# A MYSTERY ABOUT THIS:

# JUSTIFIED SIN AND VERY PRIVATE MEMOIRS IN THE DETECTIVE NOVELS OF JOSEPHINE TEY

Christina R. Martin

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

August 2001

Department of English Studies

University of Strathclyde

*To the memory of*

*Elizabeth Stewart,*

*late of The Park School, Glasgow*

*There is a mystery about this, which stimulates the imagination; where there is no imagination, there is no horror.*

Sir Arthur Conan Doyle
A Study in Scarlet (1887)
Chapter 5

# ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the eight detective novels produced between 1929 and 1952 by the Scottish writer best known as Josephine Tey. On this side of the Atlantic they are largely out of print and seem almost forgotten. In America, by contrast, her work has grown in reputation and receives respectful academic attention. Critics there examining the novels point to unusual elements in them which they cannot explain. This thesis considers briefly her work as a playwright, novelist and biographer written in the name of Gordon Daviot. Its central concern however, is to address the problems perceived by critics in the detective novels she wrote, by exploring what place the books might occupy in the context of the tradition of Scottish literature. Seen thus, these narratives emerge as self-consciously literary structures, full of allusion, woven from other texts and underpinned by the use of symbol. Issues of class, gender and sexuality are treated boldly. The detectives created are themselves unstable and their own stories and uncertain fates assume as much importance as the cases they solve. Conclusions are bleak and ambiguous rather than reassuring and the prevailing tone is one of irony darkening on occasion to satire.

Throughout, Tey's texts interrogate the nature of Scottish experience and identity, engaging with the debate raging between other writers of the time and relevant still. She appropriated techniques of modernism which at the time seemed inimical to the genre of detective fiction. There is an autobiographical subtext. Finally, these sophisticated narratives locate themselves in the tradition of Scottish writing by women, a tradition only now, almost half a century after her death, achieving recognition. Specifically, clear connections are traced between her work and that of Catherine Carswell. This radical reassessment of Tey's detective novels shows them to stake a claim to a position in the mainstream of the tradition of Scottish literature.

# CONTENTS

# ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank many people, too numerous to list, for their help in the preparation of this thesis, especially the academic, administrative and secretarial staff of the Department of English Studies. Special thanks are, however due to a few. First must come Margaret Elphinstone, to whom I am grateful for her sustained interest, support, suggestions and advice. I have benefited, too, from the help, guidance and breadth of experience of Simon Frith. Nigel Fabb provided invaluable assistance at the early stages of this research. The staff of the Andersonian Library have been cheerful and resourceful in helping me. My family and friends are due much gratitude for their understanding acceptance of the abrupt change of life-style that undertaking this research necessitated. Lastly, the support of my husband, Gordon, has been crucial, especially in the final preparation of this document itself.

Christina Martin
August 2001

# CHRONOLOGY OF ELIZABETH MACKINTOSH/ JOSEPHINE TEY/GORDON DAVIOT/F. CRAIGIE HOWE

| | |
|---|---|
| 1897 | Elizabeth Mackintosh born in Inverness, 25 June 1896. |
| 1918 | (approximately) Graduated from Anstey Physical Training College, Birmingham. |
| 1919-26 | Taught near Liverpool and in Tunbridge Wells |
| 1926 | (approximately) Retired as physical training instructor and returned to Scotland to care for invalid father on the death of her mother, Josephine Horne. |
| 1929 | As Gordon Daviot published The Man in the Queue and Kif. |
| 1931 | The Expensive Halo- A fable Without a Moral (Daviot) published. |
| 1932 | First production of Richard of Bordeaux in London at the New Theatre. |
| 1933 | Publication of Richard of Bordeaux (Daviot). |
| 1934 | The Laughing Woman and Queen of Scots produced at the New Theatre. Publication of The Laughing Woman and Queen of Scots (Daviot) |
| 1936 | A Shilling for Candles (Josephine Tey) published. |
| 1937 | Claverhouse (Daviot) published. Film Young and Innocent based on a Shilling for Candles appeared, directed by Alfred Hitchcock. |
| 1939 | The Stars Bow Down (Daviot) published. |
| 1941 | Leith Sands performed as a radio drama. |
| 1946 | Leith Sands and other Short Plays published (Daviot) The Little Dry Thorn (Daviot) performed in April at the Citizens' Theatre, Glasgow and the Lyric Theatre, Hammersmith. Cornelia (F. Craigie Howe) produced at Citizens' Theatre (subsequently published as by Daviot). |
| 1946 | Miss Pym Disposes published (Tey). |
| 1947 | The Franchise Affair (Tey) published. |
| 1949 | Brat Farrar (Tey) published. The Stars Bow Down (Daviot) produced at the Malvern Festival. |
| 1950 | Death of Colin Mackintosh, Elizabeth's father. To Love and Be Wise (Tey) published. |
| 1951 | The Daughter of Time (Tey) published. Film The Franchise Affair, starring Michael Denison and Dulcie Gray, appeared. |
| 1952 | Di.ed in Streatham, London, February 13. |
| 1952 | The Singing Sands (Tey) and The Privateer (Daviot) published. |
| 1953/4 | Plays by Gordon Daviot- three volumes. |

Full details of all publications are given in the Bibliography

Sources: Mitchell Library (Glasgow), Inverness Public Library, *Inverness Courier,* Sandra Roy (1981), Nancy Talburt (1981).

# SECTION I

## A MYSTERY ABOUT THIS?

### 1. My Contention

Elizabeth Mackintosh was a versatile writer based in the Scottish Highlands who enjoyed both critical and commercial success during her lifetime. She was a prolific playwright using the name Gordon Daviot with her greatest triumph coming early in her career, when in 1932 Richard of Bordeaux, starring the young John Gielgud, ran to full houses in London's West End and subsequently toured the English regions. Thereafter, Gielgud's praise of this work and stress of its importance in the development of his career was consistent[1)], but these plays are regarded now as occupying an honourable place in the history of the stage rather than as having any contemporary relevance. Her biographical works and mainstream novels are known to even fewer, specialist, readers.

In contrast, the eight detective novels she wrote in the name of Josephine Tey increased steadily in popularity in her lifetime until the last one appeared posthumously in 1952. Two became films, and radio adaptations are still made regularly. In America they are highly regarded: in recent years they have received renewed academic attention and become required reading in some university courses[2)]. A number of eminent critics of the genre of detective fiction, such as Howard Haycraft, have accorded them a high place among the classics of the form (Julian Symons, Bloody Murder, p. 178). More recently, the American commentators Nancy Talburt ('Josephine Tey' in 10 Women of Mystery, 1981) and Sandra Roy (Josephine Tey, 1981) have praised her work and explored it in detail;

---

1) For example, he states: It was to the brilliant inspiration and sympathy of Gordon Daviot that I owed the biggest personal success of my career. (John Gielgud, Early Stages, (London: Heinemann, 1974), p. 143.)
Richard of Bordeaux was drawn attention to, also, in Gielgud's obituaries (2000).

2) The Daughter of Time is a set text at the University of Washington in Seattle.

she has also been studied in continental Europe[3]. Roy states in her Preface: "Since Tey, whose popularity daily increases, wrote in the august company of Agatha Christie, Dorothy L. Sayers, Marjorie Allingham and Ngaio Marsh, and can be compared favourably with them, she should no longer be ignored" (p. 11). Talburt's consideration places Tey's work similarly, as providing a connection between that of Sayers and Marsh.

### i. Problems Tey's detective novels pose

Hand in hand with this recognition from committed admirers, however, go persistent suggestions, even from them, that some features of these novels seem strange. They point to the odd, minimally violent crimes which are presented in her work in almost off-hand manner. They express misgivings about the focusing of attention on wholly innocent characters subjected to relentless pursuit by legally sanctioned forces of destruction while, as often as not, the indubitably guilty escape blithely unscathed. They notice the focus on and constant undercutting of, conventional roles of gender and sexuality. They are surprised by the close questioning of the validity of any single narrative, especially if it claims to be an authoritative account of characters and events of the past. Most troubling of all to these critics is their perception that the central figures, the detectives, themselves suffer agonies, are tortured rather than inspired by their insights and discoveries, and so find themselves reluctant to take decisive action. This means that they cannot perform the function, expected of the detective in fiction, of restoring order and the tendency is for the crimes to be solved, or any kind of justice to be meted out, by quite accidental events. Roy and Talburt were of course working in America. (Andrew Hook has traced close literary links between Scotland and the USA, in his book From Goosegreen to Gandercleugh, pointing out that Scottish literature is traditionally well received across the Atlantic[4].) Since then, still in

---

3) For example, the April 1, 1996 edition of *Aftenposten* (*Evening Post*, Oslo), contains a 2000 word article by Kirsti Espegren, based on her academic thesis, entitled Josephine Tey- glemt kriminalforfatter? (Josephine Tey- forgotten criminal author?), and celebrating 100 years since Tey's birth. It begins "Lesere med smak for kvalitets-kriminal-romanen burde oppsoke Josephine Teys bøker" ("Readers with a taste for quality criminal novels ought to seek out Josephine Tey's books").

4) The work of Thomas Carlyle, for example, was appreciated by Emerson and others before it was admired in Britain (p. 138).

America, the Harvard professor Marjorie Garber has analysed one of Tey's novels in 1992 alongside examples by other "prominent practitioners of the craft" in Vested Interests: Cross Dressing and Cultural Anxiety. On this side of the Atlantic, Alison Light, based in the south of England, contributed an essay in 1986 on the significance of The Franchise Affair in Jean Radford's The Progress of Romance: The Politics of Popular Fiction.

In this context, it is striking that the place where Tey's writing has so far received no critical attention is her own country of Scotland, despite the huge recent increase in the scale of academic study of Scottish literature. It occurred to me that the problems presented by her work, as identified by Roy and Talburt, might be addressed by taking into account Mackintosh's personal background and any Scottish dimensions and characteristics in her writing likely to have been unnoticed by commentators thinking of her work as in the tradition of literature based in England. Roy, Talburt, Light and Garber assume that these novels should be perceived as a straightforward contribution to the English-based detective genre of the time, unquestioningly supportive of London-based patriarchal authority. Roy, especially, who has written on Tey's work at greatest length, attempts to insist that it complies with the conventions of the detective genre of the time in its aims, declaring in her judgement of Miss Pym Disposes that "these novels offer the reader a sense of security and stability" (p. 95). Despite noting that this particular detective goes so far wrong as to heap punishment on an innocently involved character who nobly accepts it, while the murderer escapes without even being accused, Roy states baldly in her conclusion that in Tey's novels, "the bad are always punished"(p. 184). For her part, Talburt finds "a network of fine cracks in the restored world to which the characters are returned at the end of her novels" (p. 75). Yet Talburt, too, remains convinced that these texts, and even the writer in person, exhibit "deep conservatism towards law and order coupled with the desire to see real justice done characteristic of the genre" along with "the less attractive but characteristic ethnocentrism of the classic detective novel" (p. 67). I find that such readings involve ignoring or misinterpreting important features of the work, which respond to being examined in the context of their Scottish provenance. I was aware, too, that in Mackintosh's own lifetime, when she was sought after by

the press and could have offered explanations of her literary aims and techniques, she refused to do so. This is attested to by all commentators on Tey's life, including Roy and Talburt and also Virginia Morris in The Dictionary of Literary Biography[5]. John Gielgud, who was one of her few close friends, puts it thus in his Foreword to the posthumously published Plays of Gordon Daviot:

> Gordon Daviot was a strange character, proud without being arrogant, and obstinate, though not conceited [...] it was difficult to tell what she really felt, since she did not readily give her confidence, even to her few intimate friends [...] she shunned photographers and publicity of all kinds, and gave no interviews to the press. pp. ix/x

In addition, local sources testify that she avoided even conventional, apparently trivial, daily interaction with other people in her home town of Inverness. She is remembered as "dour and aloof", and even unresponsive to children who greeted her politely in the street[6]. Her obituary in the *Inverness Courier* (Appendix A3) bears the comments:

> While living in Inverness, Gordon Daviot took little or no part or interest in the life of the town, her spare time from the household duties being taken up by her writing, and she spent a good deal of each year in the South. Her trenchant wit, ready tongue and inquiring mind made her an interesting companion, and those who enjoyed her friendship will miss her stimulating personality[7].

My feeling was that the unexplained features of her work, coupled with personal reticence so extreme, in itself amounted to a mystery, and a mystery, moreover, that could be investigated now, almost fifty years after her death, by a detailed examination of her texts as part of writing by women identified as Scottish, supported by relevant recently developed literary theories. These texts might then be found to carry meanings working as clues to some kind of solution that has until now gone undetected by critics. Neither Roy nor Talburt, nor any other critic of Tey's work so far, has been in a position to pick up on references and allusions

---

5) Roy p. 14; Talburt p. 44; Morris p. 285.

6) From article by Jim Love in Inverness Courier, October 5th 1993: "Mr. MacPherson, who knew her as Helen Mackintosh, remembers her as dour and aloof. 'Most people have something about them that makes them attractive and pleasant but she didn't,' he declared. 'At school, we were always taught to salute teachers and other adults and were accustomed to being acknowledged- but when we touched our caps to Helen there was never any response.'"

which point to its grounding on Scottish literature. Yet some clues are as obvious as those supplied in Brat Farrar, which I discuss later (p. 142). I uncover in this thesis many more examples of her use of names and other allusions which indicate her works' relationship with a wide variety of Scottish texts, both classic and contemporary.

### ii. Their place in the Scottish literary tradition

Building on these connections, my thesis is that the idiosyncrasies found in her work can be explained by detecting in it a subtext exploring the nature of Scottish identity particularly in terms of the Scottish literary tradition. Techniques are used which are unusual, to say the least, in the detective novel of the time. Setting out on my examination, I found much discussion of issues central to conceptions of Scottish identity. I found the texts working to establish their own status as writing, while drawing on other texts and, in so doing, making a clear demand to be inserted into the history and tradition of Scottish literature. In addition many critics have pointed to elements in the novels that seem autobiographical. As the Dictionary of Literary Biography puts it "reading biographical details into her fiction has become a frequent practice" (p. 285). This writer "who did not readily give her confidence, even to her few intimate friends" seems to have found an indirect way of conveying the story of her marginalised life to millions of readers. Her own story is woven into the whole as yet another subtext which gives a detailed explanation of her position and the choices she made. Bringing together these texts and references, including very personal ones, the books explore the nature of Scottish identity by utilising some of the techniques of modernism, newly introduced and controversial at the time she began writing and considered to be inimical to the genre of the detective novel. As the principal study of this thesis is her detective novels, I shall, from this point, refer to Mackintosh by the pen-name she used for these, that of Josephine Tey.

I am far from alone in embarking on a re-examination of the work of a Scottish woman writer, highly successful in her own time, whose contribution to the

---

7) *Inverness Courier*, Friday, February 15th 1952.

national literary tradition has been ignored by later critics, if not erased entirely from memory. In 1962, David Craig posed a question which illustrates the presumption of a wholly male tradition that prevailed until recently. In his highly regarded analysis Scottish Literature and the Scottish People, he asked rhetorically, "Scott, Galt, Hogg, Lockhart, Stevenson- do they not together render a great range of the national life? (p. 140) As recently as 1987, Aberdeen University Press published the volume devoted to the twentieth century in its History of Scottish Literature. In it, greater attention is paid to women writers, and one contribution is devoted to Muriel Spark alone. Despite this, only a few other novelists (Willa Muir, Nan Shepherd and Naomi Mitchison) are afforded more than a brief mention. Such a seminal figure as Catherine Carswell is referred to only twice, very much in passing, and dismissively.

> Muir makes the same kind of point that Catherine Carswell made in Open the Door! (1920) but with an assurance and skill that are unusual (p. 115).
>
> [...] it is not possible to deal with [...] Catherine Carswell's highly idiosyncratic Lawrentian novels (p. 305).

Yet Joy Hendry, concentrating on poets in the chapter entitled "Twentieth-century Women's Writing: The Nest of Singing Birds" (from which that second quotation is taken) is able to cite no fewer than fifty-four names as worthy of attention. She concludes that "sufficient momentum is beginning to be generated to ensure that their songs will not continue to fade unheard into the silence of obscurity" (p. 307). Duly, in 1993, Hendry herself edited a double edition of the literary magazine "Chapman", opening up a genuine debate on the contribution of women, with a detailed discussion of novels by Violet Jacob, Carswell, Muir, Shepherd and Mitchison, as well as of works by figures then emerging, such as Janice Galloway and A.L. Kennedy. This new appreciative assessment now constituted, according to Hendry, rather than "sufficient momentum", an "unstoppable drive" (p. 4).

Then, in 1997, Douglas Gifford and Dorothy MacMillan responded with an appropriately comprehensive and dense volume, A History of Scottish Women's Writing, tracing its development from the earliest known poetry (in Gaelic) to contemporary drama and fiction. The number of writers treated is enormous. More

than two hundred names are listed in the Select Bibliography dealing with the twentieth century alone. In this context, the editors point to the absence of an established canon of women's writing in Scotland (compared to that of Jane Austen, Charlotte and Emily Bronte, George Eliot and Virginia Woolf in England) as a strength rather than a weakness, allowing more easily as it does for the hearing of less celebrated voices and, in consequence, fresh interpretations of established texts. They remark also that recognition of Scottish women's contribution to the country's literary history seems to have lessened rather than increased during most of the twentieth century.

In their Introduction, Gifford and MacMillan show once again that women's achievement has been excluded from analyses of the literary tradition and express the opinion that positive remedial action such as theirs needs to be taken rather than relying on "gradualism" (p. ix) to restore lost reputations. Hence their book. What they find "more alarming" is the absence of any Scottish contribution in the British edition of The Norton Anthology of Literature by Women, published in 1996. Scottish women's writing is seen to have suffered from the double disadvantage of exclusion from history, on the basis of gender, within Scotland and exclusion from history, on the basis of Scottishness, in the wider world. (Hendry herself has memorably dubbed this syndrome as "the double knot in the peeny"[8]). The editors go on to discuss the terms they use in their title. "Scottishness" in many writers is open to question, consisting as it does of a variable mixture of ethnicity, place of birth, education and residence, and choice of subject matter, language and tradition within which to write. In the face of this difficulty, surely true of all cultures, Gifford and MacMillan suggest searching among writers for a "hidden continuity" (p. xiii), as did Sandra M. Gilbert and Susan Gubar in their important The Madwoman in the Attic (1979). Their ideas are valuable in my analysis of Tey's work, which I find, in Section IV to stand in just such a tradition of unacknowledged continuity. Since that book's appearance, of course, differences have come to be recognised between women writers working in all traditions in terms of their personal origins and adopted perspectives. A white, upper- or

---

8) Joyce Hendry, "The Double Knot in the Peeny" in In Other Words: Writing as a Feminist.

middle-class background can no longer be assumed. It is relevant to analyse, too, their writing's relationship to that of the men who preceded them and those working contemporaneously. Each woman has to be seen, necessarily, as writing from her own specific position. For Gifford and MacMillan, "Scottishness, like gender, turns out to be more a matter of the imagination than of logic" (p. xx). Yet, they conclude, the chapters in the volume they edit "make their own statements in ways which combine to say what women connected with a part of Europe, for long recognised from within and without as different from other parts, thought and felt" (p. xxii). They express the hope that their work will stimulate further discussion.

This vital work has indeed been built on. In 2000, there appeared Scottish Women's Fiction 1920s to 1960s: Journeys into Being, edited by Carol Anderson and Aileen Christianson. In it, contributors now find themselves able to discuss novels in the context of an acknowledged tradition, although not, of course, a unified one. Anderson and Christianson identify interests their texts address in common in the range of novelists treated (Carswell, Muir, Rebecca West, Shepherd, Nancy Brysson Morrison, Jessie Kesson and Spark). Political, educational, spiritual and domestic issues are all addressed. Gender issues are of particular importance, and some traditional features of the Scottish novel are turned around. The role of parents, mothers as well as fathers, is put in question. These writers themselves give evidence of awareness of new ideas and techniques being used in the aftermath of the First World War. All this fits in with my interpretation of Tey's novels as standing in the vanguard of Scottish women's writing as it developed during that period.

With so much appreciative attention in recent years, surely, Hendry's "unstoppable drive" has to be seen as confirmed and the reputation of women writers as a vital part of the Scottish tradition secured. Yet Janet Paisley pointed out in the December 1999 edition of "The Scottish Review" that Naomi Mitchison, who had died earlier in the year, seemed already to be forgotten. Scotland's record in the silencing of women's voices is, according to Paisley, "worse even that that of

England" (*The Herald*, February 26th 2001, p. 14)[9]. Accordingly, the Scottish women's committee of International Pen, the world-wide writers' association, has produced its own poster featuring one hundred women writers[10]. That such defensive action is still necessary after so much ground-breaking academic activity is almost incredible, but has to be recognised.

That Tey's novels so far have not been accorded their due place as part of this now identified tradition may be in part because of the popular genre in which she chose to write. Yet her texts themselves draw attention to their relationship to those of Scottish women of the past, often by the reuse of names and motifs. They place themselves firmly, though not uncritically, in the context of Scottish, and Highland, culture and history. Other texts, ancient and contemporary, are invoked, so that a densely woven pattern emerges as each novel is followed by the next. In many cases the invocation of relevant texts seems to have been deliberate on the part of the writer. Such intention, of course, is rarely amenable to proof. What is undeniable is that each text is created out of a wide variety of others.

The term used now for the process of a single text invoking and involving others is intertextuality. (Its introduction I discuss later in this Section of the thesis, on p. 56.) Its use is foregrounded in the novels of Carswell and Muir, who preceded Tey, and on whose work she built. Examining later writing by Spark and Emma Tennant, I find their continuing use of classic texts of Scottish literature to demonstrate their active participation in that same tradition. Perhaps reflecting increasing national and cultural confidence, such use seems to have intensified as the twentieth century wore on, and Tennant's novels are found to invoke these sources most explicitly of all.

As with those other women writing in the tradition, one of the threads running through Tey's novels is autobiographical in nature. Roy and Talburt

---

9) [...] Mitchison died only months before a chain of bookshops brought out a poster of "100 great Scottish Writers" in which only one woman, Muriel Spark, was included.

10) All [...] are women writers of whom, the poster declares, "Scotland should be vocally and gloriously proud". Quoting Margaret Oliphant, it reminds us that "woman is half the world". Janice MacFarlane, *Bookshelf* column, *The Herald*, 26th February 2001.

assume this to be the case, as do Mairi McDonald and Virginia Morris[11]. Her own story is woven into the whole as one palimpsest, among others, which offers a detailed account of the confined position she found herself in and her changing reactions to that position as time passed. Like biography itself, autobiography must of course be seen as of textual status and dubious in its authority, another form of fictional writing rather than a direct representation of any kind of reality[12].

Yet autobiographical writing presents itself as "true", an exercise in rational thinking, as stories are told of lives of exceptional recognised achievement. Such accounts offer an obvious starting point for the narrative, to be followed by a steady progression of events in a public career and in private life before drawing to a natural close. Seen in this somewhat simplistic way, it seems to lend itself to the telling of the stories of men rather than women, and, moreover, of those men whose lives have been led close to centres of widely recognised political power. Very few men suffer the discontinuities usual in women's lives. They do not change, perhaps several times over, the surnames and signatures by which they are known. It is highly unlikely that they will be expected, on moral grounds, to drop out of successful professional careers, potentially on a permanent basis (which was of course Tey's fate as a playwright). Rarely are they expected to subsume their identities in those of others. Carswell expresses the difference between men and women's expectations of life experiences well in her own autobiographical writing.

> Why are men so much more afraid than women of losing their identities? Does nature provide for the more striking physical changes through which every normal woman has to pass– i.e. when she bears a child? How would men tolerate the change in their very shape? Although the shape is restored (more or less) after childbirth, the

---

11) Here again we glimpse the real person [...]. (McDonald p. 118)
Glimpses of Tey can be found in [her books]. Hunting for these is a pleasant pastime (Morris p.5).
It is impossible not to read into this novel [The Singing Sands] Tey's knowledge of her impending death. (Talburt p. 45)
In this final work [The Privateer], Daviot adds a surprising twist to her hero's character. Unlike Grant, Kif, Miss Pym, Brat Farrar and all the others, Morgan is able to relate, communicate, and respond to individuals [...]. Doubtless the author's final painful and lonely year of life is reflected in this denial of isolation and withdrawal. (Roy p. 44).

12) Sidonie Smith's A Poetics of Women's Autobiography (1987) traces women's autobiographical writing back five hundred years, identifying patterns in it which conflict with theories about male autobiography.

> woman has had her lesson that nothing is static, including herself. With men the illusion of their own firmness persists much longer- indeed until destroyed by age. Lying Awake (p. 136)

Thus men can expect to tell their stories directly without "the loss of the illusion of their own firmness" to which Carswell alludes. Yet few, even of them, have no problematic characteristics in their personal backgrounds and thus in the positions from which they speak. Nationality, ethnic and class origin, the preferred language of self-expression, educational level reached, political stance, sexual orientation and even the age at which one's story should be told, can all be sources of difficulty. Certainly, the life stories of men living in Britain in the first half of the twentieth century show their paths to be eased if characteristics of the London based establishment are embraced. The career pattern of the Scottish born man of letters and of public affairs, John Buchan, demonstrates this. He espoused, literally, the English aristocracy, in the person of Susan Grosvenor, whose grandfather was Lord Ebury, and established his household in a suitably grand Oxfordshire country house, very different from the Glasgow manse in which he had grown up. Overt indications of his Scottishness had disappeared within months of his leaving Glasgow University for Oxford in October 1895. In June 1896, Arnold Bennett described him as

> 'varsity in every tone and gesture. He talks quietly in a feminine, exiguous voice, with the accent of Kensington tempered perhaps by a shadow of a shade of Scotch (or was that my imagination?).
> Janet Adam Smith, John Buchan and his World, 1979, p. 25.

Adam Smith painted a picture here, as she did in the original biography issued in 1965, of a man at peace with himself. That Buchan settled without inner conflict into the persona he assumed in his adult life is an idea that critics now question. Andrew Noble interprets his final novel, Sick Heart River, as providing evidence of deep-rooted and unresolvable personal problems in relation to his Scottish identity (Lecture, St. Andrew Society of Scotland, March 1990). Marshall Walker, in his Scottish Literature since 1707 concurs in his opinion about "this most personal of Buchan's novels" (p. 243), in which "the physically afflicted [...] Leithen's elemental search for himself persuades, touches the heart and shows that the basis of Buchan the entertainer is Buchan the son of a Free Church minister, preoccupied

with the good of the soul" (p. 243). Christopher Harvie goes further and analyses Buchan's difficulties in detail in his 'Travelling Scot: Essays on the history, politics and future of the Scots' (1999). I discuss Harvie's ideas on Buchan in relation to Tey's work later in this Section (p. 69).

Despite these problems of identity within the British state experienced by Scottish men, the writing of memoirs is clearly among the strengths of Scottish literature. Works by James Hogg, J.G. Lockhart, James Boswell and Henry, Lord Cockburn, give evidence of this[13]. Women, too, have excelled in the form. Some have found autobiographical writing useful to foreground and show, from the recounting of personal experience, the effects of the discontinuities and abrupt changes common in women's lives. Suffering, including that arising from depression and loss, and mental illness, usually excluded from fiction, can also be shown. For example, Alison Cockburn's memories, written in 1784 and finally published in 1990, contain very personal and moving accounts of the deaths of her husband, nephew and son. That women, traditionally, have been expected to be introspective, assuming responsibility for the private and domestic sphere of life may be one reason for this strength.

Certainly memoirs assume importance in the annals of the writing of Scottish women, many of whom emerge as stronger and wiser than the men with whom they are associated. An Anthology edited by Dorothy McMillan in 1999, The Scotswoman at Home and Abroad: Non-Fiction Writing 1700-1900, contains an impressive range of writing by twenty-five women including Cockburn[14].

---

13) James Hogg, Domestic Matters and Private Life of Sir Walter Scott (1834).
J.G Lockhart, Life of Burns (1828).
----------, Memoirs of the Life of Sir Walter Scott (1837/8).
James Boswell, Life of Samuel Johnson (1791).
Henry, Lord Cockburn, Life of Jeffrey (1852).
----------, Memorials of his Time (1856).
----------, Journal, 1831-44 (2 vols., 1874).
----------, Circuit Journeys (1888).

14) The 25 women are: Lady Grisell Baillie (1665-1746), Lady Murray of Stanhope (1693-1759), Alicia Cockburn (1713-94), Elizabeth Mure (1714-95), Margaret Calderwood (1715-74), Lady Anne Lindsay Barnard (1750-1825), Anne Grant of Laggan (1755-1838), Elizabeth Hamilton (1756-1816), Joanna Bailie (1762-1851), Eliza Fletcher (1770-1858), Mary Somerville (1780-1872), Christian Isobel Johnstone (1781-1857), Charlotte Waldie (1788-1826), Janet Hamilton (1795-1873), Fanny Wright (1795-1852), Lady Lucy Clementina Davies (1795-1879), Catherine Sinclair (1800-85), Anne Chalmers (1813-91),

McMillan's Introduction makes clear that many further candidates had to be excluded for reasons of space or because their work is readily available elsewhere. One of the latter is Elizabeth Grant of Rothiemurchus, whose work I find in Section III of this thesis to be implicated in Tey's final detective novel. Another writer in this category is Lady Louisa Stuart, whose biographical writing overtly celebrates the life of another woman, Frances, Lady Douglas, while showing how her own, the private life of a single woman, was itself also one of fulfilment. The writing of the successful novelist Margaret Oliphant is represented in McMillan's volume by extracts from articles she wrote for Blackwood's Magazine. Her Autobiography, published in full for the first time in 1990, was written over three decades and is a piercingly grief-stricken account of motherhood and loss in the context of unremitting labour. Her approach to the telling of the story of her life is unstructured and contains internal self-contradictions, lending itself to interpretation as irrational, offering the reader glimpses of the unconscious rather than the conscious mind[15]. I discuss The Daughter of Time, Tey's penultimate, and most famous, detective novel in Sections II and III. In it, Oliphant's career as a Scottish woman writer is pointed to as one by which Tey measured her own achievement and by which she was led to reflect ruefully on any possibility of its being recognised by future generations. (Janet Paisley's present crusade on behalf of the reputation of Naomi Mitchison (p. 8) echoes Tey's analysis.) Carswell's autobiographical work, to which I have already alluded, was published posthumously in 1950 two years before Tey's own death. Like Oliphant's (and indeed Tey's in her turn) it was created over years, and, in the writer's own words "not in any form though informed by a theme" and there is "no reason why it should ever end" (p. ix). Even her title, Lying Awake, lends itself to the perception that the story it tells should be regarded as a fiction, "lies" being told while the mind is supposedly "awake". Might this oblique statement by Carswell on the ambiguous nature of autobiographical writing

---

Felicia Skene (1821-1899), Henrietta Keddie (1827-1914), Margaret Oliphant (1827-97), Isabella Bird Bishop (1831-1904), Ellen Johnston (c.1835-73), Constance Frederica Gordon Cumming (1837-1929), Flora Annie Steel (1847-1929).

15) The text itself makes no attempt to achieve closure. Mrs. Harry Coghill, editing it for publication in 1899 after Oliphant's death, contrived to represent the writer as a conventional Victorian domestic woman. Much material was omitted. In 1990 the full text, edited by Elizabeth Jay, was published.

be a comment on the conscious misrepresentation now thought to be present in the accounts of John Buchan's life, with which she herself was involved[16)]? Willa Muir, like Carswell, wove her own experiences into her fiction, which is placed in the repressive atmosphere of a small town called Calderwick, a thinly disguised version of the Montrose in which she grew up. The novels of both these writers are highly relevant to my analysis of Tey's work and are discussed in Section IV of this thesis. Later, Muir too turned to reminiscence, writing the story of her life with her husband, the poet Edwin Muir, in Belonging (1968).

As I have indicated, two women currently writing whose texts demonstrate their building on this lively and innovative tradition are the celebrated novelists Spark and Tennant. Both, too, have written their memoirs, making much of the Scottish locations in which they spent their early years, and which inspire and inform their well-known fiction[17)]. Yet the accounts of their lives that they offer are open to the charge of being evasive, raising questions about class and ethnicity and about relationships between generations that are left unanswered. An element of conscious obfuscation, of "lying awake" seems to recur here. Both Tennant and Carswell add to such ambiguity, by indicating on the final page of their accounts the possibility, in the words of a traditional story told by an elderly woman, that "this is none of I". The status of autobiographical writing and the concept of authorial intent are put in question. As McMillan puts it "there is no writing that is not self – writing and no writing that is not more than that" (p xiv)[18)]. Every writer, then, that I discuss here as part of the tradition Tey was joining in, has written her own story, albeit with obvious gaps and inconsistencies. Tey contrives to tell hers too, and to reveal herself as a subject in the texts, emerging as a multiple outsider pursued by forces of patriarchal authority. (Paradoxically, her use of this most unlikely of genres, regarded as conformist, seems to have helped.)

---

16) Carswell supplied an account of her first meeting with Buchan and states unequivocally that "I never saw him again.". Yet it is now accepted (for example in *The Times* obituary of her son John Carswell, who died on November 12th 1997) that they were close friends.

17) Muriel Spark Curriculum Vitae (1992).
Emma Tennant Strangers: A Family Romance (1990).

18) Critical deconstruction, derived from the work of Jacques Derrida, aims to show that any and every text inevitably undermines its own claims to a determinate meaning and emphasises the role of the reader in a work's production. Roland Barthes essay "The Death of the Author" (1968) and Jonathan Culler's Structuralist Poetics (1978) are important influences here.

Memory itself is of course notoriously unreliable and selective. Light is shed on the unreliable nature of any kind of autobiographical writing by the discoveries of psychoanalysts. The split that occurs in the infant psyche as the child recognises its own identity as an individual and acquires language has been famously identified by Jacques Lacan as representing the acquisition of a conscious self[19]. Language itself works as a defence network against unconscious knowledge. Yet it is notoriously unreliable, allowing messages from the unconscious to break through, showing the supposedly unified self to be divided. Shari Benstock writes about this in "Authorizing the Autobiographical" in The Private Self: Theory and Practice of Women's Autobiographical Writing (1988). Such repeated messages are directed at the dominant patriarchal culture by "those who occupy positions of internal exclusion within the culture- that is by women, blacks, Jews, homosexuals and others who exist on the margins of society". In Tey's case, internal exclusion within the British state came by virtue of being a woman, Scottish, Highland, and single (whether or not lesbian), and emanating from a class position lacking political power. Autobiographical writing from such a position is unlikely to take the form of a straightforwardly written "life". Even more than those of the other Scottish women writers I discuss, Tey's autobiographical work is likely to be approached obliquely and told by subterfuge, detectable as "unconscious knowledge" repeatedly declaring its presence in an apparently patriarchal text. The reasons for extreme personal reticence, in this context, become clear.

### iii. Unexpected techniques

It seems appropriate to indicate briefly here what these techniques are that I find Tey to be using so unexpectedly, yet successfully, in her chosen genre of detective fiction. They are techniques foregrounded in the work of her predecessor in the twentieth century, Carswell, whose work I discuss at the beginning of Section IV. They are those thought of as exemplifying modernism, which have been outlined succinctly by Peter Faulkner in Modernism (1977).

---

19) Lacan's best known work is The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis (translated 1977).

Modernism, a somewhat vague term, involves writing that marks a deliberate break with traditional thought that in the Victorian age underlay Western culture in general. Thinkers such as Karl Marx and Sigmund Freud had overturned long-held political and medical assumptions, changing the ways in which the individual self could be regarded. Especially influential at the time Tey began writing was James G. Frazer whose The Golden Bough (1890-1915) undermined the tenets of Christianity by making plain the ways in which they corresponded to pagan myths and practices. In the light of such discoveries, society had to be perceived as more complex than before. Tey's texts display consciousness of the impact of these new ideas. Roy and Talburt draw attention to the texts' championship of characters multiply excluded from centres of political power and thus easily made victims by authority[20], despite insisting, conversely, that they exhibit conformist, even extreme, right wing attitudes. This characteristic is very apparent in Tey's first book of detective fiction, in which a defenceless but innocent Highlander comes close to being hanged for murder. Later in this Section, I discuss the political implications of his position and identity, of which these previous critics were unaware. Further, Frazer's ideas about the nature of society, its organic growth, and the relationship of the individual to it are a source of interest. This is most marked in To Love and Be Wise where the opening paragraph describes the "shrieking" at a successful party as having as its undercurrent "a dull continuous roar; an elemental sound, like a forest fire or a river in spate" (p. 7). One of the themes of To Love and Be Wise is that the inhabitants of an East Anglian village are having their indigenous and valid culture threatened by an invasion of alien and self-satisfied Londoners. Thirdly, the necessity of recognising the validity of the insights of psychology is emphasised in Miss Pym Disposes, where suppressing instinctive knowledge of psychological factors leads to disaster. These later works are discussed in full, and my claims supported, in Section III.

In modernist writing, too, awareness is shown of the significance of irrational ideas and the workings of the unconscious mind. These developments lend themselves to the presentation of personality in terms of individual awareness,

---

20) Tey arranged the materials of much of her writing to emphasise the trials of the innocent (Talburt, p. 49).

a method known in the novel as "stream of consciousness"[21]. Tey's characters, especially her detectives, have their thought processes, internal monologues, and even, on occasion, dreams, laid bare to the reader to such an extent that critics such as Roy regard it as a weakness[22]. Characteristic of these changes, too, is the use of classical and biblical myth and of poetic image as a central means of aesthetic communication. Tey's novels foreground archetypal myth. For example, the first sentence of Brat Farrar juxtaposes the figures of Ulysses and Noah, while the biblical story of Joseph abandoned by his brothers in the pit at Dothan, whom they encounter again years later, underpins the narrative. Poetic image, too, is foregrounded in her work and symbols, such as the tea-tray with its carefully laundered cloth in The Franchise Affair, make a vital contribution to the overall significance of the texts. A tendency appears, too, to draw attention to a work's reliance on earlier texts, often by the re-use of names and motifs. This, of all the characteristics of modernism, is the one which displays itself most prominently in Tey's novels. Each in turn draws attention to its dependence on a multiplicity of texts and other discourses, non-literary as well as literary, contemporary as well as ancient, reusing familiar and more esoteric names and motifs throughout. In this way a network of textual relations is established, often, and most importantly to my thesis, with other significant Scottish discourses. The writings created in this way are self-consciously experimental and challenging to the reader. Tey's use of these methods is subversive in terms of the conventions of the detective genre of the time, which I outline here also. This subversiveness allows the texts to address issues other than those that, on the surface, they appear to deal with. The vulnerable position of the outsider in society is a favourite theme throughout, most marked in her later work in The Franchise Affair, where the public is easily persuaded that two single women living in isolation are monsters. I point to the presence of this theme of the vulnerability of the outsider in my discussion here of her first detective novel. Malcolm Bradbury and James McFarlane, in their analysis of modernism,

---

21) This method was heralded by Virginia Woolf in her essay "Modern Fiction" in The Common Reader (First Series, 1919), and is associated especially with her later novels.

22) Roy repeats the criticism that "the story might have been rather better than the average detective yarn if the author had only refrained from revealing to us at great length the mental processes of the detective" (Originally in a review of The Man in the Queue in the New York Times Book Reviews, July 28th, 1929, p. 13).

identify the period between 1890 and 1930 as central to its development and flowering, saying that " few historical phases contain such an extraordinary wealth of major writers" (p. 52)[23]. My intention is to show that Tey's detective novels have affinities with the work of such writers, drawing on the innovative methods of many writers of the time.

### iv. The contemporary discussion of Scottish issues

My argument is that Tey's novels stand in the Scottish tradition. The problems critics have found disappear when this is taken into account. Allusions to Scottish texts underline the connections, commenting on their place in the tradition, which was in the process of being established anew at the time she was writing. This process is relevant to her work. Cairns Craig, in his The Modern Scottish Novel: Narrative and the National Imagination (1999), identifies the tradition he uncovers as "an index of the continuity of the nation and the national imagining to which it contributes" (p. 33). Indeed, in the years between Tey's birth and her emergence as a novelist in 1929, new possibilities had arisen in how Scottishness could be perceived. The First World War, sweeping away as it did many social and cultural certainties, weakened ecclesiastical and political structures across Europe. Further, the innovative ideas of intellectuals working on the continent found a receptive audience in their Scottish counterparts, who, even when domiciled in London, knew themselves to be at a remove from metropolitan certainties and so were able to respond to fictional characters struggling to establish coherent identity. Thomas Common and William Archer were the first translators into English of Nietzsche and Ibsen. Edwin and Willa Muir translated Kafka, and G. K. Scott Moncrieff and Catherine Carswell were early experts on Proust. Ferment in other small nations, especially Ireland, with which Scotland shares deep cultural roots, provided a model for the breaking up of the British state. In Imagined Communities, Benedict Anderson shows how at that time relatively small

---

23) MODERNISM: 1890-1930 (Sussex: The Harvester Press, 1978). They cite such writers as Yeats, Gide, Proust and Valéry, followed by Eliot, Pound, Lawrence and Joyce, Woolf, Sitwell, Moore, Hemingway, Cummings, Faulkner, Malraux, Huxley and Graves.

geographical areas regained consciousness of themselves as separate entities when overarching religious communities and dynastic realms grew less powerful[24]. He identifies the novel as the form, simultaneously reinvented, which expresses this. The Republic of Ireland itself came into being in 1921. During these years, as Scotland became more conscious of the possibility of separate identity, its own literature underwent a parallel change, and the novel itself seemed reborn.

The important novels of Carswell, Willa Muir and Mitchison began to appear during these years. Neil Gunn, a native of Caithness, emerged as a writer of both novels and drama around the same time as Tey. Unusually among Scottish writers of that era, he chose to live his adult life in the very Highlands in which he had been brought up and about which he wrote. This flood of exciting new work focusing on the "condition of Scotland" [25] has to be thought of as relevant to the start of Tey's career, as is the contemporaneous emergence of James Bridie as a playwright, contributing to the tradition of drama, represented at that time by the establishment figure of Sir James Barrie. Barrie and John Buchan are thought of as representing the tradition of identification with London as the vital centre of culture, but both were to express their continuing involvement with their Scottish roots in their later writing[26]. All these writers were conscious of the emerging debate as they put Scotland, the literary project, on the boil. The ideas of cultural and political identity are of course strongly connected and the two can be seen as having come together in the physically striking and inspiring figure of Robert Bontine Cunninghame Graham, the writer, international adventurer and veteran politician who became the first President of the National Party of Scotland in 1928.

I interpret Tey's detective novels as entrants to this bubbling debate about the continuing existence and nature of Scottishness, both literary and political. Her novels certainly depend on Scottish texts. They also comment insistently on Scottish

---

24) As late as 1914, dynastic states made up the majority of the membership of the world political system, but [...] many dynasts had for some time been reaching for a 'national' cachet as the old principle of legitimacy withered silently away.
Benedict Anderson, Imagined Communities: reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism (London: Verso 1991, First Published Verso 1983.

25) A term used by Angus MacDonald, writing in 1933.

26) J.M Barrie- Farewell, Miss Julie Logan (1932).
J. Buchan- Sickheart River (1941).

history and politics. Her use of the techniques of modernism in this reactionary genre make them a highly ironic contribution to the quest of rediscovery. Clues distributed freely in the narratives emerge as hard evidence. Her serial detective, the English born Alan Grant, is built up as emblematic of Scotland, destabilising any conception of fixed identity in a way which echoes the contradictions and complexity of the "extremes" favoured by Hugh MacDiarmid[27]. The doubleness of the real eighteenth century figure of Deacon William Brodie, who haunts Edinburgh to this day, and the extra-legal exploits of this pillar of the civic establishment, find strong echoes in the character of Grant. Brodie is considered of course to be in part the inspiration of James Hogg's The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner (1824). Stevenson followed in his turn with his own presentation of a split character, The Strange Case of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde (1886). According to Christopher Harvie in Scotland and Nationalism, Scottish Society and Politics 1707-1994 (1994). "Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde remain the most potent symbols Victorian Scotland produced" (p. 100). This, he declares, is because "the predicament of Scotland was a schizoid state which could only be suggested by allegory", Tey, I argue, embarked on just such an allegory made relevant to the major arguments of the time. Grant emerges as split between Englishness and Scottishness, with potentially fatal consequences. In addition, use of the Brodie figure enabled her to put innocence and guilt themselves in question, placing her writing firmly in the tradition of fiction inspired by Hogg.

Current reviews of Ian Rankin's best-selling novels routinely begin with the bald statement that Scotland has no tradition of detective fiction for him to draw upon, incidentally ignoring not only the contribution of Tey, but also the Scottish identity of such writers as Robert Bruce Montgomery writing as Edmund Crispen, J.I.M. Stewart, who used the name Michael Innes, and even Arthur Conan Doyle himself. (In Section III, I show one of Tey's texts in particular, Miss Pym Disposes, to exhibit awareness of these influences (p. 137).) Rankin has declared that there is no tradition of the writing of detective novels in Scotland, ignoring in

---

27) I'll hae nae hauf-way hoose, but ay be whaur/ Extremes meet - it's the only way I ken/ To dodge the curst conceit o bein richt/ That damns the vast majority o men.
(*A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle*, 1926, II. 141-144)

his turn the work of William McIlvanney. Interestingly, he analyses his own work as dependent on the historical figure of Deacon William Brodie, and on the novels of Hogg and Stevenson[28]. It is the burden of this thesis that exactly the same dependence on classic Scottish texts is found in the detective work of Josephine Tey, which thus takes its place in a distinctive, diverse and ongoing tradition[29].

Francis Russell Hart, working in America, demonstrated in his landmark The Scottish Novel: From Smollett to Spark (1978) that a Scottish tradition in the novel itself can be traced. This work has now been superseded by others, but his insights make a basis for discussion that is still useful. He proposed that the national culture is sufficiently distinctive to provide a influential tradition which leads not to the production of a succession of stereotyped narratives but rather to those displaying important variations which arise from contradictions in the treatment of fact and romance and the inheritance of oppositions in language and religion. Cairns Craig's recent study confirms and builds on these ideas. Hart draws attention to these contradictions as reflected in geological contrasts such as the Castle Rock arising in central Edinburgh above the polite, classical layout of the New Town as well as in the dramatic cleft between Highlands and Lowlands. Against this background, personal identity is fiercely insisted upon but emerges as shifting and contradictory. It is often established by invoking names of characters, clans and locations important in inherited tradition, where they carry a weight of political and associative connotations.

The motifs identified by Hart as significant characteristics of the Scottish novel begin with an obsessive interest in, but mistrust of, accepted versions of historical truth. The record and influence of religion emerges as an especially important topic. Tey's texts conform strikingly here, with the attack in The Daughter of Time on the creation of historical narrative and on the methods and prejudices of historians themselves making her celebrated or notorious according to the position from which the commentator is writing. For Symons, her work suffers

---

28) Interview on the Margaret Throsby programme, ABC Classic FM, August 24th, 1999.

29) In fact I have seen a newspaper article (reference mislaid) in which Rankin expresses appreciation of Tey's "marvellous" Daughter of Time.

from being "preoccupied by the past" (p. 180). Certainly, too, an interest in the influence of religion and in characteristics of people defined as religious is marked. Ministers of religion are shown as lazy, self-satisfied and of limited intelligence. Covenanters are portrayed as gratuitously violent and duplicitous. In A Shilling for Candles, Grant requests access to an idiosyncratic community of monks and "the grill shot back with an effect which might in a community less saintly have been described as snappish" (p. 183). This community, supposedly committed to prayer and poverty, is actually a hotbed of mendacity and crime. Tey seems to have shared with David Hume the conviction that "the Morality of every Religion was bad, and when he heard a man was religious, he concluded that he was a rascal"[30]. According to Hart, the nature of the problematic relationship between the individual and the community and preoccupation with the possibility of exile providing a solution is also a concern of Scottish novels. In The Franchise Affair two isolated single women are pilloried by an inward-looking local community. Yet, conversely, in the later To Love and Be Wise, the inhabitants of a village have their indigenous culture threatened by an onslaught of outsiders. The character of Grant himself is underpinned in its entirety by his dubious status as a man of Scottish ancestry attempting to identify himself as entirely English. Exile, in his case, has not provided a solution, though returning to Scotland to take up the position of a landowner, which he considers briefly in his final appearance, is not the answer to his problem. I discuss his position in full in my analysis of The Singing Sands.

References and clues to historical and other texts abound in these detective novels in names, locations and apparently trivial details of the kind Hart points to as significant. Any one of these clues, standing alone, can be questioned and its validity denied, and some are likely to be detected only by those with a more detailed knowledge of Tey's life and the Scotland of her time than my own. I cannot claim to have uncovered even a large proportion of these. The cumulative effect of those I have picked out, however, is of the creation of an elaborately layered tapestry of meanings, with Jacobite and Hanoverian names used in opposition to each other. Making these connections became a quest satisfying for its

---

30) On his deathbed, reported by James Boswell in his Journal (3rd March, 1777).

own sake, the pleasure that of an insider sharing a secret language. That the space is private means that problematic categories can be shown to exist, and to include the problematic life of the writer herself.

When I embarked on this research, my expectation was that her books would be found to fit into the Scottish tradition in a passive way. I thought that they would exhibit the effect of influences perhaps unnoticed by the writer but inescapable in the atmosphere in which she grew up. In a first paper I went so far as to conclude that "it is doubtful whether even she herself thought of her work as specifically Scottish" (Christina Martin, 1997, p. 204). What I uncovered on further investigation, however, was not only clear references to names in Scottish literature but a very active and quite self-conscious use of one characteristic of writing identified by her contemporaries as emblematic of Scottishness, a divided self which resists reconciliation[31]. This concept underpins the action in her detective novels which I see now as working as a series, each building on the insights of the one before. From the first her serial detective, Alan Grant, is presented as torn in two, as he attempts to reconcile his position as an authoritative London-based detective with a lurking and inconveniently subversive Scottishness. It is startling to find this sophisticated device used with serious ends in view in what was then considered a genre existing solely for the purpose of providing passing, casual entertainment, and noted, as I discuss in this Section, for its support of conventional social structures. Especially marked, too, is the unambiguous nature of closures in this genre, where detectives identify and condemn the guilty and the fate of central characters is never in doubt. Critics do perceive that Tey's novels fail to conform. Thus, Talburt points out that "no-one asks for 'an Alan Grant novel', or ever did" (p. 50); this, she suggests, is because he is not presented as "a great detective". I take this insight further and demonstrate that Grant is himself a developing and interesting character and it is fundamental to this development that he does not in fact repetitiously solve one crime after another. Further, his relationship with the

---

31) The motif of the divided self was developed by George Gregory Smith as an innovative way of reading Scottish literature and reconstructing Scottish identity in his Scottish Literature: Character and Influence (1919). New and exciting, it was used by many writers of Tey's generation, including Hugh MacDiarmid in his poem *A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle* (1926) and James Bridie in his play Mr. Bolfry (1943). In Section IV I draw attention to its presence in Carswell's The Camomile.

Scottishness that is part of his make-up is fundamental to his well-being. His own fate is put in question as his health declines from the beginning, and crumbles in the final works. Each "Alan Grant novel" is a text different in its emphasis and concerns from the one before, demanding that the reader work at its interpretation and consider the nature of its closure.

The subject of Section II of this thesis is the relevance of Tey's work outside the genre of detective fiction to the ideas I put forward. In Section III, which is central to my argument, I examine the development of Tey's treatment of the issues with which her texts all concern themselves, in her further seven detective works. In Section IV, I look at the context in which I place her books, that of the novels of her compatriots and near contemporaries, the highly regarded women writers Catherine Carswell and Willa Muir. Important correspondences can be traced. This is followed by a consideration of the ways in which the present-day writers Muriel Spark and Emma Tennant have built on the tradition these predecessors established. All are found to utilise names and motifs of political, cultural and historic significance. All show Scottish identity, especially that of women, to be a problem. All draw on classic works of fiction, and utilise in particular James Hogg's seminal The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner. All of these writers are under discussion today, and I find that their work responds to fresh interpretations. Closure in their novels often admits of doubt about the fate of the central character, and I pay particular attention to the novels of Carswell in this context. The possibility of escape from the inherited darker elements of Scottishness assumes a problematic quality.

For most of this century, the history of Scottish literature has been seen as that of a once healthy and flourishing tradition which has been subjected to irreparable damage and fragmentation. The ideas expressed in Edwin Muir's Scott and Scotland, building on the anglocentric theories of Matthew Arnold and T.S. Eliot, were, and have remained, influential in circles extending far beyond the literary ones to which his work was addressed. The underlying cause he identified as responsible for the supposedly miserable condition of Scottish culture was the dominant position of the presbyterian church after the Reformation, hostile as it

proved to be to both the Scots language and the workings of the creative imagination. Subsequent loss of the royal court in 1603 and of statehood itself in 1707 is seen as a further damaging blow in psychological as well as practical terms, exacerbated by the political division between Jacobites and Hanoverians. This interpretation of Scottish history and its effect on culture as one of repression, loss and fragmentation has been widely accepted as a background against which literature could not flourish.

It comes as a refreshing change that Gerard Carruthers questions these assumptions in his paper "The Construction of the Scottish Critical Tradition". He casts doubt, too, on the validity of the all-pervasive identification of the Jekyll/Hyde split as emblematic of this Scottishness, which demands to be interpreted as fatally damaged. Carruthers challenges Muir's proposition that Scotland's history made it impossible for its writers to participate properly in the Romantic Movement flourishing in Europe at the end of the eighteenth and beginning of the nineteenth centuries. Accepting Muir's theory means regarding the work of Robert Burns as the personal achievement of an isolated genius, necessarily inadequate to function as part of an ongoing tradition. Carruthers regards Burns, rather, as having used the revolutionary atmosphere of the period to put forward a powerful response to the institutions and social structures surrounding him, on which later writers have been able to build. He views Hogg's Confessions similarly as a classic text of its time, only now being recognised for its importance and influence. Commenting on its "rediscovery" by the French writer and critic André Gide in 1947, Carruthers suggests that "there is the strong possibility of the novel's profound resonance in a select few but distinguished number of writers". That Carswell and Tey utilised it as part of the of the inspiration for their texts, along with Muir, Spark and Tennant, surely entitles them to places in that exclusive group. Interestingly, Carruthers points out that Gide argues persuasively that Robert Browning knew Hogg's novel. My argument in this thesis is that Tey's writing taps into this tradition which, Carruthers argues, is far more robust than has been traditionally assumed. "Some of the lacunae in Scottish literary history are more apparent than real", he claims. Extracting Tey's work from the mighty empire of English literature and interpreting it as that of a Scottish woman helps to fill one of these apparent gaps in a thriving

tradition that has been present all along, its strength consistently underestimated. Fitting in with these ideas of Carruthers, in 1995 Christopher Whyte edited Gendering the Nation, a collection of essays aimed at the reassessment of a few canonical, male, Scottish texts and some other writing, less well known. His approach helps to validate my revaluation of Tey's writing, and I return to these insights later in the thesis.

Berthold Schoene suggests that Scottish writing, especially novels reflecting Highland experience, has had, during the twentieth century, a place in the post-colonial canon, in the journal *Scotlands* 2:1, 1995. In this time, he proposes, it has moved on from producing images of a unified nationhood to the treatment of interpersonal relations and power structures within Scotland. Rather than dealing with "the status of the Scottish nation as a minority within the United Kingdom" it focuses on " the status of minority communities within Scottish society" (p. 121). There are many communities in Scotland, divided by geography, gender, class, religion and ethnicity, and a greater variety of voices can be heard. Scottish writers, he concludes, have arrived in their own country. I see Tey's writing as one of the voices raised on the journey.

## v. The detective novel of the time

It seems appropriate, before making further claims, to illustrate my ideas with an exemplary analysis of The Man in the Queue, Tey's first detective novel, in the context of the conventions of the genre of detective fiction of the time and of more recently developed literary theories. It appeared a few years after what is agreed to be Tey's reluctant return to Inverness around 1926 from her career in England as a teacher of physical education to care for her invalid father[32]. At the time this was what was expected of an unmarried daughter, whatever her gifts or interests. She began her writing career when detective fiction was at the height of its popularity between the two World Wars, and such well-known writers as

---

32) "As the only unmarried daughter, Elizabeth had given up a career as a gym teacher in England and returned, rather reluctantly, to look after her father following the death of her mother, a former schoolteacher." Jim Love in *Inverness Courier*, October 5th 1993:

Dorothy Sayers and Agatha Christie, with whom she is often compared, were producing some of their best-known work.

By this time, writers were coming to be constrained by an emerging self-discipline for the genre:

> Up to the middle twenties there had been little serious consideration of crime stories as a particular kind of literature, and no attempt had been made to assess the detective story as something having rules which could be strictly formulated and which it was important to observe. By the end of the decade, however, a body of criticism had been produced which tried to lay down the limits within which writers of detective stories should operate (Julian Symons, Bloody Murder, 1972, p. 114).

Thus although no universally applicable *codex* was ever drawn up[33], detective novelists were increasingly required to follow "rules" prescribed in detail by various practitioners. One of these was Monsignor Ronald Knox, whose "Ten Commandments of Detection" (1928)[34] began with the strictures that the criminal must be mentioned early on, that supernatural phenomena must be ruled out as evidence when events are to be explained, that the investigator himself must not commit the crime, and that detectives must never solve crimes by means of accidental occurrences or unaccountable intuition (Symons p.13-14). The interplay of character and the force of passion were declared by others, such as Dorothy Sayers, to be complicating factors, not subject to rational explanation, which would detract from the readers' enjoyment of attempting to solve cases. What was considered important was that the crime should be a genuine puzzle and that material clues, such as footprints or cigarette ends, should be provided so that the astute reader could work out the solution by means of logic (Symons p. 14-15).

---

33) Symons (p13-16) lists five of Monsignor Knox's 'commandments', but also quotes 'rules' introduced by the Detection Club in Great Britain, T. Austin Freeman, S.S. Van Dine, Dorothy L. Sayers, J.W. Krutch, and even W.H. Auden. Thus: "S.S. Van Dine [...], asserted that characters in a detective story should 'merely fulfil the requirements of plausibility', because any deeper delineation would 'act only as a clog in the narrative machinery'. [...] this had the full agreement of Dorothy L. Sayers, who severely reproved 'the heroes who insist on fooling about after young women when they ought to be putting their minds to the job of detection', rapped [R. Austin] Freeman over the knuckles for allowing his secondary characters to 'fall in love with distressing regularity' and concluded that, upon the whole, 'the less love in a detective story, the better'." (Symons p. 14)

34) Howard Haycraft devotes 36 pages to discussion of "rules" in Murder for Pleasure (1941) (pp. 222-258).

Yet, as Symons points out "the book that has no interest whatever except the solution of a puzzle, does not exist, and if it did exist would be unreadable" (p. 16).

Symons goes on to analyse the motive for reading crime fiction as essentially a religious one, springing from the need to exorcise the guilt of the individual or group and analogous to the tradition of human tribal sacrifices who often appeared disguised as the devil before their deaths[35]. The detective, seen in this context, performs the part of a witch-doctor or god-like authority figure acting as a force of light in the presence of darkness. The final scene in which this central figure identifies the guilty and dispenses justice is often compared to the biblical Day of Judgement. Symons adds that "one of the most marked features of the Anglo-American detective story is that it is strongly on the side of law and order" (p. 22). This emphasis seems to derive not from fear of violent crimes, as might be supposed. Intended to appeal to those "who have a stake in the permanence of the existing social system" (p. 23), in 1929 especially, as financial stability was under threat, it played rather on fears of political and cultural change, was supportive of established patriarchal authority in all its forms and so was suspicious and distrustful of any character shown in a British setting who was not conventionally male, English and upper-class. Thus, detective fiction refused to treat seriously almost everyone in society. These ideas are explored in depth and entertainingly in Colin Watson's Snobbery With Violence (1971). Yet, paradoxically, many writers, especially women, have found the genre of detective fiction, with its supposedly infallible and unmoved investigators, useful for their purposes. The explanation for this may be that the texts created are so unrepresentative of the messiness and tragedy of real crimes and the limited success rate of living detectives, and thus in themselves such artificial narratives that the genre becomes in practice open and

---

35) In the beginning there was guilt: the basic motive for reading crime fiction is the religious one of exorcizing the guilt of the individual or the group through ritual and symbolic sacrifice. The attempt is never wholly successful, for the true addict is a sort of Manichee and his spirits of light and darkness, the detective and the criminal, are fighting each other for ever. Human tribal sacrifices might be regarded as sacred, and often appeared in disguise before death, the human features being replaced by those of the devil who had to be expelled. The detective story shows this operation in reverse, the criminal appearing at first as an accepted and often respected figure. This mask is stripped away at the end of the book, when his real features as lawbreaker are seen. The detective is the equally sacred witch doctor who is able to smell out the evil that is corrupting society, and pursue it, through what may be a variety of disguises, to its source.
(Symons p. 21/2)

responsive to subversive uses. This is what Sally Munt argues in Murder by the Book? Feminism and the Crime Novel (1994). From the beginning, she tells us, women exploited the form[36]. In any case, it was in this atmosphere of "rules" that shored up English and patriarchal authority that Tey began her writing of novels. Such emphasis on central authority, on rational explanation of events, and outlawing of the expression of individual consciousness and emotional life, itself necessarily irrational in nature, surely stands in opposition to the insights, subtleties and new ideas finding expression in modernism. Yet at that time Tey chose to use the genre of detective fiction with all its supposed restrictions and limitations, seeming to find in it an ideal ironic framework for a woman writing from a marginal position in British society. Her choice was to mobilise her gifts to use the detective novel as a vehicle to demolish the very certainties it strove to defend, turning the genre against itself and against society as a whole.

## 2. Relevant Literary Theory

Tey's detective fiction begs to be examined in the now recognised tradition of the writing of Scottish women acclaimed in their day but, perversely, disregarded after their deaths. Her texts offer such a profusion of clues to be followed up that I found it necessary to clarify and validate my approach to their interpretation. That many echoes of other texts are present establishes the kind of interconnections thought important by such eminent dissectors of the novel as Mikhail Bakhtin[37] and Roland Barthes. Their analyses confirmed me in my use of the concept of intertextuality in relation to Tey's work.

This quest to explore the unusual elements in Tey's work first suggested itself to me as an examination with her own personal position in mind and certainly,

---

36) Thus even in the genre's origins certain fundamental structures emerge that are to be characteristic of the meeting between women and crime fiction: utopian models of female agency; and exploitation of the transgression of social mores by the employment of disruptive humour and parody; an irreverent 'feminizing' of male authority myths; the coded deployment of stereotypes (e.g. the refined white-haired spinster, the enthusiastic and naive young virgin) which signal to the reader the seeds of subversion. (Munt p. 6/7)

37) Four of Bakhtin's essays are reproduced in The Dialogic Imagination, ed. Michael Holquist (University of Texas Press, 1996).

as I indicated earlier, these texts contain autobiographical elements and explanations of her own personal position. All her work is redolent of political protest on behalf of persecuted minorities, along with, as a somewhat strange bedfellow, the defence of ancient rights of title. Yet, as I embarked on the study of her idiosyncratic version of the detective novel, seeking to explain its strangeness by uncovering clues referring directly to her life and personal position, I found the texts to offer, rather, self-conscious literary clues open to, and ultimately demanding, a structuralist, and poststructuralist, interpretation. These literary clues gradually assumed more importance than either obvious references to her own background or conventional, material clues pointing to the identities of fictional criminals, so strongly recommended to writers of detective novels and found by critics to be sadly lacking in Tey's work. This lack is very apparent in the book, where the following up of such clues is foregrounded by the narrative as a waste of time.

That Tey's novels offer literary clues pointing to their status as entities depending on a network of other texts is an idea illumined by the theories of Roland Barthes. He used the systematic procedures Saussure had applied to analysing the workings of language as a model in his analyses of literary structures themselves. Words were seen to work according to a fixed system creating meanings that are relational, depending on processes working within the differential system of language itself. The Russian literary theorist Bakhtin, however, had developed these ideas with his suggestion that language does not work as a fixed system, but rather as one in which each utterance should be seen as operating in a specific social situation. In so doing, each bears traces of previous utterances. Bakhtin identified prose fiction as doing greater justice to this aspect of language than the older genres of epic and lyric. This he found to be because the novel presents conflicting voices (even in one utterance by a single person) which are essentially dialogic. These voices include that of the narrator. But, for Bakhtin, the author is still a presence behind the novel. Barthes went much farther. Working on these theories, Barthes postulated the demise of the notion of the writer as a god-like authority, consciously imbuing each work with a discoverable and final meaning. Further, the literary sense made of a text by a reader is in its turn not subject to final stabilisation. I discuss these ideas later in this Section.

Tey's texts lend themselves to unravelling in detail and being analysed closely. This acts as a reminder of Barthes' later suggestion in S/Z[38] that any narrative may be regarded as predominantly lisible and readerly or scriptible and writerly. By writerly texts he meant those which exhibit consciousness of themselves as texts and make demands on the reader to produce meanings. He had in mind modernist works such as those of his compatriot Alain Robbe-Grillet. In writing in English, texts by T.S. Eliot, James Joyce, Catherine Carswell and Virginia Woolf are examples. As I have indicated, the appearance of such challenging work has been interpreted widely by Bradbury and many others as a response to powerful new concepts in philosophy, politics, science and medicine influential in the first decades of the twentieth century. It is seen also as responding to the calamity of the First World War which shook the foundations of thinking in the Western world. In contrast to these innovative scripts, the detective novel of the time was assumed to be one of the most readerly and undemanding of forms and is still, despite its development and erudite comment by critics such as Garber and Munt, commonly cited as an example of such by prominent literary analysts. An example is J.A. Cuddon in his Dictionary of Literary Terms and Literary Theory (1992)- "a 'closed' text (e.g. a whodunit by Agatha Christie) [...]more or less determines or predetermines a reader's response" (p. 771). A structuralist critic working in France alongside Barthes, Tzvetan Todorov, asserted in 1966 that detective novels especially cannot afford to draw attention to their status as literary texts. "No author of detective fiction can permit himself to admit directly the imaginary character of the story, is it happens in 'literature' " ("The Typology of Detective Fiction" quoted in Modern Criticism and Theory ed. David Lodge (1991), p. 160)[39]. Reading this, I began to suspect that Tey was an early, as yet undiscovered, example of a writer of detective fiction who subverted the genre by indicating clearly the "imaginary character" of her story, showing its links with what Todorov calls "literature."

---

38) S/Z (London: Jonathan Cape, 1974).

39) The essay from which this comes, "The Typology of Detective Fiction", appeared in The Poetics of Prose (1977). This book had first been published as La Poetique de la Prose in 1971.

Barthes illustrated his propositions about the nature of texts in S/Z with a close examination of Balzac's short story "Sarrasine". Paradoxically, even this text claimed as realist and readerly is found to contain a plurality of meanings. He followed it with a similar examination of Edgar Allan Poe's story of investigation "The Facts in the Case of Monsieur Valdemar" in 1973[40]. He drew attention, among many other things, to the important implications of the title, the significance of the central character's name, and the text's apparent claim to the status of social realism while it claimed also the freedom to lift away the customary censorship of discussion of the process of dying. Barthes' method of approaching works in this detail, showing them to be open to multiple and contradictory interpretations, supports his earlier contention that "the birth of the reader must be at the cost of the death of the author"[41]. My aim is to use Barthes' method to show that Tey's novels, approached by critics as if they can be presumed to be readerly and undemanding, yield up very much more than has been recognised. My tactic, following his, is to examine small sections of the texts closely to show how they carry layers of meanings, the interpretation of which depends on connections which must be made actively by the reader. My proposition is that Tey's work, disapproved of by these same critics when it departs from the prescribed formula, emerges as having much more in common with the widely recognised writerly literature of the time than has been detected.

Barthes made the relevant further claim in "Le Plaisir du Texte" (1973) that the texts which are most enjoyable for the reader are those, precisely, which cross the boundaries between the readerly and writerly, introducing avant-garde techniques into discourse which is assumed to be traditional, in the same way as "a naked body is less erotic than the spot where the garment leaves gaps" (Young, p. 31). Such a text, he argues, retains the advantage of being accessible to readers while nursing possibilities of surprising and challenging them. These theories help to clarify the continuing appeal of Tey's work, where modernist techniques are used in a genre traditionally regarded as straightforward. A complicated process of meanings can be detected to be at work. This first text of hers, I suggest, is

---

40) "Textual Analysis of Poe's 'Valdemar'", in Untying the Text, Robert Young ed. (1981).

41) Image – Music – Text, trans. Stephen Heath (London: Fontana, 1982) p. 148.

offering clues that the writing itself, breaking rules deliberately, invoking and using the techniques of modernism, must be regarded as writerly and is open to the possibility of being found to contain layer upon layer of meanings, the uncovering of which depends on the reader's ability and willingness to establish unexpected connections and make the necessary deductions. A detailed examination in the manner of Barthes is required.

One of Barthes' first suggestions is that Poe's use of the words "The Facts in the Case of" in the title suggests that his fiction has the status of realism while of course his macabre tale of a man on the point of death being hypnotised turns out to be no such thing. Similarly, Tey's use of the genre of detective fiction leads to a presumption on the part of critics that this text, also, claims to be "facts" in a "case" and has the same status of realism which Todorov declared to be an essential part of the illusion of the form. It, too, is no such thing.

It is a priority for Barthes that the names of characters should be subjected to detailed examinations. It is worth noting his remarks on this issue:

> A proper name should always be carefully questioned, for the proper name is, if I can put it like this, the prince of signifiers; its connotations are rich, social and symbolic. In the name Valdemar, the following two connotations at least can be read: (i) presence of a socio-ethnic code: is the name German? Slavic? In any case not Anglo-Saxon; this little enigma here implicitly formulated, will be resolved [later]; (ii) 'Valdemar' is 'the valley of the sea'; the oceanic abyss; the depths of the sea is a theme dear to Poe: the gulf refers to what is twice outside nature, under the waters and under the earth. From the point of view of the analysis there are, then, the traces of two codes: a socio-ethnic code and a (or the) symbolic code (we shall return to these two codes later).
>
> Saying 'M(onsieur) Valdemar' is not the same thing as saying 'Valdemar'. In a lot of stories Poe used simple christian names (Ligeia, Eleonara, Morella). The presence of the 'Monsieur' brings with it an effect of social reality, of the historically real: the hero is socialised, he forms part of a definite society, in which he is supplied with a civil title. We must therefore note: social code.
>
> Lodge (1991) p. 176/7

In the work of Tey, the name of her serial detective, Detective Inspector Alan Grant, must be of pivotal importance, despite its apparent simplicity, in which it is

similar to that of Valdemar. Careful consideration of it reveals a multiplicity of significances. I am not of course arguing that Tey imbued the name with every one of these deliberately. Barthes himself suggests, rather, searching for "connotations". As Carolyn Heilbrun puts it, discussing at length the implications of the name of Amanda Cross that she herself chose with careful deliberation to adopt for her writing of detective fiction, and denying conscious knowledge of some of these implications, "a word or name must bear [...] all the meanings that connotations attach to it" (Writing a Woman's Life, 1988, p. 116). I am far from alone in finding significance in simple names of people or places. Muir's use in her novels of the invented name Calderwick for a repressive small community indicates a cold climate where potential life forces can be expected to be snuffed out.

Alan Grant possesses a short and quite common name. Yet those of Monsieur Valdemar and Amanda Cross are hardly more complicated. The use of highly significant names is a feature of the intertextuality which is foregrounded in modernist texts. Hart found it important in the Scottish novel. Many significant examples could be quoted. I allude here to the highly charged names of Caroline Rose and Georgina Hogg used by Muriel Spark for two significant characters placed in juxtaposition to each other in her first novel The Comforters. The resonances of these names in the context of Scottish history and literature are considerable and echo exactly a choice made by Tey in Brat Farrar where Great Uncle Charles, for example, is a romantic figure whose return from Europe is eagerly anticipated. In contrast, in the same book, a Reformed clergyman named George personifies the antithesis of romance and his personal presence is almost unendurable. These choices I point to, with many others putting Jacobite and Hanoverian characteristics in opposition, in Section III.

Critics of Tey's work draw attention to her use of names where implicit references are so obscure that most readers are unlikely to notice them. Marjorie Garber discusses the implications of the choice of the name Dora Siggins for a character in To Love and Be Wise who appears briefly but whose significance is vital to the solving of the mystery.

> Dora Siggins' name may be yet another oblique Tey clue. Dora Siggerson Shorter was the author of a poem called "A Vagrant Heart" which begins "O to be a woman left to pique and pine", and includes the sentiment "there is joy where dangers be-Alas to be a woman and the nomad's heart in me". Julie Wheelwright uses "A Vagrant Heart" as the epigraph to her book on female-to-male cross-dressers, Amazons and Military Maids (London: Pandora, 1989).
>
> Vested Interests, p. 407.

Such critics, too, point to the significance of many details of her texts. What follows here is an interpretation in the same spirit as Garber of the meanings attached to the names of Tey's central figures in this first book in the detective genre in the light of the knowledge of someone of my own background and experience. Like her, I find many "oblique Tey clues". Like Barthes in his textual analysis of Poe's "Valdemar", I interpret these clues in terms of various social and symbolic codes. My interpretation is made in the light of the knowledge of someone of my own experience as a Scottish woman familiar in childhood with the Inverness area in the last years of Tey's life. In this way, I use the approach to a woman's poetry outlined by Adrienne Rich in her essay "Vesuvius at Home: The Power of Emily Dickinson". She thinks of herself as "traveling at the speed of time, along the Massachusetts Turnpike [...] trying to visit"[42]. According to Patrocino P. Schweichart, Rich's aim is to speak as a witness in defence of the woman writer and to take the historical and cultural background of the work produced into account while recognising that the writer herself cannot be reached or appropriated. Both she and the texts must be treated with respect[43].

Barthes interprets the use of the title "Monsieur" to prefix Valdemar's name as indicating the presence of a social code. He is assigned a place in a definite society. So, too, is Detective Inspector Alan Grant, who occupies a distinguished professional position. Like Valdemar, too, his surname, Grant, indicates the presence of a socio-ethnic code. It is not Anglo-Saxon but Norman in derivation, and denotes membership of an ancient Highland clan. Scottish surnames, of course,

---

42) On Lies, Secrets and Silence, Selected Prose (New York and London: Norton, 1979) p. 158. First appeared as one of the Lucy Martin Donnelly lectures at Bryn Mawr College.

43) "Reading Ourselves: toward a feminist theory of reading" in Gender and Reading: Essays on Readers, Texts and Contexts, ed. Elizabeth A. Flynn and Patrocino P. Schweickart (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1986).

carry a weight of association according to the part played in national politics and history by the families who bore them. Names such as MacGregor, MacDonald and Campbell typify this. As will become clear in my discussion, in Tey's novels clan names are used with their political implications important to the meanings they carry. In her work, the symbolic code found by Barthes in Valdemar's name is replaced by a historical and political one. (This is a characteristic of the Scottish novel.[44]) Significantly, Clan Grant occupied an ambivalent position during the period of religious wars and Jacobite uprisings. Some septs were Jacobite and some Hanoverian. Alan Grant himself is, in this first text, presented as very much an ambivalent figure poised between these two stances, unsure of his position as he delivers an apparent murderer to justice. Several times he is described as having "that twist to his mouth". Late in the text, as Grant struggles with the evidence he himself has produced, we are told that "when Grant was at war with himself his mouth had a slight twist in it, and tonight the twist was very marked" (p. 198). "Caimbeal", the origin of the name Campbell is the Gaelic for a twisted mouth[45]. Tey uses such names and oblique references, as I have indicated, to demonstrate not only the connections between her work and other texts in Scottish literature, but also the status and moral qualities of characters.

In the exemplary analysis of Tey's first detective novel that follows here, I introduce further relevant literary theory. Throughout the thesis, I find it appropriate to call on a wide variety of traditions and approaches developed during the twentieth century, which at first sight constitute a strange gathering. Ferdinand de Saussure laid the basis for this thinking in his Course in General Linguistics (1915), pointing out the nature of all language as relational. Mikhail Bakhtin saw it as essentially dialogue, every utterance being made up of previous ones and its existence presupposing others being made in the future. Feminist theory is obviously relevant. Julia Kristeva worked with theories of language and literature

---

44) A fine example is Sir Walter Scott's creation of Mrs. Bethune Balliol in Chronicles of the Canongate (1827). Bethune, or Beaton, is a name of ancient derivation, connected with distinguished men of the church and of medicine. Balliol, equally ancient, is that of a royal house seen as having betrayed Scotland. Both names are French in origin.

45) James D. Scarlett, The Tartans of the Scottish Clans, p. 46.

and coined the word intertextuality in the essay "Word, Dialogue and Novel" [46]. Catherine Belsey persuades in "Constructing the Subject: deconstructing the text" that classic works of literature, including those of Conan Doyle, should be read in new ways by women[47]. Bonnie Zimmerman uncovers heterosexist assumptions underlying feminist literary theory in "What Has Never Been: An Overview of Lesbian Feminist Literary Criticism"[48]. The discussion of the nature of narrative truth in Tey's novels makes the ideas of Wayne Booth relevant[49]. Much work is being done in Scottish literature. Recently, Christopher Harvie has dissected the popular novels of John Buchan[50]. Cairns Craig has much to say about the modern Scottish novel, and he too foregrounds the importance of narrative, in this case emphasising its function in formations of national identity[51]. His ideas are very much confirmed by Tey's novels' sustained examination of national identity. Marshall Walker, too, has reassessed Buchan and drawn comparisons between his work and that of Conan Doyle[52]. That all of these theorists, and others, can be quoted from as relevant in the following pages points to the continuing vibrancy of Tey's detective novels.

---

46) "Word, Dialogue and Novel" in Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art (New York: Columbia University Press, 1980).

47) This essay appeared in Feminist Criticism and Social Change, ed. J. Newton and D. Rosenfelt (London, Methuen, 1985). See also "Literature, History, Politics" from the journal *Literature and History*, 1983.

48) Feminist Studies 7:3, Fall 1981, University of Maryland.

49) Wayne Booth, The Rhetoric of Fiction (Chicago and London, University of Chicago Press, 1961).

50) Christopher Harvie, 'Travelling Scot, essays on the history, politics and future of the Scots (1999).

51) Cairns Craig, The Modern Scottish Novel: narrative and the National Imagination, EUP (1990).

52) Marshall Walker, Scottish Literature Since 1707 (Addison Wesley Longman, 1996).

## 3. Exemplary analysis

### Tey's first detective novel: The Man in the Queue

### i. Synopsis

The opening chapter shows people queuing in London's West End to see the last performance of a popular musical comedy. It stars the dancer and singer known as Ray Marcable who is about to leave the country for America. As the queue begins to move forward, a lifeless man sinks to the ground, a small, enamelled, exotic-looking dagger stuck in his back. A nameless fat woman gazes on in horror and another sobs hysterically. Alan Grant, who is to become Tey's serial detective, is assigned to the case. Strangely, the body is free of anything which might establish the man's identity and in his pocket is a loaded revolver.

Grant interviews the people who were near the man when he fell and, on revisiting the theatre, has tea with Marcable, whom he likes. He sends the dagger for forensic examination but discovers only that the murderer, presumed to be male, was left-handed and had sustained a small cut on the inside of his thumb. Grant and his junior colleague, Williams, dine at a first-class restaurant and a waiter, noticing them, calls at Grant's house later with the information that he had seen the man in the queue arguing with a younger, dark man who had disappeared by the time the murder was discovered. Meanwhile an envelope has arrived containing twenty-five pounds "to bury the man who was found in the queue" (p. 41). The notes are traced to a bank where the manager can say that the dead man's name was Albert Sorrell and the money was drawn from his account by a dark man, "foreign-looking, a little" (p. 74). Grant's earlier presumption that the murderer was not an Englishman but an outsider, what he thinks of as a "Dago" or "Levantine", is confirmed. Grant visits Sorrell's lodgings and discovers from the landlady, Mrs Everett, that he had been on the point of leaving England for America. The friend he lived with, Gerald Lamont, Grant identifies from a photograph as the wanted "Dago". Mrs Everett insists that she doesn't know where Lamont's new lodgings are, but, when Grant departs, hurries to warn her protégé that he is under suspicion and must give himself up or flee. She suggests he goes as an apparently casual

visitor to stay with her brother, a minister, and sister who live in a manse in a village called Carninnish in the north-west of Scotland. Grant traces these relations and follows Lamont there in "a burst to the North" (p. 118). Pretending to be fishing innocently in the neighbourhood of the manse, Grant accepts an invitation from the minister, Mr Logan, to join them for tea, where his niece, Miss Dinmont, is also present. She is a nurse who lives and works in London but is spending her holiday at her mother's home. Lamont conceals his recognition of Grant and agrees to accompany him on his walk back to the hotel. He escapes and Grant hunts energetically for him in the surrounding wild country. Lamont steals a rowing boat and makes off in it, while Grant gives chase in a motor-boat with Mr Drysdale, a Glasgow stockbroker who is on holiday in the area. Lamont is injured and almost drowned attempting to elude them and is rescued by Grant. Back at Carninnish House Lamont recovers, nursed by Dinmont. Then on the train to London he makes his statement to Grant.

His story is that he and Sorrell parted on the afternoon of Sorrell's last day in London. Sorrell gave him a small packet to be opened later. Unpacking in his new rooms, Lamont discovered that his army revolver was missing. Alarmed, he joined Sorrell in the queue and they exchanged angry words, before parting again. On opening the packet, Lamont discovered that it contained all the money Sorrell possessed. Realising that it was his friend who had been murdered, he sent twenty-five pounds to Scotland Yard and, alerted that he is under suspicion, fled.

Back at Headquarters, Grant is congratulated on his successful arrest and the customary legal proceedings against Lamont begin. But instead of feeling satisfied, Grant is tortured by instinctive doubts that somehow his case is wrong. Examining Sorrell's luggage, he finds a brooch with the monogram M.R., the entwined initials of the hysterical woman in the queue, Margaret Ratcliffe. Despite the coincidence of her having booked a passage to the USA on the same ship as Sorrell, Grant cannot establish a connection between the two. Dinmont has returned to London early, intrigued by the case, and helps intelligently with his enquiries. His doubts confirmed by her sceptical attitude, Grant nevertheless decides to give up and let the case against Lamont proceed, still feeling that the brooch is the vital clue he cannot

interpret. The fat woman from the queue then arrives in his office and confesses to being the murderer. Named for the first time, she is Mrs Wallis, the mother of the actress Ray Marcable. Sorrell, it turns out, was a rejected suitor of Marcable, and the brooch, which should be read as the entwined initials R.M., had been destined for her. Spurned, Sorrell had intended to shoot her in the theatre on her last evening in England and Mrs Wallis's only way of saving her daughter's life was to kill him first.

### ii. Problems detected by Roy and Talburt

In the context of the conventions of the time, the opening page of this first detective novel fairly trumpets Tey's iconoclastic intentions. Yet it seems that no critic, then or since, has drawn attention to its implications. Repeatedly invoked in the first paragraph is the Day of Judgement itself, normally associated with the final revelations at the end of the narrative as the triumphant and god-like detective dispenses justice (see p. 28 above). People waiting patiently in a theatre queue hear sounds likened to a "last trump" as an Olympian figure "separated the sheep from the goats" (p. 11). The queue itself, composed as it is of "the weary attendants on Thespis and Terpsichore", indicates, further, an intention to harness the techniques of modernism for startling use in this most reactionary of forms. "Greek tragedy is not popular" the narrator remarks ominously, pointing to this novel's own departure from the expected path and to Grant's career as a detective who is insecure, fallible and under threat.

Despite some characteristics agreed to be unconventional, the book was well received both on its publication in 1929 in the name of Gordon Daviot and on its reissue in 1953 as part of Tey's detective oeuvre after her death[53]. As Roy remarks correctly, "Considering both the competition and the vogue of the period, it is

---

53) From Twentieth Century Literary Criticism, vol. 14, p. 448 and p. 451 on The Man in the Queue: The New York Times Book Review, July 28th 1929, p. 13, contained a "generally favourable" review, though "it labels the crime 'preposterous'".
James Sandoe in his introduction to Three by Tey: Miss Pym Disposes, The Franchise Affair, Brat Farrar (The MacMillan Company, 1954), p. v, declares that this first detective novel is "[...] anticipating fully in texture and in interest its seven successors. Miss Mackintosh catches up in the net of her plot the same rich, acutely observed, diversity of characters- clergymen and bookies, actors and stockbrokers- one remembers from all of the tales."

amazing that The Man in the Queue received any satisfactory reviews" (p. 45)[54]. Symons praises it as "for its time and of its kind an unusually interesting performance" (p. 179) but qualifies this comment by adding immediately "although it depends upon the supposition that a man stabbed in a theatre queue will not cry out or even know what has happened, before he collapses a minute or two later".

Both Roy and Talburt are relatively unenthusiastic about this first work in the form, taking for granted that it was intended and can even be presumed to require to conform to the contemporary conventions of the genre, thus offering the reader interesting clues leading to the identity of the murderer against a background convincingly realistic. The reservations they express are telling, though they draw no conclusions from them. Roy complains that the following up of material clues which lead nowhere, like the murdered man's tie, coupled with the long accounts of Grant's mental processes, are tiresome (p. 55). The more percipient Talburt notices that Grant's "distinguishing feature is a Scottish ancestry" (p. 50) but does not build on this observation by discussing its significance, and echoes Symons' judgement on the matter by calling the stabbing of a man in the back a "bizarre crime" (p. 58). Both critics remark on the extreme suffering of the suspected murderer, Gerald Lamont, who is hounded almost to death before his appearances in court, innocent of any crime but defenceless against the forces of law and order amassed against him. They draw attention also to the doubts which plague Grant inexplicably as he reflects on the case he has created and the arrest he has made. Talburt alone considers the problem posed by the fundamental change in the detective that takes place in the course of the book. Initially, he seems to be presented conventionally as a "great detective", childishly confident to the point of being unattractively cocksure about his powers of scientific deduction. Talburt assumes that Tey changed her mind about the central character in the course of writing and decided that a more reflective character would be of greater interest to the reader as well as

---

54) [...] some of the greatest works in the genre were being written in this period. Among them were Philip Macdonald's The White Crow in 1928, Dashiel Hammet's The Dain Curse (1929) and The Maltese Falcon (1930), Margery Allingham's Crime at Black Dudley, Msgr. Ronald A. Knox's The Footsteps at the Lock (1928), The Greene Murder Case by S.S. Van Dine (1928) and Dorothy L. Sayers' Clouds of Witness and The Unpleasantness at the Bellona Club (both 1928) (Roy p. 45).

to herself, without troubling to return to alter the first few chapters[55]. Roy condemns the novel's conclusion, depending as it does on a quite unpredictable confession, as "unsatisfactory and unbelievable" (p. 55). Once again, Talburt's interpretation is the more subtle, deciding that the solution "brings into question the entire process of deduction" (p. 44) but for a third time she does not build on her perception. Grant's Scottish ancestry, the shift in the depiction of his character and the doubt posed by the text about the efficacy of traditional literary detection in pinning blame on the truly guilty are not discussed further by either of these critics. Talburt has uncovered important clues to underlying meanings in this initial foray into the detective novel but has dismissed them as weaknesses in Tey's writing. Both Roy and Talburt raise additional questions about the oddness of the murder itself and the unsatisfactory nature of material clues provided to the reader. Grant's thought processes and change of attitude provoke them to express further doubts, as do the suffering of the suspect and the unforeseeable solution provided. Problems abound in this text. But Tey's Scottish and Highland identity, as a single person, which she bestowed on both her detective and his unfortunate victim, the suspect Gerald Lamont, is not interpreted in any way. Even Talburt dismisses the frequent references to Lady Macbeth as a "false clue" (p. 68). My argument is that these supposed flaws are pointers to the unexpectedly subversive use Tey set out to make of the genre of the detective novel from a self-consciously Scottish position at a time when Scottishness itself, both literary and political, was very much under discussion.

### iii. My analysis

My point about Tey's use of names is best illustrated by a discussion in the spirit of Barthes of the name of Grant's suspect in this first novel. Gerald Lamont, who flees to a remote area of the Highlands where he is hunted down and returned to London, has a name of significance and subtlety fitting in with the unexpected

---

55) [...] it appears that divinity was intended to enter in at the nativity of the character, but that a writer of Tey's particular interests and talent ultimately found more appealing the vicissitudes of a more nearly mortal character. (Talburt p. 51).

meanings that I detect as underpinning this text which is crammed with political significance. It fits in, too, with the ambivalence of Grant's attitude to his prey once he has been captured. In the aftermath of the First World War, anyone called Jerry- as he is addressed by his friends- was automatically cast in the role of an enemy of the British state. His surname is, however, problematic. Readers based in England tend to presume it to be French and pronounce it with the emphasis on the second syllable, confirming to themselves in the process that Lamont is indeed the "Dago" Grant is so anxious to convict of the crime. Indeed, he is repeatedly referred to as "foreign looking". Those living in Scotland, on the other hand, familiar with the name carrying stress on the first syllable as its Norse origin dictates, know that this dark outsider is a native of the Scottish Highlands. (This is taken for granted when Dinmont remarks casually that Lamont's "grandmother was an Italian" (p. 142), so that he, like her, is not a pure-bred Highlander.) The socio-ethnic code that Barthes noted in the name of Valdemar is an important part of the significance of this suspect. Using it, the text conflates the Highlands of Scotland with mainland Europe as foreign to the English and likely to produce enemies of the state. A convention of the contemporary detective novel, a suspicion and vilification of continental Europeans, seems to be being upheld, while, at a deeper level in the narrative, it is being undermined. Ironically, the name Lamont is derived from "logamadr", the Norse word for a lawman or officer in a colonised state.

A further political spin is added by the poignant history of the clan. The unfortunate Lamonts were neighbours and therefore enemies of the expansionist Campbells in their heartland of Argyll, a position exacerbated by their espousing of the Stewart cause and support of the campaigns of the Marquis of Montrose. In 1646, the Campbells retaliated in two separate incidents characterised by the use of central power and the deceit associated with their behaviour later (in 1692) at the better-known massacre of Glencoe. The Lamont strongholds of Toward and Ascog were burnt down and women, children and invalids put to the sword in an attempt at total extermination[56]. Such punishment and humiliation was made very public by

---

56) ...this was the Lamont stronghold that was torched and destroyed, with much treachery and murder, by the Campbells in 1646 after a long siege.

the Campbells and the spectacle of large numbers of Lamonts being hanged from trees in the town of Dunoon has never been forgotten. The clan name was proscribed, survivors fleeing north and adopting the name of Black, which many use to this day. As this single, lonely Lamont flees to a remote northern village, he is pursued by Grant, whose own family origins are in the Highlands but who is acting as a Campbell-like self-interested agent of London-based power intent on having his victim hanged. Tey's use of Lamont for the name of his victim means nothing to critics unfamiliar with the bitter conflicts of Scottish history. Yet in the Inverness in which Tey was born in the nineteenth century, where the Jacobites made their last stand at the Battle of Culloden, and the Duke of Cumberland took his notorious revenge on the area, such stories of atrocities by Campbells and Hanoverians would have been the stuff of everyday conversation. They were familiar to me growing up, even in Glasgow, fifty years later. Her use of the name Lamont for Grant's innocent victim resounds with unassuaged resentment and powerless rage at undeserved punishment felt down the centuries in the Jacobite heartland. Jacobite trials, of course, took place in England because in Scotland convictions were unlikely. When that representative of London power, Alan Grant, replies to a Highland woman's concern about Lamont's medical condition, her abrupt body language draws his attention to "the unhappiness" of the phrase he has used. He has suggested that Lamont will receive "south treatment" (p. 159).

Gerald Lamont's name is, like that of Valdemar and Grant, apparently simple. Such simplicity does not indicate lack of depth in its connotations. Garber indicates that Tey uses apparently unimportant names like that of Dora Siggins as carriers of quite obscure meanings which have to be interpreted as "oblique clues" (see p. 35 above). Such clues repeatedly undermine the established structures of society. In my discussion of Tey's handling of narrative authority in this first detective novel, I examine this characteristic further. Certainly, the presence of this

---

It was the property of the Lamonts, who had held lands in Cowal from 1200 or earlier. [...]. The Lamonts were Royalists, and in 1646 the Campbells captured, looted and torched the castle. Although the Campbells had promised that the Lamonts could go free, they massacred and mistreated any Lamonts they found, including old folk, women and children. They took many of the captives back to Dunoon where they hanged 36 from one tree. (Entries on Ascog Castle and Toward Castle in The Castles of Scotland, by Martin Coventry 3rd edition, 2001.)

racial and political outsider, Gerald Lamont, who becomes Grant's first victim, announces, in sideways fashion, the disruptive nature of her writing.

I return now to further discussion of the significance of, and connections established by, the name of Tey's serial detective, which is rooted in Scottish literature. Alan Grant's first name connects him with Robert Louis Stevenson's Highland adventurer, Alan Breck Stewart and the events in Kidnapped and Catriona, yet another clue that the aftermath of Culloden when that character was a fugitive is relevant to the import of the text. Alan Breck is a confirmed bachelor, uneasy in the presence of a woman, and his final appearance on the last page of the latter book is as a welcome, but secret and lonely, visitor to the established Lowland household of David and Catriona Balfour. A further connection with this book is established in his sharing of his surname with the dubiously moral yet authoritative figure, William Grant of Prestongrange, Lord Advocate, and his beautiful daughter Barbara Grant, who warns that there is "something of danger in the name of Alan" (p. 40).

It is emphasised in Grant's first appearance that he is an aristocrat of great wealth.

> Some years before, Grant had inherited a considerable legacy- a legacy sufficient to have permitted him to retire into idle nonentity if such had been his desire. But Grant loved his work even when he swore and called it a dog's life, and the legacy had been used only to smooth and embroider life until what would have been the bleak places were eliminated, and to make some bleak places in other lives less impossible [...]. It was owing entirely to the legacy, therefore, that Grant was an habitué of so exclusive an eating place as Laurent's, and- a much more astonishing and impressive fact- a pet of the head waiter's. Only five persons in Europe are pets of Laurent's head waiter, and Grant was thoroughly conscious of the honour, and thoroughly sensible of the reason (p. 42).

Possessed of social and financial advantages, he conforms, of course, to the convention of the detective novel of the time, and is a figure comparable to Lord Peter Wimsey, the creation of Dorothy Sayers. Yet Wimsey is not presented as importantly wealthy in international terms, as is Grant. As he is of Scottish lineage, the clear implication is that he is a member of the Inverness-shire family heading Clan Grant, traditionally boasted of locally as more impressive than the

monarchy. In his final appearance, when he visits his family home, the seat of the head of the clan, this interpretation of his position is confirmed. The use of a social code, as pointed to by Barthes, is implicated once again. My own childhood memory, from the 1950s, of that part of Scotland is of holidaymakers - Mr Drysdale, the Glasgow stockbroker, is a typical example - being informed defensively, and repeatedly, by shopkeepers of the great wealth possessed by the Grants. "The Countess of Seafield is richer than the Queen" ran the mantra, making the clear claim that no local person could possibly be impressed by any visitor, however wealthy. This boast must have been more than familiar to Tey, whose father ran a greengrocer's shop in Inverness. Indeed, an inordinate pride of clan and family and boast of its position in relation to royalty is a tradition in Scotland, found also in Alan Breck's boast "I bear a King's name" (p. 57), and in the motto of the proscribed MacGregor clan "Royal is my race". That Grant is revealed quite casually as being one of the five richest people in Europe, with half of the aristocracy at his beck and call[57], stands as ironic comment, I suggest, on the exaggerated pride of the inhabitants of Inverness-shire at that time. It works, equally, as comment on the convention of the wealthy gentleman detective in the genre of the time, in the same way as the use of the "foreign" name Lamont does on the convention of the suspect "Dago".

Early in the narrative, the nature of Grant's mental activity, (objected to, as I have noted, by critics of Tey's work), is explicitly compared to the technique of a literary innovator. His thoughts are

> Not the painful tabulations of Barker, that prince of superintendents, but the speculative revolving of things which he, Grant, found more productive. He numbered among his acquaintance a poet and essayist, who sipped tea in a steady monotonous rhythm, the while he brought to birth his masterpieces. His digestive system was in a shocking condition, but he had a very fine reputation among the more precious of the modern littérateurs. (p. 40)

This reference implicates the literary establishment of the time, including the prominent Bloomsbury Group, surely the most "precious" of the "littérateurs" of

---

57) Grateful to the waiter at Laurent's Grant promises "When you are mâitre d'hôtel, I'll come and stay and bring half the aristocracy in Britain" (p. 92).

the time. Not only is Grant an aristocrat, but he also moves in headily upmarket literary circles. Such an unexpected association works as an indication this novel itself should be regarded as departing from the detective novel presented as a realist text in which the use of traditional "painful tabulations" and the use of logic will lead inexorably to the truth.

Grant is presented, then, in 1929, as a member of the leading family in Clan Grant who has an established career in London and moves in avant-garde literary circles. Such a person did in fact exist, and is involved in this text. The Inverness-shire born but London-based scion of that family, Duncan Grant, was a painter and member of that same celebrated and sophisticated Bloomsbury Group. Far from having lost touch with his roots, this Grant was well-known on the Seafield Estates, where he is still remembered as bringing his illustrious associates on climbing expeditions.

> Keynes, the world-famous economist, was of course a leader of the Bloomsbury Set with Lytton Strachey, the author, [...].
>
> Keynes was also a veritable mine of information on Scottish and global tourism, spending week-long bachelor climbing parties in remote Inverness-shire arranged by Duncan Grant, of Rothiemurchus, and could also advise on the delights of Sicily to Strachey as a tourist's destination.
>
> The economic adviser to both Britain and America, who presumably knew, instead "recommended him to go to Tunis where 'bed and boy' were cheaper". Perhaps visitscotland should study Maynard Keynes's works for other marketing opportunities.
>
> Alistair Campsie, Letter to the Editor, *The Herald*, 31st March 2001

The implication of the name Duncan has a second significance here. Later in this Section, I discuss the way in which Shakespeare's Macbeth itself acts as a key to this text, in which Marcable is the evil influence who did not commit the murder in person but whose self-centredness and ambition was the cause of it. These references carry the suggestion that the murdered Duncan of the Scottish play, one of Scotland's earliest kings, lurks in the atmosphere and that the detective himself, who is initially charmed by Marcable but comes to see her as selfish and unscrupulous, is a potential victim. In the play, itself so dreaded that its name cannot be mentioned in the theatrical circles in which Tey moved, Duncan was

murdered at Cawdor Castle on the Moray Firth. This castle was not yet built at the time of Duncan's death but its history is appropriately bloody and hair-raising. By the time of the religious wars that are central to the issues treated in Tey's later books, it was a stronghold of the Campbells who had inherited it by the means of kidnapping the infant heiress in 1500 and marrying her to a younger son of the Earl of Argyll. In the process they burnt down the neighbouring seat of Clan Mackintosh, Daviot Castle, an atrocity Tey, both in her own family name and Daviot persona, was likely to resent as a personal affront. Commentators on Tey's work repeat the idea that she chose to write in the name Daviot because she enjoyed childhood holidays in the village of that name near Inverness[58]. While that idea has validity, I suggest that a darker subtext is involved. In the ancient graveyard at Daviot lie the earliest known chiefs of Clan Mackintosh, but the line is broken abruptly and disappears at the end of the fifteenth century. Tey's preferred choice of pseudonym makes a political as well as personal point rather than a sentimental one. It is significant that this first detective novel appeared in the name of Gordon Daviot and it was not until its reissue after her death that it joined her later books in the genre as one of the works of Josephine Tey. The usurping of ancient rights of title by force inspired much of Tey's writing, as her production of later, important works in drama and fiction[59] championing the defeated English kings, Richard II and Richard III, in turn, shows. According to Mairi MacDonald, the Inverness based commentator on Tey's life, Tey's generation at the Royal Academy there benefited from especially inspiring teaching of Shakespeare's plays[60]. MacDonald sees this teaching as providing the impetus for Tey's reassessment of the characters of the two Richards. Shakespeare's portrayal of Duncan, a rightful king of Scotland, being murdered by an ambitious usurper on the outskirts of Inverness itself, in a process that eventually involves the suppression of her own

---

58) Talburt p.44
McDonald p. 121

59) Richard of Bordeaux (R II)
Dickon (R III)
The Daughter of Time (R III)

60) Many were the hours spent in discussion as to why Hamlet had obeyed a particular impulse under certain emotions; whether Shylock was just a typical Jew or an everyday userer indigenous to any nation, or whether Richard II was indeed "lily-livered" or what was now termed "pacifist", and if "pacifist", a great, rather than a weak character. (MacDonald p. 116.)

clan identity, arouses an emotionally charged response in this work. Throughout her career her texts vilified Campbells, Scottish covenanters and other enemies of the Stewart dynasty. Her use of Macbeth as a text underpinning the narrative in this first detective novel, to which I draw attention later in this analysis, confirms a parallel championing of Duncan. In weaving together so many literary and historical identities for Alan Grant, closely connected with the Inverness area and stretching from Scotland's earliest royal house to twentieth century contemporaries, Tey created, in the use of this simple-sounding name, the most local of heroes.

There are many other minor Man in the Queue characters whose names bear analysis comparable to Garber's discussion of that of Dora Siggins. Mr Drysdale's name is chosen, similarly, as another "oblique Tey clue", in tribute to Sara Tytler's novel, St. Mungo's City, which features a Glasgow entrepreneur of that name. From the beginning, in this way, Tey placed herself in the tradition of writing by Scottish women. Other examples are those of the self-indulgent Mrs. Ratcliffe, her sympathetically presented sister Miss Lethbridge and the tenacious Dandie Dinmont. Mrs. Field's name, however, is central to this text. She is Grant's housekeeper and as a character is a fine satirical creation familiar to Scots as the kind of English person who exhibits ritual hostility by dwelling on the country's supposed deficiencies in weather, food and customs. Mrs Field's sister, returning from service on a Scottish estate, reported that: "the natives had never heard of tea-cakes and called scones 'skons'" (p. 125). The mild Grant, packing his fishing clothes lovingly for his trip to the Highlands, merely remarks "How barbaric". Her mispronunciation of "scones" is an echo of the expected mispronunciation, by readers outwith Scotland, of the name "Lamont". It is impossible to convey to the complacent Mrs. Field any conception that Scotland might have a valid cuisine, culture and traditions of its own. On Grant's return, disconsolate, dissatisfied with the arrest of Lamont he has made, "Mrs. Field blamed it unconditionally on the Scots: their food, their climate and their country; and said dramatically to her husband, after the manner of a childish arithmetic, 'If four days in a country like that makes him like this, what would a month do?' [...] she made no secret of her beliefs and prejudices" (p.201). Her name connects her with the "cowlike" English

countryside (p. 218) which Grant contrasts with turbulent Highland rivers and scenery in episodes placed so that they provide the text with a frame.

> When he had run the Dago to earth, he would wangle some leave- sick leave, if he couldn't get it any other way- and go fishing somewhere. Where should he go? You got the best fishing in the Highlands, but the company was apt to be darned dull. He would go fishing in the Test- at Stockbridge, perhaps. Trout were poor sport, but there was a snug little pub there, and the best of company. And he would get a horse to ride there, and turf to ride it on. And Hampshire in Spring-! (p. 26)
>
> And presently he would have that holiday. He would go down to Stockbridge and fish. Or should he go back to Carninnish? Drysdale had given him a very warm invitation, and the Finley would be teeming with salmon just now. But somehow the thought of that swift brown water and that dark country was ungrateful at the moment. It spoke of turmoil and grief and frustration; and he wanted none of that. He wanted a cow-like placidity, and ease, and pleasant skies. He would go down to Hampshire. It would be green there now, and when he grew tired of the placid Test waters there would be a horse and the turf on Danebury (p. 218).

These two passages, one occurring at the end of the chapter in which Alan Grant makes his first appearance and the other at the close of the book, are worth their quotation at length. They set out a choice he must make which will affect his health throughout his career. (In To Love and Be Wise, a chilling mention of Hampshire indicates that his resorting there and refusing to recognise the Scottish element in his make-up threatens him with death[61]). They foreshadow, too, his return to fish in Scotland in the last book, in which he finally recovers. Ironically, the "sick leave" he takes to do this he does not "wangle" but has forced on him by his psychological condition made manifest in agonising claustrophobia. This development of the character from novel to novel forms an important part of the cumulative meaning of these texts.

That a contrast between Englishness and Scottishness is a topic of this first book is flagged up early in the text when English and Scottish behaviour in queues is stated by the narrator to be different.

---

61) Grant had just come back from Hampshire where a case had ended unhappily in suicide, and his mind was still reviewing the thing, wondering how he might have managed things differently to a different end (To Love and Be Wise, p. 71).

> Up in the front of the queue where the order was less mathematically two-and-two than down in the open, the excitement of the door-opening had for a moment or two overcome the habitual place-keeping instinct of the Englishman - I say Englishman advisedly: the Scot has none of it. (p. 13).

Conventional clues to the identity of the murderer, are, as the critics point out, absent. Clues to the vital issues treated in this text are, however, thick on the ground. The use of these three names, Lamont, Grant and Field establishes a major thrust of the text. Any possible unity in the United Kingdom is put in question with emphasis on the separate character and past struggle and suffering of Scotland. The sensitive Alan Grant, placed ambivalently and acting his part as a Campbell-like Golden Age detective, attempting to restore order, is taking on an impossible political project. The suggestion of Barthes, confirmed in the work of Hart, Carolyn Heilbron and Garber, that careful examination of names used in a text can be productive of unexpected meanings and connotations is borne out here.

Barthes made clear, too, the importance of analysing the symbolic field present in a text[62]. Both Roy and Talburt draw attention to symbols in Tey's texts central to each narrative and, in this one, point to the queue itself and the murder weapon, the dagger, as important. I concur in this, but find that further and more subtle interpretations of both can be detected. Their suggestion certainly seems justified that the queue, composed of people who are part of a crowd lacking in discernment, acts as an expression of Tey's own personal distancing of herself from those around her. I think, further, that attention is being drawn to the single status and anonymity of the man found murdered as well as that of the man being sought for, in the queue. Unlike Monsieur Valdemar, this victim possesses no name or family background and his social position is immediately put in question. He stands alone in a queue which is emphasised as consisting of people in pairs. At the inquest, the coroner wearily remarks "Yes, I was aware that queues usually go two by two" (p. 39) and "the jury allows themselves to snigger". Singleness in society and the vulnerability associated with it are central issues drawn attention to at the outset and backed up by a multiplicity of further references. Among these are

---

62) Young, p. 156.

images of the Flood, allusions to Greek tragedy and the comparison (direct this time) of Grant's pursuit of Lamont to the searches instigated by Hanoverian authority for individual fleeing Jacobites in the Highlands after Culloden. Mr. Drysdale's response to Grant's presence is to recall that "Even in the forty-five, they didn't come here looking for anyone, and no-one certainly has done it since [...]. Why, drunk and incapable is the most horrible crime that this neighbourhood has known since the flood" (p. 133).

The second symbol drawn attention to is the dagger. Grant's early interpretation of it as the murder weapon leads him astray in a way typical of a Golden Age detective. "No thorough Englishman used such a weapon [...] the very femininity of it proclaimed the Levant" (p. 16). It indicates to Roy and Talburt in its sinister foreignness reprehensibly racist attitudes held by Tey herself in her own person[63], prompted by such sentences as "Grant knew the Londoner's mulish habit of clinging to the town he knows, and the Dago's rat-like preference for the sewers rather than the open" (p. 64). Virginia Morris, in her article on Josephine Tey in The Dictionary of Literary Biography, Volume 77, goes so far, even, as to accuse the text itself of "xenophobia" (p. 288). In view of my interpretation of the use of the name Lamont as indicating sympathy for the racial and political outsider pursued by Campbell-like murderous forces of authority, I can hardly agree with this easy condemnation. I find that the dagger is central to the working of the narrative in a much more complicated way. A vital clue is provided when Grant's superior, the aptly named Barker, remarks that the weapon is "more like something out of a book than part of an honest-to-goodness crime" (p. 25). The reservations about the nature of the murder itself expressed by Symons, Talburt and the anonymous critic in *The New York Times* are justified. It is not to be interpreted and judged as a believable crime but rather as "something out of a book". What has not been recognised is that the artificiality and literariness of the crime are themselves important evidence, pointing to the way in which this narrative should be read. As I discuss later in this Section, this text depends heavily on other texts and these are,

---

63) "Grant, and also Tey, the reader might assume, was not fond of foreigners." (Roy p. 51.)
There is also in Tey the less attractive but characteristic ethnocentrism of the classic detective novel: Grant is casually chauvinistic towards foreigners. (Talburt p. 67-8.)

overwhelmingly, in Grant's description of the crime on the same page, "un-English".

Roy identifies a third major symbol, the much admired oval, monogrammed brooch of pearls making up the initials MR. This she finds to be a symbol of femininity. I take this idea further. It is a beautiful object whose owner will be "a lucky devil" (p. 196). In the final pages it is explicitly paired with the male symbol of the dagger, now referred to as a knife, much to the latter's detriment. It has been the focus of attention but turned out to be "so barren a clue" (p. 201). The brooch, now recognised by Grant as the key to solving the mystery, "glowed a silent and complete refutal of all their puny theories" and, he realises, "it was shouting its tale at them, only they could not hear" (p. 202). It is referred to continually in sexual terms. Its velvet case is a "bed" (p. 183) and, as Mrs Wallis is ushered in to make her confession, Grant's left hand is "caressing the handle of the drawer that held the brooch" (p. 205). The tale it is shouting which authority, obsessed with the knife, cannot hear, is that of the key importance of female sexuality in this text. When the brooch is read correctly as saying R M rather than MR, the opposite of what it was presumed to be saying, the mystery is solved. Female sexuality is a key issue. The text itself emerges as female centred, and this book, I argue, should be read, like the brooch, as saying the opposite of what critics, seeing it as a conventional detective novel and thus supportive of patriarchal society, assume it to be saying.

In his examination of Poe's narrative, Barthes draws attention to the lifting of the customary censorships of the process of dying and suggests that further examples of such transgression may be found in other supposedly conformist texts. Tey's first detective novel displays such an example in its innovative treating of gay or ambiguous sexuality. Lamont and his friend Bert Sorrell are established as a couple who have lived together for several years with no time for other friends, choose to be photographed in a romantic setting on the river and who, their landlady declares on producing the picture "never did a wrong thing in their lives" (p. 91). Sorrell, meanwhile, has a long-standing attachment to the actress Ray Marcable which has become more important to him, and he and Lamont part company just

before the book opens. Lamont himself, fleeing from Grant's clutches to the Highlands, is attracted to a young woman he meets there, Dandie Dinmont. Grant, of course, is a confirmed bachelor like many of his literary predecessors, Sherlock Holmes among them. A strong hint of this central issue is given in the first chapter when a romantic tenor attempts to entertain the waiting theatregoers and is dismissed by the narrator as offering "inappropriate resurrection of decayed sentiment" (p 13). Tey writes, in terms of the conventions of the detective novel, as a multiple outsider. Not only is the Highland Scot shown to be an easy prey to London-based authority, but so too is the single person or anyone of dubious sexuality.

Dinmont is the first to appear of Tey's strikingly independent and attractive woman characters. Born and brought up in the Highlands, she yet had a father from the Border country and so is saved from having "in a pure-bred degree all the stubbornness and stinking pride" shared by her mother and uncle (p. 142). This overweening pride, apparently, extends to a conception of being impervious to the vicissitudes of living which have affected all other human beings, at least back to the time of Noah. Dinmont's mother is "solid Highland, back to the flood and before. Logans are Maclennans you know and there never was a Maclennan who hadn't a boat of his own" (p. 142). No Logan had any need to stand in the queue for Noah's Ark. Dinmont herself is a nurse in London who lives at her club. Even she is not able to solve the crime but her intelligence and awareness that convincing police cases exist "where the evidence is nothing but a lot of things that have nothing to do with each other put together [...] like a patchwork quilt" (p. 192) shakes Grant's confidence in the case that his own rational, London-based and supposedly English self has created. Only the voluntary confession of the murderer, Mrs. Wallis, saves him from being a Campbell-like murderer in his turn of the innocent Lamont.

Figures such as Dinmont and Wallis are far from the shadowy and mysterious female characters traditionally found in the detective novel. This text is making clear its opposition to any claim an unsuspecting reader might suppose it to be making to be in support of rational thinking and the values of patriarchal society. Grant is presented at the outset as a comically immature product of an English

public school who takes cold baths. Alarmingly, he cheerfully invokes trusting in the Lord and manipulating the evidence (p. 33). Grant, accompanying Lamont away from the manse with the aim of arresting him, thinks of Dinmont with the contemptuous attitude which is traditional in the fictional detective's attitude to women[64]. "And then Miss Dinmont came out to join her uncle, who was seeing them off the premises, and Grant had a sudden fear that she was going to offer to accompany them. [...] He had no desire for a scene with a hysterical female, if it could be avoided" (p. 144). Once he has made his arrest and taken Lamont's statement, however, he becomes introspective and moody and declares that "logic carried to excess is madness" (p. 214). By this time, he has been seen twiddling his toes in a hot bath (p. 179). He does this as he is on the brink of having his whole case put in question by the perceptive and far from hysterical Dinmont (p. 407). Talburt notices that the character of Grant has undergone a transformation in the course of the novel. She puts it down to Tey's having simply changed her mind about his presentation (see p. 41 above). Rather, I suggest, he is shown to have found the use of logic and traditional detective work inadequate in this case and is struggling with his own instinctive knowledge that Lamont is innocent. In changing her investigator from a childishly confident authority figure to a man tortured by his intuitive knowledge but trapped in his position as a professional detective, Tey is writing as a Scot, a single woman and a Highland based Jacobite, doing for these groups of outsiders what Catherine Belsey puts forward as necessary when she concludes her essay "Literature, history, politics" with the statement "we must fiction a literature which renders up our true history in the interests of a politics of change" (Lodge, 1991, p. 410). Interestingly in the context of Tey's first book, Belsey's later discusses Macbeth, suggesting in "Constructing the Subject, Deconstructing the Text" that a political reading of the play shows it to offer a route to encountering forbidden discourses, such as witchcraft, regicide, madness and suicide which themselves repudiate patriarchal structures of religion, law, medicine

---

64) As a lover, he would have placed himself in a false position. He never spoke of the softer passions save with a gibe and a sneer. (A Scandal in Bohemia, in Sherlock Holmes: The Major Stories with Contemporary Critical Essays, ed. Jon A. Hodgson (New York: Bedford Books, 1994, p. 32; first published in *The Strand*, 1891.)

and history (p. 407). Tey's use of this text enables her work, too, to encounter forbidden discourses. Belsey's ideas will be further discussed later in this Section.

Working in France and following in the steps of Saussure and Bakhtin, Julia Kristeva built on their ideas as structuralism was replaced by poststructuralism. Her suggestion, like that of Barthes, is that criticism cannot be considered to be objective but rather must be seen as unstable. Texts, she proposed, inevitably depend on other texts. In 1966, in this context, she was the one to coin the helpful term "intertextuality" in "Word, Dialogue and Novel" and returned to the idea in 1974 in "Revolution in Poetic Language"[65]. By this term, she meant not just that any text can be shown to be a mosaic of quotations from other texts. She draws on semiotics and shares their conception that texts exist in the field of signs, defined by their relationship to a multiplicity of other signs. This intertextuality is destructive of binary systems and emerges as being the way in which a play of deferred meanings is set up. Tey, I find, used these characteristics of intertextuality to imbue her narratives with unexpected meanings. The novels' apparent simplicity does not indicate a lack of depth. In my discussion of the nature of narrative authority to be found in them, I find her to have used the genre of the detective novel as an ironic framework for the dissemination of subversive ideas.

The term Kristeva invented is used now to signify the multiple ways in which any one literary text is inseparably inter-involved with other texts. This involvement can be indicated in various ways and four are listed in Graham Allen's Intertextuality. It can be by pointing to specific works (as the text by Tey under discussion cites Macbeth directly). Connections can also be by allusion. The allusion may be fairly obvious to an educated public, as is Tey's re-use here of names, such as Logan and Master Robert, connected with Hogg's Confessions, a key text on which much writing by Scottish women in the twentieth century depends. The name of Dandie Dinmont, too, is a reference to Walter Scott's novel Guy Mannering But modernist writers, including Joyce and Eliot, often include allusions that are specialised or drawn from private reading or experience, aware that few readers will recognise them. Tey's use of the names of Highland clans,

---

65) Both essays appear in The Kristeva Reader, ed. Toril Moi, Basil Blackwell, London, 1986.

such as Grant, Lamont and Campbell, is done in the knowledge that their political significance will be apparent only to readers with a detailed knowledge of the history of the Highlands and of the Jacobite uprisings. Others of her allusions, like her use of the name Dora Siggins as pointed to by Garber, are thoroughly obscure and likely to be uncovered only by detective work by similarly scholarly annotators. For example, her use of the name Drysdale as a reference to writing by a Scottish woman (Sara Tytler- see p. 49) might go unnoticed. Tey's writing is highly political. Yet it would be absurd to castigate critics outwith Scotland, or even those here, for failing to pick up on this allusion. A third way that a text's intertextual status can be established is by the re- use of well-known or formal features of an earlier text or group of texts. Tey's re-use of features of the Scottish novel and of the detective novel in particular is striking. In this first work, her use of the Day of Judgement in the opening scene establishes a relationship with the genre in which she is working which is highly subversive. Finally, a text may exhibit awareness of itself as a discourse intersecting with other discourses of the past, present, or even future, in other forms. I make connections in the later pages of this Section between this first text of Tey's in the detective genre, and other discourses, legal and political as well as literary. The Jacobite rebellions of the eighteenth century and the contemporary furore over the suffering of Oscar Slater (p. 76 below) are both relevant. An examination of Tey's tests with Kristeva's thinking in mind reveals abundant clues pointing to the relevance of other texts. References to symbols of ancient origin (such as the queue, the dagger and the brooch) and to Jungian archetypal myth (such as the Flood), are prominent. Seminal works of Scottish literature are evoked constantly, and references to other well-known historical and contemporary texts are multiplied to the point where "altogether they speak to each other independently of the intention of their authors", as Umberto Eco put it in his examination of a popular film, which appeared in 1942[66].

A piece of writing, then, cannot be shown to have a single, fixed meaning. Any criticism, according to Barthes, must be seen as essentially unstable and, in turn, sets up another free play of multiple significances. This means that I have to

---

66) "Casablanca: Cult Movies and Intertextual Collage", in Faith in Fakes (London: Martin, Secker and Warburg, 1986) p. 199.

acknowledge that my own reading, however exciting I find it, must be regarded as provisional. Yet it is a reading which uses experience and information available only to someone of my generation and background. Further, such a multiplicity of very specific allusions which cannot, by their nature, be accessible to most readers, is thought of as one of the features of modernism. Similarly, while Tey can no longer be regarded as the "author" of her books in the old fashioned sense, I do not wish to lose sight of the very unusual location from which these detective novels were produced or the specific political and historical readings that they allow.

My own unravelling of these texts reveals multiple connections with others. Narrative authority is seen to be questioned and subverted. Just as, according to Barthes' claim, the lifting of one censorship implies the removal of others, so the subverting of one authoritative system suggests the undermining of others[67]. Tey's deceptively simple works, subverting the authority of the detective novel from within, are likely to subvert other systems usually regarded as not open to question. What I found to be set in motion is best expressed in the words of Barthes.

> What may be called an anti-theological activity, an activity that is truly revolutionary since to refuse to fix meaning is, in the end, to refuse God and his hypostases - reason, science, law.
>
> "The death of the author" (Image - Music - Text. p. 147).

## iv. Feminist theory relevant to The Man in the Queue

I turn now in my consideration of this text from the ideas of the post-structuralists to discussion of the very different contribution to the debate of theorists concentrating on feminist issues. Thanks to their work it has become clear that the history of writing is incomplete when it concentrates attention on the work of men. It is, too, widely conceded that the inclusion of women's writing in the canon expands it greatly while changing its character by subverting its assumptions

---

67) A final word, which is perhaps one of conjuration, exorcism: the text we are going to analyse is neither lyrical nor political, it speaks neither of love nor society, it speaks of death. This means that we shall have to lift a particular censorship: that attached to the sinister. We shall do this, persuaded that any censorship stands for all the others: speaking of death outside all religion lifts at once the religious interdict and the rationalist one. (Untying the Text, p. 138.)

and implicit ideology. Much has been done on an international scale to establish an alternative canon of women's texts and identify within it traditions still marginalised by the mainstream. Sally Munt has looked at women's massive contribution to the detective novel. Anderson and Christianson's recent work shows women to have turned around the way gender issues are traditionally treated in Scottish literature. While some feminist critics distrust theories of deconstruction, seeing them as irredeemably male, Catherine Belsey has produced work which mediates between the two sets of protagonists (see footnote 47 above). In 'Literature, history, politics', she uses the Saussurean ideas of Barthes. Language change and cultural change which have taken place in the past, she asserts, create openness to further change in the future as centres of power shift. As we have already noted, her essay ends with the suggestion that "we must [...] 'fiction' a literature which renders up our true history in the interests of a politics of change". This, I argue, is what Tey's first text is doing as it plays with the reader's perception of the shifting identities of both Lamont and Grant and introduces the self-reliant and perceptive Dinmont. Slightly later, in 1985, in "Constructing the Subject, Deconstructing the Text", Belsey considers four of Arthur Conan Doyle's stories featuring his supposedly rational detective Sherlock Holmes, showing how the texts themselves exhibit a Lacanian unconscious in their presentation of women, who have to remain shadowy, silent and mysterious figures. In this way, the texts testify against their own apparent claim to celebrate the power of scientific investigation and lay themselves open to other, contradictory readings. Similarly, Tey's texts offer up much testifying against the claim they appear to be making.

Already, in 1981, in 'What Has Never Been: An Overview Of Lesbian Feminist Literary Criticism', Bonnie Zimmerman had pointed out that the first feminist critics had, in their fight for revision of the canon, presumed the existence of some kind of heterosexist central authority. Just as most texts respond to a feminist reading, she argues, most could usefully be re-read from a lesbian perspective. She urges attention to the specificity of texts in particular times and places and the installation of newly-identified texts into the feminist canon. Further, she elaborates a putative lesbian aesthetic suggesting features to be looked for in women's writing. These include the use of unusual or experimental features, the

presence of a palimpsest, the setting up of a dialogue between the concepts of freedom and imprisonment and a sense of the writer's personal identification with characters vindictively pursued by forces of social conformity. Her propositions urging the re-examination of texts encouraged my consideration of Tey's novels. Her argument that any kind of a politicised ideal position has to be read in the context of the historical moment in which it was produced convinced me that the writer's background in place and time could not be ignored. The social construction of gender in that moment has to be a relevant factor[68]. The characteristics of writing Zimmerman points to as significant leap from the pages of these supposedly slight novels. Their subversion of narrative authority (discussed at the end of this Section) extends in turn to the subversion of the heterosexist structure of society.

In the light of the ground-breaking thinking of all these theorists, my examination of The Man in the Queue, written at a challenging time in the development of the novel and the ways in which it could be understood, became an intriguing investigation. I find that it draws attention consistently to its status as some kind of dream rather than as a literal reflection of reality. (Todorov's statement that such a thing is impossible in detective fiction is challenged.) It illustrates Barthes' ideas that meanings in any text multiply and admit of no absolute conclusion. With its constant internal signposts and references it is a fine example of Kristeva's and Eco's notions of intertextuality. I thus argue that its approach to the constructs of any kind of central authority places it as having in its own way pre-empted post structuralist semiotics. That it has been subject to misinterpretation over the years even when considered recently as a work of a woman fits in with Zimmerman's suggestions.

Feminist subtexts can of course be detected in many narratives produced by women in the past. Zimmerman's suggestion that such texts can be examined further for any lesbian perspective led me to apply her ideas to this book. It exemplifies every one of the characteristics she looks for. She uses as her criterion for embarking on the reconsideration of any piece of writing, attention in it to the

---

68) The background of the reader is also important in a text's interpretation. Critics involved in New Historicism, such as Marilyn Butler, confirm this. Changing political, cultural and social systems imply that the meanings of texts (including those of history itself) are never fixed.

social construction of gender in a text clearly specific to a particular time and place. This book focuses on gender while being very much part of its historical moment in joining in the argument about Scottish identity raging among the foremost writers and thinkers of the interwar years. Even more marked than this position in time is its drawing on cultural resources available in a specific area, Inverness, where the Jacobite army suffered its final defeat and the victorious Duke of Cumberland notoriously took his revenge on the area's inhabitants. It is this very strong specificity in her work that gives rise to the problems posed when her books are interpreted outside Scotland.

Having identified the time and place of a text's construction, Zimmerman looks for four particular features in it. The first is any unusual or experimental techniques it may contain. It is precisely such features which have led to the difficulties critics have with Tey's books. Strange crimes, difficulty in apportioning real guilt, inwardly divided and struggling detectives and apparently unsatisfactory conclusions have all come under fire and are not explained away when they are regarded simply as weaknesses, as Roy and Talburt treat them in respect of this first novel.

The second feature Zimmerman recommends looking for is a subtext or palimpsest telling a different story from the one the text appears to be telling. As I have discussed, this narrative puts in question issues normally taken for granted as fixed in detective fiction, and a multiplicity of subtexts can be found woven through the texture of the surface of the writing. At the end of this Section, I show how the story of Tey's own life is begun. Most importantly, a complex discussion centred on the character of Alan Grant himself is established which was to be sustained and extended until his final appearance twenty-three years later. This subtext shows him as an ambiguous figure, undecidably English/Scottish, Hanoverian/Jacobite and hetero/homosexual. Is he, this dialogue begins here by asking, to be regarded as a stereotyped London-based authority figure, bent on destroying Scots like Lamont who find themselves outside the protection of the law, with "south treatment"? Or should he be seen, rather, as a representative of an ancient and authentic

Scottishness with roots in the nation's earliest history and, as such, a potential victim like his almost name-sake, Duncan, in Cawdor Castle?

A third feature which can be identified in lesbian texts, according to Zimmerman, is yet another dialogue, that concerning the concepts of imprisonment and freedom. In this first work, Lamont and Grant are paired, both prisoners of the legal system and unable to break free. After the second scene set in court, they both depart miserably "the one to his cell and the other to his work" (p. 204). Grant's work on behalf of the state is itself a prison from which he does not escape until the end of his career.

The fourth and final suggested characteristic is a sense of the writer's personal identification with innocent characters pursued by forces of authority. Tey's identification with Lamont is strong in his role of blameless victim, who can find no defence to put forward. Roy and Talburt both draw attention to Tey's personal sympathy with the persecuted Lamont, Talburt saying that the suffering of innocents is "one of her most consistent motifs" (p. 50) but neither interprets it further.

The ideas of these feminist theorists provide a basis for my project of deconstructing Tey's text. They lend themselves to being read against conventional expectations and thus found to tell new, unexpected narratives, which may not privilege traditional patriarchy. Further, the removal of the presumptions of a heterosexual perspective allows the voice of the marginalised writer to escape from suppression and silencing.

### v. Texts involved in <u>The Man in the Queue</u>

I turn now to a discussion of seven texts involved in this first detective novel by Tey. Its roots are deep in Scottish literature, and it emerges as connecting in vital ways with the novel of its time, showing her literary career to invite close comparison with that of John Buchan and to draw on the work of Catherine Carswell. As in their work, classic texts are used to show the way in

which a single narrative is constructed. So many are used that they seem to create their own interplay independent of the writer who brought them together.

**Macbeth**

Both Roy and Talburt identify the dagger as a vital poetic image. For Roy it works as a "masculine symbol, sharp and cutting" (p. 58). When it is studied in a Scottish context, its importance is found to lie at a deeper level, as a clue to underlying meanings and connections. That the dagger is to be regarded as self-consciously literary is made clear when Barker and Grant discuss it, judging it to be "more like something out of a book than part of an honest-to-goodness crime" and as "un-English" (p. 25). It is "toy-like" (p. 46) and clearly something the narrator is playing with. The text is drawing attention to its status as text in a manner anticipating the work of much more recent writers, such as Spark, regarded as post-modernists. Rather than detracting from the novel as Symons, Roy and Talburt suggest, the odd nature of the crime comes "out of a book" and is a vital element of its force. Meanings disseminate from it. The presence of this hard-working dagger establishes connections with two key works on which Tey's text depends, Shakespeare's Macbeth and James Hogg's The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner (1824). Both are of course deeply involved with concepts of Scottish identity, confirming Grant's pronouncement that we are looking for things "un-English". The search is for allusions to Scottish texts. The repeated references to Shakespeare's Macbeth are hardly remarked on by Roy and dismissed by Talburt as "a false clue". Yet they are insisted upon. Ray Marcable's stage debut was as Lady Macbeth. Likewise the strong-minded and Scottish Mrs. Everett is nicknamed Lady Macbeth. " 'Bert was right when he christened you Lady Macbeth,' he [Lamont] said" (p. 95) and "She ruled us both. Bert used to call her Lady Macbeth, because she was Scotch and used to screw us up to doing things" (p. 173). Most important in this context is the horrifying and haunting dagger. In the play, the weapon's status as an imaginary construct is drawn attention to in these famous lines:

> Is this a dagger which I see before me
> The handle toward my hand? Come, let me clutch thee
> I have thee not and yet I see thee still.
> [...] art thou but
> A dagger of the mind, a false creation. II, 1, 33

The weapon is pointed to in Tey's novel as just such a "dagger of the mind", taken from a book and defined as "un-English", making Symons and Talburt's condemnation of the contrived nature of the murder itself as a weakness in the novel seem misguided.

The crimes committed in Shakespeare's play and this first work have even more in common. Not only are they "a false creation", but in being carried out while the victim is quite unaware of the presence of an assailant, they are cowardly. They are alike, too, in being inspired by truly guilty characters who are not their actual perpetrators. The seemingly charming Marcable is aligned with Lady Macbeth in her ambition, cold self-centredness and ability to manipulate those around her. Her ruthlessness is demonstrated early in the text by her use of her glowing personality to put the leading man on the stage with her at a disadvantage (p. 67). Watching her performance, Grant is disillusioned at finding her "hard as flint" (p. 103), and his reflection as she departs for America is that her companion "was evidently going to be managed by that clear cold will for the rest of his life" (p. 103)[69]. Playing the part of the "heroine" in Macbeth, she had been lent the dagger as a mascot by her mother. One of the few indications that Marcable is involved in the case is the recognition that flashes across her face when Grant describes the weapon to her (p. 25). The detective has no means of interpreting her reaction correctly, being inside the text, but an alert reader, with the play in mind, might pick up this important clue to her real guilt, as the inspiration of the crime. The ending is not quite as unforeseeable as critics have claimed. Indeed the last lines of Tey's novel invite readers to decide for themselves who is the "villain" of the piece[70].

---

69) The nature of the character of Ray Marcable seems to have been inspired by Carswell's writing. According to Carol Anderson, "Carswell was not afraid to be controversial. Her acclaimed essay on the Italian actress Eleonora Duse (1859-1924), who was admired by George Bernard Shaw is boldly critical:

> Duse audiences always have to grovel a bit, and to my mind at least it has seemed as if this grovelling has infected the other players who occupy the stage with her. She is more than the centre of her stage. Her very presence there condemns the physical, and sucks the spiritual vitality out of every other character. (*The Athenaeum*, 1923)."
> (Opening the Doors p. 9.)

70) 'Well,' I said to him, 'it has been a queer case, but the queerest thing about it is that there isn't a villain in it.'
'Isn't there!' Grant said, with that twist to his mouth.
Well, is there?

A further allusion to the murder in Macbeth arises at the conclusion of the book. Marcable's mother's confession has solved Grant's problem and with relief he takes the dagger and the brooch out of his drawer, reflecting as he does so: "Only a little space between the intention and the act and what a difference!" (p. 217). He cannot allow himself to think about Lamont's certain fate if Mrs Wallis had not intervened. A parallel can be drawn with Lady Macbeth's despairing cry: "And 'tis not done, th'attempt and not the deed/ Confounds us" (II, 2, 9). In the space of a few minutes, Grant has been saved from being a Macbeth or Campbell-like figure, the murderer of Lamont, while knowing in his heart that he was perpetrating a crime which is justified only in terms of his own career. Far from being "a false clue", the references to Macbeth underpin Tey's text and furnish meanings at a deep level.

## The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner

Tey's novel is suffused likewise with references to Hogg's Confessions[71]. The dagger, or rapier, is, in Hogg's book, in its turn a "false invention" changing its shape and appearance throughout the novel. It appears in Wringhim's breast pocket without his knowledge and disappears from under double lock and key (p. 218). "A more dangerous or insidious looking weapon could not be conceived" (p. 213). It, too, has a "gilded haft" (p. 213). This weapon kills a man who, similarly, is unaware of an assailant's presence behind him. Grant thinks of the underhand nature of such an attack. "His gorge rose at the contemplation of a mind capable of conceiving the crime." (p. 102). His horror at this baseness is transferred to the crime in the earlier book where Robert is induced by a sinister but plausible companion to attack and kill his brother. Tey names the boat Grant boards to chase Lamont on the sea loch the "Master Robert". The detective novel relates crucially to Hogg's book, as it does to Shakespeare's tragedy, in terms of the nature of any one narrative and its relation to any kind of reality. Grant and Wringhim are alike in being misled by their own false narratives to the point of disaster. Both pursue the innocent relentlessly while pointing to justification by a higher authority.

---

71) Hogg, James, The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner (Oxford: Oxford University Press,1969, reprinted. 1991; first published 1824.)

Both, successful in their hunt, become tortured internally and close to breakdown. Both find themselves trapped in their own false narratives with no route of escape. Robert, of course, is damned. Tey produces a *deus ex machina* and saves Grant from becoming the effective murderer of the innocent Lamont. Wallis has a similar attitude to the narrative she is trapped in, as she recounts the story of the murder she felt she had to commit - her memoir and confession - to the initially incredulous Grant and Barker. Facing the gallows, she regards herself as a fully "justified" sinner, making no apology and showing no remorse.

In Hogg's novel, the name Logan is the name of the "housekeeper" who moves in with the Laird of Dalcastle. The Calvinist Highland minister Tey shows has the first name Robert and he and his housekeeper are both Logans. In this context, the attention drawn to church life is significant. Two Reformed churches and their ministers appear. Grant's minion, Simpson, attends a church social gathering in the course of duty and finds it an excruciating and embittering experience. Both ministers are lazy, self-indulgent and unintelligent and preach irrelevant and outdated sermons. Dinmont refuses to attend church, despite being the minister's niece and a guest in the manse. She chafes at the petty restrictions imposed on women by life there[72]. The influence of these clerics may be less warping than that of the Reverend Wringhim but they cut thoroughly unpleasant figures. The books have further characteristics in common. Both Grant and Robert have twisted lips, a characteristic of the presbyterian Campbells that links the two texts. "When Grant was at war with himself his mouth had a slight twist in it, and tonight the twist was very marked" (p. 198). The recounting of Grant's tortuous and distressing mental processes, found tedious by Roy and Talburt, runs parallel to that of Robert's internal struggles. Hogg's seminal Scottish novel is a second text vital to the understanding of that of Tey, confirming it as a self-conscious part of that same tradition.

---

72) At the end of tea, when they began to smoke, Grant offered Miss Dinmont a cigarette, and she raised her eyebrows in mock horror.
'My dear man,' she said, 'this is a Highland manse. If you like to come out and sit on a stone by the river I'll have one, but not under this roof.'
The 'under this roof' was obviously a quotation, but her uncle pretended not to hear (p. 143).

**Kidnapped and Catriona**

Alan Grant's first name establishes the connection of the text with Stevenson's Kidnapped and its sequel. Both writers engage their characters in desperate chases in the Highlands in the aftermath of a murder. Some situations which occur in Tey's novel work as reminders of the earlier books. Once, he takes refuge concealed on a vantage point while scanning the country below for movement, (Stevenson, p. 130 and Tey, p. 146). Another example is his impressive leaping across a river in spate, jumping from boulder to boulder (p. 137 and p. 148). Like David Balfour in the Glencoe torrent, he just reaches the far bank with his hands, is immersed but saves himself. More important, however, than these passing incidents are the qualities the characters share. The unimaginative Balfour naively supposes that his truthful evidence on behalf of a Stewart being tried for the murder of a Campbell will prevail in a court of law. "Ye muckle Ass" is the forthright reaction of the Edinburgh lawyer, himself a Stewart, in Catriona (p. 15). Grant, too, tries to think of himself as logical with a belief in the validity of evidence and rational thinking. "From now on I'm going to believe what I see and know, and not what I feel" he announces gloomily (p. 205). Essentially, however, he is a divided character who tries in vain to suppress his Alan Breck-like qualities. He is a well-connected, gentlemanly and stylish Highlander with a lively intelligence, imagination and intuition he finds uncomfortable- his "flair"- which, as a detective committed to thinking logically about evidence, he finds a liability. In his later career, these attributes refuse their repression and return through his unconscious. I discuss this, in the context of his further appearances in Tey's later books, in Section III.

**The Thirty-Nine Steps**

In 1915 John Buchan, the writer, historian and man of affairs, published The Thirty-Nine Steps, a "shocker" very much in the tradition of Stevenson. Readers of Tey's detective novel in 1929 would find many similarities between her

work and his spy story, which itself invokes the work of Conan Doyle[73]. It should be noted that Buchan's story depicts an entirely male world. In this it fits into the tradition of Stevenson's Dr. Jekyll, and Doyle's placing of Sherlock Holmes. Hannay does not need the assistance of a Dandie Dinmont to work out the solution to his problems.

Buchan's novel, like Tey's, features an unmarried, financially secure, central figure of Scottish origin who lives alone in London with a servant who attends on a daily basis to look after him. Like Grant, he moves effortlessly in the best social and intellectual circles. This protagonist, named Richard Hannay, tells us on the first page that he has been brought up in Africa, as "My father had brought me out from Scotland at the age of six" (p. 5). As with Tey's first novel, the story opens with a murder, by stabbing with a knife, of a character whose identity is a mystery. This death results in Hannay, the wholly innocent suspect, whose actions are mirrored by Lamont, embarking by train on a journey of escape to Scotland, followed by his lengthy pursuit, in various disguises, by hostile forces over wild country. In Buchan's text, the hunted character emphasises the pleasure he feels in escaping to open spaces. "My notion was to get off to some wild district where my veldcraft would be of some use to me, for I would be like a trapped rat in a city. I considered that Scotland would be best, for my people were Scotch" (p. 18). This emotion recurs in Tey's book and is experienced by hunter and hunted alike. Grant expresses surprise that the despised Lamont did not have what he thinks of as "the Dago's rat-like preference for the sewers" (p. 64) but wished to escape the city. Lamont, who had served in the First World War tells him of his reaction.

> And I tell you straight I'd rather a thousand times be for it wire-cutting, or anything else like that, than be hunted round London by the police. It isn't so bad in the open. More like a game, somehow. But in London it's like being in a trap. Didn't *you* feel that it wasn't so deadly awful out in the country somewhere? "Yes", admitted the inspector; "I did, But I didn't expect you to. I thought you'd be happier in town" (p. 170).

---

73) The adventures the book contains are identified by a character with literary interests as "all pure Rider Haggard and Conan Doyle". (The Thirty-Nine Steps, John Buchan, Penguin Popular Classics, 1994, p. 29.)

This supports the idea that Grant and Lamont are paired as characters of Scottish origin, each imprisoned "like a trapped rat" in his position and seeking freedom. Despite being the pursuer rather than the pursued, Grant, fitting unobtrusively into the country scene in his old tweeds, surveying the landscape from a well-chosen vantage point and demonstrating impressive physical prowess, is a worthy successor to Hannay. There is even a reference in Buchan's novel to Hannay's conviction that the possibility of "a Dago" being murdered is of little significance. "The fifteenth day of June was going to be a day of destiny, a bigger destiny than the killing of a Dago" (p. 33). The life of someone identified as belonging outside the circle of Anglo-Saxon civilisation is seen, by this London-based Scot, as not important. The links, and discrepancies, between Buchan's and Tey's texts and their central characters are of vital importance.

During his lifetime, John Buchan, like Tey, was highly regarded for his so-called serious work, including his lives of the Marquis of Montrose and Sir Walter Scott and his multi-volume History of the First World War. His popular fiction, highly successful in its time, has, like hers, recently attracted critical and admiring attention, though, unlike hers, his has been interpreted consistently in terms of his Scottish identity. The first to trace the background to The Thirty-Nine Steps was David Daniell in The Interpreter's House (1976), emphasising its dependence on John Bunyan's Pilgrim's Progress. Christopher Harvie has developed Daniell's ideas, succinctly summing-up his conclusions about the novels in six points, all of which are relevant to my argument, in his chapter "Decoding Buchan" in his Travelling Scot (Argyll Publishing, 1999). He calls these points "the following deductions"[74], and I find them all equally relevant to my decoding of Tey's writing.

---

74) *One*: Buchan was an enormously erudite and allusive writer and the allusions were not inserted for fun. They work at a deeper level than the 'good read' of the text.
*Two*: Buchan's attitude to the boundary between the civilised and the primitive was much more complicated than his character Lumley's 'a thread, a pane of glass' in The Power House (1913), which Graham Greene believed represented Buchan's own views.
*Three*: The business of story-telling- the praxis, if you like- was very important to Buchan and was bound up with a detailed formal knowledge of philosophy, psychology and anthropology.
*Four*: Buchan's own efficient, undemonstrative personality masked considerable tensions and ambivalences, personal and political.
*Five*: In a cultural sense, these crystallised in his ambiguous attitudes to Scotland, Britain and the Empire
*Six*: Buchan had a highly developed facility for irony and wit, a delight in double-bluff and an ability carefully to conceal his tracks.

The first deduction he makes is that "Buchan was an enormously erudite and allusive writer and the allusions were not inserted for fun. They work at a deeper level than the 'good read' of the text" (p. 93). Harvie illustrates this assertion by examining the significance of a famous line from The Power House (1913) and working out its provenance. "You think that civilisation is as solid as the earth you tread on. I tell you it is a thread, a pane of glass". He traces back the same idea expressed in different words to a novel by H.G. Wells and suggests that both books feature a character who is based on the same living person, the politician Arthur Balfour. The idea of civilisation disintegrating (though expressed in different words once again) is found in writing by Disraeli. By way of Disraeli's own reading-matter, a connection is posited with a statement of Carlyle's, in 1831, about the "thin crust" of civilisation giving way. Harvie writes thus:

> "You think that civilisation is as solid as the earth you tread on. I tell you it is a thread, a pane of glass." This is perhaps the most famous line in all of Buchan, though we must remember it is the view of an arch-villain, not of the narrator Edward Leithen, himself. Now, where did it come from?
>
> I'd seen it somewhere before, in another contemporary novel, also about politics. In a bizarre and alarming scene at the end of H.G. Wells The New Machiavelli (1910), in which Tory politicians discuss the collapse of civilisation while a London house burns about their ears, Mr. Evesham (a thinly disguised Arthur Balfour) speaks: "But what is civilisation? A mere thin set of habits and associations."
>
> Is Lumley [Arthur] Balfour, to whom The Power House is dedicated? Lumley's conversation is everything that Buchan said Balfour's was-ingenious, super-cerebral, ruthless. But the allusion goes even further back, to Disraeli's last novel, Falconet, (a name Buchan later used as a character), where a nameless Nihilist uses a similar line about modern civilisation "resolving itself into constituent parts". We know that Buchan wanted to write a study of Disraeli, viewing him (I think) with a kind of fascinated horror as an example of Lumleyite "pure intellect" let loose in politics. If we study Disraeli's own reading-matter we end up with Carlyle's Characteristics of 1831 and his vision of the 'thin crust' of civilisation giving way and plunging France into the raging inferno of the revolution and the terror. (Harvie p.94)

Whether or not one agrees with Harvie's conclusion in this particular case, it demonstrates that his findings in Buchan's writing have a strong echo in that of Tey,

where her use of intertextuality establishes unexpected and sophisticated links with other texts. I see this her first novel as making allusions constantly, to characters both real and fictitious, historical and contemporary and to texts ranging from the earliest known myths through classical literature to those of current causes-célèbres. Some of these, such as the name of Dandie Dinmont, a reference to the sturdy Lowland farmer who helps Scott's Guy Mannering back to his lost inheritance, are obvious. Others are obscure. The significance of the name Lamont, and indeed of its pronunciation, is unlikely to be appreciated by readers outside Scotland. Like Buchan, Tey did not insert her allusions for fun. They, too, work at a deeper level to create hidden meanings in her texts.

Harvie's second deduction is that Buchan's attitude to the boundary between the civilised and the primitive was complicated. This he relates to the contrast in the first years of the twentieth century in Scotland between the prosperous and supposedly advanced industrial Lowlands and the poverty stricken and equally supposedly primitive Highlands. This insight leads on to his third point, that Buchan's storytelling was underpinned by an interest in, and knowledge of, philosophy, psychology and anthropology. Once again, Harvie's ideas chime with my own about Tey's writing, emerging as it did from "that dark country" where the landscape "spoke of turmoil and grief and frustration", of which Mrs. Field is suspicious and which Grant finds himself reluctant to return to confront. Yet the journeys he makes there, which frame his adventures, stand out as among the liveliest episodes in these novels as the landscape of mountain and sea is lovingly evoked[75]. Much of the force of Tey's texts, too, depends on the knowledge of, and concern they display about, issues of philosophy, psychology and anthropology, not least the psychological condition of Grant himself. Harvie points out that these interests can be detected in many writers of the Scottish Renaissance and cites

---

75) But as they swept into Garnie with all the éclat of the most important thing in twenty-four hours, the long line of Garnie sands lay bare in the evening light, a violet sea creaming gently on their silver placidity. The car decanted him at the flagged door-way of his hostelry, but, hungry as he was, he lingered in the door to watch the light die beyond the flat purple outline of the islands to the west. The stillness was full of the clear, far-away sounds of evening. The air smelt of peat smoke and the sea. The first lights of the village shone daffodil-clear here and there. The sea grew lavender, and the sands became a pale shimmer in the dusk.
And he had come here to arrest a man who had committed murder in a London queue? (p. 129)

Edwin Muir, Neil Gunn, and Lewis Grassic Gibbon as examples[76]. Tey's writing, hitherto disregarded by critics of Scottish literature, is clearly part of this tradition, still in1999 regarded by Harvie as wholly male.

Harvie's fourth deduction that "Buchan's own efficient, undemonstrative personality masked considerable tensions and ambivalences, personal and political", is true of Tey also. McDonald tells us that in Inverness, Tey "blithely undertook her full share of all household duties, more or less working to a timetable which suited her dual purpose, allowing plenty of leisure for her beloved hobby" (p. 117). The words the well-meaning McDonald uses betray a lack of appreciation of the position Tey found herself in. A versatile, acclaimed and prolific writer cannot be regarded as having a "beloved hobby" for which she arranges to have "plenty of leisure". Rather, there is evidence in Tey's life and her texts that she made her home in Inverness with extreme reluctance and that household duties were not to her taste. Personal tensions surely arose in her relationship with her parents. Talburt tells us of her emerging from her house on her father's arm every Sunday afternoon and accompanying him in a taxi to visit her mother's grave, all the while immersed in a book[77]. A strange picture, giving evidence of a set of tensions on a par with those of Buchan who, according to Harvie, even while Governor-General of Canada felt obliged to write every day of his life to the mother who almost outlived him (p. 97). These tensions are involved in the consideration of Harvie's fifth assertion, that Buchan's writing gives evidence of deep-seated difficulty in reconciling his origin in a bourgeois Scottish family with the English and upper-class position he acquired in adult life. It has, of course, never been easy to be a son of the manse as was Buchan. His final novel, Sick Heart River, is widely interpreted as giving

---

76) This recourse to myth was not, in this period, unique. The fascination with psychoanalysis and anthropology is a common theme in the Scottish Renaissance, constantly recurring in Edwin Muir, Neil Gunn and Lewis Grassic Gibbon. Buchan's ultimate point of rest, in Sick heart River (1940), when the autobiographical Sir Edward Leithen decides to stay with the Hare Indians and organise their hunting, at peril of his life, replicates the same idea of a 'golden age' of human and ecological balance, to be found in Gibbon and Gunn. (Travelling Scot, p. 96.)

77) Her neighbours describe her interest in reading as being so extreme that she would emerge from her home to enter the taxi- which each Sunday took her and her father to visit her mother's grave- reading a book (Talburt p.44).

Every Sunday abut 1.30 in the afternoon a taxi would pull up at the foot of the Mackintoshes' drive and we would see old Colin shuffling down the drive with his daughter on his arm, reading a book (McPherson).

evidence of his need to accommodate his Scottishness in his identity in his final years (see for example Andrew Noble's interpretation on p. 11)[78]. In it, Edward Leithen rejects Englishness for a multiple identity in partnership with a tribe of hunters, who are half Scots and half Native American, in an intense tale of endurance in the Canadian ice-floes. It is difficult not to see the end of Buchan's own life here in a palimpsest whether or not he claimed overtly to be contented with his London-based political career. Tey, too, sets up a model of conflict between a Scottishness that constricts and an Englishness which may not be genuine and that denies the truth of the experience of suffering. It arises in all her texts and it is the denial of the Scottish element in his inheritance that causes Grant's sense of self to disintegrate as book follows book and his health deteriorates in parallel.

The final qualities of Buchan's writing about which Harvie makes a deduction are its irony and wit. These, too, are prominent in Tey's work. She certainly shares with Buchan what Harvie calls "a delight in double-bluff and an ability carefully to conceal his tracks". That the vulnerable Grant is introduced in the first novel as a typically confident fictional London detective pursuing a villain with a dubiously foreign name is surely in itself a bold exercise in bluffing. That such characters are placed in a series then and now regarded as having a place in classical detective fiction is yet another irony, or bluff, that Tey found worked for her. The narrative voice that appears to be unfolding a detective story seeking to conform to the conventions of the genre must be interpreted as highly ironic. Harvie draws attention to Douglas Gifford's stress of the importance of the unreliable narrator in the tradition of Scottish fiction[79]. One of the complaints expressed by Roy about The Man in the Queue is that the reader is subjected to Grant's lengthy thought processes. A contemporary reviewer concurs[80]. Yet these inconclusive thoughts to which the reader is privy lend Grant the status of being in

---

78) According to Janet Adam Smith, here Buchan "writes his own testament" (p. 111).

79) An influence here was the work of a contemporary Scots critic, Dr. Douglas Gifford, and in particular his essay on The Master of Ballantrae. "In analysing this – and in particular the credibility of Ephraim McKellar – Douglas stresses the Scottish tradition of the unreliable narrator and the structural irony that the device creates." (Travelling Scot, p. 92/3.)

80) The story might have been better than the average detective yarn if the author had only refrained from revealing to us at great length the mental processes of the detective.
A review of The Man in the Queue in *The New York Times Book Review*, July 28, 1929, p. 13.
(Twentieth-Century Literary Criticism, Vol. 14, p. 448)

part the narrator of the story, and insofar as he is unable to make sense of it, an unreliable one at that.

To quote Harvie once more:

> It seemed obvious that after Stevenson (both as literary theorist and active author), Barrie, and the revived James Hogg, the twentieth-century Scots novel had to be treated very carefully indeed- and particularly the novel with first person narration- in which Buchan excelled. (p.93).

This analysis supports my view that Tey's novels (and those of Carswell and Muir) respond to being "treated very carefully indeed". Like Buchan, she had a primary and continuing career as a serious writer. It is noticeable that her obituaries, appended here, address her identity as a playwright, mentioning her detective writing only as an afterthought, but in fact both aspects of her career produced writing which makes a claim to be part of the canon of English literature. Yet simultaneously both writers poured energy into novels designed for the popular market. The critical attention Harvie pays to Buchan underlines the validity of my approach to Tey. That they emerge as having much in common in their writing points to their comparable places in the tradition of the Scottish novel and is, in the context of their time, striking. Tey's popular writing, like that of Buchan, demands to be decoded. Marshall Walker's Scottish Literature Since 1707 (1996) discusses the work of Buchan in relation to that of Conan Doyle. He concludes that together they "demonstrate that for good entertainment something must be at stake. Serious and popular need not be too far apart" (p. 243). This judgement applies equally to Tey's work, written in the same tradition, and it too has to be placed alongside that of Doyle.

## The Man with the Twisted Lip

I turn now to connections between The Man in the Queue and a classic of detective writing. My first interpretation of Grant's twisted lip was as indicating his putative identity as a Campbell-like murderer of Lamont. It is repeatedly referred to and works, too, as an allusion to Hogg's great novel. Yet one of Conan Doyle's stories, The Man with the Twisted Lip (1892) demands attention. Doyle's creation,

Sherlock Holmes, has much in common with Stevenson's Dr. Jekyll. Both figures grew out of the practice of medicine in Edinburgh where the writers had their family homes and studied and, thus, both show the influence of the Enlightenment. Both made their first appearance in 1886 and their appeal has grown rather than lessened with the years. The writing of Conan Doyle is increasingly being seen as part of Scottish literature[81]. Marshall Walker is not alone in this.

This particular story shows a London gentleman gainfully employed as "something in the city". He resorts to disguising himself as a beggar to make more money than would otherwise be possible for him, thus acquiring a twisted lip. His wife's recognition of him in his condition of abasement and his subsequent disappearance create the mystery which is, of course, solved by Holmes. Some similarities with Tey's book are obvious. Her title, too, suggests a mysterious and unidentifiable central figure. In both texts a cut finger is a vital clue. In both, concerns are raised about gender, money, class acceptability and, especially, the importance of perceived identity which may itself shift or be subject to alteration. The idea of stable or unified identity is itself put in question. Stephen Knight's essay on this story reveals even more connections. In "The Case of the Great Detective" (1981), reprinted in Sherlock Holmes, the Major Stories with Contemporary Critical Essays, (1994)[82], he interprets it as Doyle's statement that his own earning of good money at the lowly level of popular writing should be seen as a pitiable descent in one whose ambition was to write real literature, comparable to a financier's resorting to becoming a beggar. When Tey wrote her first detective novel, she, too, was an ambitious mainstream writer with her greatest success as a playwright still to come. Her use of the genre of detective fiction at this time appears a strange and perhaps somewhat unworthy departure and her first work in it implicates this story of Doyle's. Certainly, she later called her stories her "yearly knitting" in what seems a tone of deprecation (Gielgud, p. x). Gielgud, Roy and Talburt all accept at face value the idea that Tey despised her detective novels.

---

81) Attested to by Owain Dudley Edwards, in a lecture to the Royal Philosophical Society of Glasgow, April 1998.

82) Knight's essay originally appeared in the Australian journal *Meanjin* 40, 2 (1981).

But was it deprecation? Knitting, after all, is what Highland women of the time did when they were sitting down, as the novels of Neil Gunn demonstrate[83]. Maybe Tey was aligning herself here with these contemporaries. She was, too, offering a clue about her technique and how her work might be interpreted. Unravelling this book demonstrates that it was created of texts knitted together according to a new and complicated pattern. The result works as *écriture*, demanding that the reader creates unexpected meanings. It is not surprising that misinterpretation occurs. Despite The Man in the Queue having appeared as a first novel in a popular genre and with a quite unpretentious air, it responds to being read now as an especially subtle work from a decade recognised as one in which something called "literature" had been transformed. Interestingly, Grant, throughout his later appearances, never again has a twisted lip. It had served its purpose.

## Oscar Slater

Another Scottish text which is implicated is the tragic real life story of the German and Jewish Oscar Slater, who was wrongly convicted in 1909 for the murder the previous year of the elderly and wealthy Glasgow woman, Miss Marion Gilchrist. As it happened, Slater had sailed to the U.S.A. shortly after the crime was committed but, with a touching faith in Scottish justice, he agreed readily to return to stand trial. Who, he asked, was Marion Gilchrist? A case concocted by the police suppressed vital evidence and he was condemned to death. An anonymous letter led to his secret "pardon" at the last moment but he suffered penal servitude in Peterhead prison until 1927 when a tide of support including that of Conan Doyle and Edgar Wallace secured his release. A book vindicating Slater by William Roughead was published as early as 1910 (Trial of Oscar Slater), to be reprinted in 1915 and 1929. In 1927 a further book by William Park appeared with a hard hitting introduction by Conan Doyle and attracted enough attention for the

---

83) Examples can be seen in The Lost Glen (1932): "When his mother's eyes lowered to her knitting he looked at her" (p. 34) and "She straightened herself [...] and gathered some knitting from her lap" (p. 270). Christopher Whyte, in "Fishy Masculinities", in Gendering the Nation, interprets Gunn's novels as showing arrival at manhood to involve "conscious acquisition and retention of economic and material power" (p. 64). Women occupy a separate sphere.

Morning Post to commission a detective novelist of the stature of Edgar Wallace to review it. For the first time, a Scottish Court of Criminal Appeal was established, which ordered Slater's release. The surrounding publicity was enormous, and features of The Man in the Queue give evidence that this *cause célèbre* was being turned over in Tey's mind as her first detective novel was being written, appearing as it did in 1929. Many key elements of the case, reassessed in Oscar Slater, The Mystery Solved, by Thomas Toughill (1993), chime with those in Tey's novel. (Much later, in The Franchise Affair, she invokes Slater's case directly as proof that innocent characters can be let down by the legal system (p. 125).)

Gerald Lamont is presented as "very dark in complexion and hair" (p. 50), with a foreign appearance and high cheekbones which attract attention. He disappears from the city where the murder was committed. Grant's first reaction to the crime is that "no thorough Englishman could have committed the crime" (pp. 21/22). In the real-life case, Oscar Slater's accusers emphasised his sallow complexion and foreign-looking cheekbones as characteristics arousing general suspicion. The disappearance of this multiple outsider from the place of the murder was interpreted as further proof of his guilt. Toughill observes that a first reaction to the murder was that it had been committed by someone "acquainted with deeds of violence in America", rather than by a Scotsman, and that this information had led the police to inquire about foreigners in the city. Grant makes a similar assumption. Again, the conviction of this character who could only plead his innocence protected the interests of respectable society. Gilchrist's murder, according to Toughill, resulted from the efforts of her nephews - Professors, ironically enough, of Medicine, Law and Theology - to find and destroy a will she had recently made, disinheriting them. Roderick Watson, in his introduction to Nan Shepherd's 'A Pass in the Grampians' (in The Grampian Quartet, 1996) calls three brothers who are respectively Professors of Divinity, Classics and Medicine "almost ironically complete emblems of traditional Scottish Presbyterian probity". That a Professor of Law completes the trinity in the Slater case makes the irony even more complete. The distinguished but guilty real life trio of Charteris brothers sheltered behind the police account, despite knowing quite well of Slater's innocence. That police

account was deliberately concocted to be false. According to Toughill, Francis Charteris, Professor of Materia Medica at St. Andrews, was involved in the break-in to Miss Gilchrist's flat, and was present at the murder which was the work of his cousin. He was even recognised as he left, rather as Deacon Brodie was recognised in Edinburgh at the scene of his crimes by people who were too startled and frightened to tell the police they had seen him. Yet another parallel between Tey's novel and the Slater case is the way in which a woman's forbidden sexuality is a crucial issue. The new will recognised Gilchrist's own illegitimate children, a bold step for her to take in Edwardian society. Finally, a beautiful brooch of doubtful status was a vital clue which resisted interpretation. (That a more recent study of the Slater case attempts to exonerate the Charteris brothers and pin blame on unknown burglars merely emphasises the importance here of race and class issues, and the mythopoetic status of Slater himself [84]).

The overall resonance between the themes of the Slater case and Tey's first detective novel is of course the creation of an utterly false narrative by the police for the purposes of pinning blame for a murder on an outsider in society and the subsequent near impossibility of disproving this fiction. This poignant and all-too-real Scottish tragedy is yet another text clearly involved. Taking it into account emphasises the irony implicit in Grant's certainty that the murderer he is searching for must be a rat-like "Dago" with disgusting personal characteristics. Further, its use suggests an awareness of the state of the world and of Scottish society at the time of writing, an attitude not normally associated with the detective novel of the period. Implicating this contemporary Scottish case, where the self-interested actions of detectives extended and compounded injustice and suffering rather than restored order, is a bold stroke. It underlines the evil that will result if Grant's pursuit of Lamont results in his punishment for a crime he did not commit.

---

84) The Oscar Slater Murder Story: New Light on a Classic Miscarriage of Justice, by Richard Whittington-Egan (Neil Wilson Publishing Ltd., Glasgow, 2001).

## Tey's Own Life

In the light of these books' insistence on their existence as literary texts, there can be no possibility of seeking to explain them by direct reference to the life of the writer, or indeed regarding them as transparently autobiographical. That the novels draw attention to their status as texts "from a book" might be thought to be contradicted by the presence of a personal subtext. Yet this can be seen rather as a paradox in that the self consciousness displayed by the fiction is mirrored and replicated by a similarly self-consciously existing palimpsest. My suggestion is that Tey in person guarded her privacy while contriving to tell her own story between the lines of these novels. Such a hidden subtext is in tune with her narratives' sympathy with marginalised characters. The details of her life to which the texts, and I, draw attention are not, of course, the point of this discussion. What is important is to take note of a personal account which could not be given openly, of a self which changes and develops over the years. In yet another way, I find that the unpretentious and innocent seeming genre of detective fiction is being used consciously and trangressively as a vehicle for the purpose of subversion of the very ideas it is assumed to uphold.

In person she avoided publicity as a writer of novels, and little is known about her life apart from the basic facts recorded in the file about her available on request in Inverness Public Library. She was born in the town, the eldest of three daughters of a small shopkeeper and his partly English wife. After a traditional academic schooling at Inverness Royal Academy, she made the unexpected choice to attend a college of physical education in Birmingham, far from her home, rather than matriculating at Aberdeen University, attending Gray's College of Art there or going to Dunfermline College of Physical Education in Scotland.

> Destined for a university, I stuck my toes in and refused to continue what I had been doing for the previous twelve years. I balked, too at art- my talent is on the shady side of mediocre- and settled for a course in physical culture and have never regretted it. I trained at the Anstey Physical Training College in Birmingham for three years and

> have earned my living all over England as a physical training instructor[85].

She remained single and childless. Deep mistrust of the institutions of the establishment in Scotland, such as the church and legal systems, which can be found in her texts as well as in her life, marginalised her further. She took no part in public or political life, unlike her contemporaries as novelists living in the Highlands, Gunn, Mitchison and Eric Linklater. I have found no record of her aligning herself with any of the literary groupings of the time (though she did correspond with the Ayrshire-based writer Agnes Dunlop, who wrote as Elizabeth Kyle[86]). Joyce Hendry dubbed the predicament of the Scottish woman writer as being that of having a "double knot in the peeny" (see p. 7 above). According to my calculations, Tey, distanced from mainstream writing by so many factors, had at least six "knots in her peeny". The topics tackled in her books suggest she was highly conscious of all of them. Suffering characters such as Lamont distanced from English society by such factors as being Scottish, Highland and single and similarly distanced from, if not victimised by, the political establishment are deeply sympathetic figures.

As I have discussed, details and references point to this first text's relationship with other Scottish literary and contemporary texts. A reader familiar with the circumstances and events of Tey's life is likely to notice references to them present in yet another subtext. Explanations of some of the choices she made are offered almost explicitly. Her feelings about the stage in life she had reached can be read as expressed through sympathetic characters throughout to poignant effect as it is apparent that her youthful expectation of release from her supposed duty of caring for her widowed father turned to bitterness as decades passed. Occasionally, she herself seems to walk anonymously into the action in the manner of the contemporary film maker, Alfred Hitchcock, who directed the film made of Tey's second detective novel. In this first text, she walks across a scene as a single nameless teacher living in lodgings, and is wryly presented. "A drab woman of twenty-eight or so let herself in, her grey-drab coat, fawn-drab scarf, timidly

---

85) Quoted by Roy (p. 13) from a contribution by Tey to Twentieth Century Authors (1954).

86) McDonald p. 118.

fashionable green-drab hat, and unexpectant air proclaiming her profession" (p. 93). It is assumed that this teacher will raise no objection to being left a cold supper. Further, this text exhibits a sympathy for and solidarity with the outsider in the south of England which is at variance with the conventions of detective writing of the time. Tey herself had recently been just such an outsider. It also paints an unflattering portrait of the insular Mrs. Field, who finds the very existence of Scotland threatening. Tey wrote this book not long after her return to Inverness, and it reflects her experience of life as a teacher in England at that time. Sometimes, in later books, there is identification with a leading character. For a reader who becomes involved in this subtext, tracing her life story is part of the game of detection in the texts. Yet their claim to exist as texts alone, open to multiple reading, holds.

That Tey seems to tell her own story in the pages of her novels is not a new idea. According to Virginia Morris, "reading biographical details into her fiction has become a frequent practice. There is little question that her own attitudes are revealed" (p. 285)[87]. Yet it is important that the details of her life and attitudes that are traced are not taken to be the point of this study. What is the point is that subversive subtexts dealing with unexpected issues can be traced. Gender ambiguity is one such important question addressed, especially in To Love and Be Wise. According to Gielgud, she herself adopted the name Gordon Daviot in private as well as public life. Motifs are to be found, closely guarded information is indicated

---

87) For example, not only commentators on her life but also texts themselves give evidence that she rejected small-town life and insisted on spending as much time in London as possible.
According to her entry in Who's Who, Tey was a member of the London club, The Cowdray, and her obituary states that she "spent much of each year in the south".
McPherson's account of Tey as unfriendly is quoted in Note 3. In McDonald, her attitude to her native town is further illustrated with this story.
On one occasion, when asked by the Rector of The Academy whether she could mention anything acquired during her schooldays which had proved helpful in her career, she replied with a bright smile- "Oh, I have no doubt that the four-leaved clovers I so often found at interval-time, in the playground, were responsible for my great good luck" (p. 117).
The present-day writer Alison Smith is quoted by Caroline Gonda in Whyte as having found it essential, as a single woman with an unconventional life-style, to leave Inverness. She relates her general concern with limitation to 'coming from a small Highland town where writing about sexual differences would still be very difficult'" (p. 15) and "for her, the ability to be open about her own identity and sexuality' has been to do with moving south [to Aberdeen as an undergraduate and then to Cambridge] [...] and at each stage it's been easier [...] to be honest with *myself* " (pp. 13/14).
It is likely that Tey was conscious of facing the same difficulties.

subtly, and underlying themes concerning psychological illness and the approach of death treated. In my further discussion in Section III, I show how this is achieved as the books succeed one another, working as a series.

Personal testimony in the form of memoirs and biography is one of the strengths of Scottish literature. Carswell claimed in a letter to her son on 12th November, 1943, that she had "made a fair start with a funny sort of autobiography" (Lying Awake, p. 225). Tey's novels make the claim, without any announcement at all, to be an even funnier kind of autobiography. Finding her story and her constructed self as yet another thread woven into the texts becomes another quest on which readers can embark with the enjoyment of feeling themselves one of a chosen- even if self-chosen- few.

## 4. Narrative authority

My analysis of The Man in The Queue shows it to work at a deep level to subvert the London-centred patriarchal assumptions about society the genre of the detective novel was expected to promote. Yet, I am far from alone in tracing subversive undercurrents in supposedly conventional detective novels produced by women. Munt points out that Agatha Christie's detectives (Hercule Poirot, Tommy and Tuppence Beresford and the aged Miss Marple) fail to conform to the stereotype. Poirot's name reveals him as a reduced Hercules, a "little man" and a clown (p. 8). Sayers, Munt tells us, went further. Her novel Gaudy Night presents her detective Lord Peter Wimsey as in love with the professionally successful Harriet Vane, "violating [her] own high profile objectives ('the less love in a detective story the better') voiced in her introduction to the Omnibus of Crime (1927)" (p. 10).

As Tey began her career, like Christie and Sayers, in the aftermath of the First World War, texts later defined as modernist and writerly were being produced which displaced the concept that the meaning of any work might be discovered by reference to some single, authoritative system existing outside itself, based for example, on paradigms of class or religion. Ways in which literature could be

written and read were transformed. Tey was able to use these new techniques in this first text. Ancient myths and legends, such as those of Greece and of Noah and the Flood, are invoked. All her books are pervaded by a sense of cultural relativism, as Scottishness, and Englishness are placed in opposition to each other and other cultures, such as those of America and continental Europe, are invoked. The workings of the subconscious mind are shown to be more valuable than those of logical thought. Psychological evidence revealing the true nature of characters is likely to be helpful in the solving of mysteries. Culpability may not lie with the actual perpetrators of crimes but rather, as in this first novel, with those, like Ray Marcable whose self-centred, blinkered attitudes set the events recounted in motion. Closures can seem of doubtful validity leaving the outcomes open to argument or, at the least, leaving what Talburt calls "a network of cracks" (p. 75) showing in the supposedly restored world. Responding to these unusual features, readers find themselves required to participate more actively in the production of meanings in ways unexpected in the "closed" genre of the classic detective novel.

Closely linked with the texts' questioning of the possibility of establishing any single narrative point of view or conclusion is their undercutting of the notion of the fixed identity of any one person. Talburt points to this attribute as Tey's showing of "an intimate view of life in the theatre with an extension of acting and impersonation into the 'real' world" (p. 43). (This I discuss in Section IV, on p. 186, as a feature of Carswell's work, too.) At that time, the convention in detective novels was that the role of each character was known clearly, except for that of the one deceiver who had to be exposed. In Tey's work, in contrast, virtually every significant character is engaged in acting a part, and that part is subject to alteration under pressure. As novel follows novel, it becomes clear. An intending murderer can himself be murdered, a perceived murderer escape unscathed while another is condemned in her place, and innocently implicated bystanders can find their lives destroyed. A criminal fraudster risks his life for the sake of uncovering truth. A man of captivating personal charm is revealed to be a woman bent on murder, and, in this case, a woman's conventional identity is defined by her clothes alone. Most significantly, the serial detective who is central in five of the novels and a lurking presence in the other three, has difficulty

sustaining his role as a representative of establishment authority, and, prey to his doubts and irrational fears, becomes a confined and helpless victim, dependent on his Scottish cousin, Laura, to solve his problem. The role of the individual is of course closely linked with the concept of the family and thus not only with gender but also with sexuality, class and inheritance. Just as many characters in these novels find their positions shifting so those other personal issues are subject to detailed examination and destabilisation. Once again, Tey's writing presents a reversal of the comfortable world portrayed in traditional detective fiction, where the roles of men and women are clear and traditional structures of class, religion and politics are stoutly defended. The narrative point of view is totally unlike the expected simplistic version.

Thus I will look first at Tey's treatment of the family. Her striking use of sympathetic unmarried characters, free to act independently, is remarked on by critics. According to Talburt "the lives of her main female characters are a feminist statement" (p. 72). These characters tend to position themselves outside their local community and to act as vital agents in the development of plots. Single women, in particular, occupy a position quite different from the shadowy, subservient one Belsey draws attention to as expected in the detective novel. Single men, too, abound, inhabiting quite naturally their male-orientated world, though this of course is a convention of the form. Alan Grant is the central example. He is introduced as emotionally and financially independent, blessed with an attentive and reliable housekeeper and immersed in his work. Of Scottish descent, he is domiciled in central London and, despite his career in the police force, is indistinguishable outwardly from an aristocratic Englishman. In this way, he functions both as the conventional stereotyped detective and as an idealised version of the writer herself whose brief experience of moving in sophisticated professional circles in London was the highlight of her life to which she longed to return[88]. (Her own name, Mackintosh, is closely linked with that of Grant in the annals of Scottish history.

---

88) She maintained her ties with the world of London theatre, and her entry in Who's Who lists her membership of a club, the Cowdray, there. Further, knowing herself to be dying in December 1951, she travelled to London "for Christmas" and spent the last weeks of her life there. Her funeral took place at the Streatham crematorium and was attended by many friends from the world of the theatre, including John Gielgud, Edith Evans and the widow of James Bridie.
(Source: Hamish McPherson in *Inverness Courier*, October 5, 1993 (see Appendix A4.)

Both clan chiefs built castles at Moy, near Inverness. This connection is alluded to in Grant's final appearance.) Gradually, as further books unfold, Grant's cherished emotional independence evaporates along with his professional confidence but it is important that even in his ultimately badly weakened state, he gathers the strength to avoid being manipulated into marriage. It is significant, too, that the source of this strength is the personal commitment he makes to an attractive and unmarried young man who has been murdered.

Of course, in 1929, overt treatment of sexuality could not appear in the novel. D. H. Lawrence's Lady Chatterley's Lover was printed privately in Florence in 1928 but was the subject of bitter controversy and a court case before the full text could be published in London in 1960. Radclyffe Hall's The Well of Loneliness did make a public appearance in 1928 and was promptly banned. A court case brought by Hall to contest the ban failed, despite the services of Norman Birkett, who brought forward more than forty witnesses, all of unimpeachable character, in support of the book's publication[89]. E. M. Forster's Maurice, written decades earlier, languished out of the public eye until 1971. Tey's treatment of sexuality is necessarily subtle but in its understated way it is bold and even, on occasion, humorous. Most critics do notice that women's and men's most important bonds in the texts tend to be with companions of the same gender and that the strong emotions between them generates much of the action. Talburt calls this "the special love, or bonding, which the biblical David had for Jonathan" and draws attention to the passionate relationships between women shown in Miss Pym Disposes and in To Love and Be Wise which inspire murderous intention in both cases (p. 66). Like characteristics of gender, sexuality is shown to be subject to direction by the pressures of the communities in which characters happen to move. Such treatment of these issues echoes central concerns of Catherine Carswell's The Camomile (1922) and Virginia Woolf's Orlando (1928), however deep the gulf perceived by critics between these classic texts of modernism and the genre of detective fiction. Both these novels deal with the limitations society places on women, the dubious

---

89) Birkett himself claimed that "a more distinguished body of witnesses has never been called in a court of justice" H. Montgomery Hyde (Norman Birkett: The Life of Lord Birkett of Ulverston, Hamish Hamilton, London, 1964, p. 257).

nature of gender and sexual characteristics and the central importance of inheriting and keeping property and position. I discuss these characteristics of Carswell's book in Section IV of the thesis.

In contrast to these sympathetic single characters, conventional married couples living together make rare, brief appearances in Tey's work and are not appealing when they are seen. The men are typically lazy, selfish bullies, limited in intelligence and experience, while the women are either downtrodden victims of their domestic situation or unattractively manipulative appendages. The possibility of contentment in marriage is denied, especially where women are concerned. For children, too, the nuclear family as a benevolent construct is cast into serious doubt. Most characters have not been raised by their natural parents. When they have, the relationships between them are presented as warping and destructive rather than as supportive of the individual. The role of the family in any individual's development is a central issue but no comforting thesis is put forward. This bleakness of vision is reminiscent of Samuel Butler's dark The Way of All Flesh (1903) with its condemnation of parental influence as incurably damaging[90].

Another defamiliarisation and deconstruction unexpected in the detective novel is that of the unity of the so-called United Kingdom. Yet Tey used the genre to add her voice to the contemporary discussion. Even when her settings are firmly in middle England, its certainties are subject to ironic scrutiny and issues of Scottish history and culture are foregrounded. The idea that the two countries can be regarded as one is undermined. Sometimes, the focus is on their differing landscapes, illustrating the conception that the tranquillity of the English countryside and small towns is a reflection of its people's relative distance from suffering and therefore from self-knowledge. In the same way, the turbulent rivers and dramatic contrasts of the Highlands, which Grant shies away from confronting, work as transmitters of awareness of an inescapable and tragically divided past that makes it a disturbing country to be part of.

---

90) The family life of the central character of this autobiographical satirical novel, whose father is a clergyman, is so grim and repressive, that he boards his own children out "with kindly decent people, and in a healthy neighbourhood" (p. 359).

This laying bare of the text of the United Kingdom leads on, as I have indicated, to a similar deconstruction of the concept of Scottishness itself, showing it to be made up of contradictions. Issues dividing those suffering Scots from one another are examined, including those of language, class, relation to institutions and, especially, perception of history. These are the problems identified by David Daiches in The Paradox of Scottish Culture: The Eighteenth Century Experience (1964). Like the texts of individual and family identity, Scotland the text emerges in postmodernist fashion as being in essence an impossible project. Tey's contribution to the debate about the existence and coherence of a Scottish consciousness is as bleak as her analysis of the individual and the family. Presented as an essay in detection fiction, it is also highly ironic. Yet there emerges, from the texts' discussion of Scottishness as inescapable but fragmented a vision of the political and religious fissure dividing those of Jacobite sympathies from supporters of the Hanoverian regime. It runs quite overtly through these books but operates, too at a deep and concealed level. Jacobites are identified with the unfairly persecuted but virtuous outsiders who frequent Tey's pages, while Hanoverians are interpreted as including all upholders of establishment structures. Clues to an overwhelming preference for those of the Jacobite persuasion are abundant and this, finally, is one position which is presented unambiguously and is not subject to destabilisation.

## 5. Conclusion

These texts offer evidence of their dependence on other texts. Undercutting the genre they themselves are part of, they show that the attempt to establish identity, as a person or as part of a family or nation, means the painful suppression and loss of parts of that identity. Binary divisions into such categories as male and female, heterosexual and homosexual, English and Scottish, Hanoverian and Jacobite, create a succession of dominant and muted groups with one side wielding power over the other. Hélène Cixous argues persuasively in 'Sorties', published as part of La Jeune Née in 1975 (Lodge 1991, p. 287), that such divisions are reductive and oppressive and lead to fragmentation. When, as in Tey's writing, any

text can be shown to be suspect, any single account of anything must be regarded as equally suspect and its interpretation as depending on where it came from in the first place, who is analysing it and who is responsible for any future assessment. Any final meaning is necessarily deferred. The comfortable, conformist world usually portrayed in the detective novel is turned upon its head, as the narrative point of view differs widely from the simplistic version expected. (In The Daughter of Time, the concept itself of narrative is placed under the spotlight, again with disturbingly subversive results [see Brent's complaint on p. 164 below].)

There are many theories which it is tempting to apply to Tey's work. The narratives' scepticism about the possibility of any individual becoming a unified self might be considered in conjunction with Jacques Lacan's theory that a fundamental and irreconcilable split in personal identity occurs at the moment of entry into language.

It is obviously impossible to discuss these theories at length here, but their relevance to Tey's work certainly casts doubts on Julian Symon's claim that her most admired work is "really rather dull" and "is not only obsessed with the past but belongs to it" (p. 180). Symons goes so far as to suggest that her work fails to use the insights of psychologists. It has to be kept in mind, however, that he has been criticised recently for being "persistently dismissive of women authors" (Munt, p. 14). Roy's final judgement that Tey's novels "provide the reader and herself with a bastion of predictability and surety" (p. 184) is even less sustainable. Finally, the inference made by Roy, Talburt and Virginia Morris that the writer in her own person held politically reactionary and unpleasantly racist views is surely refuted. Predictability, surety and support of the established structures of society seem very far away indeed from anything implied in these texts.

In Section II I now go on to a consideration of a small part of Tey's considerable output in mainstream fiction, drama and biography. Then in Section III follows a discussion of her further seven works of detective fiction. In Section IV, I look at those novels' place as part of Scottish writing by twentieth century women and find them to provide a link between writing produced before

and after the Second World War. In conclusion, in the final Section, I consider them as an unrecognised contribution to Scottish literature, standing in the tradition which now, at the start of the twenty-first century is seen as flourishing and allowing for many voices from different backgrounds to be heard.

# SECTION II

## HER OTHER WORKS

### 1. Introduction

My quest to solve the problems posed in the interpreting of Tey's texts centres on the detective novels for which she is now best known. I therefore look only briefly at her other, varied, work, in order to establish whether it supports my suggestion that her writing is more complicated, especially in its self-conscious Scottishness, than has been assumed. All her work outside the genre of detective fiction was published in the name of Gordon Daviot but re-issued later as the work of Josephine Tey (except for Claverhouse, which had no second edition)[1]. For that reason I will continue to use the name Tey in this section of the thesis.

Her two novels which are not detective stories appeared at the beginning of her career, and it was no doubt their relative lack of popularity that encouraged her to turn her attention to her plays, her development of Grant's career in detective fiction and her biographical texts. Roy is enthusiastic about the first novel, Kif, An Unvarnished History which was published in 1929, the same year as The Man in the Queue. The second, The Expensive Halo, which followed two years later, she regards as "a disappointment" and goes on to condemn the "trite plot, absurd characters, unbelievable motivation, and mechanical action" (p. 37). Certainly it is the least well known of Tey's novels. This story of a wealthy brother and sister who fall in love with a sister and brother from the wrong side of the tracks has some interest as it contains Tey's first use of the doubling motif which she was to develop and use successfully in later work, most notably of all in Brat Farrar. The only memorable character is a grocer, Alfred Ellis, a part-time preacher and tyrannical husband and father. An unpleasant and dishonest shopkeeper appears in Kif, too, prompting the idea that, at the beginning of her career, comment is being made on Tey's own father, who ran a greengrocer's shop. Certainly, Tey would be familiar with life behind the counter and may well have worked in the shop herself on occasion. Apart from these minor points of interest,

---

1) A full list of Tey's writing, detailing her 10 novels, 2 biographical works and upwards of 25 one-act and full length plays, appears at the beginning of the Bibliography (p. 278).

this second novel, apparently intended to be a sparkling comedy, has little to offer and I concur in Roy's judgement that it fails and probably convinced Tey that this kind of writing was not her strength. For this reason, I will not discuss it further, but concentrate instead on the much more interesting Kif.

## 2. Kif- Its Reception

This book, which appeared at the start of Tey's career in the same year as The Man in the Queue, seems to have been less well received by an audience which perhaps was satiated with novels set during the First World War, with which it deals[2]. The critic Sandra Roy, however, in her book Josephine Tey (1981), praises Kif as a psychological novel fitting into "the twentieth century tradition between Joseph Conrad and Somerset Maugham" and suggests that it "deserves both reissue and careful study". Roy's interest is mainly in the central character whom she calls "directionless, like most young men in modern literature" (p. 37). She does not draw attention to the extensive social and political comment in the novel, nor indeed to the strangely complacent and condescending tone of the judgmental narrator who addresses the reader directly, and above the head of the poorly educated Kif. Both of these features surely must be taken into account in any consideration of the novel, however brief.

Unknown to Roy and other commentators Kif had in fact been reissued by Sphere Books in 1969. Since her remarks, too, Kif has appeared again, in a large print edition[3], suggesting that although the novel is not in fact forgotten, interest in it has been prompted by the nostalgia it seems likely to evoke in older readers. I suggest that the book's setting, during and immediately after the First World War, does provide, even for younger people, an emotive background at once powerful and oddly familiar, viewed from the beginning of the twenty-first century. Especially well portrayed and memorable is the angry and moving portrayal of the invidious position thrust on those ex-servicemen who had survived the horrors of war and returned from that traumatic experience to civilian life.

---

2) A résumé of the novel is given in Appendix B1.

3) Kif, An Unvarnished History, (London Sphere Books 1969)

On the very first page of the book the first thoughts of Kif (here referred to impersonally as "the boy") as his brain was "waking to its daily passion of revolt" are: "God! What a life! What a bloody damn-fool life" [4]. He feels trapped in his work in a remote, inward-looking community. It is my contention that this same grim and bleak world-view emerges more subtly in Tey's detective novels, but is finally modified and the suggestion made that some meaning can be found in living. Here, she is telling the story of an innocent character who becomes the victim of society, as she did with Lamont in The Man in the Queue. Intertextual use is made, too, of Rudyard Kipling's Kim (1901) and its themes of disguise and colonialism.

A detailed study of Kif proved to be tangential to my main thesis, and I have therefore placed it, including the résumé mentioned above, in Appendix B1. Its conclusion is that the preoccupations of the first detective novel arise here too. Kif himself emerges as undecidably Scottish/English and a lonely character who is psychologically vulnerable and doomed.

## 3. Her Plays

### i. Introduction

Tey's strikingly successful playwriting is much more germane to her later career. The writing of fiction by women (even Scottish ones) is a recognised tradition, even if some earlier authors, such as Mary Brunton, have felt compelled to keep their activity secret[5]. Being a dramatist was unusual. Until the twentieth century, Scotland did not develop a theatre-centred culture. As David Hutchison put it in "Scottish Drama 1900-1950", "..the open hostility of the reformed church [...] made theatrical enterprise well nigh impossible outside the protective umbrella provided by the court of King James, and when that monarch

---

4) Kif as a character is an echo of the farm-servant Katie in Jane Findlater's short story "The Pictures" (1921). Neither, in their humble positions, can find romance in Highland scenery.

5) I would rather, as you well know, glide through the world unknown, than have (I will not call it *enjoy*) fame, however brilliant. To be pointed at – to be noticed and commented upon – to be suspected of literary airs – to be shunned as literary women are, by the more unpretending of my own sex; and abhorred as literary women are; by the pretending of the other! – My dear, I would sooner exhibit as a rope dancer – I would a great deal rather take up my abode by that lone loch on the hill, to which Mr I. carried my husband on the day when the mosquitoes were so victorious against him. Alexander Brunton "A Memoir of Mary Brunton in Mary Brunton Discipline (London, 1842) (Source: Carol Anderson and Ailean M. Riddell, p. 180 in Gifford and MacMillan).

hastened south to claim the throne of England in 1603, the theatre was fully exposed to the intemperate hostility of Calvinism"[6]. That a young, Inverness-shire woman born in the Victorian era wrote plays, especially full-length works destined for the London stage, is still surprising, though she had important predecessors in Joanna Baillie, Frances Wright and Lorna Moon, all of whom used their gifts as writers of drama at the highest levels. That the world of the theatre as a whole is viewed traditionally with suspicion as disreputable, even in the major cities, is clear from attitudes of disapproval expressed by conventional characters, in, for example, Guy McCrone's Wax Fruit trilogy[7], set in Victorian Glasgow, where a respectable young man, David Moorhouse, visiting an actress feels he is "overstepping propriety" (p. 306) and cannot countenance his sister Phoebe even attending a theatrical performance, despite her strikingly unconventional and adventurous spirit.

From this discouraging background, Tey embarked on an ambitious career, completing four full-length plays in the early 1930s, of which the first, Richard of Bordeaux, was the outstanding success. In 1946 a book of one-act plays was published and, after her death, Plays by Gordon Daviot appeared in three volumes. In all, no fewer than twenty-six plays were published. Interestingly, for one of these she used a characteristically ambiguous third identity, F. Craigie Howe, neither male nor female, English nor Scottish. The light comedy Cornelia was produced in 1946 at the Citizen's Theatre, Glasgow, in that name. It was followed the next week by a production of The Little Dry Thorn under the name of Gordon Daviot. No attempt seems to have been made to inform the audience of the oneness of these two playwrights[8]. A full study of these plays is neither necessary nor possible in this thesis, but a brief consideration of her best known production and one other, set in the contemporary world, is likely to help in the assessment of her career as a detective novelist.

## ii. Richard of Bordeaux

This historical play reassesses the character of Richard II, portrayed by Shakespeare as melancholic and philosophical. According to Gielgud, who took the leading role and to

---

6) History of Scottish Literature Vol. IV, p. 163, ed. Cairns Craig (Aberdeen University Press).

7) Guy McCrone, Wax Fruit (Constable 1947).

8) This information was kindly given to me by the historian of the Citizens' Theatre, the late Dr. Anthony Paterson.

whom the play is dedicated, "she improved on Shakespeare (from a commercial point of view at any rate) by giving the character of Richard a sense of humour" (p. xi). Certainly, Tey's character displays dry, ironic wit. Her approach to the presentation of Richard is essentially the same as it was to that of Kif, despite their quite different class positions. Each is an innocent acting impulsively, unaware that he is making mistakes that will lead irrevocably to his downfall.

The story is well known. Richard alienates his courtiers, and falls foul of public opinion. The people he is closest to, his wife Anne and his court favourite Robert de Vere, the Earl of Oxford, die. After unpopular decisions over the wars in France and Ireland, he is deposed by Henry, Duke of Lancaster, who becomes Henry IV. As Roy remarks, the writer's attitude is one of "tactful regret" (p. 22) that events turned out as they did. I observed in Section I, in the context of her use of Macbeth, that the removal from a throne of its rightful incumbent inspired much of Tey's best known work and her response seems one of deepest personal outrage. The loss of a sovereign by an early violent death or by exile, has been of course the Scottish experience through the centuries, not least among the Stewart line which Tey's texts champion.

The issues established as important in Tey's first detective work are treated here. Class tensions are present inevitably at court, and any character of mercantile rather than aristocratic origin is suspect. Scotland is a constant threatening presence comparable to those of France and of Ireland. Significantly, Richard admits to loving campaigning on the Scottish border. Like Grant (and also Kif), he is positioned as occupying indefinable borderline territory, where Scottishness is seen as an unknowable, dangerous but alluring otherness[9]. Tey, herself, is "campaigning on the Scottish border" in her writing. The main topic of interest in this play is a sexual otherness. Richard is furnished with two queens and three male attendants in succession in the course of the play. To the women he is affectionate and dutiful. His bond with all three men in turn is presented as deeper and more passionate. It is Robert de Vere, not Anne, who is invoked in the last line, "How Robert would have laughed" (p. 256). Tey is using an element of ambiguity and refusal of rigid categories present in Shakespeare's play, and making it central to her own.

---

9) E. Said, in Orientalism (1978), coined the notion of colonial powers perceiving the geographical and racial Other as exotic and enticing.

Certainly, conventional morality is shown as inadequate. Oxford, a devotee of Richard's, though married, is openly affectionate to another woman at court. The Duke of Lancaster's wife, Mary, expresses disapproval and is confronted by Anne's more generous assessment that Oxford's wife dislikes him and the dalliance he enjoys makes the marriage bearable for them both. Mary, too, sneers at Anne's clever mind by making the supposedly superior claim that "the children take up most of my time" (p. 170). Such condescension from the mother of a family towards an intellectually gifted but childless woman enjoying public success must have been an insult Tey herself was all too familiar with. And the ridiculous, disabling effect of women's fashionable clothing is drawn attention to and made amusing (if one ignores the dark subtext) in the account of a woman wearing a new and modishly large head-dress at Cheapside who "forgot that she wasn't wearing a cap, and was impaled between two booths" (p. 147), to the laughter of male bystanders. The church benefits from the imposition of these extremes of fashion, according to the sympathetically portrayed Queen Anne, as they provide new targets for misogynist sermons. Men and women are placed in opposition to each other, too, much to the latter's advantage, in Act II, Scene III, where a male group "self-important and mysterious" (p. 222) is discussing recent events, with great solemnity but little accuracy. Two women, carrying loaves and vegetables, cross the stage, exchanging cheerfully and succinctly the information the men lack about political developments, while attending to their own practical business and discussing, "the price of flour". The men sneer at them in ritual fashion, and the final stage direction has the idle males turn back to their ill-informed gossiping (p. 224). This scene seems to me to anticipate in essentials the points made in Liz Lochhead's poem "Men Talk" (True Confessions and New Clichés (1985)). In it, women "rabbit", "tattle", "titter", "prattle", while men "talk" and need a "good listener" (p. 134).

With vignettes such as these, the play reads still as fresh, fast moving and biting in its analyses. Tey puts into the mouth of Richard vehement expression of convictions that are likely to echo her own feelings at the time.

> You have hedged me round with lies until I am as much in prison as if you had built stone walls round me... You murder me by little bits, murder the thing that is me, and I have no redress. I cannot go out into the streets and shout "It is not so! I am not that..." ...you who come here in all your sanctity of self-righteousness to say what I shall or shall not do. (p. 183)

This reads as a protestation of Tey's own position as a multiple outsider. It was also the position of the actor John Gielgud who took the lead part[10]. This play, I suggest, stands as a landmark in theatre history, projecting an argument for the breaking down of rigid categories and classifications, especially of nationality, gender and sexuality, at a time, sixty-five years ago, when ideas such as these were presumed by the general public to be unacceptable.

Finally, creativity is put forward as a saving force, especially for someone both sensitive to the workings of society and suffering from them. Richard suggests to his lover "Sing, Robert, and save your wits" (p. 176). That is exactly what Tey was doing herself.

### iii. The Laughing Woman

This play, which appeared in 1934, in set in the twentieth century. There is a short prologue and epilogue, set "at the present day" (p. 379). Both show a room in an art gallery where an old woman sits silently, staring at the floor, beside a bust of her younger, laughing self.

The story, based on fact, is that of the relationship between two gifted artists, a Swedish woman aged 38 named Ingrid and a French man almost two decades her junior, named René. He persuades her to elope with him to England where they will live together, supposedly as brother and sister, "so that we can encourage each other" (p. 392). This, of course, is not what happens. He is so inadequate personally that she is forced to take over the running of his life. After the opening scene, she is deprived even of her name, becoming "Fröken" and then "Frik". Her talent, energies, financial resources and finally identity are gradually absorbed into his career. With all this support, René becomes successful. At the outbreak of the First World War, he returns to France to fight, despite his previous claim that he hates his country, and is killed.

The theme is of course that of the difficulties faced by a creative woman in a relationship with a man, with nationality an important subtext. In Kif, it is treated covertly in the character of Ann, who is ambitious in her youth but whose ultimate role as a wife and mother is approved of by the reactionary narrator. Here, the use of the statue in the epilogue

---

10) Gielgud was of Dutch origin, had not attended an English public school or university, and remained unmarried.

makes it clear that the young, strong, ambitious woman has become in essence merely an ornamental object attributed to the man. A perspicacious young girl passing through the gallery is disappointed that there is no record of who the beautiful woman is.

Once again, a powerful idea well ahead of its time is being expressed in this play. Many men who have become famous have been in a position to appropriate, all but unacknowledged, the gifts of their wives. Edwin and Willa Muir could be cited in example[11]. So, too, could Albert and Mileva Einstein, who had equally distinguished early careers and worked together on the theories for which he is famed[12]. Tey's play stands as a serious and important feminist statement. As a play, however, it lacks somewhat the liveliness of Richard of Bordeaux and according to Mairi MacDonald, the production lacked the sumptuous costumes and settings enjoyed by its predecessor. In The Daughter of Time, Grant states that "most people's first books are their best anyway; it's the one they wanted most to write" (p. 180). Certainly, Tey's first play fits in with this idea, seeming to have been the one she wanted most to write.

## 4. Claverhouse

By 1936, Tey, still in her thirties, had an impressive record as a writer, with two mainstream novels, two detective novels and four major plays to her credit[13]. At this point in her career, she produced her one piece of historical work which was not fictionalised, a

---

11) I am a better translator than he is. The whole current of patriarchal society is set against this fact, however and sweeps it into oblivion, simply because I did not insist on shouting aloud: 'Most of this translation, especially Kafka, has been done by ME. Edwin only helped.' And every time Edwin was referred to as THE translator, I was too proud to say anything; and Edwin himself felt it would be too undignified to speak up, I suppose. [...] And yet, and yet, I want to be acknowledged (Willa Muir, *Journal* 1951-53, quoted in Kirsty Allen p. xii).

12) Mileva Maric Einstein (1875-1948), notable mathematician, fellow scientist and spouse of Albert Einstein had two sons in the marriage which lasted from 1903 to 1919. [...] Although Mileva Maric never signed any of the Einstein's works as his assistant, her scientific contribution to the work of the celebrated husband was indubitable. Mileva was a mathematician of the world class, and Einstein used her knowledge a lot.

In the world circles, there are many researchers who think her name be written down in the book of science with golden letters. Abraham F. Joffe witnesses that he saw a signature of Einstein-Maric on the work on special theory of relativity. It should be mentioned that the money Einstein received with the Nobel Prize in 1922, he gave to his ex-wife Mileva Maric.

(http://www.vojvodina.sr.gov.yu/ingles/nauka/nauka1.html#mileva)

13) At the beginning of Claverhouse, an indication is given of how someone unexpectedly writing a novel in Scotland can be received: "There was a very present astonishment that George MacKenzie had written and published something called a novel. It was a story, it seemed; just a lot of nonsense that he had made up in his head. No one in Dundee had done the like of that before. *Arctina*, it was called" (p. 16).

carefully researched biography of the Jacobite leader, John Claverhouse, Viscount Dundee, traditionally remembered in Scottish presbyterian circles as the villainous persecutor of godly covenanters. Roy points out that Tey is very much Claverhouse's champion, attempting to rescue his reputation as she was to do for Richard III many years later in The Daughter of Time. But for Roy, Claverhouse is such as obscure figure that the choice of central character is mystifying. "While the whole world has heard of Richard III, few individuals are aware of the existence, let alone significance, of John Graham of Claverhouse" (p. 41). If Roy had considered Tey's work as standing in the tradition of the Scottish novel, she would not have pronounced the figure of Claverhouse to be unknown. His career is important in Scott's Old Mortality, and is accorded a significant appearance, "as beautiful as when he lived", in Redgauntlet, surrounded, in hell, by other historical characters who people Tey's biography[14]. Roy's suggestion that the biography and later detective story are similar in their aim prompted me to consider them in comparison with each other. Her feeling that the central character was unknown even "to professional historians" (p. 39), making the writing of his biography a strange diversion in Tey's career, must be challenged at this point. (A synopsis of The Daughter of Time appears on p. 152 in Section III, where the novel is discussed in full.)

The repeated allusions in Tey's work to classics of Scottish literature demonstrate her consciousness of taking part in the renaissance of Scottish writing which followed the First World War. Two older distinguished novelists, John Buchan and Catherine Carswell, were then at the peaks of their careers. John Buchan had found the life of the Jacobite Marquis of Montrose of such significance that he wrote his biography twice, the first edition of 1913 being followed by a revised and extended version is 1928. No doubt Roy would consider Montrose, too, as "unknown". In 1932, Buchan published a biography of Sir Walter Scott.

---

14) "There was the fierce Middleton, and the dissolute Rothes, and the crafty Lauderdale; and Dalyell, with his bald head and a beard to his girdle; and Earlshall, with Cameron's blude on his hand; and wild Bonshaw, that tied blessed Mr. Cargill's limbs till the blude sprung; and Dunbarton Douglas, the twice turned traitor baith to country and king. There was the Bluidy Advocate Mackenyie [...]. And there was Claverhouse, as beautiful as when he lived, with his long , dark, curled locks streaming down over his laced buff-coat, and his left hand always on his right spule-blade to hide the wound that the silver bullet had made. He sat apart from them all, and looked at them with a melancholy countenance; while the rest halooed, and sang, and laughed, that the room rang. (From Redgauntlet, Waverley Novels, Centenary Edition Vol. XVIII (Edinburgh: Adam and Charles Black, 1887, p. 112.)
Claverhouse is an important figure, too, in John Galt's Ringan Gilhaize or The Covenanters (1823) and Hogg's The Brownie of Bodsbeck (1818).

According to Buchan's own biographer, these works are "his outstanding achievements"[15]. Buchan adopted a dismissive attitude to his popular novels of adventure, which he called "shockers", similar to that of Tey to her detective novels, referred to as her "yearly knitting". In 1930, in her turn, Carswell brought out a Life of Robert Burns which caused a storm of controversy by demolishing myths which had grown up surrounding the character of the poet. It seems a natural development that an ambitious writer like Tey should follow in their footsteps, producing a ground-breaking account of Montrose's kinsman who succeeded him as leader of the Jacobite troops in Scotland. Magnus Linklater and Christian Hesketh have recently published yet another sympathetic account of Claverhouse's life, in which they acknowledge the Tey/Daviot narrative as a "colourful and entertaining account"[16]. The appearance of this book suggests that Grant's opinion, expressed in his advice to Carradine, is correct. The task of revision of popular mythology, he proposes, has to be undertaken anew in every generation. Carradine, researching the life of Richard III, is not so much making "A Great Discovery" as leading a crusade against "Tonypandy" (pp. 179/180), the word Tey invented to stand for supposed history which is nothing more than politically inspired rumour.

Not only does Tey adopt a more oblique approach to the rehabilitation of Richard III than she did to that of Claverhouse, she inserts into the second text what seem to be her reasons for doing so. Encouraging Carradine to write his revisionary book Grant tells him that

> all the people who've never read a history book since they left school will feel themselves qualified to pontificate about what you've written. They'll accuse you of whitewashing Richard: "whitewashing" has a derogatory sound "rehabilitation" hasn't, so they'll call it whitewashing. A few will look up the Brittanica, and feel themselves competent to go a little further in the matter. These will slay you instead of flaying you. And the serious historians won't even bother to notice you. (p. 180)

I have been unable to trace contemporary reviews of this biography, but putting these words into Grant's mouth is, I suggest, Tey's way of protesting about the reception of her work. Reviews written routinely seem to have condemned her "whitewashing" of the character. The few commentators who checked his entry in an encyclopaedia "slayed", rather than

---

15) Janet Adam Smith, John Buchan and his World (1979), p. 77.

16) Bonnie Dundee: for King and Conscience (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1992), p.229.

"flayed" her. The use of the strong images of beating and killing emphasises the personal identification and commitment Tey seems to have made with both her chosen character and the book she produced about him. And serious historians, according to this account, paid it no attention at all. No wonder she felt bitter. Yet my own memory, in Scotland, stretching back to the 1950s, is of Claverhouse being a well-known book and recommended reading. Certainly, it was welcomed by the small, enduring Scottish Episcopal community, including those in the heartland of Appin[17]. Apparently the lack of interest historians took in her biography is the reason for this stinging attack on them in The Daughter of Time. She seems to have concluded that they themselves were in the business of perpetuating myths rather than establishing truth. Ironically, historians did of course notice her making this claim in The Daughter of Time, and their reaction was one of fury[18].

Another point made in this detective novel, telling us more about the way Claverhouse was received, is that people react badly to having the narratives with which they are familiar subverted or deconstructed. They don't wish notions of history with which they are familiar to be demonstrated to be false. Grant's cousin Laura makes this point to him in a letter.

> It's an odd thing but when you tell someone the true facts of a mythical tale they are indignant, not with the teller, but with you. They don't *want* to have their ideas upset [...] so they reject it and refuse to think about it [...]. They are annoyed. (p. 119)

Before proceeding with a comparison of Tey's technique in the biography of Claverhouse and the detective novel, it seems appropriate to touch on the topic of sexuality as it appears in the former book. The central character is shown as uninterested in domesticity throughout his life. He had not "the patience to build and plant" (p. 152). More significantly, he is the odd one out, not one of the "nine men out of ten" (p. 18) who married routinely at an

---

17) Claverhouse was recommended to her classes at the school I attended by a teacher whose family came from Appin and was Episcopal.

18) See, for example, G.M. Townsend's "Richard III and Josephine: Partners in Crime", in *The Armchair Detective*, Vol.10, No.3, Summer 1977, pp. 221-24. A crime writer, M.J. Smith, replied in "Controversy, Townsend, Tey, and Richard III, a Rebuttal" in *The Armchair Detective*, Vol.10, No.4, Fall 1977, pp. 317-19.
A 10 page Notes and Bibliography of Richard III on-line primary texts and secondary sources is maintained by the Richard III Society American branch at http://www.r3.org/fretnot.html.
A scholarly and comprehensive biography of Richard III, published in 1956, also supports the argument for Richard's innocence (Virginia Morris, p. 77).

early age. When, eventually, Claverhouse does marry, his wife is portrayed very similarly to those of Richard of Bordeaux and Richard III. She is sympathetic to him, but more of a friend than a lover, providing him with support and encouragement in his own pursuits. It is clear that she will have to be mistress of his house with no husband at her side, even on special occasions. The heir born to Jean Graham "for whom they had been hoping so long" (p. 264), is "her" rather than "their" child (p. 265). Clearly, the birth of a son will not bind him to home. "It was Dundee's tragedy and glory that he was not built like that" (p. 264).

In comparison with his matter-of-fact relationship with Jean, that with his friend and colleague-in-arms, Colin Lindsay of Balcarres, shows the two men to be close emotionally. Their last meeting, in the flesh, like that of Richard II and Robert, is tense, and something "he regretted for the rest of his life" (p. 269). He makes reparation at the moment of his death, when it is to Lindsay that his spirit flies and he makes a phantom appearance, just as it is Robert who is invoked in the last line of the play. In both cases, it is the same-sex relationship that is important.

## 5. Comparison between Claverhouse and The Daughter of Time

These two books invite comparison, and although a synopsis of this detective novel is delayed until Section III of this thesis where its importance as Tey's penultimate work in the genre is discussed, it is appropriate to make the comparison here. In both, Tey sets out to rehabilitate the reputation of a central character whose name has long been synonymous with evil in the public imagination. Both are meticulously researched in the light of the facts of the time rather than being rehashes of legend. Both attempt to expose the doubtful ways in which historical "truth" is created. Both deplore the influence of the Scottish Presbyterian churches. Both express cynicism about the workings of legal systems. In both, the reader is conscious of emotional commitment on the part of the writer. Both attracted interest when first published. The "serious" biography is now, however, almost forgotten, and is condemned as an inexplicable aberration even when Roy discusses Tey's work in full, while the "popular" and therefore supposedly inconsequential detective novel is still in print, is a set text in university courses and, of all her varied output, is the work most widely known and accorded both praise and serious academic attention. Of course, as with all Tey's work,

this attention is accorded overwhelmingly in the USA[19], and it is there too, that students are presented with it (as noted on p. 1). (A search of the internet reveals lively discussion of this book in particular in American literary circles[20], and it is there too that Dickon, Tey's play about Richard III, attracts much current consideration.[21] The greater success of the later The Daughter of Time is, I suggest, owed to the greater possibilities the writer had, by 1951, found the genre of the detective novel to offer.

That explanation is supported by the evidence of yet another thread running through the narrative. Marta has been trying to persuade the playwright Madeleine March to write a play for her to act in. "And now she decides that she must write one of her awful little detective stories. She says she must write it while it is fresh– whatever that is" (p. 101). Tey was, at the time of writing, in demand for her playwriting skills but, Talburt remarks (p. 70), insisting on writing The Daughter of Time while the inspiration for it was fresh in her mind. The substitution of Tey's first name, Josephine, for Madeleine works as an allusion to Little Women (Louisa M. Alcott, 1868/9), where the eldest daughter, Josephine March, is a tomboy who is ambitious to become a writer.

In 1951, when The Daughter of Time was published, Tey's sympathetic serial detective, Alan Grant, was well established with a large audience who found his doubts and inner self-questioning appealing. Here, approaching the end of his career, he is shown constricted and vulnerable as never before, fixed in a hospital bed in a single position, flat on his back. This condition of being paralysed works as a metaphor, I will argue in Section III, for the position of entrapment of any one narrator. The emotional involvement of the narrator in this book is not only with Richard and his rehabilitation, as it was with Claverhouse in the biography. Much involvement is with Grant, who is lending his skills as a professional detective to this investigation into the past. Confined and suffering, he cannot display the physical daring traditional to the detective hero which he exhibited early in his career but he shows an equivalent intellectual courage. Doubting the possibility of establishing reliable narrative truth, he dares to question imposed versions of history,

---

19) "If a more enchanting book comes my way this year I shall be surprised", James Sandoe, reviewing it in *The New York Herald Tribune* Book Review, February 24, 1952, p. 11.
"Most [readers] will [...]. like this reviewer, clasp it to their hearts as one of the permanent classics in the detective field", Anthony Boucher, in *The New York Times* Book Review, February 24, 1952, p. 31.

20) See, for example, a review ('Superb') at http://www.mysteryguide.com/bkTeyTime.html.

emphasising the importance of the finding of patterns and subsequent detecting of breaks in these patterns, which can be viewed only from one inescapable point of view, itself also imposed. We are told on the first page that he had requested that his bed be turned round a little, so that "he could have a new patch of ceiling to explore "but found that in hospitals symmetry ranked just a short head behind cleanliness and a whole length in front of godliness" (p. 9).

In the same way as Grant questions imposed narratives, Tey inserts into this text questions about the imposed narrative of Scottish church history which so exercised her in Claverhouse. Here, she makes her point indirectly that the Covenanters were "a small irreconcilable minority, and as bloodthirsty a crowd as ever disgraced a Christian nation" (p. 130) by putting the words into the mouth of Grant. Even more daringly, Grant's inspiring of love in his male disciple from a New World, who is thereby rescued from an unsuitable heterosexual attachment, questions rigid, imposed, symmetrical patterns of sexuality. Tey herself, confined in Inverness for twenty-five years at the time of writing, was, like Grant, suffering, yet had found in her detective fiction a way of communicating her courageous vision. Grant is in a position where he possesses no personal freedom at all in physical terms, but is still able to be daring intellectually. Tey, writing this book, was equally trapped but intellectually daring. There is a strong personal identification of this writer with her detective at this point. These issues are addressed in Claverhouse, as they are in all her work, but in the biography raw emotion is all too evidently present as the narrator identifies with the lonely victim of the unlovely, bigoted and dishonest covenanters. It is full of personally felt and bitter hatred disturbing even to a reader like me, fundamentally in sympathy with her argument[22)].

---

21) A frequent lecturer is Judy R. Weinsoft- see http://www.r3.org/struttxt.html.

22) According to Tey's narrator, Scotland's several thousand presbyterian ministers were "nearly all of them vain, thrawn, ignorant, self-important, and self-seeking coarse vessels filled to the brim and running over with hatred" (p. 37). The narrator's dislike of the inhabitants of the south-west is equally unbridled, they are "suspicious, ignorant, inflammable" (p. 40). When Covenanters are imprisoned, saintly Episcopalians treat them uniformly with saintly generosity. "The captives were shut up in that part of St. Giles Church known as Haddo's hole, where Sir John Gordon had spent his imprisoned days before the Covenanters put him to death; and Wishart, the Bishop of Edinburgh (who had been chaplain to Montrose and as such had been confined by the Covenanters for seven months in the dark with only one change of linen so that he was devoured by vermin, and carried the marks of rat-teeth on his face still) sent them daily supplies of food at his own expense. They ate the food gladly, but the bishop was still a priest of Baal" (p. 43).

The central figure, painfully amassing evidence and searching for truth, is vital to the genre of detective fiction, though as I commented in Section I, in its artificiality it is hardly true to the nature of investigations that take place in real life. A simple example might be a comparison between the crime clear-up-rate of fictional central figures (one hundred percent one supposes) and that of the real police force. The isolated, thoughtful and scrupulous Grant is ideal for this literary purpose, his consciousness functioning as a mediating factor between the writer and reader. Like Henry James's character Lambert Strether, it is his acting as "but one centre" and his "coherency" that gives the novel its structure[23]. It is clear that any writer has to create a limited world, to control the complexities that arise in the lives of real human beings. The detective novel, with its central figure almost always concentrating on a single investigation, works well in this way. Grant's room in hospital works correspondingly well as a limited world, a world, moreover, familiar to most readers. James tells us, too, that the central character needs "a confidant or two" (The Ambassadors p. 11). Marta and Carradine are supplied to Grant. Using Grant thus confined, Tey herself was poised to discuss the issues that concerned her much more surely than on the wide canvas of time and place inhabited by the real character, Claverhouse.

Trapped in his situation, Grant as a centre of consciousness is shown amassing details of evidence about the life of Richard III and struggling to detect patterns in them just as he has made patterns out of the cracks in the ceiling. Stuck in bed in one position, he has just one view and cannot move in space, or travel in time back to the fifteenth century. In this way, he represents the position of a traditional narrator in a realistic novel, who is, too, stuck in a single position, unable to see more than one version of events. This narrator acts as a mirror reflecting this version to the reader. And Grant's consciousness acts as a "lamp" throwing "a pool of light" (p. 71) on the pattern on the ceiling which is all he can see. Tey's novel appeared in 1951, to be followed in 1953 by M.H. Abrams's landmark work The Mirror and the Lamp: romantic theory and the critical tradition. In the presentation of Grant's consciousness can be traced some anticipation of the ideas Abrams put forward. It could be said that these detective novels give evidence of original thinking on the part of their creator in tune with that of this leading literary theorist of her time. Certainly, this late detective novel exists on one level as an extended discussion of the nature of narrative,

---

23) The Ambassadors, Henry James (Norton: New York 1994), Preface p. 8. (First published in 1909).

becoming, in the process, itself a book of contemporary literary theory, which I now proceed to discuss.

In Wayne Booth's The Rhetoric of Fiction (1961), he defines modernism in the novel as avoidance of authorial intrusion coupled with the use of one consistent point of view. Like James, he emphasises the need for a centre to create distance between the real writer, who is an individual person, the implied author created by any text, the fictional characters portrayed, the implied reader at whom the text is aimed and the real reader, another individual person. In The Daughter of Time Grant acts as a centre with which all these categories connect and communicate and by which they are distanced from each other. He is, in Booth's terms, the unacknowledged dramatised narrator. Suitably for this function he seems to be searching sincerely, in his difficult circumstances, for truth. Or, to use instead the analysis of narrative fiction of Schlomith Rimmon-Kenan (1983)[24], Grant acts as a diegetic character in the first narrative told by the extra diegetic narrator. For Rimmon-Kenan, the implied author and implied reader are not the "second selves" of the real writer and reader. They have no voice but are, rather, constructs, outwith the narrative, the product of the implicit norms conveyed by the text. Active in the production of meanings within the narrative are, rather, the narrator and the narratee, which can be complex creations. The story told by Grant about Richard III makes him an intradiegetic narrator. That his moral values seem to tally with those of the implied author makes him reliable in that role.

Tey, the real, living writer has taken on her established role as detective novelist depicting her familiar investigator engaged this time on an unusual quest into the past. The conclusions he reaches are doubly distanced by this method and simultaneously rendered problematic by the emphasis on the unreliability of any perceived pattern. The difficulty of establishing truth, itself defined by the book's title as the daughter of time, is underscored. The multiple ironies work to involve the sympathies of the reader, implied and real. In the biography, on the other hand, the all too real living writer seems to be embarking directly on a narrative in which she is deeply emotionally involved on the side of the central character. Even a reader inclined to be convinced by her argument is uneasily aware of the sound of an

---

24) Narrative Fiction: contemporary poetics (London: Methuen, 1983), p. 94.

axe being ground, loudly, in the background, and to feel an involuntary resistance[25]. The fictionality so clearly foregrounded in the detective novel, which, as I discuss in Section I, is one of its strengths, is quite absent. In Booth's terms, Claverhouse emerges as a "bad" book in so far as it is a book whose implied reader, or narratee, we find ourselves, even reluctantly, refusing to become. This reaction is not at all a matter of wishing to have one's prejudices echoed but of being conscious of needing a more complete literary experience. Equally, it is clear that the creation of a work of art does not depend on whether or not the real writer has a personal commitment to the issues raised, but on what is achieved with that commitment. The writer's second self, Booth's implied author, allows the real person to hide. "Signs of the real author's loves and hates are almost always fatal" (p. 86). On the other hand, "the emotions and judgements of the implied author are... the very stuff out of which great fiction is made" (p. 86).

The self-expression of this implied author filtered as Rimmon-Kenan shows, through a narrator, needs a sophisticated technique to make it accessible to the reader. According to Booth, the novel is an ambiguous form, in effect a drama produced by the reader. The reader of Claverhouse finds it difficult to become receptive enough to the text to fulfil that function in the light of the writer's direct insistence. In The Daughter of Time, her use of the genre and of Grant as a reliable centre avoids authorial intrusion and wins the reader's trust and engagement. As Mikhail Bakhtin puts it in his essay "From the Prehistory of Novelistic Discourse" (1981), "the author (as creator of the novelistic whole) cannot be found at any one of the novel's language levels: he is to be found at the centre of organisation where all levels intersect"[26]. It is Tey's greater sophistication by 1951 as a "centre of organisation" that ensures this narrative's success as a work of art. It depends, too, on the use of irony, of seeming detachment, which is a greater compliment to the understanding of the reader than the tub-thumping insistence of Claverhouse. A further correspondence between these two books can be traced in the writer's personal identification with the characters being rehabilitated. Claverhouse is depicted as diverting his attention from family life and pouring his energies into his professional career, like Grant, and, indeed, Tey herself. The adoration

---

25) The writer's bitter resentments of covenanters extends to repeated insults to the country they live in. "Very welcome Wigton must have looked in January rain" (p. 80). A reference to "dreich Galloway hills" appears on p. 88. In contrast, the east coast is always "bright".

26) In The Dialogic Imagination, ed. Michael Holquist (Austin, Texas, 1996) pp48/9. First published 1967, though written earlier.

his troops feel for him is emphasised: "Every man of them there because they loved him" (p. 276). They are, moreover, "ready to die for him", feeling that "to have shared the life of a man like Claverhouse was privilege enough" (pp. 329/330).

One implication is that Tey herself, a best-selling writer working alone in Inverness, treasured her certain knowledge of an army of readers with whom she was able to share her ideas and her life in her books. Many, possibly a majority of these, would have been women. All, certainly, were there because they loved her, in the sense that their choice to read her books was made freely, a newly published detective novel being a volume rarely, if ever, read under duress. The same is true of her books of plays and of the productions of these plays. Once again, the detective novel extends the idea first put forward in Claverhouse. The epitaph suggested for Richard III ("he was loved in his day" (p. 187)) confirms this relationship as part of her own story as a writer. It is defined as "not at all a bad epitaph" by Grant, who adds that "not many men would ask for a better", and, "few men have earned so much". At the time of writing, Tey was using her own experience of hospital life, knew of her impending death and is, here, suggesting her own epitaph as a Scottish woman writer. Between making these two final statements about "men", Grant is "shutting Oliphant for the last time". Tey threw out signals from the first that Scottish literature, including that penned by women, such as Sarah Tytler, Jane Findlater and Catherine Carswell, is being invoked. The reference to Oliphant is poignant. Here the fictional Sir Cuthbert Oliphant is the "modern authority" (p. 80) on the Wars of the Roses and it is his honest but self-contradicting history that Grant has been referring to for detailed evidence throughout the novel. As so often in Tey's work, allusions are multiple. Oliphant is a name she surely favoured, as the Oliphants of Gask were among the most committed Jacobites of all, and it was upon the Laird of Gask, Sir Laurence Oliphant, that the exiled James VIII conferred in 1760 the peerage that is thought to have been the last such created by the Stewart dynasty[27]. The poet of the House of Gask, Carolina Oliphant, who became Lady Nairne, is implicated here as the writer of many Jacobite songs[28]. The central reference, however, is of course to the prolific Victorian Scottish woman writer whose works, like those of Tey, were

---

27) *Laurence Oliphant of Gask (1691-1767)*- in Scottish Biographical Dictionary, ed. Rosemary Goring (Edinburgh: Chambers, 1992) p. 342.

28) *Carolina, Lady Nairne (née Oliphant) 1766-1845)*, source as above p. 332. Her songs include *Will ye no' come back again*, and many were published in The Harp of Perthshire (Alexander Gardner, Paisley, 1893).

best sellers in her lifetime but faded into relative obscurity for a time after her death. Her Autobiography is referred to on p. 13. When this detective novel was published in 1951, it must have seemed that Margaret Oliphant's books had indeed been "shut for the last time". In this context, the epitaph "he was loved in his day" followed by the remark "few men have earned so much" is biting. Tey, like so many writers, creates her own epitaph. In this comment on its significance, she recognises both the enormous contribution of Scotland's women to its literature in each generation and the seemingly inevitable process of even the memory of that contribution being lost in the next. I discussed this phenomenon, and the positive action now being taken by leaders such as Janet Paisley, to make redress, in Section I (p. 8). When this novel of Tey's was published in the aftermath of the Second World War, reactionary forces in society were engaged in bolstering centralised patriarchal authority systems in Britain. Even in the context of Tey's thinking chiming with that of literary theorists, it is eerie to uncover such percipience on the subject of Scottish women writers.

## 6. Conclusion

Tey's final work, the fictionalised biography of the pirate Henry Morgan, draws praise from Sandra Roy for its qualities as a traditional yarn. It was received as such when first published, In contrast, my assessment of it, after careful study, is that this account of the life of a swashbuckling hero is satirical, providing a sweeping condemnation of male, patriarchal values. To expedite the main argument of this thesis, I have relegated my discussion of this text, as with that of Kif, to an Appendix (B2). Yet this consideration, even if truncated here, is of value. Tey's mainstream fiction, plays and biographical work fit into and add substance to my analysis of her detective novels. In Section IV (p. 228) I point to Margaret Elphinstone's discussion of the bearing of Willa Muir's political comment (such as Mrs. Grundy in Scotland) on her novels, helping the interpretation of them as complicated, sophisticated works of art[29]. Similarly, I find that careful reading of Tey's now less well-known texts confirms my finding that her detective novels treat radical issues, presenting characters ironically and questioning relationships involving political power. All this runs counter to the messages detective novels of the time are assumed to carry.

---

29) Margaret Elphinstone, "Willa Muir: Crossing the Genres", Gifford and McMillan (p. 400).

# SECTION III

## CONTINUING USE OF THE GENRE OF DETECTIVE FICTION AFTER THE MAN IN THE QUEUE

### 1. Introduction- Tey's detective fiction after her initial success

It is evident that, at the outset of her career in the nineteen-twenties, Tey aimed for recognition as a writer of serious plays and novels. It seems likely that she regarded the relatively greater commercial success of her first detective novel over Kif, her work in mainstream fiction, with an attitude of some dismay, comparable to that of Doyle in similar circumstances[1)]. By the time of the second work's appearance, however, her reputation in literary circles had undergone a transformation. That no less a critic than Queenie Leavis gave her husband F.R. Leavis a book of six plays headed by Richard of Bordeaux as his combined birthday and Christmas present in 1933[2)] indicates that Gordon Daviot's work stood at that time among the most highly thought of in Britain, even if there is no available evidence about which of the plays the Leavises themselves favoured. The novels under discussion here seem a diversion from that path, being in a popular genre, despite their defiance of the carefully set out conventions applying to that genre at the time. After the first work, just one more was produced before the Second World War. It appeared in 1936, shortly after her greatest success as a playwright and a year before the publication of the biography which has been disregarded by recent critics but testifies to the involvement of her texts with serious political issues, and to her positioning herself as biographer alongside her compatriots Buchan and Carswell. This second detective novel, A Shilling for Candles, is not mentioned by Symons at all and is considered by Roy and Talburt to be largely a rewriting of the first. That is, to some extent, true, and, in addition, the irony which I found

---

1) This dismay, according to Stephen Knight in "The Case of the Great Detective" (see p. 75 above), underpins Doyle's story "The Man with the Twisted Lip".

2) My copy of Famous Plays of 1933, purchased from the second-hand department of Heffers, Cambridge, bears the inscription: To Frances (*sic*) with much love and the (*sic*) best wishes for Xmas and 1934, also a belated birthday present. From Queenie.

to emerge as integral to the force of the earlier text proves here to be elusive and problematic when finally detected.

Claverhouse was followed by almost a decade's silence. Gielgud, ever Tey's admirer and sympathiser, describes her as "depressed and unhappy" (p. x) during the Second World War. When the war ceased she produced six detective novels in quick succession before her untimely death in 1952. As before, these texts draw attention to their status as literary artefacts closely related to other texts. The issues treated in the first works remain centrally important and each book seems to focus on one of these. The story of her life is continued in a sub-text. Despite this consistency, I argue, a new and darker tone is established in the work issued in 1946. What was anger has become bitterness and the detached, ironic tone has shifted to one of involved and biting satire.

As the books which appeared between 1946 and 1952 form a group in this way, it seems appropriate to consider them together and to look at A Shilling for Candles separately and briefly. Like Claverhouse, it was written when she was still in her thirties and, at the height of her fame, could look forward to a distinguished literary career. Despite my own initial relative lack of enthusiasm for this particular text, which seemed to me inexplicably bland compared to the others, I had to recognise that it was well received, made into the successful film Young and Innocent by Alfred Hitchcock in 1937 and drew critical acclaim, especially in the United States[3)].

That this novel was produced at the zenith of her career indicates her intention to extend her use of the genre of detective fiction alongside her playwriting. The analysis I arrive at of the seeming slightness of the novel points to a long-term plan for future development centred on the character of Grant as he struggles to reconcile his awkward Scottishness with his role as a London authority figure. Her use of the pseudonym of Josephine Tey for the first time suggests a statement that from this point her detective writing should be considered as a separate career from that continuing in the mainstream of literature, an arrangement used of course by many contemporary writers[4)]. A fulfilling future as an

---

3) A Shilling for Candles was called "a joy absolute" by Antony Boucher (*New York Times* book review, April 18th, 1954, p. 23), on its reissue after her death.

4) Cecil Day Lewis, for example, began writing detective novels as Nicholas Blake around this time. A Question of Proof (1935) was his first work in this genre and introduced his detective Nigel Strangeways.

author accomplished and well-known in several forms was surely anticipated. A Shilling for Candles was written in these happy circumstances, and I now examine it.

## 2. A Shilling for Candles

### i. Synopsis

In the opening pages, the body of a glamorous young woman is found on a beach by the English Channel. A button from a man's coat tangled in her hair reveals that she did not drown accidentally but was murdered by having her head forced under the water. She turns out to be a famous actress, Christine Clay, married to the unconventional aristocrat Lord Edward Champneis (pronounced Chins) who spends most of his time overseas and is involved in the politics of the invented Eastern European country, Galeria. Chris's temporary companion in a nearby rented cottage, Robert Tisdall, who has been added to the list of beneficiaries in her will only the day before, is the obvious suspect. He disappears. The chief constable's daughter, Erica Burgoyne, convinces the police of Tisdall's innocence by tracking down his stolen overcoat which has its buttons intact. Meanwhile, Grant investigates the theatrical circles in which both Clay and Tisdall moved by attending a party at his actress friend, Marta Hallard's, flat. He disposes quickly of a false confession made by the actress Judy Sellers. Clay's husband becomes a suspect along with his associate, the immigrant songwriter Jason Harmer. Throughout, Grant works with the lawyer, Mr. Erskine, who holds Clay's will, and he investigates her brother, Herbert Gotobed, who has been left the derisory legacy which forms the title of the book. Gotobed is traced operating in a bogus religious community, is found to be criminal, but is not the murderer. The fugitive Tisdall, suffering from pneumonia after exposure to a thunderstorm, is discovered and his life saved. Grant decides with reluctance to question Champneis whose whereabouts on the night of the murder cannot be accounted for. It turns out that he and Harmer were engaged in the illegal, but morally and socially acceptable, activity of smuggling a political refugee from Galeria into England. On his way to interview Champneis, Grant glances at a movie magazine featuring Clay and notices that the astrologer Lydia Keats, whom he had met at Marta's party, foretold the drowning as she had done other supposed accidents. The man's oilskin she wore with its missing button is discovered on her motorboat at Chelsea, and Grant arrests her for Clay's murder.

## ii. Comparison with The Man in the Queue

Grant resolves at the end of the first detective novel that sometime, of course, he will go back to Carninnish (p.218) but defers his visit because "somehow the thought of that swift brown water and that dark country was ungrateful at the moment. It spoke of turmoil and grief and frustration; and he wanted none of that" (p.218). It is not until his final appearance more than two decades later that he makes amends for this decision by returning to the Highlands and to the challenge the area represents that he is so reluctant to face. In this second text, a visit to Scotland is never under consideration and the discussion of the country's characteristics in relation to those of England, which figured so largely in the first, is absent. Scottishness as a theme has disappeared. Moreover, the texts alluded to here seem to be, without exception, un-Scottish. The presentation itself of the detective has changed as he is shown refusing to recognise consciously, as he did when returning Lamont to London, his instinctive unhappiness about the status of the rational case and narrative he is producing and the possibility that it is condemning to death an innocent suspect. The only time he recalls that he is not entirely English is when he attempts to arrest Tisdall and is aware of being more cautious that usual in the circumstances. "Why was he so anxious to have the bird in his hand? Was it just the canniness of his Scots ancestry coming out, or was there a presentiment that - that what? He didn't know," (p. 80). He is not prepared to admit to himself that this "presentiment", and example of the intuition known at the Yard as his "flair", rather than sober caution, might be the result of being Scottish. The cut and thrust of the original argument centred on Grant's position as undecidably English/Scottish has disappeared.

Somewhat disappointed I embarked on a detailed comparison of these two pre-Second World War works in the detective genre. As Roy and Talburt point out, they share features. Both open with the discovery of an unidentifiable body. Soon, an innocent but defenceless suspect flees from Grant's clutches, is, towards the end of the book and at his moment of greatest vulnerability, immersed in water, and his life threatened as a result, quite apart from the threat posed by the gallows. A young and unconventional woman persuades the detective that the case he has constructed must be flawed. Routine detective work leads nowhere and the solution is arrived at by chance.

Once again, the text draws attention to its existence as a piece of literature. The young Erica, tracking down evidence that will exonerate the suspect and show Grant's narrative to be false is conscious of her own function in yet another narrative. She has been asked if her investigations are philanthropic. "No. Literary." is her reply. Asked if she is writing a book, she responds "Not exactly. I'm gathering material for someone else" (p. 111). Grant, too, comments in post-modern style on his own status as a character, wishing that "he was one of those marvellous creatures of super-instinct and infallible judgement who adorned the pages of detective stories and not just a hard-working, well-meaning, ordinarily intelligent Detective Inspector" (p.206). The irony here is that his very problem (as in The Man in the Queue) is his superinstinct and almost unconscious but sure judgement of character which makes him uncomfortable and unhappy with the results when he tries to solve crime on a purely rational basis.

As always in Tey's work, personal identity is subject to alteration. Tisdall has changed his name on inheriting a fortune, spent the money and attempted to disappear from society completely, all before the novel begins. He knows Clay only as Chris and they make no demands on one another. Families, again, are dysfunctional. Fathers are absent or inadequate. Clay has suffered from her mother's unreasonable preference for her brother. Erica's lack of a mother, on the other hand, leaves her "forlorn" (p.69). Clay's marriage works only because she and Champneis are financially independent of each other and lead separate lives. They have no shared home and no children. Nationality, too, is subject to alteration. Clay has changed hers twice. Champneis and Harmer are engaged in smuggling a refugee into England who may return to Galeria when political circumstances permit. Grant himself has suppressed his Scottishness.

The issue foregrounded in this narrative is that of class. Roy comments on Grant's "almost paralysing" respect for Champneis (p. 70). The detective, who for the purposes of this text is shown devoid of the unassailable confidence as an aristocrat bestowed on him for the purposes of the first narrative, defers to Champneis, instantly granting him permission, highly irregularly, to attend a Yard conference, despite his status as a suspect. Later, we are shown Grant finding himself unable to summon the courage to enquire where Lord Edward slept on the night of his wife's murder: "There was no getting away from the fact; one didn't demand information from the son of a ducal house as one demanded it from a coster. A

rotten world, no doubt, but one must conform" (p.134). The narrator, too, calmly doing his professional duty, presents him as conformist. The disturbing elements of his Scottishness having been suppressed, he later gives in without a struggle to his class-conscious decision to question the immigrant Harmer rather than the aristocrat "because there was less chance of running into trouble" (p.206). Even in his supposedly authoritative position, he is shown as having to take into account the position of influence of any suspect. Shown to conform in this way, and to behave in a manner that he knows to be wrong, a toll is taken on his health that other characters remark on. It is Jason Harmer who has the perception to warn Grant that he is "heading for a breakdown" (p. 208). As the books follow each other, Grant is presented as suffering declining physical and psychological strength, and, in the final one, Harmer's prediction is fulfilled.

In this text, consideration of the issue of class in relation to institutions of power, such as the system of criminal justice, extends to consideration of the linked question of gender inequality. Grant's position of authority may be shown to exist in theory rather than in practice over Champneis but when a fair-haired woman comes to see him he is presented as using it without hesitation. Once again he seems to be presented briefly as a traditional detective hero. "Grant could be very intimidating", the narrator informs us (p. 89). The actress, Judy Sellars, attempts to confess to Clay's murder in an altruistic effort to save Tisdall, an effort which, had it succeeded, would also have effected her own suicide. However, failing to persuade Grant, she quickly stops trying. Grant, having recovered from his rage at having his time wasted by "some sensation-mad female" analyses her to Williams as "soft-hearted to the point of self-sacrifice" (p. 93). This character, who hates her career on the "legitimate stage", functions as comment on the roles women are forced to play in real life, whether or not they find them agreeable. As she leaves, re-applying her lipstick, and declaring "I suppose I must go on playing blonde nit-wits for the rest of my life" (p. 93), she functions as a sympathetic figure representing, for the purposes of this more conventional text, conformist but unhappy womanhood.

In this text, the narrative point of view has changed in more than the attitude taken to nationality, to social class and to gender. Having decided to abide by the rules and values of the public sphere (and of the classic detective novel), the detective too has hardened and become worldly. Despite ongoing bouts of depression, he is careful not to acknowledge to

himself his unhappiness over the fate of Tisdall as he did over that of Lamont. Only when Tisdall's life has been saved "Grant realised quite how awful it had been. That continual pushing down of an unnamed fear" (p. 213). The text is showing Grant's refusal to admit to himself his choice to avoid uncovering evidence which might undermine the "rational" case he is creating against Tisdall and so conflict with the workings of established order. The narrative is using the character of Grant as a device to point out the inevitable self-interested and self-limiting approach to any investigation of even a high-principled, perceptive and well-meaning detective.

Grant, in this assumed conformity, seems to be a much less complex and interesting character in this novel and certainly not a divided Brodie or Jekyll-and-Hyde-like figure. The novel fits strangely into Tey's *opus*. Though some clues did emerge, close examination of the title and the names used yielded less to underpin the text. I therefore include them merely as a footnote[5)].

### iii. Intertextuality

Fitting in with Grant's decision to conform to the "real" world of authority based in London, the texts directly invoked here indicate a near-absolute Englishness. Shakespeare's Hamlet is quoted from at least once, when a minor character, excused from attending a

---

5) As the English Channel is an important boundary here, the title seems to be a reference to Dr. Johnson's comment about Thomas Sheridan's influence on the English language. "It is burning a farthing candle at Dover, to shew light at Calais" (Life of Samuel Johnson by James Boswell, p.454.) There may be an absence of attention to Scottishness in this book, but the relationship of Englishness to "otherness", including Celtic and European otherness, is implied here as a topic. That Erica Burgoyne's first name means heather, suggesting a connection with the Scottish Highlands, and that her surname is French in origin, adds to this. Her second name is, too, that of the British General who surrendered to the Americans at Saratoga in 1777.
In the first text, the one clue available to Grant is a dagger of doubtful provenance. It is of no help to the detective except as final confirmation that the solution arrived at by accident is correct. It functions rather as a clue to the underlying concerns of the text itself. Here, the button found in Clay's hair is the central clue. In the same way, it assists Grant only as confirmation of the solution he arrives at by chance. Like the dagger before it, the button functions as a clue to a subtext. Grant takes it to a long-established tailoring business, the stability of which warms his heart. "Stacy and Brackett continued to make clothes with leisured efficiency for leisured and efficient gentlemen" (p. 64). The button appears to them a very inferior product and, thus, unlikely to be English.
He would not be surprised, indeed, to find that the button was of foreign origin. 'American, perhaps?' suggested Grant. Perhaps. Although to Mr. Trimley's eye it suggested the Continent. (p.64)
The nature of the button confirms the English, French and American connotations of the name Burgoyne as important. That the button is substandard suggests it is not English. Englishness itself is confirmed as of significance in this text, which apparently takes for granted that Englishness in anything is a guarantee of high quality and superiority over products from elsewhere in Europe or from America.

lecture on astrology, expostulates. "for this relief much thanks" (p.160)[6]. The death of the innocent Clay by drowning fits in as a reference to the death of Ophelia. Yet the play itself is not mentioned and does not underpin this text in the way Macbeth does in the first detective novel. English poets are invoked. One of the few clues to the reader that the astrologist Keats is the murderer is the reference to that poet's epitaph that the name establishes, and Roy points to "here lies one whose name was writ in water"[7]. A journalist confuses Keats' name with that of Pope, is corrected and told in addition "it was Blake's assignment [...] He was the obvious person for it", (p. 160). The title of the film made of this book, Young and Innocent, suggests Blake's Songs of Innocence (1789) and certainly the character of Erica exemplifies the quality of innocence. In 1789, too, Blake's Book of Thel was published in which the character visits the house of Clay, sees the couches of the dead and hears a voice protesting at Puritan hypocrisy and repression. Christine Clay's inappropriate funeral, at which Grant would be forced to contemplate "the couches of the dead", is the only one to feature in these novels. Clay, Grant thinks, "should have a hundred foot pyre. Something spectacular. A Viking's funeral. Not ovens in the suburb" (p. 66). Certainly Blake's rejection of the tradition of eighteenth century rational thought represented by Pope, and insistence on creating his own system chimes with the interest of Tey in subverting the authority and rationality expected to be validated in the detective novel of the time. "I must create a system or be enslav'd by another man's. I will not reason and compare: my business is to create." (Jerusalem (1815), Chapter 1, plate 10, 1.20).

The Sherlock Holmes story invoked in this text I find to be "The Red-headed League". Clay's hair, which is "bright" (p. 35) and has "a dyed look" (p. 3) may well be red. Interestingly, Pope is allowed a brief mention in the Holmes' story. "I started off for Pope's Court" (p. 61). The character who is going to Pope's Court is being gulled in his acceptance of the task of copying out the Enlightenment inspired Encyclopedia Brittanica, first issued by 'A Society of Gentlemen in Scotland between 1768 and 1771[8]. It is a pointless occupation designed to keep him out of the way and ignorant of what is really going on. The tradition of rational thought is being undermined by Doyle's work, too, despite his detective's

---

6) Hamlet, Act I, Sc. 1, ℓ.8.

7 Roy state "Keats, named after the poet who died young, causes a death by drowning" in a part of her discussion headed "here lies one whose name was writ in water" (p. 72).

8) Entry in Oxford Companion to English Literature, 1986.

and his texts' overt claim to rationality[9]. Christine Clay's surname is a reference to this story as well as to Blake's Book of Thel. In it, the archcriminal who is foiled by Holmes is named John Clay. He is an aristocrat of royal blood and, even on the point of being arrested, tells the police officer "Have the goodness also when you address me always to say 'sir' and 'please' (p. 72). In just such a way, Grant replies to an outrageous suggestion by Champneis with "Very good, sir" (p. 74) despite knowing that such class-consciousness is indefensible in moral terms when a murder is being investigated. Tey's "knitting" is certainly taking place once again in this text. Yet, still, this analysis did not seem to me to provide a real key to its significance.

### iv. The story of Tey's life is continued

When Tey wrote this book, she herself was living a double life. At the height of her eminence as a London playwright, she yet was chafing at the restrictions imposed on her by a near decade of domesticity suffered in Inverness. Perhaps this book goes some way to make a statement about her confinement in the service of another person fitting in with Blake's insistence on creating his own system and his need to create. On Tey's own evidence, recorded in the file about her available for inspection in Inverness Public Library, and commented upon by MacDonald, elements of her identity as Scottish and female were an embarrassment and received as almost comical in theatrical circles[10]. Being English, upper-class and male, even if not heterosexual, would have transformed the path of her professional career. This position is reflected here in Grant, who is shown as having suppressed his Scottish, Highland and intuitive "other" self, so troublesome in the first text, to act out his very public role as a male, rational, authority figure based in the metropolis. This aspect of her life can be traced, too, in the narrative's emphasis on the vulnerable position of the immigrant Galerian song-writer, Jason Harmer, and the refugee he and Champneis smuggle into the country. Harmer has previously bluffed his way into America. Similarly, Tey, a Scottish woman of lowly origin, felt that she had "bluffed" her way into the world of London theatre. Both Harmer in this narrative and Tey herself in real life at the time of writing, are

---

9) Detection is, or ought to be, an exact science, and should be treated in the same cold and unemotional manner. (The Sign of Four (1890) Chapter 1.)

10) MacDonald p. 120.

subject to repatriation for political reasons. In England, they are of dubious status and Harmer is forced to cover his tracks in the presence of an authoritative figure such as Grant. Tey was on the defensive in England and, in having to return to domestic life in Inverness according to the conventions applying to an unmarried daughter of the time, parallels Harmer in being liable to suffer political repatriation as "an immigrant song-writer". This text demonstrates nationality working as a trap in a small, persecuted nation.

A close identification with the position of Christine Clay, too, is apparent. The issue of class as it affected the actress is spelled out. Clay is from a modest background but has become prominent, moves in upper-class circles and is reluctant to talk openly about her history or personal life.

> Every six months she was in a different social sphere, she went up at such a rate. That takes a lot of living up to - like a diver coming up from a long way below. You're continually adjusting yourself to the pressure. No, I think she needed a shell to get into, and keeping people guessing was her shell (p. 45).

The progress of Tey's own career is outlined here and justification of her reserved behaviour spelled out in class as well as personal terms. McDonald confirms that Tey's sudden fame was an ordeal to her[11].

The explanation of Clay's unusual will is even more clearly a reference to Tey's own life. No provision is made for her immediate family, in this case her wealthy husband. The first beneficiary mentioned is her dresser and housekeeper, Bundle. Jo Myers, who directed her greatest successes, is the second. There are various minor personal bequests, but "because she found people - disappointing" (p. 76), the bulk of her fortune is left to provide for "the preservation of the beauty of England" (p.72). Clay was originally English but had become American and made two wills in that country. These were destroyed and her final will was made subject to the law of England "for the stability of which she had a great admiration" (p.72). Tey's final will was, too, written in England, and it contained similar clauses. Tey's closest friend is known to have been Mollie Macewan, the daughter of Sir Alexander Macewan. She was the wardrobe mistress in Tey's theatrical productions, and

---

11) For any person to attain to sudden fame from the obscurity of ordinary life must be something of an ordeal- and so it was to Gordon Daviot. Inundated with social invitations; laudation from the press; laudation from all interested in the theatre and the arts; discussed in her home-town [...] she found it necessary to discourage those who now clamoured for her friendship. Her puckish sarcasm was her weapon, and she used it ruthlessly. (MacDonald p. 117.)

presumably stood in the same relation to her as Bundle does to Clay here[12]. (Tey's closeness to Macewan explains her delight, frequently remarked on, when the cast of Richard of Bordeaux presented her with a cushion made from their original costumes[13].) Jo Myers, who directed her successes, suggests the figure of John Gielgud who acknowledged her as a close friend after producing and starring in her plays (p. xii). Certainly, the bulk of Tey's estate, together with any further royalties to be earned by her books, was left to the National Trust for Places of Historic Interest or Natural Beauty, that is, the Trust operating in England and Wales rather than that in Scotland, which had been founded in 1931. When, years later, Tey knew herself to be dying, she travelled to London where her funeral took place, like Clay's, at a suburban crematorium, and was attended by many friends from the world of the theatre[14]. These arrangements are so similar that it seems a reasonable surmise that by 1936 she herself, finding people disappointing and admiring the stability of England, had had two earlier Scottish wills destroyed and, after a few personal bequests, left most of the substantial sum of money she had earned as a contribution to the enhancement of England and subject to the law of that land.

Once again, the writer walks across the action anonymously. This time she is a retired teacher who feels that her life has been thwarted. "I had been very ambitious once myself and had - had to put my desire aside" (p. 145). Even the description of playing lacrosse fits into the story of Tey's life. "And Erica was [...] running across the clearing, as she had swerved and run, half-bored, half-pleased, through many winter afternoons." (p. 122). This is likely to represent the feelings of an intellectual woman like herself at a physical training establishment. It points forward to further explanation of her unexpected choice of career provided in the next detective novel, published more than a decade later, which is set in a women's training college.

---

12) This information was kindly given to me by Professor Tom McLean of Edinburgh University, who is a native of Inverness. Sir Alexander Macewan was an Inverness solicitor and owner of an Indian tea plantation. He was also chairman of Inverness Royal Infirmary and of the town's education committee. He was Provost for many years. Of international outlook, he worked on behalf of refugees. A writer and nationalist, he produced three works, The Thistle and the Rose (1932), Scotland at School (1938) and Towards Freedom (1938).

13) Yet she did appreciate youthful friendship of one particular kind, and that was when, after Richard of Bordeaux had run for a whole year and the cast had been supplied with new costumes, some of their number made a patchwork cushion from small squares of the original costumes, and sent it to her with beautiful bouquets of flowers, as a token of their esteem and enjoyment of her play. Never was she so excited – and she treasured that cushion all her life. (MacDonald, p. 120.)

14) See *Inverness Courier* article (Appendix A4 at p. 252).

## v. Extension of Grant as a split character

My interpretation up to this point still felt lacking in depth, with just one mention of a prudent, Calvinist kind of Scottishness, despite its consideration of the text's focusing on class and nationality and the extension of Tey's own story moving to favour an inclusive kind of Englishness. Perhaps the writer herself had mellowed in the years of the success of her plays and was happily anticipating a move to London on a permanent basis. Yet one clue to further meaning in this text that so noticeably lacks comment on Scottish issues did emerge- the choice of the name Erskine for the lawyer who holds Clay's will and with whom Grant works to solve the mystery.

Erskine is a name involved over centuries with the Stewart dynasty and with the fomenting of rebellion. One Erskine, the Earl of Mar, was the leader of the Jacobite uprising of 1715. Thomas, first Baron Erskine, was a noted radical thinker and supporter of Thomas Paine, and eventually became Lord Chancellor in 1806. Most importantly for this text, Thomas's brother, Henry Erskine, was the advocate who, in 1788, put up a vigorous defence of Deacon William Brodie when that respected Edinburgh town councillor and cabinet maker was tried and condemned to death for his nocturnal crime which had terrified the establishment and business circles in which he moved by day. His position allowed him a monopoly of the trade in supplying doors and locks for buildings in the centre of the city and this inside knowledge enabled him to enter them without the use of force. It also led to his being hanged on a gallows he himself was reputed to have designed. The Whig Erskine's skilled, if ultimately unsuccessful, defence of the indubitably guilty Brodie was politically motivated. It centred on protest at the Tory Lord President Dundas's use of crown privileges to overrule an important principle of Scots law, that of the inadmissibility of a convicted criminal as a witness in a trial. Erskine was appealing to resentment on the part of the jury and public at Dundas's control of Scotland in his own self-interest and that of his cronies, who included the Lord Advocate, Sir Ilay Campbell. At that time of international revolutionary ferment, nationalist feeling abiding since 1707 was, too, surfacing anew, and Brodie's conviction in these circumstances was interpreted as an attack on the ancient liberties

of Scotland[15]. Words spoken by Erskine during Brodie's trial in turn inspired, moreover, Robert Burns' "battle cry of Scottish radicalism, this in turn to reverberate round the world in 'A man's a man for a' that'" (J.S. Gibson, Deacon Brodie: Father to Jekyll and Hyde, 1993 p.122)[16].

That Stevenson used Brodie's career to inform the character of Jekyll and Hyde is well-known and, as discussed earlier (p. 20), his creation has been identified as the most potent myth produced by Victorian Scotland. Between the two World Wars, the conception of a self ineradicably split had been identified as central to Scottish consciousness and was being used by many writers in the explosion of new work appearing at the time[17]. In Section IV I discuss its use by women writers in particular. Tey employed it in her first detective novel. The significance of the use of the name Erskine, for Grant's legal ally, may hint at the detective being a literary descendant of Brodie, and to his being engaged in crime sanctioned and facilitated by his official position, as he was in the first text. His officially approved pursuit of the innocent Tisdall involves him, like his historical and literary predecessors, in rearguard action to deny his outlawed, intuitive and implicitly Scottish self which is inimical to the assumptions and processes of the authoritative English law he is employed to maintain. Grant, maintaining a Brodie-like, Calvinist and canny, air of righteousness in his official public role, falls, like Dr. Jekyll, into the trap of moral pride and hypocrisy as he attempts to hide his less acceptable self, which depends upon his "flair", from view. In the same way, the clear references to texts innocent of Scottishness such as

---

15) There it was. More than the Deacon's guilt was now on trial. What was now at issue was the intrusion into Scotland of the overriding power which the Crown enjoyed in England. The law of England held that the King's prerogative could so expunge the misdeeds of even the blackest villain that he could bring down others by his bartered evidence for the Crown: conviction by a Scottish jury debarred altogether any such future appearance as a Crown witness. The English practice, my Lord-Advocate would say, was a safeguard against crime of an occult nature. Erskine's reply would be that it was a power which could put the individual at the mercy of tyrannical authority, an attack on the ancient liberties of Scotland.
Gibson, p. 85.

16) 'I have heard it said [...] that the King could make a peer, but that he could not make a gentleman. I am sure that he cannot make a rogue an honest man.' Down in Dumfriesshire Robert Burns caught the echo of his words. Perhaps he had read the reports in the newspaper and Harry Erskine's speech had stuck in his mind. Perhaps [...] he had bought a copy of Willie Creech's book. However it happened, seven years later, by the poet's alchemy Erskine's words had become:

A prince can mak a belted knight
A marquis, duke an a' that
But an honest man's aboon his might
Guide faith, he manna fa' that. Gibson p. 122.

17) An example is James Barrie's character Adam Yestreen in Farewell, Miss Julie Logan. Later, James Bridie created a similar figure in Mr. Bolfry in the play of that name.

those of Shakespeare and Blake could be seen to be undercut by this one allusion to the Scottish. The use of the name Erskine in this conformist text may indicate that, perhaps in conflict with the writer's intentions, there is a subversive Scottishness going on.

Seeing Grant as once again a Brodie figure adds, too, to the local connections enjoyed by this detective around Inverness. William Brodie was a member of a landed family of the most ancient lineage stretching back to the time of Macbeth and based at Forres close to Cawdor Castle itself. The clan chief, Brodie of Brodie, wrote in person to Dundas asking for clemency for his kinsman[18]. The family was closely involved with the neighbouring Grants and Deacon Brodie's grandfather had been sent to the capital city to establish a representative presence in it[19]. Brodie's own mother was a Grant and after her death his father and he himself in turn lived with a Mistress Ann Grant who bore them five children. Such interweaving of these families makes the names of Grant and Brodie almost interchangeable and underlines Tey's detective's dependence on the famous historical character as well as adding to his already well-established links with the Moray Firth.

The connotations of the name Erskine are extensive. That same lawyer, Henry Erskine, was the prime moving force behind a parliamentary bill, aimed at reducing political corruption and extending the franchise. The bill was drafted in 1783, the same year as Burgoyne surrendered the American colonies. It threatened the personal supremacy of Henry Dundas, who T.M. Devine sees as the heir of the Campbell Earl of Islay (later Duke of Argyll) as despotic ruler of Scotland in his The Scottish Nation (p. 197). The power of Dundas was so great that not one Scottish MP was willing to introduce the bill in the House of Commons. The Irish MP and playwright Richard Sheridan stepped in and presented it to parliament repeatedly, year after year, each time to be scathingly repudiated by Dundas. The title itself, A Shilling for Candles, is a quote from Sheridan. The unrest that followed in that time of Enlightenment thought and radical protest is not the point of this, perhaps accidental,

---

18) ...from his castle near Forres Brodie of Brodie, swallowing his not inconsiderable pride, had brought himself to ask the Secretary of State that his kinsman's sentence be Botany Bay rather than the gallows. Not that there was anything to be said for the Deacon, the Laird of Brodie hastened to add; but the disgrace of a hanging would mortify the Brodie gentry whereas clemency would put them under a lasting obligation to the present administration. And on the petition a Home Office clerk had written, 'He has been told it cannot be done'. (Gibson, p.138-9.)

19) Sometime in the late seventeenth century the son of the Brodie Laird of Milntown came to Edinburgh to learn the law and be the family's man of business. (Gibson, p. 21.)

allusion. What is its force is that this second detective novel can be read as politically revolutionary and condemnatory of the Campbells and their followers as was the first.

## 3. Resumption of her career after the Second World War

### i. Three new investigators

That a woman and multiple outsider in London society like Tey achieved initial success with her plays is surprising. It is no surprise that sustaining such a career during the Second World War from the distance of Inverness proved impossible. In the years after it ended she concentrated on producing her detective novels although she never ceased writing both full-length and one-act plays. The novels brought her renewed fame and an even larger readership despite, or, perhaps, because of, her continuing subversion of the form. Even the grudging Symons concedes that "all have something original about them" (p.179).

The topics important in the first two books are returned to, and the story of her own life continues. Yet, I argue, a bitter and harsher tone emerges which can be attributed to the fading of her hopes of escaping from Inverness, to be succeeded in its turn by a note of melancholy and resignation. An exhaustive examination of all six further books is not possible. Instead, I aim to pick out of each one the characteristics of her work it best exemplifies.

In this return to the form, Grant is removed from centre stage and his place taken by three new investigators who each makes a single appearance and, each ill-suited to the role, is thoroughly reluctant to become involved. All know that their well-meaning attempts to restore order may avail nothing and could instead precipitate disaster. I shall consider these three novels with new investigators, each solving a single mystery, as a group[20]. It is not until the appearance of the fourth post-war novel that Grant returns as an active detective. He is a changed figure who is developed further. I will examine these three final 'Grant' novels[21] later, but now turn to consider the three with 'new' investigators.

---

20) Miss Pym Disposes (1946); The Franchise Affair (1948); Brat Farrar (1949).

21) To Love and Be Wise (1950); The Daughter of Time(1951); The Singing Sands (1952).

## ii. Résumés of the three 'non-Grant' detective books

### Miss Pym Disposes

In this novel, the crime takes place, uniquely in Tey's work, late in the narrative rather than before the action begins. Lucy Pym is a retired teacher and writer of a celebrated book refuting the insights of psychological theory, which she finds discomfiting. She visits a college of physical culture, named Leys, to give a lecture in the summer term, because the Principal of the establishment, Henrietta, was her idol in her schooldays. Despite Lucy's initial horror at the spartan regime, she is persuaded to stay on by the attention she is accorded by the large cast of lively and attractive students and staff. The most charming of all is the glamorous Pamela Nash, known as Beau, who is a close friend of the quieter but distinguished-looking Mary Innes. Lucy is unfortunate enough to notice the cheating in a final examination of a less appealing girl, Barbara Rouse, decides in the interests of peace merely to prevent further such action, and destroys the evidence. Henrietta, responsible for allocating positions to the graduating students, insists on favouring the undeserving Rouse with an exceptionally good opportunity while passing over the clearly more able Innes despite the united opposition of her staff and the expectations of the students. Rouse, who practises early in the gymnasium, is fatally injured by faultily secured equipment, and Henrietta is forced to offer the post to Innes. Again, Lucy finds herself in possession of vital evidence. A rosette from a shoe, which she found there after the gymnasium had been cleared by a powerful vacuum, indicates that the equipment has been tampered with by an intruder. Innes has lost such an object. Rather than approaching authority, Lucy confronts the student, who accepts responsibility for the accident. The punishment Innes herself suggests is returning home to work in her father's medical practice in a small market town from which she has longed all her life to escape. In the final chapter, her friend Beau reveals accidentally to Lucy that she, too, has lost the button from her shoe. Lucy has condemned the wrong person to punishment but finds herself unable to speak out and rectify the situation.

## The Franchise Affair

Tey's familiar theme of persecution of the innocent is the starting point here. Two adult women, Marion Sharpe and her mother, who live at an isolated house called *The Franchise*, are accused by a young girl they maintain they have never met, Betty Kane, of having kept her prisoner there and assaulted her. Robert Blair, a solicitor practising in the neighbouring country town of Milford, is persuaded to act for the friendless pair. His investigations do not produce enough evidence to convince a jury of the demure-looking girl's dishonesty, though he is able to engage his persuasive friend, the barrister Kevin Macdermott, to represent the Sharpes in court. The mystery is solved and the women exonerated when the manager of a hotel in Denmark recognises Kane's photograph in a newspaper as that of the supposed wife of a commercial traveller who stayed in his establishment during the time she claims to have been imprisoned. Her bruises were the result of an attack on being discovered by his wife. Blair, by now deeply attached to the unconventional Marion, proposes marriage and is firmly rejected on the grounds that she is "not a marrying woman" (p.250) In a final, brief episode he joins the Sharpes on the aeroplane on which they are leaving for Canada and the narrative closes with his future uncertain.

## Brat Farrar

Here, the eponymous central figure is a picaresque adventurer of uncertain parentage. A chance acquaintance named Alec Loding persuades him to adopt the identity of Patrick, a vanished child he resembles, in order to inherit the stud farm at Latchetts, a property occupied by the orphaned Ashby family who have been brought up by Aunt Bee, their father's unmarried sister. Brat carries off the deception, but becomes convinced that Patrick was murdered by his malevolent twin, Simon, who pushed him into a quarry. In the struggle at the same place that ensues between the two, Simon is killed while Brat survives. He is to spend time breeding horses in Ireland with Aunt Bee, the mother figure he has come to love. In the meantime, the return from Europe of the head of the family, Great Uncle Charles, is a cause for celebration. Simon's sister, Eleanor, who now inherits Latchetts, hopes to marry Brat on his return. This eventuality would secure his future and change his status from that

of fraudster to one of valued member at the centre of the Ashby family, to which, it turns out in traditional fashion, he has belonged all along.

### iii. These amateur detectives

These three new detectives are all single and without close friends but there their conformity to the traditional central figure ends. All are far from self-sufficient, and in fact vulnerable emotionally. Lucy, having achieved independence and freedom on the death of her "remaining parent" (p.7) and having decided not to marry, finds herself isolated in her London flat. Robert, the product of intermarriage between cousins involved in the family law business, was brought up by his aunt and educated at a boarding school which caused him "misery and desolation" (p.252). Brat has lacked family, and has had no personal or financial support of any kind. All three are thus unlike the prescribed God-like, unmoved figure, have problems meting out justice and, finally, have their own assumptions, perceptions and futures altered forever by the course of events. I shall discuss each in turn.

Lucy, reluctant to disclose her findings to authority, attempts to play God and exacerbates the situation, as the book's title, referring to the work of Thomas à Kempis, indicates. "For man proposes, but God disposes" (*De Imitatione Christi*, Book 1, Chapter 9, Section 2). By failing to report Rouse's cheating immediately, she precipitates the accident which kills the student, and her subsequent decision to conceal the fact that a murder has taken place allows the guilty character to escape punishment while in her place an innocent person sacrifices her future. Both Roy and Talburt accept at face value Lucy's assertions in the text that she is happy as a single woman[22]. Yet it is clear that the reason she becomes involved in college affairs against her better judgement is her loneliness. Near the end of the narrative, she notices the look on a man's face when he is in love and realises that the warmth of college life and the polite attentions of men are not enough. "It was not enough to have one's hand kissed"' (p.182). The text testifies at a deep level to this reason for her vulnerability. Meditating on Henrietta's devotion to the college, she reflects that her friend has never been attractive to men, quite apart from the initial deprivation of having had

---

22) She lives alone, likes it and is apparently well-adjusted. (Roy, p. 88).
She is firm [...] in enjoying the life she has, free from domestic ties. (Talburt, p. 74).

"elderly parents and no sisters" (p. 56). Thinking of her own suitor of long ago she wonders "where Alan [was] nowadays" (p. 56). Later, as the expectant college reacts in petrified horror to the announcement that Rouse is being favoured instead of Innes, she recalls an Easter holiday on Speyside, where she had "missed the Grantown bus" and, a long way from home, "had to walk it every foot of the way, under a leaden sky into a bitter wind over a frozen world" (p. 126). The faithful reader of Tey's novels, wondering with Lucy where Alan Grant is to be found in this text, can find him here as an erstwhile and rejected suitor. "Missing the Grantown bus" is the reason for Lucy's loneliness in a society which freezes out the unmarried person. The lack of personal love in Henrietta's background and current position is the reason that the college means so much to her. "She lived and moved and had her being in the affairs of Leys; it was her father, mother, lover, and child" (p. 38). Her emotional involvement in its affairs and subsequent irrational judgement is the trigger that sets events in motion. The absence of masculinity in the closed community of the college is a lack that leads to disaster.

In this situation, Lucy's attempts to smooth things over bring about the crime itself, the escape unscathed of the criminal Beau and undeserved suffering to the innocent Innes. Talburt interprets the workings of Pym's mind as "giving more weight to psychology than to physical evidence" (p. 53). Roy seems confused, remarking that " it does seem odd that Lucy should be the author of a psychological book" (p. 94). I disagree with both critics. I see Lucy's authorship as highly significant. Her effort to deny validity to disturbing discoveries in the field of psychology, rather than giving them weight as Talburt suggests, mirrors the anxiety of her attempt to ignore the dark subtext of college life. Both are perilous. In the two previous texts, the well-intentioned Grant is saved by providence from causing the conviction and deaths of the innocent Lamont and Tisdall. No such salvation is provided for the even more agonised Pym. She has to recognise that she herself operates in the affairs as "a deus ex machina; a perverter of justice" (p. 200). The artificiality of the detective genre itself, with its infallible and unmoved central figure dispensing moral judgement and restoring order to chaos, is exposed.

Robert Blair, like Lucy, struggles with a situation he has tried to avoid becoming involved in which makes him feel inadequate. Like her, too, he suffers from a nameless unhappiness and we first meet him as he attempts to identify what is lacking in his life as a

respected solicitor in a quiet market town. As the narrative progresses, it becomes clear that the early loss of his parents and his unhappiness at boarding school have resulted in failure to mature in emotional and sexual terms. Like Grant and Pym, his predecessors in Tey's work, Robert's embarking on detection involves an agonising internal struggle. Unlike Grant but in common with Pym, he is conscious of being overshadowed by other characters. These include Grant himself, who arrives as the sophisticated representative of Scotland Yard charged with securing a conviction in the case. Closer to home, his own nephew and office junior, Nevil, cuts a more dashing figure as a champion and protector of the Sharpes. His old friend, Kevin, too, has an enviable family life, the qualities of a cavalier and is engaged in forging out his own glamorous career as a barrister. Not least, old Mrs. Sharpe's caustic tongue and Marion's moral courage and refusal of convention dent his confidence. Beside these people, Robert is all too conscious of his lack of personal sparkle and comparatively limited horizons. These deficiencies are confirmed to the reader by his classically presbyterian name. Like his predecessors, he finds that his best efforts do not resolve the situation but, like Grant rather than the hapless Pym, he is rescued from disaster by a providential occurrence, the arrival of the Danish hotel-keeper who has by accident noticed Kane's photograph in an English newspaper. Solving the mystery does not, however, restore the world to rights. For example, Betty Kane's adoptive mother, Mrs. Wynn, a sympathetic character who deserves no punishment, suffers "crucifixion" on hearing the truth about her daughter in court (p. 248). She is not, however, a figure central to this text. When their house, *The Franchise*, itself is burnt down, the Sharpes are deprived of the independent life they value and have only recently acquired. Even when they are proved to be innocent, they still perceive the world "as just a place where dreadful things can happen to one" (p. 218).

This text sets up two questions rather than one. The more obvious is whether the Sharpes will be able to clear their name. The underlying question, posed at the outset, concerns the fate of the unhappy Robert. The reader is alerted in the early pages that his life is to be changed for ever by the telephone call he receives from Marion Sharpe as he is about to leave the office for home. "Always, afterwards, Robert was to wonder what would have happened if that telephone call had been one minute later" (p. 7). Despite his brave last-minute effort to escape "the soft folds of life in Milford" (p.252), there is no suggestion that Marion will change her firmly expressed decision to remain unmarried. Roy and Talburt assume that his life will be unchanged and that the trip to Canada is in the nature of a

vacation. Alison Light regards it with suspicion[23]. I agree that the reader senses the futility of Robert's attempt to escape. Marion's manner to Robert is affectionate but far from passionate and, in the last sentence of the book, she applies to him the adjective, "revolting". The reader familiar with Tey's use of Scottish names such as those of Lamont and Grant (and perhaps Erskine), as keys to palimpsests in these texts must be chilled by the allusion of Robert Blair's name to that of the Edinburgh preacher and writer who produced the melancholic work "The Grave" in 1743. It is a blank-verse poem dwelling on the horrors of dying. While it seems likely that Marion will attempt to help Robert Blair begin a new life, with such an ancestry in Scottish literature the future for this character of Tey's seems bleak indeed[24].

Brat Farrar is a youthful and rootless adventurer rather than a prosperous middle-aged figure struggling with a vague unhappiness. He lacks even a clear identity. Born in England, he is of unknown parentage. Much of his life has been spent in America, where a jealous woman rival forced him to leave his position as close companion to an elderly and rich man but he also "had his first girl" (p. 28). His happiest time, spent training horses on a ranch, was cut short by an accident which left him lame.

The fraudulent Brat gradually becomes a sympathetic character as he tries to solve the mystery of the disappearance of Patrick without revealing his own dishonesty or damaging further the now settled Ashby family. In his dubious position as a Brodie-like character both bad and good, he more nearly resembles Grant and Pym than he does Blair. Unlike all three, Brat finds that he is able to solve the mystery without causing suffering to an innocent character. In the process, he himself is rehabilitated. In Aunt Bee, he finds the vital mother-figure who offers the physical and emotional closeness to a human being his life has lacked. From this basis he can build a secure identity. If he marries the new heiress Eleanor, he will have a central place in the family to which, it is found, he has belonged, as a cousin, all the time. His future is, however, still uncertain. At the very end of the book, Aunt Bee refrains

---

23) "In a last ditch attempt to achieve resolution Tey gives us a final page, tacked on almost, like an afterthought, [...] we are not given wedding bells, however, but an ambiguous final comment on Blair's smugness." (p. 160)

24) Adam Blair, the bereaved minister who has a tragic end in J.G. Lockhart's novel of that name (1822) may also be involved. Certainly, Tey invoked one of Lockhart's other novels Valerius in her drama of the same name, which treated the same subject matter.

from informing Eleanor that she thinks that Brat does not wish to marry. "Bee hesitated; and then decided to let the future take care of itself" (p. 274).

### iv. Extension of discussion of Scottish Concerns

None of these three new detectives is presented as of Scottish origin, despite Blair's Scottish name and ancestry in its literature. And the only journey to Scotland involved is the one that takes place in Lucy's mind as she recalls her ill-fated holiday in a frozen Speyside. Yet, in this first post-war text, Scottish affairs are debated rigorously, if obliquely, just as they were in The Man in the Queue. Two students from Scotland are set in opposition to each other. Campbell, from the west coast, is lazy and deceitful. Like Rouse, she is not likeable, but is "too pliant, too soft-mouthed, too ready to be all things to all men" (p.31). On the other hand, Stewart, from Edinburgh, is hardworking, honest and direct. The two are conscious that the shadow of Glencoe hovers over their relationship[25]. Yet, in the detailed results of examinations offered, while Stewart is second only to Innes in achievement, Campbell also performs well compared to the English students. The ancient Scottish dynasty is invoked when Pym is brought up short by hearing Stewart "effortless and pure" singing "a frank old song" and thinks "I have been too long in London" where she hears only voices made artificial by being reproduced over the radio (p. 41). In contrast, the Hanoverians are represented by the college skeleton, named George, who is "a grotesque burden", split in two, which Lucy encounters when she meets "a small scuttling figure clutching under one arm the head and thorax of a skeleton and the pelvis and legs under the other arm" (p. 16). Putting this "burden" together is a real problem. In this way, blame is pinned on the Hanoverian dynasty for the phenomenon of the irreconcilable "divided self", used with such subtlety as a motif in these books.

Later, Scottish education is once again implicitly praised when Lucy, contemplating a kindly but illiterate letter from her housekeeper, recollects that "old McLean", who was her family's gardener "could write as good a letter as any university acquaintance of hers" p. 78). McLean's education, in "a small village school" is the kind Tey was familiar with in

---

25) "It is explained to Lucy that 'there is some personal reason for the quarrel [...]. It happened more than two hundred years ago. In the deep snow, and there was a massacre' " (p. 27).

her own youth. (McLean, of course, is a Jacobite name.) Even the intriguing remark that "you can boast in Dunbar but not in Berwick" (p. 119), raises a question about the opposing natures of society in Scotland and in England and is a reminder of the unbridled pride of family so widespread in the former. Further, the betrayal of Mary Innes by Henrietta is compared to the execution of Mary, Queen of Scots at Fotheringay (p.124). Scotland's contemporary nature and its troubled history in comparison with its more settled neighbour return as sources of interest in this text.

In The Franchise Affair, discussion of Scottish affairs disappears once again. Condemnation of Scottish presbyterianism is presented casually. A forbidding figure invoked is "Calvin or Caliban, he did not care" (p. 12). And John Knox is mentioned disapprovingly as believing in self-appointed executioners (p. 45). Certainly, Englishness seems to be favoured when Blair and the presumably Irish McDermott are placed in opposition to one another as Saxon and Celt. Marion puts into words the difference between the two. "The Saxons have the two qualities that I value most in the world [...] tolerance and responsibility [...] two qualities the Celts never had" (p. 179). But when Grant appears once again in person he is "calm and polite" (p. 157), just as he was in A Shilling for Candles. When Grant is calm, ignoring the complication of his family background, Scottishness, too, is ignored and is not part of the overt agenda of the text.

In Brat Farrar, Grant does not appear in person. He does, however, I suggest, play an implied role when the police "at the highest level" are informed of what has taken place (p. 270), and connive with other authorities in a scheme to gloss over such an unseemly event as the solving of a murder previously not known to have happened. In this cover-up, the processes of law are apparently complied with and are compared to "a harrow dragging over earth that held below its surface unexploded bombs" (p. 270). It is the vicar, George, who "loses" the one piece of inconvenient physical evidence, the stylograph which had belonged to Patrick and was found in the quarry with his bones. Presumably Grant, in his high position, is calm, refusing to struggle with his conscience as he condones this dishonesty. Scottishness is hardly discussed. Instead, Englishness is looked at from outside by the Glasgow journalist, Mr Macallan.

> Mr. Macallan looked down at the southern English walking about in their southern English sunshine, and metaphorically spat. "They're so satisfied with themselves I can't take my eyes off them", he said (p. 168).

His xenophobia, and argument that "these people kept Scotland fighting for four hundred years" (p. 169), are firmly contradicted by Brat who states that "but for them your Scotland would be part of Spain today". There seems little doubt that Brat is the mouthpiece for Tey's own opinion, in this text that centres on and praises the continuity of rural life in England. A Jacobite subtext is however present in the person of Great Uncle Charles. His return from travelling in Europe to take his place as head of the family is eagerly anticipated. The Stewart dynasty is once again celebrated.

### v. Symbols important in these novels

Roy points to Tey's use of central symbols to clarify the import of her texts[26]. In her discussion of The Man in the Queue and A Shilling for Candles she draws attention to the queue in the former and to the overcoat in the latter. I in turn identified the dagger and brooch, and the button as productive of meanings, building on and adding a dimension of "otherness" to Roy's conclusions. The symbol Roy notices in Miss Pym Disposes is the rosette lost from a shoe, an image of femininity. To me, darker forces are at work.

The setting of Miss Pym Disposes invokes the Garden of Eden as the college seems close to a paradise, full of "nice, clean, healthy children" where the air is "bright with sun and heavy with roses" (p. 23). The students themselves are first presented as flowers "making the bare lecture-room look like a garden" (p. 9). The very use of the simple word "garden" draws on the associations of Danté's vision of Earthly Paradise[27] and on medieval and renaissance allegories, stressing that it is a place of moral order and harmony. Yet the interweaving of gardens and sexual imagery is also centuries old and the Garden of Eden itself a place where threatening sexuality makes its presence felt. The implications of this setting tie in with the key symbol of the bell, which opens the text with its early morning clanging and is "Brazen, insistent, maddening" (p. 5). Its assault on the hearing is painful and it represents the autocratic, even cruel, way the college is run. As Lucy falls asleep and

---

26) Throughout her works, Tey uses a carefully interwoven set of symbols which reflect both her personal opinions as well as the theme of the novel (*sic*). (Roy, p. 58).

27) Alighieri Danté, Paradiso, Part III of Divina Commedia.

is woken by its tolling for a second time, it is interpreted in her dreams in terms of sexual deviance. "She was being beaten with knouts by two six-foot Cossacks [...] and the blood had begun to trickle down her back" (p. 12). The bell is used by the college as an instrument to intimidate and subjugate the young women who are students there to the power of the establishment. This power is centred in the person of its Principal, Henrietta. The bell functions in the text, too, as a clue to the identity of the murderer. Lucy detects unconsciously that Beau's enjoyment of taking her turn at ringing this outrageous instrument of power is linked to her own personal need to wield authority comparable to that of Henrietta. (p. 48). As usual, Lucy prefers to dismiss her uncomfortable insight, just as, earlier, she "pushed up a hump of sheet to shut out the full brilliance of the daylight" (p. 9). The representation of the college as a Garden of Eden and the use of the bell as a symbol of cruelty and repression in sexual terms work together to focus on the cause of the crime as the misdirection of sexual energy in an enclosed and deceptive environment. As symbols, they operate with an energy and insistence, even violence, absent from the use of the dagger, brooch, or any of the other symbols which were central in the first two texts. In this context, another quotation provides a central clue to the underlying cause of crime. The vacuum cleaner used by the gardener to clear the gymnasium of dust in the early morning is nicknamed "the Abhorrence", in deference to the statement, "Nature abhors a vacuum" (Rabelais, 1532). Roy notices this, but is vague about its implications, suggesting only that the college is shut off from the outside world (p. 91).

I interpret this vacuum in the college as the space caused by the absence of masculinity in its life. This space is filled by strong emotional ties formed between the women themselves. The setting of The Franchise Affair, the second of this trio of texts published in the immediate aftermath of the war, works, as with Miss Pym Disposes, as a comment on the difficulties of the lives of single women. The quiet town of Milford, seemingly idyllic, is revealed to operate as a community which automatically excludes incomers or those who fail to conform.

> That the Sharpes had not entered Milford socially was nothing to reckon by. Old Mrs. Warren, who had bought the first of the elm-shaded villas at the end of the High Street a small matter of twenty-five years ago [...] was still referred to as 'that lady from Weymouth'. (It was Swanage, incidentally) (p. 14-15).

Further, the lonely, ugly and uncomfortable house which Marion Sharpe and her mother occupy as single women makes them seem threatening, rather than merely outsiders who are

unconventional. The portrayal of the position of a lonely, single woman like Lucy is extended to illustrate the social exclusion such a person is likely to experience in a small community, especially if she makes no effort to conform. Roy points to the house, the Franchise, as a symbol in this narrative of the freedom the Sharpes hope to achieve.

In The Franchise Affair, as in Miss Pym Disposes, I find that a second important symbol is present. The lacquered tea-tray which triggers Robert's dissatisfaction with his lot is linked with his failure to mature after the death of his parents at an early age. His young mother, with his father's approval, had rescued the attractive old tray from oblivion (pp. 5/6). His substitute mother, Aunt Lin, and his secretary, Miss Tuff, shower him with domestic attention and comforts, but are unable to compensate for his emotional and psychological loss. Miss Tuff has obscured the tray she finds "distracting" with an intervening cloth (p. 6), which represents the covering and stifling of the worthwhile and valuable with inhibition and denial. Robert's needs as an adult have been covered over, like the tray, by the women around him. He himself interprets his unhappiness correctly as a "lost part of childhood crying for attention" (p. 7). At the old-fashioned hotel where he stays in London, a tray organised by someone with no such inhibitions gives him pleasure[28]. The original tea-tray reappears in the penultimate chapter as the symbol of his frustration, and is pushed away "with a gentle finality" (p. 253), as Robert realises he can no longer endure the "soft folds" of life in Milford (p. 252). (Linen, in such forms as Peter Pan collars and net curtains is referred to consistently in the text as stifling and reductive to the individual on whom it is imposed.) Yet, the idea that he can escape the prison of his own psychology is unconvincing. His name hints, I have argued, at a future far from bright. As with Grant himself and with Pym, Tey's first amateur detective, Robert's lack of recognition of his own psychological problems is the root of his difficulties and the uncertainty of his future.

The tone of violence linked with sexual deviance introduced in Miss Pym Disposes is, in this second post-war work, maintained and heightened. Betty Kane's original accusation is

---

28) At the Fortescue, the Edwardian old place in Jermyn Street where he had stayed ever since he was first allowed to go to London on his own, they greeted him like a nephew and gave him 'the room he had last time': a dim comfortable box with a shoulder-high bed and a buttoned-plush settee; and brought him up a tray on which reposed an outsize brown kitchen tea-pot, a Georgian silver cream jug, about a pound of sugar lumps in a sixpenny glass dish, a Dresden cup with flowers and little castles, a red-and-gold Worcester plate made for 'their Maj's' William IV and his Queen, and a much buckled kitchen knife with a stained brown handle. Both the tea and the tray refreshed Robert. He went out into the evening streets feeling vaguely hopeful. The Franchise Affair, p. 77

that, while holding her captive in their house, the Sharpes beat her regularly with a whip. The treatment accorded the women by the popular press is referred to as "its undressing of them in public" and this metaphor is returned to when the reserved and inhibited Robert expresses the wish, startlingly, to do the same to Kane in open court (pp. 166 and 172). Both Marion and Robert express satisfaction that someone has indeed punished her physically and Marion declares "I could torture her every day for a year and then begin again" (p. 165). Nevil joins in, considering a photograph of the girl's attractive face and stating, with slow venom "What I should like to make of it [...] would be a very nasty mess" (p. 66). Possible techniques for destroying flees and comparable sadism as a "distraction" may be discussed on a light level by Robert and Mrs. Sharpe (pp. 26/27) but the topic runs through the text and the characters' expressed desires in disturbingly serious manner.

In Miss Pym Disposes and The Franchise Affair, the first two post-war texts, the idyllic-seeming backgrounds which turn out to be deceptive are crucial to the force of the texts. In the third, Brat Farrar, the setting is once again vividly realised and important to the meaning of the narrative. It opens on a stud farm in rural England, where the Ashby family have been established for generations. Their enviably stable Englishness is emphasised and the theme is the process undergone by the central character as he struggles to find a secure identity as a mature adult within this family. The mystery about the disappearance of Patrick Ashby is of secondary importance. Meanwhile, the horses Brat has become responsible for at Latchetts occupy a central and symbolic place. It is their presence and his memory of similar companionship in America that make the project of impersonating Patrick irresistible to him. His successful pitting of his wits against an appealing but treacherous mount which attempts to kill him, and his pleasure in the experience, serve as the precursors of his resolution of the situation he finds himself in. His fraudulent behaviour becomes justifiable in personal terms as he thinks "I don't care [...] I don't care. I'm a criminal and it's worth it" (p. 122). The horses that are the source of his joy are linked with his pleasure in returning to the country where he was born. "This is what riding a good English horse was like [...] England, England, England, said the shoes as they struck [...]. Who cares, who cares, who cares [...]. If he died tomorrow it was all the same to him" (p. 123). This feeling of self-justification gives way to a conviction that what he is doing is actually morally correct. He begins to identify with the dead boy he is replacing and to become his champion. His goal in the second half of the book is to avenge the killing. In this thesis I have concluded that all four

of the texts I have discussed up to this point undercut the apparently idyllic English settings they present, whether in Hampshire, London, Westover, Leys College or Milford. Even so, it still seems that this fifth narrative celebrates the stability of the English countryside and Englishness itself. Doing this, it does of course act as a reflection of Tey's own final distribution of her assets. Here, uniquely in her novels, the background of Englishness works unambiguously positively, transforming the life of this investigator when, in solving the mystery, he uncovers his own identity and finds a home. Grant, Lucy Pym and Robert Blair have been seen to struggle unsuccessfully with their psychological problems. By contrast, Brat Farrar overcomes his. A question, of course, still lingers about his future (see p. 129above).

## vi. Intertextuality

In these three detective novels, as in the first two, many texts, ranging from the most ancient to those produced by Tey's contemporaries, are woven together until, as before, they seem, in Eco's terms, to speak to each other over the centuries. As always, Tey uses direct reference to key texts, quotations and the re-use of names and motifs. In its title, Miss Pym Disposes refers back, of course, to the writings of Thomas à Kempis (see p. 37 above). The ideas it puts forward, I argue, are underpinned by the statement of Rabelais that "Nature abhors a vacuum". In the context of this discussion it seems fitting that the books of Rabelais were first translated into English by Sir Thomas Urquhart, a Scot, a Northerner and Jacobite, whose work is invoked here by Tey who herself was all of these things. His imaginative prose work, The Jewel (1652), was the first such to be written by a Scot and was built on by later writers such as Smollett. Tey places her books firmly in this tradition[29].

Many further texts are referred to in this book. Blake is again quoted as inspiration (p. 160) and Shakespeare's Othello is invoked (p. 121). The revision of the interpretation of the character of Richard III to be undertaken by Tey later is anticipated when Shakespeare's play of that name is defined as "a blatant piece of political propaganda" (p. 143). Special, repeated, and detailed reference is, however, made in this particular book to the genre of

---

29) Her knowledge of the history of the Scottish novel is extensive. See section II, footnote 13, where reference is made to the unpublished novel of Sir George MacKenzie, also written in the seventeenth century.

detective fiction in which she was writing. Lucy's surname is that of an early fictional woman detective, Mrs. Pym, and refers back to Tommy and Tuppence Beresford, a pair of detectives created by Agatha Christie, are alluded to: "Tommy took my only safety-pin yesterday to pick the winkles with at Tuppence-ha'penny's party" (p. 10). Similarly, Edmund Crispen's detective, Professor Gervase Fen, is indicated when Mary Innes's father's first name is revealed to be Gervaise (p. 73). The almost exaggeratedly English sounding name of Edmund Crispin was in fact the pen-name of a Scot, Robert Bruce Montgomery, who according to Symons modelled his work on that of his compatriot, the Edinburgh and Oxford academic J.I.M. Stewart (p. 177). Stewart, in his turn, wrote detective novels in the name of Michael Innes. Both detective writers, Crispin and Innes, produced books, often with an academic background, rich in literary allusion and quotation from both English and Scottish literature which have much in common with Tey's novels[30]. Michael Innes is surely part of the inspiration of the name of Mary Innes and the connection between the names of Stewart and Innes made explicit when the characters are partnered and work together in the Final Demonstration of physical prowess by the students at Leys College (p. 168). That Michael Innes's most famous and influential work, set in an academic community, was entitled Death at the President's Lodging (1936) is chilling confirmation that responsibility for the tragic events in Tey's book must be lodged with the "President" of the College, Henrietta. It is her blind and obdurate use of her power in allocating students to professional posts which leads to action on the part of the equally strong-willed Beau, depicted in her reaction to Henrietta's unfair decision as operating as a part of nature, "part of the sunlight and shadow" (p. 127) and "a child raging and hurt at the wrong that had been done her friend" (p. 129). Like the actress Ray Marcable in Tey's first detective novel, Henrietta, who bears real guilt, is beyond the reach of the law, as she is not the perpetrator of the murder itself. Tey's allusion to the work of Michael Innes is not merely entertaining or decorative in its intent but is used as a subtle yet forceful underscoring of the dark implications of this narrative.

It is fitting in the context of Tey's weaving together of disparate texts that her contemporaries have used hers similarly. The Anglo-Scottish writer of detective novels, Gladys Mitchell, is an example. Her Laurels are Poison (1942), set in a girls' school, shows

---

30) For example, Innes's Lament for a Maker, dependant on the work of William Dunbar, had appeared in 1938.

a class studying Tey's Richard of Bordeaux. Tey returned the compliment to Mitchell's writing, quoting directly from her text remarks about the nature of kinesiology (p. 16). Like Mitchell in that book, she too uses a gymnasium as the key site of tension and violence. Once again a reader who is aware of these allusions feels the thrill of having access to inside knowledge.

The Franchise Affair is based on an officially documented case, that of the trial of Elizabeth Canning, who disappeared in 1753 for a month, worked as a prostitute and lied about the events that took place during that time. A fictional version, Elizabeth is Missing by Lillian de la Torre, appeared in 1945. Canning accused two women, a gypsy and an older accomplice, of keeping her prisoner and beating her. Public sympathy was immediately in her favour, people readily accepting the idea that two unconventional women, acting together and distanced from the local community, were violent and depraved. Such a reaction indicates the widespread persistence of belief in the eighteenth century in the existence of witches, even if that belief was largely unacknowledged. In Tey's book, the suggestion is strong that, even in the twentieth century, women like Marion and her mother, enjoying their independent lives without troubling to enter the social life of Milford, are perceived automatically by the small community as threatening, arousing deep-seated fear leading to persecution amounting to a witch-hunt. As a helpful colleague tells Blair "Give these Midland morons a good excuse and they'll witch-hunt with the best. An inbred crowd of degenerates" (p. 49).

Other texts on which this book depends emerge. Certainly Shakespeare's As You Like It is invoked when the young Nevil, infatuated by Marion, composes a poem in praise of her eyebrows (p. 152). As always in Tey's work, glancing references are made to her other books. Mention of the cases of Dreyfus and Slater as relevant to the defenceless position the Sharpes find themselves in (p.116 and p.248) are a reminder of the sufferings of Gerald Lamont, the first persecuted outsider to figure in her detective novels. Similarly, the conviction here expressed by Kevin Macdermott that "a boy's first horse [...] colours his whole afterlife" (p.185), points forward to a central tenet of the narrative of Brat Farrar, which was to be published in the following year Earlier in this Section (p. 97), I indicated the importance of horses in the orphaned Brat's development.

No doubt many similar texts are present, undetected by me. One I have found, however, works at a deep level to confirm suggestions I have made about the narrative. This is Lewis Carroll's Alice's Adventures in Wonderland (1865) and its successor Through the Looking Glass (1872). Certainly, it is emphasised that the somewhat naive Robert is moved abruptly from a world which is all too predictable to another where normality has fled and a dream-like atmosphere has taken its place[31]. Roy recognises this, describing him as "plunged into the tortured lives of the Sharpes" and commenting that "once again the author is stating that the world is a sort of Alice-in-Wonderland affair" (p. 123), without noting the text's dependence on these books, expressed by the re-use of motifs and by direct quotation. Similarities to Carroll's work abound. The wide-ranging conversation between Nevil and Marion which makes Robert feel inadequate covers "Mountains - Maupassant - hens" (p. 54). This works as a version of Carroll's "Of cabbages - and kings -And whether pigs have wings" (*Looking Glass*, Ch. 4). A direct quotation from conversation between the Walrus and the Carpenter is supplied when Marion, discussing the possibility of obliterating the graffiti on her wall, asks, "Could seven maids with seven mops?" (p. 131). The scene in court is presented as a game of chess in which characters such as Robert and Betty Kane's mother, Mrs. Wynn, are the pieces to be moved: "the game had been laid out on the squares now and they were chequers of different colour" (p. 186). In Through the Looking Glass, of course, chess pieces, such as the White Knight and Red Queen, have come to life. And my final example of direct quotation from this work comes when Marion's explanation of her refusal of Robert's proposal of marriage, is "Oh, as the children say, 'because' " (p. 249), which refers to Carroll's

> "The little fishes of the sea,
> They sent an answer back to me.
> The little fishes' answer was
> 'We cannot do it, Sir, because -' "
> Alice's Adventures in Wonderland

But the strongest connection with Carroll's work is the use of the symbol I found to underpin this narrative, the teatray.

> "Twinkle, twinkle, little bat!
> How I wonder what you're at!
> Up above the world you fly!
> Like a teatray in the sky."
> Alice's Adventures in Wonderland Ch. 7.

---

31) He is described as "clutching after the normal" (p. 17).

The teatray, which represents the blinded, bat-like Blair's inhibitions and difficulties in his personal life, is tellingly involved. It is easy at the beginning of the twenty-first century to read the departure of the Sharpes and Robert by air as natural. In fact, when this book appeared in 1948, this so-called "public conveyance" (p. 254) was no such thing (see p. 206 below). Flying was prohibitively expensive, uncomfortable and dangerous and, as such, was undertaken only by the seriously rich and flamboyant. These characters are neither. This scene is, like the one showing the murder in The Man in the Queue, not to be regarded as part of a realist narrative. It is important both symbolically and for intertextual reasons that Robert departs bat-like in his blindness "like a teatray in the sky". The bleak future that readers such as Alison Light sense to be in store for him, and which his name suggests, is confirmed. In boarding the plane, Robert is attempting to leave behind the regime the teatray implies but the psychological damage and limitation it represents are not to be escaped from.

Alison Light's study of The Franchise Affair in The Progress of Romance is relevant here[32]. This volume traces the development of popular fiction, beginning with the Greek romance and ending with comment on the future of the genre by the contemporary writer, Michele Roberts. It examines the relationships exhibited by texts to the prevalent political atmosphere at the time the various works discussed appeared[33]. Interestingly, Light echoes Tey's suggestion in The Daughter of Time that history itself must be viewed as no more than a way of writing down ideology, "an imaginary representation of people's lives" (p. 140).

Light's starting point is her demonstration that even works by women which have enjoyed great popularity relatively recently, and yet more surprisingly, those which are still widely read, frequently are ignored in histories of literature[34]. In this context, she dates the theory that great literature is "universal" in its appeal and application to diverse human beings, as having become untenable before the start of the Second World War. She points to the appearance, after its end, of many novels concerned with the topic of class difference,

---

32) See Section I, p. 3.

33) This book begins with an examination of the Greek romance, illustrated by the story of Daphnis and Chloe. In addition to The Franchise Affair, the volume contains discussions of How Green was my Valley, The Well of Loneliness, Gone with the Wind, family sagas such as Penmarric and fiction published by Mills and Boon.

34) One of her examples of this is Mary Stewart, a Scottish writer whose work is not discussed, although it is listed in the Appendix (p. 706) in Gifford and MacMillan.

thought of as the work of "Angry Young Men" [35]. While their work strikes a new note in this respect, she claims, its rewriting of the subject of class does not alter long-standing misogyny in male writing and, in fact, depends on its retention. The possible roles and needs of women as subjects in their own right did not, apparently, become part of the agenda of new writing until 1960. The idea that these issues of class, gender, and race (this last not yet addressed in 1960) are deeply interwoven was still to come. In this, of course, I see Tey, whose work shows connections between these concerns from the start, as far ahead of her time as a writer.

Light goes on to point out that immediate post-war austerity was followed by a new era of prosperity in the 1950s, when conservative political forces, based on a consensus thought of as middle-class, returned women, and images of their femininity, firmly to their traditional roles as homemakers. This "consensus", Light proposes, was composed of elements in society which found post-war social mobility threatening. It is her search for evidence of unconscious resistance to the political atmosphere on the part of women writers and readers as that era began that leads her to discuss The Franchise Affair as important. Tey's narrative, according to Light, attempts to support conservative ideology. She proposes that "through Blair, the way of life and the values of the English middle classes are constantly praised" (p. 152). I find that this praise is undercut from the start of the text, where Blair is presented knowingly as ill at ease and unhappy with his life as a member of that middle class. Further, Light argues that when Betty Kane turns out to come originally from a broken home in which she was badly mothered in a working-class community, she has become, with her lying and her rampant sexuality, "a kind of reservoir into which all the fears and desires of middle-class heterosexuality have been poured" (p. 157). Taking into account the sophisticated concern with class issues and the propensity to irony I have uncovered in Tey's books, along with Blair's distaste for the inhabitants of Milford, which grows throughout the text, I question this judgement. Light herself perceives that this text "informs against itself" (p. 156). She, like me, cites as important the violence of the emotion directed at Kane by Marion, Robert and Nevil. She questions also the text's offering of a solution to the problems faced by the eccentric Sharpes as emigration to Canada. The life they lead there is likely to be just as lonely as that they experienced in Milford. Like me, she doubts that the

---

35) She cites the writers Wain, Amis, Osborne, Braine, Barstow and Sillitoe.

ambiguous ending offers hope of a future romance between Marion and Robert. I concur in Light's finding that this highly commercially successful novel of Tey's, which became an equally successful film starring Michael Denison and Dulcie Gray, fills a vacant space in the history of the novel in the 1950's which seems strangely lacking in its discussion of possible ways for women to live their lives. Yet I see this text not as "informing against itself" as it attempts to celebrate the era's return to conservative political attitudes, but as working coherently in its analysis of the time and the paucity of choices- for Robert as well as Marion- it offered. But I applaud her conclusion that this novel " cannot be read realistically" (p. 160), which is the conclusion I reached about The Man in The Queue[36]. It is typical of Tey to leave her detective novels unresolved, requiring the reader to question rather than be comforted by conclusions. It works on several levels and offers no easy solution of their deep-seated problems to the innocent and likeable characters it presents.

I turn now to Brat Farrar. Like its immediate predecessor, The Franchise Affair it was inspired by real events. It is based on the case concerning the Tichborne Inheritance which occurred in 1866. In it an impostor, claiming to be a member of the family long presumed dead, arrived to claim an estate. The court case which resulted in his being unmasked was, until very recently, the longest ever to take place in England. A film, The Tichborne Claimant, recounting the story of the claim, appeared in 1998. The director, David Yates, defines the appeal of the story as that of identification with maverick characters taking on the establishment[37]. Such identification sounds likely to have appealed to Tey, too. In this text, however, the basic situation only is used and no criminal investigation at all takes place.

The first sentence of the novel, posing the question "was Noah a cleverer back-room boy than Ulysses?" invokes ancient legend. Both characters are relevant to this text. Noah, with, we are told, his divine "good Met. service" was able to survive God's wrath and enable both animals and mankind, in strictly heterosexual pairs, to survive. Ulysses, like Brat, returned home after his wanderings to be recognised only by an animal. He is pronounced by the perceptive Simon to be the more able of the two because he survived without the help of God.

---

36) See section I, p. 52.

37) *The Times*, 14th March 1998, magazine section.

Very clear references are provided to establish this book's position as part of Scottish literature. In her use of a key name of significance, Tey echoes Stevenson in Treasure Island[38], placing Colonel Smollett as an authoritative figure. At the horse-show, he makes the rules and is in charge of "the book" that all competitors must sign before they take part (p. 231). He is, too, to be consulted about how best to uncover Brat's real parentage. "He'll know how to go about it" (p.267). The implication is that Smollett's work is the touchstone by which a Scottish novel such as this must be judged. Certainly, his best known work, Humphry Clinker (1771) is involved here. Both these books are accounts of picaresque adventures. The names Farrar and Clinker are linked by their connection with a blacksmith's forge and indeed a smithy plays an important role at a vital point in the unravelling of Tey's mystery (p. 187). It is at the local forge that Simon crafted the weapon he used to murder Patrick. In Smollett's book the vagrant, Clinker, like Brat, is recognised at the end as having a genuine place as a deserving member of the family. Aunt Bee, as a single, older woman in charge of a motherless family, is paired with Tabitha Bramble. Both, too, are depicted as resembling cats, though they are of course very different as characters.

Traces of Confessions of a Justified Sinner can be detected in this text[39]. The striking use of a supposed twin as an alter-ego of dubious status depends on the earlier text, and in both texts there is competition over an inheritance. In both, the twin is revealed gradually to be wicked and undergoes a spiritual disintegration in the course of the book. By the time Brat knows that Simon is evil and the murderer of Patrick, he is himself so deeply implicated that exposing the killer inevitably will involve destroying the identity he has so carefully built up. When Simon confesses to Brat that he is a murderer, he claims "I'm a witch. I can be in two places at once" (p. 239). Both the struggle of the brothers on the edge of a ravine and the producing of the stiletto-like pen as proof of the murder are echoes of Hogg's novel. These references to the classic Scottish text are shown to be explicit when the Anglican vicar accuses Brat of destroying himself "on an edifice of his own making" (p.255). Once again, the fate of Deacon Brodie is invoked and use made of the motif of the divided self.

---

38) Captain Smollett is in command of *The Hispaniola*. Treasure Island (London: Dover, 1993) p. 37.

39) I am grateful to Dr. Kenneth Simpson for pointing this out to me.

Interestingly, the situation used in this book by Tey was picked up on and used again by Mary Stewart in her novel The Ivy Tree (1961)[40]. In it a manipulative character who equates to Alec Loding persuades another to return as an impostor, as if from the dead, to claim an inheritance. The twist in Stewart's tale is that this "impostor" is in fact the character he pretends to be. Tey placed her work quite deliberately as a woman writing in the tradition of the Scottish novel and it seems appropriate that contemporary Scottish women writers like Gladys Mitchell and Stewart set out to involve their work with hers. In Section IV I discuss further connections between the writing of Scottish women in the twentieth century, and in particular their use of Hogg's Confessions.

### vii. The story of Tey's own life in these books

In these three novels, the story of Tey's own life seems to me to be told more directly than before, and her personal and professional experience used more powerfully. In each, certainly, is found a vividly realised background familiar to Tey. Critics such as Roy and Morris agree that, in the first, good use is made of her intimate knowledge of life at a women's college of physical education[41]. The American mystery writer, Dorothy Salisbury Davis, reviewing Tey's works as they reappeared in 1954 after her death, is led by the charm of the setting at Leys College so far as to call this book "the gentlest of these welcome reissues" (Twentieth Century Literary Criticism, Vol. 14, p. 453). Tey's appreciation of the history of the growth of such establishments, too, is evident in such details as her creation of the Swedish gymnastics expert, Fröken, an acknowledgement of the contribution made by the Nordic states to the development of physical culture. In The Franchise Affair, in its turn, the depiction of the idyllic-seeming Milford doubtless owes much to her knowledge of life in the small market town of Inverness. Its tea-shop, run by the ironically named Miss Truelove, is a hotbed of self-regarding gossip which works to exclude unmarried characters such as Marion and Robert. "You got the best coffee in Milford at the Anne Boleyn, but it was always full of shopping females (*How* nice to see you, my dear! We *did* miss you so at Ronnie's party! and '*have* you heard...') and that was an atmosphere he would not face for all the coffee in Brazil" (p. 141). In Brat Farrar, her loving evocation of

---

40) Elisabeth Gemmill of Glasgow University kindly drew my attention to this book.

41) Roy p. 92.
Morris p. 289.

the English countryside is a reminder of her admiration for the country's air of stability and continuity, expressed in A Shilling for Candles through the wording of Christine Clay's will. That earlier text is evoked, too, when the account of the inquest on Patrick's death reveals his jacket to have been found by the unlucky coastguard Albert Potticary at the same cliff-top near Westover from which he spotted Christine Clay's body on the beach (p.171). It is likely that Tey's experience of being a Scot living in England is drawn on when Mr. Macallan is shown as instinctively resentful of its untroubled sense of security, but is quickly corrected by Brat's rejoinder that if England had not resisted invasion both it and Scotland would have become part of the Spanish Empire.

Personal testimony is evident, too, in many of the characters presented. Lucy Pym is a single, professional woman who has enjoyed literary success in the writing of a best-selling book. Like Tey at the time of writing, she has been retired from teaching for twenty years. In these circumstances, she is conscious of her lack of close companions with whom she could communicate. Of Pym we learn that "in the last few years she had been ignored, envied, admired, kow-towed to and cultivated; but warm, personal liking was something she had not had" (p. 43). Dark, disturbing humour is present, too, in the account of the alacrity with which Pym retired on winning her freedom. We are told too that "her remaining parent had died [...] and Lucy had dried her eyes with one hand and given in her resignation with the other" (p. 7). In 1946, the writer was herself in the prison that was Inverness, caring for her father, from which the only release would come on just such a death. This example of her telling of her own socially unacceptable story between the lines demonstrates well the use Tey was able to make of a popular genre with an air of inconsequentiality and innocence.

After this initial clear setting out of her own position as Lucy Pym is introduced, the emphasis shifts. Lucy's extreme femininity and self-abnegation is expressed in the most minor social interaction. For example, when guests are assembling at the college "Lucy went with them, and while she was waiting to see if sufficient chairs had been provided before taking one for herself..." (p. 171). This, coupled with her ultimate weakness as the crisis unfolds, may be ironic in its intent and effect, given the circumstances of Tey's own life, but they hardly suggest further personal identification with the character. More compelling in this context is the development and fate of the admirable Mary Innes. In this text, Tey does not just walk across the stage as an anonymous and downtrodden teacher as she did in the two

previous books. Innes, hoping to embark on a career in teaching, who has "quality as well as looks" (p. 30) and who is by far the most intellectually able of the students, has much in common with her creator. Like Tey, her experience has made her "unenamoured of the human species" (p. 188). Like Tey, she suffers "thwarted ambition" (p. 188) and is of an uncompromising nature. Like Tey, she scorns to show her emotion but "just burned up inside" (p. 130). All this sounds like the writer in the circumstances in which she found herself. The undeserved punishment which Innes suggests for herself, that of returning to a small town on the Celtic fringe, to work for her father, which she equates to a living death, is of course exactly that which Tey had suffered for two decades and her resentment of its unfairness is conveyed clearly. Both Beau Nash, the murderer, and Henrietta, whose folly was the root cause of the crime, remain untouched at the end of this book. In the savagery of this punishment meted out to the innocent Innes, this narrative seems to me the most shocking and the most disruptive of the genre of detective fiction of all Tey's works, rather than the "gentlest" as Davis proposes. Neither can it, as Roy argues, offer the reader "a sense of security and stability" (p. 95).

It is emphasised, too, that Innes is "wasted" at the college. "With an intelligence like Innes's one could lead much more thrilling lists than these" declares the incisive Miss Lux (p. 86). Miss Lux's own younger sister, whom she adores , is a medical student and she suggests, too, that Innes might have studied medicine. That being a teacher of physical education can hardly be seen as a glittering career is emphasised in the text. The students' enjoyment of the pressure and intensity of college life is explained by the fact that "very few of them will ever have any legitimate reason for feeling important" (p. 87). In life, Tey insisted that she had "never regretted" her chosen course of study[42]. Such insistence in itself seems suspiciously defensive. McDonald's description of Tey's school-days accounts for her career choice in speaking of the pleasure she derived from practising gymnastics in the intervals on parallel bars stored in the cloakroom: "...her one delight being to escape from the rigours and dullness of the schoolroom, and scamper off to the cloakroom where, upon an old set of parallel bars- housed there for no apparent reason- she delighted herself and others by turning somersaults and performing various other acrobatics in a highly expert manner" (p. 114). Perhaps such enjoyment palled in the less intellectually inspiring

---

42) Quoted by Roy from Twentieth Century Authors (Chicago, Illinois: Gayle Research Corp., 1954), pp. 620/1).

atmosphere of a physical education college as she matured. Certainly her personal identification with the innocent and highly principled Innes, whose talents are "wasted" and who could have studied medicine, suggests great regret. Had she qualified and worked as a doctor rather than as a gymnastics teacher, her standing in the community and in her own family would have been very much higher, a "legitimate reason for feeling important", and perhaps enabled her to refuse to return as if in captivity to Inverness. This text suggests at the least a keen awareness of the drawbacks of her choice of a relatively lowly career[43].

I have discussed the connection that the use of the surname Innes establishes with the writing of Michael Innes. It works, too, as an indicator of an identification of Tey herself with this character at a deeper level. The clan bearing the name Innes occupied land on the Moray Firth contiguous with that of the Grants and Brodies and claims even more ancient lineage. The name is territorial, from the barony of the same name in Urquhart, Moray[44]. Once again a very specific local connection to the Inverness area is made and the reference I established earlier to Sir Thomas Urqhuart's involvement with this text, as the translator of Rabelais, is confirmed. Further, the best known members of the Innes family are the brothers Lewis and Thomas. Living in the key period of the late seventeenth and first half of the eighteenth centuries, they were historians and archivists to the exiled Jacobite court working at the Scots College in Paris. Thomas Innes's two books, A Critical Essay on the Ancient Inhabitants of the Northern Parts of Britain or Scotland (1729) and posthumously published The Civil and Ecclesiastical History of Scotland (1853) are recognised as key works demythologising Scottish history and "placing historians of every and no religious persuasion in his widely acknowledged debt" as Chambers's Scottish Biographical Dictionary puts it, (p. 211). Tey's close identification of herself with a character bearing the name of Innes is a reminder of the Jacobite subtext in her books and her mission to rewrite the very much mythologised history of the Covenanting period in her biography of Claverhouse. In this, one of the most interesting characters in this detective story of hers which seems the most highly charged in personal terms, the name Innes has multiple significances.

---

43) The teacher shown in The Man in the Queue is emphasised as drab looking and having an "unexpectant" air (see p. 80 above).

44) The first of the name (Innes) on record is a Fleming named Berowald, who obtained a charter of the lands of "Innes et Etherureard" (Easter Urquhart), in the province of Elgin, from King Malcolm IV. (The Tartans of the Scottish Clans, J.D. Scarlett (1975) p. 75.

Roy concludes that this book is "escapist" and "offers the reader a sense of security and stability in a threatening and unstable world" (p.92). I conclude, rather, that this particular text, appearing as it did after a long silence and featuring a character closely identified with the writer herself, who is punished undeservedly, is an expression of its creator's barely controllable anger and frustration at the waste of her own personal and professional gifts in a life lived according to the expectations of society in the service of the "remaining parent".

In the second post-war text we are again introduced initially to a sympathetic, struggling character whose position in life reflects Tey's own. Robert Blair, contemplating his tea-tray, is all too aware of his feeling that "this is all you are ever going to have" (p. 6). The depiction of such a convincing mid-life crisis invites the suspicion that the writer herself was experiencing similar symptoms as the routine of her life in Inverness continued and her hope of escaping on the death of her father faded. This, it appears that she concluded, is all I am ever going to have. Robert may consciously consider himself as "a happy and fortunate person, and adult at that" (p. 6), but he admits to himself that his life lacks any real fulfilment when he reflects that walking down Milford High Street is "still one of the things that gives him conscious pleasure" (p. 8). Yet, this street, lovely in terms of its architecture, is "punctuated with pollarded lime trees growing out of the pavement" (p. 8), mirroring Robert's state of arrested, even in a sense violently assaulted, personal development. Later in the text, Robert becomes so disillusioned with Milford society that he can no longer tolerate living in the town he thought he loved. The indications are that Tey was able to appreciate the architecture surrounding her in the old-established town of Inverness while simultaneously finding living there as a single, middle-aged person unbearably confining.

Just as, in the previous narrative, the figure of Pym is distanced gradually from that of her creator after its initial introduction, and Innes seems to embody characteristics of Tey herself, so Blair, too, is distanced as this text progresses. Once again, a new character with qualities strikingly similar to Tey's own, becomes more positively portrayed. In the presentation of Marion Sharpe, discussion of the isolated position in society occupied by the older, unmarried woman is extended and has the ring of personal experience. Marion, a middle-aged woman who declares "I am not very feminine" (p.36), unconventionally swarthy and striking in her looks, and uncompromising as Innes in her attitudes, is a figure compared

to Joan of Arc (p.126). On the golf course she drives "a long ball like a man" (p.15). She is unafraid to declare "I loathe domesticity" (p.35) and, later, is especially adamant that "I am not a marrying woman" (p.250). All this sounds very much like Tey herself and is probably the closest approach possible in a popular text in 1948 to the sympathetic depiction of an openly lesbian woman. Further, Marion, too, has been disadvantaged by her education. It has left her only the option of "helping in lady-like businesses" (p.35) The idea that a prestigious medical career could have been her salvation - and, by extension, the salvation of Tey herself - is returned to in this text when Marion is shown as bandaging a cut efficiently. She declares that she would not have enjoyed a career as a nurse, adding, "But I might have been a surgeon" (p.147). Marion, like Innes, has found herself in a position where her potential is grossly underused. That is true of most, perhaps nearly all, women and certainly reflects the experience of Tey.

In the third text considered here, Aunt Bee, the mature and gifted single woman who has stepped into a maternal role, emerges as yet another version, perhaps idealised, of Tey herself. Her physical resemblance to a cat establishes her dependence on Tabitha Bramble, and that it is "a very expensive cat" (p. 1), later defined as "the long-necked, short-haired kind [...] heraldic cats" (p. 8) points to identification with the writer as a real person. The crest badge of Clan Mackintosh is a cat and its motto "Touch not the cat but a glove" (James D. Scarlett, The Tartans of the Scottish Clans, 1975, p. 112). Bee is, like her creator, troubled. As she walks through a graveyard on her way to consult the vicar, she meditates on its peacefulness: "Some day quite soon [...] my trouble too will be just an old song; one must try to keep things in proportion. But it was her head talking to her heart, and her heart would not listen" (p. 68). Later, Bee makes an apparently light remark that has the ring of truth about it: "There is a lot of the past I should like to drop behind me" (p. 176). Yet Bee, a single woman bringing up an orphaned family, has escaped the socially isolated and lonely position her predecessors Lucy Pym, Mary Innes and Marion Sharpe found themselves in. Her practical and personal gifts are used and valued in her role as a substitute mother. This, of course, did not happen in Tey's own life, but she does, here, in this character, offer a solution to the problems faced by a single woman.

In one further, very significant, way, the writer's life story is being told. Brat has been reading in the local paper the obituary of Patrick, the boy he is replacing, "his own"

obituary. Once again, Bee makes the vital remark- "It is what we would all want to do" (p. 175). Mr. Macallan returns to the idea enthusiastically. "I want to read my obituary" [Brat says]. "Man, who doesn't! You're a privileged person, Mr. Ashby, a very privileged person." (p. 169). I read here a suggestion that Tey was concerned about her own reputation as a writer in the future. We know from McDonald and Gielgud that Tey was deeply concerned about the passage of time and that her last illness was prolonged and kept secret.

> She had a serious urge- the urge to create and continue to create new characters; to produce more plays; to write more novels- and always the fear was that the time to do these things might prove too short. This time urge was almost an obsession. "We shall all be in little boxes soon enough."
>
> McDonald p. 117.

> Her sudden death last year was a great surprise and shock to all her friends in London. I learned afterwards that she had known herself to be mortally ill for nearly a year, and had resolutely avoided seeing anyone she knew. This gallant behaviour was typical of her and curiously touching, if a little inhuman too. Gielgud p. 10.

Roy indicates that Tey was aware of being gravely ill for several years (p. 151). As she died from cancer in early February 1952, it is likely that when Brat Farrar was published in 1949 she had already suffered health problems and suspected she had only a few years more to live. A wish to know the nature of the obituaries that would be written for someone in her position seems natural[45]. Obituaries as a source of interest return in her final detective novels, with To Love and Be Wise dealing forcefully with the questions of a prominent person's obituary and how it might be altered over the years of her life, the ultimate version depending on her precise reputation at the date of her death. I look at this question again in my discussion of that book.

## 4. Grant returns and is developed

In the three final detective novels, To Love and Be Wise, The Daughter of Time and The Singing Sands, Grant, who, I have argued, has never really been away, returns to active detection. I find that the tone of these texts has altered once again. The defiance and anger so prominent, and, in the immediate aftermath of the war, expressed in robust physical terms, have subsided. The ironic detachment found in the first two mysteries (The Man in the

---

45) Tey's own obituary notice in *The Times* is reproduced in Appendix A1 (p. 245).

Queue and A Shilling for Candles), has returned, this time with a note of experience and resignation. Grant himself retains his advantages of good looks, charm and wealth and now is a closer friend of a more sympathetically drawn Marta Hallard. But no longer does he possess the physical ability or even the psychological strength necessary to leap from rock to rock across a river or fight off attack by a maniacal monk as he did in the pre-war texts. Nor is he able to maintain the air of colluding, calm professionalism he adopted in A Shilling for Candles and fought to maintain in The Franchise Affair when his instinctive knowledge that the Sharpes were innocent conflicted with his duty to arrest and charge them (p. 161). As he becomes involved in further cases, his internal conflicts reassert themselves, leading to melancholy, paralysis and confinement and finally to a full-scale nervous breakdown. The warring factors in his nature can be reconciled only by return to his Scottish roots and the establishment of a meaningful personal relationship. That necessary journey back so clearly indicated at the end of The Man in the Queue in 1929, to "turmoil and grief and frustration" which he avoided then, preferring the "cow-like placidity, and ease, and pleasant skies" of Hampshire, is undertaken in his last appearance, published twenty-three years later. The questions raised by the unfolding story of Alan Grant, a subject in process, would have remained unanswered if his final journey to Scotland had never been undertaken and The Singing Sands never published.

## i. Résumés of the three last Grant books

### To Love and Be Wise

Grant meets Leslie Searle, who is a photographer from America and a disconcertingly attractive young man, at a London party held to launch the latest romantic novel by the commercially successful writer Lavinia Fitch. Searle is invited to Fitch's home in the country and introduced to her secretary, Liz Garrowby, who helps him pack his belongings and drives him there. He has expressed an interest in meeting Liz's fiancé, Walter Whitmore, who in turn is a flourishing but irritatingly self-satisfied radio commentator. Walter was previously engaged to an actress, Marguerite Merriam, who committed suicide when he left her. Liz, Walter, Fitch and her sister Emma Garrowby, who is Liz's step-mother and Walter's aunt, all live in a large house called Trimmings, near the village of Salcott St. Mary which has recently become popular with well-known writers and

personalities. Marta Hallard, Grant's actress friend, sets the fashion by purchasing a house here. Liz and Searle, thrown together, revel in each other's company, much to Walter's discomfiture, even though he and Searle begin the preparation of a book about the local river, the Rushmere, and depart to camp on its banks while they follow its course. One evening when they are pitched near the village, they visit the local public house where Walter takes his departure before Searle, following an intense and apparently personal disagreement between them. After Searle leaves in his turn, he is not seen again at either the camp or the village. Grant is called in to investigate the disappearance. Despite the river being dragged twice, all that is found is one of Searle's shoes. Grant traces the photographer's only relative, a cousin named Lee Searle, a woman painter who lives in London. It is quickly established that Lee and Leslie are one and the same person. Lee realised early in her career in America that dressing as a man smoothed her professional path and since then has used two identities. The visit to Salcott St. Mary, in her identity as Leslie Searle, was planned by Lee with the aim of murdering Walter, whom she blamed for the suicide of her beautiful cousin Marguerite to whom she was devoted. Marta's account of the selfishness that underlay Marguerite's brilliance led Lee to abandon her murderous intention but before leaving she took the opportunity to taunt Walter as not good enough for Liz, claiming that he, Searle, could take her away from Walter in less than two weeks. That satisfying point made, Lee abandoned Walter and the proposed book, returning to London by bus in her identity as a woman, wearing lipstick, a bright scarf and high heeled shoes.

**The Daughter of Time**

Grant, here, has fallen through a trapdoor in pursuit of a criminal, and is in the humiliating position of being confined in a hospital bed, his body paralysed and his mind unoccupied. To provide him with entertainment, Marta brings him portraits of historical figures and he is fascinated by that of Richard III, the supposed monster of Shakespeare's play, whose face he interprets as sensitive and full of suffering. He begins to investigate Richard's life with assistance from a young American researcher, Brent Carradine, who is in London because he is in love with an actress working there, Atlanta. Together, they discover that no contemporary rumour existed that Richard had killed his nephews and conclude that the Tudor Henry VII, Richard's successor and much less secure in his position as monarch, is

more likely to have been the criminal. At the close of the narrative, Grant, satisfied with the success of his application of police methods to the historical case and helped by the close relationship he has established with Carradine, has recovered his ability to walk and is making joyful preparations to leave hospital.

## The Singing Sands

Grant once again finds himself incapacitated but this time his difficulties are clearly psychological. Always seen to be subject to bouts of depression, he is now suffering from a nervous breakdown with claustrophobic symptoms (as prophesied by Jason Harmer in a Shilling for Candles) and forced to take time off work. Travelling by overnight train to his cousin Laura's home in Scotland where he spent childhood holidays, he stumbles across the unpleasant attendant trying to rouse an attractive, dark young man, who, Grant realises, is dead. Later, the detective notices that on a newspaper he picked up in the man's compartment is an incomplete poem, evoking a strange place with "singing sands". In contact with his loyal subordinate at the Yard, he discovers that the body has been identified as that of a Frenchman, Charles Martin. Dissatisfied, he places an advertisement in the London papers asking anyone who recognises the poem to communicate with him at his Scottish address. A chance meeting with the posturing, kilted figure of a supposed Scottish patriot, Archie Brown, reveals to him that the enchanting-sounding Hebridean island of Cladda possesses sands the "sing" in the wind. His visit to it proves fruitless and the welcome he receives at the hotel there is far from enchanting, but the activity and interest of the trip bring him returning health. The written responses he receives to his advertisement yield only amusement. Laura has a new visitor, Lady Zoe Kentallan, a good-looking widow to whom he considers proposing marriage. He is distracted, however, by the arrival of an American pilot, Tad Cullen, who has seen his advertisement and recognised the lines of poetry as the work of his colleague, Bill Kendrick, who has disappeared. Grant identifies a photograph of Kendrick as being that of the young man whose body he saw on the train. Cullen informs Grant that Kendrick had become obsessed by the lost city of Wabar he had glimpsed when blown off course over the Empty Quarter of Arabia, where he encountered "the singing sands". Grant visits Heron Lloyd, the recognised authority on the fabled lost city, but learns nothing. Shortly afterwards, Lloyd's main rival as an explorer in Arabia,

Kinsey-Hewitt, announces publicly that he has discovered Wabar after noticing a plane circling over it - Kendrick's plane. Lloyd departs by air to commit suicide and crashes spectacularly in the Alps. He leaves Grant a letter confessing to the murder of Kendrick, whom he wished to deprive of the credit of his discovery. Grant, now happy with the success of the investigation which has cured him of his illness, returns to Headquarters, reflecting with amazement on the idea that he had ever considered doing anything so extraordinary as marrying and settling down[46].

**ii. The importance of these three books**

Each of these books foregrounds one or two of the established interests of Tey's texts. Each uses the genre of the detective novel differently. Grant, contemplating a pile of all too predictable narratives by such writers as those residents of Salcott St. Mary we have met before, Lavinia Fitch and Silas Weekley, sees such work as "thirled to a formula" and wishes their authors would "change their [gramophone] record now and again" (The Daughter of Time, p 12). Tey herself certainly "changes her record", and these three final detective novels are all memorable individually for their approaches to mystery and their settings as well as the issues they foreground.

To Love and Be Wise is, as Roy and Talburt observe, in the tradition of the "fair play" detective novel[47]. Clues to the solution of the mystery, such as the cultural iconic status of men's and women's shoes build up in a way unprecedented in Tey's work, and Grant himself solves the problem without the intervention of providence. It is, however, emphasised that he uses inspiration rather than rational deduction, and he is warned by his colleagues against "doing a Lamont" (p. 174). Commentators presume this book's title to be a quotation from Shakespeare. "To be wise, and love,/ Exceeds man's might" (Troilus and Cressida, 1609). I suggest it just as likely refers, rather, to the earlier poem by Alexander

---

46) What odd notions occurred to one on holiday.
He was going to resign, and be a sheep farmer or something, and get married.
What an extraordinary idea. What a most extraordinary idea.

47) The plot, when compared with Tey's earlier work, is much more polished and systematic (Roy p. 134).
The best use of clues in Tey occurs in To Love and Be Wise, where they bombard the reader (Talburt p. 57).
Miss Tey employed her boldest deceit, underscoring her clues (James Sandoe in Twentieth Century Literary Criticism, Vol. 14, p. 452).

Scott. "There is no man, I say, that can/ Both luve and to be wise" (A Rondel of Luve). This poem was collected in the Bannatyne Manuscript of 1568. Once again, there is a hint that Tey's book stands in the tradition of Scottish literature.

Here Grant, always subject to depression, has become less active physically and tends to melancholy. This emerges most clearly in the scene where he and his local colleague Rodgers sit on the stump of a fallen willow tree supervising the dragging of the Rushmere in a search for evidence for the second time. The river functions as a central symbol of the novel. It is a force of nature akin to love, mesmerising and powerful, its beauty hiding its destructiveness. It is, too, reluctant to give up its secrets. The scene is "a timeless world, and comfortless" (p. 149). It inspires Grant to poetic thought: "Swift beauty come to pass/ Has drowned the blades that strove" (p. 150). The poem these lines come from, says Grant, is "what an army friend of mine wrote about floods" (p. 149). I have identified it as "A Soldier looks at Beauty" by one Hugh Mackintosh[48]. Grant's melancholy persists and even his eventual solving of the mystery affords him only the reflection that, in adulthood, "life was entirely constructed of compensations" (p. 203). This melancholy I connect with his ongoing refusal to come to terms with key aspects of his own identity.

Scottish interests are present though touched on lightly. The publisher Ross has a partner called Cromarty, not, as is generally supposed, "as a matter of euphony" (p. 48). It is an unequal partnership, in which the West Highland Ross uses his colleague as a scapegoat when he wishes to refuse to publish a book. "Cromarty had once said to Ross in a fit of temper: 'You might at least let me *see* the books I turn down!" (p. 48). Ross is an example of a too pliant West Highlander, like Campbell in Miss Pym Disposes, who shuffles off responsibility for unpleasant decisions onto someone else. Further, Walter Whitmore's perverse use, in a radio broadcast, of the word "England" to denote the whole island of Great Britain, will, he knows, provoke "fifty-seven letters tomorrow morning by the first post [...] to point out that Scotland too had her earthworms" (p. 50). That he is described as thus hanging his programme on "a Shakespearean hook" refers us to John of Gaunt's famous speech which makes the same assumption, in its reference to "This precious stone set in a silver sea [...] this England" (Richard II, Act II, Sc. 1, 1.40). The text in question has

---

48) This reference may be a pointer to the loss Gielgud suspects Tey suffered during the First World War, or to the occasion for the unhappiness he noticed in her around 1942. It is possible, of course, that the poet was a relative, but as Mackintosh is a very common name in the Moray Firth area, this cannot be assumed.

affinities with that play, which had such great significance for Tey in her career as a dramatist. They are alike in their melancholic and elegiac atmosphere, their presentation of ambiguous sexuality, and in the loneliness of their main protagonists.

The most telling reference to Scottishness comes in the final pages, when Grant visits Lee Searle to find her surrounded by her own paintings, taken from postcards, of Scottish mountains. Overtly the tone of the narrative here is lightly ironic, but a dark text lurks. The mountains themselves are "arrogantly destructive" (p. 200), and now that the artist has discovered that "it is very growing-up to find that someone you loved all your life never existed" (p. 200), she will destroy them, regarding them as evidence of her own youthful arrogance, expressed in her planning to kill Whitmore. This condemnation of the presumption that one can paint a place one doesn't know at all works in conjunction with Liz's definition of the attitudes of the artists who colonise Salcott St. Mary as "obscene" (p. 20). We are told, later, that "the aborigines are all right". Even more importantly, looking at the pictures, Grant is forced to admit to being "a renegade Scot", whose grandfather belonged to Strathspey (p. 199). As he leaves, Searle offers him a picture as a memento of the investigation but he finds himself unable to accept or to refuse the gift and avoids making any decision, claiming defensively that he may return when he has more time to think about it (p. 203). Grant is shown to feel under attack, just looking at the pictures[49]. This scene works as a reminder of his conscious rejection of his Scottishness in the first novel, where he chooses to holiday in Hampshire in preference to returning to Carninnish, coupled with his on-going, Brodie-like refusal to return to his own country from the public sphere in London and grapple with the problems that belonging there presents. Further, the angry-looking, intrusive mountains work as a reference to the crest of his own Clan Grant, which bears the image of "a mountain, inflamed, proper" (Scarlett, p. 70). His refusal to recognise his problem and find a way of accommodating his Scottishness is damaging him and, like the pictured mountains, the identity he is attempting to deny is asserting itself. The point was made earlier that this refusal on his part is potentially fatal. "Grant had just come back from Hampshire where a case had ended unhappily in suicide, and his mind was still reviewing the thing, wondering how he might have managed things differently to a different

---

49) They didn't present themselves to one, they attacked. "Look, I'm Suilven!" shouted Suilven, looking odder and more individual than even that mountain had ever looked. The Coolin, a grape-blue rampart against a pale morning sky, were a whole barrier of arrogance. Even the calm /waters of Kishorn were insolent (p. 191)

end" (p. 71). It is confirmed in this way that choosing to holiday in Hampshire at the end of The Man in the Queue is a major source of his crisis of identity. The implication of this scene are dark indeed, despite the light tone of the narrative. He is in deep and worsening trouble which may result in his death. The character of Grant has itself become the "case" in question in this series of books.

Issues of gender and sexuality are, too, foregrounded in this text. As Marta develops previously unsuspected nurturing skills, Grant feels mild regret that neither of them has any room in their life for another person.

> There was no room in his life for Marta, and none in her life for him; but it was a pity, all the same. A woman who could announce a surprising development in a homicide case without babbling on the telephone was a prize, but one who could in the same breath ask if he had had breakfast and arrange to supply him with the one he had not had was above rubies (p. 143).

The position of the single person in society is touched on again when Searle quickly realises that Grant's unmarried state has contributed to his ability to make sense of, and sympathise with, her actions. "It is the unattached person who - who helps", she proposes, explaining that "married people [...] are normally far too cluttered up with their own emotions to have spare sympathy" (p. 200). More importantly, an illustration of the idea that those deeply in love cease to be sane is provided by the behaviour of the ballet dancer Serge Ratoff prompted by his devotion to the world famous playwright Toby Tullis. Ratoff sees Searle snubbing the self-important Tullis, preferring to converse with the local garage-owner, and attacks him physically and verbally, shouting imaginative insults like "You middle-west Lucifer" (p. 41) as he is hauled away. The perceptive Ratoff seems provoked as much by Searle's sexual ambiguity as by the insulting behaviour to his beloved Toby, and in this way comes the closest of all the characters to divining the reason for Searle's entrancing yet upsetting "wrongness".

The question of dubious sexuality is as prominent as the equally doubtful question of Scottishness in Tey's work, and the presentation of Lee/Leslie Searle is its fullest treatment. Lee's devotion to her charismatic but self-obsessed cousin Marguerite was such that, like Ratoff, she had ceased to be sane about the beloved and, acting as an uncontrollable force of nature like the destructive river, planned an attack. Her transformation back from a man to a woman by donning a few items of apparel shows her gender to be an artificial construction

which can be appropriated and discarded at will[50]. She is able to bring to her acquired persona as a man the skills of a sensitive woman in subtleties of behaviour and conversation. That this male persona is that of a sophisticated and successful professional person allows her the freedom to use these gifts mercilessly in the baiting of Toby Tullis. Yet still, the sense of "wrongness" her person presents persists. Grant notices it first when he and she are wedged together in the crowd at Lavinia's party, but does not then detect the source of his unease. It is normal, of course, to be deeply disconcerted when the sex of a person is unclear, no matter what the dress. What Liz notices is that Searle's manner to her is very much more flattering than that of Walter. It is "a charming reversal of form" (p. 28). The two fall into place as a natural couple sharing "some quality of loveliness, of youth" that is "not apparent in any communion between Liz and Walter" (p. 33). At the least, the creation of this couple indicates the creation of a space between categories in relationships. It is open to being read as the suggestion of an essentially lesbian relationship between Lee and Liz. In this context, Searle's threat to take Liz away from Walter, which upsets him so much, is to be taken seriously. The presentation of gender as fluid is of course a marked characteristic of modernist writing by women. Lee and Liz, revelling in each other's company, echo the scene in Catherine Carswell's The Camomile, where Ellen, imagining herself to be a man, peeps through the curtain at her excited school fellows. This scene is part of my discussion in Section IV[51]. The emphasis on the function of clothes in the creation of gender is a reminder of the claim made in Virginia Woolf's Orlando (1928) that "it is clothes that wear us and not we them" (p. 180). At the time Tey's book appeared, when women were being returned to their traditional domestic role as wives and mothers in the aftermath of the Second World War, such a sympathetic presentation of a lesbian couple in a popular form, even if veiled, was bold. This novel is indeed, as its title implies "A Rondel of Luve".

I have commented on Alison Light's examination of the political implications of The Franchise Affair. In turn, Marjorie Garber's erudite analysis of this text of Tey's (among others) discusses the issues of transvestism in depth. She draws widely on its cultural manifestations expressed in the earliest known literature up to contemporary popular music and films and shows it to be fundamental to culture. Her discussion of Tey's To Love and Be

---

50) The construction of gender is an issue in all Tey's writing, seen in the characteristics of such characters as Dandie Dinmont and Marion Sharpe.

51) See p. 214 (Section IV).

Wise is prefaced by her statement that "I want to look clearly and in some detail at a few detective novels and short stories, all by prominent practitioners of the craft (Dorothy Sayers, Arthur Conan Doyle, Josephine Tey, Ruth Rendell), for each reveals something telling – we may as well call it a clue – about the conjunction of sartorial gender and the unknowability of essences or identities" (p. 187)[52]. This discussion of detective novels is preceded by a chapter entitled "Fear of Flying, or, Why is Peter Pan a Woman?", thus placing detective writing, including that of Tey, in relationship with that of J. M. Barrie[53].

Garber interprets Searle's disappearance in Freudian terms as vanishing "into the navel of the dream" (p. 198). This central character, using a few items to construct her "real" identity as a woman, exposes it to be as artificial as that of any male cross-dresser who, likewise, appears to be a woman. To call Searle "she", Garber points out, "is in fact quite misleading, in terms both of the narrative exposition of the plot and [...] of the point of cross-dressing in this as in other, mystery fiction" (p. 197). As Garber says, to ask if Searle is "really" a woman is to miss the point. The transvestite is a supplement, a third identity, unknowable in its essence, destroying the idea of fixed binary classification by the fact of its undeniable subjectivity and agency. Its appearance in fiction is a sign of category crisis, whether that of the immigrant as opposed to the character native to a country, of different nationalities, or of gender roles. (These categories, of course, I have found to be subject to rigorous question in Tey's books from the start.)

Grant is informed by the US police that "the infant that Mr. and Mrs. Durfey Searle *took with them* when they left Jobling for points South, *was, they reported*, female" (p.201, my italics). Garber points out that this statement based on uncertifiable opinion, parallels the disappearance of Searle from Salcott St. Mary, where his presence is based on a misapprehension. "And it is through this loophole that the woman escapes, for she was never, in that sense, really there".

Interestingly, Garber sees an apparently ordinary name given by Tey to a character who appears briefly, if significantly, as bearing unexpected meanings. "The 'oblong of empty

---

52) Garber points out, too, that Tey's novel uses Conan Doyle's A Scandal in Bohemia (1891) in which Holmes is deceived by Irene Adler's male disguise.

53) Tey is connected with the figure of Barrie, of course, by much more than her use of transvestism. Both fit into the history of Scottish literature as playwrights and novelists. Both present themselves as lonely figures, unable to fit into mainstream society, with private lives defying firm interpretation.

space where something had been taken out', the gap of the box of the cross-dressed woman, the space which has been identified only through the chance encounter with Dora Siggins has become a kind of Pan-Dora's box, and what is left is not evil but desire" (p. 202). Garber adds a further note on Dora's name, suggesting that it is an "oblique Tey clue" referring to the American writer Dora Siggerson Shorter, as noted in Section I (p. 35).

I look now at possible elements of autobiography in this novel. Once again, To Love and Be Wise seems to reflect Tey's own life. The opening scene, a literary party full of well-known people of no real achievement, is not the kind of event Grant, Marta or Lavinia Fitch herself would ever choose to attend[54]. The implication is that Tey, too, obliged to attend launchings of her own new books, disliked such occasions. This is confirmed in McDonald's account of Tey's personality. "In spite of her able wit and quick repartee Gordon Daviot suffered from a certain shyness- an unwillingness to meet strangers which was almost pathological in its intensity" (p. 120). Obituaries are again, as in Brat Farrar, the subject of discussion. The suspicion recurs that Tey knew herself to be seriously ill or, at the least, had a premonition that she would not live to a great age, and that the nature of her own obituaries was a topic of great interest to her. In this case, Marguerite Merriam's have been so enthusiastic that "the mourning was practically of national dimensions" (p. 15). Marta remarks that "if she had lived another ten years she would have got a tiny par in among the "ads" on the back page" (p. 14). Tey must have been very conscious when this book under discussion was published in 1949 that her greatest prominence had been around the time that Richard of Bordeaux had its success almost two decades earlier. In the event, the contentious opinions on the nature of historical truth expressed in her next book, The Daughter of Time, were to bring her new celebrity, but, of course, she could not have known that in advance (see the discussion of the reading of Tey's own concerns about her long term reputation in the text of Brat Farrar in Section I, p. 150)

The interest in the topic of cross-dressing, and account of the freedom allowed in personal terms by the acquisition of a male identity, is intriguing. The speculation seems invited that she, with such interest in questions of gender, had on occasion done the same thing for the same reasons. Textual evidence backing up this idea is her choosing of the

---

54) Literary sherry parties, even distinguished ones. Were not Grant's cup of tea. (p. 7)
The distinguished in achievement did not celebrate the birth of Maureen's Lover nor drink the sherry of Messrs. Ross and Cromarty. (p. 8)

name Searle for the character in question. Serle is the name Smollett used for the character who is himself in Humphry Clinker (Note 23, p. 399). Serle has fallen foul of a character named Paunceford, whose benefactor he has been in the past. Paunceford is identified as one Alexander Campbell, also a real person, "formerly one of the Council at Bengal". Given Tey's self-conscious use of clues from Scottish literature, and the dig at the Campbells that the choice of name implies, Lee Searle emerges as to some extent a self-portrait. In this context it is interesting to notice that this detective novel is the only one of Tey's in my hands to be prefaced by the statement that "This book is fiction, and all the characters and incidents in it are entirely imaginary". It is possible that there is a reason for this unexpected denial.

It is true, too, that further identification with Grant himself can be traced. Tey's earlier frustration and bitterness at her position in Inverness, which leaps so strongly from the pages of Miss Pym Disposes seems to have subsided at this time to a mood of melancholy reflection similar to the one depicted here. Certainly, like Grant, she was ambivalent about her Scottish identity, finding it disabling in London but seeing denial of it impossible in the long term. On the final page, Grant comes to the conclusion that "life was entirely constructed of compensations" (p. 204). It is likely that he is putting into words his creator's own outlook at the time of writing.

In The Daughter of Time, Tey has "changed her record" again. Here, she uses the convention of the detective novel known as "armchair detection", though Grant cannot occupy the comfortable position the term suggests. Falling through a trapdoor has put him on his back in hospital in what is to him "an intolerable situation" (p. 10). No action at all is possible on his part. The trapdoor works, too, to establish a connection with Scott's Kenilworth in which Amy Robsart suffers a similar accident, and which is invoked later in the text.

> He went back to considering Elizabeth's Robin. What mystery was there about Robin? [The Earl of Leicester]
>
> Oh, yes. Amy Robsart, of course.
>
> Well, he wasn't interested in Amy Robsart. He didn't care how she had fallen down stairs or why (p 23).

At the end of To Love and Be Wise, images representing his Scottish identity, mountains "inflamed, proper", present a challenge Grant, posing as an authoritative Englishman, cannot meet. Discussion of Scottish issues continues in this book, where he is

far from calm. Mary, Queen of Scots is the subject of attention when Marta, on the first of several visits to Grant's bedside, has her romantic vision of the character demolished. Mary, according to Grant, was "sexually cold" (p. 15), had "the outlook of a suburban housewife" (p. 16) and even lesbian tendencies. "She would have been a wild success as a mistress at a girl's school [...] the staff would have liked her, and all the little girls would have adored her" (p. 17). These books lead on from one to the other. Grant's Scottish cousin, Laura, so important in the next and final book, is introduced in this text. Their exchange of letters inspires Grant to forget his troubles for a little, as "the waters of the Turlie sounded in his ears and slid under his eyes, and he could smell the sweet, cold smell of a Highland moor in winter", (p. 98). Laura declares that "Nothing (repeat : nothing) would surprise me about history" (p. 118). She tells Grant the story of two women who are regarded as martyrs in the south-west for "not abjuring Presbytry", when both contemporary personal testimony and official documents record that they were convicted of treason according to the law and even then finally reprieved. The Covenanters, according to Grant, were "as blood thirsty a crowd as ever disgraced a Christian nation" (p. 130), making him the mouthpiece here of the convictions expressed so strongly in Claverhouse. In addition, the wickedness attaching to the name of Glencoe is alluded to and responsibility for it placed at the door of the covenanting Dalrymple who ordered it to take place (p. 131). In the context of such conflict in the Highlands Laura's nine year old son Patrick is mentioned briefly but significantly. Having learned at school with horror that the Scots sold Charles I to the English, he is conducting a one-man protest strike against all things Scottish (p. 99). This works as a reference to Patrick Grant of Crasky, one of the Seven Men of Glen Moriston who acted as bodyguards to Charles I (Charles Maclean, The Clan Almanac, p. 36). Like the writing of John Buchan, Tey's is erudite and full of allusions, and the allusions are not inserted for fun (see page 70 above).

The detective backed away from artificially produced representations of "inflamed" mountains, symbolic of being a Grant, in To Love and Be Wise, but in The Daughter of Time he is able to take them on board and use them as personal psychological support. Among the pile of despised texts at his bedside, he discovers one about mountains, illustrated, which is "a godsend" (p. 21) and is the only one he takes with him when he leaves hospital. This book does not deal specifically with Scottish mountains but seems to provide him with images of his ancestry which he does not find threatening but can accept

and assimilate. The final text is foreshadowed in which, suffering from a breakdown, in refuge at Laura's home in the Highlands, he is able at last to come to terms with his Scottish inheritance and all that it involves as part of his identity.

Issues of gender and sexuality are touched on lightly. The figure of Richard II is invoked, as it was in the previous text, and the idea conveyed that the root of Richard III's problems in a deeply divided country lies in the earlier deposition of the rightful monarch, Richard II. Grant meditates that "it seemed to him that the whole trouble was implicit, the germ of it sown, nearly a hundred years earlier, when the direct line was broken by the deposition of Richard II" (p. 43). Grant knows all about it because in his youth he had been to the play Richard of Bordeaux at the New Theatre, "four times he had seen it" (p. 43), in what strikes me, as a reader, as a touching display of loyalty to his creator[55]. Then, Grant looks tactlessly surprised when he discovers that Marta has been lunching with another woman, rather than a man (p. 23). Yet, he informs the enormous Nurse Darroll, whom he nicknames the Amazon and the Statue of Liberty, who is going to the pictures with another woman, "you can still hold hands" (p. 32). Even the issue of the possibility of same-sex marriage, still considered challenging at the end of the twentieth century, is mentioned. "He couldn't marry either of the boys you see. No, I suppose even Richard III never thought of that one" (p. 42). Certainly, Richard's own marriage is presented as one of convenience and companionship rather than passion (p. 55). The question arises as to whether Tey interpreted both Richard II and Richard III as having homosexual tendencies, accounting in part for her championing of these misrepresented figures, as well as that of Claverhouse. It is significant that Grant's recovery owes much to the emotional bond he establishes with the American researcher, Brent Carradine.

The topic most closely addressed by this text is, however, the creation of narrative. The expensive best-selling books the invalid Grant has been given are predictable narratives he cannot read. The fallibility of historians relying on supposed evidence which is, in police terms, mere backstairs gossip, is emphasised. The suspect narratives thus created are dubbed "Tonypandy" in a reference to an unruly crowd thought of as martyrs who in fact suffered little and were no such thing. History books, according to Carradine "are just riddled with

---

55) Making repeated visits to see the play was not uncommon. According to a memoir in *The Times* occasioned by Gielgud's death, Alec Guinness saw Richard of Bordeaux fifteen times (*Times2*, May 23rd 2000, p. 6).

it" (p. 184). That historians reacted defensively to the publication of this, a mere detective novel, is a measure of its commercial success and subsequent influence. The general remarks (unattributed) which precede Tey's entry in Twentieth Century Literary Criticism contain these comments.

> Historians, whose enterprise, methods, and general characters are acridly maligned throughout The Daughter of Time, have accused Tey of a personal vendetta. Guy M. Townsend, for example, contends that fictional history must be faithful to the large historical context and cannot take liberties with historical fact. In a direct rebuttal of the Townsend position, M.J. Smith argues that since all novels are creations of the writer, manipulation, omission and invention can be used at will. As Smith observes, the controversy surrounding the work illuminates Tey's thesis that historians have only second hand evidence at best, and that they tend to manipulate that evidence to substantiate their own conclusions (vol. 14, p. 447).

The idea of gossip that is essentially small-minded and destructive is underlined by the presence of small birds chattering constantly on the window-sill of Grant's room. "Don't these damned sparrows get you down?" Brent complains (p. 178).

The idea that a narrative is a pattern that is created and must be interpreted runs through the whole book. When we first see Grant, he is analysing the patterns on the ceiling in different ways. Part of his frustration is that his bed cannot be moved to allow him to explore new patterns. What historians should be doing, it is proposed, is looking for patterns and analysing any unexplained breaks in them. Further, "historians should be compelled to take a course in psychology before they are allowed to write" (p. 184). Tey's earlier portrayal of the inadequate Lucy Pym, terrified of its insights, testifies to these texts' concern with the findings of psychology. Here, the idea is stressed that a real, unconscious life exists which is truer than the surface narrative, which itself may be sterile and meaningless. Nurse Darroll finds that her mind works without her knowing about it, and she will remember something she needs to know when she is "counting the sterile dressings" (p. 103). Marta complains about the long-running play she is acting in, "thinking of something else all the time" (p. 20) and oblivious to the lines she is mouthing. There is an entertaining account of Marta's co-star Geoffrey's own thoughts about moving house while he is on stage acting on auto-pilot, and how he "dried up in the middle of the second act" (p. 20). He was "being an automaton. Saying the lines and doing the business and thinking of something else all the time".

Tey's own life at the time of writing, trapped, like Grant, in "an intolerable situation" is easily compared to Marta's long-running play, which is a nonsense one, entitled To Sea in a Bowl. Like the actors, she was likely to be thinking of something else the whole time: in her case it would presumably be the writing of her novels and plays and the issues raised in them. The surface narrative she was living in Inverness must have counted as "sterile" indeed. Like Marta, she had probably " got to the frightful stage when the lines have ceased to have any meaning at all" (p. 20). This book appeared around the time of the death of Tey's father, at the end of her own acting in what, this evidence suggests, seemed to her a nonsense play which refused to come to its end of its run.

As I discussed in Section II[56], Marta is trying to persuade a well-known playwright, Madeleine March, to write a play for her as part of her plans "for when this endless thing finally comes to an end" (p. 101). March eventually refuses, preferring to write "one of her awful little detective stories1". As an explanation of Tey's own approach to her writing at the time, this sounds obviously autobiographical and critics have interpreted it as such[57]. The further information is provided that writing one takes "six weeks or so". Tey, aware that her own time was running out, had to make choices and seems to have given priority to the completion of her series of detective novels while the inspiration for them was present. The writing of plays, which, even if they were eventually produced would probably reach a smaller audience, presumably took longer and was given lower priority. That playwriting promised fewer rewards is revealed by Grant's cogitations on the subject when he visits Marta in the theatre on a previous occasion.

> Perhaps they think I look like an author, he thought, and wondered who had written Faint Heart. No one ever did know who had written a play. Playwrights must lead blighted lives. Fifty to one, on an actuary's reckoning against their play running more than three weeks; and then no one even noticed their name on the programme.
>
> And something like a thousand to one against any play ever getting as far as rehearsals even. To Love and Be Wise, p. 184.

The Daughter of Time was published in the twelve months before Tey's untimely death after her long illness. The vivid description of hospital life in a single room, subject to the attentions and whims of nurses, doctors and visitors, is, according to Roy, based on

---

56) See p. 102.

57) Murder and Mayhem p. 5.
Talburt p. 46.

recent personal experience[58]. Making frequent trips to London as she did, she, like the fictional Grant, would have been likely to have had any necessary operation performed privately in a hospital there[59]. In the novel, Marta Hallard visits Grant regularly. According to Gielgud, Tey, who had few friends, was "devoted" to Gwen Ffrangçon Davies, who had played Mary, Queen of Scots (with Laurence Olivier as Bothwell) in Tey's play of that name. As she was a close friend, it is permissible to imagine elements of that real, distinguished person in the character of Marta in this novel. In this context, Grant and Marta's discussion of Mary and possible interpretations of her character becomes ironic. Later, Grant finds the idea of getting out of hospital to be "a glorious prospect" (p. 176) which is movingly portrayed. This surely reflects Tey's very natural emotion from her own experience at the time.

According to Roy, Tey's posing a contemporary detective with the problem of a historical crime is "unique in the use of the format" (p. 141). However, the idea of an experienced and familiar detective occupying time in hospital by examining a crime which took place years ago has recently been taken up again, this time by Colin Dexter. In The Wench is Dead (1989) his serial detective, Inspector Morse, investigates the murder of a woman which took place in the nineteenth century. Morse himself is similar to Grant in his lack of family and friends. After his sudden illness it is thanks to his housekeeper, who finds him in a state of collapse, that he is removed to hospital, and it is his subordinate, Detective Sergeant Lewis, who visits him. Aided by a young librarian, Morse is able to work out that no murder did in fact happen and that the woman in question had chosen to disappear so that insurance money on her life would be paid. Morse feels, like Grant, the satisfaction of having cleared the name of supposed villains, and the book closes similarly with his return to health. Symons condemns The Daughter of Time as "really rather dull", objecting to the lack of action on the part of the detective (p. 180). Interestingly, in the same book, he does not apply to Dexter's writing the rigorous strictures he does to Tey's. Instead, he concludes the mild qualification of his praise "that perhaps it is churlish to wish that motives and behaviour were a touch nearer reality" with the remark that "one wouldn't want the

---

58) Note that both in this novel and in The Singing Sands, which was published posthumously, Inspector Grant is seriously ill throughout most of the work. Tey herself was aware of her own fatal illness as these books were being written (p. 151).

59) According to her obituary "she spent a great deal of each year in the South" (*Inverness Courier*, February 15th 1952).

imaginative flights of his plotting to be brought down to earth by a mass of pedestrian detail" (p. 307).

In The Singing Sands, the creation of narrative is again accorded attention. Grant's method of solving mysteries has been established as that of shaping patterns in his mind and letting them resolve themselves rather than by pursuing active detection. This is embodied in Bridget, the silent three year old child on the hearth rug at Clune, who spends her days "re-arranging the same few objects into new patterns" (p. 29). Such absorption is regarded as a sign of intelligence. In this book, Tey makes her final arrangement of her own "objects", creating a narrative that returns to the issues that concern her writing.

The subject of class arises again in the shape of the presence of the aristocratic and beautiful, but impecunious, Lady Kentallen. With her easy and unaffected manner, she shatters Tad Cullen's idea of a stereotyped, imperious, upper-class woman. Yet, Grant meditates, she is in a difficult situation. London is "lousy with sleek men in shiny cars" who would be delighted to marry her and solve her financial problems. "The difficulty was, he supposed, that in Zoë Kentallen's world money was neither an introduction nor an absolution" (p. 104). She needs, in other words, to marry someone like Grant himself, with a similar aristocratic background as well as ample money. The character of Grant is presented at an ironic distance here as he fails to divine that his proposing marriage to Lady Kentallen is exactly what she has in mind. She and Laura have laid a trap for the detective that he would have fallen into but for his overwhelming desire to find out what happened to Bill Kendrick.

In this text, however, neither the issue of the status of narrative nor that of social class is as important as the linked problem areas of Scottishness, gender and sexuality, each with the potential to place the individual at a remove from the presumed norm. All are highly relevant to the detective. Grant has been in denial as far as his inconvenient inheritance is concerned since the end of The Man in the Queue. The nervous breakdown forecast by Jason Harmer in A Shilling for Candles fifteen years earlier, on which I touched at the beginning of this Section[60], has now come to pass and his psychological suffering is much greater than that induced by mere physical confinement in his hospital bed as it was in The Daughter of Time.

---

60) See p. 114.

It presents itself as a black, suffocating claustrophobia, at its worst in a railway sleeping compartment or a car. His recovery begins when he goes to stay with his cousin Laura in her family home where they spent childhood summers. She has now inherited the estate and lives there with her husband, Grant's old school friend, Tommy Rankin, and their two children. Grant is shown to begin his recovery there at what is for him, too, the ancestral home. Once again (as with Pym, Blair, Sharpe and Aunt Bee) the difficulties being faced by a single person with no children are being considered in the narrative. Laura's acceptance of his illness, putting it in perspective as the result of overwork, reassures him (p. 50). Her sharing of her family life assuages his loneliness. It is important that Laura is detached about her family and does not demand that Grant praise their progress and attainments[61]. A smug, exclusive family would have worked against his recovery, emphasising his personal isolation. As it is, with Laura and Tommy, Grant is shown to feel that "these two accepted him" (p. 22). He is in touch, too, with the next generation: "He watched Pat put his rod together and bend a fly on the line, and thought that if he could not have the felicity of possessing a son then a small red-headed cousin made a very good substitute" (pp. 33). As the two return over the moor to Clune that evening, they are like "homing horses" and "the world and London river seemed the width of stellar space away" (p. 38). The open country in itself acts as a background providing relief.

Back in Scotland, Grant takes on once again some of the Stevensonian characteristics he acquired in the first novel. As Laura comes out of her house, Clune, to welcome him, Grant remembers that "just so she used to be waiting on the little Badenoch platform for him when she was a child" (p. 26). Yet, Badenoch is not Grant country, but that of Clan Macpherson, and Cluny was the name of the clan chief's home near Newtonmore. Grant is making, figuratively, the visit of Alan Breck and David Balfour to the cave where Ewen Macpherson of Cluny hid for nine years after Culloden, evading government troops. Grant's journey to Scotland and Speyside to a house called Clune has Jacobite overtones. These are underlined by the presence of the Clune Burn, a tributary of the River Garry, on the battlefield of the fateful Killiecrankie, to which so much of Scottish literature returns,

---

61) It was quite typically Laura that she should not even have demanded from him a due admiration of her daughter; that he had not been asked to exclaim over her growth in the last year, her intelligence, her looks. Bridget had not been mentioned at all. She was merely a young creature somewhere out of sight, like the rest of the farm animals. (The Singing Sands p. 28.)

including this novel[62]. The name chosen for Lady Kentallen is a further reference to Stevenson, Ardshiel House in the Kentallen area being the traditional home of the Appin Stewarts, famously dragged into the affair of the murder of Colin Campbell, the Red Fox.

Many other implications of Scottishness are discussed. Pat, angry with his mother, declares that he is glad he is a Rankin rather than a Grant and does not have to wear their "horrible red tartan" (p. 46). The Rankins are a sept of the Macleans, one of the most prominent Jacobite clans, and were hereditary pipers to the chiefs. The Grants of Strathspey sided with the Hanoverians. Pat does not, however, wear the Maclean tartan, but that of "part of Tommy's mother's web", Macintyre. Interestingly, Macintyre is not her birth surname but "part of [her] web". The point is made that indigenous Scots are normally descended from so many different clans that they are "entitled" to claim the tartan they wish to wear, and the political implications it bears, almost at will. Clan Macintyre is included among the "native men" of the Stewarts of Appin and they were, in addition, admitted to Clan Chattan by the thirteenth Mackintosh chief (Scarlett, p. 107). The best known clansman is Duncan Ban Macintyre who wrote the Gaelic poem known in the Lowlands as "The Anathema of the Breeks", in protest at the law brought in after Culloden proscribing Highland dress. Its appearance led to his imprisonment. These allusions (like the one to Badenoch) confirm the text's involvement in that period of great suffering in the Highlands after the last Jacobite rebellion. It confirms too, its position in clear alignment with the oppressed clansmen, such as the Macphersons of Cluny, as government troops under the Duke of Cumberland took their revenge. The explanation of the choice of tartan for Patrick's kilt, supplied in almost offhand manner, resonates with meanings.

Just as important as clan history and Jacobite feeling in this last text is the vexed question of language use in Scotland. Pat's parents, who, like Grant, attended boarding school in England, speak standard English. Pat himself has picked up Scots at the village school where the shepherd's son from Killin is his best friend "his Jonathan" (p. 47). It is condemned outright as ugly to hear or to read. "Pat's phonetics are no pleasanter to the eye than they are on the ear" (p. 30), the narrator tells us directly. This Scots will of course

---

62) A glance at their history or literature (and especially if you count Byron as a Scot, which, after dinner at least, is permissible) reveals what lies underneath the slow accent, the respectability and the solid flesh. Under the cake lies Bonny Dundee. James Kennaway, Household Ghosts (Harlow, 1961), p. 174.
An example of a recent text where the dénouement takes place at Killiecrankie is Alice in Shadowtime, Iona McGregor (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992).

disappear when he, in his turn, is sent south to be educated. Grant hopes that Laura will not delay in making this move too long (p. 186). Glasgow speech, too, is introduced and regarded as "vile" (p. 35) and "repellent" (p. 40). At the time Tey wrote, it was not even considered to rank as Scots or included in the National Dictionary then being compiled[63]. More surprisingly, Gaelic itself is derided. One might have expected an Inverness-based writer like Tey, a supporter of the Jacobite cause, to be sympathetic to its use, especially given her endorsement of Macintyre's political verse. In spite of Grant's memory of its being used quite naturally in Strathspey in his youth (p. 90), its impracticality in the modern world is stressed. Laura, especially, despises it. In what seems now to jar in the presentation of this sympathetic character, Laura mocks Gaelic by making an imaginary news broadcast of five lines in the language that she claims has no word for anything less than two hundred years old. "Blah-blah bicycle blah-blah S-bend..." (p. 100). It seems that no irony is present here as Laura's point of view is aligned with that of the narrator. Such an attitude condemning the older languages of Scotland is very much of its time in the period following the Second World War, with the middle-class "consensus", operating outside literary circles, presuming to speak for the nation[64]. It fits in with Tey's own appropriation of an inclusive Englishness which might somehow solve the problem at the heart of Scottish nationhood and her refusal to align herself with any of the very active literary groupings of the time in Scotland, though she did correspond with a number of contemporary women writers[65]. She could not have foreseen the future of both Scots and Gaelic as languages deserving official support, and Gaelic in particular receiving substantial government subsidy to facilitate the kind of broadcasting Laura jeers at. That a novel written in demotic Glasgow parlance would win a major London-based literary prize as did James Kelman's How Late it Was, How Late in 1994 would have seemed an even wilder idea in 1952.

Fitting in with this attitude to language and to Scotland is the presentation of the unpleasant and posturing Archie Brown. He has a Glasgow accent and a history of writing in Scots, "the cleesh - clavers - clatter school" (p. 40). Having found that in Scots the

---

63) The way [of being Scottish] associated with Scottish nationalism in the inter-war period had a concern for linguistic and racial purity which emerges in the Scottish National Dictionary's by now notorious banning of Glasgow speech from its pages as a corrupt and urban dialect. (Whyte, p. xiv)

64) For discussion of this point, see Douglas Dunn's Introduction to his Faber Book of Twentieth Century Scottish Poetry (1992), entitled "Language and Liberty" (p. x).

65) See p. 188 below.

"competition was too keen" he has learned Gaelic and now writes in that. Archie is a Scottish patriot and purveyor of an unattractive nationalism which pins the blame for all the country's woes on a tyrannical Southern neighbour. Self-appointed to this role, he possesses no Scottish ancestry at all (p. 40). His Highland costume, unlike Patrick's carefully chosen kilt is "a pitiable fancy dress" and as a figure he is "a perversion of patriotism" (p. 35). At the end of the book it is revealed that he is engaged in criminal activity with the possible connivance of Cladda's Church of Scotland minister, Mr MacKay. That MacKay bears the name of Claverhouse's opponent at Killiecrankie is clear indication, in the terms of Tey's texts, that he is a villain[66]. The last word on Archie himself is that he is a "vain vicious little bastard [...] as long as he could strut in the light he did not care who paid for the illumination" (p. 97). Grant delivers the last verdict in Tey's work on nationalism itself when he declares that, in 1707, "Scotland stepped thankfully onto England's bandwagon, and fell heir to all the benefits. Colonies, Shakespeare, soap, solvency and so forth" (p. 117).

Yet, in original and appealing fashion, Grant is placed recovering his identity in a fictional ideal Scotland where such contradictory elements as the opposition of Highlands and Lowlands and the Gaelic and Scots speaking split are resolved. This becomes clear only gradually. The train he arrives on at a terminal seems so patently the London to Inverness sleeper that I initially took it for granted that the town of Scoone is Inverness and that the village of Moymore near which Clune is situated is in Strathspey, especially as Grantown-on-Spey is the traditional home of the Grants and Strathspey is mentioned by name. For example, Grant remembers "the old folk in Strathspey when he was a child" (p. 90). The Cairngorm Mountains are also invoked. Part of Grant's bond with Laura is that "together they had first walked the Larig and together had stood for the first time on the top of Braeriach" (p. 19). This togetherness is based firmly in Inverness-shire. Sandi Toksvig assumed Scoone to be Inverness when she explained why she was reading The Singing Sands on a train from London to Inverness, in a 1998 programme in the television series entitled "Great Railway Journeys of the World", which she was presenting. Yet a closer examination of Tey's text shows that Scoone is not a simple substitution for Inverness, but works as a more complicated geographical reference. The first evidence occurs when Grant and Tommy drive "away into the great clean Highland country" (p. 14) on the journey to Clune, and see

---

66) The Government troops were led by Hugh MacKay of Scourie.

that "...behind all stood the long rampart of the Highland line, white and remote against the calm sky" (p. 22). They are, therefore, south of the Highland line, which every schoolchild in Scotland draws with a ruler carefully slanted between Helensburgh and Stonehaven. Yet, when Grant is relaxing in his cousin's home, he is comforted by the thought that there is "not an enclosed space between this and the Pentland Firth. Between this and the North Pole, if it came to that" (p. 28). This inserts an oblique reference to the actual residence of the chief of Clan Grant at Old Cullen in Banffshire (which the name of Tad Cullen invokes also). This contradiction in geographical terms is explained (I almost wrote "solved") when the exact location of Moymore is supplied. Grant places an advertisement requesting information in the London papers.

> The beasts that talk, the streams that stand, the stones that walk, the singing sand... Anyone recognising please communicate with A. Grant c/o P.O., Moymore, Comrieshire (p. 74).

In using the name of Moymore, Tey is confirming her involvement as a real person in the character of Grant. The war-cry of Clan Mackintosh is "Loch Moy" (Scarlett, p. 112). This suggests that these books are Elizabeth Mackintosh's own "war-cry" on society, albeit announcing a deeply buried subversion rather than an obvious, straight-forward attack. This war-cry calls to mind, too, the well-known Rout of Moy, when Lady Anne Mackintosh, in the absence of her husband in 1745, raised the clan in support of Prince Charles and went on to scatter fifteen hundred government troops who were ambushing her home, with the aid of just six family retainers (Scarlett, p. 112). A powerful but disregarded Inverness woman is invoked. But even in the context of this interesting name awarded to the imaginary and attractive village, "Moymore had standards" (p. 120), the placing of it in the fictitious Comrieshire is more significant. Comrie, part of Strathearn rather than Strathspey, is in Perthshire. This means that Scoone, the county town, must be interpreted as Perth rather than Inverness. Perth was of course at one time the capital of Scotland, but a deeper meaning is implied. It was to a banquet at Scone that the Dalriadan King, Kenneth, son of Alpin and a Pictish princess, invited his rivals to the Pictish throne and liquidated them. After this, as Sir Iain Moncrieffe puts it in his introduction to Scarlett's book, "his claim was undoubtedly the best" (p. 10). So it was at Scone that the Kingdom of Picts and Scots came into being and the concept of Scotland as a country originated. I suggest, too, that in this context of Tey's

interwoven allusions to early history, that Laura's children, Patrick and Bridget, bear Irish names in acknowledgement of the origins of the kings of Dalriada in Ireland.

All this creates for Grant's homecoming a position in an ideal, unified Scotland where Highlands and Lowlands have ceased to exist as separate entities. Once again Moncrieffe can be quoted. He uses the same concept in his own historical snapshot, choosing the Perth and Angus area as intervening between the two in what he calls the Brae Country (p. 9), a location where their geographical and cultural characteristics meet. Like Tey, he treats language as of crucial importance. He illustrates his idea with the assertion that "it is clear that the earls of Strathmore at Glamis were Scots speaking, but also Gaelic speaking" (p. 9). This central location, created in such detail for Grant, is evidence that Tey anticipated Moncrieffe's concept that this area, the Brae Country, encapsulates an ideal and inclusive Scottishness that heals otherwise irreconcilable divisions. Both base their ideas on early Scottish history. Yet Tey contrives to place all this in the context of the area south of Inverness where the chiefs of Clan Grant traditionally had their seat and which, I argue, underpins her key character. The Cairngorm mountains are naturally a part of this. One of them, Braeriach, important as we have seen in the relationship between Grant and Laura, is invoked in Kinsley-Hewitt's report of his discovery of Wabar, headlined in the morning newspaper as "SHANGRI-LA REALLY EXISTS" (p. 187). The mountain range he climbed to reach this paradise has "no entrance apparent" and "walls like the Garbh Coire on Braeriach" (p. 188). This inclusive Scottishness with an Inverness-shire mountain as a central trope is Tey's final statement on this issue which lies at the heart of her work. Yet she holds to her original thesis that a mixed racial inheritance is a great benefit, and that, in its absence, the Scot must have experience outside Scotland as an antidote to a narrow outlook. Pat has sent Grant a fishing fly as a gift, along with a letter recommending its use, but doubting its efficiency in "those English rivers".

> The typical Scots insularity in "those English rivers" made him hope that Laura would not wait too long before sending Pat away to his English school. The quality of Scotchness was a highly concentrated essence, and should always be diluted. As an ingredient it was admirable; neat, it was as abominable as ammonia (p. 186).

It is this solving of the problem of the element of "Scotchness" in his make-up that brings Grant release. In the last few lines of the novel, the idea that this turbulent Scottishness

stands in opposition to a calm Englishness is reiterated. Grant's superior, Bryce, greets him with the suggestion that "he might go down to Hampshire in answer to an appeal from the Hampshire police which had just come in" (p. 201). It is Grant's original decision to "go down to Hampshire" and subsequent indefinite deferral of returning to the Highlands to face the problem of his Scottishness that proves, as these texts unfold, almost fatal, as he crumbles and becomes weaker, and approaches suicide physically and emotionally. The case he dealt with in Hampshire did indeed "end in suicide". Now, the reader suspects, he can go to Hampshire with impunity. The "case" that is Grant and was foreshadowed in the previous novel as ending in suicide, is solved (this Section p. 156).

His Scottishness is not, of course, Grant's only problem. Questions of gender and sexuality arise naturally and once again an inclusive kind of reconciliation is offered. Laura is a fulfilled wife and mother, the first to appear in these detective novels. Her domestic setting in the sitting-room at Clune is "pure Zoffany" (p. 29) with its children, dog and laden tea-table in the sunlight. Grant has a keen sense of his vulnerability to exclusion from this or any other nuclear family. "He had a moment of stinging impatience with her. She was far too complacent. She was far too happy, here in her fastness..." (p. 39). But he knows in his heart that Laura is too intelligent and analytical in her relationships to be smug about her family. He notices, too, that Heron Lloyd's entry in Who's Who makes no mention of a wife or children, thinking wryly that these are "possessions that the owners of both are habitually proud to mention" (p. 156). In this text, Grant's single state and his lack of a family of his own to support him in his difficulties are very much on his mind. He even considers marrying the beautiful but bland Lady Kentallen who, along with Laura, is laying a trap in traditional fashion for this single man in possession of a good fortune. His attention is drawn away from this idea by the haunting image of the dead man he had seen and attended to on the train. His obsessive desire to unravel the mystery surrounding Kendrick is the driving force that solves his own psychological problems. Kendrick himself had been sharing a house with his friend Tad Cullen, whose sorrow at the death is much more intensely personal than that normally accorded a deceased colleague. "No female is going back East with me. I'm not having any little-woman-round-the-house cluttering up our bung- I mean -. His voice died away" (p. 185). A "little-woman-round-the-house" is not what Grant wants either, even if that woman could be the beautiful Lady Kentallen.

It is the physical appearance of the young man which attracts Grant's attention. "Nature itself would turn cartwheels for the young man with the reckless eyebrows" (p. 16). As Tommy drives him to Clune, Grant is almost overcome by an anxiety attack. It is his pondering of the possible reasons for Kendrick taking the journey north and visualisation of him in romantic situations such as the bridge of a ship, "hellish in any kind of a sea" (p. 25), that rescues the detective from humiliating collapse. "The dead young man, who could not save himself, had saved him" (p. 25). His fascination with the young man is what takes him to the island of Cladda in search of the singing sands. There, at the brink of the Atlantic, the recovery begun with his cousin's family at Clune comes to fruition. Turning from the ocean back to the land, he has regained his sense of proportion and his self-control. After several days of fresh air and exercise, including country dancing, he is recovered sufficiently to fly rather than sail back across the Minch. "He had gone out to look for B Seven and had found himself" (p. 99). This idea that the bond between Grant and Kendrick has restored the detective to health, is repeated often. On the aeroplane returning to London "Bill Kendrick stood beside him all the way" (p. 144). When it is confirmed that Kendrick, as a pilot, was different from his colleagues and had a poetic soul, we are told "and for that Grant loved him" (p. 135).

In Grant's final appearance back at Scotland Yard, his new-found radiance is emphasised. "You look like a bridegroom" is Sergeant William's remark. His joy emanates from the knowledge that "He had paid back the debt he owed that dead boy in B Seven" (p. 201). It is Alan Grant who has made sure that Bill Kendrick's name will go down in history as the discoverer of Wabar. It is with surprise he recalls his earlier thoughts. "He was going to resign, and be a sheep farmer or something, and get married. What an extraordinary idea. What a most extraordinary idea" (p. 202).

In <u>To Love and Be Wise</u>, I argue, Tey comes as close as was possible at the time to depicting a happy lesbian relationship. Here, in what she knew would be her last comment on the subject, she shows that conventional marriage offers no solution to her detective's problems. Grant's salvation has been achieved, and his health and happiness restored, by his building of an erotic relationship with another man, albeit one not in a position to return his interest. This is surely as close to a sympathetic depiction of a central character who happens to be homosexual as could be achieved in 1952. It was not until 1957, after the publication

of the Wolfenden Report, that homosexual acts between consenting males over the age of twenty-one were decriminalised. Tey's final employment of the genre of the detective novel is in this way the boldest. It completes the story of Alan Grant, the renegade and lonely Highland Scot, who has to come to terms with his sexuality as well as the politics involved in his background. This text, where his problems are solved, is surely implied at the beginning of his career in The Man in the Queue, when his difficulties with his Scottishness and sexuality begin and he attempts to ignore them, return to Hampshire, and be "calm". Sexual liberation, as well as Scottishness, is a major theme of these novels from the start. The discovery of the lost, fabled city of Wabar in this last product of her imagination can be seen as standing for the suggestion of the possibility of the re-discovery of a lost realm where rigid categories, boundaries and prohibitions governing issues of gender and sexuality do not exist. It can also be thought of as the "wild zone" of feminist theory[67].

I discuss the relationship of The Singing Sands to later writing by Scottish women and in particular to its use of Elizabeth Barrett Browning's Aurora Leigh, in Section IV at p. 219. Here, I look at its relevance to the text of Tey's own life. She wrote the book in the knowledge of impending death, and much of the material in it reflects this. It has to be seen, too, as her final statement in this genre. The silent child on the hearth rug, Bridget, endlessly re-arranging the same few objects, can be interpreted as a picture of Tey herself, who re-examined the issues she found of interest in different ways in succeeding texts, while refusing to make public statements about her ideas. Bridget's mother, Laura, is a key character and much more than just a "plump pillow" who "momentarily comforts her cousin", as Roy puts it (p. 84). Laura stands, too, as a comment on the position of the writer in a domestic situation in Inverness, and the character works as a suggestion of some sort of solution to the questions raised by these texts. In this way, she succeeds the figure of Aunt Bee, the successful replacement mother seen in Brat Farrar. As I mentioned in my initial discussion of the significance of Alan Grant's name in Section I, the chief of Clan Grant at the time Tey was writing was the Countess of Seafield, who had inherited both the title and the family seat in her own right in a way not possible in England (see p. 46 above). Laura, who has always had her home at Clune, is clearly based on this real person, a matriarchal figure, routinely

---

67) Two essays by Edwin Ardener, "Belief and the Problem of Women" (1972) and "The Problem Revisited" (1975), suggest that women constitute a muted group, the boundaries of whose culture and reality overlap, but are not wholly contained by, the dominant (male) group.

compared to the Queen, of whom all Inverness-shire was proud. In comparison, her husband, Tommy, is a mere cipher, seen eating greedily and making plans for indulgences such as a private golf course on the estate. Unreliable, he forgets to post his wife's letters for her and conceals the fact[68]. He is a necessary but unimportant adjunct to an establishment and family which are very much hers. As a Rankin, a hereditary piper, he is "piping" to Laura's tune. That the real life family is being alluded to is confirmed by the introduction of the character named Tad Cullen. Although the traditional seat of the chief of the Grant clan is at Castle Grant on Speyside, the Countess of Seafield resided at Cullen House in Banffshire. As is usual in Tey's work, this text is scattered with clues to its real concerns, which necessarily include a close look at the position of women in society. Marriage, apparently, can be advantageous for a woman in a position of unquestioned authority and wealth in her own right, who can maintain that position in her domestic environment[69].

An issue explicitly raised here is the poignancy of having no children of one's own. Grant is conscious of being an outsider in a family consisting of parents and children, although it is vital to his recovery that they receive him warmly. Suffering badly from claustrophobia on his train journey north, he meets the morning feeling drained.

> "I suppose this is how women feel after long labour", he thought.... "But at least they have a brat to show for it. What have I got?" His pride, he supposed. His pride that he had not opened a door that there was no reason to open. Oh God! (pp. 11/12).

This reads very much as the statement of a woman who had no wish to marry, has retained her pride but bitterly regrets not having "a brat to show for it". In Tey's lifetime, a woman who rejected marriage was denying herself the opportunity to bear and bring up children.

---

68) 'Damn' said Tommy. 'I forgot to post her letters. Don't mention it unless she asks' (p. 26).

69) The character of Laura Grant is perhaps a pointer, too, to the implication of Elizabeth Grant of Rothiemurchus here. A member of this same family leading Clan Grant, she lived from 1797 to 1885 and was of course the writer of Memoirs of a Highland Lady, published posthumously by John Murray in 1898. Written first for the benefit of her own grandchildren, it stands in the tradition of ground-breaking biography and autobiography so marked in Scottish literature. A woman of great energy and efficiency, she managed her husband's estate before and after his death. Like Tey, Elizabeth Grant is fascinated by the rich history of the area surrounding Inverness and weaves it into her narrative. Like Tey, she considers childhood experience there to have left an indelible mark on members of her family, who find it necessary to return to their early home in later life. Tey is pointing, as is her wont, to the tradition in which her own work stands, in this case that of an Inverness-shire woman writing in English, and telling her own remarkable story in a genre which is deceptively unassuming.
Another writer, Anne Grant of Laggan (1755-1838), may also be invoked. She produced Letters from the Mountains in 1806.

This passage is a reminder, too, that during the last months of Tey's life when she was writing this book (hastily, according to Roy), she was fatally ill. Shortly before her death, she made the long journey from Inverness to London and it is probable that she spent many sleepless, painful nights alone and faced the mornings with a distaste similar to that of Grant. His recognition that, even in these circumstances, life is a privilege, and his wish "that it were possible to die temporarily" (p. 13) suggests Tey's own feeling at the time. There are many other reflections on mortality. Grant feels compassion for the man who has died. "Not for him the clean morning, the kind earth, the loveliness of the Highland line against the sky" (p. 24). Life, even in Inverness, it seems, on this evidence, had had the "compensations", drawn attention to at the close of To Love and Be Wise. The quality of detachment, even in close relationships, is recommended in this text. Grant shows a "fundamental detachment" even in his attitude to his own suffering (p. 11). Similarly, Laura's attitude to her children is one of "glinting detachment that shot the texture of her maternalism" (p. 31). The inference to be drawn is that Tey herself, in the last years of her life, had employed a similar detachment and concentration on "compensations" which enabled her to distance herself from her own experience and use it in the writing of these last three detective novels. Grant is confirmed in these pages as an idealised version of Tey herself. His Scottish background is a problem he must come to terms with or die. He is yet male, rich, well-connected and professionally successful. Sought after in London society, he is neither impressed nor seduced by it. Confirmation of the close connection between the writer and her detective is contained in the symbol central in this text. It is that of the legend of Narcissus, who fell in love with his own reflection[70]. Later Grant, fishing, sees the image of a face in the water, which distracts him (p. 59). It turns out to be that of Bill Kendrick, whose image is haunting him, rather than his own. This trope is extended until, finally, Tad Cullen is employed cleaning windows in a bid to gain access to Heron Lloyd's engagement diary. This unnecessary and unmemorable diversion in the narrative allows Cullen to report that "All you see from outside a window, believe it or not, is your own reflection in the glass" (p. 178). This I take to be Tey's statement that "all you can see" in these texts and in Grant himself is her "own reflection in the glass". It was necessary for Tey to write this last book. It is not

---

70) The doctor Grant consults is "crossing one elegant Wimpole Street leg over the other and admiring the hang of it" (p. 11). (Wimpole Street, rather than Harley Street is used. The achievement of Elizabeth Barrett Browning is perhaps invoked.) Grant's horror of confinement and resulting claustrophobic illness can be seen as a reflection of Elizabeth Barrett's imprisonment there.

just another repetitive detective novel, churned out as if by a writer on automatic pilot. It "changes the record" once again, and completes the story of Grant and that of Elizabeth Mackintosh herself. Her careful placing of her work in the Scottish tradition by her use of its literary landmarks makes it very much a new and original way of telling her own story, the "Memoirs of a Highland Lady", or, perhaps, the "confessions" of a supposed sinner who has been punished by society but felt her position and the choices she made to be wholly justified.

# SECTION IV

## TEY'S PLACE AS A SCOTTISH WOMAN WRITER

### 1. Introduction

In this Section, I look at connections that can be made between Tey's work and that of other Scottish women writing in the twentieth century. I find the novels of her immediate predecessor, Catherine Carswell, relevant to Tey's career. Those of Tey's contemporary, Willa Muir, display affinities in their scrutiny of life in an inward-looking small town. Writing more recently, Muriel Spark and Emma Tennant indicate directly that some of their works, which I discuss here, stand in the tradition of the Scottish novel. All four writers deal with the dark shadow cast by Calvinism on the lives of women. The texts I examine here are steeped in references to Scottish history and literature. All seem to place themselves as standing in relation to James Hogg's Confessions, that landmark novel of 1824.

In their well-known text The Madwoman in the Attic, Sandra M. Gilbert and Susan Gubar explore the work of women writers, mainly based in England, and in the nineteenth century. Their findings shed light on the novels of the Scottish women writers. For the English women, a central and forbidding figure is the seventeenth century poet, John Milton, with the focus falling on his production of the famously misogynist work "Paradise Lost". For Virginia Woolf, this spectre took on an aspect she named "Milton's bogey"[1)]. As Gilbert and Gubar put it "for her, as for most other woman writers, both he and the creatures of his imagination constitute the misogynist essence of what Gertrude Stein called 'patriarchal poetry'" (p. 188). What they introduce as a "minimal list" of figures who have directly or indirectly expressed similar anxiety comprises, in their words, "Margaret Cavendish, Anne Finch, Mary Shelley, Charlotte and Emily Brontë, Emily Dickinson, Elizabeth Barrett Browning, George Eliot, Christina Rossetti, H.D. and Sylvia Plath, as well as Stein, Nin and Woolf herself" (pp. 188/9). Discussing in some detail Shelley's Frankenstein, Charlotte Brontë's Shirley and Emily Brontë's

---

1) If we look past Milton's bogey, for no human being should shut out the view [...] the dead poet who was Shakespeare's sister will put on the body which she has so often laid down. (A Room of One's Own, Flamingo Modern Classics, 1994, p. 123. First published by the Hogarth Press, 1929).

Wuthering Heights, they demonstrate that these writers can be shown to have rewritten the myth of creation told in "Paradise Lost", often using tropes of female consciousness such as illness, paralysis, claustrophobic atmosphere and frozen landscapes, contrasted with images of flight and freedom. They find that these texts engage with the latent as well as manifest hostility to women in the content of Milton's work and with its wider implications.

My analyses of Tey's detective novels find them to use motifs that Gilbert and Gubar point to as important, those of entrapment and limitation, as Grant and her other detectives, each one in his or her own way imprisoned, struggle with the mysteries they are involved in, and equally importantly, with their own destinies. The use of classic texts of Scottish literature is, too, common to the other writers I have mentioned, rooted as their work is in the powerful tradition of the Scottish novel. I find, applying the theories of Gilbert and Gubar to their work, that once again a single text emerges as a "bogey" with which the novels engage and struggle. Showalter wisely concludes that such a "bogey", vigorously contended with as part of a woman's tradition, may paradoxically emerge as a source of strength rather than weakness.

> Too often women's place in literary tradition is translated into the crude topography of hole and bulge, with Milton, Byron, or Emerson the bulging bogeys on one side and women's literature from Aphra Behn to Adrienne Rich a pocked moon surface of revisionary lacunae on the other. One of the great advantages of the women's-culture model is that it shows how the female tradition can be a positive source of strength and solidarity as well as a negative source of powerlessness; it can generate its own experiences and symbols which are not simply the obverse of the male tradition.
>
> Feminist Criticism in the Wilderness, in *Critical Enquiry*, Winter 1981 p. 204.

Similarly, in the women's texts I study here, James Hogg's Confessions is constantly drawn attention to and its myth of division and destruction energetically rewritten. That book, of course, is a devastating analysis of the Calvinism underpinning post-Reformation Scottish society and the self-delusion, hypocrisy and greed emanating from it. Like "Paradise Lost" for women writers based in England, the implications of Hogg's text, arguably the most powerfully and

essentially Scottish of all novels[2)], seem especially devastating for the women of its country. The central vision is of a deeply misogynist, struggling figure who regards women as fearsome objects to be shunned if not actually murdered.

> In particular, I brought myself to despise, if not abhor, the beauty of women, looking on it as the greatest snare to which mankind are subjected, and though young men and maidens, and even old women (my mother among the rest), taxed me with being an unnatural wretch, I gloried in my acquisition; and to this day, am thankful for having escaped the most dangerous of all snares. (p. 113)

Gilbert and Gubar found English women writers self-consciously grappling with the misogyny of Milton's work. Similarly, I find that Scottish women novelists engage with Hogg's text, a "bogey" looming up in their own tradition, with latent as well as manifest content that must be taken into account. As they use it, it becomes, as Showalter predicts, a source of strength and solidarity, rather than weakness. Women's own experience and symbols are applied to the text and transform it.

Many of these Scottish women writers make direct reference to the work of Hogg, in the manner of Carswell and Tey. They do not, in general, make use of the genre of the detective novel, though Iona McGregor is the exception who does. It is hard, however, to find a single Scottish woman writer from the first half of the twentieth century whose work does not point to a link between the evils of Calvinism and the especially difficult struggle of Scottish women to find a means of self- expression. Even very recently produced work often returns to this key issue. Maggie O'Farrell's acclaimed first novel <u>After You'd Gone</u> (2000) is an example[3)]. It is impossible to examine all this writing in detail here, but, looking at some of the most obvious examples which draw on Hogg's vision, I find that Tey's writing, considered as part of their tradition, fits into a varied, but integrated, pattern.

Hogg's text was not well received on first publication, because, Marshall Walker suggests, his literary reputation at the time was problematic (p. 144). Contemporary reviewers judged the work "uncouth and unpleasant", "extraordinary

---

2) André Gide quotes his friend and translator Dorothy Bussy's telling him: 'This book is Scottish to its very marrow; no Englishman could possibly have written it. (Walker p. 147).

3) On a radio programme, she claimed that <u>Confessions</u> was the basis of her novel.

trash" and lacking "one single attribute of a good and useful book" (p. 256). Thought to be inspired by Christopher Marlowes's Dr. Faustus, it fell into obscurity outside Scotland until it was discovered and relaunched by André Gide in 1947. Since then its reputation has grown in every decade[4], and, according to Cairns Craig, it has a "continuing centrality to late twentieth century Scottish fiction" (p. 39). But its history before 1947 shows that it clearly was not an icon to be feared and contested with in the first half of the twentieth century. In contrast, Milton's Paradise Lost was just such an icon for women in England. It is true, too, that Milton's work is thought of as shoring up patriarchy. Hogg's text, rather, is as subversive as those of his women revisionists. Wringhim himself may despise women but he is far from an admirable character and his world is one of inverted values. Arabella Logan, Arabella Calvert and Bessy Gillies are all characters in whom decency is found. Hogg himself is ironising Calvinism, questioning the social control practised by the established church. Its very subversivenss is part of its appeal for Scottish women writers.

Even for those who have never read Hogg or Stevenson, the idea of a self divided in two and unable to shake off its evil half was well established as a trope of Scottish literature in the first half of the twentieth century. Michael Foucault's essay "What is an author?" (1969) explains how such a phenomenon comes about in terms of what he calls author function. Figures such as Freud and Marx, he tells us, in writing their seminal texts "have established an endless possibility of discourse" (Lodge, 1988, p. 206). Thus they have become part of the modern world's common culture, subject to constant revision.

For this reason it is not necessary to produce solid evidence that Tey, Carswell and Muir had themselves read Hogg's Confessions. Yet it seems probable that all three did. All give evidence in their writing of deep interest in Scottish history and literature. Tey's texts evince an awareness of less well-known Scottish writing, such as that of Sir Thomas Urquhart and Lewis and Thomas Innes. Her play Valerius is a rewriting of J,G. Lockhart's novel of that name, published in 1821. The reference she makes to an unpublished seventeenth century novel by

---

4) For an account of some of the praise it has attracted, see Marshall Walker, p. 145.

Sir George MacKenzie is esoteric indeed (See footnote 13 on p. 97). Carswell and Muir were, with their husbands, deeply involved in the reassessment of the Scottish literary tradition that took place in the years following the First World War. Catherine and Donald Carswell embarking together, with an element of collaboration and under the same roof, on exhaustive and definitive biographies of the respective towering figures of Robert Burns and Sir Walter Scott were world-class experts on the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century literary landscapes. In this context the texts of Hogg are likely to have been familiar to them. Indeed according to her son, John, writing in 1994, "Catherine treasured the Scottish poets and novelists such as Galt, Hogg,....." ('Remembering Catherine Carswell' in Opening the Doors: The Achievement of Catherine Carswell (p. 28).

## 2. Where Tey's writing fits into the continuing tradition

In my discussion of The Man in the Queue, questions raised about Tey's work by otherwise admiring critics find answers when its multiplicity of intertextual references is taken into account. Her further seven detective novels respond to similar analysis. Supposed flaws, such as the agonising internal struggles of the detectives, emerge rather as literary strengths when the Scottish and Highland provenance of these deeply allusive texts is taken into account. The popular genre provides an ideal ironic framework for the conveying of subversive ideas about the ways society is structured. The relationship of her writing to that of other novelists of the time falls into place when the concepts examined by Gifford and MacMillan in the 'Introduction' to their analysis of women's writing are considered. It relates crucially to that of male novelists. Harvie's appreciation of John Buchan's vital contribution applies to Tey's work in every particular. Her texts build on the tradition created by women such as Ferrier and Oliphant. Consideration of the work of Buchan's contemporary, Carswell, brings the strengths of Tey's work into even sharper focus. Parallels are drawn with the novels of Willa Muir. All these women writers' texts share concerns with those of Spark and Tennant produced in the second half of the twentieth century. All emphasise the dependence of their works on the religious struggles that are part of the history of Scotland. One after

another, characters emerge as divided unhappily in terms of their identities and allegiances. Alan Grant (along with Pym, Blair and Farrar) competes in these texts with Joanna Bannerman, Ellen Carstairs, Elizabeth Shand, Annie Ritchie, Jean Brodie, Dougal Douglas and Jane Wild among many others. Carswell's writing underpins this twentieth century progression and I consider it carefully in the next part of the Section. Tey's production of a hard-hitting biography of a character such as Claverhouse whose story is crucial to the formation of Scottish identity demonstrates her to be following in the footsteps of this older contemporary, who had shortly before reinterpreted the figure of Robert Burns to be greeted by a storm of controversy. As well as the texts, the lives of these two writers, Carswell and Tey, exhibit striking correspondences.

### 3. Parallels between the lives of Tey and Catherine Carswell

Both Carswell and Tey were born in Scotland in the Victorian era and both were adventurous in their personal lives as well as in their writing. Both rejected the conventional, passive, domestic existence middle-class women especially were expected to enjoy in their day, and ventured into the public arena. In the process, both were to tangle with the law at a young age and face court cases, highly unusual experiences for any women of their time. Tey was sued on the grounds that she had plagiarised the writing of the author of an earlier biography of Richard II. Gielgud tells us that her publisher settled out of court (p ix) which suggests that a degree of culpability did indeed exist. Carswell made legal history in 1908 by securing the annulment of her first marriage on the grounds of her husband's insanity at the time the ceremony took place. Both had their attitudes to society changed by these traumatic experiences. Tey withdrew for years from the world of London theatre. Carswell, according to her son, changed from being a "Glasgow girl who seemed to have all before her" and instead "came to shrink from the world of success and security and the compromises that living in it demanded" (Introduction to The Savage Pilgrimage p. viii). Both, too, refused to conform to the expectations of society in their personal lives. Tey did not make a conventional marriage and give up her independence. Carswell embarked, too, on a long love affair, deeply committed to a married man seventeen years older than herself. It is difficult now

to appreciate just how courageous these actions were for Edwardian women with ultra-conventional Scottish backgrounds such as theirs.

Despite these two women having much in common in their lives, their writing careers do not now, superficially, invite comparison and their backgrounds within Scotland appear very different. Tey's home was of course remote from the cities of the central belt while Carswell grew up in comparatively luxurious circumstances in the heart of the country's largest industrial conurbation then at the zenith of its financial and cultural prosperity. Yet both received a solid, traditionally Scottish, school education and were subject to an equally traditional Presbyterian upbringing. Both later rejected institutional religion in their lives and deplored its influence in their books, while, I argue, using to the full the richness of the biblical and theological knowledge they had acquired[5]. Both revelled in physical activity. Carswell gives evidence of her pleasure at being able to rely on the services of an agile body and attempt daring physical feats even as she approached old age (Lying Awake p. 4)[6]. Both were highly gifted academically and in time Carswell excelled in classes in English at Glasgow University, but both initially made the unusual decision to pursue professional vocational training outside Scotland, Carswell studying music at the Schumann conservatorium in Frankfurt-am-Main. Both had to abandon these first careers and were returned from new lives they had begun in England to their family homes in unhappy circumstances before they had reached the age of thirty. Trapped thus, they both embarked on careers entailing involvement in the world of the theatre, still, in their time, regarded in respectable circles in Scotland with suspicion and disapproval as beyond the pale[7]. Carswell became a critic of drama as well as fiction at the *Glasgow Herald*. Both used their experience of the world of acting in their novels,

---

5) Explaining Tey's use of biblical stories in her plays, McDonald tells us: "Gordon Daviot was a diligent and enlightened student of the Bible and Biblical history- and although a rare church-goer, could expound and explain the gospel far more intimately than many who wag their heads in pulpits" (p.118).

6) In addition John Carswell tells us that she loved riding, was an enthusiastic skier, and "swam and dived all day if she could" (Opening the Doors, p. 22). As he was born in 1918 when she was thirty-nine years of age, she must have continued those activities well into middle age.

7) The Camomile shows a religious gathering being addressed by a "reformed actress" (p. 91) just as in later days a reformed alcoholic might be produced to perform a similar function.

and both saw escape from their smothering family backgrounds as essential to their development despite being conscious of the loss of personal identity such a move entailed. Both identified London as the place where they would be free to develop their individuality and put their gifts to use though knowing they would forever feel in exile there. Tey is recorded as being conscious that, when conversing in London, "she had to 'translate mentally' in order to be completely lucid [...] and she gave it as her opinion that hers was a difficulty common to all Scots" (MacDonald, p. 120). Carswell moved to London on the death of her mother in 1911 and established herself in Hampstead, still reviewing novels for *The Glasgow Herald*.

Each, in her turn, enjoyed early success as a writer but found this second career to falter. Carswell lost her post at the newspaper in 1915 for daring to smuggle into it a review of D.H. Lawrence's banned novel, The Rainbow. Both embarked ambitiously on careers as writers of fiction, producing long first novels delineating the struggles of a young central character suffering from oppression by the social forces around them. Carswell's Open the Door! (1920) enjoyed much greater public success than Kif, but her second work The Camomile (1922) was less well received. That both these writers, like their compatriots Willa Muir and Nan Shepherd, reached an impasse and found it necessary to change direction after producing two or three novels seems evidence of the position of extreme marginality occupied by the Scottish woman writer in the first half of this century. Tey's utilisation of the genre of the detective novel as her career as a major playwright waned is mirrored by Carswell's later concentration on literary journalism and biography[8]. Both, working on, found themselves, as women, hampered in their careers by the domestic duties that running a household imposes yet were, too, in

---

8) Bibliography of Catherine Carswell: Open the Door!, Melrose, London, 1920; The Camomile: An Invention, 1922; The Life of Robert Burns, 1930; The Savage Pilgrimage: A Narrative of D.H. Lawrence, 1932 (all Chatto & Windus, London); A National Gallery: Being a Collection of English Character (with Daniel George Bunting), Martin Secker, London, 1933; The English in Love: A Museum of Illustrative Verse and Prose Pieces from the 14th to the 20th Century, (with Daniel George Bunting), Martin Secker, London, 1934; The Fays of the Abbey Theatre: an Autobiographical Record (with William Fay), Rich & Cowan, London, 1935; The Scots Week-end and Caledonian Vade-mecum for Host, Guest and Wayfarer, (ed. with Donald Carswell), Routledge, London, 1936; The Tranquil Heart: Portrait of Giovanni Boccacio, Lawrence & Wishart, London, 1937; Lying Awake: An Unfinished Autobiography and Other Posthumous Papers, (ed. John Carswell), Secker & Warburg, London, 1950. (By Fiona Black and Kirsten Stirling in Gifford and McMillan page 694.)

the position of providing their own source of income. Carswell's second husband, Donald Carswell, is described sympathetically by their son as "a gentle, scholarly, quite unpractical man" in his Introduction to Open the Door!, but his writing "earned respect, but little money" (p. xiii). Many commentators, including John Carswell, represent this marriage as happy[9]. The artist Emilio Coia, who died in 1997, judged Donald, and that relationship, more harshly. The Carswells and Muirs both welcomed Coia to London as an exile from Glasgow's Art School in about 1930 and he and Catherine were close friends for years. He expressed the opinion strongly that Donald was "absolutely useless" and that "he was never to be met at any time of the day or night without a stiff drink in him". Catherine, according to Coia, longed to be rid of her husband[10]. Whether or not Coia's judgement is correct, it is very clear that, as with Tey and her relations, Carswell received no personal or financial support of any substance for her writing from her family circle. In these circumstances, Carswell produced two further biographies after her life of Robert Burns. The first was written in defence of the reputation of her close friend and literary confidant D.H. Lawrence soon after his death and was named The Savage Pilgrimage. The second was a life of Boccaccio, The Tranquil Heart, undertaken, according to her son, "because Boccaccio was the first author to write avowedly for women" (ibid., p. xv). The life of Calvin which she undertook was incomplete at her death.

Both Tey and Carswell, in their difficult personal circumstances, shunned what John Carswell calls "the routine of social life" (ibid., p. xvi) though both valued friendships they considered important. These were often with women with creative gifts similar to their own. Tey may have lived very privately in Inverness but she was close to Mollie Macewan and formed friendships with Gielgud and the actress Gwen Ffrancon Davis. She is recorded as having corresponded with her contemporary Agnes Dunlop, who, based in Ayr, wrote in the name of Elizabeth Kyle (MacDonald p. 118). Dunlop was a schoolfriend of Carswell (Opening the

---

9) It was a happy marriage, both of talent and temperament, even though the talent and temperament brought by each partner were so different. (Introduction to Lying Awake p. xiii.) Her second marriage, to the journalist and writer Donald Carswell, was a successful partnership both professionally and personally. Glenda Norquay in Gifford and MacMillan (p. 389).

10) Emilio Coia, private communication.

Doors, p. 2), so a personal connection is established here. Carswell retained the friendships of Glasgow women she had known in her schooldays and youth such as Isobel Hutton and Maud McVail, both distinguished doctors, and the sculptor Phyllis Clay, and added to them better known names such as Vita Sackville West. She exchanged many letters with the writer F. Marian McNeill, the contents of some of which are appended to her autobiography. Both Tey and Carswell, finding their time encroached upon, created their own space for writing at a remove from their domestic establishments. Tey retreated to a wooden summerhouse in the garden of her home, Crown Cottage[11]. Carswell found it necessary to rent a room, the location of which she did not divulge, where she could not be reached even by those she recognised as having claims on her[12]. Both, in their similar positions, contrived to tell the stories of their own unhappy lives, indirectly, through their fiction. Both show awareness that in doing this, as women, they were transgressing. As Margaret Elphinstone puts it in a forthcoming paper, for the woman writer "to write a female self both asserts a hidden subjectivity that is not fully reflected in the ideology of the world she inhabits, and at the same time places it in the public, conventionally male, world of literary discourse" ("The Dangerous Subject of the Woman Writer: Two Texts about The Self by Margaret Oliphant"). Carswell emphasises her sense that in revealing herself through her writing she is transgressing: "Writing – for women- has inherent difficulties [...]. In a man there is nothing ridiculous, certainly nothing disgraceful here. In a woman there tends to be something of both" (Lying Awake, p. 118).

Both acted boldly in making themselves the subjects of their own narratives. Both, standing together in this way, give evidence of their loneliness. Carswell made her perception of the position of a ground-breaking writer clear in her admonition to D.H. Lawrence that he would have to work "for those who could not

---

11) She wrote in a wee hut in the garden, and would get very angry if any of the children made a noise. Hamish McPherson, quoted in *Inverness Courier*, October 5th, 1993.
Photographs of Tey's house and garden, the latter showing a glimpse of the summerhouse, are reproduced and attributed to Nancy Talburt in the section on Tey in *Murder and Mayhem*, Vol. 1, Issue 2, p. 7.

12) Carswell's daughter-in-law, Ianthé Carswell, tells us that "John never went to her writing rooms and believes that his father didn't either". Introduction to 1987 Edition of The Camomile, p. xi.

understand him till long afterwards, and he would have to be alone, all through and in the end alone", quoted by John Carswell (Introduction to Open the Door!, p. xii). This bleak formula is repeated in The Camomile by the aspiring writer who reflects in her final communication to her London friend who seems to have withdrawn the hoped-for support that "the sooner one knows that one has to stand quite alone in the world, the better" (p. 292). This expression of pessimism about the status of her literary reputation in the future chimes with Tey's own suggestion, which I interpret in Section II in my discussion of the conclusion of The Daughter of Time, that, like Margaret Oliphant, she would have to be satisfied with having been popular with readers in her own lifetime[13]. Yet, despite this awareness of loneliness and doubt about the possibility of recognition in the future, both continued to write with heroic energy even in the face of death, and would surely have achieved even more but for its untimely occurrence.

Having established these correspondences between the lives of these two writers, I now examine more closely Carswell's two novels in conjunction with those of Tey. Both of Carswell's are tripartite. Each centres on a young woman oppressed by, and seeking escape from, the rigours of Glasgow middle-class society. The nature of their experiences in both cases mirrors known events in the writer's own life and both narratives are accepted as autobiographical in nature[14]. Despite that, I argue, in both cases the central character is distanced from the narrator by the use of irony.

## 4. Synopses of Carswell's two novels

### i. Open the Door!

In, Open the Door!, Joanna Bannerman is introduced as the second of the four children of a prosperous and deeply religious family, who hear in the opening pages of the death of their father and are to be brought up from that point by their mother, Juley, alone. As she grows up, Joanna longs to sacrifice herself in a

---

13) See p. 107 above.

14) This point has been made frequently: an example can be found in Ianthé Carswell's Introduction to the Virago Modern Classics edition of The Camomile.

passionate relationship and in desperation becomes engaged for a brief period to a friend of the family, the immature and repressed Bob Ranken, who is the son of the forbidding minister of the church around which her family's life revolves. That episode over, she attends classes at Glasgow University and marries an Italian engineer she meets there, Mario Rasponi. Once she is established in his home in Florence, she, who loves physical activity, finds to her dismay that she is to be kept as if imprisoned in a cage, forbidden even to go out for a walk. Before the situation can be resolved, Mario is killed in an accident and Joanna returns to Glasgow. The second book opens three years later, to find her once more living in her old home but enjoying training at the School of Art and mixing socially in well-educated and sophisticated circles. Her mother's evangelically minded friends are jealous of her good looks and artistic talent but fail in their attempts to drag her down to their own more limited level. Despite her socially awkward position as Juley's daughter, she embarks in a spirit of long-term commitment on a love affair with a married man, the artist Louis Pender, who is seventeen years her senior, and whom she follows to live in London when he goes back to his home there. The third book begins at this point. She returns briefly to Scotland to her mother's death-bed and is profoundly moved by her reassessment of their relationship as one of love which both found difficult to express. Once back in London, she accompanies Louis, at his suggestion, on a visit to Edinburgh in the hope that he will commit himself fully to her, but his greater age is now telling on him and Joanna realises that this love-affair is over. He is abandoning her to return to his wife and family.

Surviving with difficulty the shock of the collapse of this third relationship with a man to whom she has been deeply committed, she accepts an invitation to stay on her aunt's estate in Perthshire and revisits the holiday home she had made her spiritual refuge as a child, a farmhouse called Duntarvie. There she sees in the distance Lawrence Urquhart, a quiet friend from Glasgow who has always admired her. Wildly she runs to catch up with him in case he disappears. They recognise each other as soulmates and her problem seems to be solved.

### ii. The Camomile

Carswell's second novel, The Camomile, is in epistolary form. Ellen Carstairs, living in Glasgow with her aunt and brother, is writing to her London friend Ruby, whom she met when studying music in Germany on leaving school. In the first short section, the scene is set. In the second, which takes the form of a much longer Journal which she sends to Ruby, she is involved with friends from her old school and becomes engaged to the brother of one of them, Duncan Bruce. She is to prepare for their wedding while he works as a doctor in India. Finding herself lonely and strangely without purpose, Ellen talks seriously to an impoverished scholar she meets in the Mitchell Library, whom she names Don John. Finding that the prospect of losing her own identity in her marriage is making her morbidly unhappy, she writes to Duncan, breaking off the engagement. In a short final section she explains to Ruby that Don John's death and meeting his unpleasant brother who is successful in worldly terms has convinced her that being honest, living one's life in one's own way and developing one's talents is of first importance. At the end, the support she has assumed she will receive from Ruby has been withdrawn. Undaunted by the prospect of surviving on meagre financial resources, Ellen resolves to pursue her writing career in London.

## 5. Parallels in their Work

### i. Specificity of location in time and space

Superficially, Carswell's ambitious novels bear little resemblance to Tey's apparently more modest work in detective fiction. Yet an examination of them in detail reveals thematic correspondences running between the two. Both writers produced books which are adventurous and therefore easily misunderstood. Each writes as a Scottish woman rooted in one very specific locality, Carswell's novels being as deeply involved in the Glasgow of her youth as Tey's are in the post-Culloden Inverness area.

Here I shall concentrate on just two of the many issues both foreground in their work. I have interpreted Tey's writing as important as part of the tradition of women's writing in its examination of the formation of gendered identity. It is for a very similar "sophisticated analysis of gendered identity" that Glenda Norquay praises Carswell's work in her chapter entitled "Catherine Carswell: Open the Door!" in Gifford and Macmillan (p. 398). Secondly, and of course linked with the question of gender in these books is the problem of Scottishness, traditionally especially acute for any character not aligned with the supposed norm, as Christopher Whyte's introduction to the collection of essays he edits in Gendering the Nation (1995), makes clear. He shows that many texts in the canon of Scottish literature take it for granted that to be Scottish is necessarily to be male and heterosexual[15]. Yet, contradictory readings of these texts are possible and many new and rediscovered voices are entering that canon. His book, Whyte tells us, "not only broadens the range of texts to be considered in any survey of gender, sexuality and nationhood. It aims to reroute, or at least to contest and diversify, our approaches to familiar texts." (p. xvii). Almost incredibly, Carswell's novels are mentioned only in passing in the 1989 Aberdeen University Press volume devoted to the twentieth century in its History of Scottish Literature (see p. 6 in Section I). They have, of course, received much attention since[16], but despite this, I suggest that they, like Tey's, can be found to be open to new and subversive readings. Here I aim to reroute, or at least contest, current critical approaches to Carswell's novels. I find, too, that Carswell, with Tey, in treating issues of gender and sexuality, draws on classic texts and tropes of Scottish literature and uses to the full the

---

15) The [Scottish] texts in question are almost exclusively by male authors. Alexander Moffat's group portrait of seven Scottish poets, men to a man, is emblematic. [...] If the Drunk Man succeeds in standing for his nation, his representation is limited to its male members, and to the heterosexual ones at that. Whyte, p. x

16) Tea and Leg-irons (Open Letters, London, 1992) ed. Caroline Gonda, contains Dorothy Porter McMillan's "Heroines and Writers" which includes a discussion of Carswell's work.
No. 74-75 of the literary magazine (Chapman, 1993) contains Christopher Small's essay, "Catherine Carswell: Engagement and Detachment" and a discussion of Open the Door! In Margaret Elphinstone's "Four Pioneering Novels".
Gifford and McMillan contains Glenda Norquay's "Catherine Carswell: Open the Door!" and Margery Palmer McCulloch's "Fictions of Development 1920-1970".
Anderson and Christiansen's Scottish Women's Fiction, 1920s to 1960s contains an essay by Carol Anderson " 'Behold I make all things new': Catherine Carswell and the Visual Arts".
Opening the Doors: The Achievement of Catherine Carswell, ed. Carol Anderson (Edinburgh: Ramsey Head Press) appeared very recently (July 2001).

concept of the deceptive double along with the devices of irony and satire so long established as a feature of the country's writing. Both writers, deeply in tune with the area of their origin, foreground deeply rooted aspects of its characteristic concerns and commitment. In Inverness, such commitment is to the House of Stewart, in Glasgow, to the acquisition of wealth.

### ii. Treatment of Gendered Identity

Carswell's texts show young women suffering from cultural oppression. Both her protagonists are trapped in households stifling in their religiosity and headed by women who place them (but not their brothers) under intolerable pressure. Joanna and Ellen are discouraged from developing their careers and it is assumed that their talents will be devoted to the service of others. It is anticipated that they will marry within the family's immediate acquaintance at a young age. Both rebel. It appears on a first reading that both rebellions are successful and that the narratives end on an optimistic note, Joanna finding her ideal relationship fourth time round and Ellen justified in her decision to leave Glasgow and pursue her writing career even without the support of her London-based friend. Yet, as will be shown later, critics have expressed reservations about the endings of both these novels. Here I suggest that the texts admit of other, very much bleaker, readings. Nevertheless, they stand as demanding the right of the individual woman to freedom to pursue fulfilment in both personal and professional terms. This is very much the message conveyed by Tey's quite different narratives.

We have seen, in To Love and Be Wise, that a woman's gendered identity could be established by the wearing of just three items: lipstick, a bright silk scarf and a pair of high-heeled shoes. This was possible when that book appeared in 1949 but in Carswell's texts, located around the time of her own youth, the clothes a respectable woman was required to wear were voluminous and much more disabling in their effect. Her autobiographical work, Lying Awake contains a passage making clear her own attitude to them, worth quoting at some length. She has been listing

the half dozen or so layers of clothing imposed on children when she was growing up and goes on to describe her feelings as a young woman.

> "When we were verging on our teens, my sister and I, in scorn of young ladies, vowed to each other (1) that we would never wear 'real stays with bones in them,' and (2) that we would never carry a parasol. We did not keep our vows. At eighteen I wore the same garments as at eight - except that they were longer and the top petticoat was a divided affair, white camisole above and frilled silk or stout mohair as to skirt. The straight padded band of our stays became confining and stiff with steel fronts. The neckbands of the dresses were fortified with whalebones and the lined bodices also. The skirt, also lined, and reaching to the ground in front and at the back, had braid all round inside the hem which became constantly unstitched as it caught in the wearer's heel. Our hair was rolled up over a pad on top, to which pad a hat was precariously pinned and a veil adjusted. Gloves were a necessity, and usually an umbrella or parasol. With one hand, while out walking, the back of the skirt had to be held clear of the pavement in such a manner as just to show an edge of petticoat but no stocking or ankle. This involved many backward and downward glances. The other hand was usually occupied in grasping the hat brim and frantically adjusting the veil - both subject to the least breath of wind. The umbrella or parasol being on the hat arm it was hard to assume an unconcerned smile. At fifteen or so I had more or less reorganised my costume, discarding much below and removing neckbands above, and at all times in the country or by the sea we went about anyhow, often in trousers or jerseys. But when my skirts grew long and I was corseted, I succumbed for a time to overpowering convention."
>
> (p. 34)

Considering the ending of Open the Door! in the context of the clothes Joanna as a respectable woman emerging from her aunt's Perthshire home would be wearing, shows it, I argue, to work subversively and testify against its overt meaning. Critics have indeed regarded it doubtfully over the years. D.H. Lawrence himself, John Carswell tells us, felt it really belonged to some other book[17]. For Marshall Walker, the ending is a "blemish" ( p. 229). Margaret Elphinstone, too, questions Joanna's final romantic encounter with Lawrence Urquhart, calling it "positively Laurentian but not altogether convincing" in her essay "Four Pioneering Novels" (p. 27). Elphinstone concludes "Wonderful, if you can believe it." Glenda Norquay, too, finds the closure unconvincing and uses the adjective "Lawrentian"

---

17) Introduction to Open the Door! (Virago, 1986 p xvii).

twice, saying that "while the novel may appear to move towards personal resolution with an almost Lawrentian celebration of the union of spiritual and sexual fulfilment, the finding of 'life'- it also has an undercurrent of larger social and psychological questioning" (p. 396). Alison Smith, discussing it in "And Woman created Woman" in Whyte, analyses it further, commenting that Joanna is "spawned of an uneasy mating of Lawrentian influences and middle class Glasgow respectability" (p. 27). The novel, she says, "reveals gender deadlock, which it resolves at the cost of believability". Smith decides that the ending is another trap for the hapless Joanna, "though neither Carswell nor Joanna give any hint of being aware of this" (p. 29). I propose that quite a large hint is in fact given in the text, in Joanna's surely incredibly joyous and abandoned behaviour in her rediscovery of Duntarvie.

With the reservations of these critics in mind, I find myself forced to read the closing pages in which Joanna is wearing the full constricting panoply of an Edwardian lady's clothing with increasing scepticism, given that Carswell herself provides evidence that even just walking down the street attired like that was tiresome beyond bearing. Joanna takes two train journeys and then walks several miles on rough ground to the farmhouse, surely that in itself debilitating enough. Yet, we are apparently meant to believe that she finds it natural to stop on her way to bathe naked. The idea of an Edwardian woman getting out of all these clothes, relaxing in "a lovely bath" as the water runs "in a rivulet between her breasts" (p. 399), then climbing back into those layers of garments again without qualm, apparent effort or benefit of a towel, is surely risible. A further serious point is that this is in Scotland, where such behaviour is far from being part of the culture and, above all, she is alone and vulnerable in a public place. Her old friend Alex Peddie who once proposed on the banks of this same stream, to show her "what lads is for" (p. 37), still lives locally and he, or perhaps one of the "mindless paupers" who now inhabit Duntarvie (p. 386), is liable to come crashing through the bushes at any moment and make good his offer. In a court of law, it would probably be Joanna who would be considered to be breaching the peace by "asking for it".

Having survived this, to me, incredibly careless and rapturous prelapsarian interlude, she wanders contentedly around for hours in treacherous "dewslippery" conditions instead of thinking about finding accommodation for the night (p. 390). Though it is getting dark, she is untroubled about being alone in the forest and clearings. Looking for somewhere to sleep, she goes into the pitch dark barn and decides, of an old stable-bin full of chaff, that "a better bed could hardly be found" (p. 391) and sleeps there, in all her clothes, among the cows[18]. Here the text seems to testify against its overt meaning with the use of threatening images and grotesque comparisons worthy of Edgar Allan Poe. This "bed", which she cannot see, is "a great metal box, long as a coffin and far deeper". The use of the word "coffin" in connection with the metal box is chilling and the effect is compounded by the presence of its lid propped against the wall with the potential to bang shut and trap her in an airless bed of chaff. Joanna has been shown throughout the narrative of having a horror of being enclosed, yet she climbs happily in, in total darkness. In the morning, still revelling in this closeness to nature, she picks up a metal vessel of doubtful cleanliness. Using it she milks a cow and when "spirts" of milk penetrate her layers of woollen skirts through to the skin, she merely laughs happily (p. 391). Some of the milk lands in the heaps of cow-dung that are lying all around. A long list of further escapades includes jumping over a stream, climbing a fence and gorging on blaeberries. This last, we know from the second chapter, covers her hands and face in purple dye (p. 36). Then she settles herself into her chosen bedding, sleeping this time in the open air. "Her last conscious moment before yielding utterly was a pushing and insinuating of herself as far into a bush of heather as she could. On all sides she was supported by the springy stems, yet she was so far sunken out of sight that the warm, dry, rustling flowers[19] nearly met over her" (p. 393). Romantic natural images are everywhere. Seeing Lawrence in the distance she rushes, hysterical and, sometimes falling on her hands and knees, stumbling up hill and down dale, "springing over the sapling pines" (p. 394) to fall finally into his arms. He is struck by the physical effects of her burst of running but

---

18) The last place Wringhim sleeps in before his death in Confessions is a cowshed, among cows.

19) Similarly, in Women in Love, Burkin lies among primroses which meet over him and "he seemed to saturate himself with their contact" (p. 119).

makes no comment at all on her general condition which after all this would surely have been that of a dirty and bedraggled scarecrow. In addition, she has had very little to eat and drink, and no toilet facilities at all. It is pointed out that, unsurprisingly, "the braid of her skirt was torn into festoons" but no further details are given of her appearance (p. 395). Before long, remarkably, she is "cool as satin" (p. 398) and "all freshness" (p. 399). She has even, through all this, retained her hat. Such a performance of emerging fresh and beautiful from two days of living close to nature and sleeping in her clothes is surely that of a lover in some male fantasy rather than achievable by any living woman.

The tone of this account is one of high drama, as wild claims are made about Joanna's utter contentedness during the whole unlikely episode. Never for a moment is she chilly or frightened or even uncomfortable. The same is true of the rapture of their love, and the language and images used are suitably overwrought. "The hollow of grass and heather received the sun as if in a chalice" (p. 392). As she runs, Joanna's livid face is described as "blazing like heather flowers in September sunshine" (p. 396). Despite the apparently romantic image, this does not create a pretty picture. She does not wash her face in the stream but "laves it" (p. 398). Finally, "they passed with their happiness between the new-scythed shocks of wheat that bent in their places meekly as if praying" (p. 400).

Not only is the language and imagery overwrought. Preposterous claims are made about the strength of this sudden commitment between a man and a woman. Two years older than Lawrence, Joanna pours out the story of "all that love had meant to her" (p. 398) and "knew well that no corner of her life would be – or need ever be – kept from him" and "Lawrence understood". He, apparently, has no such history, and "his essence and his treasure had lain hoarded up for her alone". This complete reversal of accepted middle-class gender roles in terms of sexual experience, and Lawrence's easy acceptance of her account is wildly unnatural and must have its validity questioned[20]. Carswell's own conversation with men seems to have been thoroughly circumspect.

---

20) In The Camomile, Ellen opines that women cannot "talk the talk of men" because "Nature doesn't work that way" (p. 270).

> I have found that men, in all other ways admirable, have insisted upon flattery, upon extreme tact, upon suppression of opinion, in short, upon the sort of extreme and conscious consideration one shows to children or to persons suffering from nervous ailments.
>
> Lying Awake pp. 136/7.

Scenes emphasising natural surroundings are foregrounded in D.H. Lawrence's Women in Love, which was published earlier in the same year as Carswell's novel. In it, Ursula Brangwen and Rupert Birkin come together in idyllic episodes centred symbolically on animals and other natural imagery. Carswell and Lawrence had been in close contact preparing these major works and exchanging early versions of them, and she was his devoted admirer both personally and professionally. Yet she did not, John Carswell tells us in writing about Open the Door!, like Women in Love: "But she did not like the novel, and reproached him for writing about 'people so far removed from the general run, people so artistic and "spoiled", that it would hardly matter what they said'. Lawrence's defence [...] did not convince her." (p. xii). Feminist theorists writing since have agreed with her[21]. I see these closing pages of Carswells as working to question the validity of these Lawrentian scenes from the point of view at least of a gendered woman. In this context, it is important that the character Joanna meets in the novel is named Lawrence. Alison Smith proposes that this name is significant.

> Finally, and all along, there's Lawrence, the rather insubstantial character with the very meaningful name, whom Carswell insists throughout is the 'natural' partner for Joanna. Lawrence carries a great symbolic weight in the novel, too much for his thinly drawn self. Carswell inscribes him with "instinctual imagery". (Whyte, p. 29)

Smith seems to be suggesting that Carswell was herself in love with Lawrence. John Carswell makes the same suggestion, pointing out that the two met when each was on the point of marrying and that "there was an instinctive puritanism in them both which each was quick to recognise" (p. xi). Coia, who himself claimed to have had a long romantic relationship with Carswell in her later life, confirmed the

---

21) Carswell is not alone in disliking Women in Love. Schweickhart declares "Simone de Beauvoir and Kate Millet have convinced me that this novel is sexist [...]. If we reverse the roles of Birkin and Ursula, the ideological components [...] stand out as absurdities. ('Reading Ourselves' in Feminisms, p. 535).

idea, telling me that when he knew her "she was in love with Lawrence all the time, even after he had died". I now develop Smith's insights, agreeing on the significance of the name, and the strangely insubstantial nature of the character. I see them as evidence that Carswell's writing is here "meeting" that of Lawrence and providing a critique of Women in Love in which his presentation of women as great in their closeness to the natural world is ironised. In my analysis, the "thinly drawn" character of Lawrence Urquhart emerges as that of an ambiguous "other" of dubious influence. I think that when D.H. Lawrence expressed the opinion that this ending really belongs to a different book, he was right. It belongs, rather, to one of his own.

Joanna, then, is entering an impossibly idealised relationship with a man in a context of closeness to an Eden-like world of nature. "There on the moor that vibrated with noon-day he was Adam to her Eve" we are told (p. 397). Joanna is cast, alarmingly, as Eve whom writers have made a scapegoat throughout the history of Western literature. This process is analysed by Gilbert and Gubar in their chapter entitled "Milton's Bogey: Patriarchal Poetry and Women Readers". Their discussion on pages 202/203 of the importance of Eve's brief experience of flying in a dream in Paradise Lost, and the subsequent enduring use of the symbol of flight as escape in women's writing, confirms Carswell's place in that tradition. Hélène Cixous, in "The Laugh of the Medusa", confirms this idea with the statement that "flying is woman's gesture"[22]. Throughout the novel, Joanna's wish for freedom has been symbolised by the escape of birds into the sky. But for her at the end, presented here as she is, as Eve in Eden, the flight above the Earth can only occur in a similar dream and the outlook is bleak. The idyll she seems to be involved in, I read as more and more ironic. Joanna may have worked her way through the life experiences of Carswell in her relationships with men, but at this point in the book the character and the narrator are distanced indeed. Alison Smith's suggestion that Joanna is entering another trap is confirmed. On the first page of Burgess's Introduction to the Other voice, she identifies a "tone of voice, peculiar to Scottish women's writing" as one of "ironic detachment". Ironic

---

22) Warhol and Herndl p 343.

detachment is a traditional characteristic and strength of the Scottish novel, seen most obviously in John Galt's presentation of the minister Micah Balwhidder in Annals of the Parish. That is the tone Carswell adopts here.

It is, too, the tone adopted by Tey throughout her work as Grant and her other detectives struggle with the cases they are investigating and the even more challenging problems of working through their own private destinies. They share characteristics of their lonely creator and all are ironised. They themselves face bleak futures. Conclusions leave the further course of events open to doubt and the world still an unfair and chaotic place. Tey's one presentation of a conclusion in the tradition of the romance format where Robert Blair is attempting to win the hand of Marion Sharpe shows him to be likely to be going to his doom. Interpreting the closure of Open the Door! as ironic and far from indicative of future happiness for Joanna draws an immediate parallel between her work and Tey's, demonstrating the younger woman's work to be following in the footsteps of that of her distinguished compatriot (p. 229). According to my analysis, this strange conclusion stands as a condemnation of the view that men and women are natural soulmates and the supposed happiness of the ending is placed in serious doubt.

### iii. Intertextuality in The Camomile

I turn now to discussion of Carswell's second novel The Camomile. It is usually thought of as lighter and less ambitious than its predecessor, perhaps because the naïve and limited perceptions of the first person narrator are frequently amusing[23)], and the structure of the novel explicitly echoes that of a sonata, with its

---

23) I don't, of course know what reality is, but I do hope some day I shall. I suppose getting married and having children would bring one face to face with it. But then that may never happen to me. Anyhow not for years and years (The Camomile p. 14). The irony is that Ellen is surrounded by social pressures which force young women to marry early. Madge Bruce arranges a party for Ellen and Duncan to meet as soon as possible (p. 146). I was kidnapped in Buchanan Street by Mrs. Bruce, who insisted on my walking her way while she talked with the greatest emphasis and solemn relish about Madge's engagement. She kept saying, 'Now i can say this to *you*, Ellen,' as if she regarded me as a specially reliable, discreet sort of person, or almost as if I was one of the family. It gave me a queer, not wholly pleasant sensation. It is true I have been a great deal at their house lately, and I am *very* fond of Madge, and very happy about her. That must be it (p. 203).

Ellen is profoundly naive about money. Walking to the Mitchell library "partly to economise in car fares" she is tempted by a dress in the window of an expensive shop and "I fell" (p. 79).

Prelude, Exposition, Development and Recapitulation, followed by a Coda. According to John Carswell, it is "much more light-hearted than her first, and more tautly constructed (Introduction to Open the Door!, p . xiii). In The Glasgow Novel Moira Burgess concurs. Yet in her more recent Imagine a city: Glasgow in fiction, Burgess reconsiders this judgement, saying that it "was for a time regarded as a less considerable work than Open the Door! (p. 122). Very welcome then is Alison Smith's recent statement that

> The Camomile is usually seen as a poor sister to Open the Door!, much less complex, 'much more light-hearted' *(quoting John Carswell [above])*, though I'd suggest the opposite. This is a novel much darker at the heart, much less rambling, more courageous formally and thematically than the first [...] The Camomile is fascinating in its reading of relations between men and women, and dark in its conclusions. Whyte pp. 31/32

Once again, in my discussion of this second novel, I build on Smith's opinion about Carswell's writing, and on her interpretation of its implications.

I have argued that Tey draws attention specifically to Confessions of a Justified Sinner in The Man in the Queue and in Brat Farrar, and uses it intertextually to underpin the development of Grant. He is presented as a divided character from beginning to end as his attempts to be rational and in control of himself falter and he descends into a helplessness which threatens his life. Carswell's first novel tangles with one of Lawrence's written in tandem. Lawrence's writing works as a tempting but ensnaring "other self" which has the potential to delude Joanna and Carswell herself and lead them into the "trap" to which Alison Smith draws attention. I detect that in the text of her second novel she once again made use of Hogg's seminal novel to underpin her work. There is much evidence to be found, in the use of formal features, motifs and names, and in the treatment of dark subject matter.

In The Camomile the tripartite structure follows that of Hogg's book closely, especially in the relative length of the sections and in the voices adopted. The first section sets the scene as Ellen speaks in a confident rational tone depicting the outer reality of her existence as a sensitive young woman who has come back home to Glasgow, a tone which reflects that of Hogg's "Editor's Narrative". As in Hogg's

work, this account is validated by letters. There follows a long, confessional memoir as her ever more distressed voice breaks down and becomes fragmented. This voice has moved from being one of naïve vulnerability to one of psychological collapse amid images conveying the violent loss of personal identity[24]. The end of this central narrative, containing the sentiment "have done for myself now" (p. 287) echoes Wringhim's declaration that "the hour of repentance is past and now my fate is inevitable" (p. 240). These statements are followed soon after, respectively, by "End of Ellen's Journal" and "End of the Memoir". In both cases there is a short, final, explanatory section. In Carswell's work, as in Hogg's, I see this section as laden with doom.

There are other correspondences which work to support the proposition that Carswell's text is using that of Hogg. The patterning on the washing-up basin that arrests Ellen's attention and makes her write "I am glad I saw it" (p. 196) echoes "the fairy web" that forms on George's hat so that he becomes "light of heart" (p. 39). Both are examples of evanescent beauty seen by chance. It is significant that George finds beauty in a setting of fulfilling escape in the open air on his way to Arthur's Seat, while Ellen sees hers in a situation of domestic servitude in the scullery which she resents and undertakes unwillingly, feeling blackmailed[25]. At a later point it becomes an issue that in Indian expatriate society, tennis parties are important and, when they are married, Ellen will be expected to partner Duncan even if she has several children and even if she would rather write[26]. Duncan's voice and attitude at this point is that of the outer "Editor's Narrative" which Ellen has come to feel inadequate. The tennis court is of course, a central site of tension in Hogg's novel where George and Robert come into conflict (p. 33).

---

24) Examples are: "Shall I ever be able to write any more in my journal to you? [...] Now that Duncan and I are engaged, the poor thing's back is broken for good" (p. 212); "Had a horrible dream about Duncan last night. He was coming toward me to kiss me, and all his face was mouth- one huge voracious mouth. In my terror at being devoured I woke up" (p. 239).

25) I am always finding exquisite things in unexpected places. On Sunday nights I sometimes have to wash up the supper things. I get out of it if possible, for, in spite of her fault-finding, I consider that Aunt Harry spoils the servants ridiculously, but tonight I had to set to (p. 195).

26) When I asked- didn't it seem unfair that men-writers could write and yet not be stinted of life?- he agreed that perhaps it was unfair, but that things were like that, and had to be faced. [...] Besides, I feel that even if I had ten children D. would still want me to play tennis and ride with him. And how are tennis, dancing, riding more 'life' than writing? (p. 250/1).

Most importantly to my argument, in Hogg's book Robert Wringhim's struggle is with a half-hidden other self who seems at first a friend, whose existence may be illusory but whose influence is far from benign. The development of the character of the shadowy Ruby in this narrative echoes that sinister process. At first, Ellen has complete faith in her as a close friend and ally. Yet never does she speak for herself or even seem to respond properly to Ellen's overtures. She may exist only in Ellen's imagination. We are told, however, that "she doesn't much like her home, which is in West Hampstead" (p. 11). (Carswell's home was in Hampstead at the time of writing.) Later, she is far from happy and in "hard circumstances" (pp. 211 and 213), as was Carswell throughout her life in London. Like Lawrence in Open the Door!, the dubious character who apparently offers Joanna a valid future, Ruby is thinly drawn and strangely absent from the text in which as a character she plays such a pivotal role. In the final section she has withdrawn the support Ellen so desperately needs. My suggestion is that this novel, like Carswell's first, responds to being read as largely autobiographical, that it is indeed "dark in its conclusions" as Alison Smith suggests, and that the ambiguous nature of Ruby's presence here, as Ellen's second self, demands attention. Ruby, I propose, stands for Carswell's older and wiser self.

Ellen and Ruby met in Frankfurt and would never have been friends had not Ellen gone there and had her horizons widened[27]. In Carswell's own life, if she had not left home to study music in Germany with similar effect, her older self necessarily exiled from Scotland and living in Hampstead would not have come into existence. Both Ellen and Ruby are gifted in arts other than music in which they have only a "hübsches Talent" (p. 13). The name Ruby indicates the character's significance as foregrounding the problem a woman faces in attempting to make the most of her gifts while fulfilling her obligation to society to be "virtuous" in proverbial terms. "Who can find a virtuous woman? for her price *is* far above rubies" (Proverbs, Ch. 31, V. 10). The writer of Proverbs goes on to detail, in

---

27) I now think Miss Rory was positively naughty (in the Shakespearean sense of the word) to over praise me as she did, and so easily to mistake general artistic enthusiasm in me for the very particular talent of music. Especially when she must have seen how madly I was in love with her. She made me work hard and got me those blessed years of freedom and study and *you*. Yes, I forgive her. But for her, Ellen Carstairs and Ruby Marcus would never have met! (p. 35).

twenty-one further verses, the domestic attributes of such a woman, in terms inducing a sense of inevitable failure to any sensitive young woman hearing them declaimed from a pulpit[28]. Ruby, from a Jewish background, is, like the Scottish Carswell, in a marked category, both outsiders when living in Hampstead unable to rid themselves of the sense of having a lost homeland, as well as impossible and guilt-inducing obligations as a woman based on stern Old Testament theology.

My contention that Ruby stands for Ellen's older self is confirmed by the use of time in the novel. Initially, we are surely placed firmly in the last years of the reign of Queen Victoria, which are those of Carswell's youth. The atmosphere of the era is conveyed powerfully with references to gentlemen in carriages, thick woollen underwear made at home, and corseting that is painful to wear. "I said one of my stays had run into me" (p. 145). The moral attitudes struck by Ellen's guardian, Aunt Harry, who regards attendances at theatrical performances as wicked and actresses as sinners in desperate need of repentance, reflect the period. Carswell used the unusual name of the teacher who then introduced the Park School girls to piano-playing, Miss Sprunt, for that of Ellen's teacher. This seems to me an

---

28) Proverbs, Ch. 31, V. 10). The writer of Proverbs goes in to detail, in twenty further verses.

*10* WHO can find a virtuous woman? for her price is far above rubies.
*11* The heart of her husband doth safely trust in her, so that he shall have no need of spoil.
*12* She will do him good and not evil all the days of her life.
*13* She seeketh wool, and flax, and worketh willingly with her hands.
*14* She is like the merchants' ships; she bringeth her food from afar.
*15* She riseth also while it is yet night, and giveth meat to her household, and a portion to her maidens.
*16* She considereth a field, and buyeth it: with the fruit of her hands she planteth a vineyard.
*17* She girdeth her loins with strength, and strengtheneth her arms.
*18* She perceiveth that her merchandise *is* good: her candle goeth not out by night.
*19* She layeth her hands to the spindle, and her hands hold the distaff.
*20* She stretcheth out her hand to the poor; yea, she reacheth forth her hands to the needy.
21 She is not afraid of the snow for her household: for all her household are clothed with scarlet.
*22* She maketh herself coverings of tapestry; her clothing *is* silk and purple.
*23* Her husband is known in the gates, when he sitteth among the elders of the land.
*24* She maketh fine linen, and selleth *it;* and delivereth girdles unto the merchant.
*25* Strength and honour *are* her clothing; and she shall rejoice in time to come.
*26* She openeth her mouth with wisdom; and in her tongue *is* the law of kindness.
*27* She looketh well to the ways of her household, and eateth not the bread of idleness.
*28* Her children arise up, and call her blessed; her husband *also*, and he praiseth her.
*29* Many daughters have done virtuously, but thou excellest them all.
*30* Favour *is* deceitful, and beauty *is* vain: *but* a woman *that* feareth the LORD, she shall be praised.
*31* Give her of the fruit of her hands; and let her own works praise her in the gates.

example of the novelist using "an eminently natural unlikeliness" drawn from personal experience which, Ellen explains to Ruby, gives a reader "that sudden, piercing, sense of life" (p. 74). Certainly, a reader like me, steeped in the history and texture of Park School life, notices this and perceives too that the charming head depicted is Miss Kinnear, who retired in 1900. These connections are confirmed by Carswell's choice of name for this cameo portrait of another, thinly disguised, real person. It is Dodds, the name of the minister who in real life was leader of the school's first Board of Directors and was also its chaplain. Conflating the two characters shows the lives of the school and the Church of Scotland to be inextricably entwined and clinches the setting in time as late Victorian.

Despite this Victorian atmosphere, as the story develops, mention is made of the first aeroplanes, regarded with suitable Calvinist opprobrium as "of the devil, devilish" (p. 59)[29]. Cars take their place as available for outings to Loch Lomond and even a casual "run up" to London (p. 205)[30]. At the time of Ellen's agonised decision to break off her engagement, the presence of dangerously heavy traffic shows that we have moved on not just the fifteen months the dates of her letters indicate, but more than two decades to the time of the book's writing after the First World War, when cars flooded the streets of central London for the first time[31]. Yet no hint is given of any of the characters having been touched by these traumatic years. As with her use of the quotation about the camomile which I discuss later, Carswell is ambiguous in her use of time and quite deliberately so. The minor but significant character of Dobbin vividly illustrates the shift in time the novel shows.

---

29) The first heavier than air flight was in 1903 in the USA, and though a few British individuals owned aeroplanes in the years before 1910, it was not until 1916 that the first UK carrier took passengers. Imperial Airways was not founded until 1924. "Calvinist opprobrium" of the aeroplane could hardly date from much before 1920. (Sources: websites of United Airlines [http://www.ual.com/] and Imperial Airways [http//:www.imperial-airways.com].)

30) Cars were luxury items until about 1914, with the first Morris car being produced in 1913. Widespread car ownership had to wait until the 1920's, and "run-ups" from Glasgow to London were not lightly undertaken before the 1950's. There could be no question of "dangerously heavy traffic" which was also significantly motorised as early as 1900. (Source: http://www.car-uk.com/histmain.htm)

31) Carswell's own consciousness of the change in London traffic during her life is evidenced in an evocative letter to her son on 14th September 1943:

> I'm glad [...] to have known London before the era of motor cars when the horses clopped along the wooden setts and the air smelt of horses and the hansom bells jingled and the 'swells' loitered along in top hats. You missed all that. (Lying Awake p. 237)

John was born in 1918.

When we first see her as a fellow student of Ellen's in Frankfurt, her problem hair needs the painstaking use of curl papers (p. 5). By the time we meet her again as a celebrated concert pianist she has abandoned a destructive relationship with a man and is sporting a twenties bob, indicating her success in throwing off conventional shackles to make her own way as an artist (p. 232). In his introduction to Carswell's posthumously published and more directly autobiographical Lying Awake, John Carswell reminds us that his mother contributed an essay on Proust's women to the memorial volume collected by C. K. Scott Moncrieff soon after the writer's death in 1922 (p. xiii). In the light of her knowledge of his work, her interest in the creative possibilities offered to the novel by the collapsing of time to reveal an inner, alternative truth is unsurprising. It may be that her manipulation of time in The Camomile has gone so long unnoticed precisely because it is such an early and subtle use of the technique in the novel in English. An inspection of the traffic which overwhelms Ellen in London shows it to be an eclectic mixture of Victorian and Twenties vehicles "cabs and carriages, cars and buses" (p 280). (She has been hit by the mudguard of a taxi in Renfield St. in Glasgow, too.) In this key scene, Carswell brings together the two periods with which the book concerns itself, confirming her sophisticated use of a quite new and disturbing technique[32].

Her existence confirmed by this time-shift, Ruby as Ellen's older self becomes a chilling character, acting in this text as she does in parallel with Robert's fearful companion in Hogg's novel. She has withdrawn her support from Ellen, who needs it, in leaving Glasgow, above all else. The reader has been forewarned of Ruby's uncompromising and unsympathetic attitude to the young Ellen, who declares that "I am still full of the mists and fogs of the North. She has the pitiless clearness of the South" (p. 12). At the last, Ellen pleads despairingly with Ruby that "surely you, of all people, will agree with me that no number of fine, pretty , or commendable actions can ever turn a false position into a true one. [...] I counted on your taking everything on trust" (p. 292). She continues "To you, though, indeed only to you, Ruby, do I now want to plead my own cause as far as it

---

32) In this scene, she realises that "never to be married would be like coping on foot all your life with the world's traffic" (p. 281). Tey's conception of the same position is expressed similarly in Miss Pym Disposes, as having "had to walk it every foot of the way under a leaden sky into a bitter wind over a frozen world" (p. 126).

can be pleaded" (p. 292). It is, after all, only oneself to whom one is fundamentally answerable for one's actions. Yet Ellen has already shown that she has absorbed the hopelessness of her situation when she prefaced this plea with the despairing insight that "the sooner one knows that one has to stand quite alone in the world, the better". The young Ellen, like Robert, has to face abandonment by the one character she trusted completely to support her actions, her other, in this case older and more experienced, self, now living in exile in London.

It is an important point that the attitudes to money of characters older than the young Ellen are shown to be deeply deceitful and hypocritical. On the first page Aunt Harry is reported to have justified her moving the family to a characterless new house as "forced" on her by economic necessity as a result of Ellen's departure to Germany "at least so she says". This is immediately followed by an account of the opulence of the house of a ship-owner called Lockhart "said to be very grand- all carved oak and tapestries and coloured glass in the windows. Reverence enters the voice that speaks of it." Yet Mrs. Lockhart has tried to beat down Ellen's charges for piano lessons for her three daughters. In Burgess's discussion of the Glasgow novel she declares that "money [...] is clearly seen as a moving force; a character we may say [...] and a theme in Glasgow fiction" (p. 25). That character looms over this novel, appearing importantly on page after page. Ellen's friend, Laura, whose family suffers financial ruin, is ironically surnamed Sterling[33]. At the end Ellen confidently proposes living in London on very little money but throughout the book she has been shown to be unable to control her impulsive expenditure on gifts and clothes. Buying a hat which costs a guinea, she conceals the fact from Aunt Harry and vows that she "would never pay so much for one again" (p. 54). But before long, she has indulged in an expensive dress, adding to it a hat at twenty-five shillings (p. 79), despite her laudable intention to give Aunt Harry, Laura and Ronald lavish presents. She even has to borrow a shilling to attend the theatre (p. 198). All this plants grave doubts in the reader's mind about her future, in terms of her control of her finances. At the time of writing the novel, Carswell was in her forties and struggling to pay her way in Hampstead, burdened with the

---

33) Like Tey, Carswell uses names to convey important concepts and as an intertextual device.

necessity of supporting an improvident husband. Jan Pilditch points out that in Carswell's life "a constant theme is shortage of money"[34]. In 1925, the couple were at "a low ebb" and seem to have separated on a temporary basis, partly because of financial problems (Opening the Doors, p. 24). On 21st February 1927, she writes "we continue to sink deeper and deeper into debt week by week" (Lying Awake, p. 196). Debt is, of course, in Calvinist society the ultimate humiliation, while evidence of prosperity is regarded by the tradition as evidence of the approval and the grace of God.

It is sad now to know that her position in this respect was to worsen year by year for the rest of her life as her poignant letters to F. Marian McNeill show, in their discussion of menial ways of making ends meet.

> Yes it is beastly never being able to get new clothes one chooses oneself and how tiresome all the shifts of poverty to oneself, and alas to others. (Lying Awake, p. 215)
>
> I should have thought there was any amount of domestic work in Edinb, as there is in London. What about mending? I do it professionally and *could* get enough to keep myself if I made a push. Household linen is all in rags and clothes need repair. The way is to *go out* and to charge by the hour (not less than 2/- an hour). [...] What about making rag dolls? I'm doing one now.
> (Lying Awake, p. 233)

Impulsive expenditure on clothes and gifts, such as she had taken for granted in the high class Glasgow shops of her youth, was out of the question in Carswell's adult life. It seems to me that the dialogue in this novel between her older and younger selves shows her to have made a bitter reassessment of her decision to reject the conventional marriage expected of her. In upper middle-class Victorian Glasgow, this would have been almost a guarantee of financial security, but instead she moved to London and an uncertain future. Her native city was the workshop of the Empire and its bourgeoisie was enjoying a prosperity unprecedented in Britain. Her contemporaries at school were marrying "well" and becoming such prominent figures as Mrs. Walter Blackie at The Hill House, Helensburgh, a patron of Charles Rennie Mackintosh. Mending even their own clothes or making rag dolls would have been out of the question in that circle. That she could have accepted the role

---

34) "And so my days are full": the letters of Catherine Carswell, in Opening the Doors (p. 54).

expected of her is attested to by her son, in his Introduction to the republication of The Savage Pilgrimage. John Carswell tells us that, immediately after leaving school, "she refused at least one conventional but eligible suitor" p. (vi). In a letter to McNeill on 19th February 1931, she writes "I've got stories and articles seething in my head. All I need is to be financed for a year or two" (Lying Awake, p. 213). Ellen's older self has discovered what well-established middle-aged Glaswegians whose faces are "observant" and "grim" are hiding from the young, the central importance of the acquisition and retention of money in their lives (p. 151). It is repeated that money is the god that they revere[35]. The ambiguity of the setting in time and in distinction between the two correspondents works creatively in this analysis of her life story in a way that a linear account of real events could not. Even in Lying Awake, which itself plays with time and is experimental in form, she does not dissect the roots of the difficulties of her adult life as she does here. Money is a very important character in this Glasgow novel. Cairns Craig draws attention to the appeal of Hogg's Confessions to readers who have had to reassess their own beliefs in the light of bitter experience:

> Wringhim's tale is not simply an account of the false assumption of election: it is realisation that what, at one moment in life may seem an undeniable truth, justifying a certain course of action, will come in retrospect, to have an entirely different significance, subject to reason both by ourselves and by the processes of history- dramatised in the later and misconstruing narrative of Hogg's 'Editor'- that will make our beliefs incomprehensible to the future. Far from being a rehearsal of contradictions within the inheritance of a Calvinist theology, The Confessions spoke out of the peculiarities of Calvinist experience to all those who, in the world of post-war Europe, discovered that they had all spent the decade before the War supporting the unjustifiable monstrosities by which they believed their every action could be justified, no matter how horrific. The anguish of Hogg's tale spoke directly to André Gide, and spoke increasingly powerfully, not only because of his own Calvinist background but because it dramatised what so many who had committed themselves to fascism or to communism in the 1930s had experienced when they saw their beliefs scrutinised in relation to outcomes that they had

---

35) I have already told you that the Lockharts are wealthy people, and they think a lot of themselves for that reason alone. [...] Glasgow people dining [at their large house] look around and tot up in their minds the price of curtains, carpets, chandeliers, pictures, inlaid cabinets, etc, so that [...] they say with a solemn, almost religious expression on their faces, 'Mind you, the things in yon drawing room cannot have cost much under £5000!' (The Camomile p.169).

never personally willed. The power of Hogg's tale is able to connect the foundations of Scottish Calvinism, with its desperate resistance to external repression in the conflicts of the seventeenth century, to those twentieth-century forms of belief in predestined justification that were to wreak havoc across Europe. Calvinism becomes a prescient metaphor for commitment to any absolutism based on the assertion of the individual ego, however rational its apparent justifications: all those modern philosophies and ideologies that claim a special insight into the nature of truth repeat, in secular form, the same traumas that Wringhim suffers- a transcendence of fear achieved by a pact with the devil that will produce an even more fearful outcome (p. 38/39).

Yet the subtlety of the novel's structure, echoing Hogg, means that this book, like his, resists a final, absolute interpretation. Read as satire, it shows Ellen to be deluded and led astray by the ideas and influences she was exposed to in Germany. The name given to her fiancé, Duncan Bruce, suggests that as well as self imposed exile her abandonment of Scotland and of him is akin to an act of murder. Macbeth lurks in this text alongside Confessions, just as it did in Tey's first detective novel. I have claimed that Tey told her own story in her detective novels by subterfuge, producing texts that are sombre in their analysis of the relations between men and women. To do so she harnessed the traditions of Scottish literature including those of irony and satire and made use of its classic texts. In these ways, I now see her as following in the footsteps of the most prominent Scottish woman writer of her time. Tey, I argue, picked up on Carswell's powerful literary response to long-standing assumptions of the centrality and importance of maleness. Like Carswell, she showed the structures of society to work as part of the patriarchal system. It is interesting to notice that they both make use of the work of Hogg, who of course was treated as an outsider in class terms in the established literary circles of his day, yet could not, with his literary knowledge and gifts and Edinburgh experience, fit back into the Border peasantry from which he sprang. It is significant that an oblique reference to the treatment that Hogg received from J.G. Lockhart and Christopher North is found in Carswell's novel. The family of shipbuilders called Lockhart are pillars of society, bowed down to and treated with reverence by unsophisticated Glasgow visitors like Dr. Bruce for their conspicuous expenditure. The Lockharts are, despite their assumed interest in music, philistine as well as self-obsessed and grasping, and presume that they may,

without warning or suggestion of payment of any kind, appropriate the gifts of the truly creative. Mrs. Lockhart attempts to make use of Ellen on a long term basis, asking her to call one afternoon. This is what happens:

> Can you guess what she wanted? She wanted me to play for an hour before tea, not to *her*, as she is incapable of listening for so long with any degree of attention or enjoyment to classical music ( and this, she said, must be classical), but to the unborn child, so that he-she was very sure about its sex- the other three being girls- might have a better chance than the others of being musical! (p. 168)

Ellen, offended by "the calm assumption that I should be only too delighted to play in this way, without any question of a fee, every day or every second day for the next few months" (p. 168), plays loudly and aggressively. "Nothing was said about a second performance" (p. 169).

In the context of Carswell's invocation of Hogg's Confessions, the lifting of the name Logan from that book to place it in conjunction with that of Lockhart is surely of significance in its reference to a key relationship in the history of Scottish literature. Mr. Logan is put in an impossibly embarrassing position by the Lockharts on a social occasion.

> The meanest thing of all, I thought, was that a Mr. Logan [...] a real professional musician who happens to be good natured and sociable, had been bidden there quite under false pretences [...] He turned up thinking it was just a few friends at afternoon tea, in which case, as he told me afterwards, he wouldn't in the least have minded playing to them for an hour on end. But here he found himself well wedged into the Lockharts' medieval drawing-room with close upon a hundred other guests, and being sweetly called upon to open the proceedings with a piano solo! [...] He played one short piece, none too carefully, excused himself on the plea of a 'professional engagement' and rushed from the house". (p. 163)

This passage works to confirm the involvement of Hogg's work with this text. In addition it engages with the text of Hogg's life rather than his novel. It makes blistering comment on the insulting treatment Hogg received in public at the hands of the Edinburgh Establishment figure of J.G. Lockhart and on the dismissive behaviour of the contemporary literary establishment towards him. The tone of light irony as the events of the musical evening are recounted is undercut by the use of such expressions as "stingy", "the meanest thing of all" and "don't you think it is

shameful"[36]. In this context of severe personal criticism, the portrayal of the character of the lawyer, Mr. Dudgeon, is the most violent and condemnatory of all. He is "a leading elder in our church and a very rich man" (p. 26), "smiling very sweetly and falsely" (p. 27) and "one of these pompous Christians with whom I defy anyone to be quite human and natural except by committing homicide without delay" (p. 27)[37]. There is hardly an admirable character in the whole narrative. There lurks a dark subtext, treating themes of deceit, hypocrisy and betrayal to be found in the family, school, church, business and social lives of Glasgow. This narrative points to examples of bullying, wasted lives, dishonesty, infidelity, insanity, alcoholism and suicide. Most crucially of all, the marriages shown are, without exception, unequal partnerships typically embarked on as business arrangements entered in a spirit of hypocrisy. The tone throughout the book may be that of light irony but the subject matter itself is that of tragedy.

Gilbert and Gubar put forward the idea that many nineteenth and twentieth century women writers in England have felt the necessity of rewriting Milton's misogynist Paradise Lost. They quote Charlotte Brontë thus:

> Commenting on the so-called condition of woman question, she told Mrs. Goodall that there are "evils- deep rooted in the foundation of the social system- which no efforts of our can touch; of which we cannot complain: of which it is advisable not too often to think". (p. 206).

Scottish women of the twentieth century, I find, including Carswell, Muir, Spark, Tennant and Tey herself, rewrite Hogg's profound novel in similar fashion. In doing so they point to similar deep-rooted evils in the relations between men and women. My conclusions echo Alison Smith's, that this novel by Carswell is dark indeed in its analysis of relations between the sexes. The light-hearted tone established by the fresh young voice of Ellen is deceptive. She stands as yet another unreliable narrator revealing that her character is headed for disaster.

---

36) Carswell's Life of Robert Bruce expresses similar bitterness at the way the poet was lionised but not accepted socially in the snobbish and Anglicised salons of Edinburgh.

37) A dishonest lawyer appears in Confessions too, and is interpreted as a key figure, despite his brief appearance. He is Ridsley (pp. 67-8 and 76) and Linkum (pp. 145-7).

### iv. Treatment of Sexuality

In considering Carswell's treatment of gender and sexuality, I suggest that her work does not just refuse the traditional romance plot but has too, a lesbian undercurrent. In The Camomile, the relationships between the young women are strong. The weddings they spend their time preparing for are very much female centred events in which the men have merely a walk-on role. At Ellen's friend Laura's wedding, her bridegroom, Wilfred Dudgeon, is the one character who seems to be excluded from the proceedings[38].

At a social evening for former pupils held at the school the girls attended, there is a scene which is of key importance, confirming the physical and emotional commitment of the young women to each other rather than to men. It follows exactly the pattern of the somewhat idiosyncratic structure of the social gatherings which took place for former pupils at Carswell's old school around the turn of the century (Joan Lightwood, The Park School, 1880-1980, 1980), confirming that Carswell was using her personal experience in this novel[39]. An odd kind of sexuality is shown. Ellen peeps through the stage curtain at the assembling audience of excited young women and imagines herself a man finding them attractive. This scene lends itself to interpretation as making use of Freud's theory of the bi-sexual, pre-oedipal phase, which explains Ellen's feelings, as it does the enjoyment women may find in participating in the "male gaze" when watching popular films. The noise of the girls supports this interpretation. The strong sexual element in their communication is confirmed by Ellen's friend Madge's blatant behaviour. "She couldn't resist giving quite a hard smack to the bottom of any girl who happened to

---

38) All the arrangements down to the last frill had been planned by Laura herself and our Laura is a bonny planner. [...] I watched her, fascinated but observant, and I could have sworn that no single thought of her bridegroom crossed her mind. [...] Even when the newly wedded pair were arm in arm together, Laura managed, by her expression to detach herself from Wilfred in the most extraordinary manner. (p. 108/9)

39) In 1899 a Park School Seniors' Association social evening, possibly attended by Carswell herself, announced its programme thus: 7.00 to 7.30 Refreshments/ 7.30 to 8.00 Conversation/ 8.00 Theatricals The Idyll of Theocritas, Scenes from The Antiquary, Hiawatha's photography, the Mousetrap/ Music in the intervals. After the theatricals refreshments again while the Hall is cleared for Dancing until 11.00pm. "The only recollection I have of our social evenings" wrote Elizabeth Sellars "is of any amount of energetic dancing and somewhat erratic steering. Of course no boys were present, we danced together and greatly enjoyed the evenings" (The Park School, 1880-1980, p. 39).

bend within easy reach of her" (p. 66). Carswell's use of the word "infantine" to define such behaviour confirms this Freudian interpretation.

In such a setting of long-term commitment of women to friendships with each other against the background of a girls' school, where emotions run high, a husband of the required social and financial status becomes a kind of necessary but peripheral accessory to the main drive of their lives. Laura is able to use this fact to exclude her imposed husband, Wilfred, from the charmed circle of those she is intimate with, while maintaining the outward appearance of a happy marriage. That strategy would have been open to Ellen too, but the relationship between Ellen and Duncan is different. "Duncan [...] really enjoys being engaged, even in Glasgow", we are told (p. 217). The situation that forces Ellen's life and work to an abrupt halt works to his advantage in adding to his the services of a presentable and well-educated slave who will adorn his domestic life. As Ellen puts it, "somehow one feels one is being made into a kind of shop-window" (p. 271). The "hierarchized" and destructive oppositions discussed by Hélène Cixous in "Sorties" (Lodge, p. 287), which I drew attention to in Section I (p. 87), can, too, be detected in this emphatic division of women and men into separate spheres.

In this context of polarisation of men and women, considering the title of the book might, as the theories of Barthes suggest, be productive. From the start, doubts have been expressed about it. In her Introduction to Virago Press's 1987 republication of it, Carswell's daughter-in-law, Ianthé Carswell, reveals that D.H. Lawrence disliked it and expressed the opinion that it was responsible for the book's relative lack of commercial success. Alternative names he suggested are Gingerbread and Rose-hearted Camelia, which might, he thought, have made the public "sup it up" (p. vii). The quotation from Shakespeare, "the camomile, the more it is trodden on the faster it grows" (Henry IV, Part 1, 2, 4, 389), occurring halfway through the book[40], seems to indicate that Ellen will respond to the crushing process of becoming an educated woman in Glasgow by developing

---

40) Ellen's friend Don John speaks to her at the Mitchell Library: "Of my writing he said, 'I see. It is like the camomile- the more it is trodden on the faster it grows'." (The Camomile p. 101.)

strongly and flourishing and Ianthé Carswell accepts this interpretation at face value. Chillingly, a slightly fuller quotation from the play goes thus:

> For though the camomile, the more it is trodden on the faster it grows, yet youth, the more it is wasted the sooner it wears.

On the concluding page Ellen announces "I have the whole of Duncan's world to write about". The point is clearly made, with self-reflexive irony, that the city Ellen is leaving and Carswell writing about, is a male world, in its machismo crushing young women as if underfoot, destroying, in this way, their youth and gifts. Carswell's use of the image of the camomile to define the central character with which she herself is closely associated I interpret as far from the random choice Lawrence supposed it to be but rather as savage in intention, fitting in with my reading of this text as satire. This seems to me, rather than light-hearted, a very bitter book.

I argue that the character of Ruby works as representing Carswell's older, more experienced self commenting bitterly on choices made when she was younger and naïve. That interpretation does not of course preclude the character carrying further meanings in this complex text. Working instead as a potentially benevolent older self, she can be seen as a forerunner of Elise Shand, the alter-ego of Elizabeth Shand in Willa Muir's Imagined Corners. An older, more experienced version of herself, Elise enables the trapped Elizabeth to escape from small-town life in Calderwick. As Alison Smith puts it "Muir suggests that at least for the moment the answer to this completion lies in the support of the right woman, rather than the wrong man" (p. 38). Ellen's desperate need for the support of Ruby as a necessary woman companion as she leaves Glasgow can be read similarly, and has comparable lesbian implications. I am not suggesting that Carswell's novel demands to be read as a lesbian text only, but that, as Douglas Gifford memorably put it of Muir's book, in this respect "it drags its coat a bit" (Lecture on Scottish Women's Writing to the Royal Philosophical Society of Glasgow, January 15th, 1998).

My proposition that this text of Carswell's has lesbian implications is confirmed by the choice of Ellen's surname, Carstairs. Its similarity to her own name suggests of course that this may be autobiographical writing, and links it too

to the possibility of incarceration on the grounds of criminal insanity. As a sinner in theoretical terms, believing oneself to be justified, perhaps? The fate of Miss Hepburn, Ellen's supportive but hysterical English teacher who is removed to Woodilee is involved, as is that of Ellen's own dead mother whose devotion to her writing proved disastrous. But at the time Carswell was writing, Marion Barbara Carstairs, a prominent figure in London society, was famous, too, in the popular press. Kate Summerscale, in The Queen of Whale Cay, Fourth Estate, London, 1997, tells her story. Born in 1900, she was the daughter of a Scottish army captain and an American heiress of part of the fortune made by Standard Oil. An "invert" known as Jo, who smoked cheroots and dressed smartly as a young man, she first found fame driving ambulances in France during the First World War (p. 25). When it ceased she drove celebrities around London in fast cars at enormous expense (p. 49); later she held records comparable to those of Malcolm Campbell as the fastest female speedboat racer in the world (p. 108). In 1934 she bought an island in the Bahamas and disappeared as far as the British public was concerned. But in 1922, when The Camomile was published, she was the most famous lesbian in Britain, supposedly attempting the seduction of every beautiful woman she met. Summerscale's book is yet another story of a strong, gifted, but ultimately tragic, woman. This connection would have been picked up on by Carswell's novel's readers in the 1920s, just as the reference to Duncan Grant in her detective's name would have been clear to those of Tey.

Whyte's Gendering the Nation provides useful material for my arguments, especially in Alison Smith's "And Woman created Woman" from which I have already quoted remarks about Carswell's writing. The final essay in his book is Edwin Morgan's "A Scottish Trawl". In it, texts are suggested which might be cornerstones in the yet to be established canon of Scottish gay literature. (These include plays by the almost unknown Catherine J. Ballingall Birrell entitled The Lesbians and Two Queens: A Drama. She is not listed even in Gifford and MacMillan.) More centrally here, however, the first, key text on which he focuses is Hogg's Confessions, featuring as it does an isolated central character who avoids and despises women and is fascinated by men. The bond he forms with his sinister alter-ego, Gil-Martin, is based, Morgan points out, on "a quasi-erotic attraction"

(p. 206), and although of course the relationship "hurries to its final hellish outcome" (p. 207), the book as a whole is seen as having a positive lesbian and homosexual undercurrent. This interpretation is supported by the history of the text itself. Thought to be inspired by Christopher Marlowe's Dr. Faustus it fell into obscurity outside Scotland until it was discovered and re-launched by André Gide in 1947. That the original wandering scholar, Georg Faust, was homosexual as were Marlowe and Gide, supports Morgan's contention that the text has "an obvious and special attraction for gay readers" (p. 206).

That I found the text used by the two writers I have examined here suggests it has a special attraction for women readers, too, distanced in similar fashion from the established heterosexual canon. Moreover, in the work of both it is invoked in the context of a positive lesbian undercurrent. Carswell and Tey identify strongly with their lonely characters, Ellen and Grant, in their strugglings and eventual breakdown. That these women writers picked up on Hogg's work at a time when it was not a well-known or fashionable text and themselves produced narratives running in parallel with it suggests to me that both should be seen as potential contributors to the gay and lesbian canon Edwin Morgan sets out to establish.

## 6. Use of Open the Door! in The Singing Sands

Tey's books, then, can be seen to stand in a flourishing wider tradition. Gendered identity and ambiguous sexuality are issues foregrounded. Characters find Scottish identity to be at once a privilege and a problem whether at home or in England. Tey invokes Confessions and Macbeth importantly in her first detective novel following on the example set in The Camomile. It seemed to me, as I pursued these ideas that Tey was taking her rightful place in the tradition of Scottish women writers. Looking at Tey's last detective novel in conjunction with Open the Door!, I was not surprised to notice that both texts interrogate gendered personal relationships in conjunction with Scottishness in the context of the position of central characters, Joanna and Grant, who have chosen to live in exile from Scotland itself. I have already noted that Tey seems to have appropriated Carswell's conception of a

gifted actress whose presence on the stage sucks the vitality out of the other actors (p. 64 above). She also followed in Carswell's footsteps in embarking on a revisionary biography of a character who is much mythologised and central to conceptions of Scottish culture. Yet I was startled to notice The Singing Sands working to confirm the link between the two works by seeming to invoke Open the Door! directly.

In my discussion of intertextuality in The Singing Sands I proposed that the choice of Wimpole Street as the location of the medical consultation which prompts Grant's journey of escape to Scotland works as an allusion to Elizabeth Barrett's imprisonment there, imposed on her as an invalid by her tyrannical father, but did not take the idea further. Glenda Norquay's demonstration, in Gifford and McMillan (p. 392), that Open the Door! draws upon Barrett Browning's novel in verse, Aurora Leigh, confirms this link and led to my consideration at this point of these novels by Carswell and Tey in juxtaposition. I found them to have much in common, Tey's novel entering a dialogue with Carswell's just as Carswell's does with that of Barrett Browning.

Both Joanna and Grant are figures who turn their backs on their problematic Scottishness and take up residence in London. Both, in this way living in denial of a fundamental part of their make-up, suffer from loneliness and incipient breakdown which threatens them with death. Both, finally, know themselves to stand in need of a redemption they are unable to define which will have to come from their own inner resources. In this process, vividly depicted and memorable journeys, especially by train, are important in both books.

Throughout her story, Joanna has found health-giving release in physical activity. She certainly revels in it - to excess, I argue - on her return to Duntarvie. Grant's own final escape from anxiety-induced claustrophobia comes with his enthusiastic participation in dancing at the ceilidh in the village hall on Cladda, where "a wonderful time was had by all. Including Alan Grant" (p. 93). The tone of the text indicates surprise at this revelation about the melancholy detective, who has never before been seen to enjoy himself. The dance scene in Open the Door! is

invoked, where Urquhart dances well "to Joanna's great astonishment" (p. 69). He had, we are told, "to the full that tranced and happy seriousness which is the spirit of a national dance". In both cases, the dance we are shown is a reel.

Vital, too, to the spiritual recovery of both characters is the presence of water, that ancient Celtic symbol of restoration and rebirth. Grant is soaked through as he returns from the ceilidh to his hotel. When Joanna, abandoned by Pender in Edinburgh, is at her lowest point, it is the "dreep - dreep - dreep" she hears from the water tank in her hotel bedroom that is "the voice of a new birth, a new life" (p. 360). Water functions, too, to provide images of narcissistic reflection. Grant is distracted from his fishing by his own image in the water which takes on the appearance of the dead young man (p. 59). Similarly, the child Joanna is dreamily admiring her own reflection in the stream at Duntarvie when Alec Peddie makes his fateful suggestion that they go up "yonder on the moor" (p. 36).

Most importantly of all in their connection with Aurora Leigh, these two texts are concerned at their heart with images of containment and escape, entrapment and flight. Norquay points to the bird imagery suffusing Carswell's text (p. 392), which she sees as derived from Barrett Browning's work and used similarly to convey the need of the individual for freedom. The claustrophobia from which Grant suffers so intensely is in essence the fear from which Aurora and Joanna in turn suffered, that of being enclosed and unable to escape. In the very brief passage in Tey's text in which Wimpole St. is invoked three times (p. 11), the phrase "open the door" is repeated, with very slight variations, no fewer than six times and interleaved are many references to such things as "a Small Enclosed Space", closed doors and the need to escape from an imposed confinement, if that is what the individual wishes to do. That Tey's book stands in a intertextually dependent relationship to that of Carswell is strongly indicated. The bird imagery and references to man's ancient dream of flying, present in Barrett Browning, which Carswell puts as "the deep-set human longing for wings" (p. 87), recurs. Tey's passage treating the same idea and celebrating Grant's recovery from claustrophobia is worth quoting at some length.

> "When man first dreamed of flying he had seen himself rising on his own silver wings into the blue empyrean [...] being picked up from the sand on the sea-ward fringe of the world by a casual - alighting bird was as near as one would ever come to the free soaring of man's original vision [...] here on the open sand, with the pilot draped about the top step [...] and the crying of the gulls and the smell of the sea [...] there was no compulsion to be afraid of [...] the great bird idled up to them along the sand..."

Grant finds himself able to climb aboard what is pointed to as a "tight-closed trap of a thing" and ignore "that closing door" (p. 96). In these three texts, through these images, escape from compulsion and entrapment is shown to be vital to meaningful existence and, as an extension to this, the entrapment involved in conventional marriage is an issue foregrounded. These texts make a demand for sexual relations to be governed by some kind of higher morality which would allow greater individual freedom. Even now, at the beginning of the twenty-first century, all this has a contemporary ring. It is in this last detective novel that Tey identifies herself most clearly as a Mackintosh with the statement that "Moymore had standards" (p. 120), as Grant notices the welcoming atmosphere of the inn where Cullen is lodging. These standards, it is implied, are not merely domestic ones. Norquay claims that Open the Door! is striving ultimately towards "not escape, not entry, but revaluation" (p. 393). So, too, is The Singing Sands.

Perhaps most strikingly of all, Carswell's and Tey's books are at one in placing the necessary resolution of the problems of identity suffered by their protagonists in a mythic Scotland where contradictions can be dissolved. Commentators, as I have discussed, are consistent in their expression of doubts about the validity of Joanna and Lawrence's final rapturous encounter but they are, equally, inclined to embrace the idea that the return to Duntarvie itself works as some kind of solution to her problems. For Margaret Elphinstone, it works as a return to "the forgotten world where there are no doors, no prisons" (p. 26). According to Norquay, Duntarvie "appears to contain an integrity and innocence" (p. 395). In Carswell's book, unlike Tey's, this place of refuge is quite specifically

pinpointed as lying a little to the north of Auchtermuchty[41]. Is Hogg's work invoked again here? Changing trains in childhood to get there involved drinking "out of these thick, white cups that had the thrilling word *Perth* emblazoned on them on a blue strap" (p. 382). Yet Joanna has never perceived the magical Duntarvie as possessing anything as mundane as a geographical location, and in her adulthood has dismissed it from her conscious mind despite her early perception of it as a spiritual resource. "If I forget thee , O Duntarvie", she whispered, "let my right hand forget its cunning" (p. 33). Noticing its name on her aunt's map, she is "deeply shaken" and realises that "she had never thought of Duntarvie as having a place upon the map" (p. 381).

In Section III, I discussed my idea that in The Singing Sands Tey takes this concept of a place central to Scottish consciousness but existing outside normal geographical boundaries much further (see p. 172). Grant's spiritual refuge is placed ambiguously, contriving to be at once in Strathspey and Strathearn, with a hint of Banffshire involved, and has deep roots in Scotland's early history. Perth itself is not mentioned by name but the "thrilling word" is implied in the names of Scoone and Comrieshire. A fantasy in geographical terms, the white house of Clune by Moymore is for Grant a lost heartland as psychologically needful as Duntarvie is for Joanna.

One striking scene at least passes from Barrett Browning's work through Carswell's to Tey's. It is that of Aurora arriving at her aunt's house in England. "I think I see my father's sister stand/upon the hall-step of her country house/to give me welcome" (p. 46, 1. 270). This aunt is of course herself emotionally imprisoned and damaged and her hair, tightly braided "as if for taming accidental thoughts" is emblematic of this (1. 274). She can be of no help to Aurora, who, to find freedom, must escape to Italy.

Joanna's marriage in Italy of course ended in disaster, mitigated only by her visit to her lively and eccentric Aunt Perdy. When she approaches her own father's

---

41) After having declared eagerly that she well knew Auchtermuchty, Joanna discovered that she could tell Carl nothing definite about it. It lay little more than five miles from Duntarvie, so that she had been there many a time. (Open the Door! p. 383)

sister's house, which stands "white-washed and four-square on its hill" (p. 380), Lady Westermuir comes out to welcome her in similar fashion "on its wide semi-circular steps". She is an intimidating presence which would be best expressed by "the triumphant clash of cymbals" (p. 381). Her hair is concealed by "her widow's cap with its precise gophering". But Joanna has grown up and no longer quails beneath her aunt's gaze or craves her approval as she did in childhood. She is able to use the visit to Perthshire to move towards her own personal spiritual redemption.

As Grant, in his turn, approaches the home of his ancestors, the white house "which lay in the green cup of the hill", Laura comes out to meet him. "She waved to them, and as her arm came down from its wave she tucked in the strand of hair that fell onto her forehead" (p. 26). Laura is of course Grant's cousin and contemporary rather than an intimidating aunt and, as we have seen, her understanding of his needs is crucial to his recovery. Her position of authority as chief of Clan Grant, the inheritor of the estates involved and thus head of the family in her own right, as well as a mother allows her - and her hair - freedom her literary predecessors did not enjoy. She occupies a central, subject position they, a single woman and a widow cannot. Despite their assumed grandeur, they are important only in their relationships to men. In Tey's rewriting of the scene, the wounding psychological situation Aurora had to escape and Joanna was able to overcome has been reversed and this family home offers real welcome and succour. In this context, it is significant that Cora Kaplan's introduction to my edition of Aurora Leigh offers the information that "Aurora as a name was chosen after some debate - she hovered between Laura and Aurora" (p. 23).

A further important association is added to the name Tey bestowed on this central character. She is far from the cipher, or "plump pillow" to be discarded by Grant as Roy supposes her to be, but is central to the meaning of the text. Placing her writing thus so deliberately, Tey is pointing to the tradition of women's writing she is using and to its development in the twentieth century. According to Kaplan "Aurora Leigh should be read as an overlapping sequence of dialogues with other texts, other writers" (p. 16). In just the same way as Barrett Browning and

Carswell, Tey inserts The Singing Sands into the history of literature, placing it as an overlapping sequence of dialogues with other texts, other writers.

## 7. Connections of Tey's work with other Scottish women writers of the Twentieth Century

My aim so far has been to consider Tey's novels in a context in which they have not been discussed before but in which they belong, that of the tradition of Scottish literature. I have found this interrogation to suggest answers to the questions that have been repeatedly raised about her work by critics with no experience or knowledge of this background. Her novels belong to a tradition larger than that of the detective novel and this wider tradition surfaces in her work precisely in these places where critics have found implausibilities and imperfections. She began publishing at a time when the twentieth century Renaissance in Scottish literature was emerging, itself informed by a search for some kind of national identity in the work of its instigators. Even in her unusual position as a Scottish woman writer based in the Highlands where she was born, she cannot be seen as standing alone, or even simply in relation to Carswell. The history of the twentieth century novel shows that a large group of Scottish women from widely scattered areas of the country were producing texts demonstrating self-conscious dependence on its traditional techniques and themes. This work has received much recent and growing critical attention and study both here and elsewhere[42]. I now see Tey to fit in as one of this group, in that her novels use experimental methods working against all expectations, in her case those applying to the popular genre of the detective novel. Grant himself is shown as having an intuitive approach to his work as a sleuth, as he resolves his speculative thoughts and instinctual insights, which defy logic but point him in the direction of solving the mysteries he is confronted with. These unconventional narratives, themselves questioning the assumptions on which the detective novel rests, reuse older texts, many of them Scottish, woven together in the creation of a series of elaborate tapestries. In these the "objects", or issues,

---

42) Examples of this 'critical attention' are AUP History of Scottish Literature, Vol. 4, Twentieth Century; Chapman 74/75; Whyte, Gendering the Nation; Gifford and McMillan.

with which the texts concern themselves, are rearranged to provide different emphases, or treatment from different angles. In this, I suggest, she must be considered as joining a distinguished group of women writers of the twentieth century. As well as Carswell, it includes such figures as Jane and Mary Findlater, Nan Shepherd, Willa Muir, Naomi Mitchison, Nancy Brysson Morrison, Dot Allan, Jane Duncan, Muriel Spark, Dorothy Dunnet, Iona McGregor and Emma Tennant. There is currently a lively debate about how open these texts are, how they should be read and how their endings should be interpreted. Should their creators, the question arises, be regarded as feminist writers?

Writing by women has usually been seen as illustrating the development of feminist consciousness. Elaine Showalter, in A Literature of their Own: from Charlotte Brontë to Doris Lessing (Princeton University Press, 1977), identified three stages in this development, which she defined as those of imitation, protest and discovery. These she named as feminine, feminist and female stages to which she assigned the dates 1840 - 1880, 1880 – 1920, and 1920 onwards to her time of writing[43]. Later, in her essay "Feminist Criticism in the Wilderness", first published in the journal *Critical Inquiry* in 1981, she appropriated the definition by Shirley and Edwin Ardener of men's and women's experience as taking place metaphorically in two overlapping spheres (rather than in the separate spheres often posited in the past). In woman's sphere the knowledge and concepts known only to women are inaccessible to men because they are not named within the dominant patriarchal culture. Women's experience cannot be shown because no words for it exist. It is thought of as existing in "the wild zone" (see p. 236 below). Also in 1981, Julia Kristeva's essay "Women's time" again defined three stages to be found in woman-centred writing. These she sees in her turn as a process of development from the initial position of liberal feminism, which demanded equality with men in terms of rights and treatment. This is followed by radical feminism, a rejection of the male symbolic order and celebration of femininity for itself. In the third stage,

---

43) First, there is a prolonged phase of *imitation* of the prevailing modes of the dominant tradition, and *internalization* of its standards of art and its views on social roles. Second, there is a phase of *protest* against these standards and values, and *advocacy* of minority rights and values, including a demand for autonomy. Finally, there is a phase of *self-discovery*, a turning inward freed from some of the dependency of opposition, a search for identity. An appropriate terminology for women writers is to call these stages, *Feminine*, *Feminist*, and *Female* (p. 13).

the concept of fixed identity is challenged with the rejection of the dichotomy between masculine and feminine as purely metaphysical. A writer's personal political stance can be posited only in the light of her own direct statements. But what can be advanced is that many of the woman-centred texts produced by the writers that I list give evidence of all three of the stages Kristeva points to. Barriers are broken down, the experience of women celebrated and identity itself put in question. In a Scottish context, discussion of gender issues necessarily involves examining issues of Calvinism and misogyny.

Amongst the writers I have listed, Carswell seems to be the most crucial figure of all[44], and a key influence, which is why I have discussed her novels at length. It is obviously impossible to discuss the work of all the others here, but I shall consider some of the seminal novels of Muir, Spark and Tennant briefly. I have engaged with the ongoing debate about how these texts should be interpreted, once again emphasising the endings of the novels, which, critics have suggested, present problems.

### i. Willa Muir (1890-1970)

Muir began publishing novels around the same time as Tey and so was, like her, in the position of being able to build on Carswell's ground-breaking achievement in the immediate aftermath of the First World War. All three produced two novels before being diverted variously to the fields of journalism, social commentary, translation and detective novels. All three published important biography, Muir writing in her last years a moving account of her life with her husband the poet, Edwin Muir. In all she had eight significant works published[45].

---

44) I am not alone: at the University of Waikato in New Zealand, Dr. Jan Pilditch gives a course on the twentieth-century novel in English written by women, which she begins with a lecture on Carswell, supported by slides of Victorian buildings in Glasgow, the confident prosperous city which provides such a vigorous background to her ground breaking novels.

45) Bibliography of Willa Muir (1890-1970): Women: An Inquiry, Hogarth Press, London, 1925; Five Songs from the Auvergnat Done into Modern Scots, Samson Press, Warlingham, 1931; Imagined Corners, Martin Secker, London, 1931; Canongate, Edinburgh, 1989; Mrs. Ritchie, Martin Secker, London, 1933; Mrs. Grundy in Scotland, Routledge, London, 1936; Living with Ballads, Hogarth Press, London, 1965; Belonging, Hogarth Press, London, 1968; Laconics, Jingles and Other Verses, Enitharmon Press, London, 1969; Imagined Selves (Imagined Corners, Mrs. Ritchie, Mrs. Grundy in Scotland, Women: An Enquiry); 'Women in Scotland', ed. Kirsty Allen (Canongate, Edinburgh, 1996). (By Fiona Black and Kirsten Stirling in Gifford and McMillan page 703.)

Imagined Corners (1931), the better known of Muir's two published novels, was the first to appear. Its chief concern is the fate of a young, intellectually able and newly-married woman, Elizabeth Shand, who has to endure the censorious and suffocating atmosphere of the small town of Calderwick on the east coast of Scotland. Despite having the best of intentions in her approach to her life and relationships, she finds herself unable to submit to the inherent constrictions and injustices which as a women she encounters there. At the end of the novel, she has survived the breakdown of her marriage and departs for Italy with another version of Hogg's double, or other self, her older sister-in-law of the same name who has made her own escape years before. Muir's work, much of it now republished, is strong evidence of her concern with her own complicated relationship with her Scottishness. According to Kirsty Allen in her Introduction to Muir's collected work published recently by Canongate "she was a Scot who resented Scotland, although her writing is obsessively Scottish in its themes and attitudes" (p. v). Issues of culture and gender are central to this writing, treated, following in Carswell's footsteps, in ways that suggest deep pessimism about any constructive possibilities in relationships between men and women. Responsibility for such a damaging situation seems to be attributed to the social and political structures of society itself rather than to men or women as individuals. Elizabeth's husband Hector is portrayed as himself trapped in a partnership for which he is not intellectually or emotionally equipped and from which he too finds it necessary to escape. This interpretation is confirmed in a reading of her second novel Mrs. Ritchie (1933) which shows how the structures and pressures of Calvinist society, including those of education, religion and community life, combine to produce monsters among women as well as men. Annie Ritchie emerges from childhood as a tragically repressed character, whose influence on her husband and children in turn is destructive in the extreme. This theme is elucidated in Muir's entertaining but serious social commentary "Mrs. Grundy in Scotland" (1936) which again illustrates the damaging effects of repression on women. Life in Scotland is shown to be deeply wounding and incapacitating to both sexes.

Muir, as a determined and intellectually gifted woman, was able to attend university and be awarded a degree, albeit as a pioneer[46]. After graduating in Classics, she chose to study psychology and, according to Allen, she "developed an enduring interest in the workings of the conscious and unconscious intellect. It was a fascination which invariably and necessarily insinuated itself into the fabric of her fiction" (p. vii). Tey's own emphasis on the importance of insight into psychology is seen in Miss Pym Disposes, as I have discussed (see p. 127 above), and runs as an undercurrent in her presentation of the problems of each one of her detectives.

Muir's work is examined as a cornerstone in the history of the Scottish woman's novel by Margaret Elphinstone in Gifford and MacMillan[47]. Allen's interpretation that Muir's own experience was being used and her Scottish identity examined is reaffirmed in the words "for a Scottish woman, it seems, the issue of Belonging is most painful when it relates to Scotland and yet it is in relation to Scotland that it must be resolved" (p. 405). Elphinstone shows too that Muir's work fits into its time in its examination of these issues of Scottish identity that informed the Scottish Renaissance, paradigmatically thought of as male. (Alexander Moffat's group portrait of seven Scottish poets in an Edinburgh public house springs to mind (footnote 15 in this Section)). Allen interprets these novels as in part a retelling of Muir's early life in Montrose. Elphinstone takes this further, showing that Muir's novels use modernism to achieve the literary construction of an inner, hidden self. A tension emerges between the overt narrative and a subversive subtext. Understanding of these novels deepens when her work in other genres is considered. In Section II I found this to be true of Tey's work also. Elphinstone confirms Allen's idea that "Mrs. Grundy in Scotland" effectively tells the same story as the novels, showing the spiritual effects of Calvinism to be disastrous in their consequences. She concludes that Muir's novels and Confessions are strongly linked in her statement about the character of Annie Ritchie that "like her predecessor James Hogg, Muir here shows us a monster created out of the doctrine of the elect" (p. 410).

---

46) As Wilhelmina Anderson she graduated LLA (Lady Licentiate in Arts) in 1910 with First Class Honours.

47) Willa Muir: "Crossing the Genres" (pp. 400-415).

Muir's devastating analyses of life in an inward looking small Scottish town match with Tey's account, filled with almost uncontrollable personal loathing, of the Calvinist forces which destroyed John Graham of Claverhouse. They fit in with the account of the same group's seditious activities, distanced, as I have discussed, by the use of Grant's consciousness as a filter, shown in The Daughter of Time. And they fit with Tey's indictment of life in Robert Blair's suffocating Milford, despite that town's setting in the English Midlands. Further, Muir's fascination with the conflict between the workings of the conscious and unconscious mind finds an echo in the struggle of Lucy Pym, with her determination to deny her own instinctive and discomfiting knowledge. Grant, of course, is Tey's prime example of a character attempting from his first appearance to use his conscious mind to think logically and deny what his instinct tells him is the truth. As his career progresses, his unconscious un-English and irrational self asserts itself and this conflict makes him ill. Muir's telling of her own story in a subversive subtext is mirrored by Tey's life-story recounted similarly in a palimpsest. And, just as Muir's writing in different genres conveys a consistent philosophy or view of life, so too does Tey's work as playwright and biographer as well as novelist. Her texts combine and complement each other in their insistence on showing society to be disastrous in its effects on innocent and well-meaning characters who find themselves isolated and marginalised if they dare to be different from their contemporaries in any way.

In discussing the relevance of Muir's work to that of Tey, I draw attention finally to the close of Imagined Corners, which is the subject of some controversy. Both Douglas Gifford and Alison Smith incline to assess the novel as offering an optimistic resolution as the two women flee to Italy[48]. Elphinstone disagrees, stating that "in the final analysis I would argue that Elizabeth and Elise are not really free either. Although they have escaped Calderwick, they carry its crippling effects with them, and so they will meet manifestations of it wherever they go" (p. 407). I see Elise Shand's promise of escape to Elizabeth to be as deeply suspect as that of Lawrence to Joanna in Open the Door! and that of Ruby to Ellen in The Camomile. In the Scottish novel, after all, the alluring double who seems to

---

48) Gifford and MacMillan, p563; Whyte (Alison Smith "And Woman created Woman"), p. 41.

offer a chance of freedom traditionally deludes and betrays. Elizabeth, in France, sees "gnarled little trees, that looked as if they had been maimed and tortured ... Crippled, like herself" (p. 281). In my discussion of The Franchise Affair (Section III) I noted that Robert Blair was presented as attempting to convince himself that he is content. The same symbol is employed to indicate forcibly distorted growth. One of the things that still affords him pleasure is a landscape "punctuated with pollarded lime trees growing out of the pavement" (The Franchise Affair, p. 8). The dubious, ambiguous elements at the end of Muir's novel, hard to analyse, find an echo in Tey's writing. Robert Blair, like Elizabeth Shand in her trip to Italy, may seem to be escaping small town life as he boards the aeroplane bound for Canada. Presented alike by the contemporaries Muir and Tey, these two characters are revealed as similar in that their damaged psyches must accompany them through life and from this there can be no escape.

### ii. Muriel Spark (1918- )

I turn now to the novels of Muriel Spark[49]. Like Muir, she offers some explanation of her literary aims and techniques in her autobiographical work Curriculum Vitae. She draws attention to the influence of elements of her Edinburgh upbringing on her writing, mentioning in particular that "the steel and

---

49) Bibliography of Muriel Spark (1918- ): Out of a Book, Millar & Burden, Leith, 1933; Tribute to Wordsworth, ed. with Derek Stanford, Wingate, London and New York, 1950; Child of Light: A Reassessment of Mary Wollstonecraft Shelley, Tower Bridge, London, 1951; revised and published as Mary Shelley, Constable, London, 1988; The Fanfarlo and Other Poems, Hand and Flower Press, Aldington, 1952; (ed.), A Selection of Poems by Emily Brontë, Grey Walls Press, London, 1952; Emily Brontë: Her Life and Work (with Derek Stanford), Peter Owen, London, 1953; John Masefield, Peter Neville, London, 1953; My Best Mary: The Letters Of Mary Shelley, ed., with Derek Stanford, Wingate, London, 1953; The Brontë Letters, Neville, London, 1954; The Comforters, Macmillan, London, 1957; The Letters of John Henry Newman, ed., with Derek Stanford, Owen, 1957; The Go-Away Bird and Other Stories, 1958; Robinson, 1958; Memento Mori, 1959; The Ballad of Peckham Rye, 1960; The Bachelors, 1960; Voices at Play, 1961; The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie, 1961; Doctors of Philosophy, 1963; The Girls of Slender Means, 1963; The Mandlebaum Gate, 1965; Collected Poems, vol. 1, 1967; Collected Stories, vol. 1, 1967; The Public Image, 1968; The Very Fine Clock, 1969; The Driver's Seat, 1970; Not To Disturb, 1971; The Hothouse by the East River, 1973; The Abbess of Crewe, 1974; The Takeover, 1976; Territorial Rights, 1979 (all Macmillan, London); Loitering with Intent, Bodley Head, London, 1981; Bang-Bang You're Dead and Other Stories, Bodley Head, London, 1981; Going Up To Sotheby's and Other Poems, Granada, London, 1982; The Only Problem, Bodley Head, London, 1984; The Stories of Muriel Spark, Bodley Head, London, 1987; A Far Cry From Kensington, 1988; Symposium, 1990; Curriculum Vitae, 1992; Reality and Dreams, 1996 (all Constable, London). (By Fiona Black and Kirsten Stirling in Gifford and McMillan page 705).

bite of the ballads, so remorseless and yet so lyrical, entered my literary bloodstream, never to depart" (p. 98). Secondly, she pays tribute to her religious experiences at school "with the predominant accent on the lovely Bible" (p. 115). A further claim is that "details fascinate me. I love to pile up details. They create an atmosphere. Names, too, have a magic, be they never so humble" (p. 11).

Her first novel, The Comforters, draws attention to its own artificiality as a work of fiction in the manner of The Daughter of Time, as the main character overhears a typewriter remorselessly writing her own story, a narrative from which she is unable to escape. Just as importantly, the novel tells the story of Spark's spiritual journey, as a convert, in the Roman Catholic faith. Religious tensions comparable to those found in the work of Tey, Carswell and Muir are an important factor. This sympathetic protagonist is named Caroline Rose, whose surname indicates a Jewish inheritance. Juxtaposed is an obese and unattractive "cradle Catholic" whose reliance on her religious credentials to underpin her importance is as great as that of any Calvinist. She herself has ceased to exist on a personal level, disappearing completely, we are told, when she enters her own domestic premises. In her public self-appointment to grace, she is the Roman Catholic equivalent of the damned Robert Wringhim. Ironically, she is named Georgina Hogg. The work of James Hogg is invoked, as it is in so many of the novels by Scottish women. More is involved in this name, however. Given the female version of the classically Hanoverian name George, she is set in opposition to the Jacobite name of Caroline. The powerful Jacobite undertow found in Tey's work is echoed here. Echoed too, as I discussed in my analysis of Brat Farrar, is Tey's opposition of the unhelpful and condemnatory vicar named George with the generous and lovable Great Uncle Charles. The one invokes the work of Hogg to discourage Brat's investigations as a construction of his own devising, while the other's return from travels overseas is eagerly anticipated (see p. 132).

It is widely recognised that subsequent Spark novels reuse the work of Hogg[50]. In The Ballad of Peckham Rye, the Border Ballads are invoked in the

---

50) Hogg's novel [...] forms the intertextual structure of many recent works, including Muriel Spark's The Comforters (1957) and Symposium (1990) (Cairns Craig, p. 39).

repetition of refrains, while Hogg's seminal novel finds echoes in the central figure of the devil-like Dougal Douglas who acts as a catalyst for evil and possesses the demonic ability to change his shape at will. Valerie Shaw points to him as an example of "the split self which is most prominent in Spark's fiction" and remarks on his choice of a tennis court on which to stage a confrontation. She notes that it has "traces of the tennis match scene in 'The Editor's Narrative' early on in Hogg's novel" and sees a parallel between the underhand tactics of Wringhim and those of Dougal[51]. Gerard Carruthers, too, sees this novel as a parable depending on the work of Hogg, in which the devil's influence leads to murder. "Wrong begets wrong and Dougal is brought into the lives of those who deserve him"[52].

The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie is of course well-known in its evocation of Hogg's work. Shaw has noted that its title harks back to his use of the tradition of the Ballads. "Kilmeny was chosen by the supernatural beings who took her away because she was, in a phrase which itself anticipates the title of Spark's novel, 'a virgin in her prime' (ℓ.78)" (p. 278). Jean Brodie, embarked on her career of self-destruction, is explicitly dependent on Deacon Brodie in her name and in her claim that she is his descendant and that he was "hanged on a gibbet of his own devising" (p. 117). The book evokes Hogg's poetic account of the mysterious journey and return of the beautiful unsullied Kilmeny further as it explores the development of adolescent girls. Jean Brodie herself emerges as an enigmatic character, appealing to the reader in her promotion of art and culture, thought of by one of her girls years later as "an Edinburgh Festival all on her own" (p. 27). Yet she is misguided and, in that she seeks to control their futures, a dangerous influence on her girls. As Carruthers suggests "the final moral implications are not clear [...] Spark refuses to offer the reader secure conclusions" (p. 518). In this she follows in the tradition of Carswell, Muir and Tey.

A more recent novel, Symposium, returns to a Scottish background. Sinister in its atmosphere (the family home on the east coast is the threateningly named

---

51) His actions resemble those of Hogg's Robert Wringhim in springing from a conviction that he is immune to all authority as it is enshrined in all civic or moral laws (Valerie Shaw in "Muriel Spark", in Twentieth Century Scottish Literature, p. 282).

52) "The Remarkable Fictions of Muriel Spark", in Gifford and MacMillan (p. 517).

Blackie House), the narrative shows a character like Dougal Douglas, once again acting as a catalyst. Again and again throughout her life, Margaret Murchie is present when murders and disappearances occur. The idea that apprehension of her guilt is not the result of rational thinking is spelled out. "Dan felt, not with his mind, but deeply within the marrow of his bones, that she had sent the maniac to her grandmother" (p. 79). Grant's uncomfortable insights are echoed here. The darkness of the background is drawn attention to as specifically Scottish. The ballads are invoked in her use of the name 'Corbie' for a character intent on preying on the vulnerable[53]. And we are told, by the deranged but perspicacious Uncle Magnus that "Here in Scotland [...] people are more capable of perpetrating good or evil than anywhere else. I don't know why it is, but so it is" (p. 159).

In the novels of Carswell, Muir and Spark, then, along with those of Tey, can be traced their use and subversion of Hogg's landmark novel and its motif of the destructive double, together with their building upon the traditions it established. Struggling characters, be they Joanna Bannerman, Ellen Carstairs, Elizabeth Shand, Annie Ritchie, Caroline Rose, Jean Brodie or Grant himself, find themselves imprisoned, like Wringhim, in horrifying situations for which they themselves are in part responsible, and subject to mental and physical breakdown. Even when some kind of escape is offered to the characters in the final pages, the conclusions reached by the texts raise further problems of interpretation rather than resolution of the situations in which the protagonists find themselves.

---

53) The Twa Corbies is one of the most chilling and best-known of the Scottish ballads:

As I was walking all alane/ I heard twa corbies making a mane;/ The tane unto the t'other say, "Where sall we gang and dine to-day?"

"—In behint yon auld fail dyke,/ I wot there lies a new-slain knight;/ And naebody kens that he lies there,/ But his hawk, his hound, and lady fair.

"His hound is to the hunting gane,/ His hawk to fetch the wild-fowl hame,/ His lady's ta'en another mate,/ So we may mak our dinner sweet.

"Ye'll sit on his white hause-bane,/ And I'll pick out his bonnie blue een;/ Wi' ae lock o' his gowden hair/ We'll theek our nest when it grows bare

"Mony a one for him makes mane,/ But nane sall ken where he is gane;/ O'er his white banes, when they are bare,/ The wind sall blaw for evermair."

### iii. Emma Tennant (1937- )

Tennant's[54] autobiographical writing, like that of Spark, attributes her early inspiration to the surroundings and literary influences of her childhood. Once again, a rich background knowledge of the ballads and the work of Hogg is pointed to as crucial. Building on this personal testimony, two of her works direct attention unambiguously to classics of the Scottish novel, themselves related, on which they in turn depend. These two, The Bad Sister (1978) and Two Women of London (1992), invoke Hogg's Confessions and Stevenson's Jekyll and Hyde respectively. They have been republished together, along with her Faustine (1992) which is based on a reading of Christopher Marlowe's Dr. Faustus. Earlier in this Section (p. 218) I discussed the idea, proposed by Edwin Morgan in Whyte, that Marlowe's work itself stands in relation to that of Hogg. These three novels of Tennant, connected thus to each other in the history of literature and in spirit as well as in theme, reappeared together in a compilation in 1995 entitled Travesties[55]. (All of the page numbers that follow refer to this volume.) The first of these "travesties", or rewritings, involves itself more directly with the work of Hogg than does that of Carswell, Muir, Tey or even Spark. On this showing, Hogg's novel's importance as a "bogey" for Scottish women writers appears to have increased rather than diminished over the twentieth century. In The Bad Sister, Tennant follows his use of the tripartite form along with the change of the tone of the narrative voice from that of outward authority to that of inner disintegration in the manner of Carswell's The Camomile, as it recounts a succession of events which resists clear analysis and judgement.

---

54) Bibliography of Emma Tennant (1937- ): The Colour of Rain, Weidenfeld & Nicholson, London, 1964; The Time of the Crack, Cape, London, 1973; The Last of the Country House Murders, Cape, London, 1974; Hotel de Dream, Gollancz, London, 1976; The Bad Sister, Gollancz, London, 1978; Wild Nights, Cape, London, 1979; Alice Fell, Cape, London, 1980; The Boggart, Granada, 1980; The Search for Treasure Island, Puffin, New York, 1981; Queen of Stones, Cape, London, 1982; Woman Beware Woman, Cape, London, 1983; The Ghost Child, Heinemann, 1984; Black Marina, Faber, London, 1985; The Adventure of Robina: by Herself, Faber, London, 1986; The House of Hospitalities, Viking, London, 1987; A Wedding of Cousins, Viking, London, 1988; The Magic Drum: an Excursion, Viking, London, 1989; Two Women of London: The Strange Case of Ms Jekyll and Mrs Hyde, Faber, London, 1989; Sisters and Strangers: A Family Romance, Grafton, London, 1990; Faustine, Faber, London, 1992; Tess, Harper Collins, London, 1993: Pemberley, Hodder, London, 1993.
By Fiona Black and Kirsten Stirling in Gifford and McMillan page 706.

55) Travesties (Faber and Faber, London, 1995).

The first section, entitled "Editor's Narrative", presents itself in the detached tone of an Edinburgh lawyer who is delving into the family history of the victims, an outwardly respectable father and daughter living in London, named Dalzell, whose ancestral home is located in the Border country. The lawyer's authority is added to by what seem to be the facts in this case of a double murder. Like those in Hogg's novel, these facts are established as of good provenance by personally-presented evidence and letters which arrive at his office in answer to advertisements he has placed in the press. Some of this evidence points to events echoing scenes from Hogg's novel. An example is a fight between women taking place at a birthday party for the daughter in a hotel named the Black Barony, which replaces the riot in which Wringhim and his brother are involved at the Black Bull. The women who attack include Dalzell's illegitimate daughter and her mother, whom he had abandoned. This commune of women living in the hills above his home follows the tormented landowner as he makes his way about his estate. In a reference to the ballads like that used by Spark, they are "corbies" in wait for their prey (p. 16).

The second part of Tennant's tripartite novel follows in the path of Carswell's Camomile as it echoes the long central section in that of Hogg. Following the Editor's authoritative statement of the background to the mysterious killings comes a recently discovered Journal, written years before by a character analogous to Wringhim who has, like him, succumbed to a potentially malign philosophical and political force, that of radical feminism, centred on a single charismatic and demonic person. The female writer of this Journal, who is Dalzell's illegitimate daughter, shows awareness of her own gradual transformation into a demented "other" self, attempts to resist this evil influence but is ensnared because of the early indoctrination she suffered and the sense of freedom, power and importance that the imposed political system allows. Responsibility for her own actions disappears as she becomes unconscious of what she is doing and apparently capable of being in two places at the same time. The Journal closes with this direct reference to Hogg's text.

> the sighing of grass on the hill, I see him standing there, by my mother's cottage on the hill...
>
> Gil-martin comes towards me [...] I knew he would be there waiting for me! (p. 165).

Finally, the lawyer adds a short note, following the pattern of Hogg's novel and speaking in his role as the Editor. He tells of the recent discovery of a strangely attired hermaphrodite corpse buried in the ancient Forest of Ettrick above St. Mary's Loch. It is the body of the deranged young woman who had been driven by her delusions to murder her father and half-sister. The lawyer's investigations into the case are now closed but questions are raised by the text about where the culpability for such tragedy might lie. The murdered man's behaviour arguably invited his fate. As in the novels of Carswell, Muir, Tey and Spark the moral implications of the narrative are far from clear.

In this reworking of Hogg's writing by Tennant, it is once again women who are the central characters and who act as threatening doubles. Robert Wringhim is replaced by Jane Wild as the young person induced to commit murder. Her name, in this context, might be seen to connect her to the "wild zone" identified in the Ardeners' model and quoted by Showalter. The uncertainty about whether her corpse is male or female echoes the breakdown of such categories as pointed to by Kristeva as the third stage to be reached by writing inspired by feminist thinking. Her vulnerability parallels that of Wringhim and is the result of her position as the child of a single mother, who has turned for protection to a commune of feminists. As such she, a child, is condemned to be "always searching for some 'missing male principle'" (p. 32). (Tey's creation of Lucy Pym and her experiences at Ley's College, similarly lacking a male element, finds an echo here.) This vulnerability is exacerbated by her upbringing in this community of fiercely politicised women, seen first based on Jane's father's estate in the Scottish Borders and, secondly, in London to which his family moved. The leader of the community, Meg Gil-martin, demands obedience from its members and like Hogg's demon possesses the ability to change her appearance at will. In this text, the doctrine of the elect is replaced as an evil influence by that of radical feminism. Yet the church as a source of influence is not ignored. Jane has a friend, Stephen, who is an Anglican vicar. It is he who supplies memories of Jane as well as her Journal to the Editor, who in turn is initially sceptical about Stephen's theory that Jane was in a state of demonic possession as a result of Meg's supernatural powers. The part played by Stephen in

Jane's life was that of a male friend attempting fruitlessly in a spiritual role to help her escape from Meg's malevolent domination.

Thus trapped and beyond help, Jane commits murder twice. One victim is her father, who perhaps deserves such punishment. Yet the text suggests he is a typical product of social systems rather than personally responsible for his faults. Far from an admirable figure, he is a landowner who as a young man seduced and abandoned her mother, a shop girl, while he himself was engaged to be married to a woman of his own class. Named Michael Dalzell, he is portrayed as feeble and selfish, interested only in drinking, gambling and womanising, and incapable of supporting his family by his own efforts[56]. As such, he is a deeply unsympathetic character emblematic of patriarchal society. According to Meg "His assassination was symbolic [...] it was a ritual killing" (p. 29). She is unmoved by Stephen's protestation that "He's now a body in a morgue. Doesn't that make any difference to you?". The text draws attention to the fact that he remained a person, whatever his faults, and that his killing was a crime. The second victim, Dalzell's legitimate daughter and Jane's half-sister, is of course completely innocent.

Setting all this out, Tennant follows Hogg's text closely. In the manner of the women writers discussed in this thesis, she uses names rich in historical, political and literary associations. When Meg herself is first given a surname she is identified humorously as well as with dark associations as "Meg Gil-martin [...] An old Scottish family!" (p. 147). Michael Dalzell's first name connects him with traditional mystery in the Border country, where his story finds its roots. In The Three Perils of Man Hogg evoked the legendary wizard Michael Scott presiding at Aikwood Tower. The landowner's surname links him with the strongly Jacobite Dalzell, or Dalyell, family of West Lothian. Their best-known character was Thomas, a charismatic soldier who supported Charles II, and whom Scott shows as one of Claverhouses's companions in hell at Redgauntlet Castle (see footnote 14 in Section II). Most relevant to this text is the traditional story of Dalyell's dicing at

---

56) Michael Dalzell sold his estate in 1970, to pay his gambling debts. His wife wasn't given the reason, and was simply told by her husband that he thought it was time they went back to London so he could 'go into the City'. He would have been quite unable to do this, of course, or to support his family, if a stroke of luck hadn't befallen him in the death of two uncles and the unexpected inheritance of a large fortune from the other branch of the Dalzell family (Travesties, p. 20).

cards with the Devil, with catastrophic results. Tennant echoes this in her text by having Michael gamble on the night before his wedding and throw nothing but twos, earning him the name "Deuce Dalzell" (p. 8). The use of that name is a reminder of Tey's equally significant use of the Jacobite name of Lamont in The Man in the Queue[57]. Karl Miller points out that the use of names with dubious or alternative pronunciations is characteristically Scottish and offers further examples[58]. History and politics are never far from the surface in these novels.

In Hogg's key novel, then, a male, and misogynist, demonic double inspires the central character into crimes which stand for the evil excesses sanctioned by Calvinist thinking. Women writing in the Scottish tradition in the twentieth century repeatedly subvert and transform this text, creating divided selves, often female, with haunting doubles who exert control on their lives. Thus trapped, these characters struggle to free themselves, but have little chance of escape. Carswell's unfortunate protagonists pave the way. Joanna is last seen entering a man-made, Lawrentian, trap. Ellen's concentration on interpreting her prescribed biblical role as a virtuous woman in her own terms brings about her mental disintegration and the prospect of a bleak future, exiled from Scotland and dogged by money worries. Muir's novels make similar points. Elizabeth's efforts first to conform to and then to escape from the demands of respectable society in the company of her own double seem doomed to failure. Annie Rattray's frustration as a child and subsequent career as a wife and mother brings about tragedy. Writing more recently, Spark plays with the tradition in postmodernist fashion. Her ambiguous and divided characters' actions deliver disaster to the vulnerable people around them. Tennant, focusing most clearly of all on Hogg, shows a young woman possessed and unable to escape from the implications of the darker side of feminist politics. Following in the tradition established by one key novel, these writers have found themselves able to examine the nature of Scottish society from a variety of

---

57) The names are linked, too, in that their pronunciation, well known in Scotland, is typically greeted with bewilderment bordering on disbelief in England. Two prominent bearers of these names in British politics in recent years demonstrate this in their adoption of the pronunciation expected in England (Tam m and Norman Lamont).

58) Norman Lamont, Tam Dalyell; Auchinleck/Affleck; Marjoribanks/Marshbanks (Lecture at Edinburgh Film Festival, 1996); another example is Gillies/Gilhazie.

class positions and geographical backgrounds. Tey's writing can now be seen to take its place as part of this pattern. The Man in the Queue and Brat Farrar allude directly to Hogg's novel. Over his extended career, her key figure, Alan Grant, follows the path established by Robert Wringhim. His struggle to conform as a detective, by relying only on rational deduction, leads him to mental breakdown and the threat of death. Only an unexpected extra-legal emotional commitment (and return to his family home) can save him. These writers seem to be pointing to evils, deep-rooted in society, similar to those referred to by Charlotte Brontë (p. 213 above). Tey's detective novels address these evils self-consciously in their breaking down of barriers between male and female. Tey's tests may be unpretentious, but if we reroute our approach to her books in the manner recommended by Whyte, we see her writing to fit in as part of a strong tradition.

# SECTION V

## THE MYSTERY SOLVED?

At the beginning of this thesis I identified problems otherwise admiring critics had found in Josephine Tey's eight detective novels. As these critics had not been in a position to examine them with their Scottish provenance in mind, I suggested that such an examination might help in their interpretation. Unusual features included struggling, irrational detectives, victims whose suffering went far beyond being unfairly suspected of crimes and endings that failed to restore order. Tey's closures seemed far from final. That literature in Scotland was seen at the time Tey began writing as undergoing a self-consciously created transformation added a significant backdrop to the publication of her first work in the popular genre. This Renaissance, led by male scholars such as Hugh McDiarmid and Edwin Muir, saw itself as recovering an ancient tradition which had dwindled at the end of the nineteenth century into sentimental and parochial writing known as the Kailyard. With political overtones, it sought also to create a homogeneous Scottish identity discrete in its un-Englishness.

According to Cairns Craig, however, Scottish cultural identity had in fact begun the twentieth century alive and well. "From Alexander Graham Bell's invention of the telephone to Clerk Maxwell's theories of electromagnetism, from MacIntosh's art nouveau to J.G. Frazer's The Golden Bough, the 'Second Scottish Enlightenment' had provided some of the key elements in the transformation of Western culture which we now identify as 'modernity' and which gave birth to 'modernism' in the arts" (p. 34). Gerard Carruthers, too, as I discussed in Section I (p. 25 above), has come to the conclusion that the Scottish literary tradition was not in the parlous condition it had been considered to be but had continued to be used creatively down the centuries. Both Craig and Carruthers identify Hogg's Confessions as a key text on which the modern Scottish novel depends. Berthold Schoene also claims that "contemporary Scots have arrived in their country" and that a multiplicity of voices can now be heard (p. 121). Whyte's deconstructive criticism of the canon and rerouting of approaches to familiar texts works similarly.

Such positive views of the Scottish cultural inheritance suggest it to be far more robust than had been supposed.

A close examination of Tey's first detective novel, undertaken in Section I, shows it to repudiate well-known features of the contemporary detective story. London-based authority is seen to be fallible and a Jacobite subtext is established. Many Scottish texts are invoked and used intertextually, including those of Macbeth and Confessions of a Justified Sinner. The writing bears close comparison to that of John Buchan. Issues of nationality and gender are addressed. A palimpsest telling the story of the writer's own life is begun. Perhaps most surprisingly of all in the popular genre, the text draws attention to its own status as imaginary, as one piece of literature drawing on others rather than as reflecting any kind of reality. The overall effect is very much that of an unusual narrative told from the margins rather than the centre of British, or even Scottish, society.

Tey's work outside detective fiction, consisting of ambitious novels, plays and biographies, confirms her standing as a writer seeking canonical status. Her output as a dramatist was enormous and the biography of Claverhouse a serious attempt at the revision of the standing of a character key to the development of Scottish culture. However, the emotion of the writer obtrudes awkwardly into that text. The later similar attempt at revision of the character of Richard III is handled with greater sophistication and much more successfully in the detective novel The Daughter of Time. All the books written outside the detective genre work to confirm these texts' concerns with categories that create divisions between people, whether of nationality, class, gender or sexuality.

Critics reviewing the books of Ian Rankin are inclined to begin by stating that there is no tradition of detective writing in Scotland, thus ignoring the contribution of Michael Innes, Edmund Crispin and Tey along with that of Conan Doyle himself. I see Tey's writing as building on these achievements, working as a Scottish and feminist revision of the genre of detective fiction, destabilising it by removing from its centre the patriarchal figure of the English, male, detective whose efforts support the structures of a society based on the use of centralised power. In

this revision, such oppositions as English/Scottish, male/female and heterosexual/homosexual are taken apart. Colonialism itself is examined. Her choice of the genre of detective fiction in which to do this must itself be seen as ironic. The voice of the narrator presents Grant, and the other detectives, with a degree of personal identification and sympathy for their difficulties, but is distanced from them too as they struggle to reconcile their conflicts. Margaret Elphinstone recognises this in her analysis in Whyte, claiming that Tey maintains a "subtle balance between identification and ironic distance between author/narrator and detective, in which gender becomes more flexible and ambiguous" (p. 107). The reader may share in the detectives' tortured thoughts but sees them from a remove allowed by an element of ironic detachment as Pym, Blair, Farrar and Grant himself struggle. Carruthers sees Burns's "Holy Willie's Prayer" and Hogg's seminal novel as proof of the fact that "productive and creative use is made in Scottish literature" of difficult circumstances. Just as Carswell's modernist novels are recognised now as filling a space long thought to be a "lacuna" in the history of Scottish writing, despite difficult circumstances, so I see Tey's as making a claim to vital recognition in the period following immediately after her distinguished predecessor and building directly on her work. In using Hogg's Confessions, her writing fits into the tradition of twentieth century women's writing which includes that of Muir, Spark and Tennant. In addition Tey includes elements of Carswell's writing woven directly into her own texts. To use an appealing phrase borrowed from Carruthers, such writers are, rather than struggling in a hopeless situation, "creatively surfing the waves". Tey finds herself able to use these divisions and contradictions as part of the richness of Scottish culture and history, despite that culture and history being one of trouble and suffering. It stands as an example of "fruitful literature emerging from unpropitious cultural circumstances". She is able to join the Scottish tradition of groundbreaking biographical work by telling her own story in a palimpsest. I think that Edwin Muir himself might have been heartened to find her invoking Alexander Scott's "Rondel of Luve", one of the works he cites as possessing a wholeness of vision forever lost to Scottish literature[1)]. This is not to say that Tey should be seen as a nationalist writer, any more than as a crudely feminist one.

---

1) Scott and Scotland (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1992) p34. First published 1936.

On page ii of this thesis are Sherlock Holmes' words "There is a mystery about this". Where there is no imagination, he says, there is no horror. Tey's books certainly show imagination in her use of the genre of detective fiction. It may be objected that there is little horror in them of the conventionally gruesome kind. There is plenty of horror, however, in her depiction of society as brutal to all who fall outside the perceived norm of upper-class heterosexual Englishman and dare to show themselves as different. The worst horror of all is the undeserved punishment suffered by those of the Jacobite persuasion, especially at the hands of Clan Campbell. Tey is not alone in this among twentieth century writers: the obituaries of Sorley Maclean show that the unhappiest period of his life was when he lived in Mull, unable to dismiss from his mind the thought that the island was ancient Maclean territory, appropriated by the Campbells.

In the context of Carruther's perceived lacunae, suggested to be more apparent than real, Tey's writing emerges as significant. The huge commercial success her first play enjoyed at the Haymarket Theatre is consistently drawn attention to in accounts of the history of twentieth century theatre. This early critical and commercial success was repeated by her detective novels and the film and radio versions made of them, and this popularity has been sustained especially in the United States[2)]. Her varied output of writing should be seen as an established part of the history of literature in English, verging on the canonical.

That this idea is accepted is shown by the growing attention her work has received by the critics currently working from whom I have quoted (Roy, Talburt, Garber, Morris and Light among them). They see her as a figure who is part of a distinguished group yet whose work diverges from that of others in that group in important ways. Her novels feature no great detective nor dazzlingly intricate plots. Instead, the detectives are themselves revealed as vulnerable, acting in the world of the theatre extends into impersonation in "real" life, innocent characters have their security destroyed and an unusual use is made of history and of characters who are women seeking independent lives. Despite all this Roy struggles to define her as

---

2) The successful crime writer Mary Higgins Clark, based in the USA, cited her as an influence in an interview in *The Herald Magazine*, 10 July 1999.

providing texts which reassure the reader in traditional detective novel fashion. Roy's lengthy study ends with the statement that "she provides the reader and herself with a bastion of predictability and surety in a world where all appearances deceive and disillusionment is common currency" (p. 184). Talburt more perceptively calls them a "unique statement which transcends a nominal adherence to rules" (p. 43). The problems both critics encounter and cannot explain away disappear when the texts' own self-conscious literariness and extensive use of intertextuality is taken into account. Their nature as rooted in Scottish literature becomes clear. The concerns of her texts show them to fit into the lively debate about the nature of Scottishness being conducted in the years after the First and Second World wars.

When I began this investigation, the detective novels were back in print on this side of the Atlantic in the series named Penguin Classic Crime. Now they are unavailable again, except for the occasional maverick appearance of one or two titles. They should, I suggest, be issued as a set once more, this time by a Scottish publisher, and with an introduction exploring their status within Scottish literature. Further work could then integrate them in that tradition, and especially that part created by women.

APPENDIX 1 NOT COPIED

ON INSTRUCTION FROM

UNIVERSITY

# Appendix B1

## Kif

### i. Résumé

The action begins in 1914, when Kif, a fifteen-year-old orphaned farm worker, enlists in a Highland regiment. His motivation is a longing for adventure and escape from life in a rural community, and he enjoys his time in London and France. He makes several friends in the army and in France. On one of his leaves he stays with the prosperous family of Tim Barclay, his special friend. Tim's sister, Ann, intrigues him. He is injured at the Somme and sees friends die. After the war, he attempts to make an honest living but is cheated out of his savings while working in a bookmaker's business. He visits the Barclays again, but now that he is not in uniform, they receive him coldly. Another army friend, Thomas "Angel" Carroll, offers the by now almost destitute Kif lodging with his family, which turns out to operate on the wrong side of the law. He falls in love with Carroll's sister, Baba, and becomes involved in crime himself, spending some time in jail. As an ex-convict, he discovers that finding work is impossible. Desperate for money, he takes part in another burglary and shoots a man in self-defence as he was trained to do in the army. He is sentenced to death. Neither Tim nor Baba, both of whom he loves, will visit him in the condemned cell, but Ann, now married to Kif's commanding officer, does visit him, until the end. Only Mary, who was kind to him during his childhood on the farm, weeps over his death.

### ii. Narrative

The text itself claims clearly that the novel should be regarded as the story of a single human being. "This is not a war diary; it is merely the history of Kif" (p. 50). Yet the action moves through such memorable war scenes as Kif's enlistment, training, arrival in France, leave, battlefield, hospital, convalescent home and return to civilian life. Somehow, too, the central character whose history it is claimed we

are being told seems strangely absent, despite the fact that we are assured of his many admirable qualities and witness a procession of other characters, beginning with the maid Mary (p. 3) and his schoolteacher "who rather liked him" (p. 6), finding him appealing. We perceive him as a site of vulnerable emptiness rather than as a character. As in a picaresque novel, he is a space moving through a series of experiences, allowing the narrator to comment on a host of social and political issues. Perhaps we are intended to interpret him as a "birling gap", the name of the Sussex picnic spot where the key scene of the novel takes place. As a "gap" Kif has no reflective thoughts, no inner life and no stream of consciousness.

The narrator adds to the impression that Kif hardly exists, and is only a space moving through the text, by habitually addressing the reader over the character's head. Not only is Kif excluded from what is purported to be his own story in this way, but the hectoring tone of the narrator's comments assumes a great deal about the reader in terms of nationality, class, education and attitudes. An example is the insistence on the debt "we" owe to the NCOs of the old army (p. 15). Who are "we" supposed to be? The reader seems to be assumed to share with the narrator an unquestioned identification with a comfortable, middle-class existence relying on protection from the army but not part of it at a lowly level. Privates and NCOs are certainly banished from the audience addressed by the narrator, though the ranks are portentously referred to as "that multitude of individual worth" which had not been "made null for lack of a welding power"; they are being patronised in a heavy manner by the narrator, who also seizes the opportunity to invoke the biblical concepts of faith, hope and charity, thus drawing an implied connection between the narrative voice and the authority of God. Perhaps the use of such a narrative voice is intended as an ironic comment on snobbish progressive thinking of the time which prided itself on its radical views while still assuming class superiority and privilege, and showed no inclination to identify with the proletariat whose cause in theory was being supported.

Pointed out directly to the reader by the narrator is Kif's lack of education and cultural background. For some highly questionable reason, the reader is presumed to enjoy these blessings. "Kif had never seen the Samothrace Victory and

might not have liked it if he had" (p. 178). The working-class central character is being condescended to and marginalised and the reader seems forcibly implicated in the process. The use of the term "ave valeque to Britain" (p. 19) a Latin phrase Kif is unlikely to understand, to describe his brief initial experience of the South of England, is another example of the character's marginalisation. It works at the same time to marginalise all other areas, which apparently do not count as part of Britain in the narrator's eyes. It is, too, not even Kif himself who is allowed to make political deductions and feel anger at his own position. This is done for him in the narrator's voice.

Linked with this view that the South of England can be regarded as all that matters of Britain is the narrator's strongly expressed contention that Surrey and Sussex are unmatched in their varied beauty, with the relegation of everywhere in Britain north or west of London to second-class status. Once again, a tone of the reactionary social superiority of an older person is struck. "Surrey and Sussex! What terms of week-end sophistication they are become! And even now, with the red rash of villadom creeping over them...." (p. 72). The narrator again seems to aim to exclude on the basis of class people who live in new villas, and speaks from a single, middle-class, snobbish, limited and Southern English point of view, assuming its own superiority and the reader's acquiescence. Surely this point of view was unlikely to be that of most of the potential or actual contemporary readers of the text, who must be considered distanced from this voice.

This book claims to be the "history" of Kif. Tey's antagonistic attitude to any form of official record of events was spelled out much later in The Daughter of Time. Here in her first novel, through this deeply suspect narrator, she seems to me to show that no single interpretation of events, however authoritative, can be regarded as absolute, and the claim that this "history" is "unvarnished" must be regarded as ironic. Once again, Tey is subtly adopting a characteristic of modernism, making the suggestion that the same story told from other available points of view, such as Kif's own, would be very different. The use of this narrator reveals the limitations of one very specific stance. That the persona involved is that of an overconfident, snobbish and blinkered middle-class person, rooted in the past

and interested only in the south-east of England makes a clear statement that the narrator is as distanced from the reader as is Kif, the opinions expressed by the narrative voice undercut and deeply suspect.

That the adoption of a persona for the purposes of ironic self-revelation on the part of that persona is a recurring characteristic of Scottish literature is made clear by Kenneth Simpson in The Protean Scot (1988). Discussing Peregrine Pickle, Simpson points out that "the overwrought prose [...] is clear evidence of the distance at which Smollett stands" (p. 32). The similarly overwrought prose used by Tey's narrator as in "Shades of famous trenchermen, behold your sons" (p. 7), is likewise evidence of the distance at which Tey stands from the narrator.

### iii. Conflicts in the Character of Kif

Many of the oppositions familiar to the reader from Tey's later work make their first appearance in Kif. As a novel with a cataclysmic war as its setting it does of course have opposition and conflict at its heart, though issues concerning the justification of the war are hardly discussed. Many of the characters can be seen as operating in the narrative in one or more pairings. The internal battles of the divided self familiar to those who have followed the subsequent lengthy career of her serial detective, Alan Grant, are touched on very briefly in the character of Kif, when we see his "arguing mind" (p. 171) after his doomed call at the Barclay's home. Just as Kif himself fails to come to life, however, so, too, does this internal battle fail to convince or engage the reader. It is rather different external conflicts and inconsistencies that Tey deals with here.

Tey's ambivalence about nationality is implicitly expressed in this book. Her enduring interest in conflicting Scottish and English identities reveals itself in the blinkered Englishness of the narrative voice. It is strongly shown, too, at the beginning, when we find that the character of Kif resists definition as one or the other but inhabits a borderland. His home is a kind of inverted Berwickshire, where the county town, Ferry, bears a Scottish name. He himself lives in a village called Tarn, a name found only in the north of England. We are told that Kif and his

siblings have been "scattered to the ends of the kingdom" (p. 5) and so have to presume that the kingdom concerned is England; the balance of probabilities seems then to be that Kif is English. This conclusion is, however, undermined later in the novel when Kif mentions casually that he was born in Ferry (p. 145). Is he then Scottish in origin? Or was he born in the Scottish county town of an English county? The inhabitants of the farm at Tarn are, too, little help. Mary has a soft "western" voice. The farmer bears a name suggesting likely origin in central Europe rather than anywhere in Britain, Vass, an interesting choice in the context of the First World War. He does, however, use the traditional Scottish definition of unshakable purpose "Who will to Cupar maun to Cupar" (p. 11). The reader, forced to become detective, to collect and weigh up evidence from this scattering of clues, can come only to the conclusion that these same clues do not amount to proof of any sort on one side or the other and that Kif's nationality is undecidable. Like the regiment he joins, "the Half and Halfers" (p. 9), Kif is neither wholly Scottish nor wholly English, but an ambiguous figure standing somewhere between the two nationalities.

Everything in the first chapter seems to be in quantities of threes. "Threepenny shockers" (p. 2), "three errands for Mrs. Vass" (p. 6) "three o'clock train" (p. 6) and "third battalion" (p. 7) are examples. So, too, the two alternative somewhat doubtful identities in Kif are together in thrall to an unambiguous third, the crowning vision of otherness seen by Kif in the stirring romance of a kilted Highland regiment sweeping through Ferry. A long tradition in literature of viewing the Highlands and its inhabitants as "other" and romantic does of course exist, and is often connected with a romantic desire for liberty. The Highlander had seemed an appropriate figure to stand in for Rousseau's "noble savage" in the mid-eighteenth century and the idea was capitalised on a little later by writers such as James Boswell, James Macpherson and Walter Scott. The Highlands as an icon with a long tradition was thus available for Tey to use, but her own background as a Highland woman herself, forced to live reluctantly in Inverness at the time of writing, makes its use surely double-edged.

In contrast to the ambiguity shown over Kif's nationality, the comparison of the quality of life in rural and urban environments is bitterly made and a very decided preference expressed. We are introduced to Kif in the first pages feeling a violent revulsion against the village life in which he is trapped. He thinks of the limited horizons of his world in which the only excitement is of an unsophisticated variety, "a dance an affair of polkas and boots" and music represented by "Johnnie, the hired man, [who] scraped on his fiddle" (p. 2). His dislike of the country is not only impatience with the limited social and cultural life but extends to the land itself. "The phlegm, the appalling for-everness of the fields and hills roused in him a desperate consciousness of his own evanescence, and a rebellion that any part of his short and so precious time should be given to their thankless service"(p. 2). It is of course Kif's longing for excitement and adventure that leads him to join the army and enjoy his subsequent leaves in cities such as London and Paris.

On the second page, too, we see that the alternative entertainment available to Kif takes place when the local worthies gather to gossip at the bridge in Tarn. In their lack of perception and charity, their "spiritual poverty", they are a direct reference to similar characters, the "bodies", in George Douglas Brown's The House With the Green Shutters (1901), who gather at the Bend o' the Brae and are "the sons of scandal" (p. 59). Later in Brown's book, we see them indulging in personal attack and are told that "amid the suave, enveloping greatness of the world, the human pismires stung each other and were cruel, and full of hate and malice and a petty rage" (p. 139). Making this connection, Tey can be seen at the very outset of her novel-writing career to be placing her work deliberately in the tradition of Scottish literature emphatically set in opposition to the pastoral idyll depicted by the Kailyard. Later in Kif, the narrator informs the reader that the character's Barbie-like experience at the bridge in Tarn equipped him for ribald conversational exchange in the regiment. The disgust expressed at the unpleasant tone of talk in Tarn is extended to include a clear reference to its misogynist element. "Kif, who had made one of the bridge-head gatherings at Tarn and whose country upbringing had not inculcated in him any reverence for the female of the species" (p. 95). The narrator is here informing the reader in the usual high-faluting tone, very far from

any used in Tarn, that the stultifying nature of small-town life is especially inimical for women, always more readily subject to criticism than men.

Other Scottish women writers of the time, too, portrayed rural life as very different from an idyll. Rather, it was an environment in which women could be treated as slave labour, powerless to escape. Jane Findlater's short story "The Pictures" (1921), quoted in Moira Burgess's the Other voice, shows a neglected young girl farmworker, whose hard life tending cows and sheep is remarkably like Kif's, as she struggles in the cold from farmhouse to byre, her only enjoyment "a few screeching notes from his concertina" (p. 106) when Johnnie Ross, the farmer's son, plays. It is very interesting that Tey draws attention to almost exactly the same musical entertainment in Kif. Like Kif, Katie longs for excitement and finds no pleasure in the surrounding landscape, even when her attention is drawn to it. "I'm no' carin'" are her last words as she turns away. The scenery cannot compensate for her restricted life. That rural life is no idyll is clear in "The Pictures". It is also clear in Kif. It is almost universally the stance of Scottish woman writers of the period.

At the time Tey was writing, between the wars, other Scottish novelists were examining the relevance of the landscape and countryside of Scotland to women. Jane Findlater, as we have seen, concurred with Tey's view of a farm as a hard and thankless taskmaster, no matter how breathtakingly situated. Willa Muir's Imagined Corners (1931) portrays small-town life in Calderwick as a kind of hell, and houses as prisons. Her character finds it necessary to escape from Scotland altogether. Catherine Carswell, however, showed her protagonist Joanna in Open the Door! (1920) finding escape and eventual inner strength from her closeness to the land at her old holiday place of Duntarvie. Joanna, however, is very much in the tradition of the urban, Lowland Scot for whom the country is a retreat rather than the prison it can be for the country born person. In Nan Shepherd's The Quarry Wood (1928) Martha feels that choosing between staying or leaving her native countryside involves a loss either way. The same problem faces Chris Guthrie in Lewis Grassic Gibbon's A Scots Quair, who feels that education will turn her into an English Chris rather than the Scottish Chris she is, "Chris Caledonia". In the end she is identified

with the land and seems to be part of it, but from a male point of view. The women in the books of Neil Gunn are similarly viewed, and are less important and memorable as characters than Chris. What is certainly true is that no Scottish writer of the inter-war period could avoid dealing with the problem the land and relationship to it posed. Tey was no exception. In her detective novels, especially the first and last, the Highlands offer longed-for escape to his roots for her London-based detective, Alan Grant. In the latter book, The Singing Sands, escape to the north and west provide the necessary cure for his humiliating nervous breakdown. Life there on a permanent basis, as a sheep-farmer, is briefly contemplated and finally firmly rejected along with the idea of getting married, in the last lines of the book. In Tey's work, it seems, wild country can offer escape and healing, but life bound to a small part of it on a permanent basis is not to be borne, and would be likely to obliterate the identity of the individual. That is true also in Kif.

The notion that a woman in society is an artificial construct is indicated. A countrywoman Kif meets on a train is wearing a hat which is "an erection of net, lace, wire, feathers, sequins and flowers" defined by the narrator as "degrading and meaningless" (p. 24). This seems a valid point with which many readers are likely to agree. The class snobbery of the narrator should not obscure the important point that, in an era when hat-wearing was obligatory for respectable women of all social groups, in church and elsewhere, even a well-chosen and stylish hat was a constricting and marginalising tool of society, as are high-heeled shoes and many other items of clothes women were and are expected to wear. In a later scene when Kif wishes to give a present to Ann as well as Mrs. Barclay after his stay at their house, he is unable to think of an item Ann might like. He "analysed for the first time that outer shell that woman presents to the world" (p. 85). More than twenty years later in To Love and Be Wise Tey again used the idea of an outer shell constructing a woman, when the central clues to the solving of a mysterious disappearance are a woman's high-heeled shoes, lipstick, coloured head-square and gloves.

That the genders are seen as in opposition to each other is illustrated most clearly in the memorable scene at Birling Gap on which the book hinges. Tim had

demanded that the seaside place they visit should be one with cliffs, emphatically not where land and sea meet almost accidentally and without drama. "I like a place where the sea comes up against more than it bargained for and makes a song about it" (p. 92). A character who had compared the scene at Birling Gap to a postcard is agreed by the Barclays to lack soul and suffer from "chronic ladylikeness" (p. 73). Imposing "ladylikeness" on a character who "never said 'Gosh' in her life" is identified as another way of artificially constructing a marginalised woman whose thoughts and ideas seem trivial and uninteresting. The relationship between sea and cliff expressed as a clash with "a song about it" mirrors that between male and female. Human emotions are ascribed to the inanimate background scenery using what Ruskin called "the pathetic fallacy". Ann and Kif find themselves content in each other's company, although Ann is initially merely making herself pleasant mirroring "the white boulders that the cliffs had cast as sops to the importunate sea" (p. 73). As their satisfying conversation reaches its natural conclusion "the almost brimming tide give little exhausted pants of achievement" (p. 77). Using this device, passion can be conveyed which would not seem credible if portrayed directly in this scene. Female and male with the female, like the cliffs, in the more powerful and secure position, seem to hold the promise of potential compatibility.

Tim and Ann are contrasted as male and female characters. That both are half in love with Kif is illustrated when Tim has bought a watch as a farewell gift for him. Ann takes it "and she in turn fingered it absently; laid it on her wrist, dangled it from a first finger, held it in an embracing palm, gazed at its shrewd, elongated face [...] She surrendered it wordlessly" (p. 139). Ann shows reluctance to consider her relationship with Kif over and in the past. Tim's reaction is more final. He puts the watch in its box and replaces the lid. "As though he were burying something" is Anne's perceptive thought, "Laying a ghost" (p. 140). Both brother and sister find Kif attractive as a partner, both know he has to be abandoned, but the woman is the stronger character and recognises the situation for what it is.

Despite the suggested compatibility with Ann, Kif feels more comfortable when women are absent from his life. "Kif infinitely preferred an evening in

unalloyed male company to playing cavalier" (p. 164). Yet Kif, here declining to play cavalier, has been defined earlier as endearing himself to weary corporals "so beset by martyrs and protestants" (p. 13). Tey's later iconoclastic biography of Claverhouse certainly condemned "martyrs and protestants", the legendary covenanters. Again, Kif emerges as a "half and halfer", belonging to neither camp. Just as he is neither Scottish nor English, neither a covenanter nor a cavalier, his sexuality is ambiguous and resists definition.

As already discussed, both Ann and Tim find Kif attractive. Had Tim remained by his side, Kif would have been saved from his ill-fated friendship with Angel Carroll. Ann fears that the watch Tim bought as compensation for Kif was a gift for a woman but realises with relief "No girl [...] he isn't that sort. Dear Tim," (p. 139). Tim's sexuality is not in doubt, at least to Ann, though the narrator appears to be unaware of it. Once again, this voice insists on a single, limited point of view, comparable to the long, straight road Ann contemplates ahead of her. That single point of view was of course the one sanctioned by society at the time of writing. Once again, as in the case of history or official record, authority is being expressed as insisting on its blindness to any reality that does not endorse one single, convenient "truth".

Kif's relationship with Angel Carroll is, too, a strong one. The very name suggests an ironic identification of this character with goodness. It is also an allusion to Thomas Hardy's fateful character, Angel Clare, in Tess of the D'Urbervilles. The book Kif does as a whole carry traces of Hardy's work in its grim fore-shadowing of the inevitable tragic conclusion. Kif and Angel withdraw frequently to box together, another form of collision, in "stolen moments" (p. 144). The pairing of Angel and his self-centred and unscrupulous sister, Baba, is a mirror-image of that of Tim and Ann. While Ann supports and visits Kif until his last day in the condemned cell, Baba immediately and unrelentingly attempts to exploit the situation to advance her own personal ambitions. Tim, too, betrays Kif and is himself condemned for lacking the courage to meet him. Angel, in contrast to these two, is genuinely distressed and personally damaged. "In those days Angel lost forever the bloom which had made his beauty the singular thing it was. He became

merely a good-looking youth who dressed well" (p. 292). Although less capable than Ann, he is, as a character, paired with her.

Early in the book the reader is presented with a strong suggestion of the physical consummation of a homosexual relationship. Such a thing does not seem to occur as a possibility to the narrator, still at this stage in the text adopting an over-confident tone of voice, but is left to the surmise of the reader. "His indignant eye, together with the clinging trousers, were too much for Kif. He subsided on the edge of the bed and laughed tearfully. And Travenna after a moment's hesitation joined him. 'What do you want trousers for when you have a kilt?' Kif asked presently" (p. 34). The word "presently" certainly suggests that some event has taken place about which no information is being conveyed. The narrator again is unable to convey it as s/he adopts a deliberately blind pose and only sees "the long straight road ahead". This single viewpoint is repeatedly revealed as inadequate. Tey herself would of course be aware of the dangers of publishing a book containing overtly homosexual scenes. As well as the danger of being completely censored by the Lord Chancellor - as even heterosexual scenes were up to the famous case of D. H. Lawrence's Lady Chatterley's Lover in 1960 - there was the further personal awkwardness that the authorship of such a book at that time would entail. The kilted Travenna, whose name suggests transgression and perhaps a third identity or possibility, is a member of a Highland regiment, and, as we have seen, associated through it with the attraction of "otherness" and as an object of romance and desire. He is the first person Kif ever feels a pang at parting from (p. 45) and is referred to later in the text as "perfectly his complement" (p. 84).

Kif, who resists definition as either Scottish or English, who joins a regiment drawn from both sides of the border, who is attracted to and attracts both men and women, had watched the passage of such a regiment "wild, defiant, deliciously triumphant" (p. 7) as one watches a lighted train, another romantic symbol of escape important in Tey's writing. While doing so, he absently caresses the mare which has been disturbed by the commotion. Once again he is an ambiguous, borderline figure, a "half and halfer". But a possible third identity or means of escape is offered by means of this powerful image. To the recruiting officer of the "half and

halfers" the request to be sent to a Highland regiment is "so curious a predilection" (p. 9) that he demands to know the reason. Kif's reasons are "a vague memory of fine stories" and "the unforgettable vision of the other day". Kif's sexuality may be ambiguous but a third possibility is offered by this use of an image of escape from rigid classification. This escape Kif eventually makes in the company of Danny, who is also in love with Baba. Finally, as Baba hears of Kif's arrest for murder, she is "cutting up steak" and looks at "the chopped and oozing fragments under her knife" (p. 285). Her hands and the knife, which must be covered in blood, symbolise her ruthlessness and her part in Kif's downfall and fate. Hands covered in blood suggest an allusion to Shakespeare's character Lady Macbeth in this scene. Certainly, in The Man in the Queue published in the same year, real responsibility for the murder is attributed to the actress associated with the same figure. Such a reference appearing in Tey's two early novels seems to confirm that her work should be considered as in the Scottish tradition, dependent on "the Scottish play". Tey's contention seems to be that genuine rather than apparent goodness is rare. People who are not in prison are not there simply because "the things they did weren't punishable by law" (p. 249). What the Barclays and Carrolls have in common is that they are family units where Kif's presence is tolerated but where he does not belong. Both treat him kindly but ultimately inevitably exclude him.

Kif finds his ultimate haven elsewhere, in the rooms occupied by the Carrolls' associate, Danny, rather than in a family home. Danny's instinctive tastes are more sophisticated than those of either family and he uses colours in subtle combinations. They are "warm purple combined with shades ranging from buff to amber" and the furniture is "all of walnut, dark and beautiful" (p. 227). Furthermore, this relaxing refuge, where Kif finds asylum from social pressures in a single person's rooms, is full of books and music and the scene of meaningful discussion of abstractions. "The atmosphere of the place fed a part of him which was starved to atrophy at Northey Terrace".(p. 228). Danny's sexuality, like his colour sense, seems to favour subtle combination. He is in love with Baba, but interested also in Kif. It is Danny who is asked by Kif in the condemned cell to look after the worthless Baba. Especially when Angel's involvement is taken into consideration, an intriguing web of relationships has been established. Danny

himself, dark and with the sinister appearance of an assassin, is known as "Danny the Dago" (p. 192). A "dago", a dismissive label used to indicate an outsider from continental Europe, was traditionally the villain in detective fiction of the period. A connection is again suggested with The Man in the Queue, as Danny has an affinity with the "dago" in it, Lamont. Both have Highland fathers, and mothers who are too in a sense outsiders. Both are guiltless victims, Danny being afflicted with incurable illness which will soon kill him, and Lamont hounded by the police force almost to the point of death.

As with the polarities concerning nationality and gender, Tey has not identified Kif with either the Barclays or the Carrolls. Other families, too, like the Houghs and Clamps have welcomed him and then, for their own reasons, disappeared from his life. These families, as social institutions, exclude and fail outsiders, especially the single. Tey was to show this to be a major issue in her last book The Singing Sands, where Alan Grant is made welcome by his married cousin Laura, but feels a stinging resentment at her domestic happiness which is open to interpretation as complacency.

Kif's deficiencies are attributed to his lack of individual attention and approval as a child. This is indicated by his face which has "missed good looks through lack of modelling" (p. 14). Even after several years have passed, he has been in few family homes and remains fascinated by them. Because of his original deprivation, he finds himself unable to respond positively to his exposure to education and sustained personal relationships as he grows up. Despite this, he finds refuge in reading, his taste in material progressing ironically in parallel with his experiences. Originally he has access only to "shockers", simple, predictable exciting stories, satisfying "his thirst for colour and movement" (p. 3). Next he is supplied with adventures set in the American Wild West, by Owen Wister, which have clear heroes and villains. (The more cultivated Tim has himself been reading Walter Pater.) Kif quickly progresses to the writing of Kipling, with its depiction of adventure linked to the service of Empire. His own name and story seem an allusion to Kipling's picaresque novel (Kim (1901)) about the orphaned son of an soldier serving in India. Kim, who becomes a spy and adopts various guises is, like

Kif, outside oppositions of race and class. Finally, on the eve of his last burglary, Kif borrows from Danny volumes by Heraclitus and Sophocles. Heraclitus has been called "the weeping philosopher" because of his conviction that nothing lasts and Sophocles was well-known for his depiction of pathos. Both can be seen as references to Kif's tragic fate as well as indications of his developing literary taste. Books are obviously another important symbol in the text. The reading material available at the Carrolls is "a collection of 'sevenpennys' hung on a two-shelved bracket on a wall" (p. 202). Baba disapproves of reading and of the nurturing books Kif borrows from Danny. She "resented these oblongs of red or blue or green which she recognised as a talisman against her charms" (p. 213).

Kif's original emotional deprivation is exacerbated by his innocent but adventurous nature, willingness to fight back when attacked and the training in violence which his country has provided. In the social, political and economic situation prevailing after the war he has no chance of holding down work that is not, for him, soul destroying. In this way, his arrival at violent crime is presented as inevitable. The crucifix Carroll despatches him to steal in person symbolises his position as a tortured sacrifice. The deprived nature of Kif suggests to Tey's readers affinity with her other hunted innocents pursued by the forces of law and order. Lamont in The Man in the Queue and Tisdall in A Shilling for Candles appear in her two pre-war detective novels and are the most obvious parallel creations. They have committed no crime at all and, like Kif, lack any social or professional standing. In all three novels guilt lies elsewhere, is inherent and ineradicable, and may or may not be punished. In A Shilling for Candles, the destitute and desperate Tisdall goes into hiding to avoid arrest and narrowly escapes severe illness. The murderer, Lydia Keats, is in this case truly wicked, and it is by fortuitous accident that her guilt is discovered and she is punished. In The Man in the Queue the murdered man himself intended to kill the actress, Ray Marcable, who had been bullying him emotionally. It is her mother who foils him by murdering him, seeming almost justified in the crime. Lamont is mercilessly pursued and almost drowns. The root of the crime is the vanity and utter self-centredness of the actress, who cannot share the limelight. She is the Lady Macbeth figure, and goes unpunished. In Kif, we are again presented with Lady Macbeth, in

the person of Baba, whose selfishness and greed has put Kif in the position of committing the crime. Keats, Marcable and Baba are all predecessors of the character Betty Kane, drawn by Tey in The Franchise Affair, years later. Kane's only instincts are selfish and self-indulgent, and she seems careless and oblivious of the suffering she causes to those around her.

In each of the three books appearing between the wars in which a murder takes place, responsibility for the crime lies with self-absorbed and self-centred women- Baba, Marcable and Keats. The murder victim is not a focus of interest. Most of the interest lies in the three real victims, the pursued innocents Kif, Lamont and Tisdall, all men, all of whom are threatened with death. All suffer at length, and are shown towards the end of the book in which they appear devoid of hope, homeless and unsupported. They are alike, too, in that they all suffer immersion in water, akin to a baptism, at the turning point in the text. The difference in the case of Kif is that, after his soaking when he meets Carroll as he tries to take shelter, he is on the downward path to the scaffold. No providential intervention allows his escape as happens with Lamont and Tisdall.

Kif is an "innocent" like Lamont and Tisdall in the sense that he is not in control of the events he is taking part in. Yet, of course, unlike them, he is at least technically guilty of the murder for which he is eventually hanged. The argument of the narrative seems to be that Kif has made the best he can of the position and abilities that he was born with and that shooting first when he is threatened with a gun is true to the training he received in the service of the country. The burglaries he is involved in large houses draw on Doyle's story "Charles Augustus Milverton". In it, Holmes and Watson feel obliged to steal compromising letters from the safe in the study of a unattractive and blackmailing middle-aged man, Milverton. They find a large number of letters which they eventually burn. Half way through their illicit activities Milverton returns. Holmes and Watson conceal themselves and witness his being shot by a woman he had blackmailed, whose husband when sent incriminating letters "broke his gallant heart and died" (p. 283). Tey draws on these events, showing the intruders as "gentlemen" burglars, approaching a large house through the garden. They burn similarly damaging letters which they find in

comparable surroundings, and in showing an unsympathetically portrayed householder returning unexpectedly and being shot. According to Catherine Belsey in "Deconstructing the Text: Sherlock Holmes" in Warhol and Herndl's Feminisms (p. 604), "Conan Doyle presents the reader with an ethical problem". Holmes' approach to the case may be illegal but it seems morally justified. When Holmes is asked to help catch the murderer, he declines. His sympathies are with the criminal. Just as Tey used "The Man with the Twisted Lip" to make points in The Man in the Queue, she used "Charles Augustus Milverton" to claim that the burglaries Kif takes part in, when his efforts to make an honest living fail, may not be immoral, but even have good consequences. Similarly, his instinctive shooting when he himself is threatened may be condoned in the circumstances as inevitable and natural. Technically a murderer, he is in essence, it seems, as much of a suffering innocent as either Lamont or Tisdall. This long, involved early novel displays characteristics very like those seen in her detective work. Deeply intertextual, it is imbued with ambiguity and irony and must be seen as very Scottish.

### iv. The Structures of Society- The Law and the Church

In this book legal processes are shown to work randomly. It is only by good fortune that Kif has the support of Murray Heaton, who, unlike the well-meaning Carroll family, is in a position to procure and pay for the services of a first rate defence counsel. Even then, the outcome of the court case is dependent on the personal factors affecting everyone involved. The barristers are hoping for a new appointment by the Crown or the advancement of juniors (p. 297). The jury, with one exception, a plumber who plumbs the unacceptable truth, is imperceptive. The judge hates the defence lawyer, is self-absorbed, and, like other characters, no more important than a hen. In deciding on Kif's fate "artistically" he is likened to a taxi-driver fixing a fare. Elsewhere in Tey's work, she shows barristers proceeding according to their own personal predilections. Kevin McDermott in The Franchise Affair is impulsive and unpredictable and personally and professionally insecure. The police-force is shown repeatedly as easily satisfied with superficial explanations of

events. It is Alan Grant's instinctive dissatisfaction with this situation that provides him with his famous but distrusted "flair". Legal processes and judgements and the institution of law itself are demonstrated to be untrustworthy.

Tey's dislike of organised, institutionalised religion emerges strongly in her early books. In The Man in the Queue, a church social evening undergone by a policeman in the course of his duty is depicted as a dreadful experience among repulsive people. In A Shilling for Candles, discussed in Section III, the monk who has been left the insulting legacy (of a shilling, for candles) is a despicably selfish and dishonest character lacking any redeeming feature. In Kif, too, distrust and condemnation emerges. The padre who visits Kif during his first imprisonment is well-meaning and treated more gently as a character. He is the only visitor Kif is prepared to receive and brings him the books which provide him his only relief from boredom. But this character fails to listen to others, knows little of the world and is of limited intelligence. His own reading material is work by Mrs. Hemans and R.M. Ballantyne, both nineteenth century authors still very popular when Kif appeared. "Fluent and innocuous" is the description Margaret Drabble gives to Mrs. Heman's verse in The Oxford Companion to English Literature (1985), and the same words could be used of R.M. Ballantyne's novels depicting manly adventure and exterior appearances. We are not told what books Kif asked him to bring, but evidently they were not by these authors. The padre's choice reveals his lack of subtlety and perception and when he eventually duly "said his little piece" (p. 249), he and Kif are unable to communicate with each other.

It is with the character Danny, an associate of the Carrolls who appears later in the text, that Kif discusses religion seriously. Neither has any belief and they agree that whether one has is merely a question of susceptibility to being superstitious. Danny is dismissive of the clergy. "When clergymen go to a better paid job they always have a 'call' [...] Ugh!" (p. 230). When Danny defines the Bible on the same page, as "Just an ordinary hotch-potch of a book" and adds that "the only thing in the book worth reverence is the English and they never think of that" it seems likely that this sophisticated, sensitive and thoughtful Celt in whose rooms Kif finds his ultimate refuge is the mouthpiece of Tey's own opinions. The crucifix Kif is despatched to steal in person works not only in relation to his own position as a victim, but also as a

somewhat ambiguous comment on the heart of the Christian faith and ethic. Kif reflects that he has witnessed many even more painful calveries. "Well," he thought, "lots of our chaps took far longer to die and were a much nastier mess while they were doing it. And for far less reason". (p. 220). Here Kif is seen to make a political point on his own account. Agonising and unnecessary death is familiar to him, but the validity of individual, personal sacrifice is not to be diminished.

Danny not only provides sanctuary for Kif but is the one character shown as prepared to sacrifice himself in Kif's place. He tries to persuade the police that he himself committed the murder. It is he, too, who has the courage to break the news to Kif that the Home Secretary has not intervened to prevent his execution happening. "Are you going to leave Kif to a - parson when he hears that?" (p. 314). The church, like the legal system, is an institution created by society and of no avail to the vulnerable individual. Voluntary, personal sacrifice and moral courage are to be respected as the ultimate good.

## v. Conclusion

Kif immediately strikes the late twentieth century reader as an unusual book. It was written at a time when new novels were regarded as clearly divided between the traditionally and the experimentally written. Apparently traditional itself, it yet resists final definition as such. It does, too, resist definition as a novel with the First World War as its subject despite the interest of the various background scenes and characters. Yet so much conflict of identities emerges that it does seem, symbolically at least, to be a war novel. In this first published novel, themes and issues emerge which continue to be foregrounded in Tey's subsequent work. Many characters can be seen as operating in one or more distinct pairings. Questions concerning nationality, gender issues, sexuality, class and the influence of social institutions are addressed. It is clear that absolute answers to these questions are to be avoided and that an atmosphere of openness and freedom of identity is the suggested aim. As these issues are addressed in this book, both the central character and the omniscient narrator are distanced from the reader and their

perceptions rendered doubtful and unreliable. The reader is left to infer the implications of events and even what events have taken place.

In a world in which there can be no reliance on constructs of society and in which families inevitably ultimately exclude the outsider, hope seems unavailable. But occasionally within these families can be found individuals who will provide loyal support, as Ann does. And refuge can be found in a single same sex relationship, spiritual rather than physical, founded on shared sensitivities and ideas. It is through Danny that Ann's final visit is arranged. It is he who goes forward to confess to the murder himself and is prepared to die as a sacrifice in Kif's place. The book with Heraclitus in it that Kif borrowed from Danny would be likely to suggest, to the contemporary reader of the novel, the poem addressed to that philosopher rather than his own work. It was translated in a well-known version by the Victorian poet William Cory:

> "They told me, Heraclitus, they told me you were dead,
> They brought me bitter news to hear and bitter tears to shed.
> I wept as I remembered how often you and I
> Had tired the sun with talking and sent him down the sky."

This obviously foreshadows the death of Kif. It is a reminder, too, of the happy hours he and Danny had spent in discussion. The second stanza ends

> "Still are thy pleasant voices, thy nightingales awake,
> For death, he taketh all away, but these he cannot take."

The suggestion seems to be that what remains of Kif at the end is the memories he leaves behind with those who loved him, especially Danny with whom he finally achieved a fulfilling relationship. The bleak world-view that seemingly was offered by the book is in this way finally tempered and the "damn fool life" that Kif berated on the first page allowed to hold the possibility of having some meaning.

The topics tackled in Kif are those which run through Tey's work from the beginning to the end. The writing is adventurous in its refusal of clear categories and use of a self-regarding narrator. Yet the book fails to engage me in the way The Man in the Queue does. The key to this difference in the appeal of the two books seems to me to lie in the contrast between the two central characters. They

may be alike in their instability of identity and their lack of family and friends. Yet Grant, as a Golden Age detective, is endowed with financial and professional security, and, further radiates a personal charm quite lacking in the character of Kif. Tey never produced another mainstream novel along the lines of this first one, through the creation, two decades later, of the rootless fraudster Brat Farrar, owes much to this earlier character. The much greater success enjoyed by her first detective novel, I conclude, planted the idea that further work in that genre would be likely to afford her books the expression she sought in the development of the character of Grant himself.

# Appendix B2

## The Privateer

After discussing Claverhouse, it seems appropriate to consider briefly Tey's fictionalised biography of Henry Morgan, the seventeenth century Welsh buccaneer, whose image is familiar to us today as a figure on labels of bottles of Morgan's rum. His spectacular and triumphant expeditions against Spanish possessions in the West Indies defined him as either a lawless pirate or a licensed privateer whose aggressive activities were sanctioned by authority, according to one's point of view. From that of the defeated Spanish, the distinction is meaningless. As always in Tey's historical work, the account is underpinned by meticulous, detailed research. Once again, it seems, she finds her chosen protagonist to be admirable. At the close of the book, Morgan's success is rewarded by a knighthood from Charles II and appointment as Lieutenant-Governor of Jamaica. That this narrative was published in the year of Tey's death, along with her last detective novel, which, I argue later in this thesis, completes Grant's story, suggests that it was important for her to write it to round off her unconventional career as an interpreter of the past. That the copy in my hands comes from a third printing issued in 1963 shows that it sold well.

Some affinities with Claverhouse are obvious. Set in the seventeenth century against a background of religious conflict, it centres on a man of action and apparent goodwill who has been misrepresented as acting outside the law. Both Roy and Talburt praise this book. For Talburt it rates as "her best non-mystery novel" (p. 46). Unsurprisingly, in terms of technical accomplishment, it does outshine the early Kif and The Expensive Halo. Roy finds it "compelling and readable", suggests it should be reissued and that "of all the work written under either the Daviot or Tey names, this one would most easily translate into film" (p. 43). This last claim may be well-founded but, for me, Kif and Claverhouse, despite their flaws, are interesting texts, while The Privateer, with its unreflective and self-obsessed central character making repeated successful attacks on ship after ship

belonging to the Spanish, whose villainy is taken for granted, is almost impossible to read unless interpreted as a deeply ironic narrative. A filmed version, I suggest, would depend for its success on the exotic and colourful background and on special effects showing ships on fire and sinking, and might appeal to an audience of adolescent males. In its lack of subtlety it would be insulting to the adult intelligence. Roy, praising the work, uses the words "in the best romantic tradition" and "swashbuckling" (p. 43). Surely, this cannot be a style a sophisticated writer like Tey would adopt casually. Even her admired man of action and inspiring leader, Claverhouse, suffered melancholy and loneliness. Not one of her other thoughtful and self-questioning protagonists has so much as a hint of swash and buckle about them. To this should be added the evidence Gielgud gives that she was strongly affected by war. "She spoke very bitterly of the First World War in which I fancy she must have suffered some bereavement" and "she was depressed and unhappy when I met her while I was touring in Edinburgh during 1942" (p. x). In Richard of Bordeaux, too, one of the King's most appealing virtues is his opposition to his warmongering nobles. Surely this narrative, which Tey struggled to write in the closing months of her life, cannot be accepted without question as a straightforwardly written story of aggression, battle and exploitation.

There are, of course, typical Tey motifs. When we first meet him, Morgan, although of good family background, is a bondsman accepting his release, to whom the sea represents "freedom made tangible and manifest" (p. 8). On the next page, he stirs himself into action, expressing his conviction that "there was nothing a man could not do if he was young and free" (p. 9). There is no question here, apparently, of a young woman being free and self-assertive. In the context of my discussion of her text's analysis of gender issues, I find that this book responds to being read as Tey's final, devastating critique of masculinity.

The reviews quoted by Roy assume that the narrative succeeds as a rattling good yarn, and she herself claims that Tey "scrupulously polishes her hero into a gentleman" (p. 43). That Tey is firmly in the business of rehabilitating her central figure here, as she did in her studies of Claverhouse and Richard III, is not questioned. Yet Morgan is pictured as sexist to the point of inhumanity, treating his

concubines contemptuously and unable to communicate in any way with those other women who cross his path socially, because "he had the feeling that not one of them really knew who he was" (p. 241). He himself has no interest in women as individuals. On gaining his freedom, he attempts to leave both the estate and the woman he associates with there without so much as a farewell. Distraught at being abandoned without as much as a backward glance, she pursues him and watches his retreating figure until she can see him no longer. The narrator's voice is male, unsympathetic to her plight, and refers her surely sincere and justifiable distress as infantile "pouting" (p. 7). Later in the text, Morgan acquires what Roy terms "a believable, honest wife" (p. 44), to whom, she assumes, he relates well. Yet it is clear that his treatment of her is equally shabby and she, too, must accept his heartless disappearance from her life. Further, it is taken for granted that she will, loyally, assume total responsibility for overseeing his plantation in difficult and dangerous times when she must sleep with a pistol on her pillow. Neither Morgan nor the narrator considers awarding this woman the "freedom" to be her own person they both value so highly. We are told with what I interpret as savage irony that "in his more idle moments Henry had the grace to worry about the thing he was proposing to do to her" (p. 168), but that "he had no time to brood on this problem" (p. 169). It is his wife's friend, comforting her, who comments that "presently you will have children to love, and it will not matter one little bit to you that the silly creature must needs be off after his guns and his glory" (p. 169), providing, I suggest, this text's verdict on masculinity. His wife and home do not appear in the text again. The question of whether or not she is pregnant is left open, as it was when he abandoned the first woman. What is clear is that Morgan, in his chilling selfishness, is determined to accept no responsibility for their predicament.

Meanwhile, he prides himself on his mannerliness in public to women of his own class and even, generously, to those of a lower class he considers to be "respectable" (p. 154). The familiar double standard applies. The fine gentlemen of his acquaintance frequent brothels at will. For Henry's own comfort, he has a male disciple who is his constant companion, an "Indian boy... enchanted by clothes and all that pertained to them" who nurtures "a major passion" for Henry (p. 124), "the reason for his existence" (p. 125). It was Henry in person who inflicted the

pain of branding him as a slave, which he bore bravely. As always in Tey's writing, her protagonist's sexuality is, at the least, problematic.

Some explanation of Morgan's failure to mature emotionally and his resulting callous behaviour is offered in references to his search for a father in his seeking out of the reassuring company of older men. This search is caused by the suffering inherent in an upbringing in a repressive religious atmosphere. Noticing with a pang the good relationship enjoyed between a loving father and his son, Morgan reflects that "if my father had been a Royalist instead of a damned Puritan, it might have been like that" (p. 15). In the last lines of the book, it is an older male colleague with whom he looks forward to being united in Jamaica, while the possibility of returning to his wife does not enter his thoughts.

He is presented as not only psychologically damaged and sexist, but as racist, too. Playing delightedly with black infants who "rolled at his feet in the dust", he reminds himself that "enchanting black babies grew up to be stupid and unreliable adults of uncontrolled imagination and invincible laziness" (p. 10), an attitude common in Britain at the time Tey was writing. This idea has the stiffening effect of "recalling him to his own purposes" (p. 10). This attitude is underlined by the emphasis in the text on Englishness as a benchmark of worth and virtue, along with the vilification of all things Spanish. Yet the narrative betrays, seemingly despite itself, knowledge of what the native people of the islands are suffering. "The victorious English amused themselves after the immemorial habit of invaders: they drank, wenched, stole... imitated their partners in the local dances" (p. 154). This is apart from the activities of the "criminal tenth" who were apparently doing things far worse. Murdering, perhaps? The people who have been killed in war, "merely some of the Spanish soldiery" (p. 155), are not mourned. Further, Henry, to his surprise, is able to glean much accurate and useful information from the devoted slave he patronises, who tells him "Indian know everything" (p. 183). Despite the black boy's devotion and assistance, Morgan is not prepared to be seen in public with him until "since 'black boys' were beginning to be the rage, [he] was allowed to walk at Morgan's heel" (p. 239). This text puts forward ideas about the injustices and evils of colonialism far ahead of its time. In doing so it echoes the

ideas expressed in her detective novels, where in A Shilling for Candles and To Love and Be Wise, the texts are sympathetic to colonised peoples faced with either imperial powers or village invaders. It is significant that the Welsh Morgan, unlike Grant in his last appearance, relinquishes any notion of returning from London to revisit the landscape of his native country, which remains for him "small and clear and faraway, like something in the wrong end of the telescope" (p. 252). The blinkered narrator of Kif speaks again, in more subtle and sophisticated tones, insisting on the superiority of everything pertaining to the south of England. It is shown to be vital to Grant's psychological health, I argue in Section III, that he returns to his family home and acknowledges his own Scottish identity. That Morgan refuses his Welsh one in a book written contemporaneously with The Singing Sands is surely a bad sign for the character's standing and future.

Roy's assertion that Tey "polishes her hero into a gentleman" is surely in doubt. Her narrator attempts it ironically, revealing in the process that this representative of successful, worldly manhood, a so called gentleman, acts as the embodiment of the prejudices and injustices of society. As a human being, he is dependent on the energies and insights of the women and local people he despises and ill-treats. Damaged, inadequate and brutal, he is seen to fail. The approving, surely male, voice which tells his story is telling an outwardly acceptable narrative about a man of action, operating in an exclusively male world. I find that this final historical and biographical book works only as satire, breaking new ground once again in 1952 by anticipating the insights of feminist and colonial theorists decades later. This interpretation is surely consistent with those I have drawn from her other works, biography, detective novels and plays. The use of the name Burgoyne for the character who saves an innocent victim in A Shilling for Candles, which I discuss in Section III, is surely involved here. The subject matter of The Privateer, of course, draws heavily on the tradition of Scottish literature. I at first thought it merely repeated pirate episodes important in the work of Scott, Stevenson and Barrie while lacking the depth of historical comment, psychological inquiry and sense of horror present in the earlier work. I suggest now that it draws heavily on the even older tradition of satire and ambiguity in Scottish writing, stretching back to Dunbar and the ballads.

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

## A. Texts by Tey/Daviot

### (i) *Josephine Tey/Gordon Daviot Fiction*

(*D*) indicates first published as Daviot


A Shilling for Candles ((New York: Collier, 1988; first published by Methuen, London, 1936).

Bratt Farrar (London: Mandarin Books, 1993; first published by Heinemannn, London, 1949).

Claverhouse, Collins, Glasgow & London, 1937). (*D*)

Kif, An Unvarnished History (London: Peter Davies, 1967; first published by Benn, London, 1929). (*D*)

Miss Pym Disposes (London: Penguin, 1983; first published by Peter Davies, London, 1946).

The Daughter of Time (London: Penguin, 1954; first published by Peter Davies, London, 1951).

The Expensive Halo (London: Sphere Books, 1969; first published by Benn, London, 1931). (*D*)

The Franchise Affair (London: Penguin, 1951; first published London, 1948).

The Man in the Queue (London: Penguin, 1978; first published by Methuen, London, 1929). (*D*)

The Privateer (London: Peter Davies, 1963; first published 1952). (*D*)

The Singing Sands (London: Penguin, 1977; first published Peter Davies, London, 1952).

To Love and Be Wise (London: Penguin, 1978; first published Peter Davies, London, 1950).


### (ii) *Gordon Daviot Plays* (Quoted from Roy, 1980)


'The Balwhinnie Bomb', in Plays of Gordon Daviot, Vol. 2, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'Barnharrow', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 3, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'Clarion Call', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth, 1946).

'Cornelia', in Plays of Gordon Daviot, Vol. 2, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'Dickon', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 1, pp. 155-201, (London: Peter Davies, 1953).

'Lady Charing is Cross', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 3, (London: PeterDavies, 1954).

'The Laughing Woman', in Famous Plays of 1933-1934, pp. 369-471, (London: Gollancz, 1934).

'Leith Sands', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth,1946).

'The Little Dry Thorn', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 1, pp. 1-74, (London: Peter Davies, 1953).

'The Mother of Masé', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth, 1946).

'Mrs. Fry Has a Visitor', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth, 1946).

'Patria', in Plays of Gordon Daviot, Vol. 2, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'The Pen of my Aunt', in Plays of Gordon Daviot, Vol. 2, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

Plays by Gordon Daviot, 3 vols, (London: Peter Davies, 1953-1954).

'The Pomp of Mr. Pomfret', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 2, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'The Princess Who Liked Cherry Pie', in Plays of Gordon Daviot, Vol. 2, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'Queen of Scots', (London: Gollancz, 1934).

'Rahab', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth, 1946).

'Reckoning', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 3, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'Remember Caesar', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth, 1946).

'Richard of Bordeaux', in Famous Plays of 1933, pp. 137-256, (London: Gollancz, 1933).

'Sara', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth, 1946).

'The Staff Room', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 3, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

The Stars Bow Down, (London: Duckworth, 1939).

'Sweet Coz', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 3, (London: Peter Davies, 1954).

'Three Mrs. Madderleys', in Leith Sands and Other Short Plays, (London: Duckworth 1946).

'Valerius', in Plays by Gordon Daviot, Vol. 1, pp. 75-154, (London: Peter Davies, 1953).

## B. Critical works on Tey

'Josephine Tey', in Twentieth Century Literary Criticism, vol. 14 (Gayle Research Corporation, Inc).

MacDonald, Mairi A., 'The Enigma of Gordon Daviot', in By the Banks of the Ness, (Paul Harris, 1982).

Morris, Virginia, 'British Mystery Writers, 1920-1939', in The Dictionary of Literary Biography Vol. 77, B. Benstock and F. Staley (eds.) (Detroit: Gale Research, 1989).

Roy, Sandra, Josephine Tey, (Boston: Twayne, 1981).

Talburt, Nancy, 'Josephine Tey', in 10 Women of Mystery, ed. Earl F. Bargainneer, (Bowling Green, Ohio: Bowling Green State University Popular Press, 1981), pp. 43-76.

'The Elusive Josep;hine Tey' in *Murder and Mayhem*, Vol. 1, Issue 2 (Personally owned reprint- author and date not known).

## C. Other texts cited

Abrams, M.H., The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and the Critical Tradition, (Norton, 1958; first published by Oxford University Press, 1953).

Alcott, Louisa M., Little Women, (First published by Roberts Bros., Boston 1868).

Anderson, Carol and Aileen Christianson (eds.), Scottish Women's Fiction 1920's to 1960's: Journeys into Being (East Linton: The Tuckwell Press 2000).

Anderson, Benedict, Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism, (London: Verso, 1983; reprinted 1991).

Bakhtin, Mikhail, 'From the Prehistory of Novelistic Discourse', (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981; first published 1961)

Barthes, Roland, 'The Death of the Author' (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1968), quoted by David Lodge, in Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader, (London: Longmans, fifth impression 1991).

Barthes, Roland, S/Z, (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1970).

Barthes, Roland, Le Plaisir du Texte, (Paris: Éditions du Seuil 1973).

Belsey, Catherine, 'Constructing the Subject, Deconstructing the Text', in Feminisms: an anthology of literary theory and criticisms ed. Robyn R. Warhol and Diane Price Herndl, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1991).

Belsey, 'Catherine, Literature, History, Politics', in Lodge, 1988, p. 399 (reprinted from the journal *Literature and History*,1983).

Benstock, Shari, "Authorizing the Autobiographical" in The Private Self: Theory and Practice of Women's Autobiographical Writing (1988), ed.Shari Benstock (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1988).

Blair, Robert, The Grave. A Poem, (Edinburgh, 1743).

Blake, William, Songs of Innocence (First published 1789; facsimile published by the Trianon Press for the William Blake Trust: London, 1954).

Blake, William, The Book of Thel, (First published 1789).

Blake, William, Jerusalem. The Emanation of the Giant Albion, (London, 1804).

Booth, Wayne, The Rhetoric of Fiction, (Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, 1961).

Boswell, James, The Life of Samuel Johnson LL.D., vol 1., (Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, 1952; first published London, Printed by H. Baldwin for C. Dilly, 1791).

Browning, Elizabeth Barrett, Aurora Leigh and other Poems, (London: The Women's Press, 1993; first published 1857).

Buchan, John, The Thirty-Nine Steps, (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1915).

Buchan, John, Sick Heart River (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1941).

Burgess, Moira, in the Other voice: Scottish Women's writing since 1808, ed. M. Burgess (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1987).

Butler, Samuel, The Way of All Flesh (London: Grant Richards, 1903).

Carroll, Lewis, Alice's Adventures in Wonderland, (First published by Macmillan, London, 1865).

Carroll, Lewis, Through the Looking Glass, (First published 1872).

Carruthers, Gerard, 'The Construction of the Scottish Critical Tradition' in Odd Alliances, N. MacMillan & K. Stirling eds. (Glasgow: Cruithne Press, 1999).

Carswell, Catherine, The Camomile, (London: Virago, 1987; first published by Chatto & Windus, London, 1922).

Carswell, Catherine, The Life of Robert Burns, (London: Chatto & Windus, 1951; first published by Chatto & Windus, London, 1930).

Carswell, Catherine, Open the Door!, (London: Virago, 1986; first published in London by Andrew Melrose, 1920).

Carswell, Catherine, The Savage Pilgrimage: A narrative of D.H. Lawrence (London: Chatto & Windus, 1932).

Carswell, Catherine, The Tranquil Heart- Portrait of Giovanni Boccaccio (London: Lawrence & Wishart, 1937).

Carswell, Catherine, Lying Awake: An Unfinished Autobiography, and Other Posthumous Papers, ed. John Carswell, (Edinburgh: Canongate Press, 1997; first published by Secker and Warburg, London, 1950).

Carswell, John, 'Remembering Catherine Carswell' in Opening the Doors: The Achievement of Catherine Carswell, (Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press, 2001).

Carswell, John, in The Savage Pilgrimage by C. Carswell, p. viii.

Cixous, Hélène, 'Sorties', in La Jeune Née (1975). In Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader, D. Lodge ed. (Harlow: Longman,1988).

Cixous, Hélène, 'The Laugh of the Medusa' (1975), in Feminisms: an anthology of literary theory and criticisms, Robyn R. Warhol and Diane Price Herndl eds. (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press), p. 334-349.

Cockburn, Henry, Lord, Circuit Journeys by the Late Lord Cockburn (Edinburgh: D. Douglas, 1888).

Cockburn, Henry, Lord, Life of Lord Jeffrey (2 vols.) (Black: 1852).

Cockburn, Henry, Lord, Journal of Henry Cockburn, being a continuation of the 'Memorials of his time', 1831-44 (2 vols.) (Edmonston and Douglas., 1874).

Cockburn, Henry, Lord, Memorials of his Time (Facsimile Edition Edinburgh: James Thin, 1971; first published 1856).

Cory, William, 'Heraclitus', in Rhymes after Horace- Six Verse Translations (Edinburgh: Tragara Press, 1982).

Coventry, Martin, The Castles of Scotland (Musselburgh, Goblinshead, 2001).

Craig, Cairns ed., History of Scottish Literature (Aberdeen: The University Press, 1987).

Craig, David, Scottish Literature and the Scottish People, 1630-1830 (London: Chatto and Windus, 1961).

Cross, Amanda, Writing a Woman's Life, (New York: Ballantine Books, 1988), p. 116.

Cuddon, J.A., Dictionary of Literary Terms and Literary Theory (London: Penguin, 1992; first published London: Deutsch 1977).

de la Torre, Lilian, Elizabeth is Missing (London: Joseph, 1947).

Daiches, David, The Paradox of Scottish Culture: The Eighteenth Century Experience (London: Oxford University Press1964).

Devine, Tom M., The Scottish Nation, (London: Penguin, 1999).

Dexter, Colin, The Wench is Dead (London: Macmillan, 1989).

Doyle, Arthur Conan, 'The Man With the Twisted Lip, (1891)', rep. in Sherlock Holmes: the Major Stories with Contemporary Critical Essays, John A. Hodgson ed. (Boston: St. Martin's Press, 1994), p. 112-232.

Doyle, Arthur Conan, 'The Red-headed League' (1891), rep. in Sherlock Holmes: the Major Stories with Contemporary Critical Essays, John A. Hodgson ed. (Boston: St. Martin's Press, 1994), p. 53-73.

Doyle Conan, Arthur, 'Charles Augustus Milverton' (1904), rep. in Sherlock Holmes: the Major Stories with Contemporary Critical Essays, John A. Hodgson ed. (Boston: St. Martin's Press, 1994), p. 272-286.

Drabble, Margaret, The Oxford Companion to English Literature (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985).

Dunn, Douglas ed., Faber Book of Twentieth Century Scottish Poetry (London: Faber and Faber, 1992).

Eco, Umberto, 'Casablanca: Cult Movies and Intertextual Collage' (1984), in Faith in Fakes (London: Martin, Secker and Warburg, 1986) p. 199.

Elphinstone, Margaret, 'The Quest: Two Contemporary Adventures', in Whyte, p. 107.

Elphinstone, Margaret, 'The Dangerous Subject of the Woman Writer: Two Texts about The Self by Margaret Oliphant', to be published.

Elphinstone, Margaret, 'Four Pioneering Novels', in *Chapman* 74-75: Women's Forum, (1993), p. 27.

Elphinstone, Margaret, 'Willa Muir: Crossing the Genres', in Gifford and McMillan, p. 400.

Faulkner, Peter, Modernism, (London: Methuen, 1977; reprinted London: Routledge, 1993).

Forster, E. M., Maurice: A Novel, (Arnold, 1971).

Galt, John, Annals of the Parish (London: Nelson, 1956; first published Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1841).

Galt, John, Ringan Gilhaize, (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1995).

Garber, Marjorie, Vested Interests: Cross Dressing and Cultural Anxiety, Penguin Books, London, 1993, p. 407, first published Routledge, London 1992.

Gibson, John Sibbald, Deacon Brodie: Father to Jekyll and Hyde, (Edinburgh: Saltire Society, 1993; first published 1977).

Gielgud, John, Foreword to Plays by Gordon Daviot (London: Peter Davies, 1953), p. x.

Gifford, Douglas and Dorothy McMillan eds., A History of Scottish Women's Writing (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997).

Gilbert, Sandra M. and Susan Gubar, 'Milton's Bogey: Patriarchal Poetry and Women Readers', in The Madwoman in the Attic (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1979), pp. 187-212.

Goring, Rosemary ed., Scottish Biographical Dictionary, (Edinburgh: Chambers, 1992).

Grant, Elizabeth, Memoirs of a Highland Lady (Posthumously, John Murray, 1898).

Grassic Gibbon, Lewis, A Scots Quair (London: Pan Books, 1982; full collection first published 1932).

Gregory Smith, George, Scottish Literature, Character and Influence (London: Macmillan, 1919).

Grieve, Christopher Murray (Hugh MacDiarmid), 'A Drunk Man Looks at the Thistle,' in Complete Poems 1920-1976, M. Grieve and W.R. Aitken eds. (London: Martin Brian, 1985; poem first published 1927).

Hall, Radclyffe, The Well of Loneliness (Garden City, NY: Sun Dial Press, 1928).

Hart, Francis Russell, The Scottish Novel: From Smollett to Spark (London: John Murray, 1978).

Harvie, Christopher, Scotland and Nationalism, Scottish Society and Politics 1707, (London: Routledge, 1994; first published by Allen & Unwin, 1977).

Heilbrun, Carolyn G., Writing a Woman's Life, (New York: Ballantine Books, 1988).

Hendry, Joy, 'The Double Knot in the Peeny', in In Other Words: Writing as a Feminist, Gail Chester and Sigrid Neilson eds. (London: Hutchinson, 1987).

Hitchcock, Alfred, Young and Innocent (Film), (1937).

Hogg, James, The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner (Oxford: Oxford University Press,1969, repr. 1991; first published in London by Longman, 1824).

Hogg, James, Domestic Matters and Private Life of Sir Walter Scott (Edinburgh: J. Grant, 1936; first published 1834).

Hook, Andrew, From Goosegreen to Gandercleugh, Studies in Scottish-American Literary and Cultural History (East Linton: Tuckwell, 1999).

Hyde, H. Montgomery, Norman Birkett: The Life of Lord Birkett of Ulverston, (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1964) p. 257.

Innes, Michael, Death at the President's Lodging (London: Gollancz, 1936).

Innes, Thomas, A Critical Essay on the Ancient Inhabitants of the Northern Parts of Britain or Scotland, containing an account of the Romans, Britains, Picts, and particularly of the Scots, etc. (London: 1729).

Innes, Thomas, The Civil and Ecclesiastical History of Scotland MDLXXX-MDCCCXVIII, G. Grub ed. (Aberdeen: Aberdeen Spalding Club, 1853).

James, Henry, in Preface to The Ambassadors (1903) (quoted in Lodge (1972), p. 51).

Kelman, James, How Late it Was, How Late, (London: Secker & Warburg, 1994).

Kipling, Rudyard, Kim, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987; first published by Macmillan & Co., 1901).

Knight, Stephen, 'The Case of the Great Detective' (1981), in Sherlock Holmes, the Major Stories with Contemporary Critical Essays, ed. Hodgson, (London: Macmillan, 1994).

Kristeva, Julia , 'Word, Dialogue and Novel', in The Kristeva Reader, ed. Toril Moi, (Basil Blackwell, London, 1986) pp. 34-61.

Lawrence, D.H., Lady Chatterley's Lover, (Heinneman, 1960; first published in a private printing, Florence, 1928).

Lawrence, D.H., The Rainbow, (London: Heinneman, 1971; first published by Methuen & Co., London, 1915).

Lawrence, D.H., Women in Love (New York: privately printed for subscribers only, 1920; London: Martin Secker, 1921).

Leavis, F.R., The Great Tradition: George Eliot, Henry James, Joseph Conrad, (London: Penguin Books, 1962; first published by Chatto and Windus, London, 1948).

Lightwood, Joan, The Park School, 1880-1980 (Glasgow: privately published, 1980), p. 39.

Linklater, Magnus and Christian Hesketh, Bonnie Dundee: for King and Conscience, (Edinburgh: Canongate Press, 1989, reprinted 1992).

Lochhead, Liz, Men Talk, in True Confessions and New Clichés, (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1985).

Lockhart, J.G, Life of Robert Burns (Dent: 1907; first published 1828).

Lockhart, J.G, Memoirs of the Life of Sir Walter Scott (London: Adam and Charles Black, 1896; first published 1836).

Lodge, David ed., Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader (London: Longmans, fifth impression 1991).

Lodge, David ed., 20th Century Literary Criticism: A Reader, (London: Longman, 1990; first published 1972).

Macintyre, Duncan Ban, 'The Anathema of the Breeks', in The Songs of Duncan Ban Macintyre (Oliver and Boyd, 1952).

Maclean, Charles, The Clan Almanac, (Moffat: Lochar Publishing, 1990), p. 36.

Martin, Christina, 'Josephine Tey: A Scottish Detective Novelist', in *Studies in Scottish Literature*, Volume XXIX, pp. 191-204, ed. G. Ross Roy, (University of South Carolina, Columbia, South Carolina, 1997).

McCrone, Guy, Wax Fruit (London: Constable, 1947).

McMillan, Dorothy ed., The Scotswoman at Home and Abroad: Non-Fiction Writing 1700-1900 (Glasgow : Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 1999).

Mitchell, Gladys, Laurels are Poison (London: Michael Joseph, 1942).

Morris, Virginia, 'Josephine Tey (Elizabeth Mackintosh, Gordon Daviot)', in Dictionary Of Literary Biography, vol. 77.

Muir, Edwin, Scott and Scotland: the predicament of the Scottish writer (Edinburgh: Polygon, 1982; first published in London by G. Routledge & Sons, 1936).

Muir, Willa, Belonging: A Memoir (Hogarth Press, 1968).

Muir, Willa, Imagined Corners (Edinburgh: Canongate Press, 1987; first published by Martin Secker, London, 1931).

Munt, Sally, Murder by the Book? Feminism and the Crime Novel (London and New York: Routledge, 1994).

Norquay, Glenda, 'Catherine Carswell: Open the Door!', in Gifford and Macmillan, p. 389.

O'Farrell, Maggie, After You'd Gone, (London: Viking Penguin, 2001; first published 2000).

Paisley, Janet, in *The Scottish Review*, K. Roy ed., Carrick Media, Irvine, December 2000.

Poe, Edgar Allan, 'The Facts in the Case of Monsieur Valdemar', in The Complete Tales and Poems of Edgar Allan Poe (New York: Random House; this tale first published in London by Short & Co., 1846).

Power, William, The World Unvisited: Essays and Sketches, (Glasgow & London: Gowans and Gray, 1920).

Rabelais, Francois, Les Grandes et Inestimable Cronicqs: du Grand et Énorme Geant Gargantua, Pêre de Pãtagruel, Book1, Chapter 5 (first published c. 1532).

Rich, Adrienne, 'Vesuvius at Home: The Power of Emily Dickinson' in her On Lies, Secrets and Silence: Selected Prose (New York: W.W. Norton, 1979).

Rimmon-Kenan, Shlomith, Narrative Fiction: contemporary poetics (London: Methuen, 1983), p. 94.

Roughead, William (ed.), The Trial of Oscar Slater (Edinburgh & London: William Hodge, 1950, 4th ed.; first published 1910, revised 1929).

Said, Edward W., Orientalism (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1978),

Scarlett, James D., The Tartans of the Scottish Clans, (Collins, Glasgow and London, 1975).

Schweichart, Patrocino P., "Reading Ourselves: toward a feminist theory of reading" in Warhol and Hendl, pp. 525. First published in her Gender and Reading: Essays on Readers, Texts and Contents, ed. Elizabeth A. Flynn and Patrocino P. Schweichart (Baltimore, Johns Hopkins U.P. 1986).

Scott, Alexander, 'A Rondel of Luve', Stanza 2, from The Bannatyne Manuscript, compiled by G. Bannatyne (1568) and held in the Advocates' Library Edinburgh, in The Poems of Alexander Scott (London: 1902).

Scott, Walter, Guy Mannering, Edinburgh: Printed by James Bannatyne for Longman, London (1815).

Scott, Walter, Kenilworth, a Romance (Dent, 1959; first published in Edinburgh by Constable and also Ballantyne and in London by Hurst, Robinson & Co., 1821).

Scott, Walter, Old Mortality London: Penguin Books, 1975; first published 1816).

Scott, Walter, Redgauntlet, Waverley Novels, Centenary Edition Vol. XVIII (Edinburgh: Adam and Charles Black, 1887, p. 112.)

Shakespeare, William, 'As (You Like It', in The Complete Works of Shakespeare, P. Alexander ed. (London and Glasgow: Collins 1951, 26th reprint 1989; play first published c.1599).

Shakespeare, William, 'Hamlet', in The Complete Works of Shakespeare, P. Alexander ed. (London and Glasgow: Collins 1951, 26th reprint 1989; play first published c.1604).

Shakespeare, William, 'Macbeth', in The Complete Works of Shakespeare, P. Alexander ed. (London and Glasgow: Collins 1951, 26th reprint 1989; play first published c.1606).

Shakespeare, William, 'Richard II', in The Complete Works of Shakespeare, P. Alexander ed. (London and Glasgow: Collins 1951, 26th reprint 1989; play first published 1595).

Shakespeare, William, 'Troilus and Cressida', in The Complete Works of Shakespeare, P. Alexander ed. (London and Glasgow: Collins 1951, 26th reprint 1989; play first published 1609), Act 3, Sc. 2, l.85.

Shepherd, Nan, 'A Pass in the Grampians', in The Grampian Quartet (Edinburgh: Canongate Press, 1996; first published by Constable, 1933).

Shepherd, Nan, 'The Quarry Wood', in The Grampian Quartet (Edinburgh: Canongate Press, 1996; first published by Constable, 1928).

Simpson, Kenneth, The Protean Scot (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1988).

Smith, Alison, 'And Woman created Woman', in Gendering the Nation: Studies in Modern Scottish Literature, C. Whyte, ed. (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995), pp. 25-47.

Smith, Janet Adam, John Buchan and his World (London: Thames and Hudson, 1979), p. 77.

Smith, Sidonie, A poetics of women's autobiography : marginality and the fictions of self-representation, (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1987).

Smollett, Tobias, The Expedition of Humphry Clinker (London: Penguin, 1985; first published 1771).

Spark, Muriel, Curriculum Vitae: Autobiography (London: Constable, 1992).

Spark, Muriel, The Comforters (London: Macmillan, 1957).

Stevenson, Robert Louis, Catriona, (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1995; first published in London by Cassell, 1893).

Stevenson, Robert Louis, Kidnapped, (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1995; first published in London, 1886).

Stevenson, Robert Louis, The Strange Case of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde (London: Longmans & Co., 1886).

Stewart, Mary, The Ivy Tree (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1964; first published 1961).

Summerscale, Kate, The Queen of Whale Cay (London: Fourth Estate, 1997).

Symons, Julian, Bloody Murder (London: Pan Books, 1994; first published Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 197).

Thomas à Kempis, De Imitatione Christi, Book1, Chapter19, Sect.2.

Todorov, Tzvetan, 'The Typology of Detective Fiction' from The Poetics of Prose (1966) , quoted in Modern Criticism and Theory ed. David Lodge (First published in Paris by Éditions du Seuil, 1971).

Toughill, Thomas, Oscar Slater, The Mystery Solved (Edinburgh: Canongate Press, 1993).

Twentieth Century Authors (Gayle Research Corporation, Chicago, IL, 1954), pp. 620-1.

Tytler, Sara, St. Mungo's City (London: Chatto and Windus, 1986).

Urquhart, Thomas, 'The Life and Death of the Admirable Crichtoun', from the original text of Discovery of a Most Exquisite Jewel (1652), (Paris: The Pleiad, 1927).

Walker, Marshall, Scottish Literature since 1707 (Harlow: Addison Wesley Longman, 1996).

Warhol, Robyn R. and Herndl, Diane P., eds., Feminisms: an anthology of literary theory and criticisms, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1991).

Watson, Colin, Snobbery with Violence, Crime Stories and their Audience (Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1971).

Whyte, Christopher, Introduction to Gendering the Nation: Studies in Modern Scottish Literature, C. Whyte, ed. (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995).

Whittington-Egan, Richard, The Oscar Slater Murder Story: New Light on a Classic Miscarriage of Justice (Glasgow: Neil Wilson Publishing Ltd. 2001).

Woolf, Virginia, 'Modern Fiction', in The Common Reader (London: 1919).

Woolf, Virginia, Orlando: A Biography (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992; first published in London by Hogarth, 1928).

Zimmerman, Bonnie, 'What Has Never Been, an overview of lesbian feminist literary criticism', in Feminisms: an anthology of literary theory and criticisms, Robyn R. Warhol and Diane Price Herndl eds. (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press), p. 117-137.