University of Strathclyde

School of Education

Internationalising Teacher Education in China and Scotland

Huaping Li

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

2018

In memory of my grandparents, Mr. Zongli Li and Mrs. Mixiang Ji, who raised me and shaped the person I am today

Declaration of authenticity and author's rights

This thesis is the result of the author's original research. It has been composed by the author and has not been previously submitted for examination which has led to the award of a degree.

The copyright of this thesis belongs to the author under the terms of the United Kingdom Copyright Acts as qualified by University of Strathclyde Regulation 3.50. Due acknowledgement must always be made of the use of any material contained in, or derived from, this thesis.

Signed: ………………………..……………………..

Date: ………………………..……………………..

Acknowledgements

Numerous people deserve recognition for the help and support given to me during the writing of this thesis. I must begin my acknowledgments by thanking my supervisors. My research would not have been possible without the unfailing support, constructive feedback and constant encouragement of my principal supervisor, Professor Ninetta Santoro. Her wealth of expertise about, and passion for, this research area, deeply inspired me, and provided me with a strong foundation of knowledge, which kept me on track throughout this wonderful research journey. It was her immense patience and care which helped me through tough times, particularly the loss of my grandparents, and which allowed me to grow as a researcher. I also owe a great debt to my co-supervisor, Associate Professor Cristina Costa, for her guidance, time and support. Her questioning mind and helpful criticism guided my thinking and writing during the research process.

I am extremely grateful, firstly to the staff at both research sites for their help in gaining access to potential participants, and secondly to my participants themselves, who, despite their tight schedules, gave up valuable time to take part in my study. This study would have been impossible without their contribution.

My sincere thanks also go to David Roxburgh, Dr. Claire Cassidy, and Emeritus Professor Donald Christie, for their willingness to discuss my research and expose my work to a wider academic community. Talks with them, and the advice they shared, gave me the strength and confidence needed to bring this study to completion. I am also grateful to Dr. Sharon Jessop, Dr. David Lewin, Dr. Paul Adams, and Dr. Alan Huang for their kindness and encouragement. Many thanks are also extended to my reviewer, Dr. Edward Sosu. His time and support is deeply appreciated. I am also deeply thankful to Professor Cheng Wu, who has helped and encouraged me toward the achievement of several milestones in my life, despite my graduating as his Masters student many years ago. My heartfelt gratitude also goes

to my examiners, Professor Yvette Taylor and Dr. Jae Major, who helped improve my thesis through their constructive and encouraging suggestions.

I must also thank the staff at the University of Strathclyde, particularly those within the School of Education and the HaSS Graduate School, for helping to foster a supportive learning community. I would also like to extend my thanks and love to my friends David Rush, Ronnie (Ronald) Torrance, Melissa Reid, James Davies, Stefania Pigliapoco, Miles Beard, Gigi Hassan, Wei Shen, Yuwei Xu, Yun Yu, and Guoqiang Wu for sharing in the many moments of happiness – and stress – that have occurred during my academic journey. In particular, having David as a wonderful friend in my life has been such a blessing, as he has never left my side when I am most in need. His constant help, encouragement and support have given me the strength and confidence to continue with my research. I also owe many thanks to Ronnie for being so helpful, and for cheering me up whenever he is around.

Finally, I would like to thank my family, particularly my parents, my parents-in-law, brothers, sisters-in-law, niece and nephews. Their love and support have been the best gifts for me. In particular, I cannot thank my lovely husband, Peng Liu, enough for loving me, feeding me, and never leaving me. We had hoped that my PhD would provide us with a honeymoon in Scotland, but it has turned out to be a lonely period for him at times, especially during my extended absences when working on this project. I am eternally grateful to him for keeping me centred, focused and motivated as his PhD princess. It is with him most of all that I share this great accomplishment.

Abstract

This study is an exploration of the internationalisation of teacher education at two case-study universities, one located in China and the other in Scotland. It explores how different approaches to internationalisation affect student teachers' learning, as well as how teacher educators understand the concept of internationalisation in teacher education. The study, drawing on postcolonial theory, adopts a qualitative approach within a constructivist paradigm. Data collection comprises semi-structured interviews with 34 students and teacher educators across two universities.

Findings suggest that all the teacher educators interviewed view internationalisation as a broad concept that includes different approaches. However, they differ in their understandings of the rationale for internationalisation, which fall into three discourses: neocolonialism, neoimperialism and decolonisation. The teacher educators' different understandings are translated into their practices, and ultimately reflected in student teachers' learning experiences. Another key finding is that student teachers, who are encouraged to engage in transformative learning through programmes, modules or other learning activities which have an intercultural, international or global dimension, show more readiness to become globally competent teachers. Further to this, influential factors such as financial issues, language barriers, narrow mind-sets and an overcrowded curriculum, prevent many student teachers from participating in internationalisation initiatives, which, however, can be addressed by ensuring that teacher educators have rich expertise in internationalisation.

Recommendations are for more international collaboration and communication between universities from different parts of the world, in order that internationalisation can be promoted as a two-way learning process. Moreover, communication among different stakeholders is also needed in order to ensure the success of internationalisation in teacher education within each institutional context.

Additionally, nuanced understandings of student teachers' transformative learning experiences through internationalisation initiatives suggest that, in order to prepare all student teachers to become globally competent teachers, it is essential to incorporate multicultural education, the pedagogy of discomfort and critical pedagogy into teacher education.

Abbreviations

OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PGDE	Professional Graduate Diploma in Education
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
PRC	The People's Republic of China
PS	Professional Specialisation
RME	Religious and Moral Education
TALIS	Teaching and Learning International Survey
UK	United Kingdom
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund
US	United States of America

Contents

Declaration of authenticity and author's rights i
Acknowledgements ii
Abstract iv
Abbreviations vi
Contents vii
Chapter 1 Introduction 1
1.1 Setting the scene 1
1.2 Research objectives and questions 4
1.3 Structure of the thesis 6
Chapter 2 Literature Review 8
2.1 Introduction 8
2.2 Globalisation and internationalisation in higher education 8
2.2.1 Conceptualising globalisation 9
2.2.2 Understanding internationalisation in higher education 13
2.2.3 Academics' understanding of internationalisation 16
2.3 Global impact on education 17
2.3.1 Global interconnectedness 17
2.3.2 Cultural diversity 20
2.4 The demand for globally competent teachers 25
2.4.1 *Education for global citizenship* 25
2.4.2 Culturally responsive teaching 27
2.5 The internationalisation of teacher education 32
2.5.1 The internationalisation of teacher education abroad 33
2.5.2 The internationalisation of teacher education at home 36
2.5.3 Identifying the gaps in the internationalisation of teacher education 39
2.6 Summary 42
Chapter 3 Theoretical Framework 43
3.1 Introduction 43
3.2 Postcolonialism: discourse and power 43
3.3 Postcolonialism: agency and resistance 47
3.4 Decolonisation through the transformation of mind-sets 50
3.5 Summary 52
Chapter 4 Methodology 54

4.1 Introduction 54
4.2 Research paradigm and rationale for a qualitative approach 54
4.2.1 Constructivism 55
4.3 Case studies 59
4.4 Data collection 61
4.4.1 The research sites 61
4.4.2 The participants 64
4.4.3 The qualitative questionnaire 70
4.4.4 The semi-structured interviews 72
4.5 Data analysis 76
4.6 My historical and cultural locations 82
4.7 Ethical considerations 84
4.8 Summary 87
Chapter 5 Understanding the Internationalisation of Teacher Education 88
5.1 Introduction 88
5.2 Internationalisation: a broad church 88
5.3 Rationale for internationalising teacher education 91
5.3.1 Internationalisation as a one-way process 91
5.3.2 Internationalisation as a two-way process: "What can we learn and share?" 100
5.3.3 Internationalisation as a response to cultural diversity 103
5.3.4 Internationalisation as a money-making strategy 109
5.4 Summary 112
Chapter 6 Learning to Become Globally Competent Teachers: Chinese and Scottish Student Teachers Reflect on the Impact of Study Abroad Experiences 113
6.1 Introduction 113
6.2 Learning about others and self through study abroad programmes 113
6.2.1 Learning about educational ideas and practices in the host country 113
6.2.2 Learning about others and self from cultural differences 118
6.3 Learning about/in a foreign culture: pains and gains 124
6.3.1 Experiencing ups and downs 124
6.3.2 Developing empathy as a result of feeling "out of place" as a cultural outsider 128
6.3.3 Transforming frames of reference through critical reflection on feelings and assumptions 133
6.4 Becoming globally competent teachers: from lived experiences abroad to action for change 140
6.4.1 Developing more confidence or greater awareness as a cross-cultural communicator 140
6.4.2 From seeing more of the world to transferring knowledge to actions 145
6.4.3 Becoming responsive teachers: acknowledging cultural diversity and exploring

options for responding to it 150

6.5 Summary 156

Chapter 7 Learning to Become Globally Competent Teachers: Chinese and Scottish Student Teachers Reflect on the Impact of Internationalisation at Home 158

7.1 Introduction 158

7.2 Learning about education in other countries 158

7.2.1 Learning about educational ideas and practices in other countries 158

7.2.2 Learning about educational ideas and practices in other countries and learning pedagogical skills for multicultural education 162

7.3 "Readjusting thoughts on thinking" through critical reflection on taken-for-granted assumptions 166

7.4 Developing empathy for others as a result of their experiences as foreign language learners 169

7.5 Becoming globally competent teachers 176

7.5.1 Becoming more self-aware or remaining where they are based on the experience of foreign language learners 177

7.5.2 Not being prepared to be globally competent teachers 181

7.5.3 Demonstrating readiness to be globally competent teachers 188

7.6 Summary 192

Chapter 8 Factors That Influence the Internationalisation of Teacher Education 195

8.1 Introduction 195

8.2 Barriers to student teachers' participation in study abroad programmes 195

8.2.1 Financial barriers: personal issues or family issues 195

8.2.2 Mixed views about the language factor: a barrier to participation or a catalyst for learning? 199

8.3 Barriers to student teachers' participation in approaches to internationalisation 203

8.3.1 A narrow mind-set 203

8.3.2 The overcrowded curriculum: no time or space for an intercultural, international or global dimension 208

8.4 The expertise of the academics as a key factor for the internationalisation of teacher education 215

8.4.1 Intercultural experience and cultural diversity among Scottish academics: challenges and opportunities 215

8.4.2 A lack of expertise in internationalising teacher education among the Chinese academics 219

8.4.3 The importance of the international experiences and perspectives of the Chinese academics 221

8.5 Summary 224

Chapter 9 Discussion 226

9.1 Introduction 226

9.2 A neocolonial discourse: Westernisation under the guise of internationalisation 226

9.2.1 Conceptualising internationalisation as Westernisation 227
9.2.2 Promoting Westernisation in practices 233
9.2.3 Problems in learning through Westernisation 235
9.3 A new form of imperialism: promoting Scottish teacher education to the rest of the world 239
9.4 Decolonising internationalisation: internationalisation as a two-way process 243
9.5 Understanding the process of transformative learning 247
9.5.1 The role of discomforting emotions and emotional maturity in transformative learning 248
9.5.2 The role of premise reflection in transformative learning 250
9.6 Influential factors and academics' expertise in relation to internationalisation 256
9.7 Summary 261
Chapter 10 Conclusion 262
10.1 Introduction 262
10.2 Key findings 262
10.2.1 The first question: how is teacher education internationalised in China and Scotland? 262
10.2.2 The second question: how can internationalisation shape student teachers' development as globally competent teachers in China and Scotland? 265
10.3 Implications and Recommendations 267
10.3.1 Recommendations for international collaboration and communication 267
10.3.2 Intelligent internationalisation 269
10.3.3 Curriculum and pedagogy 272
10.4 Limitations of the study and recommendations for future research 276
10.5 Summary 278
References 280
Appendices 300
Appendix 1: Participant information sheet (questionnaire) 300
Appendix 2: Consent form (questionnaire) 304
Appendix 3: The questionnaire for student teachers 305
Appendix 4: Interview guide for academics 309
Appendix 5: Interview guide for student teachers in internationalisation at Home 310
Appendix 6: Interview guide for student teachers in study abroad programmes 312
Appendix 7: Key characteristics of 7 academic participants 314
Appendix 8: Key characteristics of 27 student teacher participants in interviews 316

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 Setting the scene

In an increasingly globalised world, internationalisation has shaped the landscape of higher education worldwide. Internationalisation has become a global imperative in higher education, which has led to growing attention through national policies, institutional policies and mission statements (Knight, 2015a) and is actualised within different national and regional contexts via a diverse range of approaches (Tamtik & Kirss, 2016). Teacher education is not immune to the global agenda of internationalisation. The intensification of global interconnectedness and cultural diversity in many parts of the world has brought new challenges to education and teacher education in the twenty-first century. To prepare all students, regardless of their cultural backgrounds, for a successful life in an increasingly global and multicultural context, teachers need relevant knowledge and skills in order to assist their students "to learn about the world, from the world, and with the world" (Quezada, 2010, p. 4), as well as "to be culturally aware, responsible and culturally competent global citizens" (Santoro & Major, 2012, p. 309). The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) (2014) also recommends that teachers – especially future teachers – need to be provided with better education if they are to fully assist their students to develop a "global gaze", as well as "a sense of belonging to a broader community" (p. 14) through appreciation for pluralism and diversity. This suggests an urgent need for globally competent teachers who are able to educate students for global citizenship, as well as teach about, and teach with, cultural diversity.

However, studies have revealed that teachers in many countries show little readiness for teaching in a global and multicultural context. They are not confident, or sometimes feel reluctant to incorporate global dimensions into their classrooms, and are therefore unable to educate students to become global citizens (Ferguson-

Patrick, Macqueen, & Reynolds, 2012; Gallavan, 2008; McGaha & Linder, 2014). Moreover, there is a notable cultural divide between culturally homogenous teachers and culturally and linguistically diverse children. The majority of school teachers, as well as student teachers, are observed to be from mainstream cultures and are unable to navigate through the cultural divide in a culturally and professionally appropriate way in multicultural classrooms (Ferguson-Patrick, Macqueen, & Reynolds, 2014; Santoro & Forghani-Arani, 2015). These issues are also common in Scotland, where the majority of school teachers are predominantly white Scottish (The Scottish Government, 2014), and often inadequately prepared to address issues relating to racial and cultural differences (Hick, Arshad, Mitchell, Watt, & Roberts, 2010; Santoro, 2016, 2017; Training and Development Agency, 2011). To answer the government's call for the promotion of education for diversity and equality in the Curriculum for Excellence (Education Scotland, 2015), more efforts are needed to develop Scottish student teachers into globally competent teachers.

Little research has been conducted in China in regard to teacher preparation for a global and multicultural context. Although the importance of global education, or education for international understanding, has been acknowledged in policies such as The Core Competence of Chinese Students' Development (The Core Competence Research Team, 2016) and The National Guidelines for Mid- and Long-term Educational Reform and Development (2010-2020) (Ministry of Education of China, 2010), and in practices of school education in China (Ma & Liang, 2015 ; Z. Wang & Xiong, 2011), in recent years, particularly in Shanghai, questions remain about teachers' readiness to help their students develop international understanding. In addition to this, little attention has been paid to Chinese teachers' cultural responsiveness in classrooms, which are increasingly characterised by cultural diversity. For example, there is no mention in the Curriculum Standards for Teacher Education (Ministry of Education of China, 2011) about the knowledge and skills

that Chinese student teachers must master in order to teach in an increasingly global and multicultural context.

Internationalisation is high on the agendas of teacher education in many universities in the world. However, previous studies about the internationalisation of teacher education are restricted to isolated approaches. For example, they tend to look at a specific study abroad programme (e.g., Marx & Moss, 2011; Santoro, 2014; Scoffham & Barnes, 2009) or a specific learning experience which has a global or intercultural dimension in the home country (e.g., Almarza, 2005; Bennett, 2012; Ferguson-Patrick et al., 2014; Wilson, 1993). Few researchers have conducted an inquiry into different approaches to internationalisation in teacher education. This may lead to the risk of presenting a particular approach as a simple solution to the complex and multifaceted process of internationalisation. The focus on individual approaches can also result in the promotion of internationalisation for the benefit of only a small number of student teachers, rather than all student teachers. In order to avoid these issues, it is essential to engage with both dimensions of internationalisation for teacher education: that is, at home and abroad.

Moreover, most studies to date have explored the learning outcomes of particular approaches to internationalisation from the point of view of student teachers. Some have found that critical reflection is a vital part of transforming student teachers' stereotypical views, of developing their empathy for others and of helping them arrive at new understandings about themselves and others (e. g. Marx & Moss, 2011; Scoffham & Barnes, 2009; Trilokekar & Kukar, 2011). However, there is little information about the nature of these factors, and how these factors can enable student teachers to progress towards an understanding of a globalised world, and their own role within it. Far too little attention has been paid to teacher educators' understanding of internationalisation in teacher education and how it shapes their practices. Many researchers acknowledge that well-structured approaches can result in positive changes to student teachers' personal and professional

experiences (e.g. Miller-Dyce & Owusu-Ansah, 2016; Parr & Chan, 2015; Phillion & Malewski, 2011; Stachowski & Sparks, 2007), but these positive experiences largely rely on the efforts and actions of teacher educators, who play a key role in internationalisation practices. Despite recognition of the important role played by teacher educators, it is often the case that institutional practices are based on teacher educators' implicit and assumed understanding of internationalisation. To examine how teacher education is internationalised within institutional contexts, it is equally important to explore the views of academics, who are key actors in the implementation of internationalisation practices.

Another problem exists in the context of previous studies of the internationalisation of teacher education. Past studies mainly concentrate on how universities in many Western countries such as the United States of America (US), Australia and the United Kingdom (UK) prepare globally competent teachers or culturally responsive teachers through the internationalisation of teacher education. Meanwhile, countries from the East have become popular destinations for international learning experiences of student teachers from Western countries (Major & Santoro, 2016; Santoro, 2014; Scoffham & Barnes, 2009). The current discourses of internationalisation in teacher education signify western cultural hegemony, while the voices of non-Western contexts are seldom heard. Western ways of knowing and doing in the internationalisation of teacher education cannot represent perspectives and models in non-Western countries, because stories about internationalisation are influenced by local cultures and have "to be read in the context of their times and places" (Devos, 2003, p. 158). This highlights the need to explore the internationalisation of teacher education in both the East and the West.

1.2 Research objectives and questions

In response to the need for globally competent teachers and the problems emerging from previous studies about the internationalisation of teacher education,

this study is an exploration of the internationalisation of teacher education at two universities, one located in China and the other in Scotland. It examines how different approaches to internationalisation affect student teachers' learning, and explores how teacher educators understand the concept of internationalisation in teacher education and translate their understandings into practice. Specifically, the study addresses the following two main questions:

1. How is teacher education internationalised in China and Scotland?
2. How can internationalisation shape student teachers' development as globally competent teachers in China and Scotland?

The nature of these questions requires a qualitative inquiry. Underpinned by a constructivism paradigm, this study values the views of the research participants featured, which have been socially and experientially constructed. Two stages were involved in my data collection. The first stage included semi-structured interviews with 7 academics from both China and Scotland, and a questionnaire with 67 student teachers across the two sites. The questionnaire contained 6 closed questions and 13 open-ended questions. The questionnaire was used to capture student teachers' demographic information, as well as their knowledge about, and experiences of, learning activities which had an intercultural, international or global dimension. The interviews with the academics focused on their perceptions about, and practices in, the internationalisation of teacher education. The second stage of the research consisted of semi-structured interviews with 27 student teachers who were willing to talk in-depth about their learning experiences and the impact that these experiences had on them. The data was analysed using a thematic analysis approach.

The exploration of different approaches to internationalisation in teacher education based on the views of both academics and student teachers, from both the West and the East, can yield benefits in three main aspects. First, the juxtaposition of

different approaches in the inquiry can provide important information about the nature of different approaches, how they shape student teachers' learning, and what challenging issues need to be addressed. Second, the inclusion of teacher educators' views provides an opportunity for advancing our knowledge about the relationship between teacher educators' understanding of internationalisation in teacher education and their student teachers' learning experiences. Third, this study makes a unique contribution to research in this area by demonstrating different views and practices from both Western and non-Western contexts, rather than predominantly paying attention only to the former

1.3 Structure of the thesis

The structure of the following nine chapters is as follows:

Chapter 2 provides more detailed background information about existing research into internationalisation in higher education in general, and in teacher education in particular. Having established the background and direction for this study, Chapter 3 explains the theoretical framework and its key concepts, which are relevant to my data analysis and discussion about findings. Chapter 4 describes and justifies the methodology adopted to answer the research questions. It specifies data collection and analysis methods. Chapter 5 presents findings based on academics' understandings of internationalisation in teacher education within their institutional contexts. Chapters 6 and 7 present findings about the impact of different approaches to internationalisation, on both Chinese and Scottish student teachers, with the former focusing on study abroad programmes and the latter focusing on internationalisation at home. More specifically, these chapters focus on an analysis of how internationalisation abroad and at home shapes student teachers' personal and professional learning. Chapter 8 reveals influential factors for the success of the internationalisation of teacher education. Chapter 9 discusses the key findings presented in the previous four chapters. Chapter 10 concludes the research by

providing a summary of the key findings, implications and recommendations for policy, research and practice, as well as limitations and suggestions for future research.

Chapter 2 Literature Review

2.1 Introduction

This chapter reviews literature on internationalisation in higher education, especially in teacher education. It begins with the conceptualisation of globalisation and internationalisation in higher education from different perspectives. It then considers the global impact on education in terms of the two common themes in literature: global interconnectedness and cultural diversity. This section is followed by the demands for globally competent teachers who are able to educate students for global citizenship and to engage in culturally responsive teaching. The fifth section moves to empirical studies about the internationalisation of teacher education, based on the literature review, and identified particular gaps in the literature. The chapter concludes with a summary.

2.2 Globalisation and internationalisation in higher education

Globalisation has influenced different aspects of human society, as an increasing number of intellectual, social, cultural, political and economic activities across national boundaries have shaped a new global context. These cross-border activities make globalisation a dynamic and multidimensional process, which is difficult to define with consensus (Apple, Kenway, & Singh, 2005; Rizvi & Lingard, 2010; Zajda, 2015), because it has different kinds of impact on different countries due to different historical and cultural factors (Knight, 2015c). The education sector in particular has been greatly influenced by globalisation, as exemplified by the knowledge economy and information and communication technologies (Knight, 2008). To understand global impact on education, it is important to first understand what is meant by globalisation, and how it relates to internationalisation. These concepts are discussed in the following subsections.

2.2.1 Conceptualising globalisation

The literature review indicates that our current understanding of globalisation is largely based on some early definitions made by scholars such as Giddens (1990), Held and McGrew (2003) and Robertson (1992). These definitions are still relevant and influential as major perspectives to explain the concept. The term "globalisation" itself means a growing process of economic cooperation, exchanges of cultures, technologies and knowledge, and of migration in the world of eroded borders (e.g. Giddens, 1990; Ohmae, 1990; Tarrant, 2010). The sense of eroded borders can be seen in Friedman's (2000) idea of a shrinking world where different countries are interconnected due to the developments of the Internet, communications technologies and transportation systems. Global connectivity is the defining characteristic of globalisation in Giddens's (1990) definition. He defines globalisation "as the intensification of worldwide social relations which link distant localities in such a way that local happenings are shaped by events occurring many miles away and vice versa" (p. 64).

Intensified social relations throughout the world accelerate borderless flows. Particularly in the wake of the rapid and profound developments of communications, transport and data processing, globalisation has increasingly changed concepts of space and time (Rizvi & Lingard, 2010). Globalisation denotes the compression of time and space due to these technological developments (Harvey, 1990). The idea of compressed time and space is specifically reflected in Held and McGrew's (2003) definition. They define globalisation as "the expanding scale, growing magnitude, speeding up and deepening impact of interregional flows and patterns of social interaction" (p. 4). These scholars further stress that globalisation refers to processes of change, which brings transformation to everyday life or to social organisation by expanding and connecting human activities across national boundaries at an unprecedented speed. As such, globalisation is "the widening, deepening and speeding up of worldwide interconnectedness" in different aspects

of human life, “from the cultural to the criminal, the financial to the spiritual” (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt, & Perraton, 1999, p. 2). The focuses on interconnectedness and multidimensionality can still be found in a relatively recent definition in which globalisation is described as “the flow of people, culture, ideas, values, knowledge, technology, and economy across borders resulting in a more interconnected and interdependent world” (Knight, 2008, p. 4).

Robertson (1992) develops the concept of globalisation more broadly. According to him, globalisation “refers both to the compression of the world and the intensification of consciousness of the world as a whole” (p. 8). Building on this definition and those discussed above, Steger (2013) develops a new definition which suggests globalisation is “the expansion and intensification of social relations and consciousness across world-time and world-space” (p. 15). His view suggests that globalisation focuses not only on social activities and relations which transcend traditional national boundaries in different dimensions, for example, geographically, economically, culturally and politically, but also “involves the subjective plane of human consciousness” (Steger, 2013, p. 15). In line with these broader definitions, Rizvi and Lingard (2010) also suggest that globalisation not only involves the material shifts, but also “a changing sense of identities and belonging” (p. 34), which guides people to understand how the world is interrelated and how they might react to changing social imaginaries.

The common feature identified in early definitions is that globalisation is a borderless flow of economy, people, ideas and values which result in more profound changes in human life and a greater sense of global interconnectedness. The definitions discussed above fall into two of Rizvi and Lingard’s (2010) three ways of understanding the concept of globalisation. The first sees globalisation as an empirical fact that brings changes in patterns of social activities. The second portrays globalisation as a social imaginary that is a way of thinking, often implicitly nested in everyday practices and ideas. The social imaginary of globalisation shapes

or guides people's sense of identity, expectations and aspirations in relation to others in the world.

However, Rizvi and Lingard (2010) note that the borderless flows or networks have also raised issues concerning power relations which fall into the third way of understanding globalisation: as an ideology. According to Rizvi and Lingard, the ideological perspective interprets globalisation as either good or bad, and represents masked expressions of political interests and power. The ideological dimension of globalisation is described as globalism which attaches particular meanings and value preferences to the concept of globalisation and operates in three spheres including market globalism, justice globalism and religious globalisms (Steger, 2013). According to Steger (2013), market globalism, as a dominant ideology in today's world, is often linked with neoliberalism, and is therefore considered a neoliberal ideology which attaches neoliberal meanings and free-market principles to globalisation. Essential to market globalism is neoliberal globalisation which leads to imbalanced power relations between the global North, which is often referred to as "the global metropole", "developed" or "Western" countries (including European countries, the US, Canada, Australia and New Zealand), and the global South, which is often described as "the global periphery", "developing" or "politically or culturally marginalised" countries (mainly referring to countries outside North America and Europe) (Connell, 2007; Dados & Connell, 2012). This is because the global North plays a dominant role in the global economy, and develops its economic competitiveness at the expense of the global South through histories of colonisation and re-colonisation (Sparke, 2012). Justice globalism emerges in opposition to market globalism. It stresses a more balanced power relationship between the global North and the global South, and concerns the well-being of ordinary people throughout the world (Steger, 2013). Rejecting the values or notions of market globalism and justice globalism, religious globalisms imagine a religious community in global terms in order to defend religious beliefs and values (Steger, 2013).

The expansion and acceleration of social activities and relations across national borders requires cooperation between different countries (Beck, 2015). Accordingly, countries cannot develop to their full potential in an isolation vacuum. In particular, the borderless flows of people, capital, products, ideas, service and many other areas lead to greater international operations or involvement (Apple, 2011; Zhao, 2010). Meanwhile, the inclusion of global consciousness in the definitions of globalisation points to a growing need for individuals or global citizens who can understand that their actions and thoughts are not only attached to national and local contexts, but are also closely linked to the increasingly connected world (Rizvi & Lingard, 2010; Steger, 2013). The need for global citizens calls for internationalisation in education, and in higher education in particular. The imbalanced power relations emerging from neoliberal globalisation require a new pattern of internationalisation. In social science, for example, it is important to deparochialise Western research by avoiding presenting Western perspectives and theories as universal, and to internationalise the Western academy by enhancing global flows of academics and students (Appadurai, 2000; Connell, 2007; Rizvi & Lingard, 2010).

Globalisation can be viewed as “the economic, political, and societal forces pushing 21st century higher education toward greater international involvement” (Altbach & Knight, 2007, p.290). The relationships among globalisation, internationalisation and higher education can be better understood in Knight’s (2004) account, which states that “globalisation is changing the world of internationalisation” and “internationalisation is changing the world of higher education” (p.5). However, the relationship between globalisation and internationalisation in higher education is dialectic rather than simple and linear. A dialectic relationship means that globalisation modulates territorial and material place, space, identities, cultures and relationships and, in turn, these aspects can also modulate more global processes or trends (Singh, Kenway, & Apple, 2005). In the same vein, higher education can also address global demands and challenges through its role in creating and circulating

knowledge and ideas (Appadurai, 1990; Leask & Bridge, 2013). In what follows, a deeper understanding of the concept of internationalisation in higher education is provided.

2.2.2 Understanding internationalisation in higher education

Internationalisation can easily be confused with globalisation and the indistinctiveness between the two may bring challenges to those who seek to promote internationalisation in institutional practices (Buczynski, Lattimer, Inoue, & Alexandrowicz, 2010). Therefore, it is crucial to look at how internationalisation is defined and understood in the literature. Since the 1990s, the concept of internationalisation has become increasingly popular in education. In some early definitions, internationalisation is termed either as “the multiple activities, programmes and services that fall within international studies, international educational exchange and technical cooperation” (Arum & Van de Water, 1992, p. 202) or as a strategy for universities to promote “organisational change, curriculum innovation, staff development and student mobility, for the purposes of achieving excellence in teaching and research” (Rudzki, 1995, p. 421). These definitions describe internationalisation in a narrow scope which focuses on activities and strategies at an institutional level.

The focus on the institutional level is also seen in Knight’s (1994) early definition of internationalisation in higher education. However, she has made continuous efforts to update this definition. More recently, she describes internationalisation as “the process of integrating an international, intercultural, or global dimension into the purpose, functions, or delivery of postsecondary education” (Knight, 2004, p. 11). This definition is broad enough to cover all levels: national, sector and institutional. According to Knight, her intention to work out a generic definition is to make it applicable to different contexts, and to allow for comparisons of internationalisation in higher education across different national or regional contexts. For these

purposes, the definition does not give a specific account of factors such as the rationale, outcomes, activities, actors or stakeholders. This generic view of internationalisation is seen as helpful for a general understanding of the concept, and is widely adopted in many studies (Chen & Kraklow, 2015; Dewey & Duff, 2009; Leask, 2004; Mok, 2007).

Knight (2004) emphasises that the three terms (i.e. intercultural, international and global) are carefully chosen as a triad in the definition, because internationalisation in higher education is not only associated with the relationships between or among different countries or cultures, but is also linked to cultural diversity within national, local and institutional contexts. As intercultural, international and global dimensions become more important in higher education, different terms are used to describe internationalisation initiatives, either in institutional practices or in research, which include multicultural education, international education, global citizenship education, international studies, peace education, cross-border education, study abroad programmes and many others. These terms fall into two streams described by Knight (2004, 2008): internationalisation at home and internationalisation abroad. According to Knight, the former focuses on internationalisation practices that happen within the home country (or home campus) and the latter is about practices that are carried out abroad, such as the outbound mobility of students. These different terms, along with the two streams they belong to, are also complementary, thus enriching the meaning of internationalisation, both in depth and breadth (Knight, 2004).

However, Knight's definition of internationalisation is observed to be limited in guiding approaches to internationalisation at a deeper institutional level (Sanderson, 2011). In reality, there is a misconception about internationalisation in higher education because many universities take it to be a cluster of piecemeal approaches rather than an integral or comprehensive process (de Wit, 2016). Internationalisation is often practiced as one approach or some specific approaches

through piecemeal efforts by individual staff members or a single entity, for example, the international office (Hudzik, 2015). Meanwhile, many studies focus on the impact of isolated approaches to internationalisation on university students' learning, which results in a poor understanding of internationalisation within institutional and particularly disciplinary contexts (Leask & Bridge, 2013). Some researchers suggest the need to revisit the rationale for internationalising higher education (de Wit, 2010; Maringe & Woodfield, 2013), in order to ensure a better understanding of the benefits and objectives expected from the efforts of internationalisation and to avoid portraying a small fraction of institutional internationalisation as the comprehensive process of internationalisation (Knight, 2015b).

Knight (1997) and de Wit (2002) categorise the rationale for internationalisation in higher education into four groups: 1) academic, 2) economic, 3) political, and 4) social and cultural. According to the academic rationale, internationalisation is promoted to ensure the quality of higher education, to enhance institutional status and profile, and to aspire to international academic standards. The economic rationale focuses on the direct or indirect economic benefits brought about by the internationalisation of higher education. The political rationale is concerned with foreign policy, national identity, regional identity, national security, peace and mutual understanding and technical assistance. Finally, the social and cultural rationale seeks to promote national culture and language to others, and to understand the cultures and languages of others. The social and cultural rationale stresses individual learning experiences in programmes or activities which have an intercultural, international or global dimension. These four groups are further re-examined and included in Knight's (2004) emergent categories of rationale at two levels: national and institutional. At the national level, internationalisation is regarded as important for human resource development, commercial trade, strategic alliances, national building as well as social and cultural development. At the institutional level, internationalisation is promoted to achieve income

generation, academic standards, student and staff development, and cultural diversity.

The divergent categories of rationale for internationalisation within different national and institutional contexts can also be understood from Stier's (2006) three ideologies: idealism, instrumentalism and educationalism. Idealism is based on a normative assumption which views internationalisation as good *per se*. It describes internationalisation in arrogant and ethnocentric worldviews. For instance, it emphasises what people from the rest of the world "can learn from us" (p. 4). Instrumentalism regards internationalisation as a means for generating income and preparing a suitable labour force for the global market. Educationalism focuses on students' learning experiences and what these experiences can contribute to students' understanding of self and critical thinking. Although the categories of the rationale for internationalisation, or the types of ideologies are distinguished from each other, they may sometimes work together to drive certain approaches of internationalisation in higher education. The understanding of the concept of internationalisation in relation to different categories of rationale and ideologies can provide us with a better knowledge of institutional concerns and priorities.

2.2.3 Academics' understanding of internationalisation

According to Knight (2004), "it is usually at the individual, institutional level that the real process of internationalisation is taking place" (pp. 6-7). However, many academics show little knowledge about what internationalisation means (Knight, 2006; Stohl, 2007). Consequently, this results in a very narrow focus on academics' implementation of internationalisation within their disciplines (Bartell, 2003) and/or little engagement with internationalisation (Childress, 2010). Therefore, it is necessary to explore how academics who are key implementers of internationalisation initiatives perceive what internationalisation means, and why they promote it within their institutions, particularly within their specific disciplines.

In a very limited number of empirical studies, researchers have started to explore how academics understand the concept of internationalisation in relation to the rationale for, and tensions within, the internationalisation of higher education (e.g. Dewey & Duff, 2009; Friesen, 2013; Leask & Bridge, 2013). In a case study, Dewey and Duff (2009) have revealed that academics are actively promoting a range of approaches to internationalisation, but suggest that comprehensive internationalisation is not possible if there is little understanding of the reasons for it. Uncertainty about what is meant by internationalisation among academics, and why they have to promote it within institutional contexts, can add to the difficulty in internationalisation practices (Friesen, 2013). In a more detailed example, Leask and Bridge (2013) have examined what curriculum internationalisation means within three disciplines (i.e. accounting, public relations and journalism) in three Australian universities, and suggest that it is vital for academics to make explicit interpretations about internationalisation in disciplinary contexts. Despite the limited number of studies of this aspect, previous empirical studies pay far too little attention to how internationalisation in teacher education is mapped out by academics who are working on it.

2.3 Global impact on education

2.3.1 Global interconnectedness

Global issues concerning environment, for example, poverty, social justice, conflict, cheap labour and medical development, have rendered different societies increasingly dependent on each other (Friedman, 2005; Holden & Hicks, 2007; Rivoli, 2014; Turner & Khondker, 2010). For example, China has become an important trading partner for foreign economies, as well as a popular site for mass production and foreign investment (L. Li, Dunford, & Yeung, 2012). Similarly, the British economy, like many others, is closely connected with the rest of the world in terms of trade and investment.

This global interconnectedness accelerates competition in the global market in which future workers, managers or employers have to excel to secure a job or business (Joshee, 2008). It has become a trend that employers from some developed countries seek labour from some developing countries because it is less expensive. This trend leads to high rates of factory closures and unemployment in some developed countries (Zhao, 2010). Meanwhile, some developing countries, such as China and India, are striving hard to improve the quality of their education in order to provide workers who can compete with others in the global job market (Zhao, 2010). As the global economy is increasingly organised around global flows of capital and job opportunities, there is a greater need for workers who not only have relevant knowledge and skills, but who also possess cultural adaptability and learning capabilities (Rizvi & Lingard, 2010). As such, both developed and developing countries have to consider how to prepare their students as competent workers who can convince their employers that they have the key knowledge, skills and abilities for the job. In this sense, globalisation affects education: what is taught and how.

The rapid exchange of knowledge and information afforded by the Internet or other communications technologies in the borderless world change our traditional view towards learning. Social media enables people to gain quick and easy access to knowledge and information in the global community (Kenway & Bullen, 2008). Meanwhile, the instantaneous nature of modern life helps to create a global community in which the way people live can immediately be influenced by what is happening in distant localities (Ray, 2007). In light of these changes, Stromquist and Monkman (2014) note that education aims to help students become more knowledgeable about the world. However, in the wake of dynamic processes of globalisation and the influence of enormous online resources, to be knowledgeable about the world does not mean that students are equipped with all the knowledge they need for a successful life. The knowledge they have learned today can become out of date tomorrow due to the emergence of new patterns of socio-economic activities, compounded by the evolving process of globalisation.

Accordingly, Bourn (2011) makes recommendations about incorporating global perspectives into learning content. First, the knowledge to be learned should acknowledge difference, uncertainty and complexity, rather than remaining fixed with only predetermined content. Second, students should be encouraged to reproduce knowledge, work with differences and conflicts, and adapt their positions and ways of thinking to suit different contexts, rather than relying on merely passively absorbing or reproducing knowledge and information. Third, students should also be encouraged to understand and interpret things, events and relations in a changing, multidimensional and interrelated way, rather than focusing on stable, universal and structured meanings and interpretations. These three aspects suggest implications for education not only in terms of what and how to teach in the global age, but also in terms of what and how to learn.

The growing interdependence between different countries and the increase in opportunities for interaction between people from different cultural backgrounds demand global awareness or understanding. Global awareness or understanding, in Cuddy-Keane's (2003) account, is the process by which the individual understands "a recognition of diversity with the self, within cultures, and within the globe" (p. 544) and emphasises the inclusiveness of different voices. The acknowledgement of global interconnectedness and difference is also reflected in Rizvi and Lingard's (2010) account of globalisation as a social imaginary which is centred on issues concerning people's sense of identity, how the identity is in relation to the global context, and how it influences people's expectations and aspirations. The need for a global consciousness raises concerns about how to prepare students to better understand global phenomena and position themselves within the global context.

2.3.2 Cultural diversity

Historically, migration is not a new phenomenon. However, with the availability of advanced technologies and communications in an increasingly globalised world, a new era of human mobility has come, in which people can easily move across national borders. The global mobility of people has changed the demographic make-up of local communities and cultural practices in many parts of the world (Rizvi & Lingard, 2010). It has increased the number of immigrant students in the classrooms of many countries (Goodwin, 2010; Santoro, 2017). In the US, for example, there is an enormous influx of immigrants from Asian countries, European countries, Mexico, Latin America and many other parts of the world, which makes schools more ethnically, linguistically and culturally diverse than ever before (Gay, 2010). In Australia, the rapid increase of immigrants is further changing the country's already multicultural population (Santoro, 2013). Scotland and China (particularly in larger cities) are also experiencing cultural diversity at an unprecedented level (National Bureau of Statistics of PRC, 2011; The Scottish Government, 2016) in the global era, as is shown below.

According to Martell (2008), the UK historically spread its political and military power across many nations, in order to increase its influence internationally and to build up global relationships with a view to obtaining raw materials, production, products and markets. Its imperial legacy has shaped the multicultural feature of British society, as immigrants from former colonies have brought with them cultures and languages of their roots. As globalisation gathers pace, a more diverse cultural context has taken shape in the UK. More immigrants come from across Asia, the Americas, Africa and Europe in order to obtain greater job opportunities, to gain a better quality of education or to seek asylum. In the past two decades, migration has grown dramatically in the UK. According to net migration figures released by the Office for National Statistics (2015), the UK witnessed a fifty-two percent of growth in net migration in one single year, from the end of 2013 to the end of 2014. In the

case of Scotland, the population is increasingly ethnically diverse. For example, around ten percent of the population in major cities such as Glasgow, Edinburgh and Aberdeen regard themselves as an ethnic minority (The Scottish Government, 2013). The diverse composition of Scotland's population is more apparent in publicly funded schools in major cities. Pupils from a minority ethnic[1] group comprise thirteen percent of all pupils in Aberdeen, fifteen percent of all pupils in Edinburgh and twenty-one percent of all pupils in Glasgow (The Scottish Government, 2016). Pupil population can be observed to be even more diverse if we include White Others in the statistics. Moreover, there are 149 home languages spoken among pupils of different ethnic backgrounds in Scotland (The Scottish Government, 2016).

In the past few decades, China, as a traditional multiethnic society, has seen increased interactions between different ethnic groups. There are 56 ethnic groups (taking up 8.4% of the total population in China), with the Han ethnic group as the majority (National Bureau of Statistics of PRC, 2011). The bulk of the ethnic minority population in China live in the western provinces, such as Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region, Guizhou, Yunnan, Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region, Tibet Autonomous Region and Sichuan. These places are less developed and more sparsely populated areas in China (Jiao, 2014). To develop the country in an all-rounded way, the Chinese government has adopted the Great Western Development Strategy which encourages people, particularly investors and national talents from the Han majority, to move to western regions from other parts of China in order to contribute to the economic growth in the west (The State Council of PRC, 2000). Interactions between ethnic groups have increased dramatically as a result of the modernisation and urbanisation of China over the past four decades. Large groups of ethnic minorities have increasingly moved to the eastern coastal cities to seek better employment, quality education and lifestyle benefits (Yan & Li, 2018). According to the latest national population census, large cities or provinces such as Beijing, Shanghai, Tianjin and Guangdong have witnessed the highest rate (over 80%)

---

[1] According to the Scottish Government, minority ethnic groups refer to all categories other than White-Scottish, White Other British and White-Other.

of urbanisation of ethnic minorities (National Bureau of Statistics of PRC, 2011), which has diversified the population of these previously mainly Han-majority occupied areas. For example, the population in 20 out of 34 Chinese provincial areas consists of people from all 56 ethnic groups (Yan & Li, 2018).

The diversification of the population has led to notable cultural diversity in many cities in China, because different ethnic groups differ from each other in factors such as languages and religions. There are 299 language varieties throughout the country (Ethnologue, 2017) and many of them are mutually unintelligible dialects (Mair, 1991; Pan, 2016). Though Mandarin (or Putonghua) and Chinese characters are recognised as national standard spoken and written forms, 55 ethnic minorities possess their own indigenous languages and 30 of them still have their own written forms (National Bureau of Statistics of PRC, 2011; Ye, Jacob, & Xiong, 2017). Additionally, people from different ethnic groups normally possess different religious beliefs, artistic expressions and styles of dress. Religious diversity in China is mainly reflected in Confucianism, Buddhism, Taoism, Islam, Christianity, though many other indigenous religious beliefs are also practised. Although Confucianism has generated a profound and far-reaching influence on China and Chinese people, particularly many within the Han majority, each religion has also shaped the uniqueness of people from different ethnic backgrounds in terms of food, rituals, cultural norms, music, dance, architecture, clothes and other aspects (Zhuo, 2017). Two major ethnic minority groups, the Tibetan and the Uyghur are typical examples, with the former mainly affiliated to Buddhism and the latter to Islam. They have their own written languages and traditional costume, as well as performance-based expressions of their ethnic identities through traditional music and dance, which are greatly distinctive from that of the Han majority (Herb & Kaplan, 2017; Zhuo, 2017).

Differences in language and religion can pose a significant challenge to the promotion of a harmonious multicultural society in China, if they are not addressed appropriately. For example, language differences can result in issues concerning

social engagement and a sense of belonging in people from different ethnic groups, particularly those from ethnic minority backgrounds in Han-dominant areas (Zheng, 2014). In particular, language barriers may further become causes of cultural misunderstanding or conflict in the increased interactions among different ethnic groups. Language barriers between ethnic groups or within the same ethnic groups make it difficult for people to effectively communicate about their cultures and religious beliefs, which can ultimately marginalise or exclude minorities from the mainstream society (Dong & Anwaer, 2014).

Globalisation has increased the complexity of cultural diversity in China. China has close business ties with other countries and has become a popular site for foreign investment, which can accelerate the rapid and frequent movement of people within the country as well as across national borders. According to the latest population census taken in 2010, there are around one million foreign residents in mainland China (National Bureau of Statistics of PRC, 2011). Foreign residents are mostly populated in major cities such as Shanghai, Beijing and Guangzhou (J. Yang, 2015). Shanghai, located on the east coast of China and the largest city in China by population, has attracted large groups of people from outside mainland China. According to national statistics, over one fifth of those foreign residents in China are living in Shanghai for business, employment, education, migration or other purposes (National Bureau of Statistics of PRC, 2011). As a result of the rapid movement of people, cultural diversity has also become a common phenomenon in Shanghai schools. Shanghai has witnessed a rapid growth in the number of children of foreign personnel, from 600 in 1995 to 29,000 in 2016, and these children are from a wide range of foreign countries, such as the US, Japan, South Korea, Germany, the UK and France (Shanghai Academy of Educational Sciences, 2016). In order to respond to the rapidly growing number of immigrant students in the city, more mainstream schools are encouraged to be welcome these students, in addition to international schools in Shanghai (Shanghai Municipal Education Commission, 2016).

The enormous influx of immigrants from different ethnic, religious, cultural and linguistic backgrounds can contribute to social and cultural diversity, which is one of the most visible consequences of globalisation (Turner & Khondker, 2010). Issues concerning cultural diversity, and originating from, but definitely not limited to, immigration, have brought new challenges to education. Immigrant students in either Scotland or Shanghai may have different home languages or dialects, and they may also have to learn the instructional language as an additional language. In this case, immigrant students face both challenges from academic study and from language learning, which can be seen as a double burden or "double dealing" for them (Gay, 2010, p. 20). In addition to linguistic differences, students from ethnically diverse backgrounds may also bring to the classroom their own experiences, beliefs, values and cultures (García, Arias, Murri, & Serna, 2010; Gay, 2013; Jett, McNeal Curry, & Vernon-Jackson, 2016), which are usually different from those of mainstream society. These differences may influence the students' academic performance because they have to manage academic study while learning the instructional language and adapting to the mainstream culture in schools. If the gap between the culture of the mainstream classrooms and those of immigrant students from diverse family backgrounds is not addressed, it can be much harder for immigrant students to engage in a meaningful learning than it is for native students (Griner & Stewart, 2012). Meanwhile, the increasing cultural diversity resulting from migration, if not addressed, may deteriorate migrants' sense of belonging and trust in local communities and, in worst-case scenarios, may bring issues concerning discrimination, xenophobia and hostility (Goldin & Reinert, 2012). For example, children from ethnic minority backgrounds in major cities in China are sometimes discriminated against or excluded from mainstream society by their peers who see them as uncivilised or backward (Zheng, 2014). These potential dangers brought by migration and cultural diversity highlight the need to equip all students with the knowledge and skills required to effectively engage in multicultural communities (Banks, 2015). In order to achieve this, more competent teachers are needed for a global and multicultural context.

2.4 The demand for globally competent teachers

2.4.1 *Education for global citizenship*

One of the most significant discussions in education in the twenty-first century is education for global citizenship. There have been different interpretations of global citizenship since its emergence in the 1990s. According to Barrie (2004), global citizenship can be seen as a stance or attitude towards the world in which people act as responsible members of local, national and global communities. Killick (2011) stresses that global citizenship should not only entail how people act in the world, but also how they understand themselves in relation to others in the world. A more holistic understanding of global citizenship is provided by Morais and Ogden (2011) in their systematic review of the concept based on the relevant literature. According to them, global citizenship includes three overarching dimensions: "social responsibility, global competence, and global civic engagement" (p. 3), which resonates with Schattle's (2009) account of global citizenship in terms of responsibility, awareness and engagement. According to these scholars, global citizens are: 1) responsible citizens who can understand the interconnected relationships between local events and their global consequences, and are concerned about others, society and the environment; 2) globally competent citizens who are knowledgeable about global issues, aware of their own limitations, open to different views and values as expressed by others, and effective in intercultural communication, and; 3) global civic activists who are civically engaged in local, national and global activities for the public good on global agendas, and who construct their political voices around broad knowledge of the world and use their rich experience of constructive participation in the public domain.

The three dimensions of global citizenship are reflected in what other scholars and organisations have emphasised as the global competence of students in a broader sense or knowledge, skills and attitudes of students (e.g. Devlin-Foltz, 2010; L. Guo,

2014; Merryfield, Lo, Po, & Kasai, 2008; Reimers, 2009; UNESCO, 2014; West, 2012). The global competence of students is systematically developed as a four-dimensional framework which underpins education's role in preparing students to "examine local, global and intercultural issues, understand and appreciate different perspectives and world views, interact successfully and respectfully with others, and take responsible action toward sustainability and collective well-being" (OECD, 2018, p. 4). In practice, there are different approaches to education for global citizenship, which include global education, multicultural education, civic or citizenship education, social studies, and many others (UNESCO, 2014).

These approaches, formal or informal, curricular or extracurricular, require new knowledge and skills from teachers. According to scholars and organisations such as Devlin-Foltz (2010), Merryfield et al. (2008), Yamashita (2006), Longview Foundation (2008) and UNESCO (2014), teachers educating for global citizenship need to:

- be knowledgeable about global issues and the international dimensions of the subjects they are teaching
- be confident when teaching sensitive topics that might trigger conflict or controversies
- use learning materials and content to help students examine different perspectives and challenge stereotypes, bias, marginalisation and exclusion
- be able to guide their students to explore relationships across different locations and time periods, and understand how their behaviours or actions accord with those from other countries
- be skilful to build intercultural learning experiences across communities or through social media for their students and to develop their intercultural competences

Teachers with this knowledge, disposition and skills can help prepare students for a global future which is shaped by increasing interconnectedness.

2.4.2 Culturally responsive teaching

In the face of cultural diversity, and the challenges that arise as a result of it in schools, it is important to provide teaching that is connected to, and relevant to, the lives of students from culturally diverse backgrounds. This is a key tenet of culturally responsive or culturally relevant teaching which meets the needs of culturally diverse students who are often overlooked or marginalised in mainstream classrooms in the US (Gay, 2002, 2010, 2013; Ladson-Billings, 1995, 2009, 2014). Culturally responsive teaching recognises the cultures and prior experiences of different students as assets upon which effective teaching can be built. As is evident in Gay's (2010) definition, "[culturally responsive teaching is] one that teaches to and through their personal and cultural strengths, their intellectual capabilities, and their prior accomplishments" (p. 26). This definition stresses the link between teaching and the lived experiences of culturally diverse students. It is based on the assumption that students can learn better when new learning experiences are personally meaningful or relevant to them.

According to Gay (2002, 2010, 2013), culturally responsive teachers have to be able to: develop culturally relevant learning content and materials; establish a caring and supportive learning community; match teaching with students' learning styles; master effective skills for cross-cultural communications with students and their families; and demonstrate a rich knowledge base of diverse cultures. The first four skills can be achieved only when the last one is fully acquired. This means that culturally responsive teaching and curricula can be facilitated when teachers have more knowledge about the culturally diverse world, about what their students have experienced before and at home, about how these experiences might influence their learning, and about how students' experiences and cultures might inform their teaching.

Culturally responsive teaching focuses not only on curricula and teaching practices,

but also on teachers' stances. Culturally responsive teachers are able to examine and reflect on their own identities in regard to the cultural, social, educational and political backgrounds from which they originate (Dover, 2013) and recognise that these backgrounds can also shape their students' ways of thinking, learning and understanding of the world (Howard, 2003). This means that culturally responsive teachers have to understand the conceptions of self-identity and those of others. Aside from this, they also have to be able to value cultural diversity and culturally diverse students in their classrooms. According to Ladson-Billings (2009), culturally diverse students should be viewed not as deficit others. Instead, effective teaching should make good use of students' cultures in order to help them succeed not only in their school lives, but also in their social lives. To ensure the success of culturally diverse students, culturally responsive teaching also emphasises the cultivation of a positive attitude in students: it aims to empower them to "recognise and honour their own cultural beliefs and practices while acquiring access to the wider culture" in which they may lead their future life (Ladson-Billings, 2008, p. 170).

In twenty-first century classrooms, where identity is becoming more fluid, hybrid and complex, Ladson-Billings (2014) further suggests that researchers and teachers have to consider global identities and develop an evolving pedagogy which addresses the needs of all students, rather than specifically focusing on one racial or ethnic group of students. In this sense, education for global citizenship and culturally responsive teaching converge to prepare all students to become globally competent citizens.

Acknowledgement of the importance of education for global citizenship and culturally responsive teaching highlights the need for globally competent teachers for a global and multicultural context. Some assertions have been made in current studies or policies about what future teachers will look like, or what they have to know and be able to do. Examples are shown in proposals for the knowledge domains what quality teachers in the global age should possess (Goodwin, 2010), or

the dispositions that globally minded teachers need (Mikulec, 2014). Globally competent teachers are more specifically described as teachers who possess "knowledge of the international dimensions of their subject matter and a range of global issues; pedagogical skills to teach their students to analyse primary sources from around the world, appreciate multiple points of view, and recognise stereotyping; a commitment to assisting students to become responsible citizens both of the world and of their own communities" (Longview Foundation, 2008, p. 7). Theoretical proposals about the knowledge, skills and dispositions of globally competent teachers overlap with what is required from teachers in relation to education for global citizenship and culturally responsive teaching.

However, a significant number of empirical studies indicate that teachers in many countries are not sufficiently trained to meet global challenges. In the past decade, researchers have continuously investigated teachers' and, particularly, student teachers' attitudes towards their role in an increasingly globalised world, and have discovered that many of them are inadequately prepared to teach about global issues in classes. This is reflected in their reluctance to initiate discussions about global issues, and their inability to educate students for global citizenship (Davies, Harber, & Yamashita, 2005; Gallavan, 2008; Holden & Hicks, 2007; McGaha & Linder, 2014; Robbins, Francis, & Elliott, 2003). Even though some student teachers show an interest in global education, they are usually not ready to teach in a global context (Ferguson-Patrick et al., 2012), and are often reluctant to examine and question their own assumptions, thereby reducing complex global issues to simplistic information which obscures the structural nature of global issues (E. J. Brown, 2010).

Meanwhile, researchers point out that the majority of school teachers and student teachers are from mainstream cultures (usually described as white, middle-class female in some western research contexts) and are not prepared with appropriate knowledge and skills in order to effectively respond to cultural diversity (Dantas, 2007; Ferguson-Patrick et al., 2014; Santoro & Major, 2012; Sleeter, 2008; Walters,

Garii, & Walters, 2009). If teachers are not adequately prepared, the cultural disconnect between culturally homogenous teachers and culturally diverse students can lead to serious problems in culturally diverse classrooms. Teachers may not be ready to challenge or question their hegemonic views in regard to privilege and power (Ladson-Billings, 2009; Marx & Moss, 2011). Furthermore, they may hold stereotypical assumptions about culturally diverse children, their parents and the places from which they originate, and this can make them lose sight of the full picture as regards what the children have experienced in their lives and how their experiences have made them who they are (Apple, 2011). They may avoid some potentially sensitive topics, such as religion, racism and sexual orientation in classroom discussions because of a lack of confidence or fear of being regarded as politically incorrect or insensitive (Howard, 2003; Mysore, Lincoln, & Wavering, 2006; Sleeter & Owuor, 2011). Conversely, they may also conduct teaching practices or interact with culturally diverse students in a culturally inappropriate way, as evidenced in the study by Santoro and her colleagues (2015). This study suggests that teachers' misconceptions about different cultural norms can form a cultural divide between them and their students. Teachers' failure to navigate through the cultural divide in a professionally appropriate manner can lead to further negative educational outcomes (Mahon, 2006).

In the Scottish context, there is an urgent need to prepare globally competent teachers, as the cultural divide between culturally homogenous teachers and culturally diverse students in Scotland is pronounced. The Scottish Government has recognised the importance of helping children and young people lead a successful life in a global and multicultural society through their promotion of education for diversity and equality in the Curriculum for Excellence (Education Scotland, 2015). However, teachers in Scotland's schools are predominantly Scottish and white, with only two percent of teachers originating from minority ethnic groups (The Scottish Government, 2014). A more pressing concern is that a large number of teachers or student teachers in Scotland – and elsewhere in the UK – are ill-prepared and

uncomfortable in engaging with issues concerning cultural and racial differences in their classrooms (Hick et al., 2010; Santoro, 2016; Training and Development Agency, 2011). Even when provided with opportunities for intercultural learning experiences, such as studying abroad in teacher education courses, some Scottish student teachers do not consider the opportunities, particularly because they are fearful of different cultural norms or of being misunderstood (Santoro, Sosu, & Fassetta, 2016).

In China, there is little research investigating teachers' readiness to teach for a global and multicultural context, despite growing attention to international understanding among Chinese students in the national curriculum. A recently issued research report, authorised by the Chinese Ministry of Education, places a greater emphasis on promoting students' awareness of, and openness to, global issues, as well as encouraging understanding of, and appreciation for, cultural differences, and the ability to communicate effectively across cultures (The Core Competence Research Team, 2016). Shanghai, as an international city in China, has actively taken global and multicultural factors into account in its policies and strategic planning for the education of globally competent citizens. The Municipal Government of Shanghai stresses that education at different levels has to be internationalised in order to develop students' cross-cultural understanding, as well as their skills in cross-cultural communication and international collaboration (Shanghai Municipal Education Commission, 2012). In line with the national and municipal vision, global education, or education for international understanding, has emerged as a responsive strategy within curriculum reforms and development in many schools in China (Ma & Liang, 2015 ; Z. Wang & Xiong, 2011). However, education for international understanding is often reduced to learning about English-speaking countries, and particularly learning English, which prepares students for their further study in these countries, rather than developing their understanding of people from different countries or from different ethnic backgrounds (Qin, 2013). Meng (2014) points out that issues still need to be addressed in terms of teachers' inadequate knowledge about education for international understanding, and their

lack of pedagogical skills when trying to engage students in learning for international understanding. Overall, teachers' readiness for developing competent citizens for a multicultural and global context is a topic which remains under-researched in China. Meanwhile, scant attention has been paid to Chinese teachers' cultural responsiveness in multicultural classrooms.

Both the lack of globally competent teachers in Scotland and the little research about the preparation of Chinese globally competent teachers help to justify the necessity of my research on the internationalisation of teacher education. The next section examines what has been done in previous empirical studies about the internationalisation of teacher education, and what still needs to be addressed.

2.5 The internationalisation of teacher education

Along with the acknowledgement of global demands for globally competent teachers, there are an ample number of recommendations about different approaches to internationalising teacher education (Devlin-Foltz, 2010; Kissock & Richardson, 2010; Longview Foundation, 2008; West, 2012; Zhao, 2010). The internationalisation of teacher education is understood as a process of "not only broadening the knowledge base of teachers but also sensitising them to different perspectives on issues that can affect children, families and communities, and having those perspectives inform the way they teach" (Olmedo & Harbon, 2010, p.77). This definition raises a question about the extent to which different approaches broaden student teachers' knowledge base, develop their sensitivities to different issues and perspectives, and inform their future practices of teaching. With this question in mind, the following sections will look at studies regarding how teacher education is internationalised at universities, how it affects student teachers' learning, and what gaps exist in the literature. The internationalisation of teacher education will be reported according to two categories: internationalisation abroad and internationalisation at home.

2.5.1 The internationalisation of teacher education abroad

The internationalisation of teacher education is often associated with study abroad programmes, which are regarded as a unique way of developing globally competent teachers. This is because they can offer student teachers first-hand exploration of issues concerning cultural diversity and cross-cultural understanding (Dantas, 2007). Although student teachers have a lower level of engagement in overseas learning trips compared with their peers from other disciplinary backgrounds (Cushner, 2007; Kissock & Richardson, 2010), growing attention has been paid to study abroad programmes in research and practices of teacher preparation in many countries in the world. These learning trips are often short-term, ranging from a few days to a few months for either learning some topical modules or for placements in host countries.

To date, studies have tended to focus on student teachers' perceptions about the impact of study abroad experiences on them. They present a mixed picture of the challenges and benefits of these experiences. Some scholars recognise that student teachers can have minimal development through one single experience abroad (Addleman, Nava, Cevallos, Brazo, & Dixon, 2014; Major & Santoro, 2016; Santoro, 2014; Santoro & Major, 2012). Without proper guidance before, and during, the learning experiences, study abroad programmes cannot be very impactful on student teachers if they have been pushed out of their comfort zone in the host countries which have very different cultures from their own (Santoro & Major, 2012). Lack of support can make some student teachers retain some forms of privilege and power as foreign travellers in host countries, and maintain their existing assumptions which may be regarded as judgemental or Eurocentric (Addleman et al., 2014). Likewise, some other studies have also revealed that Australian student teachers' stereotypes or postcolonial racist attitudes can be reinforced when they conceive of study abroad programmes in India as a tourist trip (Santoro, 2014), or

when they use Australian or Western standards to judge education in the Solomon Islands (Major & Santoro, 2016). These studies suggest that additional efforts from universities (and particularly from teacher educators) must be made before, during, and after study abroad experiences, in order to prompt student teachers' critical reflection and to encourage transformative learning.

Challenges can also emerge from institutional barriers to, and student teachers' attitudes towards, international learning experiences. Mahon (2010) has examined national licensure regulations and institutional websites in the US, and found that barriers to the internationalisation of teacher education mainly result from universities' inadequate promotion of study abroad programmes. She suggests that the responsibility for internationalising teacher education rests with teacher educators who should have a better understanding of all aspects of their work in a global age, and of the importance of international perspectives for student teachers. They should therefore seek alternative ways to internationalise teacher education. In Scotland, Santoro et al. (2016) have revealed that barriers to internationalising teacher education abroad can also derive from student teachers' concerns about language barriers, and from a lack of confidence in their understanding of different cultural norms and behaviours. They suggest that more work needs to be done by universities to develop student teachers' willingness to participate in study abroad programmes.

Some studies have addressed the limitations of, and barriers to, the internationalisation of teacher education abroad by increasing the promotion and rigour of programmes, and by providing support or supportive environments for student teachers' personal and professional learning. Some researchers claim that the value of study abroad programmes can be better realised if careful consideration is made in the design of such programmes. For example, Stachowski and Sparks (2007) orchestrated international placements for student teachers by providing them with personalised learning opportunities and well-grounded content

knowledge, and by encouraging them to critically reflect on different perspectives in relation to educational and social issues, as well as on the different national and cultural contexts in which schools operate. After their thirty-year experience teaching abroad as teacher educators, these researchers acknowledge that well-structured international experiences can contribute to their student teachers' intellectual, personal and professional development as globally minded teachers. Similarly, Phillion and her colleague's (2011) study also suggests that teacher educators' skilful promotion of study abroad programmes, and the incorporation of suitable and educative experiences into these programmes, can develop student teachers' intercultural competence, and avoid some aspects of tourism.

The most valuable factor in study abroad programmes is student teachers' critical reflection on their disorienting experiences as cultural outsiders in host countries (Marx & Moss, 2011; Parr & Chan, 2015; Scoffham & Barnes, 2009; Trilokekar & Kukar, 2011). Transformative learning experiences can occur when student teachers when they have been well supported by tutors who have led structured conversations with them in a supportive group, and prepared them to challenge their invisible or hidden assumptions about people, cultures and other issues (Scoffham & Barnes, 2009). In the case study of one American student teacher, Marx and Moss (2011) have also found that the student teacher became more culturally aware and empathetic to people from different cultural backgrounds when she was guided to critically reflect on intercultural challenges in her own learning experience in the UK. The critical identity dialogues between teacher educators (who are mentors) and student teachers in an international practicum can also enable student teachers to engage with concepts of "I" and "Other", "us" and "them", and make better sense of the culturally disorienting experience (Parr & Chan, 2015).

What is common in study abroad programmes that have generated impactful learning experiences for student teachers is that these programmes have been very well organised and implemented to engage student teachers in academic, personal

and professional learning. However, the majority of studies are restricted to an exploration of the impact of one specific programme. They see study abroad programmes as the key approach to the internationalisation of teacher education within their institutional contexts. A recent study has brought attention to a comparison between two different study abroad programmes promoted by the same university (Dunn, Dotson, Cross, Kesner, & Lundahl, 2014), but these programmes still fall into the category of internationalisation abroad. Study abroad programmes are only part of the internationalisation of teacher education, and can cover only a small number of student teachers. To fully understand how student teachers are prepared to be globally competent teachers, it is also essential to look at approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education at home, which will be discussed in the following section.

2.5.2 The internationalisation of teacher education at home

While well-structured study abroad programmes can have a significant impact on student teachers' personal and professional growth, they hardly meet the needs of all student teachers. The highly structured nature of degree courses for student teachers and the additional financial burden highlight that study abroad programmes are an incomprehensive and inadequate solution to global challenges in teacher education (Stevick & Brown, 2016).

More than two decades ago, Wilson (1993) raised concerns about cross-cultural experiences for a large number of student teachers who were unable to participate in study abroad programmes or internationalised teacher education at home, by developing an on-campus conversation partner programme. In more recent years, many universities have attempted to internationalise teacher education at home by providing student teachers with field experiences in culturally diverse settings, global education, global citizenship education, international baccalaureate, comparative education, multicultural education, diversity education, or online

knowledge exchanges with student teachers abroad (Aydarova & Marquardt, 2016; Ferguson-Patrick et al., 2014; L. Guo, 2014; A. M. Ryan, Heineke, & Steindam, 2014; Spiro, 2011). There is also a growing tendency towards combining two or more of the approaches mentioned above in order to prepare culturally responsive or globally competent teachers, as shown in the combination of diversity education with field experiences in local communities or schools that demonstrated cultural diversity (Almarza, 2005; Barnes, 2006; Bennett, 2012; Miller-Dyce & Owusu-Ansah, 2016; Siwatu, Polydore, & Starker, 2009; Stevick & Brown, 2016; Walker-Dalhouse & Dalhouse, 2006).

Similar to study abroad programmes, individual approaches to internationalisation at home are also explored in terms of learning outcomes. Walker-Dalhouse and Dalhouse (2006) investigated 92 white student teachers at a university in the US by using self-administered questionnaires, and discovered that student teachers developed positive attitudes, beliefs and behaviours towards culturally diverse students and their parents after participating in seminar sessions about diversity and in field-based experiences with children from culturally diverse backgrounds. Similar results have been identified in other studies which bridged student teachers' theoretical learning about cultural diversity with their practices of teaching in culturally diverse settings (Barnes, 2006; Siwatu et al., 2009). These studies have confirmed that student teachers feel more confident in understanding different perspectives and views which are shaped by different cultures and experiences, build more trusting relationships with culturally diverse students, and more effectively connect students' school learning with their home cultures and experiences. In practice, many student teachers report that they have very little confidence or low self-efficacy when integrating what they have learned into teaching (Siwatu et al., 2009). These studies are mainly based on quantitative data, and generally report on the positive impact of multicultural dimensions on student teachers. They make little reference to the programmatic elements that contribute to student teachers' positive learning outcomes.

The specific learning moments that the combined approach of multicultural education and field experiences creates are mainly documented in qualitative research. In another study that bridged student teachers' theoretical learning of multiculturalism with field-based experiences, Almarza (2005) has found that impactful learning can occur when student teachers are guided to examine their assumptions and deconstruct their misconceptions through reflective inquiry about what they have learned in theory, and what they have experienced. Some other researchers have reported that student teachers can gain a deeper understanding of culturally responsive teaching when they are supported and encouraged to reflect critically upon the disorienting experiences which can arise from an interaction with culturally diverse children (Bennett, 2012; Miller-Dyce & Owusu-Ansah, 2016) or their families through home visits (Stevick & Brown, 2016) in the combined approach of multicultural education with field experiences. However, multicultural education, along with relevant field experiences, can become ineffective learning experiences for student teachers if they remain at a superficial level of reflection without explicit instruction or guidance (Bennett, 2012).

Many studies about the internationalisation of teacher education at home have shown that it is a complex task to prepare globally competent teachers. For example, one study has identified that student teachers from an Australian university developed an increased understanding of the importance of global education after their continuous engagement in modules which had global dimensions, but they had little understanding of their role in the world more generally (Ferguson-Patrick et al., 2014). The study suggests that more coordinated efforts are needed to encourage the integration of global education into teacher education courses. Such coordinated efforts were seen as essential in another study, where a group of Canadian student teachers observed within themselves a broader knowledge about education for global citizenship after learning about it in a compulsory module, and ultimately showed more enthusiasm and skills in teaching about global citizenship in

their teaching practices in placement schools (L. Guo, 2014). The researcher attributes the success of this process to the teacher educators' collaboration with the nongovernmental organisation UNICEF Canada in the systematic development of a module on education for global citizenship. To enhance the success, Guo (2014) recommends that more work and space are needed to systematically incorporate global dimensions into all aspects of teacher education if we are to prepare globally competent teachers who can act upon education for global citizenship. The recommendation is a reminder of the need for more efforts by teacher educators to promote the internationalisation of teacher education in a more systematic way.

2.5.3 Identifying the gaps in the internationalisation of teacher education

Most previous empirical studies focus on the impact of a particular approach of internationalisation, either abroad or at home, on student teachers. Signs of success are reflected in positive learning outcomes. Some effective factors which contribute to student teachers' development as globally competent teachers are also well documented in these studies. Some other studies have identified the limitations of, and barriers to, a certain approach of internationalisation. However, there are four gaps emerging from the literature review.

First, previous studies are largely restricted to exploring the outcomes of individual approaches to internationalisation based on the views of student teachers. A common theme running through previous studies is that student teachers can experience more positive changes as a result of well-structured approaches. Positive learning outcomes appear to be closely associated with factors such as disorienting experiences, critical reflection and dialogues, as is shown in many studies about internationalisation abroad and at home (e.g. Bennett, 2012; Marx & Moss, 2011; Miller-Dyce & Owusu-Ansah, 2016; Parr & Chan, 2015; Stevick & Brown, 2016; Trilokekar & Kukar, 2011). However, there is little information about the nature of these factors, and how such factors enable student teachers to progress towards

positive learning outcomes. This requires an in-depth exploration of the developmental processes of student teachers in the learning experiences so that insightful ideas can be drawn from it to inform the future design and organisation of the learning experiences that have an intercultural, international or global dimension.

Second, there is a lack of research about teacher educators' views towards, and practices of, the internationalisation of teacher education, despite the acknowledgement of the importance of their efforts. As many previous studies have revealed, student teachers engage in more impactful learning through well-structured approaches to internationalisation, but these studies also emphasise the importance of support or guidance from teacher educators, particularly those who are working on the internationalisation of teacher education within their institutional contexts. However, previous studies are restricted to investigating the perspectives of student teachers in regard to learning outcomes. Little research has been done to examine how academics who are shaped by different lived experiences understand internationalisation in teacher education, and how their understandings form a particular discourse which may affect their practices of internationalisation, and their student teachers' learning experiences. West (2012) also suggests that teacher educators play a foundational role in internationalising teacher education programmes, and that it is essential for them to understand what internationalisation means, and what the process can bring to student teachers.

Third, there is a lack of a holistic picture of institutional practices of internationalisation in teacher education. The existing literature predominantly presents the internationalisation of teacher education in fragmented approaches such as study abroad programmes and other learning activities which have intercultural, international and global dimensions. Each of these approaches can only be viewed as an added international or intercultural experience, or as an additional module (Koziol, Greenberg, Williams, Niehaus, & Jacobson, 2011). Many

universities act on the internationalisation of teacher education in some unrelated and fragmented approaches which are shown in the studies discussed above. According to de Wit (2016), it is a misconception of internationalisation if it is only understood as a cluster of fragmented approaches which fail to grasp the comprehensive nature of internationalisation. To understand the comprehensive process of internationalisation in teacher education, a holistic view of different approaches is needed. The juxtaposition of different approaches can also allow for comparisons between them, which can be important to inform universities about how to work on responsive strategies for internationalisation in teacher education.

Fourth and finally, most of the theoretical proposals for, and empirical studies about, the internationalisation of teacher education are based in Western contexts, particularly in the US, Australia and the UK. As a result, they are mainly concerned with how Western universities prepare Western student teachers to become globally competent teachers. Little attention is paid to how the internationalisation of teacher education is understood in Eastern countries. Devos (2003) suggests that the stories about internationalisation have to be understood in the context in which they occur because multiple perspectives and discourses about it "have currency at a particular time and place" (p.158). Therefore, the conceptualisation of internationalisation in teacher education at one institution may differ from that at another, and Western conceptualisations of internationalisation may not apply in the Eastern context. It is important to explore both Eastern and Western views towards the internationalisation of teacher education. In particular, the exploration of the internationalisation of teacher education at case-study universities in China and Scotland allows me to compare different views from Scottish and Chinese teacher educators and student teachers, as well as the different practices of internationalisation within and across the universities.

2.6 Summary

This chapter started with a discussion about the concepts of globalisation and internationalisation in higher education from different perspectives. Following the discussion about these concepts, two major themes were presented as the global impact on education: global interconnectedness and cultural diversity. In response to global impact, the chapter then moved on to the demand for globally competent teachers who can educate students for global citizenship, and can conduct culturally responsive teaching to students from culturally diverse backgrounds. The review of the studies about teacher preparation in many parts of the world and agendas of education in the two national contexts identified the urgent need to internationalise teacher education in order to adequately prepare Chinese and Scottish student teachers to become globally competent teachers. The chapter then reviewed studies about institutional practices of internationalisation in teacher education according to the two streams: internationalisation abroad and at home. In what follows, the theoretical framework will be introduced.

Chapter 3 Theoretical Framework

3.1 Introduction

The discourse of internationalisation in teacher education, as identified in the review of empirical studies in Section 2.5, is often dominated by the Western world, while voices of non-Western countries are seldom heard. To understand internationalisation in teacher education at the two research sites, it is important to use postcolonial theory as a critical tool for engaging in in-depth discussions about different voices from both sites. Postcolonial theory is developed to deconstruct the ideological heritage of colonialism in both Western and non-Western countries, and to promote dialogues or interaction between the two (Young, 2016). It is helpful for this study because it draws attention to unheard voices in educational studies, and encourages alternative views which challenge Western forms of knowledge (Crossley & Tikly, 2004). The theoretical framework mainly draws upon the works of Said (1978, 1993), Bhabha (1994) and Spivak (1993, 2002) who offer useful postcolonial insights for this study.

3.2 Postcolonialism: discourse and power

Discourses are embodied in language, ideas, institutions and practices of human beings, which "systematically form the objects of which they speak" (Foucault, 1972, p. 49). A discourse links knowledge with power, because it creates knowledge systems that decide on what to be spoken and acted upon (Foucault, 1980). This reveals the intersection between the creation of knowledge and the exercise of power in the formation of discourse. According to Foucault (1972, 1991), the dominant discourse separates the normal from the abnormal, and shapes individuals as a result of power and authority acting upon them. Those who do not follow the norms or rules of the dominant discourse of knowledge will be

marginalised or oppressed. In postcolonial studies, Foucault's idea about the normativity and marginalisation of discourse is helpful for examining the oppression of the colonised due to their ethnic difference (Hiddleston, 2009).

The term "postcolonial" has shifted from its original description of the period after colonialism to "a fighting term" or "a theoretical weapon" (N. Lazarus, 2004, p. 4). As a theoretical weapon, postcolonial theory functions in two major ways. The first reveals an imbalance in power relations between the West and the non-West. According to Bhabha (1994), postcolonial theory is developed "from the colonial testimony of Third World countries and the discourses of 'minorities' within the geopolitical divisions of East and West, North and South" (p. 171). The global North is often described as the Western metropolitan centre, and is associated with developed countries such as those in Europe and North America, as well as Australia and New Zealand (Slater, 2008). The global South is generally assumed to be those developing countries (mainly including countries outside Europe and North America) which form the world periphery, in the sense of being economically poorer and often culturally or politically marginalised because of colonisation or new forms of colonialism (Dados & Connell, 2012; Escobar, 2011). The distinction is not necessarily made in a geographical sense. For example, Australia is located in the South, but belongs to the global North when it is associated with the white settlers who possess more wealth and privilege than aboriginal people (Connell, 2007). These binary oppositions (such as the East and the West, the global South and the global North, the developing and the developed) are problematic and contested despite the broad use of these terms in literature. They draw our attention to the core-periphery power relations in intellectual fields, which are represented in "authority, exclusion and inclusion, hegemony, partnership, sponsorship, appropriation – between intellectuals and institutions in the metropole and those in the world periphery" (Connell, 2007, p. ix). For the purpose of this study, these binary terms are used for revealing power differences in different parts of the world, rather than reifying a binary ontology which is disrupted by postcolonial

perspectives.

The imbalanced power relationships between the Western metropolitan centre and Eastern peripheries are particularly reflected in Said's (1978) seminal work on Orientalism. The Orient is conceptualised by the West in a discursive way, which reinforces the colonial impulse of conquest or control not only in political and economic aspects, but also in intellectual fields. Orientalism is "a style of thought based upon an ontological and epistemological distinction made between 'the Orient' and (most of the time) 'the Occident'" (Said, 1978, p. 2). The division of the world into a dichotomy between the Occident (West) and the Orient (East), "us" and "them", is a Western tendency of othering which positions Oriental others as inferior, and in need of civilising by the developed and enlightened Occidentals (Said, 1978, 1993). However, this dichotomy is misleading and reductive, because the Orient is created to refer to all that is "other" to the Western self. The conceptualisation of the Orient by the West is a process of "dealing with [the Orient] by making statements about it, authorising views of it, describing it, by teaching it, settling it, ruling over it" (Said, 1978, p. 3). As a Western way of thought, Orientalism positions the West as the superior self, and the East as inferior others. It helps justify or legitimise the dominating Western metropolitan centre's desire or obligation to expand their imperial power over the Orient.

Western domination over non-Western countries is manifested in a new form of colonialism or imperialism in the increasingly globalised world. Imperialism or neoimperialism refers to a way of control which means "the practice, the theory, and the attitudes of a dominating metropolitan centre rul[e] in a distant territory", while the effect of imperial domination felt in peripheral territories is colonialism or neocolonialism (Said, 1993, p. 8). Neocolonialism, developed from postcolonial analysis, is viewed as a continued form of colonialism, and mainly refers to the economic and cultural dependence of countries from the global South on those from the global North (Loomba, 2005). These understandings about neocolonialism

and neoimperialism suggest that the global North is advanced or developed, while the global South is backward or developing. In academic fields, postcolonial theory is deployed in order to examine the perpetuating asymmetrical power relations prevalent in the dominant discourse reinforced by neocolonialism and neoimperialism.

Neoimperial or neocolonial perspectives are perpetuated in educational discourses. Education is regarded as a central means of normalising the postcolonial world through the vision of development or technical assistance by the West, particularly reflected in the neoliberal rationalities and educational strategies or programmes of the World Bank and other international development agencies (Tikly, 2004). These aid and development discourses are based on the taken-for-granted assumption that the global South is economically poorer and needs to be developed according to Western norms and through Western assistance (Kapoor, 2004). Acknowledging education as an important means of alleviating poverty in the global South, international development agencies provide “disciplinary mechanisms of poverty-conditional lending, poverty reduction strategies and international target setting” (Tikly, 2004, p. 190), which make low-income countries less capable of deciding their own education agendas, and consequently more dependent on Western education systems and resources. The sense of responsibility derived from these development discourses gives rise to global inequalities, which are hidden beneath impulses of benevolence or care from the global North. The universal morality behind these development discourses is an indication of Western epistemic violence which imposes “epistemological sovereignty over the bodies and minds of [the incapable distant] others” (Laqueur, 1989, p. 189).

Another manifestation of Western hegemony in education is shown in the diffusion of Western educational policies, ideas and practices in the global South (Portnoi, 2016). As neoliberal globalisation has deeply shaped education policies in many Western countries to meet the needs of the global knowledge economy, this

neoliberal influence flows "from European core to southern periphery" (Samoff, 2003, p. 3). As a result of this one-way flow of neoliberal ideas and values through policy borrowing from the West, the multidimensional process of globalisation is viewed in similar ways, and educational policies are oriented towards the same neoliberal logic in many developing countries (Rizvi, 2007). From a postcolonial perspective, the diffusion of Western policies leads to a false universalism and reinforces unequal power structures, which ignore cultural differences and the historical pasts of developing countries, as well as the particular interests of the Western developed countries.

3.3 Postcolonialism: agency and resistance

The second aspect of postcolonial theory as a theoretical weapon is that it proposes that the Orient can take on agency to resist Western discourse of knowledge. Agency refers to the postcolonial subjects' ability to perform an action which engages with, or resists, imperial power (Ashcroft, Griffiths, & Tiffin, 2007). For example, the Orient can assume agency by taking "the voyage in" or entering "into the discourse of Europe and the West, to mix with it, transform it, to make it acknowledge marginalised or suppressed or forgotten histories" (Said, 1993, pp. 260-261). This means that it may be possible for the Orient to transform Orientalist representations or constructions by working within and against Western dominant discourses of knowledge, and to ultimately resume selves in opposition to the Orientalised others, though admittedly it can be very difficult to entirely escape the influence of the dominant discourse that assigns meaning to them.

In view of these asymmetrical power relationships between the East and the West, Said (1993) argues for resistance to the ontological and epistemological mastery of the Oriental "others" by the dominant Western self, and an ethical awareness of difference. From a postcolonial perspective, resistance is a discursive process of negotiation and exchange of knowledge, which works against the clear-cut binary

oppositions between East and West (Hiddleston, 2009). According to Bhabha's (1994) understanding in *The Location of Culture*, resistance to colonial discourse involves notions of ambivalence and hybridity. His ambivalence of the colonial discourse is demonstrated in the following three main concepts. According to Bhabha, the gap or space between the creation of a meaning and the subject to which the meaning refers is called the "Third Space". The Third Space is an indicator of cultural ambivalence and a condition for productivity. In his view, "[t]he intervention of the Third Space of enunciation, which makes the structure of meaning and reference an ambivalent process, destroys this mirror of representation in which cultural knowledge is customarily revealed as an integrated, open, expanding code" (Bhabha, 1994, p. 37). The "intervention" means that the dominated culture and people can interpolate the different modes of knowledge within colonial discourse, resisting imperial forces that construct them as "others", rather than being consumed by these forces (Ashcroft, 2001).

Another sign of Bhabha's (1994) ambivalence of the colonial discourse is the stereotype. For him, "the stereotype … is a form of knowledge and identification that vacillates between what is always 'in place', already known, and something that must be anxiously repeated … as if the essential duplicity of the Asiatic or the bestial sexual licence of the African needs no proof, can never really, in discourse, be proved" (Bhabha, 1994, p. 66). For Bhabha, the stereotype suggests that the images of the colonised are fixed, and that they are repeatedly portrayed as inferior, barbarian or uncivilised, though the lack of proof reveals the uncertainty of the coloniser when producing and repeating the stereotype. The absence of proof confirms that the stereotype is an illusionary picture of the colonised which refuses to acknowledge cultural difference and only separates the image from the colonised themselves (Hiddleston, 2009). In his analysis of the stereotype in colonial discourse, Bhabha (1994) suggests that it is important to recognise cultural difference and resist the fixed and illusionary image of the colonised in postcolonial studies.

The third indicator of Bhabha's (1994) ambivalence of colonial discourse is mimicry. Mimicry is an attempt to regulate, reform, discipline, and appropriate "others" through colonial power, but it is also viewed as "the sign of the inappropriate" or "a difference … [which] intensifies surveillance, and poses an immanent threat to both 'normalised' knowledges and disciplinary powers" (Bhabha, 1994, p. 86). This means that mimicry is controlled by the coloniser, who reshapes the colonised in the former's own image, but in the meantime, it works against colonial discourse, because there are slippages and moments of alterity in mimicking the colonial modes of knowledge and power by the colonised (Hiddleston, 2009). The ambivalent nature of mimicry also suggests that there is no exact imitation, but it can be used as a potential strategy for the colonised to deconstruct and resist the colonial discourse.

As discussed above, the three key concepts (i.e. the Third Space, the stereotype and mimicry) of Bhabha's ambivalence challenge the fixation or certainty of colonial discourse and acknowledge the presence of otherness and difference. This is associated with another concept that Bhabha has recognised as a key feature of colonial discourse: hybridity. For example, the Third Space between fixed representations or identifications in colonial discourse provides a possibility for the emergence of "a cultural hybridity that entertains difference without an assumed or imposed hierarchy" (Bhabha, 1994, p. 4). In this sense, hybridisation is a process of resistance against colonial discourse which reverses its dominating effects and allows "other 'denied' knowledges [to] enter upon the dominant discourse" (Bhabha, 1994, p. 114). In postcolonial cultural engagement, this process of resistance relies on the recognition of the importance of cultures and traditions in individual countries, especially those countries which are former colonies (Ashcroft et al., 2007). The hybrid nature of colonial discourse acknowledges the capacity of the colonised, and creates an opportunity for decolonising projects which undermine colonial power and necessitate cultural dialogues and exchanges.

The ambivalence of colonial discourse helps researchers to "caution against generalising the contingencies and contours of local circumstance, at the very moment at which a transnational, 'migrant' knowledge of the world is most urgently needed" (Bhabha, 1994, p. 214). The hybrid nature of colonial discourse draws our attention to the ability of the dominated to challenge fixed and exclusionary modes of knowledge (Rizvi, Lingard, & Lavia, 2006). For this study, the ambivalence and hybridity of colonial discourse function as both a necessary caution against homogenising the discourse of internationalisation in teacher education, and as an inspiration for a transnational exchange of ideas about this topic in the increasingly globalised world.

3.4 Decolonisation through the transformation of mind-sets

Spivak's (1993) studies about the subaltern call for the deconstruction of the dominant discourse of knowledge in postcolonial studies. For Spivak and many other postcolonial scholars, the subaltern is generally identified as those oppressed or powerless groups such as non-whites, non-Europeans, women, oppressed castes and the lower classes (Loomba, 2005; Young, 2016). In a famous example, Spivak (1993) raises scepticism about the colonial impulse to rescue the subaltern or powerless women from the Indian custom of widow sacrifice after the funeral of their husbands. In this example, Spivak (1993) argues that there is an absence of the voices of the subaltern subject in the white men's intention to save Indian widows from Indian men through legislation enacted by the British government, and in the Indian men's claim that the widows wanted to die. The impulses towards "speaking for" and "speaking about" the subaltern are indicative of problematic representations (Andreotti, 2007b). In problematic representations, it is difficult to recover the subaltern (women) subject's voice if power differences are grounded on a general categorisation between colonisers and the colonised.

Spivak's example further suggests the importance of learning from the subaltern by

acknowledging their singularities or multiplicity, instead of identifying them through the deterministic knowledge of the powerful, particularly in colonial encounters (Hiddleston, 2009). This requires the imperial powers to stop portraying themselves as superior to local women and men in the epistemic violence of imperialism, and to stop legitimising "speaking for" the subaltern in the process of civilising or modernising them. Based on Spivak's (1996, 2002) suggestions on learning from the subaltern and on the transformation of mind-sets, Andreotti (2007b) proposes that to interact with the global South ethically, "people [from the global North] should unlearn their privilege and learn to learn from below (from the subaltern)" (p. 75). Similarly, Kapoor (2004) suggests that Western people should "stop thinking of [themselves] as better or fitter, and unlearn dominant systems of knowledge and representation" (p. 641). According to these suggestions, it is essential for Western people to deconstruct their worldviews and learn from difference, rather than merely describing the subaltern as inferior beings who need to be civilised by the West.

A change of mind-sets also requires that people from the global South should avoid the attitude of becoming civilised, catching up with, or following the normative practices of the global North (Andreotti, 2007b). This means that people from the global South need to become aware of their capacity to resist Western dominant modes of knowledge and to engage in intercultural dialogues. To achieve diversity in educational models, the use of English, a dominant language, plays a key role in the interpolation, appropriation and transformation of Western discourses of knowledge or the dominant forms of representation (Ashcroft, 2001). In comparative and international education, for example, alternative education systems and realities can gain access to the wider world and reach a wider audience by using English as the medium for communication, or as cultural capital for consumption (Crossley & Tikly, 2004). However, if not done cautiously, an overemphasis on the use of English can inadvertently reinforce colonial discourse. According to Thiong'o (1992), some African countries reify English as "the measure of intelligence and ability" (p. 12) of

the local people in schools and professional fields, which hold "captive their cultures, their values and hence their minds" (p. 32). This means that to deconstruct the colonial discourse of education, it is important to change the attitude of the dominated people towards the dominant language and culture and to decolonise their minds. By doing so, people from the global South can reclaim their agency and identities and negotiate a space where they can share their own cultures and values (Bhabha, 1994). The change of mind-sets holds potential for deconstructing colonial power and allows for mutual learning between the global North and the global South, the powerful and the powerless.

3.5 Summary

The concepts proposed by key postcolonial scholars such as Said (1978, 1993), Bhabha (1994) and Spivak (1993, 1996) are very useful for a deep understanding of the relations between colonial power and multiple manifestations of inequalities in the global community, and provide a critical analysis of the nuances and implications of these relations. However, postcolonialism is criticised for being guilty of involving colonialism, or a new form of colonialism, by commodifying and exoticising cultures of others without paying due attention to factors such as global capitalism and historical specificities (Dirlik, 1994; Huggan, 2002). In response to this criticism, Hiddleston (2009) argues that postcolonialism should be distinguished from postcoloniality. According to Hiddleston (2009), the former refers to a movement of questioning and disrupting colonial practices and their evolving links with asymmetrical power relations in today's world, while the latter is connected with neocolonialism, as it "is the broader epoch and set of conditions in which such exoticisation has come to thrive" (p. 5). Following this understanding, postcolonialism is deployed in this study as an open process of questioning and critique, rather than serving as a single way of understanding colonialism and its aftermath. In particular, postcolonial perspectives are used to offer both a vocabulary, and a critical lens, for analysing and discussing the data related to the

colonial past, as well as the neocolonial present in the internationalisation of teacher education in both Western and non-Western contexts. Postcolonialism is relevant to this study because it acknowledges difference, and the importance of intercultural dialogues and exchanges in knowledge generation, which philosophically and methodologically aligns with the design of this study, as shown in the next chapter.

Chapter 4 Methodology

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the research methodology chosen for this study and my justification for using it. The chapter begins with the research paradigm and the rationale for doing qualitative research. The philosophical assumptions underpinned by constructivism will be specifically discussed. Based on the philosophical positions, discussions and justifications will be made on my research design in the form of case studies investigated through a qualitative questionnaire and semi-structured interviews. Along with the methods for data collection, details about the research settings and participants will be discussed. I will then give a detailed account of the analytic strategy I chose and how I dealt with my data. At the end of the chapter, my own historical and cultural locations and ethical concerns will be presented.

4.2 Research paradigm and rationale for a qualitative approach

A research paradigm plays a crucial role in understanding the nature of a social reality and the philosophical assumptions on which the research is based. It is regarded as the "basic belief system or worldview" (Guba & Lincoln, 1994, p.105) that informs and guides the investigation. In other words, a paradigm can inform researchers about what to look at, and how to proceed with the research action (Huff, 2009). My research adopted a constructivist paradigm because its underlying philosophical assumptions underpinned my research questions, and the methods used to collect information in order to answer these questions. Creswell (2013) articulates four philosophical assumptions, including beliefs about ontology (the nature of reality), epistemology (the nature of knowledge and its justification), axiology (what is intrinsically valuable), and methodology (how research is conducted).

The purpose of my research is to explore how teacher education is internationalised in both China and Scotland in terms of the two streams or pillars of internationalisation – internationalisation at home and abroad (Knight, 2004, 2008) and how the two pillars shape student teachers' development as globally competent teachers. To achieve this aim, my research took a qualitative approach. Denzin and Lincoln (2011) define qualitative research as a situated activity in the social world which is made visible through human voices and behaviours. According to them, these voices and behaviours can be represented in interviews and some other means of qualitative inquiry, which bring full meaning to the phenomenon under investigation. More specifically, Creswell (2013) proposes key features of qualitative research, which are helpful in demonstrating the rationale for choosing this approach. He emphasises that qualitative research aims to present a holistic picture of the issue or problem in a natural setting, through participants' perceptions from different sources of data, and through the researcher's own experiences and interpretation.

Referring to these features, my research can be considered as qualitative research. First, my research was situated in two institutional settings where my participants, both academics and student teachers, were located. Second, different participants in the research gave their views on the understanding, the value, the challenges, and the possibilities of the internationalisation of teacher education based on their own experiences. Third, the research adopted two methods of qualitative data collection, which included a qualitative questionnaire as well as semi-structured interviews intended to delve into the complexity of the studied phenomenon.

4.2.1 Constructivism

According to the constructivist paradigm, meaning and truth are constructed by social actors through their interactions with their lived experiences, and with others

in society (Lincoln, Lynham, & Guba, 2011). Researchers who employ the constructivist paradigm tend to understand a complex phenomenon through the multiple realities created by different individuals who have lived it (Schwandt, 2000).

From an ontological perspective, constructivists believe that multiple realities exist, as these realities are socially and experientially constructed by individuals who assign different meanings to, and have different understandings of, a social phenomenon (Guba & Lincoln, 1994). It indicates that social realities are the result of the process of meaning construction by social actors, who have direct interaction with people and things within the social phenomenon. My ontological assumptions are represented in my appreciation for the different stories that different participants regarded as important to the internationalisation of teacher education. I did not intend to produce "a definitive capture of a reality that can be generalised to a larger population" (Mertens, 2010, p. 19), but rather, my plan was to shed light on how teacher educators understand internationalisation, and how internationalisation shapes student teachers' learning within different institutional contexts.

The acknowledgement of multiple realities constructed through social interactions highlights the subjective nature of knowledge. From an epistemological perspective, constructivists endorse the view that the world of human perceptions is "made up" rather than existing as an absolute truth (Patton, 2002, p. 96). This is because people are shaped by their own lived experiences which can influence the knowledge they generate (Lincoln et al., 2011). In my research, for example, student teachers' exposure to, or interactions with, ideas, people, cultures and education systems in other countries through involvement in learning activities which have an intercultural, international or global dimension can allow them to develop different views about their learning experiences. Teacher educators can also hold different views about the internationalisation of teacher education, as their personal experiences can be reflected in their understandings and interpretations. The

subjective meanings socially and historically constructed by the participants form the foundation of knowledge. However, knowledge also comes from what the researcher has generated throughout the inquiry. This is because constructivists believe that findings are the result of the interaction between the researcher and the participants (Guba, 1990; Guba & Lincoln, 1994). To validate my knowledge claims, I drew upon Mertens's (2010) advice about attending to the contexts of the data, and offered multiple examples through direct quotations from my participants in order to support my interpretations.

In the quest for knowledge, researchers have to consider the value and ethics of discovering what is going on in reality. This is the concern of axiology. As Heron and Reason (1997) claim, the axiological assumption "is about values of being, about what human states are to be valued simply by virtue of what they are" (p. 286). Within the constructivist paradigm, the important products of research are thought to be "personally relative and need to be understood" (Lincoln et al., 2011, p.109). My research can be valued as personally relevant to my participants who were the direct participants within the studied phenomenon. Meanwhile, different understandings about, and approaches to, internationalisation can result in different experiences for the participants, contributing to the complexity of the phenomenon, which requires a detailed investigation for an in-depth understanding. To achieve this, I followed the ethical principles of the constructivist paradigm in order to develop trustworthiness, authenticity, rapport, reflexivity and reciprocity in the process of inquiry (Lincoln, 2009; Mertens, 2010). In particular, I promoted caring and justice in relations between myself as the researcher, and my participants, through the process of co-constructing knowledge about internationalisation through the open-ended questions contained within the qualitative questionnaire and the semi-structured interviews. The outcomes of the inquiry were also intrinsically valuable because I explored the internationalisation of teacher education, both in the West and the East, which was bolstered by the views of academics and student teachers, and further enhanced social justice in the study.

Methodology illustrates what shapes the choice and application of the methods of data collection and analysis and how they link the research objectives with the research outcomes (Crotty, 1998). It involves how the philosophical assumptions mentioned above are interwoven in a research design, and how they inform methods or techniques in order to generate and analyse data and achieve the research objectives. According to Angen (2000), research within the constructivist or interpretivist paradigm typically adopts qualitative methods. From both the ontological and epistemological perspectives mentioned above, the varied lived experiences, and the multiple voices of my participants, can present the internationalisation of teacher education as a complex and multifaceted phenomenon. To obtain increased knowledge about this complex phenomenon within two institutional and social contexts, a case-study approach is needed to gather detailed information about how my participants view and interact with the learning or working contexts in which they have been involved.

Research within the constructivist paradigm mainly depends on naturalistic methods which allow for a dialogic process of data collection, and ensure a collaborative construction of meanings for social realties between researchers and participants (Angen, 2000). Naturalistic methods can include interviewing, observation and content analysis (Westbrook, 1994). In my research, semi-structured interviews were used as the main source of data, with a qualitative questionnaire as the supporting source of data, because multiple voices and realities can hardly be collected by statistical means. Meanwhile, the semi-structured feature of the interviews, and the open-ended questions asked in both the interviews and most parts of the questionnaire, provided sufficient opportunities for my participants and me to engage in a dialogic process of co-constructing meaningful realities.

These methods are also in line with constructivist axiology which demands that the research be related to participants' experiences, and that the process of the inquiry

be intrinsically valuable. When my participants were interacting with me in either the interviews or the questionnaire, meaningful realities would be constructed from participants' own experiences and interpretations, and from my own analysis. From the constructivist standpoint, dialogues and collaborative construction in the process of inquiry also allowed me to gain information through rich contexts which can form the discourse for interpreting meaning and identifying themes from the data.

My philosophical assumptions, underpinned by constructivism, are compatible with the theoretical framework of this study. Both constructivism and postcolonialism reject a universal mastery of knowledge and realities. The ethical awareness of difference, as well as cultures and traditions of different countries emphasised by postcolonial theory, is in line with a constructivist ontology which acknowledges the existence of multiple realities. Further to this, postcolonial perspectives draw our attention to the imbalanced power relationships in Western dominant discourses of knowledge, and argue for the importance of negotiation and exchanges in knowledge production. This aligns with a constructivist epistemology which claims that knowledge is co-constructed by social actors who are shaped by different lived experiences.

4.3 Case studies

This qualitative inquiry explored the internationalisation of teacher education through a rich discourse of how it was understood and carried out in each particular setting. An in-depth understanding of specific practices of unique cases in reality falls into the concerns of a case-study approach (Stake, 2006). Therefore, the research employed a case-study approach to achieve the research aim.

Case studies are flexible in regard to types. Case studies can be framed in different sizes: for example, an individual, a group of individuals, a programme, or an event,

can be identified as a case worth studying (Creswell, 2013; Yin, 2014). Creswell (2013) claims that case studies can also be grouped into the following three categories: the single instrumental case study which focuses on the illustration of an issue or concern through a bounded case; the multiple or collective case study which focuses on the illustration of an issue or concern on the basis of multiple cases; and the intrinsic case study which focuses on the case itself. My research is a collective case study: the internationalisation of teacher education was selected as an issue to be investigated, and one institution from each of two national backgrounds was selected as the cases to be examined.

Case studies can afford rich data which is generated from different sources (Creswell, 2013). Yin (2014) considers these different sources of evidence as a major strength of the case-study approach, because they help develop convergent lines of investigation, and contribute to data triangulation, which is important when portraying an event accurately. He suggests six typical sources of evidence, namely interviews, documentation, direct observation, participant observation, archival records and physical artefacts. In my research, an exploration of the multiple views of my participants about the internationalisation of teacher education required rich data from different sources. Therefore, the semi-structured interviews and questionnaire were used in my research in order to collect sufficient information for the answering of my research questions, with the intention of confirming the evidence from participants' accounts.

The final reason resides in data analysis. Themes identified within a real-life context through intensive analysis can provide a deep understanding of the complexity of each case, rather than afford a generalisation beyond the case (Creswell, 2013). In my research, data was analysed with a detailed description of the context, in terms of participants' characteristics, and their lived experiences in the process of internationalisation. The intensive analysis in my cases was helpful for gaining deep insights into teacher educators' understanding and practices of internationalisation

in teacher education, as well as student teachers' learning experiences at specific universities in China and Scotland, rather than generalising them to other Chinese and Scottish universities.

4.4 Data collection

This section maps out the research sites, the participants, and the methods used for data collection.

4.4.1 The research sites

Two universities, one located in China and the other in Scotland, were chosen purposively as the cases for the research investigation.

Nanhai University[2] *– Shanghai, China*

Nanhai University, located in Shanghai, China, was selected as one of the two sites. In response to social changes brought about by global forces, and reforms of educational policies in China on preparing human capital and developing national competitiveness, Nanhai University has recognised the importance of internationalising initial teacher education, has highlighted internationalisation in the aims and objectives of teacher education, and has made attempts to internationalise teacher education through different approaches. Though internationalisation can also be found as a buzzword in institutional policies and practices of teacher education in many, if not all, universities in China, one of the reasons for my choice of Nanhai University is that it is a university that specialises in teacher education. Nanhai University provides more than 60% of the teachers and

[2] This is a pseudonym given to the university based in Shanghai, which mainly specialises in teacher education, in the hope of protecting participants from being identified based on where they are located.

leaders employed by schools in Shanghai.[3] This means that the university shoulders a great responsibility due to its contribution to quality of basic education in the city.

The university has also established many centres or institutes focusing on international and comparative research into education and international surveys on teaching and learning. These centres or institutes are an indication of the university's active engagement with international educational research and assessment. Through its engagement in international education, the university has paid full attention to the global trend of basic education, and has attracted due attention from the outside world through its research projects on Shanghai education, such as the discussions and reports made on Shanghai students' PISA (Programme for International Student Assessment) results, Chinese math education, and influential factors for teacher education in TALIS (OECD's Teaching and Learning International Survey).

The university is keen on incorporating international components into its programmes, modules, lectures and other learning activities for teacher education, both at home and abroad. Successful programmes have been established by the university for knowledge exchange between Chinese teachers and those from other countries. In initial teacher education in particular, the university has increased investment in international exchanges and cooperation through different means. In particular, there are an increasing number of study abroad programmes for student teachers. As an active advocate, as well as an actor in the internationalisation of teacher education, Nanhai University is a unique case to be studied in terms of how teacher education is internationalised, and how it shapes student teachers' learning and development.

[3] For confidentiality purposes, references concerning the university cannot be provided; however, all the information about the university (including statistics, teaching mission, aims and objectives, international engagement, etc.) has been either translated from Chinese to English, or paraphrased on the basis of news and policies released on the university website.

Southside University[4] – Scotland

The other case for my research is Southside University in Scotland. The School of Education at Southside University is one of the largest providers of teacher education in Europe, and the leading provider in Scotland.[5] The university has acknowledged the important role that the internationalisation of teacher education plays in the development of competent teachers for all children. This university, as stated on its website, aims to prepare competent teachers who can ensure quality teaching and learning for the personal and social growth of all students. Its aim is in alignment with the Guidelines for Initial Teacher Education programmes in Scotland. It also works according to the benchmark statements for professional qualifications in Scotland by stressing issues concerning equity, social justice and inclusion, as well as the role of culture and community in education. These issues are in line with the Standards for Registration, which require that qualified teachers should value and respect cultural, social and ecological diversity and educate all students to become local and global citizens for a better future (General Teaching Council for Scotland, 2012b).

Meanwhile, as a key provider of teacher education in Scotland, the university works hard on its research by incorporating international perspectives and collaborating with those from worldwide educational community of the world, with the aim of maximising its positive impact on practices, as well as the theory-building of teacher education. Aside from international relevance in research, Southside University maintains worldwide collaborative links in its practices of teacher education. In its different courses for student teachers, the university provides opportunities for international exchanges or placements through a range of partner organisations and

[4] This is also a pseudonym given to the university based in Scotland to prevent participants from being identified based on their institutional location.

[5] As with Nanhai University, references concerning the university cannot be provided for confidentiality reasons. Therefore all the information about this university (including the statistics, aims and objectives, research themes, internationally collaborative links, etc.) has been paraphrased on the basis of news and policies released on the university website.

institutions in many countries. It also incorporates international perspectives and issues into different events for teacher education. Moreover, there are three centres within the School of Education at the university, two of which have been used successfully to support and promote quality teachers for an increasingly multicultural society. One centre has facilitated and supported study abroad programmes for student teachers to learn Chinese language and culture. The other works alongside national and international organisations to promote the importance of different cultures and languages for life and work, and to prepare teachers to deliver quality language learning in schools.

The central focuses of its research and practices are based on how teachers are educated, how they shape their identity, and how they work in response to cultural and linguistic diversity. All these efforts with international links and perspectives have been made to prepare competent teachers for a multicultural context locally, nationally or even globally, which falls into my research focus on internationalising teacher education.

4.4.2 The participants

An in-depth exploration of the internationalisation of teacher education at the two universities requires participants who can provide rich information for understanding the phenomenon under study. The selection of "*information-rich cases*" is the logic of purposive sampling, because researchers can learn much about issues important to the research purpose from these cases (Patton, 2002, p.230. emphasis in original). Participants selected for purposive sampling bear characteristics relevant to the research, and demonstrate a certain degree of diversity, allowing for an exploration of the impact of the characteristics of events (Ritchie, Lewis, & Elam, 2003). According to these features of purposive sampling and, as befits the focus of my research, I recruited my participants by checking the modules and programmes available for student teachers on the two universities'

websites, and through initial talks with two staff members from each university's School of Education. After the website search, initial talks and ethical approval, I finally gained access to 74 participants across both sites. These participants included 7 academics and 67 student teachers.

The selection criteria for academics were that they held a variety of teaching and leadership roles in teacher education, and were responsible for study abroad programmes or other learning activities (e.g. modules, lectures, placement, etc.) with an intercultural, international or global dimension at the two universities. The inclusion of the academic participants was intended to address the lack of research on the internationalisation of teacher education from the perspectives of academics, and particularly to answer one of my research questions in regard to how teacher education is internationalised at the two universities. The rationale for the interviews with the academic participants will be further discussed in Section 4.4.4. Among the 7 academics, 3 were from Nanhai University and 4 were from Southside University. The characteristics of the academics from both sites are shown in Table 4.1. More detailed profiles of the academic participants can be found in Appendix 7.

Table 4.1 Characteristics of the Academics

	Title	Gender	Site	Age range
Cai	Academic and head of International Affairs Office	Male	Nanhai University	50-59
Yang	Academic and deputy head of the School of Education	Male	Nanhai University	50-59
Jing	Academic	Male	Nanhai University	30-39
Carol	Academic and deputy head of the School of Education	Female	Southside University	40-49
Henry	Academic and course leader of PGDE	Male	Southside University	60-69
Daniel	Academic active in collaborating with China	Male	Southside University	40-49
Stella	Academic	Female	Southside University	50-59

After securing the participation of the academics, 67 student teacher participants were identified for the questionnaire investigation. The academic participants were in charge of study abroad programmes and other learning or placement opportunities with international components, and they had contact with student teachers. When seeking their help, I asked the academic participants to post a message about my research on online interactive platforms at the two universities, calling for volunteers to contact me if they were interested in participating in the

study. With the academics' help, I was able to attract 35 student teacher participants at Nanhai University and 32 at Southside University for stage one of the study. The criteria for recruiting them were that they had taken part in either one of the two streams of internationalisation: abroad or at home. The rationale behind my decision was that this study aimed to explore both dimensions of internationalisation in teacher education, rather than being restricted to an individual approach such as study abroad programme, as has already been demonstrated in previous studies.

Among the 35 student teacher participants at Nanhai University, 19 had participated in study abroad programmes, while 16 had had learning experiences comprising international components at home. Though 20 of them were from undergraduate courses, and 15 were from two- or three-year Masters courses, they were all between twenty and twenty-nine years old. All of the undergraduate participants were in their fourth and final year of study when they participated in the research in December 2015 and January 2016. However, the Masters students were from either the first or second year of their degree courses. Compared with the Scottish site, the Chinese university had fewer males volunteered for the study: there were only 2 males, as opposed to 33 females. However, this was typical of the demographic make-up of a class of student teachers at Nanhai University.

The 32 student teachers at Southside University included 12 student teachers from the Professional Graduate Diploma in Education (PGDE) course, and 20 undergraduate student teachers. The PGDE course lasts for one year, and student teacher volunteers from this course were relatively older than the undergraduates, with two thirds of them aged between thirty and thirty-nine years old. They participated in learning activities with international components in their home country. There were 7 females and 5 males, who were trained at either primary or secondary education level. The 20 undergraduate student teachers were mainly between twenty and twenty-nine years old, with 17 females and 3 males. Most of

them started their courses in 2013, and therefore they were in their third or fourth year when they participated in this study during my data collection at Southside University, which took place between January and October 2016. 10 of them had learning experiences abroad and 10 had learning experiences with international components at home. There were more females than males, which was a typical indication of the demographic composition in either the PGDE course or the BA courses.

With the information gathered from academics in interviews, and from student teacher participants in the questionnaire, I further selected 27 out of 67 student teacher participants across the two sites for follow-up interviews. Among the 27 student teachers, 14 were from Nanhai University and 13 were from Southside University. The follow-up interviews were conducted to obtain more detailed information about their lived experiences in the internationalised activities, either at home or abroad, and to examine how they perceived the experiences in terms of shaping their learning. The participants were regarded as typical because they raised key issues and provided information important to the answering of my research questions. According to Patton (2002), more typical participants can be identified when prior knowledge about them has been gathered in purposive sampling. As well as this, they demonstrated diversity in the activities in which they had engaged, which enabled me to investigate participants' perceptions about the impact of different internationalisation initiatives on them. However, the inclusion of these student teacher participants was also based on their willingness and availability for participating further in my study. The characteristics of the student teachers in interviews are shown in Table 4.2, and more detailed information can be found in Appendix 8.

Table 4.2 Characteristics of Student Teachers in Interviews

Characteristics	Nanhai University (n=14)	Southside University (n=13)
Gender		
Female	13	10
Male	1	3
Age range		
18-19		1
20-29	14	10
30-39		2
Degree course		
4-year Bachelors	8	10
1-year PGDE		3
2-year Masters	2	
3-year Masters	4	
Experience		
International experience at home	6	7
International experience abroad	8	6

Aside from the characteristics shown above, the student teachers who participated in the study were mainly in their senior years of the BA courses or from postgraduate courses at the two universities. This can avoid losing sight of different approaches to internationalisation as promoted in the two universities. If I involved those student teachers who were still only in the early stages of their degree courses, my findings may have been misleading, as these student teachers had not yet experienced learning activities that contained an intercultural, international or global dimension.

4.4.3 The qualitative questionnaire

The questionnaire was used to collect qualitative data. It took the student teachers around 15 minutes to complete. Items included in the questionnaire were informed by the current literature on the internationalisation of higher education, teacher education in particular, and were closely linked with the purpose of this study. It consisted of 19 questions: 6 were closed questions for gathering demographic information (e.g. gender, age group, the year they were enrolled in their programmes, etc.) and general knowledge about the internationalisation of teacher education; and 13 were open-ended questions, which enabled participants to mainly report on their knowledge about the internationalisation of teacher education and their experiences of it (see a copy of the questionnaire in Appendix 3). The 19 questions are within the suitable range of 3 to 30 questions in qualitative surveys or questionnaires, and as a result, they will not cause participants' boredom or fatigue (Braun & Clarke, 2013).

In some of the closed questions, space was left for participants to add more information about themselves or about their experiences, when necessary. The open-ended questions were formed as "epistemic referential questions" which can also be called "wh-questions", seeking valid and reliable data with sufficient contextual information of the topic or events under investigation (Kearsley, 1976, pp.360-361). Open-ended questions can also allow for freedom of response, as respondents can provide answers through their own account, rather than choosing answers predetermined as relevant by a researcher (Peterson, 2000).

The questionnaire was completed either by email, or at face-to-face meetings according to the preferences of the participants at the Chinese and Scottish sites. At the Chinese site, participants preferred to participate in the questionnaire during meetings with me, as they explained that this could enable them to ask questions for further clarity or for the elimination of ambiguity. Therefore, the questionnaire

sheet, Participant Information Sheet (see Appendix 1) and Consent Form (see Appendix 2) were printed out as hard copies and handed to participants during meetings. There was one exception in that one student teacher at the Chinese site was unable to be present at a meeting, and therefore she emailed her responses and signed consent form back to me. Meanwhile, participants were also informed that they were welcome to contact me for further communication about their participation and the research through the email address provided on the Participant Information Sheet. At the Scottish site, the questionnaire was sent to participants through emails, without the presence of the researcher. They indicated their preference for this means, as it was without the constraints of time and place. When emailing the questionnaire sheet, the Participant Information Sheet and Consent Form to the Scottish participants, I also encouraged them to contact me for clarity or discussion whenever they encountered ambiguity or difficulties, and for further communication about their participation and the research.

The qualitative questionnaire data contributed to this study in four main respects. First, the general information (i.e. demographic information and initial reports about their learning experiences in relation to internationalisation) the student teachers provided can serve as the contextual information for me, and for readers, to understand their narratives, as gathered in interviews. The questionnaire data particularly enriched the interview data from student teachers by offering detailed profiles of them (see Appendix 8), which would otherwise have been difficult to collect from the limited time allocated to interviews. Second, the questionnaire data was also helpful for selecting student teacher participants for interviews which were to tease out in-depth information about how they viewed internationalisation and how they felt it had shaped their learning. The recruitment of the participants was based on the two main principles of purposive sampling discussed in Section 4.4.2 concerning rich information and diversity. With these principles in mind, I referred to the questionnaire responses and selected student teachers who had raised key issues in the questionnaire, and who had participated in different learning activities

that fall into the two streams of internationalisation: at home and abroad. Third, the questionnaire responses also suggested whether or not student teachers were interested in talking about their learning experiences, which worked as important clues toward the potential inclusion of them in follow-up interviews. Fourth, their preliminary participation in the questionnaire also facilitated communication about the research topic between the student teacher participants and myself, and therefore increased the quality of the interviews.

4.4.4 The semi-structured interviews

Interviews were chosen because they are regarded as the most essential method for data collection in case study research when it involves human actions and affairs (Yin 2014). Human actions and affairs are sometimes difficult to be fully understood through direct observation. Patton (2002) suggests that previous actions, subtle feelings and profound thoughts over certain events or affairs can be better understood through a line of conversational inquiry, as interviews aim to reveal "what is in and on someone else's mind, to gather their stories" (p.341).

I previously had my own learning experiences with international components as a student teacher, which will be presented in Section 4.6. However, my participants' lived experiences can be very different from mine. The exploration of what they were thinking and saying about the internationalisation of teacher education based on their own experiences can afford a deeper and broader understanding of the phenomenon through the eyes of others. As is informed by constructivism, social actors make sense of a phenomenon on the basis of their own interactions with the things or people they encounter in their life. In this study, different meanings can be assigned to the internationalisation of teacher education when the academics and student teachers, who were direct participants, had interactions with different people, cultures, perspectives, education systems, and many other things in different countries. These meanings can be better explored and provided through in-

depth interviews. The interviews helped reveal feelings, thoughts, or even tensions participants had in the process of internationalisation, and allowed me to capture the value of internationalisation through their own voices. Seidman (2012) suggests that an in-depth interviewing investigation is embedded with an interest in understanding participants' lived experiences, and how they make sense of these experiences.

Interviews differ in structure in terms of when interview questions are determined and whether they are standardised or structured before the interview. Semi-structured interviews are often seen as qualitative interviews (Warren, 2002). According to Kvale and Brinkmann (2009), a semi-structured interview is "an interview with the purpose of obtaining descriptions of the life world of the interviewee in order to interpret the meaning of the described phenomena" (p.3). This definition shows that semi-structured interviews have a moderate degree of focus and flexibility. They are conducted with a focus on achieving a research goal, rather than being treated as everyday conversations. Meanwhile, the emphasis on seeking interviewees' descriptions of their life world implies the multiplicity, and thus flexibility of semi-structured interviews, since individually different experiences and perceptions can lead to multiple descriptions and interpretations, and can influence the ongoing process of conversation between the interviewer and the interviewee.

A certain degree of focus in semi-structured interviews is often guaranteed by a list of open-ended questions in the interview guide (Ayres, 2008). When conducting an interview, I referred to the guide or protocol that consisted of a series of open-ended questions to be covered. This was done to make sure that the data collected from each participant was based on the same basic checklist of inquiry about the particular topic within the limited duration of interview time (Bryman, 2012; Patton, 2002). Many interviews in case study research last for around one hour (Yin, 2014), but the moderate degree of focus can ensure all aspects of the topic are covered in

the investigation. This relatively focused feature can also gather data more easily within certain categories of issues, which contributes to the efficiency of data analysis at a later stage. In qualitative research, the questions in the interview guide should be helpful in gathering information for answering the research questions, but they should not be too specific (Bryman, 2012). Therefore, I developed and formulated questions carefully by referring to existing literature, and more specifically, to the research questions. However, participants' answers to a specific question can vary greatly, as they had different lived experiences in, and multiple perceptions about, the internationalisation of teacher education. In view of the flexibility of semi-structured interviews, I was very attentive to different responses, reordered the questions when necessary, and probed new questions in order to ensure a relatively natural flow of the inquiry, to confirm the consistency of responses, and to elucidate important issues arising from the investigation.

Another key feature of semi-structured interviews is its "dialogic" manner, which is in line with the constructivist choice of naturalistic and collaborative methods of data collection, as has been discussed above in the research paradigm. Constructivist researchers contend that a phenomenon can be better understood through their own interaction with participants, and the meanings of the phenomenon can be co-constructed through a dialogic means of investigation (Wahyuni, 2012). In the conversations made through semi-structured interviews, participants were able to share with me their stories, ideas and knowledge concerning the internationalisation of teacher education. This dialogic and interactive feature of semi-structured interviews also distinguishes them from structured interviews in the way that the former portray researchers and participants as co-constructors of narratives and knowledge. They can make better use of the potential benefits created by conversational inquiry, particularly in the open-ended questions, and in the extra leeway the researcher has in following up what the participants think is important (Brinkmann, 2013). Keeping these features in mind, I adopted semi-structured interviews to provide participants with

opportunities to decide on, and talk about, what they thought was important when answering the questions I had prepared beforehand or when answering new questions I posed according to fresh issues emerging from the dialogic process or from their questionnaire responses.

Views from the 7 academics were used to present a deep understanding of internationalisation in teacher education within institutional contexts. The items included in the interview guide were based on my research questions and existing literature. I interviewed the academic participants about how they understood internationalisation, what they felt the value of internationalisation was, and what challenges and opportunities existed within the process of internationalisation (see a copy of the interview guide for academics in Appendix 4). Data gathered about the academic participants' understanding and practices of internationalisation helped answer the research question about how teacher education was internationalised within the two institutional contexts, and informed the selection of student teacher participants due to the diverse range of approaches to internationalisation they mentioned.

Interviews with the 27 student teacher participants aimed to unfold the different stories student teachers told about their learning experiences. These stories were about what they had learned from learning experiences with international components, and how they had felt and performed when they were interacting with others and/or other cultures in the learning experiences. Based on their experiences, they were also encouraged to: present their perceptions of how these learning experiences shaped their understanding of self and others; report changes that had happened in their life during and after the learning experiences; and talk about the limitations they perceived in regard to learning activities which had international components, as well as the factors that influenced their participation in such activities (see the interview guide for student teachers in internationalisation at home in Appendix 5, and abroad in Appendix 6).

On average, interviews lasted for around an hour, which is common in case studies (Yin, 2014). All interviews were audio recorded. This is regarded as essential in qualitative research, as nothing can replace the raw data (what is actually said by real people in their own words) captured in the interviewing process (Patton, 2002). The recording allowed me to obtain a full picture of the particular views each of my participants expressed.

Apart from the audio recording, I also kept notes in the interview guides before, during, and after the interviews. As Patton (2002) further suggests, recording cannot eliminate the necessity for keeping notes in the interviewing investigation. In my interview guides, the items included were very general questions. Before interviewing each participant, I would carefully review the background information concerning their practices of internationalisation as well as their working experiences on their university websites, or their involvement in learning experiences that had international components from the questionnaire responses. I would then keep notes on the interview guide to remind me of their specific experiences or views relevant to my research which required further exploration. During the interviews, I maintained focused notes about some key and emerging issues participants mentioned, which was helpful for me when following up with new questions for gathering in-depth information. Immediately after interviews, I took notes on early insights I had obtained, and reminded myself to look at them in subsequent interviews. Another benefit of taking notes was that it enabled me to have a clearer picture of the conversation, and to transcribe the recorded data more efficiently.

4.5 Data analysis

The semi-structured interviews and the questionnaire generated a textual data set consisting of multiple realities which my participants presented in their own words. To approach and analyse these multiple realities, I used thematic analysis. This is

because it is regarded as the most useful strategy for understanding “the complexities of meaning within a textual data set” and it can allow for close involvement with, and active interpretation of, the multiple realities presented by my participants (Guest, MacQueen, & Namey, 2011, p.11). A theorised understanding of the studied phenomenon was developed from common thematic units identified in the textual data that participants had reported. The focuses on what participants have said, and how the data gathered from them can be conceptually grouped, are the main concerns of thematic analysis (Riessman, 1993).

Thematic analysis is commonly used across different epistemological or theoretical approaches; for example, it is thought to be compatible with the constructivist paradigm which demands that analysis to include both the participants’ accounts, and the sociocultural contexts in which they are nested (Braun & Clarke, 2006). The theoretical freedom of thematic analysis helped me (particularly as a novice researcher) since it is a more accessible approach of analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2006). To increase the interpretive power of this analytic approach, I employed it within the constructivist paradigm, acknowledging that themes did not only emerge out of the perceptions of my participants who were shaped by their own lived experiences, but they were also influenced by me as the researcher with philosophical positions and values shaped by my lived experiences.

Thematic analysis is flexible in the unit of text for analysis. There is no specific length of text required for coding (Charmaz, 2014; Floersch, Longhofer, Kranke, & Townsend, 2010). The flexibility of the length of text for coding allowed me to focus on identifying themes within each text, or across texts, rather than merely looking at micro units of text. Themes were found on the basis of their “substantive significance” (Patton, 2002, p.467). The “substantive significance” of themes is determined by: consistent and strong evidence found within a participant or across different participants for the intended purpose of the research; the possibility of providing increased understanding of the phenomenon under investigation; and the

possibility of deepening the understanding of existing knowledge about the phenomenon. Led by the tenets of "substantive significance", I put a central emphasis on the thematic elements which were significant for this study and theoretically contributed to the understanding of the internationalisation of teacher education.

The interactive process of data collection, underpinned by constructivism, is dialectical and hermeneutical, because it seeks multiple perspectives that make sense of the studied phenomenon (Mertens, 2010). When interpreting the textual data, I adopted hermeneutics as the theoretical framework. Hermeneutics informs that there are no absolutely correct interpretations or knowledge claims; instead, the meaning of a text "is negotiated among a community of interpreters" within certain geographical or temporal locations (Patton, 2002, p. 114). Following the hermeneutic approach to interpreting the data, I acknowledged that participants could have different views and interpretations of the studied phenomenon. As another interpreter in the wider community of interpreters, I admitted that I added meaning and context to what my participants had reported on the basis of my own interpretations which were influenced by my social, historical and cultural locations. Guided by the hermeneutic approach, I conducted thematic analysis in order to derive meanings from the raw data at two stages: the informal analysis and the formal analysis.

Stage 1 – the informal analysis. The informal analysis of the data occurred during the process of data collection. In many qualitative studies, it is thought to be inevitable and advantageous to start analysis during the process of data collection, as this can help researchers steer the ongoing process of data collection by refining interview questions and looking at some key, or new issues, in depth (Pope, Ziebland, & Mays, 2000). In this study, the initial stage began with the informal analysis of the data from the 7 academics in semi-structured interviews, and from the 67 student teachers in the qualitative questionnaire investigation.

As soon as I transcribed my interviews with the academics, and received the questionnaire responses from student teachers, I read through the texts, together with the notes I had taken during the process of data collection, in order to get a full view of what my participants had reported. At the same time, I used highlighters to mark places where there might be relevant information for recruiting suitable student teacher participants for the interviews, or potential patterns for formal analysis. While doing so, I kept notes in the margins beside these marked areas in order to remind me of the ideas for potential themes. This method of treating analytic thoughts or interests developed my sensitivity toward the data set, and this process was also applied to the raw data which I transcribed from later interviews with student teachers.

Stage 2 – the formal analysis. Having established familiarity with all the data through the completion of transcription and initial analysis, I started formal analysis. I re-read the questionnaire responses and listened again to the recordings when I was re-reading the transcripts, paying close attention to issues and topics which occurred and recurred within the data set. I checked the marked areas, together with the notes that I had made at the initial stage, refining or re-identifying issues or topics of potential analytic interests. I then gave a code, or some codes, to each textual unit where an idea resided. A code can be treated as "the most basic segment, or element, of the raw data or information" and can be "assessed in a meaningful way regarding the phenomenon" (Boyatzis, 1998, p. 63). Meanwhile, I wrote down a comment on each extract, and its code(s), reminding myself of what a particular segment of the text was about, what ideas could be behind it, or my reasons for giving it a particular code. Coding was made in the text of each individual participant, and across texts in the data set. It was made manually in the texts, since working away from the computer enabled me to closely interact with my data: using colourful pens to highlight the potential areas for generating thematic patterns; writing down marginal notes when ideas arose; and even applying sticky notes to identify fragments of data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). The coded extracts, the

codes, and the comments on them, were then visually represented, as shown in Table 4.3. The table helped me to organise extracts with references to where they were taken in the text, and allowed me to keep track of what codes I had given to them, as well as my reasons for doing so.

Table 4.3 An Example of Coding

Interviewee	Extract (and its location in the text)	Code(s)	Comment
Callie	That was frustrating for the first part. When we got to the marketplace, they were shouting and saying things to our driver. We were obviously a bit uncomfortable – we didn't know what they were saying and what was happening. We just tried to stick together. … They were saying things in Chichewa we didn't understand. (Q7)	Feeling frustrated and uncomfortable as a focus of attention	A strong emotion was triggered by language barriers.
Callie	You were wondering why people were looking at you. We all remember we went to the market one day and a baby looked at us and started to cry, because they had never seen white people before. We took this as – my goodness, the baby is crying. What have I done? We must be very upsetting him. But it was because we were so different, especially in the markets in small villages we felt more like outsiders, more like foreigners. (Q6)	Feeling disoriented as an outsider or a foreigner	A strong emotion was triggered by different physical appearance.
Callie	I know in that situation we were stressed, we were uncomfortable. We were able to break it down because we knew about these cultural differences. … I think just trying to provide opportunities that don't make them [immigrant children] feel like that. (Q14)	Linking her feelings to those of her future students	Disruptive experiences hold potential for developing empathy.
…			

After coding, I delved deeper into data analysis to bring codes to a broader level by cutting, sorting and collating the extracts and codes (Braun & Clarke, 2006; G. W. Ryan & Bernard, 2003). The table I developed (shown above) helped me to review the list of codes, and to sort them, by cutting rows of the extracts and codes of each participant and collating those coded extracts which capture some similar ideas together. The collation of codes with relevant aspects or coherent patterns made it possible for me to identify a "central organising concept" (Braun & Clarke, 2013, p. 224), or a theme which relates to something meaningful to my research questions. I used a broader term to name or describe a theme, but sometimes I used a code or a slightly expanded code to name a theme when the code was rich and complex in itself (Braun & Clarke, 2013). Aside from collating the coded extracts together to form themes, I also returned to the data set and checked what was missing in the list of identified themes. At the end of this stage, I put all relevant extracts, codes and comments under the theme to which they related in a table, which served as rich evidence for the next stage of writing up the findings, and contributed to the development of a theorised understanding of the phenomenon under study. The emergent themes reflect the existence of different discourses of internationalisation in teacher education at the two case-study universities, which can be better understood through postcolonial perspectives.

4.6 My historical and cultural locations

Qualitative research is greatly influenced by the researcher, who is the research instrument (Patton, 2002). Qualitative researchers are the facilitators of their interaction with research participants in data collection, and the decision makers of how to make sense of data (Poggenpoel & Myburgh, 2003). Therefore, the quality of qualitative research largely depends on the skills, experiences and interests of researchers (Given, 2008; Patton, 2002). In view of this, it is important to provide information about how my experiences influenced the inquiry about the studied phenomenon.

After three and a half years of teaching at a university in China, I recognised the importance of educating all children and young people to live comfortably, and work successfully, in an increasingly international context, rather than solely paying attention to language learning itself – learning the grammatical rules or linguistic items of English. However, I found that I was unable to relate teaching to the dynamics of society. These dynamics can be seen in the international interconnectedness in economy which can be vulnerable to crises, in reforms influencing and influenced by other nations, and in education caused by the mobility of people across national boundaries (Apple, 2011). Though I had had some amount of exposure to foreign languages, cultures and religions in my experience as a student teacher in the Masters course on Curriculum Development and English Language Teaching, I still recognised that a disconnect existed between initial teacher education and my own teaching in reality, which motivated my interest in studying abroad, in order to have a direct interaction with cultures, people and issues in a foreign country. Therefore, I started a new learning journey as a PhD student in Scotland, doing research on the internationalisation of teacher education.

My own experiences as a student teacher participant in internationalisation at home and abroad made me aware that the internationalisation of teacher education is a complex phenomenon, and that the understanding of it is socially and experientially contextualised. This prompted my desire to know more about internationalisation from insiders' perspectives through a qualitative questionnaire, and through semi-structured interviews comprising open-ended questions. According to Chenail (2011), qualitative researchers who are driven by curiosity about a complex phenomenon tend to adopt open-ended questions to reveal the multiple realities existent in individuals' particular experiences.

Some shared aspects of my own experiences as a participant in the internationalisation of teacher education were conducive to my "understanding of participants' accounts, of the language they use and of the nuances and subtexts"

(Lewis, 2003, p.65). I also acknowledged that my own cultural and historical locations could influence my interaction with participants, my judgments about themes or issues to be mined in depth, and my interpretation of participants' accounts throughout qualitative inquiry. Having experienced or lived in the studied phenomenon, qualitative researchers possess the subjective knowledge that facilitates them to ask and follow up important questions, develop rapport with, and empathy for, their participants, and make appropriate knowledge claims about the stories told by their participants (Collins, 2000; Miller & Glassner, 1997).

In this sense, who I am, and how I understood the studied phenomenon, played a crucial role in my choice of the research topic, as well as the methods for gathering information and analysing data to answer the research questions. Referring to Reinharz's (1997) idea of "brought selves" (p. 5) in research, Lincoln and her colleagues (2011) further illustrate that the brought selves created by researchers' own historical and social experiences can largely influence their standpoints. Following this account, my own lived experiences can be important to the understanding of the philosophical assumptions underpinning this study.

4.7 Ethical considerations

The main ethical considerations in qualitative research are often concerned with participants' welfare and privacy (Oliver, 2010). The topic of this study was not sensitive in nature. Participants' participation in the study did not pose potential risks and hazards to them, but there were still issues to consider before, during, and after data collection.

Participants were firstly informed about the study and their participation. Before participants agreed to be part of the research, I provided them with the participant information sheet (see an example in Appendix 1) and consent form (see an example in Appendix 2), written in plain language, as well as in their native

languages. These documents, together with the qualitative questionnaire, were kept in both Chinese and English. To increase accuracy and avoid errors in translation, I employed the method of back-translation of research documents in doing cross-cultural research (Brislin, 1970). I translated the participant information sheet, consent for, and questionnaire from English into Chinese, and then asked a friend to translate the Chinese version of these documents back into English. The English version translated by my friend was then compared with the original version I created to make sure that both versions conveyed the same meaning. Interviews were also conducted in participants' native languages. Although I demonstrated a high level of linguistic and sociocultural competence in both languages (with Chinese as my native language, and English as my first foreign language), reviews were provided by the friend who was proficient in both languages to validate the accuracy of the translation of key concepts, and to ensure the consistency of the topics discussed in the two different languages (Squires, 2009). I did not start my data collection until ethics approval was sought from the Ethics Committee of the School of Education at the University of Strathclyde, along with consent from my potential participants.

In participant recruitment, there may be ethical issues concerning imbalanced power relationships. Power differences can be brought about by social class, culture, ownership of power and knowledge, environment, gender, age or even physical appearance (Baxter & Eyles, 1997; Richards & Emslie, 2000). My participants consisted of both academics and student teachers who might have felt obliged to participate in this study when they were contacted by their colleagues or teachers to do so. To ensure their participation was secured on a voluntary basis, they were informed about their right to participate in, or withdraw from, the research at any time, without jeopardising their relationships with colleagues or teachers. Meanwhile, I created a trust-worthy environment for the investigation by being sensitive to the difference between developing a rapport with someone and becoming their friend, particularly in interviews.

In qualitative research, it is common for researchers to ensure participants' confidentiality and privacy by replacing their names with pseudonyms (Gallagher, 2009). I promised my participants that I would protect their privacy by giving them and their universities pseudonyms in order that they would not be identified in the thesis or subsequent publications. The pseudonyms bear the traits of their nationalities, which demonstrate my respect for their national identities, while also allowing readers to easily distinguish between them. Every participant was also informed about how their data would be kept and used. Openness to participants in issues concerning their privacy and other concerns can reduce their mistrust or fear of being exploited in cross-cultural research (Liamputtong, 2008). Cross-cultural investigation, however, could also be a benefit, as it allowed me to be more sensitive and respectful to the different values, cultural norms and worldviews of participants from both home and abroad (Patton, 2002).

However, it can still be challenging to maintain participants' confidentiality in qualitative research where rich and detailed descriptions of their lived experiences are presented (Kaiser, 2009). To address the challenge, I was aware of the balance between dissemination of the rich data of my participants and my own responsibility to protect their confidentiality. I reported my participants' demographic information as group data or in ranges (Morse & Coulehan, 2015), as is shown in the age-range category I used instead of particular ages when detailing the key characteristics of my participants. I did not include more information than was needed for my study. Further to this, I used codes that only made sense to me to when I needed to identify participants from the questionnaire data, and removed these codes when the study was completed (Morse & Coulehan, 2015). As the questionnaire data served as the basis for selecting student teachers for follow-up interviews, code numbers were assigned to questionnaire participants and to their email addresses. The information was electronically and securely kept in password-protected files through my university account without being lost, damaged, hacked

or misused, and were deleted when they were no longer needed.

4.8 Summary

This chapter mapped out a full picture of my research design, data collection, data analysis and ethical concerns. It began with my decision to use the constructivist paradigm and a qualitative approach. In particular, the philosophical assumptions underpinned by constructivism were discussed. According to the paradigm and the qualitative nature of the study, I adopted case studies to obtain an in-depth understanding of the internationalisation of teacher education through the views of teacher educators and student teachers from both China and Scotland. This was followed by data collection in which research settings, participants, and sources of data were presented in relation to my philosophical positions and research purpose. The subsequent section discussed the choice of thematic analysis. I then presented the historical and cultural locations that had influenced my choice of research topic and my philosophical assumptions. The chapter concluded with ethical concerns in qualitative research, and in my research in particular.

Chapter 5 Understanding the Internationalisation of Teacher Education

5.1 Introduction

One of the objectives of my research is to investigate how teacher education is internationalised in China and Scotland. To do so, it is important to understand how academics who are responsible for the internationalisation of teacher education make sense of it within their institutional contexts. Therefore, this chapter will first report on how the seven academic participants understand the concept of internationalisation in teacher education at the two research sites: Nanhai University (China) and Southside University (Scotland). The analysis will then turn to the academics' views about the rationale for internationalising teacher education at their universities, which is the main concern in their interpretations of the concept of internationalisation in teacher education. The chapter concludes with a summary.

5.2 Internationalisation: a broad church

Most of the academics from Nanhai University and Southside University thought that internationalisation consisted of internationalisation at home and internationalisation abroad. Their recognition of internationalisation as a broad concept could be seen in the approaches they advocated, which included study abroad programmes, online conversational modules between Scottish and international students, modules about comparative educational studies, modern language modules, modules/workshops/presentations by international scholars, participation in research with international dimensions, and teaching placements in schools with culturally and linguistically diverse pupils. This view is consistent with Knight's (2004) understanding of internationalisation in higher education as having at home and abroad dimensions.

According to most of the academic participants from Southside University and Nanhai University, the two universities were making ongoing efforts to internationalise teacher education. Of all the possible approaches to internationalisation, they thought study abroad programmes could generate the greatest impact on student teachers since, as Daniel, a Southside academic, said, they gave student teachers "a chance to flip on different school systems" and "some understanding of what it means to be new". Some Chinese academic participants held a similar view that study abroad programmes could provide "direct contact with different people and cultures, rather than getting filtered knowledge through secondary resources" (Yang), as well as an opportunity to "experience differences and see many alternative ways of teaching and learning" (Jing). However, many of the academics acknowledged that internationalisation was not all about study abroad programmes. For example, Stella, an academic from Southside University, who was committed to promoting knowledge exchange, literacy and equity among children and teacher research, thought that it was important to include all student teachers on internationalisation agendas. She said:

> So, it's important for students who study in Scotland to understand other cultures and to be linked to teacher education in other cultures – so teaching in other cultures. There are lots of ways you can do that. …it [internationalisation at home] is never going to be the same as visiting another country, but I think it's important for equity and inclusion that we offer a lot of different routes (Stella).

Stella's statement indicates that study abroad programmes can be a valuable means of preparing competent teachers for a culturally diverse context, but they may not be possible for all student teachers. In her view, the promotion of alternative routes has the potential to develop a more inclusive and equitable approach to internationalisation in teacher education at Southside University.

This emphasis on equity and inclusion is also reflected in the Chinese academics'

views. Cai, an academic active in international links, and dean of the international affairs office at Nanhai University, thought that to internationalise teacher education was to situate all student teachers within a wider international context, and enable them to gain different experiences and knowledge about the subject they were studying. He said:

> Internationalisation includes the following aspects: first, the introduction of excellent curricula from abroad…; second, the provision of modules having an international dimension. We have offered many modules to student teachers with an emphasis on comparative studies of cultures, educational ideas and teaching and learning methods in China and in other countries; third, opportunities for student teachers to study abroad (Cai).

Similarly, the Scottish academic participants also tended to show their understanding of internationalisation by giving examples of their internationalisation practices which were more than study abroad programmes. Carol, an academic, and deputy head of the School of Education at Southside University in Scotland, said:

> In terms of internationalising the experiences students have, I think it's about introducing them to opportunities that include those who are unable to go to visit a [foreign] country. It might mean they have opportunities to talk to people in another country, maybe by using Skype or email so that they can learn about international perspectives and talk about research and policies. … There are opportunities for students to do placements in other countries or they go to listen to people who come here to speak. For me, internationalisation covers a broad range of things (Carol).

Findings of this study indicate that most of the academic participants from both sites portrayed internationalisation as more than simply studying abroad. This is

because they are concerned about the benefits for all student teachers, rather than only thinking about the benefits for a small number of student teachers who are able to study abroad. However, their understanding of the concept of internationalisation is specifically mirrored in the approaches that they have promoted or are promoting. Their understanding of internationalisation as a broad church suggests that they do not equal it to a particular study abroad programme or strategy for internationalisation. Internationalisation is often not well understood, as seen in many previous studies, which treat study abroad programmes or some modules as the entirety of internationalisation, despite the process being much more multifaceted in practice (de Wit, 2016).

5.3 Rationale for internationalising teacher education

Though academics from the two national contexts do not clearly define internationalisation, they show different understandings of the rationale for promoting it in teacher education. de Wit (2016) suggests that when attempting to interpret and understand the concept of internationalisation, it is important to think about the reasons for, and outcomes of, promoting it. Therefore, this section will present the academics' perceptions about the rationale for the internationalisation of teacher education and possibly the teachers they aim to prepare by engaging them in learning experiences that have a global, international or intercultural dimension.

5.3.1 Internationalisation as a one-way process

All of the Chinese academics, and one Scottish academic, brought the quality of education, or teacher education in particular, to attention. However, their different views about the quality of education in their own countries, or other countries, served as an argument for, or against, the internationalisation of teacher education within their institutional contexts.

To the Chinese academic participants, a main reason for their university to promote internationalisation in teacher education was to ensure the quality of teacher education and education in general. For example, all of the Chinese academic participants were very proud that their fifteen-year-olds in Shanghai had excelled in PISA tests in recent years, an achievement they attributed to the success of their outward-looking attitude towards education. Jing, who was an academic from Nanhai University and keen on comparative studies of educational policies in different countries, said that:

> Shanghai has topped in the international ranking due to its students' good performance in the past rounds of PISA tests. Why? Because we have effectively adopted the prescriptive way of teaching in China. It originates from abroad. You can see that China is very good at absorbing foreign methods of teaching and learning (Jing).

Jing's account suggests that Chinese students' success in PISA tests is a result of learning the normative, or perhaps the best, practices of teaching and learning from abroad. As another Chinese academic confirmed, by looking at teacher education in the international community, particularly "in some European and American countries, we can learn more, because they are more advanced in higher education, or even in basic education" (Cai).

Another reason for promoting internationalisation in teacher education at Nanhai University is to keep up with Western countries in terms of the quality of education and educational research, which is evident in Jing's response:

> Lectures [given by internationally famous scholars in the forum promoted at Nanhai University] … can not only get our students exposed to the latest developments in education within the global academic community, but can also [equip them with] a broader outlook, and more knowledge about research methods and curricula in Western countries.

> They can help them keep pace with international developments in education (Jing).

These responses indicate that the Chinese academic participants at Nanhai University tended to position Western education and educational research as advanced, while Chinese education and research were seen as less developed. They needed to learn from the West in order to ensure the quality of their education and educational research, and to "keep pace with" the West. In their view, the West has become the global. This attitude is also evident in Yang's effort to introduce new ways of doing things, or new policies of education, from Western countries to China:

> For example, when America issues a new policy…we will follow the course of progress of the policy, do research on that, and generate a multitude of research outcomes. These outcomes have an impact on our education (Yang).

Aside from this aspiration towards quality assurance in teacher education, Cai found that another important reason for internationalising teacher education was to learn about the rich knowledge and skills in this field from Western countries. In reminiscing about his frequent interactions with universities in other countries, he said:

> Internationalisation, particularly in those internationally advanced countries [such as the US, the UK and Australia], is in itself a benchmark and consists of a set of standards which are recognised worldwide. Those countries have many years' experience of internationalisation, and they have normalised some advanced ways of doing it. If you don't know, if you don't experience it yourself, you can hardly carry it out within the university (Cai).

Cai's account shows that Nanhai University can improve its practices of internationalisation by working with, and learning from, "internationally advanced

countries”. As the competition among Chinese universities is increasingly determined by a national ranking system (conducted by Southwest Jiaotong University), and by the global university performance table (Times Higher Education world university rankings), institutional involvement in international cooperation is an important factor for each university if they are to achieve a high-standing position in the rankings. This means that internationalisation is a reflection of a university’s status, or an important addition to its profile, which resonates with Knight’s (2004) academic rationale concerning international branding and profile.

The mobility of students, as a key indicator for assessing the level of internationalisation, is high on the agendas of Chinese universities. Jing mentioned that many Chinese universities had plans to increase the number of students participating in study abroad programmes:

> I remember… a couple of years ago, Fangda University and Nanhai Jiaotong University[6] announced that one-hundred percent of their students would be assured a learning experience abroad within their four years’ study at the universities… so, this is a trend (Jing).

According to Jing, Chinese universities are working hard to boost the mobility of students, but what they focus on is the outbound direction. Little is said about what Chinese universities can provide to host countries. This was especially true for Nanhai University, as the academics thought that the motivation for promoting the internationalisation of teacher education was to ensure the quality of teacher education, and education in general in China, by learning advanced methods of teaching and the latest educational developments from others. Therefore, Nanhai University tended to establish study abroad programmes for their student teachers through partnerships with universities in “internationally advanced countries”, particularly “those in the US, Australia and some countries in Europe” (Cai). This

[6] As with Nanhai University and Southside University, the two Chinese universities named by Jing in his statement have also been given pseudonyms for confidentiality reasons.

indicates that the Chinese academic participants had greater trust in the good quality of education in those countries, and occasionally regions outside mainland China such as Taiwan, than that of less developed areas:

> Around 30 student teachers who are enrolled on the course of primary education or preschool education will be sent to the University of Nottingham through exchange programmes… we have student teachers going to Taiwan, going to America and some others (Yang).

The Chinese academics' strong inclination towards Western education suggests that they perceive Chinese education as inferior, which naturalises or legitimises Western supremacy and dominance in educational discourses. This outward learning attitude may lead to the risk of merely copying Western dominated models of quality education without considering the local context. What offsets worries about this situation, though, is that the Chinese academic participants have started to see potential risks. In particular, Yang warned that they had to be very mindful of the process of internationalisation. He recommended:

> We should not just see the positive things brought about by internationalisation. Just like modernisation, there are negative things as well. Here is the big problem: homogenisation. For example, if you take a look at Shanghai, and then take the bullet train to Suzhou which is around 100 kilometres away, [you'll] find they look the same. If you go another 50 kilometres further to Wuxi, they look the same again. Why? Because of modernisation (Yang).

This view is in contrast to the Westward learning attitude of his and the other two Chinese academics', presented above. According to this response, Yang has recognised that internationalisation is not a process of homogenisation or Westernisation – making teacher education look the same throughout the world by blindly taking all that has been learned from what the Chinese academic participants have termed the "internationally advanced countries". It appears that Yang has

become aware of the risk of being homogenised by the West, as seen in the modernisation that has been done to cities in China. He further stressed that:

> What we have learned is mainly about a mind-set rather than a specific way or method. … We can localise lots of things once we have that mind-set. As is reminded in the preface that Mr. Gu wrote for our Journal [which is run by Nanhai University], the simple way out is [to develop] a global mind-set and act locally (Yang).

This response indicates that Yang acknowledged a series of important issues concerning the internationalisation of teacher education, but he was still not explicit about what a global mind-set might entail, or about how teacher educators and student teachers could develop such a mind-set through their participation in internationalisation. Likewise, the other Chinese academics also acknowledged the importance of developing an international, or a broader outlook, in student teachers, and made links with the local context. They mentioned that "Shanghai … has become more cosmopolitan, and internationalisation is playing a very important role in teacher education" (Jing) and "we have to grasp features of the city and internationalise teacher education" (Yang). However, they paid little attention to the learning experiences of student teachers, which could help them become effective teachers for an increasingly international context. Instead, Yang only celebrated the prevailing trend of learning English in China, as he said:

> One point deserves our attention now. The extraordinary popularity of English among Chinese people is unparalleled in other countries. This can't be seen anywhere else in the world (Yang).

The promotion of learning English as an important aspect of internationalising teacher education at Nanhai University is another sign of Chinese academics' inclination towards the Western dominant language.

Overall, the Chinese academic participants made more general claims concerning subject learning, such as “we want to give our students opportunities to learn and understand their subjects from multiple perspectives and angles” (Cai), and “the internationalisation of teacher education can equip student teachers with an ability to develop the curriculum, and an international outlook to bring more possibilities to the different needs of their students [in their future classes]” (Jing). In these responses, there are no deeper elaborations about what these multiple ways and perspectives really mean, or how a specific learning experience which has an international focus can contribute to an international outlook. What student teachers learn from this one-way process of internationalisation is “knowledge at a relatively macro level – mostly about education systems, structures and policies [while] there are few practical skills” (Yang).

The views of the Chinese academic participants at Nanhai University indicate that an international or global dimension can bring resources and expertise from abroad to enhance the quality of teacher education in China. Their responses focusing on learning teaching methods from the West, learning English, and keeping pace with international standards of educational research, position internationalisation at Nanhai University within what Knight (1997) and de Wit (2002) would define as the academic rationale. However, what they have described as international standards of educational research most often refer to Western developed countries. Meanwhile, the advocacy for internationalisation in teacher education at the Chinese university remains rhetorical, since little weight has been placed on student teachers’ learning experiences in relation to global and local contexts.

In contrast, the Scottish academic participants did not focus much on achieving an internationally high level of teacher education or education through the internationalisation of teacher education at their university. Among the four Scottish academics, Henry, who was in charge of the PGDE course at Southside University, was the only person showing concern about international academic standards. In his

view, the course they provided is a professional one. It needs to be accredited by the General Teaching Council for Scotland "which is the oldest of its kind in the world, and the gatekeeper of professional standards". In contrast to the Chinese academics' arguments for quality assurance as their motivation for internationalisation, he emphasised that the high standard of teacher education in Scotland could work as a barrier to internationalising teacher education, which is shown in the following response:

> That [the high standard] would potentially be a barrier to allowing them to go somewhere else, because we couldn't guarantee that the experience there is going to enable us to say that you have met the standard.

According to Henry, internationalisation was more possible if there were internationally agreed standards for being a teacher. Meanwhile, he thought internationalisation largely meant globalisation, as he used the two terms interchangeably during the interview. As he said:

> … there isn't an internationally agreed set of standards about what you expect a brand new teacher to be able to do and to know. And that in itself is a barrier to globalisation … So, the demands of the standards in Scotland are in themselves an impairment to globalisation.

His conception of globalisation as internationalisation made it difficult for him to attempt to internationalise the PGDE course, because he thought a common set of standards was necessary for internationalising/globalising teacher education. The barriers to internationalising teacher education could only be broken down "if the international community looks at teacher education generally" (Henry).

As opposed to his attitude about internationalisation for home student teachers at Southside University, Henry took an outward looking approach to the provision of

teacher education for international students. In his view, the higher standards which existed for provisional registration in Scotland were helpful for the university in their aim to internationalise teacher education by recruiting international student teachers. He said:

> It is harder to become a teacher in Scotland than it is in many other parts [of the world] … you have to meet the standards for provisional registration in Scotland, which are at a more demanding level than in many other countries. So, I suppose, that in itself, on the one hand, makes Scotland a very attractive place to come and study.

In addition to the higher standards of provisional registration in Scotland, Henry observed that higher entry requirements for the course, and their focus on pedagogical skills and social justice, could add to the attractiveness of Southside University as an ideal destination for foreign students to study to become teachers. According to him, candidates who were going to enrol on the PGDE course at Southside University "have to have a qualification in the subject", because it did not largely focus on the curriculum in schools. Instead, the course put more emphasis on pedagogical skills and social justice. He stressed that the reason for them to set higher entry requirements for student teacher candidates is that:

> We are very clear that we want people to come out of our course being able to be great teachers anywhere … We see education as being the biggest potential liberator for young people from disadvantaged backgrounds to be able to live the kind of life they would like to live. So, we have that and we have the focus on pedagogy. From an international perspective, anybody looking at our course, we would hope, would be attracted by the fact that we are focusing on what good learning and teaching looks like anywhere.

From Henry's perspective, the internationalisation of teacher education at Southside University was also viewed as a one-way process, but in the opposite direction to

Nanhai University's outward learning attitude. He thought that to internationalise teacher education was to recruit students from around the world to learn from Scotland. Henry's view is reflective of the idealistic view of internationalisation, which emphasises an imperialistic notion of Western culture: people from other parts of the world "can learn from us" and "we have little to learn from them" (Stier, 2006, p.4).

5.3.2 Internationalisation as a two-way process: "What can we learn and share?"

The other three academic interviewees (i.e. Carol, Daniel and Stella) from Southside University valued differences between cultures or between education systems while internationalising teacher education. As they acknowledged, when they exposed student teachers to cultures, educational issues, and people from other countries, they and their student teachers could know better what they could learn from others and what they could share with them, as evidenced in the following account:

> So, there [is] not always critiquing other people, but actually looking into ourselves to see what we can learn from others, as well as what we may be able to – I don't want to [use] teach, because that sounds imperialistic – share, I suppose, to make what we do better (Carol).

Carol's statement shows that she resisted the imperialistic notion. She did not think that education in Scotland was necessarily better than that in other countries. She was also very aware that her university did not send student teachers out to help those in the host country. She tried to avoid saying that Scottish education was superior to others. In study abroad programmes, for example, student teachers were encouraged to learn about education in other countries, and share something new with them as well. Whether it was a developed, or a developing, country, Carol believed that study abroad experiences in either sort of country were beneficial to both the Scottish student teachers and those in the host country:

> …if we send students to Malawi, yes, they are learning about Malawian education, but they can contribute in a meaningful way. If they go to China or they go to Sweden, or they go to France, they are hoping to add something that maybe isn't there already, you know, introducing another perspective to the children [there] (Carol).

This emphasis on mutual benefits is also found in approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education at home. For example, Stella thought that they had to take the needs of all student teachers into consideration in both mixed classes, where Scottish and Chinese student teachers learned together, and in the Skyping and conversation modules, which were run in order to encourage mutual learning between Scottish and Japanese student teachers. Stella and her colleagues carefully paired up student teachers to exchange knowledge and ideas to and to allow for meaningful learning to occur:

> So, we had a group of students in Japan and we had a group of students here, and each student was matched. They arranged to Skype and they had to have 5 Skype meetings throughout the semester. … They were all in an undergraduate course to be a teacher. … They talked about life in the country, in Scotland and in Japan. They talked about growing up. They talked about the school system, how schools were assessed, and what the issues were. They talked about how teachers saw their jobs. … Our students kept a reflective diary, and wrote that up as part of an assignment on understanding international issues in education (Stella).

In Stella's view, the mutual benefits between Scottish student teachers and their international peers were important for establishing and maintaining a certain approach toward internationalisation. She was very aware of reciprocal learning possibilities. This could also be seen in another example where she recognised that:

> They [the Chinese student teachers who were studying at Southside University through a short-term study abroad programme] felt they were

> very isolated. They felt they didn't know any Scottish students really. They felt their own English was not good enough to make friends with Scottish students (Stella).

In recognition of Chinese student teachers’ needs, Stella and her colleagues built the buddy project which paired up Chinese student teachers and Scottish student teachers. She said those home student teachers who were unable to participate in study abroad programmes “can have this alternative opportunity to interact with people from different cultural backgrounds” (Stella).

Apart from an emphasis on the mutual benefits for student teachers in both parties, Carol and Daniel suggested that common interests within partnerships should also be considered in the internationalisation of teacher education. When looking for partners for international collaboration (e.g. internationally collaborative research and study abroad programmes), the two academics thought that they should not merely be concerned with their own interests. They stressed that successful and meaningful internationalisation could be established when they were able to see the value of it for both parties. To achieve mutual benefits, they had to ask themselves questions such as:

> … why we may want to send colleagues and our students out to Malawi or … why we are interested for students to go to Sweden, and what does China have, and what we can learn from them and what we might have expertise in that we can share (Carol).

Careful consideration of mutual benefits while seeking partnerships could also contribute to more international collaboration. Daniel, who was active in promoting partnerships with China, stressed that:

> We are always very conscious of exploring opportunities for Southside University, but also opportunities for the Chinese partners. That means

> they are more willing to engage in discussion when they see things as a two-way process (Daniel).

Daniel's response indicates that a two-way partnership was crucial to ensuring the possibility for, and developing the sustainability of, the internationalisation of teacher education at Southside University.

Unlike Henry's emphasis on agreed standards or higher standards for internationalisation, these three Scottish academics at Southside University thought that differences between different cultures and education systems made internationalisation necessary. They held the belief that different internationalisation initiatives could be more possible and sustainable when internationalisation was viewed as a two-way process which benefited both Southside University and its partner universities.

5.3.3 Internationalisation as a response to cultural diversity

As opposed to the academic rationale adopted by the Chinese academic participants, who sought to learn alternative ways of teaching and learning from so-called internationally advanced others, the three Scottish academics at Southside University (excluding Henry) focused more on student teachers' learning experiences when talking about what drove them to internationalise teacher education. Whether the experiences related to learning about education systems and policies of different countries, to interacting with those from other countries, or to intercultural learning in other cultures, Carol stressed:

> …I think the school's driver is about our students' experiences – what the students can contribute, and then what they can contribute when they finally work in schools, because they've had some kind of international experience (Carol).

According to Knight (1997) and de Wit (2002, 2010), the focus on individual learning and development through interactions with different cultures or people from different cultures can be categorised as the social and cultural rationale for internationalisation. The social and cultural rationale was attracting increased interest and importance in the internationalisation of teacher education within the School of Education at Southside University, because these three academics recognised that global mobility had changed the demographic makeup in their country, or the city in which they were located. Carol pointed out that "being situated in xx [a city in Scotland where they live], we can't escape diversity". Daniel also drew attention to the demographic change in Scotland's schools:

> … one thing that happened [that] I wouldn't have seen in the past ten years is that the children we are teaching in schools have become much more culturally diverse. … And I think if I am going to prepare students to engage in the profession properly, we need to open [our] eyes to the cultural varieties that exist and to some of the challenges we face in initial teacher education (Daniel).

Similarly to these Scottish academics, researchers have also paid close attention to increased cultural and linguistic diversity in schools in some Western countries, though there is a lack of teachers who are well prepared for teaching with diversity (Dantas, 2007; Ferguson-Patrick et al., 2014; Santoro & Major, 2012). Daniel observed that the mismatch between culturally diverse pupils and culturally homogenous teachers in Scotland made it necessary for their university to internationalise teacher education, as reflected in his account:

> One of the issues with Scottish initial teacher education is that students who come here quite often are coming from backgrounds where they haven't experienced much cultural diversity, because of where they live or their family backgrounds, etc. Teaching often attracts middle-class students, I would say again, whose backgrounds may be different from

> the general population. So, I think that [the internationalisation of teacher education] can expose them to something different from their own culture (Daniel).

To address the issue of the disconnect between culturally diverse pupils and culturally homogenous teachers in Scotland, Daniel suggested that it was essential to provide internationally focused learning experiences for the Scottish student teachers in order that they not only looked in “their own backyard”, but also “learn about other cultures, other places in order to inform teaching” (Daniel). To these three Scottish academics at Southside University, the internationalisation of teacher education was largely viewed as a responsive strategy to cultural diversity. In Carol’s view, it could build student teachers’ confidence when teaching pupils who might be from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds:

> I think part of it is about giving our students confidence and also about ensuring them the richness you can have in the classroom – where [there] is diversity and how exciting it can be. … So, it’s about relaxing our students a little, and making them see how easy it is to accommodate people that come from different backgrounds. We can embrace it. We can use it in our teaching. We can reposition the children, in the classroom (Carol).

Similarly, Stella suggested that the university should put different learning activities in place in order to develop Scottish student teachers’ appreciation of cultural and linguistic differences, and to enhance their ability to address the needs of all children, regardless of their backgrounds. For instance, she created the literacy project which was an opportunity for student teachers to work with children who were from different backgrounds and who had difficulties with literacy. She was keen on it because:

> Some schools have got very very high percentages of children who would have parents who were not born in Scotland, and who maybe don't

> speak a lot of English. … so we would say to the students to look at the cultural capital that a child has at home, and in their community, as well as the competence of knowledge and skills they have about reading (Stella).

As shown in the above responses, three of the four Scottish academics explicitly stated what knowledge and skills their student teachers had to learn from internationally focused learning experiences for teaching with cultural diversity. When developing internationalisation initiatives, they suggested that they had to make sure that their student teachers could learn different cultures and languages, learn about people from other countries, and understand their different ways of doing things. This is reflected in Stella's Skyping and conversation module in which she paired her students up with Japanese student teachers. She asked them to communicate with each other on different topics and to explore further by expanding upon the interpersonal skills they had already learned:

> What I want them to do is not only just about understanding international issues and international education, but it's also about students developing the soft skills of talking to people who might not have English as their first language, and might not understand what they say at the first time, and having the confidence to say a phrase in a different way, because sometimes I think Scotland's accent could be very hard to understand (Stella).

This response suggests that Stella highly valued the learning experiences student teachers had when they were interacting with people from other cultural and linguistic backgrounds. In her view, different cultural norms or ways of doing things emerging from the interaction between her students and the Japanese students could be rich opportunities for meaningful learning. She gave an example of the different feelings her students and the Japanese student teachers had during the communication sessions within the Skyping and conversation module. She said the

Japanese student teachers “felt uncomfortable asking our students to repeat themselves, because for [them], they were worried that … it would be like criticism of our students”, whereas “for our students, a lot of them are quite frightened of speaking if they think someone won’t understand them”. She took these different feelings as an opportunity for student teachers to reflect upon, and to learn, professional skills to teach children from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds. In her summary, the knowledge and skills student teachers had to acquire through their participation in the Skyping and conversation module were that:

> They don't just need to be able to understand other cultures to teach other children. They also need to have the confidence to make a relationship with somebody, to talk to somebody, to be prepared to repeat things, explain things in different ways, to make sure what they are saying is accessible to someone from another language … (Stella).

Daniel valued the uncertainties and culture shock that student teachers encountered during their study abroad experiences:

> I think go to Malawi, go to China, go to – to societies that are very different from Scotland. I think that feeling of being slightly unsettled initially will make students realise they have to engage in this culture and learn from other people. So, awareness of the curriculum and systems, awareness of self. … And, you would hope all these sorts of experiences can be brought into a classroom context. … I think if you’ve been to different countries, and maybe experienced for yourself some of the uncertainties of being abroad in other places, you’ll understand how those children feel when they come to a new country and they try to settle in (Daniel).

The unsettling experiences that Daniel appreciated can also be called disorienting experiences that many study abroad programmes offer. Disorienting experiences can

contribute to student teachers' self-awareness and promote greater confidence in engaging with different cultures (Trilokekar & Kukar, 2011).

In the opinion of these three Scottish academics, what motivated them to internationalise teacher education was the need to develop competent teachers for cultural diversity in Scotland's schools. However, Carol suggested that student teachers also had to look beyond their national context and understand their connection to the global world. She thought that teacher educators needed to help their students develop an open mind by engaging them in internationally focused learning experiences. They could not only learn from/about others, but also learn about themselves, and think and work beyond themselves, as described in the following account:

> … [future teachers] have a responsibility to show children that there is a life beyond the small confines of the classroom, or the small space in the school, or the town or city. … But, at the same time, we also have to think about ourselves in an international sphere – it's not all about thinking about these other people and other countries, but [about] situating Scotland in the international context and understanding where we sit (Carol).

The three Scottish academics focused on the social and cultural factors that drove them and their school to internationalise teacher education. They were clear about the knowledge and skills student teachers needed to learn from their participation in internationalisation initiatives. Meanwhile, they attached great importance to personal learning experiences and development in student teachers, which aligns with another ideology of internationalisation: educationalism. Educationalism values individual learning experiences, as well as the ways in which that learning stimulates critical thinking and leads to a better understanding of self and others (Stier, 2006).

5.3.4 Internationalisation as a money-making strategy

At the Scottish research site, some academics thought that their university promoted the internationalisation of teacher education in order to attract more international students, as well as associated income. Two points made by Henry could account for the attractiveness of teacher education at Southside University. First, the quality of teacher education in Scotland was assured by the demanding standards for provisional registration set by the General Teaching Council for Scotland. Second, the university set higher standards for recruiting suitable students to study education, particularly in the PGDE course in which student teachers had to be qualified in a certain subject before their enrolment. According to Henry, PGDE students were required to focus more on learning "to be great teachers anywhere" than on learning the subject itself. He hoped that anyone who looked at their course would be attracted to it. In his view, the good quality of teacher education could ensure student teachers' success in finding a job and doing it well, which helped the university seek a place in the global market:

> Our students go all over the world with our qualification and get jobs and they are successful. I'm not sure yet how good we are at selling ourselves to a global world (Henry).

Financial rewards were seen to be a main driver for promoting internationalisation at the institutional level at Southside University. Some of the Scottish academics thought that the university was supportive to the internationalisation of teacher education because it could make money from it, or from incoming students. As Carol put it:

> The university recognises that it will make money by having international collaborations. … We will have more income from students – we have students coming to us. If we send our students out, it's helpful because their students will want to come to us. I think a lot of the time it's driven

by financial gain (Carol).

This response indicates that internationalisation at the institutional level at Southside University was more associated with income generation. The aim for profit positions internationalisation within the economic rationale (de Wit, 2002; Knight, 1997). In particular, Henry's emphasis on the attractiveness of teacher education in Scotland for international students is a justification for an instrumentally oriented aim for internationalising teacher education. The economic rationale is indicated by what Stier (2006) terms as the instrumentalism ideology, which depicts internationalisation as the means of generating income or economic growth, and of developing a skilful labour force for the increasingly multicultural and global market. However, Daniel raised his concerns about the institution's emphasis on financial motivations for internationalisation. He argued that if universities were mainly driven by money in the internationalisation of teacher education, they would fail to pay attention to the mutual benefits for themselves and others, especially their partners, of study abroad programmes:

> Sometimes, practising in the UK can seem to be very one-sided: send your students and their income and their actual benefits for Chinese partners in the process can be limited (Daniel).

In Daniel's view, this one-sided financial driver at the institutional level may not be helpful to the promotion and sustainability of approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education, because partner universities "are more willing to engage in discussion when they see things as a two-way process". What is reassuring at Southside University is that most of the Scottish academics believed that internationalisation at the school level was not always driven by financial benefits, as reflected in the following statement:

> I think in the School of Education, part of what we want is not about business or financial models, but that it's driven by the social context

> and [by the fact that] we want to contribute to the good (Carol).

This response indicates that actions for internationalisation at the school level were highly determined by the society in which it was based, and the benefits they considered for themselves, as well as for those with whom they are working.

Different focuses on the rationale for internationalisation at different departmental levels may bring tensions to the internationalisation of teacher education at Southside University. If the rationale at the institutional level is not compatible with that at the school level, practices of internationalisation may stop running. For example, if the university looks solely at the financial benefit from internationalisation, certain approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education developed at school level may be unable to generate sufficient institutional support and therefore be discontinued. This can be seen in the case of the Skyping and conversation module:

> … it happened for the last 3 years. This year it won't happen, because I don't have time for teaching it (Stella).

This response demonstrates the importance of the compatibility of different views concerning the rationale for internationalisation at different departmental levels. It can influence the sustainability of approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education.

In the Chinese context, the academics did not bring up a financial motivation for internationalisation. Even when talking about student mobility in the interviews, they spoke little about incoming students in the process of the internationalisation of teacher education, let alone the money that might be brought to the university by them. Instead, what they emphasised was sending their student teachers out through study abroad programmes. This result confirms that though China has worked hard to attract international students, and to export its higher education

programmes with distinctive features to other countries in the past decade (Altbach & Knight, 2007), it is still a major source country of international students for the West, particularly for top destination countries such as the US, the UK and Australia (Hawthorne, 2010).

5.4 Summary

Academics at the two universities conceptualised internationalisation in a broad sense, rather than viewing it as a substitute for a specific study abroad programme or any other approach that had an intercultural, international or global dimension. However, the academic participants held different views about the rationale for internationalising teacher education. The Chinese academic participants at Nanhai University consistently portrayed internationalisation as a one-way process which focused on learning educational ideas and practices from “internationally advanced countries”, in order to ensure the quality of education in China. In general, this one-way process of learning from the West was mainly driven by the academic rationale. In contrast, the Scottish academic participants at Southside University demonstrated different views about the rationale for internationalisation. Henry viewed internationalisation as a one-way process which involved recruiting more international students to learn from Scotland, or from Southside University in particular. His view aligned with the economic rationale at the institutional level. The other three Scottish academics regarded internationalisation as a two-way process in which they were more concerned about the mutual benefits of all partners involved. They focused on the social and cultural rationale and the educational value of internationalisation to their student teachers’ personal and professional development, although they were also aware of the economic rationale at the institutional level. The next two chapters will look at how internationalisation at the two universities shapes student teachers’ learning.

Chapter 6 Learning to Become Globally Competent Teachers: Chinese and Scottish Student Teachers Reflect on the Impact of Study Abroad Experiences

6.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the impact of study abroad programmes on student teachers in regard to their personal and professional learning. The chapter starts with student teachers' accounts of learning about others and self through their interactions with different education systems and cultures in host countries. It then presents how student teachers felt as cultural outsiders in host countries and what they took from these experiences. This is followed by a demonstration of how the study abroad experiences have shaped their role as globally competent teachers. The chapter ends with a summary.

6.2 Learning about others and self through study abroad programmes

The student teacher participants from both Nanhai University and Southside University thought that they had become more knowledgeable about both host countries, and their home countries, by participating in study abroad programmes. They demonstrated new knowledge about others and themselves, mostly through constant comparisons between host countries and their home countries. However, different focuses were raised in the responses given by the student teachers who were from different cultural backgrounds or who had different interactions with the environments where they lived, studied and had their placements.

6.2.1 Learning about educational ideas and practices in the host country

When talking about what they had learned from overseas learning experiences, the

Chinese student teacher participants claimed that they had an increased knowledge about ideas and practices of teaching in their host countries. For example, some of the Chinese student teachers who had learning experiences at American universities, and paid visits to some local schools, noticed that American classroom teaching was more flexible, interactive and student-centred than that in China:

> They don't have textbooks in classroom teaching. … Teachers talk less [than their peers in China] and promote communication, interaction and discussions among students. … These are different from the teacher dominating and spoon-fed teaching style in China (Manlu, postgraduate).

In particular, they tended to give more detailed examples of the practices of teaching they had observed and the ideas they had learned from the host country, as evidenced by the following statement:

> In the US, teachers tend to avoid using negative words in assessments. They would lead students by saying "How about…" instead of "Don't" or "No" … [They would] establish a more relaxing classroom atmosphere than ours (Siya, undergraduate).

What is evident in these statements is that the Chinese student teachers superficially compared the child-centred teaching style in the US with the teacher-led teaching style in China. There was no careful analysis of these teaching styles in relation to local contexts. This result echoes a previous study in which superficial comparisons have been frequently made by Chinese student teachers when they are faced with big differences between the Chinese education system and the education system in Canada (Fang, Clarke, & Wei, 2016). Despite the frequent comparisons, the big differences between the Chinese education system and that of the host country were in line with many of the Chinese student teachers' expectations – "we have long heard about the more open, more advanced and more innovative education in the US" (Meng, postgraduate). This means that new knowledge about

education in the host country extended their existing assumption or expectation that "[Americans] are advanced in educational ideas and skills" (Manlu, postgraduate). Such learning can be viewed as informative or informational learning which aims "at increasing our fund of knowledge, at increasing our repertoire of skills, at extending already established cognitive structures" (Kegan, 2009, p.42).

With a similar prior knowledge about American education, many of the Chinese student teachers were not challenged to negotiate meanings about the differences they encountered. Instead, they were willing to directly take what they had learned to their future classrooms: "I will adopt this idea [giving more opportunities to children to do and try things] to teach my students" (Yueqing, undergraduate); "I will apply this [close and equal student-teacher relationship] … in my interaction with students" (Meng, postgraduate), and "I have brought back some good websites and tool kits from the US for my future classroom teaching and learning" (Yueqing, undergraduate). These responses demonstrate Chinese student teacher participants' idealisation of the educational practices that they have learned and observed in the host country, and their slight dissatisfaction with Chinese educational practices. Their views about what they have mainly learned from study abroad experiences are consistent with the Chinese academics' understanding of internationalisation as a means of learning educational ideas and practices from Western developed countries.

Among the six Scottish student teachers, three of them (i.e. Ada, Ella and Kala) studied abroad but not through university programmes. Ada and Ella also placed a major emphasis on educational issues of the host countries in regard to what they had taken from their international learning experiences. For example, Ada, who failed to get an opportunity to study abroad through university programmes, found herself a three-week placement opportunity at a Montessori School in the US. Similar to many of the Chinese student teachers, she was happy to learn educational practices from the host country:

> I learned about the Montessori Philosophy and the influence that it has on a school and the children within a school. I also learned about general classroom practices and ideas – these I will be able to use within my own classroom (Ada).

When presenting her newly learned knowledge and skills, Ada constantly compared them with those in Scotland. She found that the Montessori philosophy was "a kind of different philosophy to what we have in Scotland". Particularly, she observed that American teachers used very different strategies when approaching children's behaviours:

> They wouldn't use, like, stickers or stamps. You know what I mean by that? Like, they wouldn't give the children things. They expected it all to be internal motivation, and that was really interesting, because I hadn't really considered that before (Ada).

Similar to Ada, Ella had a practice teaching experience in a Swedish nursery for four months through the Erasmus Programme, instead of being sent through a university programme. She also felt that the international learning experience had an impact on her, particularly in terms of becoming more knowledgeable about Swedish educational practices. She listed facts and ideas about Swedish education, and constantly compared it with the Scottish education system, as evidenced in the following statement:

> I learned about a different education system to the Scottish one. So, over there in Sweden, within the preschool, children seemed to be outside a lot more. In Scotland, we don't really go outside that much for outdoor learning. … They start introducing English very early there, along with Swedish, so the teachers will speak to them sometimes in Swedish and sometimes in English, which doesn't happen here (Ella).

Similar to many of the Chinese student teachers, Ada and Ella also claimed that they had developed an increased knowledge about education of their host countries. They were also excited to take some newly learned ways of teaching into their future classrooms, as demonstrated by claims such as “the teacher really goes with children’s interests – what they want to know about. I’ll try to incorporate that as well” (Ella), and “it’s [the strategy for approaching children’s behaviours] definitely something I will take forward” (Ada).

Kala was another student teacher who attended a one-week intensive course in the Netherlands through a summer school. Unlike Ella and Ada, who had placements at a nursery or a primary school in their host countries, Kala was studying with university students from different countries at a Dutch university. She had little to say about basic education in the host country. Instead, she reported more about the content of the course which was very topical:

> It focuses on Europe’s 21st Century Challenges and looks at EU migration law … [and] I now have a better understanding of the term migration and what the circumstances mean. … I thought about, sort of, bringing it back to my degree when I go out into schools (Kala).

Though Kala had a different experience in her host country, it is evident that these three Scottish student teachers paid more attention to the content knowledge. They tend to uncritically take what they have learned into their future practices of teaching, as evidenced by Ella and Ada’s responses in particular.

The common theme running through the responses of these three Scottish student teachers and most of the Chinese student teachers is that their account of the study abroad experiences mainly focuses on content reflection on educational ideas and practices in the host countries, without much critical thought. Core to content reflection is the description of the events and things that learners have experienced, without further reflection on how they react to new events, and how they make

sense of them (Kitchenham, 2008; Mezirow, 1990). In the process of content reflection, these student teachers "are not attending to the grounds or justification for [their] beliefs but are simply using [their] beliefs to make an interpretation" (Mezirow, 1991, p. 107). The student teachers' recollection of new educational ideas and practices that they encountered in their host countries is evidence of their knowledge growth. However, their responses indicate that these student teachers appear to idealise the educational practices and ideas of their host countries. They regard the new knowledge as something that they can draw upon, as evidenced by their intention to directly adopt such practices and ideas in their future classrooms.

6.2.2 Learning about others and self from cultural differences

Aside from their predominant focus on educational ideas and practices in their host countries (and sometimes in their own countries), only a small number of the Chinese student teacher participants, and the three Scottish student teacher participants who studied abroad but not through university programmes, reported that they had gained a better understanding of themselves and others from their encounters with different cultures. Their responses in the interviews show that it is easier for them to learn about themselves and their own culture when they are immersed in a different culture. This is because "*culture hides much more than it reveals and, strangely enough, what it hides, it hides most effectively from its own participants*. … [T]he ultimate purpose of the study of culture is not so much the understanding of foreign cultures as much as the light that study sheds on our own" (Hall, 2013, p. 171, emphasis in original). Therefore, this section will present student teachers' new understandings of self through learning about others in the host cultures.

Many of the Chinese student teachers claimed that overseas learning experiences "broadened my horizons", "enabled me to know more about people and cultures in the [host] country" and "developed my international perspectives". These responses

were given without further elaboration, which sounded more like clichés. When prompted further during interviews, some of the Chinese student teachers thought that the study abroad experiences had also had an impact upon their impression of American people. They learned that American people were more “individualistic” (Meng, postgraduate) and “punctual and concerned with principles” (Yinqi, postgraduate) than Chinese people. Some others mentioned that American people were not as knowledgeable about other countries and cultures as they had expected. Zhimin, an undergraduate student teacher who spent three weeks (with one week learning at a local university and two weeks placed at a local middle school) in the United Sates, found that:

> Some students [in the middle school where I was placed] came to me on the first day and asked me, “Where are you from? Are you from Taiwan?” I said, “No, I’m from Shanghai”. [They continued,] “Where is Shanghai?” They don't even know Shanghai and Beijing! … They even asked me if there were tacos, football or Pizza Hut in China (Zhimin, undergraduate).

Yueqing, another undergraduate student teacher who studied abroad on the same programme, also reported that Americans were very different from what she had expected:

> [People] in the place where we visited were not as open as … they were shown to be in movies. … They were very much concerned about safety issues. … They were often very defensive and guarded against others. This was very different from what they were shown to be in movies (Yueqing, undergraduate).

These responses indicate that study abroad experiences can challenge some Chinese student teachers’ expectations of the host culture. The mismatch between expectations and realities is also evident in their recognition of their own taken-for-

granted views about their own culture and society. Two student teachers said that study abroad experiences enabled them to become more aware and proud of being Chinese. In Zhimin's account, she found that:

> We have developed more confidence in the splendid Chinese culture and characters, which we took for granted in our life … they [students in the American primary school where I was placed] thought I had magic powers when I was writing Chinese characters in a lesson (Zimin, undergraduate).

This statement shows that placing the student teacher in a different culture could enable her to see her invisible cultural attachment through the eyes of others, and allow her to develop pride in her own culture.

Further to this, some of the Chinese student teachers' immersion in another culture sometimes reinforced their ethnocentric views. This can be seen in the following example in which another student teacher saw some negative aspects of the US:

> … living within our own social system is very safe … when I saw that there were a lot of homeless people in the street. It was a few blocks away from the city centre of Los Angles, and there was an unpleasant smell (Meng, postgraduate).

This view suggests that the student teacher made an association between homeless people and social insecurity through her limited frame of reference. As well as this, she tended to generalise what she had seen in one part of the US as applicable to the entire country.

Responses indicate that some of the Chinese student teachers' pre-assumptions about American culture or people were challenged as a result of their immersion in the US. These challenged views can help develop their pride in, and a new

understanding of, home culture, which is often obscured in the community where they belong. However, their understanding may not be accurate if they only see their own culture and identity through the parochial views of others and focus on the underdeveloped areas of the host countries. Meanwhile, they had little to say about how they might make sense of the mismatch between expectations and realities in order to gain a deeper understanding of themselves and others. The lack of critical reflection on their challenged views can lead some Chinese student teachers to "reinforce their own identities rather than risk self-transformation" (H. Wang, 2005, p. 58). As demonstrated by the above statement, the study abroad experience did not open Meng's mind up, and in fact, on the contrary, it simply reinforced her ethnocentric view: "living within our own social system is very safe".

Similarly, the three Scottish student teachers who participated in study abroad programmes but not through university programmes also noted that learning in a different culture was very eye-opening. This is evident in the example Ada gave about how people in the US acted very differently from them:

> They are very appreciative of the military. … Every morning, they [the children in the school where I was placed] all said it [the Pledge of Allegiance] and they all stood with, like, put their hand like that [Ada placed her hand on her heart while saying this]. … They do it every day at school and – at football games and stuff like that. … But, we don't do that. They are very patriotic. … I think it made me realise that we're distinctly not patriotic (Ada).

The contrast between what others have, and what they do not, enabled Ada to become more aware of aspects of Scottish people and Scotland. In particular, the interaction with American culture and people contributed to Ada's better understanding of being Scottish. As she realised, "when you're in Scotland, you have no real understanding of the world's view of Scotland". The encounter with people in the US was a process of presenting herself as Scottish:

> … seeing how interested they were in it [Scottish culture], and how different it was to what they had … made me realise that we should appreciate it more ... I mean, we appreciate our culture, because we have a very strong, like, cultural identity, with our Scottish music, Scottish dance, and I didn't really appreciate that before (Ada).

Ella and Kala also pointed out that they had learned to become more appreciative of being Scottish through learning experiences in their host countries. The proud sense of being Scottish was cultivated when they found that people in the host countries "were always interested if you are from the UK … and we are very proud of our national identity" (Ella) and "they're limited with their options … to go to uni[versity], … but here in Scotland, it's [higher education is] more accessible" (Kala). According to their perceptions, their own culture was often invisible to them as they were situated within it. However, the learning experience abroad made it more visible, as is apparent in Ada's statement:

> Before, maybe I thought, like, when you do stuff about Scotland, it kind of – I already knew about it, so I wasn't that interested. So, maybe that would've rubbed off on my practice, because I wouldn't have been so keen to teach the children about it, but now I kind of appreciate it more (Ada).

By learning about others, these Scottish student teachers also recognised their own narrow mind-sets among themselves particularly when their pre-assumptions about people in their host countries were challenged. As Ella stated:

> I was expecting – before we went over to Sweden, we heard the Swedish people were quite cold and they wouldn't be very friendly, but we found that it was completely the opposite when we were there, which was really nice. They were very open and were always helpful if you ever had a question. … We always felt very guilty when we were there, because

> we just hoped all the Swedish people would be able to speak English (Ella).

Similar to Ella, Kala also found that her expectations were challenged by the fact that people in her host country were more open minded than she had predicted:

> … when we would go into the – town [in the Netherlands], we realised that, how close minded the British people are. … We're quite closed-minded for the fact that when we go somewhere, we automatically assume someone's going to speak English and a lot of the time they do, but they don't always. … We shouldn't assume that (Kala).

As the responses of the three Scottish student teachers show, international learning experiences in host countries could not only enable them to become more open-minded, and to cherish their taken-for-granted cultural identity, but could also push them towards discovering the parochialism in themselves, especially when their prior assumptions were challenged. The process of making the invisible culture and beliefs visible through study abroad experiences can contribute to student teachers' better understanding of themselves (Dantas, 2007). Moreover, student teachers' awareness of the incompleteness of self, and the need to open oneself to the larger world, indicates that international learning experiences are educative to them (Romano, 2007), and make them become more aware of the parochial views they once held. However, the awareness of parochialism in themselves did not lead these three Scottish student teachers any further towards making better sense of cultural differences between their host countries and their home country.

A similar problem can be found in the issues which many of the Chinese student teachers and these three Scottish student teachers had in relation to their perceptions of learning about educational issues, as well as about self and others, through cultural differences. That is, their learning was mainly based on what the differences were, rather than on how they felt when learning about these issues and

why the differences existed. Though their prior knowledge or assumptions about self and others had sometimes been challenged, they seldom had critical appraisals of these issues in order to connect the experiences with deeper learning. In this sense, their learning experiences still engaged with content reflection.

6.3 Learning about/in a foreign culture: pains and gains

Findings in the above section have shown that study abroad experiences can increase student teachers' knowledge about educational ideas and practices in their host countries, as well as knowledge about their own cultures. However, the data analysis suggests that study abroad experiences can also engage student teachers in the affective aspect of learning. In particular, the experience of a foreigner in the host country can trigger different emotional responses among student teachers from the two research sites. These different emotional responses generate different types of impact on the Chinese and Scottish student teacher participants.

6.3.1 Experiencing ups and downs

Despite their predominant focus on learning about educational ideas and practices in host countries, only a few Chinese student teachers talked about how they felt when learning about different cultures or learning as foreigners in the host countries. Two of the eight Chinese student teacher participants expressed discomfort when learning about certain aspects of their host cultures. Manlu, a postgraduate student teacher who was sent to the US through a study abroad programme of Nanhai University for two months, reported that she felt sad and sorry for black people when she heard the origin of rap from a black lecturer (who was taking a facilitative role for Chinese student teachers in the programme). She said:

> The black lecturer told us a story about why the black are good at rap. They didn't sing for fun, but they – they were captured and sold to the

> US as slaves. They were not allowed to write, so they orally recorded their history and tradition by this special way of talking and singing. … It sounded very bitter to me when I knew that it was not [originally] a form of entertainment (Manlu, postgraduate).

Though Manlu's statement shows that learning about some aspects of a different culture could involve her emotions, the information was not necessarily correct. There were no signs given as to how the Chinese student teacher was guided by the lecturer to engage with the topic. Similarly, Siya, an undergraduate student teacher who studied abroad in four different countries (namely the US, New Zealand, Sri Lanka and Thailand), also reported that she learned a cruel story about the reasons that women in a couple of Thai villages were wearing copper circles:

> I was lucky to do voluntary teaching in a small Thai village which is famous as a long-neck tribe. It's traditional for women there to wear copper circles, … but I found it so cruel and inhumane that they did it just for making their necks look longer and more beautiful (Siya, undergraduate).

Siya's statement indicates her parochial view of Thai culture within the village. She appeared to judge others' beauty norms according to her own point of view. The two responses presented above suggest that merely interacting with a new culture, without careful analysis of other factors within local communities, can lead to a simplistic view towards the culture at best, or a misunderstanding at worst.

Aside from emotional reactions to learning about the "cruel stories" behind certain cultures, some Chinese student teachers also experienced emotional ups and downs when they were living as foreigners in their host countries. Four of the eight student teachers made reference to their identity as a foreigner in the host country, but they differed in their lived experiences and feelings of being a foreigner. Three of them (two were sent to the US, while another was sent to Taiwan) felt very happy to have

been welcomed by people in the places where they were studying: “I felt very comfortable when they [Americans] smiled at me all the time, even though I may have language difficulties” (Yueqing, undergraduate); “[the Americans] were very kind to ask me if I needed any help” (Manyan, postgraduate); “I was so touched when the children and the teachers [in the Taiwanese Kindergarten] were so collaborative [in a lesson I was teaching], and I was so deeply accepted and welcomed” (Rui, undergraduate). Their responses indicate that they were excited as newcomers in new environments, because they found that the local people were so welcoming, helpful and accepting. The experience of excitement which they had can be described as the honeymoon stage, the initial stage of culture shock which was first introduced by Oberg (1960, 2006). Having experienced happy foreigners in host countries, these student teachers explained that they would be more aware that foreigners in China might also need help, and that they would treat them in a similar way they had been treated: “I’ll approach them by asking – ‘Do you need any help?’ … If they are looking at maps. I wouldn’t do that before” (Yueqing, undergraduate) or “I’ll be more willing to treat them like friends, and take the initiative to help them” (Menyan, postgraduate).

The fourth student teacher, Siya, who had participated in study abroad programmes in more than one country (and for a longer time than the other three), experienced more disorienting moments as a foreigner. Sometimes, she felt homesick when she was not so used to the food in her host countries:

> When I went there I did feel not so used – in many ways. When I was in the US, I really missed rice. … In Sri Lanka, you would miss pure rice, because we had everything with curry, every day! ... So, you would feel that you were a foreigner there (Siya, undergraduate).

In another incident, Siya felt anxious about being the focus of attention among Sri Lankans:

> I was ill in Sri Lanka, and went to a small hospital. … All the staff members including nurses, cleaners and doctors came to see me. They wondered how a Chinese person could be ill, and it was quite ridiculous. … The doctor even asked me for my Facebook account and then kept contacting me. I think it's a huge culture shock (Siya, undergraduate).

Further to this, the language barrier to communicating with the doctor who spoke Cantonese to her pushed her further outside of her comfort zone. The confusion caused by the language barrier between her and the doctor created an association with the story of the Tower of Babel – she and the doctor were both speaking different languages, and were unable to make each other understand:

> It was a very difficult experience. I was speaking English, but he was speaking Cantonese to me. I couldn't understand what he was saying. And then, the driver came to translate my words into Sinhala to the doctor. I went crazy during that experience (Siya, undergraduate)[7].

Siya's responses indicate that she was experiencing discomfort as a foreigner in her host countries, as demonstrated by the examples of missing food from home, being the focus of attention by the local people, and struggling to make herself understood by the doctor. She acknowledged that these struggling experiences led to "disruptions in my mind and I would become more dialectic to different things". According to her explanation, the dialectic views mean a better understanding of the things around her, such as understanding China as "a diverse country which consists of different ethnic minorities, accompanied by different customs … and dialects", and seeing "children [as] individuals who can have different family backgrounds … and bring different stories with them". She went on to say that "experiences as a foreigner in different countries can enable me to help different children in a better way". However, she gave no further explanation about what the

---

[7] The doctor had been to China and could speak a little Cantonese, but Siya is a student teacher from mainland China, and she could not understand Cantonese.

better way entails or, indeed, means.

These responses demonstrate that some of the Chinese student teachers experienced emotional ups and downs. Two of them said that they felt sad when learning about the "cruel stories" behind certain cultures or traditions. However, they had little critical analysis of their own ways of seeing the cultures of their host countries. As a result, they demonstrated a simplistic view, or a misunderstanding of, the local culture. Four other Chinese student teachers talked about their feelings when learning within a different culture as a foreigner, but three mentioned that they were very happy when they were treated well by the people in their host countries. These "happy foreigners" did not relate their experiences as foreigners to their interactions with children in their future classrooms. Siya, the only student teacher who experienced strong emotions abroad, recognised the importance of these disruptive experiences to her future practices of teaching. However, her responses – as well as those of the three "happy foreigners" – were all about their own feelings, in particular the ups and the downs. Few explained how they coped with these feelings in order to arrive at new understandings of themselves and others. Their accounts of the affective aspects of learning specifically focus on incidents they encountered, which is only reflection on the learning content. Content reflection is important for student teachers' learning, but it is more helpful for them to examine the processes of learning in detail alongside more critical views (Cranton & King, 2003).

6.3.2 Developing empathy as a result of feeling "out of place" as a cultural outsider

As presented in the above sections, the Chinese student teachers focused somewhat more on reporting the positive impact that study abroad experiences had on them, which was mainly reflected in their increased knowledge about educational issues and practices in their host countries, and the happy moments they experienced as foreigners. There was not much information about their disruptive experiences

abroad. However, disruptive experiences abroad were very common for the Scottish student teachers, particularly for the other three Scottish student teachers (Callie, Richard and Gina) who had overseas learning experiences through university programmes. Therefore, this section will explore the disruptive moments the Scottish student teacher participants experienced as cultural outsiders when they were immersed in foreign countries. It will also examine how disruptive experiences may affect them in terms of their personal and professional learning.

When immersed in their host countries as foreigners, the Scottish student teachers had more disruptive moments than most of the Chinese student teachers did. According to many of the Scottish student teachers, language barriers were the greatest cause of awkward, and sometimes frustrating, positions. Ella, who took a placement in a kindergarten in Sweden, realised that it was a very difficult experience for a foreigner there:

> I think from the experience, I realise [for] myself how hard it is to go into a classroom where people don't really speak your language (Ella).

It was even harder for student teachers who were placed in a country where the language was very different from their first language. For example, Callie was sent to Malawi, and was very frustrated about not being able to understand what people were saying in the village marketplace:

> That was frustrating for the first part. When we got to the marketplace, they were shouting and saying things to our driver. We were obviously a bit uncomfortable – we didn't know what they were saying, and what was happening. We just tried to stick together. … They were saying things in Chichewa we didn't understand (Callie).

This response demonstrates that the Scottish student teachers experienced intense emotions when they were pushed out of their comfort zones by not being able to

understand the local language. Their discomfort in the unfamiliar environment, and in contact with a language they were not able to speak, is evidenced from their reaction of sticking together with peers in order to protect themselves from others.

Awkwardness could also arise from a Scottish student teacher's experience in another English-speaking country. Ada, who took a placement in the US, found herself:

> … a bit out of my place and a bit awkward, … because I mean, language is the biggest barrier. Even though we both speak English, a lot of people really struggle to understand what we say (Ada).

Though some people in the host countries could speak some English and, in Ada's case, the Americans around her were native English speakers, most of the Scottish student teachers became aware that the way they spoke, and some particular words they used, could add to the difficulty of communicating with local people. As Kala put it:

> I think being a Scottish person, it was speed and pronunciation. … Watching, like, Scottish vernacular, like, little words that aren't actually really words, but are words to us. So the word "wee" – if I say "wee", they're like "What?" (Kala).

According to most of the Scottish student teachers' views, disruption could also be caused by differences in cultures and in the way that they looked. They might feel very awkward when they appeared to be cultural outsiders, without knowing what to do to fit in. This is evident in Ada's experience in an American primary school:

> So I think sometimes, like, I can remember how I felt when everyone else was doing the Pledge of Allegiance and I didn't know what was happening. I felt a bit awkward and a bit out of place (Ada).

Awkwardness could also occur when the Scottish student teachers looked different from the local people in their host countries. For example, Gina, a student teacher who was sent to China for four weeks through a university programme, found that the way they dressed was different from the local people:

> You struggle – I know a lot of times we would get maybe comments on how we dress – not negative comments, just like – "Oh, you are wearing that; oh, that's interesting" (Gina).

It could also be that the way they looked was completely different from Malawian people:

> You were wondering why people were looking at you. We all remember we went to the market one day and a baby looked at us and started to cry, because they had never seen white people before. We took this as – my goodness, the baby is crying. What have I done? We must be very upsetting to him. But it was because we were so different, especially in the markets in small villages. We felt more like outsiders, more like foreigners (Callie).

Having been a fish out of water, or experienced life as a cultural outsider, most of the Scottish student teachers claimed that they would be more understanding towards future students who might speak English as an additional language, or who come from a different cultural background. They realised that what they experienced in new environments could also happen to their future students. As a result, they thought they would be better able to understand "what it is like to live in another country" (Richard), as the following responses demonstrate:

> I feel a lot more understanding now – especially going to a school where no one can speak my language in their country, so I wouldn't expect to – but it does make you feel quite out of place. So, I could imagine how,

> especially as a child … it must be very difficult (Ella).

> I can imagine for a child coming into an environment that they don't know – that is just a small fraction of how they would feel. So I think it gives you a wee bit of, kind of, empathy and understanding of how really overwhelming it can be (Ada).

Based on the empathy they developed from their "out-of-place" experiences, some Scottish student teachers tried to make connections with their future classroom teaching and learning. They reflected more profoundly after talking about how they would respond to immigrant children who might have similar feelings to those they experienced as cultural outsiders with language barriers. Richard, who was the only Scottish male student teacher, had a learning experience in China through the same programme with Gina. He made a connection between his experience in China and his future interaction with immigrant children:

> … when I went to China, I couldn't speak Chinese. So, it was very infuriating sometimes to go into a shop, knowing what you want, but not being able to communicate, while the Chinese were very good and very patient with you and they would try to talk it through. This gives you more patience when you are dealing with children who maybe can't speak English. … For example, if children come from China to Scotland, they may not be able to learn right away, because they need to feel safe in the classroom and feel a part of the classroom (Richard).

Similarly, Callie also linked her disruptive moments in Malawi to her future practices of teaching to children from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds:

> I know in that situation we were stressed, we were uncomfortable. We were able to break it down because we knew about these cultural differences. … I think just trying to provide opportunities that don't make them feel like that (Callie).

These findings show that many of the Scottish student teachers, particularly those who had studied abroad through university programmes in China and Malawi, were more affected by their experiences as cultural outsiders in host countries than their Chinese peers. The Scottish student teacher participants had more cultural disruptions during their study abroad experiences, and these were mainly the result of language barriers, cultural differences, or differences in their physical appearance. Their views also suggest that these disruptive experiences helped them to develop empathy for immigrant students in their future classrooms. Emotional setbacks in host countries appeared to make the Scottish student teachers more emotionally resilient and pedagogically resourceful.

However, some of the Chinese student teachers experienced ups and downs as foreigners in their host countries, as shown in Section 6.3.1. Only one of them (Siya) struggled a lot during her experiences in her host countries. Although she recognised that these disruptive experiences resulted in a better understanding of cultural diversity in China, and an increased ability to help children from different family backgrounds, she did not mention how she might cope with these feelings or connect them to her future interactions with students. No explicit account was given by any of the Chinese student teacher participants about their developing a greater sense of empathy as a result of intercultural immersion in their host countries.

6.3.3 Transforming frames of reference through critical reflection on feelings and assumptions

According to Mezirow (2012), a frame of reference is "the structure of assumptions and expectations through which we filter sense impressions" (p.82). The three Scottish student teachers (Callie, Richard and Gina) who studied abroad through university programmes showed an ability to react to their problematic frames of reference, and to critically reflect on cultural disorientations resulting from their

encounters with cultural differences. Their Chinese peers, and the other three Scottish student teachers who studied abroad but not through university programmes, were less able to do so. The ability to react to problematic frames of reference and to reach critical appraisals of pre-assumptions involves process reflection and critical reflection. Process reflection is defined as the way learners react to, or deal with, problems or disorienting dilemmas, while premise reflection or critical reflection is understood to be the way learners critically reflect on their old premises of problems, question their own pre-assumptions or value systems, and search for more justified interpretations as the result of a broader viewpoint (Mezirow, 1990, 2012). These kinds of reflection can be seen in the responses of these three Scottish student teachers.

Though the three Scottish student teachers who studied abroad through university programmes also gained increased content knowledge about education systems of their host countries, they ultimately experienced deeper learning about a wider range of things (i.e. educational issues, food, cultural beliefs and norms, communication styles) than the Chinese student teachers, or the three Scottish student teachers who studied abroad but not through university programmes. Deeper learning often happens when people struggle between different emotions and start to question their own beliefs, values, and life purposes (Rogers & Tough, 1996; Scoffham & Barnes, 2009). In interviews, these three Scottish student teachers were more aware of, and critical about, their thoughts and feelings when experiencing cultural disorientations. They were able to reconstruct new perspectives or interpretations on the basis of their problematic frames of reference, rather than merely extending their existing frames of reference by adding new content or things learned. For example, Gina learned that people from different countries might perceive the norm of beauty differently:

> Even like with me, me and a few of other girls that were on the trip, we love to tan. Not like in China, people held umbrellas up all the time [to protect themselves against the sun]. They probably feel, "Oh my

> goodness, this crazy girl, she wants to be darker. That's not what we consider to be beautiful" (Gina).

When faced with different cultural norms, or other differences, Gina expressed that she would initially feel "a bit taken aback", and then she would re-examine herself by reflecting on the existence of differences: "If I was growing up over there surrounded by people of a similar nature, of course I would grow up with the same ideas and life style". Throughout Gina's responses, her learning from the trip to China involved a lot of emotions and critical thoughts, as demonstrated in the following statement:

> The first thing I noticed was the differences, the contrasts – oh wait, in Scotland we do this, or in Scotland we don't do that. So, immediately you are anxious. You are envisioning different scenarios: what will I expect? How will I cope when in that situation? Not necessarily negative, there are positive things as well. You are excited at the same time (Gina).

Gina's statements indicate that the sharp contrasts between Chinese and Scottish cultures are important conditions for learning about self and others. In her opinion, the learning trip in China was "a whirlwind of experiences" which enabled her to experience a mixture of feelings (i.e. anxious and excited at the same time), and to start to question herself and to talk with her peers in group sessions about how to cope with such feelings. When learning that many Chinese people were able to speak English, she began to question different teaching strategies in China and Scotland:

> And you begin to question … that you know, [the] teacher-led [approach] seems to be working too well in China, [but] why are we focusing so much on [the] child-centred [approach]? … If you look at languages, they [the Chinese people] are outperforming us – you know, you begin to consider alternative teaching strategies … I begin to question – hold on, why is that [the child-centred approach] not popular there? Why is it so

> popular here (Gina)?

The involvement of emotions and critical reflection in learning about others and themselves is also identified in the other two Scottish student teachers' responses. Richard also admitted that he was shocked by the good English of some Chinese students. Through critical reflection, he compared it with foreign language learning in Scotland:

> The Chinese students were very good at English. … I was very surprised by that. … Sometimes, [Scottish] children might think that everybody can speak English, because you might see Chinese people, Polish people, French people and German people over here – they can speak English! … So I think in Scotland, there is an attitude that children don't want to learn languages (Richard).

Richard's reflection on the different realities of foreign language learning in China and Scotland enabled him to realise that "it's important [for children] to be able to speak foreign languages, especially for future job prospects in the increasingly connected world".

Emotional tension is found to be greatest in Callie's learning experience, because her responses show more emotional fluctuations than any of the other student teacher participants, both Chinese and Scottish. As part of a university programme, she and four other student teachers were sent to Malawi for three weeks, in order to study at a teacher training college and be placed in schools there. Strong emotions were triggered in her by contrasting images: the deficient Malawians as opposed to the sufficient Scottish. She said that she was shocked to see "such a lack of resources" in Malawian schools, noting that, in contrast, "we have so much" in Scotland. She was astonished that Malawian children "had to go to the borehole to pump their water", whereas Scottish children can have water whenever they want and their parents can "fill [the bottle] up whenever they [their children] want from

the tap". She was also astounded that some primary school children had to take care of their siblings while simultaneously studying at school:

> …the child, she must be in about Primary 7, maybe thirteen or fourteen years old, had a baby tied on her back. I think that may be a younger sibling, but she was still at school, doing her school work with a baby tied on her back. … I just thought: that's weird. You would never bring your baby sister or brother to the school, or bring them to the university. You would have your hands full (Callie).

By learning in such a dramatically different country, Callie said that "I felt very surreal … I felt like [it was] a dream", but "it was enjoyable to experience … in another culture and to see the way other people are living in the world". She acknowledged that the dramatic differences between Malawi and Scotland, as well as the Cultural Awareness classes she had attended prior to her learning experience in Malawi, were helpful in encouraging her to think about, as well as to analyse what she had witnessed each day. She tried to interpret and make sense of differences by asking, "Why did that happen? Was that something we did, or was it something that just happened in Malawi that we were not aware of?" By doing so, she realised that "we are the different ones", and what "we may not be able to see … may be valued in Malawian culture".

The constant self-questioning about what she experienced, about how she viewed cultural differences, and about why things happened so differently in other cultures, was found to be not only conducive to a deeper understanding of her host country and her own country, but was also vital for challenging her preconceptions. This is particularly evident in her and her Scottish colleague's[8] attempt to teach Malawian teachers active learning through a lesson which they had with Malawian children:

---

[8] This colleague, a drama teacher at a Scottish secondary school, was also sent to Malawi through the same programme.

> I think we – [colleague's name] and myself went and believed that we should be going to teach these Malawian teachers how to bring in active learning, how to give all the children a voice in the class [like] we would do in Scotland. But actually getting out there, we know that wouldn't be effective in certain cultures, especially in XXX primary school that I was working in (Callie).

This failure to incorporate active learning into a Malawian class has disrupted Callie's belief in the superiority of Scottish education and her attempt to acknowledge the voices of children in Malawi. As a result, she felt "a bit awkward" at times. She kept questioning why it did not work. In the meantime, she had an active dialogue with her colleague in order to make better sense of the experience in relation to the local context:

> We came to the conclusion that some of teaching techniques we are using in Scotland wouldn't work in Malawi, wouldn't work in China, wouldn't work anywhere else; it just depends on the children, depends on the class. … Malawian teachers are really skilled, being able to teach 80 to 100 children, get them all to learn things, get them to pass exams, and make them want to go to school. [That's] something – that is really amazing (Callie).

Her discussion with a Scottish colleague enabled Callie to realise that what they had in Scotland might not apply to others in different cultural contexts. The reconstruction of assumptions about local education in relation to its context, and the formulation of informed agreement on justifiable interpretations or opinions, are central to the transformative process of adult learning (Mezirow, 2012). Callie's learning from this incident did not end with finding answers to her questions about why she had failed to apply active learning in a Malawian class. Instead, she continued to reflect more deeply on the existence of her prior assumptions and values:

> Why do we think we are doing everything right because we do it? … Why do we think Scotland is superior, and should be teaching other countries how to teach children, when they are obviously successful in doing so (Callie)?

These questions helped Callie to unlearn her privilege, and to stop thinking about the superiority of Scottish education. As she said, “I think my preconception of Malawi or Malawian education [was] definitely turned on its head”. Having socially and experientially interacted with issues and people in Malawi, alongside her own colleagues and peers, Callie realised that the experience “was the quickest way” in her life to do, and learn, a great deal. She reported that she had also started to re-examine her Scottish identity, and had learned something she would have never thought about before. For example, she said she had never noticed that she was so different from her peers in the eyes of the Malawians, and that it was such an “interesting” opportunity to “learn stuff about ourselves as well when we were out there”. It is clear that the disorienting learning experience occasioned by critical reflection moves Callie “into the uncomfortable space of ‘what we do not know we do not know’” and enables her to “see through others’ eyes by transforming [her] own eyes and avoiding the tendency to want to turn the other into the self” (Andreotti, 2010, p. 242).

The perceptions of the three Scottish student teachers who were sent to China and Malawi through university programmes suggest that their learning about others, and themselves, has evolved from the superficial level of learning about facts into more personally engaged learning involving process reflection and premise reflection. They have experienced more emotional fluctuations, or a “roller-coaster” in Roger and Tough’s (1996) words, particularly when faced with contrasting images or issues between host countries and home country. The emotional tensions triggered by stark cultural differences have become rich points for critical reflection on their own cultural norms, values or preconceptions. Meanwhile, this result also shows that the three Scottish student teachers are more able to negotiate meanings

and feelings arising from cultural differences, and reconstruct their frames of reference, through critical reflection on the basis of individual or collegial efforts, rather than simply taking what they have learned into their future actions. These features are recognised as central to transformative learning (Mezirow, 2012).

6.4 Becoming globally competent teachers: from lived experiences abroad to action for change

As researchers have acknowledged, study abroad programmes can provide student teachers with a unique opportunity to directly explore the wider world, and can enable them to experience transitions in cognitive, affective, and behavioural dimensions (Cushner, 2007; Mahon & Cushner, 2007). However, my findings suggest that transitions from cognitive, to affective, and then on to behavioural domains, vary in intensity among the student teachers who are from different national backgrounds, and who have international learning experiences through different programmes and in different destination countries. This is evident in the findings presented in previous sections. The following subsections will expand upon changes student teachers from both research sites experienced following their lived experiences abroad.

6.4.1 Developing more confidence or greater awareness as a cross-cultural communicator

Having interacted with different cultures and people in their host countries, student teachers from both research sites expressed the belief that they had achieved self-efficacy as cross-cultural communicators. Many researchers have acknowledged that intercultural immersion experiences in foreign countries can push student teachers out of their comfort zones and can generate more impact on their interpersonal dimensions than some other learning activities which have international focuses (Colón-Muñiz, SooHoo, & Brignoni, 2010; Cushner, 2007; Romano, 2007; Santoro &

Major, 2012). However, the student teacher participants from both research sites differ in the way they focus on their increased self-efficacy as cross-cultural communicators.

The Chinese student teachers paid more attention to their increased confidence as English learners in their host countries, especially in the US. They all mentioned that they had learned English for years before they participated in study abroad programmes, but their responses showed that, at the beginning, they lacked confidence when communicating with native English speakers. They remarked that "what I took in might not be the messages they intended to convey, [because] English is not my native language, … and they sometimes spoke too fast" (Siya, undergraduate). Similar remarks recurred when they described difficulties that they had experienced on both formal and informal occasions. When they attended classes at partner universities in the US, they found it difficult to understand the content of the classes:

> Though we have a little English, … we still have difficulties in communication. … At the beginning, we attended classes and we didn't learn much (Zhimin, undergraduate).
>
> At another time, they talked about history. It was quite boring. We didn't quite get it … and we didn't quite understand many specific terms (Yueqing, undergraduate).

Communication barriers also happened in their daily life, particularly when they had to deal with emergencies or unexpected issues:

> One of the girls [a group of Chinese student teachers in a study abroad programme in the US] lost her mobile phone in the hotel where we were living. We were trying to report it to the police at the police station, but we could hardly understand the terms [the policeman used during the conversation] (Meng, undergraduate).

To most of the Chinese student teachers, they thought “we have little English vocabulary for the daily life” (Manlu, postgraduate). Though difficult moments with language barriers occurred during the initial stages, after they had been immersed in the host country for a while, most of the Chinese student teachers were able to see positive changes in themselves. Their statements frequently contain claims about how they became “more confident in communication” and “more willing to try”. Some of them realised that:

> I’m no longer scared to communicate with them, and sometimes I can have longer conversations [with them] (Manlu, postgraduate).

> I learned that we shouldn't be too shy. [We have to] be confident. We shouldn't feel too scared to speak or to do things (Yinqi, Postgraduate).

These statements indicate that study abroad experiences developed the Chinese student teachers’ confidence in communicating with others in English. However, little was said about which specific experiences promoted them to feel more confident except in one incident:

> I feel more confident. When I was teaching them to pronounce my name, they couldn’t get it right, though they had tried many times. In my [three-character] name, there are two Chinese characters that begin with the spelling “zh”, and they found it very, very hard to pronounce it. You wouldn’t feel they were – you would be very tolerant. … You would have the same feeling that when you were not grammatically correct, they would be happy too, since you tried to express your ideas, and they wouldn’t look down on you (Zhimin, undergraduate).

These statements presented above indicate that the Chinese student teacher participants have progressively achieved self-confidence in communicating with English-speaking people in the US through study abroad experiences. This positive

learning outcome aligns with the key findings of a previous study (Benson, Barkhuizen, Bodycott, & Brown, 2012), which revealed that some Hong Kong students developed confidence in using English by going through identity changes and moving from an identity as language learners to an identity as language users within the authentic context where English is spoken. However, there is little mention of what increased self-confidence in English means to them both personally and professionally. Therefore, a disconnect exists between their enhanced confidence in a foreign language, and their future role as teachers, though many of them were in the final year of their degree courses, and were placed in local schools in China at the time when my data was collected.

By contrast, the Scottish student teacher participants present a different picture of the impact of study abroad experiences on them as cross-cultural communicators. The main language they spoke when they were abroad was English, their native language, and they had very little knowledge of the native languages of their host countries. In the face of huge language barriers, they encountered more disorientating moments as foreigners in their host countries than the Chinese student teachers did, as shown in Section 6.3.2. Having struggled with strong emotions, many of the Scottish student teachers mentioned that they had become more self-aware when communicating with people in their host countries, and with immigrant children in Scotland. They did not realise that they were speaking too fast until they were abroad. They were very explicit about the conscious efforts they had made to cope with that:

> I just talked so fast that when I was in America, people were laughing because they didn't know what I was saying when I was on the phone. … [I] had to, kind of, slow down, as well as obviously [pick] up bits from different languages (Ada).

> [When I was in the Netherlands,] I realised that I spoke far too fast for them to – I was working in a group with two of the students from Italy

> and they just [had] blank looks on their face, ‘cause I must have been speaking about a million miles an hour for them. … So, I had to deliberately slow myself down and, like, really pronounce my words and make sure that I was … hopefully, giving a clearer understanding (Kala).

In addition to reducing the speed of their speech, the Scottish student teachers were also aware of some other strategies that they could use to help children in their classrooms who might only speak English as an additional language. For example, almost all of the Scottish student teachers were in the final year of their degree courses, and were undertaking their last placements in Scotland’s schools following their return from abroad. They noted that they were able to “use more hands and nods”, “be respectful” and “listen to them” (Ella) and “be more patient” (Richard) with children who might have language difficulties, adding that they “wouldn't really know how to help at all, if [they] had not participated in the study abroad programme” (Ella).

These findings indicate that many of the Scottish student teachers have become more self-aware regarding the way they speak, and have gained a better understanding of what constitutes an effective cross-cultural communicator or educator. These findings are succinctly summarised in Callie’s statement, which is based on her reflections about the language difficulties she encountered in Malawi and also relates to her interactions with me, as a foreign researcher, and with the children she met in her placement school:

> As you said today, you can understand my accent, which clearly I’m changing to talk to you, [and] may be different from the way I go home and talk to my mum and my sister. I’m now aware of within how much you can alter your speech in the way you are acting around people, as well as you will do with children. I think, being a teacher, you can have lots of different personalities. You are able to, kind of, change your mind-set. … I think [you should] just adapt, and try to find a way that works to

communicate with everyone (Callie).

These results show that language barriers were a major reason for many Scottish student teachers' disorientations in their host countries, but that they could also act as catalysts for a greater awareness of themselves as cross-cultural communicators or educators. Compared with the Chinese student teachers, the Scottish student teachers made more conscious efforts to cope with the language barriers which they encountered abroad, as demonstrated by their decisions to reorient their communication approaches. Moreover, they were more able to relate their increased self-awareness to their future profession, and more willing to act upon it when interacting with foreigners, or with immigrant students. What is also worth noting is that English was regarded by student teacher participants from both research sites as the dominant or most valuable language for daily communication in their experiences in host countries. The Chinese student teachers, for example, attempted to adapt themselves to the new environment by practicing the dominant language in their host countries, whilst many Scottish student teacher participants tried to modify their usual way of speaking in order to make themselves understood by foreigners or immigrant children.

6.4.2 From seeing more of the world to transferring knowledge to actions

The frequently mentioned benefits of study abroad programmes are that "[it enabled me to] see more of the world" and that it "opened up my mind-set", as seen in statements made by student teacher participants from both research sites. Almost all of them thought that if they had never stepped out of their own worlds, they would have been unable to broaden their horizons.

Having participated in study abroad programmes, both the Chinese and Scottish student teachers observed many changes in themselves. Many of the Chinese student teachers had similar feelings in regard to the way that they had bonded more with people in their host countries, as one student teacher claimed: "I'm

closer to what is happening there, in a place which used to be so remote and irrelevant to me" (Yinqi, postgraduate). As well as this, they also became more concerned about things happening in other countries:

> After this experience, I'm more aware that the world is connected. We shouldn't be confined to our own little world. We have to pay attention to – news about California, to news about other countries. … We'll communicate with some teachers there [the US] through email about what they may need and what we may need (Manlu, postgraduate).

Similarly, many of the Scottish student teachers, particularly the three who studied abroad through university programmes, also acknowledged that international learning experiences had increased their interest in issues about their host countries and elsewhere, as well as allowing them to develop a stronger bond with others. Apart from these similar changes, the Scottish student teachers developed greater readiness for future participation in the global world than the Chinese student teachers:

> Every time I hear anything about Africa or Malawi – if it is on the news, I'll jump at the chance to read it or follow lots of organisations on Twitter. Anytime I hear global citizenship or news pick-up, I do think I'm more aware of it. … You've been part of that. You've, kind of, got links with them. … Without going to Malawi, I probably wouldn't have applied to even go to China … and to learn more about different cultures (Callie).

Some other Scottish student teachers expressed similar sentiments, such as "that country is growing close to me, so I've got a stronger bond with China than what I did before I went over" (Richard) and "I pay a lot more attention to perhaps global issues … I'd love to go back. I want to see like Vietnam, Thailand – you know, I want to do that" (Gina).

These responses indicate that many Chinese and Scottish student teachers have developed an increased interest in, and a stronger bond with, other people in the world. However, some Scottish student teachers' perceptions added a new element to their personal development: a sense of empowerment following their learning experiences abroad. They felt more empowered to make future decisions to visit other parts of the world. This result suggests that the Scottish student teachers who studied abroad through university programmes appear to be more equipped to act upon their feelings, or plan for new actions in their life, as regards to active participation in the wider world, which is characteristic of transformative learning (Mezirow, 2012).

Having seen and engaged with the wider world, student teachers from both research sites said that they would transfer their broader views, or international perspectives, to their future teaching practices. However, there was a great difference between the Chinese student teachers and the Scottish student teachers in terms of how they made sense of broader views or international perspectives as future teachers, or how they related these to educating their future students. Many of the Scottish student teachers had similar thoughts, such as "it's important to keep children up-to-date with things happening in other countries" (Ella) and "by opening myself up to these different cultures and trying to experience different things, … I would like to show the children I work with that there's a bigger world out there than what's just in front of us" (Ada).

The Scottish student teacher participants, particularly the three Scottish student teachers who were sent to China and Malawi through university programmes, noted that they could not only open up children's minds, but also cultivate their curiosity about the world by sharing knowledge about the wider world with them. For example, Gina pointed out that:

> It [a whirlwind of experiences in China] always sticks in my head as an important point of reflection. So, I think when I go to a Scottish

> classroom, I will naturally want my students to be more curious about this and I will push the topic, and I will - hopefully we can learn about China (Gina).

In addition to cultivating curiosity among future students, Callie added that she would encourage them to participate constructively in the wider world as well:

> I think for myself it has challenged me to push myself further to see more of the world, to not just live through my own eyes, and actually to go and experience different things, but as well to … give them a deep understanding of the wider world, and maybe, hopefully, to encourage them to do so in the future as well (Callie).

Moreover, study abroad experiences enabled those three Scottish student teachers who studied abroad through university programmes to recognise the importance of preparing children to have global competence for their future lives. After his learning experience in China, Richard recognised the importance of promoting foreign languages among children, and said that he would also encourage his future students to "go to a country where the learning language is from [to experience it]". Callie also saw the importance of developing global competence in her future students after her disorienting, but rewarding, experience in Malawi. As opposed to Richard's focus on language competence, she highlighted the value of cultural awareness in her future students. She stated that she would like to:

> [give] the children some form of cultural awareness, assur[ing] them things in Scotland are different in different places, [which] will be very valuable. … if they learn about that from a young age, they could take that through their whole life. That means they can interact with a range of different people (Callie).

In contrast, the Chinese student teacher participants' data presents a different view. Though many of the Chinese student teachers mentioned that they had become

closer to people in their host countries, and would pay more attention to global issues, they did not say much about what they could take from these changes to prepare their future students for a global context. Instead, they looked at how international perspectives or ideas about education in their host country enabled them to try different ways of teaching, as evidenced in the following statement:

> As a teacher, you have to possess international perspectives. As Shanghai is trying to keep pace with others in the international community, … we have to broaden our horizons – like, in my subject area, [I have to think about] where China is, where the US is, and where the gap is. China maybe still focuses on the teacher-led approach, while the US may be more student-centred. … I will make my classroom more cheerful … [and] pay more attention to my students, rather than looking at how I teach (Yinqi, postgraduate).

Some other Chinese student teachers gave similar accounts, such as "as a teacher, I would adopt this idea [giving more opportunities to children to do and try things] to teach my students" (Yueqing, undergraduate); "I would apply this [close and equal student-teacher relationship] … in my interaction with students" (Meng, postgraduate); and "I would mix both the American and Chinese ways of teaching and … make them happier" (Manyan, postgraduate). These responses show that an increased interest in – and the stronger bond with others in – the wider world are not seen to be important ways of shaping many of the Chinese student teachers' development as globally competent teachers who possess the knowledge and skills to prepare their future students for an increasingly globalised world.

There is one exception. Siya, who had studied abroad in different countries, held the view that she "would share with them [the children] knowledge about different cultures and customs" and her classes "shouldn't be confined to the textbooks". She gave an explicit account of the importance of a global mind-set to herself as a teacher, and to her future students:

> Based on my different experiences, I think I can tell them – encourage them to learn more about the world. … If you are close to where you are, you can only see a couple of people. If you step outside, you can see more. If you step further outside, you can see the vast reaches of the world. Then, to my students, a broad knowledge [about the world] may not necessarily generate a direct impact on their academic achievement, but it can have a far-reaching impact on their future interaction with different people (Siya, undergraduate).

Findings presented in this section show some similarities, and some differences, between the Chinese and Scottish student teacher participants. They felt more connected with others or other countries after they had seen more of the world, and showed greater interest in knowing about things happening in other countries. However, many of the Scottish student teachers, particularly those who studied abroad through university programmes, developed a stronger feeling of empowerment in regard to becoming competent teachers for a global world than their Chinese peers did. This is because the former demonstrated more willingness to go further and to see more people in the world, and a greater keenness to develop global competence in their future students in order to help them achieve constructive participation in the wider world. Their responses indicate that they have developed an understanding of the important role of a teacher in a connected world, who "can help them [pupils] learn about the world, from the world, and with the world" (Devlin-Foltz, 2010, p.113). By contrast, most Chinese student teachers stressed that study abroad experiences could enable them to try different ways of teaching.

6.4.3 Becoming responsive teachers: acknowledging cultural diversity and exploring options for responding to it

Most student teachers from both research sites were placed at local schools within

their home countries following their return from abroad. They acknowledged that there was cultural diversity in local schools. Some of them thought they gained better knowledge of what cultural diversity means, and how to respond to it in teaching. However, they showed different understandings of cultural diversity. Many of the Scottish student teachers held the view that cultural diversity in Scottish classrooms is very common now, mainly due to the mobility of people across national boundaries:

> … people are moving more fluidly around the world, so in our class – you're never going to have a class that's just full of Scottish children. You're always going to have different cultures, different faiths, and children from different countries (Ada).

The Chinese student teachers also recognised the existence of cultural diversity within classrooms in Chinese schools. However, they illustrated that "people in China, particularly those in Shanghai, may not necessarily come from different countries, but there are also many differences between different places in China" (Yinqi, postgraduate). Having experienced cultural diversity abroad, many of them looked at cultural diversity from a relatively different perspective. They viewed the internal elements within China as the main cause of cultural diversity, rather than referring it to different cultures or things brought by the cross-border mobility of people. Many of them held views similar to those expressed in the following statement:

> The US is a multicultural and inclusive country, which is different from our country. Ours is not that multicultural, but there are differences between provinces and cities (Manlu, postgraduate).

Further to this, Siya viewed China as a culturally diverse country which is composed of "different ethnic minorities accompanied by different customs … and dialects". According to her interpretation, cultural diversity can also exist in the family

backgrounds of children who may "bring different stories from home to the classroom".

When faced with classroom realities in schools within their own national contexts, student teachers from both research sites explored some options for responding to them. Drawing upon what they had learned from study abroad experiences, they all demonstrated some attitudes and skills that they could adopt when teaching future students from diverse cultural or family backgrounds. When talking about their future interactions with immigrant children who might speak limited English, many of the Scottish student teachers thought that they would view them as a whole, rather than judging them too quickly at the beginning. For example, Kala recognised that she became "a more open minded person" after her learning experience in the Netherlands. She said that she would "be annoyed at myself for essentially … in my mind, calling [a different] behaviour out, because that's just the way they [people from other cultural backgrounds] are [and] that's part of their culture". Similarly, Gina, who studied in China, expressed her attitude towards potentially different behaviours in her future immigrant students in the following statement:

> It's made me realise that … with the kids and with grownups as well, you can't judge a book – the old saying – "you can't judge a book by its cover". … You see someone [and] their characteristics – the behaviour isn't what you class as the norm. … It doesn't give you the right to judge them, because you don't know why they're doing that, or where they've learned to do that. It's like, you can see their face, and you can see their behaviour, but you don't know the story of how they got to that (Gina).

Gina's non-judgemental attitude towards immigrant children, and her understanding of the complex stories behind their growing experiences, is characteristic of effective teachers who "understand the sum of [immigrant children's] experiences before they came to" (Apple, 2011, p. 223) Scotland. Richard, having experienced huge cultural differences and come up against language barriers

while in China, also showed a good understanding of the complexity of a whole child. He became more aware of the difficulties immigrant children might experience when learning, and developed an awareness of how he could help them become involved in the classroom learning community:

> For example, if children come from China to Scotland, they may not be able to learn right away, because they need to feel safe in the classroom and feel as part of the classroom. They may be not good at English. They may shy away from being involved in the discussion, or some of the knowledge the teacher is sharing might not go out into their head, because they may not understand it (Richard).

Richard's statement indicates that he understands that immigrant children might be in a more difficult situation than Scottish born children. This situation can be described as double burden or "double jeopardy", as a result of which children from culturally diverse backgrounds "hav[e] to master the academic tasks while functioning under cultural [or linguistic] conditions unnatural (and often unfamiliar to them)" (Gay, 2002, p.114). To help immigrant children alleviate the second burden, Richard expressed in this response, and in some others, that he would like to make them "feel less scared", "feel safe", and "feel as part of the classroom". His attitude towards immigrant children resonates with Gay's (2002, 2010) suggestion about some of the features that a culturally responsive teacher needs, which include showing care to immigrant children, and establishing a supportive classroom climate within which they can learn.

Some of the Scottish student teachers' responsiveness to the needs of immigrant children has been partly shown in Section 6.3. Based on the enormous cultural disruptions as cultural outsiders in their host countries, they can understand better how difficult and stressful it can be to learn about, and live in, a foreign country. As a result of their study abroad experiences, they acknowledged the importance of becoming responsive and supportive teachers, as reflected in the following response:

> I would never make a child in my class feel panic or scared, but obviously sometimes it's inevitable because of different cultural norm things. I think just making yourself available and making yourself, I suppose, responsive to the situations, then reacting to the way it happened. … Try to understand why they feel that way, what makes them do [things] that way, [and] ensure that it doesn't happen again or maybe talk them through (Callie).

Many of the Scottish student teachers have begun to understand the complexity of a child as a whole, and to actively explore their roles as teachers to teach to cultural diversity. They considered specific ways in which they could try to not only eliminate the stress that immigrant children might suffer, but also to get them involved in classroom activities. For example, Ella stated that she would ensure children's involvement by valuing the cultural capital they could bring to the classroom:

> I think it's important to … make them proud of their cultures in the classroom. … So, it's like something they are proud of, and the whole class can learn how to say that too. … So, I think doing things … to mak[e] them feel respected, and show that they are welcome, and show that English is not the only language that has to be spoken [at] all times in the classroom, or even if they want to, and feel comfortable enough, they could tell the rest of the class about something to do with their culture, or something to do with their religion (Ella).

Ella's statement highlights the importance of not only creating a caring learning community for immigrant students, but of also mediating imbalanced power relationships brought about by ethnicity and culture through cultural and linguistic sharing in the classroom. These are the traits of culturally responsive teachers emphasised by Gay (2010).

However, many of the Chinese student teachers did not have very specific ideas

about how to respond to the needs of their future students who might be from different cultural or family backgrounds. They made some general claims about "helping children in a better way by trying to know their family backgrounds and how their parents educate them [at home]" (Meng, postgraduate). Only two of them mentioned more specifically how they would look at children from different family backgrounds, and how they would go about interacting with them in the classroom. Similar to some Scottish student teacher participants' non-judgmental views towards children from diverse backgrounds, these two Chinese student teachers also claimed that they "would not see any single student through coloured lenses" (Siya, undergraduate). In particular, Manlu said that she learned to be non-judgmental towards her future students by referring to a film she was shown, and a presentation she did about this during her learning experience in the US:

> I learned to "check your ego at the door" from the film – *The Class* [a film about how a French teacher works within a very tough multi-ethnic school in France]. … When you open the door [of your classroom], you shouldn't bring your biases and stereotypes with you, [and instead] you should be tolerant of every student. … You have to get to know them by carefully observing their behaviours, languages and performances (Manlu, postgraduate).

Similarly, Siya also said that she would pay more attention to students' behaviours, and try to respond helpfully during classroom events:

> Students may be from different family backgrounds. They may be from one-parent families. If some lessons are very family-focused, I'll pay more attention to that student who is from a one-parent family and look at his or her emotional responses. … Having been to different countries, experienced so much, and learned so much, I think that I'll help different students in a more responsive way (Siya, undergraduate).

These responses indicate that the two Chinese student teachers showed some

characteristics of a culturally responsive teacher, as they recognised that they would be more attentive and caring towards future students who might be from different family backgrounds. However, their perceptions concentrate more on observing students' behaviours, and eliminating barriers or problems that their students may have, than on getting them involved in classroom activities, whereas many of the Scottish student teachers focus on both aspects. The Scottish student teachers' attitudes towards cultural diversity in classrooms suggest that they are more able to acknowledge the funds of knowledge their future students bring, and more willing to use these as valuable resources when facilitating their learning, which have been identified as the main focuses of culturally responsive teaching (Gay, 2010).

6.5 Summary

The student teacher participants' learning experiences in study abroad programmes are closely related to the academics' understandings of internationalisation at the two universities. Many of the Chinese student teachers from Nanhai University mainly saw study abroad experiences as opportunities to increase their knowledge about educational ideas and practices in their host countries. Only a small number of them talked about affective aspects of learning, such as learning as "happy foreigners", or as disoriented foreigners. However, they demonstrated less skill in effectively engaging with their emotions. Although many of them had experienced positive changes, such as the development of confidence in cross-cultural communication, as well as more interest in, and stronger bonds with others in a connected world, there remained a disconnect between these personal changes and their professional development. In general, they tended to idealise educational ideas and practices in their host countries, and their learning remained at the level of content reflection.

At Southside University, the Scottish student teachers generally experienced more social and cultural aspects of learning than their Chinese peers. The three Scottish

student teachers who had studied abroad through university programmes experienced more disruptive experiences as cultural outsiders in their host countries than the other three student teachers who had studied abroad but not through university programmes. Further to this, the former group of Scottish student teachers demonstrated a greater ability to critically reflect upon what they had seen, how they had felt, and why things had worked differently in their host countries. The former group showed more skills in transforming their problematic frames of reference, and ultimately, displayed greater readiness to become globally competent teachers. This readiness was mirrored in their greater awareness in cross-cultural communication, stronger interest in, and bond with others, and greater knowledge and skills to either teach immigrant children in a culturally responsive way, or to educate all children to become globally minded.

To conclude, different study abroad programmes have generated different types of impact on student teachers across different universities, and even within the same university. This may prompt us to ask: what can internationalisation at home offer to student teachers? This question will be answered in the next chapter.

Chapter 7 Learning to Become Globally Competent Teachers: Chinese and Scottish Student Teachers Reflect on the Impact of Internationalisation at Home

7.1 Introduction

This chapter starts with student teachers' learning about education in other countries through their participation in internationalisation at home. The next three sections present learning experiences that hold promise for student teachers' transformative learning, and for the development of their empathy for culturally and linguistically diverse children. It then reveals the extent to which approaches to internationalisation at home shape student teachers' readiness to become globally competent teachers. The chapter ends with a summary.

7.2 Learning about education in other countries

Similar to the student teachers who participated in study abroad programmes, many student teachers who participated in internationalisation at home also acknowledged that they became more knowledgeable about education or education systems in the countries they had studied. However, the responses of the student teachers demonstrate different focuses across the two different national contexts and sometimes even within the same institutional context, but across different degree courses.

7.2.1 Learning about educational ideas and practices in other countries

The Chinese student teacher participants noted that some modules they had taken at Nanhai University included global dimensions. They thought that modules focusing on educational comparisons between China and other countries could develop their understanding of different educational ideas and practices in different

countries. For example, most of the undergraduate student teachers, who had taken the module Comparative Educational Studies, reported that "the exploration of educational issues in other countries in the module is quite helpful for our subject learning, and we have developed broader horizons by getting to know different curricula and educational ideas in different countries" (Dilan, undergraduate), and "it has equipped me with broader views … and enabled me to look at education beyond the confines of China, to learn the merits of others and then make our education competitive" (Peng, undergraduate).

Meanwhile, many of the Chinese student teacher participants described the learning outcomes of the module in general terms, such as "broadening my views/horizons" and "learning from the strengths of education or education systems in other countries, including the UK, the US, Germany, Russia, Japan and some others". These general claims are akin to what their peers have emphasised in Section 6.2.1. The claims align with the Chinese academics' understanding of internationalisation as a means of developing "a broader outlook" in student teachers. However, neither the student teachers, nor academics, made further elaborations about what these general claims entail, or what they mean to student teachers in regard to personal and professional development. These claims appear to be empty rhetoric.

What distinguishes those Chinese student teachers who took Comparative Educational Studies or other modules on campus from those Chinese student teachers who had study abroad experiences is that the former have a vaguer idea of how education or education systems function in other countries. When prompted further in interviews, Lishi, an undergraduate, made content reflection on the more relaxing classroom atmosphere of some other countries, and on the more structured classrooms in China discussed in Comparative Educational Studies:

> The lecturer told us that, most of the time, classrooms in the UK and the US … are unlike our large classes where kids are seated in rows, facing

> the teacher; instead, their kids are [seated in a] more relaxed way – they sit in a circle, with the teacher sitting in the middle to discuss things with them. … At the back of their classrooms, they have sofas and shelves where they can read books. … [I] think their learning atmosphere is more relaxing, free and open (Lishi, undergraduate).

Another student teacher, who had enrolled on a module called History of Preschool Education, also described learning about educational theories and practices from Western countries through content reflection:

> I learned some educational theories and thoughts of Montessori and Pestalozzi from the module. … They [preschool teachers in some Western countries] arrange around fifty minutes as free time for children to read [whatever] books they pick from the classroom library. They will ask the teacher questions about things they don't understand from their reading. But, we are different. We have the same textbooks for children, and the teacher would teach the same thing to them … and children have to practice in the traditional way (Yanyan, undergraduate).

These responses indicate that learning experiences in on-campus modules that had global dimensions could increase Chinese student teacher participants' knowledge about education in different countries. An extension of existing frames of reference is the main concern of informational learning (Kegan, 2009), which can also be seen in the Chinese student teachers' accounts of educational ideas and practices they learned during their immersion in their host countries, as presented in Section 6.2.1 in the previous chapter. However, these Chinese student teacher participants experienced more passive and receptive learning through on-campus modules than their peers who had direct contact with educational ideas and practices within their host countries. These different educational ideas and practices were often passed on to them by Chinese lecturers in the modules, and the student teachers tended to present these differences through superficial comparisons, without critical appraisals.

The Chinese student teachers provided relatively more detailed accounts of what they had learned from some lectures or seminars given by international visiting scholars or teachers. By directly interacting with international visiting scholars or with teachers in lectures or seminars, many of them thought that they had more understanding of some specific aspects of education in foreign countries. For example, an undergraduate student teacher said:

> As for the seminar – the foreign visitor was a [British] primary teacher. She made slides to introduce a school day [in their country] to us. We have now got an idea of a school day in a foreign [British] primary school (Peng, undergraduate).

Some of the Chinese student teacher participants also stressed that direct interaction with school teachers from abroad left a deep impression on them. They acknowledged that these interactions opened their minds, and encouraged them to view things differently, which can be seen in the following example:

> In many seminars – we had middle school or primary school headmasters from America, or sometimes from Africa, to present about education in their countries. … In the last seminar, I learned that they [African people] also pay a lot of attention to education. It is different from my previous knowledge about them. … They are not as backward as I thought. They actually have their own strengths. … I learned that educational ideas in those [Western] advanced countries aren't necessarily good, and that those in the least developed countries aren't necessarily bad (Ling, postgraduate).

It is apparent from this statement that the student teacher's pre-assumptions about education in developed countries and less developed countries are problematised as a result of her direct contact with teachers from different parts of the world, and with the educational ideas and practices which they presented. Her statement

indicates that direct interaction with teachers from other countries, and their educational ideas and practices, enabled the student teacher to become more dialectic in thinking, rather than simply categorising things according to a stereotypically rigid dichotomy composed of the advanced education of Western countries and the backward education of Africa. However, despite this challenge and change in thinking, she may "continue to use a deficit frame of reference" if she is not helped to critically examine her deficit views (Villegas & Lucas, 2002, p. 44). This student teacher's view of what she has learned from the experience is indicative of content reflection (describing her learning experience and the problem in her old premises), and process reflection (reacting to the problem with a relatively more positive attitude).

As shown in the above responses, the Chinese student teacher participants thought that learning experiences in modules or seminars (or lectures) which had global dimensions could result in a broader view of, or increased knowledge about, education in other countries. However, their learning remained largely at the level of content reflection, or sometimes process reflection, which was not further supported to allow for critical reflection. According to Mezirow (2012), critical reflection is the key stage which can transform problematic frames of reference in adult learners. Some of the Chinese student teachers stressed that their learning from the merits of education in other countries could enable them to make Chinese education more "competitive", which resonates with the emphasis placed by the Chinese academic participants in Section 5.3.1, on the quality assurance of education within the academic rationale for the internationalisation of teacher education.

7.2.2 Learning about educational ideas and practices in other countries and learning pedagogical skills for multicultural education

The group of seven Scottish student teachers who participated in

internationalisation at home includes two subgroups: four undergraduate student teachers, and three PGDE students who are more mature. Compared with the Chinese student teacher participants, the Scottish student teacher participants, particularly the PGDE student teachers, had more varied learning experiences in modules and seminars which have global dimensions. These dimensions cover wider topics, ranging from different education systems, theories and thoughts, to diversity, inclusiveness and sustainability. According to the views of the Scottish student teachers, these learning experiences had different kinds of impact on them.

Similar to some modules provided at Nanhai University for student teachers at undergraduate level, Southside University offers some modules which touch upon education in other countries for undergraduate student teachers. For example, most of the undergraduate student teachers took the module History and Philosophy of Education, which covers topics such as Confucius philosophy, and its impact on education in China. Within this module, some visiting scholars from China are invited to give talks about education in China. Similar to many Chinese student teacher participants, when questioned about what had deeply impacted on them by taking the module, the Scottish student teacher participants mainly listed contrasting images of education between their own country and the countries they had studied. They learned that "the difference was rote learning [in China] and we are trying to get the students to be independent" (Ronald, undergraduate); and "the whole idea of Confucius education was rote learning. … the large classes [are] still a thing in China" (Emma, undergraduate). Apart from content reflection, they seemed to be unable to make better sense of the knowledge they had learned.

Conversely, for PGDE students, there is a more diverse range of optional modules or lectures which have intercultural or global dimensions. In particular, themes of the modules or lectures for PGDE students are more relevant to children and children's education. These themes include diversity, human rights and social justice, and sustainability. Most of the Scottish student teachers think that these modules are

helpful to them, and to their future practices of teaching. Charles, a PGDE student, reported that the experience of a lecture on learning for sustainability enabled him to look at issues concerning education for global citizenship and to learn about how teacher education is prepared for it in different countries:

> …the lecture was definitely – kind of, aimed at getting children or learners to think about, you know, the environment, and trying to encourage them to be responsible citizens, … to try and preserve the environment, preserve the world. … I was really interested in seeing the – what was happening, sort of, in Australia and Finland, in particular, and America, and trying to get not – well, not just in sort of education within schools, but in particular, teacher education. So, training. … How do they teach or, or train their prospective teachers about global citizenship? … It kind of sparked my curiosity to find out a little bit more about it (Charles, PGDE).

According to Charles, another module called Human Rights and Social Justice enabled him to have a good understanding of issues concerning the rights and voices of all children:

> I think particularly young children, they need to know that their voice is valid, and their thoughts are valid as well…everyone's voice is important …This [his future classroom] is an open, safe space and if they feel, hopefully, if they feel safe, … they're maybe more inclined to kind of engage with you and with others in the classroom (Charles, PGDE).

Charles' responses indicate that these learning experiences equipped him with the knowledge or skills to teach in multicultural classrooms. The acquisition of some pedagogical skills for multicultural education was also prominent in another PGDE student's (i.e. Nila) perceptions about the impact of her learning experiences in on-campus modules. Nila, as the only ethnic minority participant (she had Indian roots, but was born and raised in the UK, and was married to a Canadian) among the three

Scottish PGDE students, said that she learned a lot of useful pedagogical skills from the module Religious and Moral Education (RME):

> [In RME,] when they [the lecturers] taught us about Diwali, [they] gave us a series of ideas of how to teach that. So, [they] talked about the different lessons you will do to teach that. … when you are covering Diwali, you divide the lessons about how you teach the concept of Diwali and make it relevant to children here or children nowadays [Nila, PGDE].

Taking skills from the module forward, Nila thought that she could teach RME to Children by translating different religious and cultural beliefs to her future students:

> For example, when you are teaching RME, you talk about Diwali which is a Hindu festival to a child from a Christian background, or a child from, you know, any background …the child might think "I'm not a Hindu, so why am I learning about this and why does it matter to me". So I'm making – by talking about good versus evil, by kind of making up the idea of being a super hero and doing good in their sense. That then makes it relevant for all children, because all children understand that concept. ... You know, it's not just about Hindu tradition. It's about what is important to all people. That's kind of what relevance is (Nila, PGDE).

Nila's response shows that she was interested in, and committed to, teaching a different culture to all children in a personally meaningful way. This might be because "I have that culture anyway". Her view indicates that her lived experience as Indian can be a benefit when teaching Diwali. Her experience as a member of an ethnic minority group in the UK, and the learning experience of RME, enabled her to recognise that it became especially important "to acknowledge all of the different festivals and special occasions that people have" when "our society becomes more and more diverse". Nila's views suggest that her lived experiences as an ethnic minority teacher candidate can add to her cultural expertise which includes personal knowledge about minority cultures and languages, and about promoting more

positive attitudes towards the cultural diversity that people's lived experiences bring (Villegas & Lucas, 2002).

It is evident that modules that have global dimensions could increase the repertoire of skills in these two PGDE student teachers. Student teachers' ethnic minority background could also hold promise for resourceful teaching about different cultures and religions. However, both the increase of the repertoire of pedagogical skills in the two PGDE students, and the increase of content knowledge about educational ideas and practices in other countries among most of the Scottish undergraduate student teachers, falls into informational learning which brings new knowledge or skills into existing ways of knowing. Yet, these modules provided these Scottish student teachers with little opportunity to re-examine, or to challenge themselves in terms of beliefs and assumptions about different cultures and about children from different cultural backgrounds.

7.3 "Readjusting thoughts on thinking" through critical reflection on taken-for-granted assumptions

My analysis of the data revealed that some PGDE participants had more transformative learning experiences in an optional module, Professional Specialisation (PS), which looked specifically at supporting bilingual learners. Among the three PGDE participants, Nila and Tina had taken this module which encouraged them to be more critical about their own views towards others and themselves. As Nila said, "we understood the importance of understanding children, understanding their backgrounds, challenging our own views, you know, assumptions [in this module]". The development of critical views through learning the module is particularly evident in Tina's responses. She pointed out that the professor who was running the module, and the learning tasks she put in place, guided her to not only understand children better, but also to critically reflect on her own views and identity as a future teacher:

> Before I started the Professional Specialisation course, I didn't really know what I was going to get out of it. … [From the module, I learned] about the stereotypical view of a British person or a Scottish person – and how we view other cultures – but we don't view that as ourselves. And I thought that was a big part, looking at me as myself before I go [on] to be a teacher (Tina, PGDE).

The learning experience in the PS module is thought to be more about changing their way of thinking or "readjust[ing] our thoughts on thinking" (Tina, PGDE) than about what things are, or who bilingual learners are. The readjustment of thoughts on thinking, in Mezirow's (2012) words, is the transformation in habit of mind, which is very epochal in a transformative experience, because it results in "a sudden, dramatic, reorienting insight" (p.86). This reorienting or transformative insight is prominent in Tina's responses about the impact of this module on her, in regard to her development as a globally competent teacher.

As she noted, the re-examination of her views and identity as a future teacher was a very important part of the learning experience. In her dialogue with the professor in the classes of the module, Tina realised that she should not "take [things] on face value", particularly when her taken-for-granted assumptions about children in her placement classroom were challenged. For example, when discussing diversity in schools through dialogic interaction between the professor and student teachers in the PS module, Tina said that student teachers would mention the foreign nationalities of children in their placement classes. However, they were given learning support by the professor to know things beyond the nationalities. When she said she had a Chinese boy in her class,

> She [the professor] asked me whereabouts in China that he was from, and I didn't know any of that, I just knew that he was Chinese. But in thinking about that, and reflecting on that, when I went back into class, I

> actually got to know this boy more. … He was born in China, he grew up in South Africa, started his education in South Africa, and then moved to England, and had only recently been in Scotland for two years. So, he's only just recently moved to Scotland, but my naivety, my misunderstanding of that child – I just assumed that he had grown up in – he'd been born in China, or his background was Chinese, and I wasn't aware [of] anything else about him. … So, that definitely was a big learning point for me (Tina, PGDE).

As is shown in Tina's response, she was guided to critically reflect on issues or topics about bilingual learners discussed in the module, which transformed her frame of reference. She tried to get rid of her "naivety" or old premises by saying that "quite naively, I thought that I was able to go into a classroom and teach without understanding and knowing about every other country's background".

The responses of these two Scottish student teachers suggest that they gained impactful learning experiences through the PS module. Their views about bilingual learners and about their own identity as future teachers were challenged through their interaction with the professor who was running the module. Both of them thought that they had developed a better understanding of children, and of themselves as teachers. The impact is particularly evident in Tina's responses. As seen in the reflective points she made, she has recognised her own naïve or problematic views towards children from different national backgrounds, and has attempted to look at children or issues brought by them beyond their "face value".

Different from other modules at Southside University and those at Nanhai University, the PS module provided more opportunities for Scottish PGDE students to actively interact with the lecturer, and to critically reflect on the issues under discussion. The dialogic relationship and guided reflection in this module prompted student teachers to re-examine their old premises about issues concerning immigrant children and their role as future teachers, to transform their problematic frames of

reference, and to reconstruct a new understanding of such issues. The result indicates that transformative learning could not only happen to the Scottish student teachers who studied abroad through university programmes, but also to the PGDE student teachers who took part in this on-campus module.

7.4 Developing empathy for others as a result of their experiences as foreign language learners

In the previous chapter, some Scottish student teachers, who struggled in foreign countries with language barriers and/or cultural differences, thought that they became more empathetic to their future students who might have difficulties in speaking English or in understanding Scottish culture within their future classrooms. Empathy could also be developed in some Scottish student teacher participants who experienced anxiety as foreign language learners when they were participating in some approaches to internationalisation at home.

In the PS module, for example, Tina, a Scottish PGDE student, mentioned that they were asked by the professor and her teaching assistant (who is Chinese) to learn to say some words or phrases in different foreign languages. When trying to say some foreign words, she felt that "it's just very scary… And quite, it makes you quite nervous as well. Quite anxious". However, she noted that the anxiety she had as a foreign language learner enabled her to understand that children who speak English as an additional language may also suffer from anxiety when learning new things in a different language. She used her own experience as a catalyst for supporting children:

> It's the fear of making a mistake in front of everyone, but if I'm able to show the children that I'm still learning, and I'm learning a language, and I will, I will make a mistake when I'm learning a new language, that's, that's obvious, and letting the children know that it's okay to make a

mistake, even adults make mistakes (Tina, PGDE).

Tina's response indicates that she was scared to commit a mistake in front of the lecturer and her peers, which is similar to what her future students might experience. She was able to move beyond her own experience and toward her future classroom teaching by trying to develop a positive attitude towards mistakes made by students.

Anxiety could also arise as a result of participation in some of the language modules which some Scottish student teacher participants undertook. Most of the Scottish student teachers at the undergraduate level reported that Southside University provided them with a series of options to learn some foreign languages, such as French and Spanish. Aside from learning the vocabulary and grammar of these foreign languages, they thought that the language modules could also develop their empathy for students who come from different cultural backgrounds, or who have language difficulties caused by anxiety or frustrations such as those which they themselves experienced in foreign language modules.

First-hand experience of difficulties in learning a foreign language enabled some of the Scottish student teachers to look at the situation from the perspective of English language learners and to better understand what it was like to learn a foreign language. In French classes, for example, Kathy found that "there wasn't really much content on, maybe, France or, you know, the context of the language and … it was very much a learning to speak a language". The anxiety-triggering experience in the French classes "opened my eyes up to help children [whose English was non-existent or very little] learn English and [understand] the difficulties that, like, we face". She explained in great detail how hard the situation was for her when she was experiencing similar feelings as a foreign language learner in the French class, and how empathetic she became to her future students:

I was very nervous and not confident. … I'd start from my own

> experience, and, um, maybe put myself back to when I started that class for the first time, thinking, you know – the tutor was saying, you know, “This is what you should know already” and I [was] sitting there thinking: “Well, I don’t know this already”. I would start by putting myself in the position of not having, you know, for example, English not being my first language, and how, you know, the difficulties I had learning another language, but also maybe the things that helped (Kathy, undergraduate).

Kathy’s response indicates that there might be misdiagnoses or misrepresentations of students as a result of the taken-for-granted views of teachers. This also suggests that these misdiagnoses can be avoided if the teacher reflects upon their own disorienting experiences, and sees things from the perspectives of others in similar situations.

Communication barriers between the Scottish student teachers and their tutors in foreign language classes where the tutors were native speakers of foreign languages could also result in increased empathy. In Emma’s case, she underwent frustrations during the Spanish module, when communicating with the Spanish tutor who had very limited English:

> I asked him [the tutor], how do you say “And” in Spanish? … He just didn’t understand. And for me, it was like I hadn’t really my experiences with other languages before this. I just couldn’t understand why he couldn’t understand my question and I didn’t know how to communicate with him. … so, it was frustrating for us both (Emma, undergraduate).

Having had a difficult experience as a foreign language learner, Emma realised that she was more able to relate this frustrating feeling to her interactions with children who spoke limited English in her placement class. She developed a better understanding of the difficult moments her students had, which she would otherwise not have been able to do:

> I felt frustrated, so I can understand how frustrating it can be for them when they don't understand. Like, Ani [a Chinese student in her placement class] used to get so upset, but it was difficult for me to understand as well, like why he was struggling so much sometimes. Then I always thought back to – if I didn't understand something when learning a language, then I felt the same. ... It's much easier for me to, like – be able to understand (Emma, undergraduate).

For some other Scottish student teacher participants who did not participate in foreign language modules, their direct interaction with immigrant children, and the role shift between teachers and language learners in placement classrooms, could also allow for the development of empathy. As Nicole said, "I gained more knowledge and empathy ... from my placement in a multicultural classroom… in a [community] Homework Club". In particular, she developed empathy through an experience where she used her limited French to interact with a Nigerian girl in the classroom, and consequently learned more French from her. In a similar case, Ronald, another Scottish student teacher, also experienced being a foreign language learner during his placement at a school which features cultural diversity. After he attempted to speak Polish to two Polish students in his class, he said he could better understand the embarrassing feelings they might experience when trying to speak English, and could more effectively put support in place for them:

> … they laughed along when I would say things [in Polish] wrong, but I would say to them that I understand how you feel when you learn English. It really helped develop a good bond between me and the other two students, because we were learning something together, and they can see that I was taking the time – they weren't getting frustrated with me, and I wasn't getting frustrated with them, because they were trying to learn (Ronald, undergraduate).

As presented above, either the fear of making mistakes in some learning tasks specially designed for a module (such as the PS module), the anxiety and

frustrations arising from communication barriers in foreign language modules, or the embarrassing situations experienced during placement experiences, made it quite possible for the Scottish student teacher participants to experience disruptive moments in their own country as foreign language learners. Their responses confirm that these disruptive moments are essential to the development or enhancement of future teachers' empathy for students who may speak little or no English. The responses of the Scottish student teacher participants also suggest that, the more open and reflective views they have developed from their first-hand experience as foreign language learners, can give rise to a richer imagination of alternative situations or contexts which can aid in the understanding of students who may have little or no English.

Findings concerning empathy in this chapter converge with those in the previous chapter: the Scottish student teacher participants' empathy for others could be developed when they were situated in a different context in which they felt frustrated or unsettled. However, what is different is that approaches to internationalisation at home did not provide student teachers with opportunities to experience the whole sense of being a cultural outsider. As some of the Scottish student teachers said, the language modules placed little emphasis on the culture, or country, of the target language they were learning, and "it was very much learning to speak a language" (Kathy, undergraduate). Similarly, they had little to say about the different cultures they could learn from their immigrant students within placement classrooms in order to inform their future teaching practices. Instead, they only paid attention to their experiences as foreign language learners, and how this role fostered their empathy for others who might have language difficulties. For instance, they only talked about their better understanding of future immigrant students in regard to how they might feel as foreign language learners.

Interestingly, there is little indication in the data that the Chinese student teacher participants have developed empathy for others through their participation in

internationalisation at home. However, this result is consistent with what has been found in the Chinese student teacher participants who studied abroad. As mentioned earlier in this chapter, many of the Chinese student teachers gained increased content knowledge about educational ideas and practices in other countries from modules or lectures that include global dimensions. There was no evidence to suggest that they had learning tasks or assignments, which might place them in a disruptive position in these learning experiences and allow for the development of empathy for others. For example, the Comparative Educational Studies module was conducted in Chinese by a Chinese lecturer, whose teaching was dominated by a focus on education or education systems in different countries.

Unlike the Scottish student teacher participants, the Chinese student teacher participants had few opportunities to experience disruptive moments as foreign language learners in modules that had global dimensions. Although the presentations given by international visiting scholars or school teachers were in English, the Chinese student teachers had little to say about their difficulty in understanding these presentations. This might be because they had learned English for years:

> English language learning starts from primary and secondary school up to university level, so we kept learning English until the third year [of our four-year degree course] (Lishi, undergraduate).

Having many years of experience in learning English could partly explain why the Chinese student teacher participants experienced few disruptions, and developed little empathy for others, through their direct interaction with international visiting scholars and teachers during the lectures or seminars.

Even when the Chinese student teacher participants were learning foreign language (predominantly English) modules, they rarely felt like disoriented or frustrated foreign language learners. All the Chinese student teachers at Nanhai University, like

those at many other universities in China, have English language modules. The most commonly mentioned language modules by my participants were College English (which was conducted by Chinese lecturers), and Oral English (which was conducted by native English speakers). In College English, many of the Chinese student teachers reported that they had little personal engagement with the learning content because "the lecturer dominated the talk and it had nothing to do with the students" (Lishi, undergraduate), "there were 61 students in the class [and] the lecturer mainly focused on grammar and vocabulary" (Peng, undergraduate), and "there were more opportunities for practising listening, reading and writing and few opportunities for speaking" (Ling, postgraduate). In Oral English, the Chinese student teachers mentioned that they had much smaller classes, and many more opportunities to communicate with their lecturers who were native English speakers. However, the Chinese student teachers found that "the module was quite relaxing, but not very helpful, because we only used the words we knew" (Ling, postgraduate). These experiences in English modules demonstrate that the small amount of personal engagement in learning content, combined with unchallenging learning experiences, are other reasons for the limited opportunities for the Chinese student teachers to either experience frustrating moments as English learners, or to develop empathy for others.

Another key finding is that the Chinese student teacher participants appear to pay more attention to learning the foreign language itself, rather than relating language learning experiences to their future profession. There is one exception: Dilan, the only Chinese student teacher who was placed in an international primary school, experienced some anxiety as an English learner, and saw the importance of English in her future teaching. Unlike many of the Scottish student teachers' experiences with ethnic minority students in placement schools, Dilan felt marginalised in the placement school because of her poor English:

> At the beginning, it was quite embarrassing. I wasn't very confident in my language [English]. For example, there was a carnival event in the

> school. We had more interactions with students [who are from different countries or regions and speak English], but I had language barriers at that time and I couldn't fully understand what my students meant and … they couldn't understand what I meant either (Dilan, undergraduate).

Based on her difficult experience as an English language learner, Dilan realised that "my oral English and communication skills are still very poor … and I have to improve them". Apart from this comment, she made no further effort to relate her "embarrassing" feelings to her understanding of the feelings or concerns of her future students who might come to an international class with little English, or who might come to a mainstream class as a member of an ethnic minority with limited Chinese.

Findings in this section align with those in the previous chapter. Disruptive experiences as cultural outsiders or foreign language learners could be catalysts for the development of empathy for others in Scottish student teacher participants. On the other hand, the Chinese student teacher participants did not have many disruptive moments in their learning experiences abroad, or at home, and made no mention of their empathy for future students who might experience difficulties in their classrooms. Two of them experienced some frustration or embarrassment a cultural outsider (Siya in some study abroad programmes) or an English learner (Dilan in the international school where she was placed), but they were less able to make sense of their feelings or to make connections with the multicultural features of their future classrooms.

7.5 Becoming globally competent teachers

The responses of student teachers from both research sites demonstrate varied degrees of readiness for becoming competent teachers for an increasingly global and multicultural context. Some of the student teachers recognised personal changes through their participation in internationalisation at home, and realised

that it could make a difference to their future teaching practices. Some of them did not see connections between learning experiences and future practices of teaching, and thought they were not prepared for classroom realities in their local contexts. Therefore, this section will present more findings about the changes different student teachers experienced in themselves, and in their relationship to their profession within the increasingly global and multicultural context.

7.5.1 Becoming more self-aware or remaining where they are based on the experience of foreign language learners

My findings show that the Scottish student teachers who participated in internationalisation at home acknowledged that they developed some knowledge, dispositions and skills to constructively engage in a global world due to their involvement in learning experiences that had global dimensions. Experience with children from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds enabled student teachers to "have more awareness of global issues" (Nicole, undergraduate). Meanwhile, they developed a stronger bond with others through their learning experiences in modules that had global dimensions – "I take an interest, more in things, like what's happening in other countries since the PS course" (Tina, PGDE); the learning experience in the French module made "you feel closer" with France and "makes you think that, … I can put myself in the position of France, as I've studied it, and I've learned about it, and the usual sort of happenings" (Kathy, undergraduate). They also developed skills for cross-cultural communication, and a willingness to participate in the global world, as one student teacher expressed that "having not been in this [placement] school with – that's so multicultural, having not learned Spanish, I don't think I would have been as open to go into – like, the Jewish camp I went to, and be surrounded by people that speak Hebrew" (Emma, undergraduate).

In particular, the Scottish student teachers who had experienced anxiety or

frustration as foreign language learners in on-campus modules or in placement schools expressed more detailed accounts of their development of self-awareness. Having interacted with a Nigerian girl, and many other children from other cultural and linguistic backgrounds in her placement classroom in a community Homework Club, Nicole became more aware of her own speech when interacting with immigrant children:

> I tried to - always be aware of slowing down my speech, speaking simple instructions and simple terms, no colloquial phrases. You know, the Scottish and the Irish love to put in words that don't make much sense (Nicole, undergraduate).

The change could also be seen in her interaction with me (a Chinese researcher) during the interview. She was very aware of her own wording and speed, and seldom using slang terms or idioms which might have hindered my understanding. In her opinion, the placement experience enabled her "to have more confidence to speak to people from different cultures". She mainly attributed her development in cross-cultural communication to her direct interaction with children from different cultural and linguistic backgrounds in the Homework Club, "because … you were put in the spotlight to think on your feet and to cope with challenges and things that might arise in the classroom".

Similarly, some of the Scottish student teachers gained greater awareness of themselves due to specifically designed tasks within modules. For example, Tina experienced anxiety as a foreign language learner in some tasks within the PS module. These tasks enabled her to "look at me as myself before I go to be a teacher" for children who spoke little English in her placement classroom:

> I'm not the best communicator. I'm not. [Laughs]. I think I'm very xxx [the adjective form of the Scottish city where she lives]. … I talk very fast as well. I try to use facial expressions and hand gestures to show, erm,

> what I mean (Tina, PGDE).

Her learning experience in the module prompted Tina to re-examine her own identity as a Scottish person, and to become more aware of how it shaped her way of speaking, and how she might address the needs of immigrant children. These skills could also be developed from foreign language modules. It was prominent in Emma's learning experience where she had communication barriers with her Spanish tutor. The different ways they used both visual and audio to make themselves understood in Spanish classes have influenced Emma's way of teaching:

> Like most times, when you were teaching animals, you would explain them with visually – with pictures, with slide show, words on the screen … there were different ways for people to understand. Whether it was their English, or whether they were just not very good at reading or not good at listening, we were always trying to have a visualised and a spoken explanation as well (Emma, undergraduate).

These responses indicate that the Scottish student teacher participants' experiences as foreign language learners in their own country helped develop their self-awareness in cross-cultural communication. The result extends the findings of the previous chapter by adding another important factor to the development of effective cross-cultural communicators. Both the experience of foreigners with language barriers in host countries (see Section 6.4.1), and the experience of language learners of certain foreign languages in the home country, provided Scottish student teachers with more effective skills for cross-cultural communication. In particular, disruptive moments such as the anxiety and frustration experienced by many of the Scottish student teachers during their learning experiences, either at home or abroad, allowed for a greater awareness of their identity as Scots and as future teachers, as well as a better mastery of different ways of communication with people or children, who are from different cultural and linguistic backgrounds.

However, the Scottish student teachers who participated in internationalisation at home tended to report more about learning outcomes, while their peers who studied abroad focused more on the process of personal changes. For example, the former would relate what they had gained from the learning experiences to their future interactions with immigrant children. The latter would give very detailed accounts of what communication problems they had had, and how they had coped with them during their experiences abroad. This could be explained by their total immersion in host countries far away from the immediate support of those familiar and close to them. They had no choice but to make themselves understood by gradually modifying their speech to suit people in their host countries. They therefore gave more explicit accounts of the conscious efforts they made during learning experiences, and what this meant for their future role as cross-cultural educators.

By contrast, the Chinese student teacher participants had little to say about their personal changes or development in cross-cultural communication through their participation in internationalisation at home. Unlike the Chinese student teachers who gained more confidence as English language learners or speakers from their experiences abroad, most of the Chinese student teachers thought that their experiences in English modules did little to develop their confidence as English language learners or speakers. They said that they had gained very little from these learning experiences, and suggested that “the university has to make some improvement in its provision of the English modules; … [otherwise,] we only regard them as our opportunities to claim credits” (Yanyan, undergraduate).

My findings show that experience as foreign language learners could develop many of the Scottish student teachers’ self-awareness as cross-cultural communicators or educators, and help them to support those who do not speak English as their first language. The Scottish student teacher participants were not concerned about whether they had mastered the foreign language(s), but instead focused on how

foreign language learning experiences developed their empathy for immigrant children. However, experience as foreign language learners did not develop Chinese student teachers' self-awareness in cross-cultural communication. Their focus on learning English itself resonates with the Chinese academic participants' understanding of learning English as a manifestation of internationalisation in teacher education.

7.5.2 Not being prepared to be globally competent teachers

Many of the Scottish student teachers who participated in internationalisation at home recognised that they had to become competent teachers for an increasingly multicultural and global context. However, the learning experiences they had on campus, or at placement schools (or community centres) in Scotland, had different kinds of impact on them, and led to different levels of readiness for being globally competent teachers. They acknowledged that it was important to develop global competence in their future students, and to prepare them for their future life, as reflected in the following example:

> … they [her future students] still need to build up an understanding of other cultures and other languages, because [when] they get out into the society, they – it's not always gonna be the same type of people they are meeting. …more and more people are working with companies abroad… they do things differently, whether you know what the differences are [or not] (Emma, undergraduate).

This response indicates that there is an urgent need for today's teachers to develop all children to "be open to other cultures and languages" (Emma, undergraduate). The need for learning others' cultures and languages is also acknowledged in some other claims, such as "[I'm] trying to show the children the importance of engaging and understanding different – different cultures, different languages, because, I mean, Scotland is increasingly becoming multicultural" (Kathy, undergraduate), and

"[I'll] mak[e] sure that children learn from a very young age that it's – it's important to know about other cultures" (Tina, PGDE).

Despite their acknowledgement of the importance of understanding other languages and cultures, many of the Scottish student teachers at the undergraduate level were still unsure about how to put their ideas into teaching practice. For example, they mentioned the 1+2 Language Policy[9] in Scotland, but they lacked a specific idea of what, or how, they would teach in response to this policy:

> Although I'm studying at the moment – I'm going to graduate this year, what's expected of me by the government and by schools, to become and to be able to teach? … Erm, so I just, through the news and things, I've heard about that – quite a few years ago now, it was the 1+2 [policy] that children should be able to, you know, for example, if English is their first language, they should leave school having learned two other languages. Erm, and that was a government initiative, and I don't know, I mean, it was a couple of years ago now, I don't know the success of that, or, you know, how it's progressing (Kathy, undergraduate).

Although a specific policy in Scotland was put in place in order to develop children's understanding of other cultures and languages, Kathy could not fully understand the kind of teacher she was expected to become by the government or by schools. Despite undertaking learning experiences that have global dimensions (e.g. History and Philosophy of Education, the French module, and placements in multicultural schools), Kathy's response shows no evidence of her readiness to respond to the policy effectively.

The lack of preparedness for teaching children to understand other cultures and languages is more prominent in Emma's account:

[9] The 1+2 language policy was issued by the Scottish Government in 2012. It aims to teach pupils two modern languages in addition to English, and to ensure that they can lead successful lives in a multilingual and multicultural context.

> I really like it [1+2 policy], and I really hope that it works for Scotland and [that] we can bring children up to have an understanding of other cultures and languages. But I'm not sure how realistic it is with the society we are living in. … hopefully within the next generation of teachers, they will understand that and still be instilling this into new pupils. I think people in my generation, some, this is [a] generalisation, but some people, are still not very open to other languages and cultures, just because of the way we've been brought up. … But, I wish, personally, [that] I had been brought up and immersed in another language, and [that] I could speak another language fluently (Emma, undergraduate).

According to Emma's view, it was still quite unrealistic for many current Scottish student teachers to fulfil the 1+2 policy, because of their encapsulated lives within their own language and culture. Though she had undertaken the module in French, she was still not ready to respond to the policy in teaching. Emma's response, along with some other Scottish undergraduate student teachers, reveals that some modules that have global dimensions at Southside University have not equipped them with the appropriate knowledge and skills needed to develop children's understanding of other cultures and languages, though they have, admittedly, demonstrated a sense of their responsibility in relation to the development of global competence in children for their future lives.

Similar to the Scottish student teachers who participated in study abroad programmes, those Scottish student teachers who participated in internationalisation at home also identified cultural diversity in Scotland's classrooms. They had placements in schools in which there were culturally and linguistically diverse children. Some of them worked with a couple of these children. Some others experienced even more multicultural classrooms, as shown in Emma's account: "the school that I worked in had about seventy percent of children with English as an additional language". However, they were aware of a significant gap

between cultural diversity in today's schools in Scotland, and the culturally homogenous environments in which they had been educated or raised. As one student teacher recalled, "I went to a primary school [which] was predominantly White Scottish, [but] it has a bigger population, like Polish and Portuguese, mainly in everywhere from just now" (Emma, undergraduate).

Further to this, some of the Scottish undergraduate student teachers showed no confidence in working with cultural diversity, because the university provided limited or insufficient preparation for it. In Kathy's placement classroom, she had to work with other teachers to develop the literacy skills of an Arabic boy. She had no idea how to cope with that:

> … it's really strange dealing with that when I've had – we've had no input from the university, but then, we have tutorials where we can go back and say, you know, "This is what we're dealing with", erm, and have pointers to bilingualism (Kathy, undergraduate).

Kathy's view demonstrates that some undergraduate student teachers at Southside University did not receive effective training for working with culturally and linguistically diverse children. Although her response suggests that there were tutorials for them to talk about their placement experiences, it implies that they would act more responsively during the placement if they had had some input in the coursework early on within the teacher education courses at the university.

The lack of proper training led to their inability to respond to the needs of immigrant children. Ronald described the inability to deal with different cultures in classrooms as "a struggle for some teachers", because "they don't know how to go about [them]":

> For instance, like Muslims, Islam and Isis, like those things are big topics to try and teach. And teachers may not be comfortable talking about a

> particular thing, because they don't want students to ask questions on that, because they don't know the answers, or they're not confident, because they themselves don't know how to relate the information that is really suitable for children, for them to really understand and how to connect with other people (Ronald, undergraduate).

This response resonates with the ill-preparedness of teachers for teaching about global and potentially sensitive topics in many western countries, as covered in extant literature (Caulfield, Hill, & Shelton, 2006; Hick et al., 2010; Mysore et al., 2006; Sleeter & Owuor, 2011; Training and Development Agency, 2011). My findings raise concerns about the effectiveness of some on-campus modules. Although many of the Scottish undergraduate student teachers had some exposure to an international, intercultural or global dimension in their learning experiences, they would still avoid global and sensitive topics in their classrooms, because of their lack of confidence, or perhaps fear of talking about them.

In this sense, internationalisation at home appeared to be not effective in shaping many of the Scottish undergraduate student teachers' development as competent teachers for multicultural contexts. They felt that what they had learned from these experiences was insufficient for helping them to address issues arising from cultural diversity in classrooms. As one student teacher summarised, they were not ready for the realities of Scotland's schools:

> I think as the country is becoming more and more multicultural, … I think schools are beginning to bring that culture [the culture of an immigrant child] in, and celebrate other cultures and see it more as an accepted thing, but I'm not sure we are quite there yet … I still think it's something that we need to work on (Emma, undergraduate).

Their insufficient preparation from internationalisation at home could also be explained by the restricted scope of some learning activities. As some PGDE

students reported, they had learned some pedagogical skills, but many lectures, which had global dimensions, were placed in a stand-alone manner, and they failed to gain an in-depth understanding of the issues that had been covered. As one student teacher explained, “you only had little snippets … because of the nature of the course. There’s little time and so much to – they have to fit in … there’s not a sort of continuation of the lecture” (Charles, PGDE). As such, the extent to which the intercultural, international or global dimension of a certain learning experience could impact on student teachers in regard to their development as globally competent teachers was very restricted.

Similarly, many of the Chinese student teachers were also aware of the importance of developing global competence in their future students. They noted that “as our society is becoming increasingly multicultural, we [our students] have to learn to respect and cooperate with each other” (Lishi, undergraduate). In addition, they pointed out that their future students “have to learn more languages and go to see the wider world in the future” (Yiwen, postgraduate), rather than “constrain[ing] themselves in their own world” (Yanyan, undergraduate).

Despite this acknowledgement, what the Chinese student teacher participants gained from learning experiences in the home country, which had global dimensions, could hardly develop their readiness to become globally competent teachers. When they were interacting with children at placement schools, they showed no signs of having the knowledge and skills to develop their students’ global competence. Some of them mentioned that when they were leading multicultural classrooms, they would “encourage children who are Han Chinese [the majority or the largest ethnic group in China] to respect those from other ethnic groups and get rid of their stereotypes by avoiding talking about some sensitive topics” (Lishi, undergraduate), and would “avoid cultural conflicts … by not talking about something controversial among children” (Dilan, undergraduate). These responses indicate that the Chinese student teachers would respond to sensitive topics or cultural differences by simply

avoiding them entirely, rather than embracing them as valuable assets that children might bring with them to the classroom. This is also demonstrated in the following example:

> In [my placement] class, there is a French boy called Adi, in Primary One. He can speak Mandarin. … Once, I asked him to stand up to answer my question, but he was unwilling to stand up. He wanted to answer the question by just sitting there. I said, "It's a way of showing your respect to the teacher by standing up". He was still unwilling to stand up. And then, I continued my lesson and just ignored this. [I think] he might have received his preschool education in a more relaxed way. I, then, respected him by allowing him to sit there when answering my questions (Peng, undergraduate).

Though Peng mentioned that he showed respect towards the French child in this incident, he did not include the child in the mainstream Chinese classroom. Instead, he singled the French child out by allowing him to answer questions in a different manner. He made some guesses about the child's prior experience, but he was unable to make further attempts to get to know the child in regard to his prior experiences or fund of knowledge.

The Chinese student teachers' decision to not speak about cultural differences or sensitive issues is an indication of their inability to help children discard stereotypical views about others, and of their failure to promote mutual understanding and respect between them. Even when some of the Chinese student teachers recognised the benefit of communication between teachers and parents in children's development, they had no idea how to make connections between this and their multicultural classrooms. As one student teacher said, "We don't know how to relate the communication between myself and parents to cultural differences in classrooms" (Yiwen, postgraduate).

Findings indicate that these approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education at home inadequately prepared the Chinese student teacher participants' readiness to teach in an increasingly global and multicultural context. Although many of them claimed that they had gained an increased knowledge about educational ideas and practices in other countries from approaches such as Comparative Educational Studies, the English modules, and lectures/seminars given by some international visiting scholars or teachers, they still felt that there was a gap between what they had learned at Nanhai University as student teachers, and how they would teach as globally competent teachers. These results demonstrate that the approaches to internationalisation at home provided by Nanhai University were not impactful on the Chinese student teachers in regard to their development as globally competent teachers.

These findings from the Chinese student teacher participants, however, are similar to what I have found in most of the Scottish undergraduate student teachers who participated in internationalisation at home. The latter also complained about the lack of sufficient preparation from Southside University. Both cohorts of student teachers were unable to deal with global and sensitive issues in their multicultural classrooms. However, the Scottish undergraduate student teachers appeared more aware of their own limitations, because they acknowledged that they still needed to work hard on bridging the gap between themselves as culturally homogenous teachers and the culturally and linguistically diverse children in their future classrooms.

7.5.3 Demonstrating readiness to be globally competent teachers

Some other Scottish student teachers, particularly those PGDE student teachers, showed more confidence in responding to an increasingly global and multicultural context. They also recognised the gap between cultural diversity in schools, and culturally homogenous features among themselves as future teachers. This gap is

reflected in Nicole's experience, though she has an Irish and Romanian background:

> I grew up in a small town in an island with 20 girls, all white, all Irish. We were brought up all together, no differences, but at the Homework Club, there are so many different children, with lots of different backgrounds and different things that make them individuals (Nicole, undergraduate).

Nicole's experience is similar to the experiences of many other Scottish student teachers. The common feature is that cultural diversity is a more recent phenomenon in schools, and was not so prominent in the schools where the Scottish student teachers were educated. What they learned in schools was confined to their local context:

> … when I was at school, it was all about learning about Scotland and learning about Scotland's history, and the importance of being Scottish, but I think now, because there is such a diversity living within Scotland, even just within xxx [the city where she lives] (Tina, PGDE).

By reflecting on her own educational background, Tina became aware of the limitations within herself as a quality teacher for all children, and of the limitations of Scottish education. She suggested that she would try to make a difference in her future teaching:

> I think trying to squash the racism that's very, I think is – it's very adamant in Scotland, and making sure that children learn from a very young age that it's – it's important to know about other cultures, it's not just about being yourself; …making sure that children are aware that there are other cultures out there, and [that] people do have different beliefs from you (Tina, PGDE).

In particular, she acknowledged that the impactful learning experience in the PS module (as shown in Section 7.3) developed her readiness to become a more

competent teacher for culturally and linguistically diverse children:

> [By] doing the PS course, I've realised that … it's small things you need to know about the country. … I always remember "Children come with a fund of knowledge". That's the one quote that I remember [from the professor]. And, [I'm] understanding that every child – they might not speak English, but that doesn't mean that they don't have a vast amount of knowledge within their selves, just because they can't speak English to you (Tina, PGDE).

Tina's response demonstrates that she would take account of what knowledge or experiences children might bring with them to the classroom, rather than simply viewing them as English learners who might speak poor English at the beginning. Her attitude towards culturally and linguistically diverse children is characteristic of culturally responsive teachers who value the experiences and funds of knowledge of ethnic minority children in teaching (Gay, 2010).

The high level of the PGDE student teachers' readiness to be culturally responsive teachers is observed to have resulted from some specifically designed tasks, as well as the guided discussions which they took part in during the PS module. They were encouraged to share their ideas of working with culturally and linguistically diverse children, and were guided by the lecturer to critically reflect on their pre-assumptions about these children, as is shown in Section 7.3. Both Tina and Nila noted that sharing ideas in the module with peers and the lecturer had enabled them to understand how to "us[e] the [immigrant] children in the class to teach me and other children … and [how] we can learn from each other's cultures" (Tina, PGDE) as well as how to "make children feel they are valued" (Nila, PGDE) within the learning community. These two PGDE students' responses reveal that they have mastered some skills of culturally responsive or relevant teachers who can "understand the role of culture and promote collaborative modes of learning among students and community to utilise students' unique cultural backgrounds as a

foundation for learning" (Jett et al., 2016, p. 517).

Another important finding from the data of the Scottish student teacher participants is that student teachers' lived experiences, and their cultural backgrounds, could also play an important role in shaping their development as globally competent teachers. Among the seven Scottish student teacher participants who participated in internationalisation at home, two of them were not from a Scottish background, but they thought positively about their cultural identity in relation to their interaction with children from culturally diverse backgrounds. Even though Nicole (when she was interviewed) was the only first-year student teacher participant at the undergraduate level at Southside University and had been educated in a culturally homogenous school (i.e. all Irish girls) in Ireland, she showed a good understanding of how to respond properly to the needs of immigrant children in her placement classroom through the Homework Club. It was apparent that she had not yet received much exposure to intercultural, international and global dimensions within the on-campus modules, especially when compared with the rest of the Scottish undergraduate student teachers who were in their final year. However, she regarded her bi-cultural family as an asset which could be readily used in her interaction with those who are considered different:

> … coming from a Romanian and Irish background, I feel like I already had that. … I like to find people who are different and encourage them and make friends with them and make them feel welcomed, because for me it is so important. I want everyone [to] feel welcomed, and I would never want anyone to feel uncomfortable (Nicole, undergraduate).

Nila is also an ethic minority student teacher. Apart from the preparation for teaching in multicultural classrooms which she gained from the PS module, she also credited her preparedness to her lived experience in the UK as a member of an ethnic minority group. Having been in close contact with different cultures throughout her life, Nila acknowledged that:

> I understand that different cultures do things in different ways, and different religions do things in different ways. So I would say that I think I'm quite accepting in that way. If [I] meet people from a completely different culture, I am interested to know, you know, where they are from, what kind of background, it's is purely - because I think diversity is a really good thing and an interesting thing (Nila, PGDE).

Nila's interest in, and excitement about, cultural diversity may also be due to her own experience of being respected by those she met during her life in the UK. As she said, "I have to continuously ask 'Is this halal or is it not?' … but I've never had anyone actually saying to me: 'That's silly'". By reflecting on her lived experience, Nila expressed that she would also value cultural differences in her future classrooms by getting to know "what is important to all of the people" and "making teaching relevant to all children". She would also educate children to be more globally minded by "talk[ing] about a different country, talk[ing] about a different religion, [and] talk[ing] about a different culture".

Findings in this section show that some PGDE students who was carefully guided to critically reflect on their taken-for-granted assumptions about children and their own role as future teachers in the PS module demonstrated more readiness to become globally competent teachers. Further to this, a multicultural family background, or an ethnic minority background, could contribute to student teachers' readiness to become globally competent teachers. This is because "I'm obviously part of an ethnic minority even though I was born and bred here in this country and I also share my identity with a different culture" (Nila, PGDE).

7.6 Summary

This chapter explored the impact of internationalisation at home on student teachers. Global dimensions in modules, lectures and placement experiences were

limited in preparing the Chinese student teacher participants' readiness to become globally competent teachers. Many of the Chinese student teachers focused mainly on content reflection on the educational ideas and practices in other countries from these experiences, and they were not encouraged to question their own thoughts or beliefs. Further to this, their experiences as English language learners did not put them in disruptive positions, and they demonstrated little development in cross-cultural communication. Moreover, they made little mention of their growth in empathy for children who might have difficulties in learning in their future classrooms. Although many of the Chinese student teachers acknowledged multicultural classrooms in China, and the importance of developing global competence in their future students, their emphasis on avoiding sensitive issues concerning cultural differences indicated ill-preparedness.

At Southside University, some modules that had global dimensions could also increase many student teachers' (particularly those at undergraduate level) content knowledge about education and cultures in other countries, but they were seen as not having a significant impact on developing their confidence and self-efficacy in teaching global issues or sensitive topics to children. However, some of the Scottish student teachers' experiences as foreign language learners in foreign language modules, in the PS module or in their placements at multicultural schools could force them into positions of anxiety and frustration. These disruptive moments were seen to have contributed to the development of their empathy for others, and to their ability in cross-cultural communication. In particular, some PGDE students who attended the PS module and experienced transformative learning demonstrated some readiness for being globally competent teachers. This is because they were more able to recognise the gap between their culturally homogenous selves as future teachers and the culturally and linguistically diverse children of their future classrooms. They were therefore more able to recognise the value of lived experiences, and the value of the funds of knowledge which these children might bring to the classroom. In addition to this, the data analysis also suggested that the

ethnic minority background of student teachers was an asset that contributed to their readiness for becoming globally competent teachers.

Chapter 8 Factors That Influence the Internationalisation of Teacher Education

8.1 Introduction

This chapter focuses on factors which are perceived to be influential by the student teachers and the academics. It first explores participants' perceptions of the key barriers to student teachers' participation in internationalisation abroad and at home, and how participants feel these barriers could be addressed. The section which follows describes what my participants perceive to be the influential factors involved in the process of internationalisation in teacher education. The chapter ends with a summary.

8.2 Barriers to student teachers' participation in study abroad programmes

8.2.1 Financial barriers: personal issues or family issues

Financial issues are commonly regarded as the most prominent barriers to university students' participation in study abroad programmes (Doyle et al., 2010; Souto-Otero, Huisman, Beerkens, De Wit, & Vujić, 2013; Van Mol & Timmerman, 2014). In particular, financial concerns can also be a reason for the low rate of student teachers' involvement in study abroad programmes (Santoro et al., 2016; Schneider, 2003). For most of my participants, financial issues are also considered as one of the biggest barriers preventing student teachers from taking up the opportunity to study abroad. However, differences exist between the financial concerns of participants at the two research sites.

The Chinese participants mainly attributed financial barriers to the lower socioeconomic status of the student teachers' families. Those who are prepared to

become teachers in China at undergraduate level receive free education or can access it for a very low fee. Many student teachers at postgraduate level at Nanhai University can also receive a varying amount of scholarships to cover all, or part, of their tuition fees. This financial benefit to student teachers can attract many excellent students to education courses in Chinese universities, who may be otherwise unable to afford to study other courses. Both Chinese academics and student teachers regarded low household income as the largest obstacle to the uptake of study abroad programmes among student teachers. As a Chinese academic said:

> Finance is a big barrier. Compared with students from other disciplinary backgrounds, our students, to be honest, are mostly from relatively less well-off families. … We have negotiated money off the learning fees of the exchange programmes, but our student teachers still have to cover their own living expenses when they are studying abroad (Jing, academic).

This response suggests that low socioeconomic status can prohibit student teachers from participating in study abroad programmes. This is more specifically reflected in the response of a Chinese student teacher:

> I remember that a classmate got the opportunity to study abroad, but his family was poor. His parents had to borrow money to support him. … As you know, we are the student teachers who can get free education at the university. Some of our classmates chose to study this course because they came from a poor family. It's a pity. They may miss out on the opportunity to study abroad because of not being able to afford it (Siya, undergraduate).

The socioeconomic status of student teachers' families was held to be the major reason for preventing the Chinese student teachers' participation in study abroad programmes. "Even though the university provides some financial support to

student teachers in some programmes, student teachers still have to pay for the majority of their overseas learning trips" (Yang, academic). My result resonates with Qiao's (2017) recent study in which he has surveyed 212 Chinese student teachers and found that family income is a major factor that influences their choice of studying abroad.

Data from the Chinese participants suggests that it is important for faculty members to think about creative ways of increasing financial support to a wider range of student teachers, in order to encourage their participation in study abroad programmes. Some Chinese academics have recognised this, and proposed that they can work together with the Chinese Scholarship Council which provides Chinese students with scholarships to study abroad, either long- or short-term. As one Chinese academic suggested, "the university can work harder on promoting this platform to student teachers, and encourage more of them to apply for financial aid from the Council" (Jing, academic). Financial barriers resulting from the low household income of student teachers can also act as a guide for future actions by the university in regard to increasing investment in study abroad programmes and other means that have an intercultural, international or global dimension.

Similarly, study abroad opportunities are practically inaccessible for many Scottish student teachers because of their financial limitations. The majority of undergraduate courses in Scotland are free to Scottish and EU students, so all of the Scottish undergraduate student teachers in my research have accessed free tuition at Southside University. For the PGDE students at a postgraduate level, their tuition fees are very low for the one-year course, as long as they are from Scotland or EU countries. Most of the Scottish student teachers interviewed for my study lived independently of their parents. They saw their personal financial status and part-time jobs as inhibitors to studying abroad. For example, a Scottish academic mentioned that her students would not choose to participate in a study abroad programme for fear of losing a part-time job:

> Not all students can do that [studying abroad]. … if you have to have a job in Scotland to help you live, you can't just leave for 3 weeks or a term (Stella, academic).

Tensions between study abroad opportunities and job opportunities were recognised by many Scottish student teachers. They had to "work right through the year" and "they can't leave their jobs, because they need the money from it" (Emma, undergraduate). This concern was typically mirrored in the following response:

> Well, I live in my own flat, so obviously I've got my bills to pay. So it's difficult in that sense to get access to these things. If you're going – if I had [gone] to China for a month, I would've had no rent money when I came back, I would've had no flat. … So I mean it's difficult. It's a balance. I mean, obviously I appreciate how lucky I am to not have to pay to go to uni[versity] and stuff, but it is just – it is difficult (Ada, undergraduate).

Apart from the fear of losing a part-time job, many Scottish student teacher participants thought that they or their peers could not afford trips abroad, despite some of the opportunities being fully or partially funded, as demonstrated in the following statement:

> … even though the programme might be funded by the university, some of it, and then you only pay some, part of it. It's still a money implication, because you are students. Personally, I know that you don't have much money to spare, so you want to be able to work to make money. So, it's difficult to prioritise what you need (Emma, undergraduate).

Responses from the Scottish participants also suggest that it is important for Southside University to work on different means of funding for their student teachers. Daniel, a Scottish academic, acknowledged this, and had been working

together with his colleagues from different departmental levels to “look at ways of ensuring, where possible, that we can offer a study abroad experience as widely as we can”. They had also tried to support their student teachers’ opportunities to study abroad by establishing a scholarship fund with the Chinese government. For example, Daniel worked together with officers from the education department at the Chinese Embassy, and created some funded study abroad programmes in China for his students.

Meanwhile, there are possible ways of breaking down the obstacle of personal financial status which often prevented Scottish student teachers from participating in study abroad programmes. Compared with their Chinese peers, the Scottish student teacher participants were more self-reliant, and they did not see their family’s socioeconomic status as the reason for their financial constraints. Some of them showed a willingness to study abroad if they had saved enough money for it. For example, a student teacher claimed that “I save[d] all year to go away. … I came back [from America] last week and I started saving this week for my next – wherever I’m going next year” (Ada, undergraduate). This response demonstrates that though money was a major concern to the Scottish student teachers, it could be addressed if they made early preparations for it. This points to the importance of early promotion of study abroad opportunities to the Scottish student teachers, which can enable them to make an early plan for saving money. Meanwhile, this response also highlights the need to help student teachers understand the value of study abroad opportunities and prioritise them. This is linked to their mind-sets, which will be further discussed in Section 8.3.1.

8.2.2 Mixed views about the language factor: a barrier to participation or a catalyst for learning?

Students who are less confident in speaking foreign languages are less likely to consider overseas learning opportunities (Souto-Otero et al., 2013). They may show

little interest in study abroad programmes because of their concerns about a different language and culture of a foreign country (Santoro et al., 2016). Even more concerns or worries may be generated during their stay in the host country because of language barriers (Liu et al. 2013). My research findings confirm that language barriers are another factor which influences the Chinese student teachers' decision to participate in study abroad programmes, but the case is different for the Scottish student teachers.

Many of the Chinese student teachers at Nanhai University saw the lack of foreign language skills as a major barrier to their participation in study abroad programmes, and to their ability to be fully involved in learning activities or daily life during experiences abroad. As a student teacher conveyed, "We are worried about studying abroad, because we have a very limited ability to communicate with others in a foreign language" (Yanyan, undergraduate). However, there was a language requirement for student teachers accessing study abroad opportunities at Nanhai University. For example, one student teacher said that "we have to have passed CET6 (College English Test 6)" (Ling, postgraduate). Another one complained that "the high requirement [in regard to foreign language competence] excludes many of us from the interviews … and from access to study abroad programmes" (Lishi, undergraduate).

However, the strict language criteria for selecting candidates for study abroad programmes did not ensure the Chinese student teachers' successful engagement in learning experiences abroad. Language barriers were also evident among those who had overseas learning experiences. Many of them complained that "all of it is in English … and you're lucky if you can understand half of the class content" (Manlu, postgraduate) and "once we were having a history class … and we didn't quite get it" (Yueqing, undergraduate). The language issue was occasionally more prominent outside of classrooms, which could trigger concerns among the Chinese student teachers about their safety in the host country:

> One of the girls [a group of Chinese student teachers in a study abroad programme in the US] lost her mobile phone in the hotel where we were living. We were trying to report it to the police at the police station, but we could hardly understand the terms [the policeman used during the conversation] (Meng, undergraduate).

These responses reveal that many years of experience in learning English could not alleviate concerns and worries about studying abroad. The lack of confidence and competence in communicating in English raises an important issue concerning foreign language training in China. Though the Chinese student teacher participants have learned English since childhood, what they have learned is generally not for communicative purposes.

In particular, it is of vital importance for the university to offer student teachers some pre-departure training in English for communicative purposes, rather than setting high entry requirements for English skills for studying abroad. However, it may not be possible to develop student teachers' communication skills in a foreign language within just a few days or weeks. As a Chinese academic noted, "foreign language skills are accumulated through a continuous process of learning, and they cannot be developed in a single institutional project" (Jing, academic).

What is interesting about the data is that language was not viewed as a major barrier to the Scottish student teachers' access to study abroad opportunities, even though most of them had hardly any knowledge of the language spoken in the destination countries (e.g. China, Malawi, etc.) promoted at Southside University. When asked about what they might consider to be the challenges to, or barriers against, their participation in study abroad programmes, the Scottish student teachers made little mention of language as an issue that prevented them from participating in such programmes. This result is different from a recent study in which language barriers are identified as a contributing factor to Scottish student

teachers' reluctance to study abroad (Santoro et al., 2016). A possible explanation for this difference is that participants' lived experiences can play a role in their attitude towards overseas learning opportunities. Although in my research, the Scottish student teachers who studied abroad experienced language barriers when communicating with local people, English was still the main language they used for daily communication in their host countries. As English is widely recognised and used in the world as a lingua franca, communication has become possible between people from different linguistic backgrounds (Fang et al., 2016). In this sense, language is not considered to be a barrier to their participation in study abroad programmes.

Another possible explanation for not seeing foreign languages as barriers is that many of the Scottish student teachers have had positive learning outcomes from their difficult learning experiences as foreign language learners, as shown in the previous two chapters. For example, they viewed language barriers as facilitators for their development of self-awareness and empathy for their future students who might come from different linguistic backgrounds. Some of the Scottish student teachers who studied abroad suggested that foreign language learning should not be a major focus of the limited pre-departure briefing sessions:

> I feel when I went to these classes, the first thing we got was – okay, language. So, the guy who put up like all the letters of the alphabets and it was like – okay, this is how we start. I think a lot of us were like – okay, hold on – I think what could be better is that we have more information on just general dos and don'ts, you know, like maybe more in-depth about … what is common practice in Chinese culture and what isn't (Gina, undergraduate).

This response indicates that for the Scottish student teacher participants, a foreign language was less of an obstacle to them than cultural differences. They were more worried by their lack of knowledge about the culture of the host country, because

“there are certain things people in China might laugh at you … [and] I don’t want to go over to embarrass myself” (Callie, undergraduate). These findings can be important to Southside University for adapting their briefing sessions to the needs of student teachers.

8.3 Barriers to student teachers’ participation in approaches to internationalisation

8.3.1 A narrow mind-set

The analysis of the data shows that student teachers’ unwillingness to participate in the internationalisation of teacher education, either at home or abroad, is closely associated with their narrow mind-sets. Some academics felt that student teachers’ understanding of the value of learning experiences might downplay these barriers. For example, “student teachers have to pay for part of their learning experience abroad, but if they understand that they are the beneficiaries of that experience, they will work ways out [to pay for it]” (Cai, academic).

My research findings reveal that many student teachers demonstrate a limited understanding of the importance of the intercultural, international and global dimensions of learning experiences to their future career. This limited understanding leads to less interest in participating in internationally focused learning experiences. As a Scottish academic said, “There is always a reluctance from our students to think internationally, or to engage in international visits or study, … [because they] don't always recognise that we need to learn about other cultures, other places, in order to inform teaching” (Daniel, academic). The responses of many student teachers are reflective of Daniel’s view of the narrow mind-sets of student teachers. Student teachers, especially those who did not study abroad, were reluctant to participate in internationally focused learning experiences, because they did not understand the value of these experiences within their disciplinary area:

> I think a lot of people that do Business, for example – [they think,] "I'm always gonna be working with the business system, global or European, whatever, so it's useful for me to see how the businesses are working in that country". Whereas, I think some student teachers, we don't really see the [relevance] – why is it important to understand that [the global dimension]? … I feel people [think], like, – "well, I'm teaching in Scotland, so I don't need to study abroad" (Emma, undergraduate).

Emma's view indicates that the value of global dimensions can be more easily recognised in disciplines other than education. This may be because teacher education is traditionally thought to be bound to the local context, and based on national requirements for certification (Koziol et al., 2011). However, the realities of education in many places in the world have changed along with the increasing cross-border movement of people and global interdependence (Apple, 2011). In this sense, Emma's response also implies a mismatch between teacher education and the promotion of global dimensions to student teachers. Some of the Chinese student teachers recognised this mismatch:

> Our views are confined to the educational environments that we have been in, from childhood to adulthood. … When we're being trained to be teachers, our university, lecturers and professors have to promote and introduce issues concerning internationalisation and multiculturalism to us, so that their importance can gradually be instilled in our minds (Yiwen, postgraduate).

Nicole, a first-year student teacher from Southside University, brought up the same issue. In her view, the reluctance of her peers to join her in the Homework Club where she worked with children from linguistically and culturally diverse backgrounds could be explained by their lack of knowledge about the importance of this experience:

> There are people who are not willing to put themselves into a different environment than what they are used to. … The benefits of learning about multiculturalism should be pushed more, so that – it's more than a norm to know how important it is to know. I feel like it should be mandatory (Nicole, undergraduate).

The responses of both the Chinese and Scottish student teachers demonstrate that student teachers tend to be more comfortable in environments with which they are more familiar. However, the responses also suggest that early efforts are needed to open up student teachers' minds to the wider world, and to encourage them to take part in a wide range of learning experiences that have international components. Although some of the student teachers acknowledged personal and professional development in themselves following their learning experiences in study abroad programmes, language classes, lectures/modules with international components or placements in multicultural classrooms (see Chapters 6 and 7), some of them still found it difficult to understand why they had to do that at the beginning. As one student teacher said, "in the first year [at the] university, … I chose Spanish, [but] at that time, I didn't really see [its] relevance to education" (Emma, undergraduate). Likewise, another student teacher said: "we are unwilling to participate in these learning experiences … because we don't see the practical benefits to our academic learning or to our future job" (Lishi, undergaduate).

Student teachers' reluctance to move out of their comfort zones can be more prominent in learning experiences involving cultures about which they have little knowledge. They may hold stereotypical views about such cultures, and imagine potential risks associated with unfamiliar cultures. For example, Richard participated in a study abroad programme to China, but he pointed out that some of his peers were unwilling to participate in the programme for the following reason:

> I don't think there is much recognition for the Chinese. … I think some people perceive China as being bad in some of the customs and in

> cultures and people may shy away from going over to China or maybe even studying in China, because they don't agree [with them]. But when you go over, it’s completely different. Everybody is so nice to you as well, being a foreigner (Richard, undergraduate).

This response reveals that some of the Scottish student teachers’ preconceptions or stereotypical views about China, Chinese people or Chinese culture are influenced by a set of images or binaries such as good or bad, similarly to the way the Orient is represented in Orientalism by the West (Said, 1978). However, direct interaction with Chinese culture, and with people in China, enabled Richard to unlearn or deconstruct his preconceptions about China. A direct encounter with Chinese people in China helped open up his mind-set, which appeared to be initially parochial or Eurocentric. His response indicates that the narrow mind-sets of some Scottish student teachers can be a barrier to their participation in study abroad programmes to certain countries, or to their participation in some other internationally focused learning experiences. However, barriers resulting from the narrow mind-sets of student teachers can be broken down by teacher educators who have expertise in internationalisation, or a rich knowledge of certain countries. As Richard said, he was lucky to have attended the lecture of Daniel, who did a presentation on the study abroad programme in China. Otherwise, Richard said that he would not have been able to understand the value of the learning trip to China, and would not have taken the opportunity.

Richard’s response also points to the importance of providing student teachers with sufficient promotional material, as well as proper briefings. Otherwise, student teachers may fear being exposed to, or immersed in, a different culture or a country which appears “bad in some of the customs and in cultures” (Richard, undergraduate), as shown in the above response. Further to this, the narrow mind-sets may give rise to student teachers’ concerns, such as “I’m afraid of misunderstanding others or being misunderstood by others, and I’m afraid of being a discredit to the Chinese … if I perform in an inappropriate way [when I’m abroad]”

(Yueqing, undergraduate). Fear or worry brought about by a lack of knowledge about others, or the cultures of others, can confine student teachers to their own little world, rather than encouraging them to participate in learning experiences that have an intercultural, international or global dimension.

The constraining factors resulting from student teachers' lack of knowledge about, or openness to, global dimensions highlights the need for teacher educators to promote the value of these learning experiences, which can open up student teachers' minds and encourage them to constructively participate in the global world. Fortunately, some of the Scottish academics recognised this barrier, and showed their willingness to break it down. For example, Stella found that:

> … sometimes students are very happy in a little bubble. They exist in their little world with their friends and don't have to look outside. I think that's like a mind-set thing. They have a closed mind, and they just like the ways things are for them. But it is our opportunity to open that up. That's our job (Stella, academic).

Stella's response suggests that a natural tendency exists among student teachers to stay within their comfort zones, where everything is familiar and certain, so that they do not have to try new things. This also demonstrates the urgent need for open-minded teacher educators who can move student teachers out of their comfort zones, encourage them to effectively engage with difference and uncertainty, and "expand their preconceived limits" (M. Brown, 2008, p. 3).

Student teachers' lack of openness to the outside world is also associated with the nature of teacher education in the past:

> I think one of the issues in terms of the training of Scottish teachers historically is that we are training teachers for the Scottish context … So, students often think just about their own backyard, … [which] has been

> an issue I think for quite some time. … It's time to change the mind-set of students who are here at Southside University, so that they value an international experience (Daniel, academic).

Daniel's view suggests that student teachers' understanding of the role of teachers is still informed by a traditional understanding of teacher education, which remains locally contextualised, as it was in the past. However, classrooms in Scotland are increasingly characterised by cultural diversity, as acknowledged by the Scottish participants in the previous three chapters.

The responses presented above demonstrate that some of the Scottish academics noted the concerns of their students and the possible reasons for these concerns. They felt they had a responsibility to address these concerns and to motivate student teachers to participate in a wide range of learning activities that had global dimensions. Although some of the Scottish academics have brought this issue to attention, more work still needs to be done to open student teachers' minds up, so that they are able to learn from different experiences and teach with open minds. However, the Chinese academic participants had little recognition of the relationship between student teachers' mind-sets and their choice of learning opportunities that had global dimensions. This result highlights the importance of communication between student teachers and academics who are working on different approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education, in order that proper promotion and training sessions can be provided to open up student teachers' minds, and guide them to an understanding of the relevance of global dimensions to their development as teachers.

8.3.2 The overcrowded curriculum: no time or space for an intercultural, international or global dimension

Another perceived barrier to student teachers' participation in different approaches to internationalisation resides in the overcrowded curriculum. Findings from the

data show that the structure of teacher education courses can make it difficult for academics to find space to incorporate an intercultural, international or global dimension. The structure of teacher education courses can also be an inhibiting factor to student teachers' ability to find time to participate in learning activities that have an intercultural, international or global dimension.

Many student teacher participants emphasised that they were under pressure to meet demanding course requirements. As some of them expressed, they might not be able to take these internationally focused learning opportunities, because "it's very intense – in making sure that – to meet the standard for registration, you've got to cover specific aspects of teacher education" (Tina, PGDE), and "the course is so demanding, and you've already got so much coursework to do" (Ling, postgraduate). Highly demanding courses for student teachers made them "feel pushed for time … [and] worried about losing time to spend completing assignments" (Emma undergraduate).

Even when they were provided with learning experiences that had an intercultural, international or global dimension, they still found it hard to balance an overcrowded curriculum with their full engagement in these learning experiences. They stressed that student teachers normally "have a lot going on [in the course] and it is hard to commit time to some projects" (Richard, undergraduate). Meanwhile, they pointed out that the unique structure of teacher education courses had prevented them, and the majority of their peers, from participating in study abroad programmes. As they explained, "there are inevitable time clashes between these [study abroad] opportunities and our placements, coursework and thesis writing" (Meng, postgraduate), and "we have a very full timetable and [we] may value other experiences over this experience [study abroad]" (Callie, undergraduate).

In response to the difficulties of integrating an intercultural, international or global dimension into already demanding teacher education courses, one Scottish

academic participant said that he and his colleagues were looking for opportunities to “allow students to look at language learning, but the problem is that there is so much content to be taught, and it’s hard sometimes to find space for all the things you'd like to do” (Daniel, academic). Daniel added that it was extremely difficult for his students to participate in study abroad programmes because “the nature of an education degree [requires] a lot of time spent in schools. So, the timing when students can go abroad may be complicated by that fact” (Daniel, academic). As well as this, “they’ve got course requirements” (Carol, academic) and “they are worried about whether [they will] miss the course that they would otherwise do” (Stella, academic). This is more difficult for PGDE students who are in the one-year course, and who have to balance the time between 18 weeks of course studying at the university and 18 weeks of placements at schools. Henry, who was in charge of the PGDE courses, mentioned that study abroad opportunities were only possible for “secondary education students of modern foreign languages, [who] can complete one of their placements at a school in the country of the language”. However, he found it quite impossible for the majority of PGDE students, as the demanding course requirements of the intensive one-year course were viewed by him as a hindrance to their ability to engage in study abroad programmes.

In the face of challenge posed by an overcrowded curriculum, most of the Scottish academics worked out ways to address this issue. They though that it was important for student teachers to recognise the value of the intercultural, international and global dimensions in learning experiences to their future interactions with children who would come from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds. As Daniel said, “if [we are] going to prepare students to engage in the profession properly, we need to open their eyes to the cultural varieties that exist [in schools], and to some of the challenges we face in initial teacher education”. Carol also held the view that teacher educators had to understand the value to their student teachers of these learning experiences which were established either abroad or at home, and should try to find space for these dimensions in the curriculum:

> … we have to look at how we can fit it in. We just have to make space in the curriculum and recognise students can learn something really valuable there [abroad] or even [when] they are going to the class here (Carol, academic).

In addition to their understanding of the value of different approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education, some Scottish academic participants suggested that they had to justify the value of experiences, and fit them within the tight curriculum by replacing some other content. Carol emphasised that "[we are] arguing and negotiating, because everyone thinks their module is the most important". The idea of replacing some current course content is very prominent in the responses of Daniel who was an active advocate of the internationalisation of teacher education within the School of Education at Southside University:

> I think the structures can sometimes be flexible, but we need to remember that going abroad offers such a rich experience for students, especially when it's well structured. It will be far better than anything we could offer here on campus. I think the content we deliver to students – sometimes, [there are] good reasons to say no. We don't have to do that because what they are doing abroad is of an equal value, or maybe more valuable than what they've been doing here on campus (Daniel, academic).

Daniel's suggestion sheds light on how to create opportunities to fit intercultural, international and global dimensions into the apparently overcrowded curriculum for student teachers. His idea is very well supported by the National Partnership Group (Donaldson, 2011), which recommends that it is unrealistic to cover all that future teachers need to know within initial teacher education, but that components can be built into some foundations laid at the initial stage. However, Daniel's statement also suggests the necessity of exploring the impact of internationally focused learning experiences on student teachers, in regard to their personal and professional

development. This exploration can help the university to identify what works, what does not, and where further institutional efforts need to be made to enable student teachers to experience deeper learning. By doing so, further justifications can be made as to whether or not these learning experiences should replace some current course content.

To address student teachers' concerns about demanding courses, most of the Scottish academics found it vital to fully motivate student teachers to participate in internationally focused learning experiences. They had been working on making these learning experiences an integral part of the curriculum, and on granting credits to student teachers for their participation. For example, Carol said that she was working with colleagues to make a study abroad experience part of a module which student teachers took on campus:

> What we were discussing this morning is whether or not it might be something – a curriculum module, for example, that the students attend, but don't have to submit the assignment, because the assignment – they have to do it in China. [This cannot only] accommodate something about the curriculum and international perspectives, but [can] also help them link back to what they've learned (Carol, academic).

In this case, student teachers may not view the study abroad experience as an extra piece of coursework added to the current module. They may see the experience as something important to be covered in module learning. Another alternative strategy many of the Scottish academics were trying to promote involved compensating student teachers appropriately for their participation in internationally focused learning experiences. They suggested that crediting experiences could be a good way of incorporating these experiences into the curriculum, and could help eliminate student teachers' concerns over what they might miss on the course if they participate in these experiences:

> We try to create a space in our programmes to allow students to go abroad without worrying about what is happening here, so we'll give credits for the international experience. That's one way of trying to encourage them to value the experience. … The opportunities to gain credits will become a standard part of the programme (Daniel, academic).

Similar efforts can also be seen in other learning experiences. Although Henry held a narrow view towards the internationalisation of teacher education at Southside University, as shown in Chapter 5, he also thought that it was important to offer student teachers some input on teaching children whose first language was not English. He mentioned that they had been working on establishing optional modules, and on crediting these learning experiences:

> We have always had optional learning experiences, but for quite some time they have not been credited. … We've changed that. We have a 10-credit module now called Professional Specialisation. It incorporates what has always been available, which has been a series of taught experiences led by people who are very expert in a very narrow area like bilingual learners (Henry, academic).

Henry's response indicates that optional modules which have an international focus can provide PGDE students with alternative learning opportunities. However, international input in the optional modules largely depends on the expertise of the academics available at the university, which will be discussed further in the next section.

Surprisingly, the overcrowded curriculum was not perceived as a potential barrier among the Chinese academic participants, although many Chinese student teacher participants saw it as a barrier to their participation in internationally focused learning experiences. Only one Chinese academic, who was in charge of international affairs at Nanhai University, mentioned that they were trying to

motivate student teachers to participate in study abroad experiences by crediting these experiences and making them compulsory within the curriculum:

> Currently, we are thinking about another issue. We intend to include students' international learning experiences within the credit system. For example, students from certain subject areas have to get an overseas learning experience, either for academic learning or for placement purposes (Cai, academic).

However, complex issues interwoven within the unique structure of teacher education courses may make it more difficult to implement these changes. This result suggests that if student teachers' concerns and needs are heeded, more responsive strategies can be used to effectively promote and implement the internationalisation of teacher education. It highlights the necessity for communication between student teachers and staff members who are working on internationalisation at Nanhai University, while the result also emphasises the importance of conversations between faculty members working in this field, both within and outside the university.

Demanding course requirements and limited space within the tight curriculum are typically viewed as reasons for the failure to incorporate an intercultural, international or global dimension into initial teacher education (Longview Foundation, 2008; Mahon, 2010; Schneider, 2003). Findings from my research prove that these typical reasons hamper many Chinese and Scottish student teachers' access to learning experiences that have global dimensions. The Scottish academic participants have recognised these issues and have been working on them. In their view, possible solutions can be worked out if these learning experiences are carefully planned and fitted into the curriculum.

8.4 The expertise of the academics as a key factor for the internationalisation of teacher education

It has been made demonstrated in the previous sections that globally minded teacher educators are needed to open up student teachers' mind-sets and to address issues which prevent their students from participating in internationally focused learning experiences. In particular, some researchers suggest that the success of certain approaches to internationalisation is linked to the understanding, knowledge, skills and dispositions of teacher educators who are working on the promotion and implementation of internationalisation (Devlin-Foltz, 2010; Pachler & Redondo, 2015).

8.4.1 Intercultural experience and cultural diversity among Scottish academics: challenges and opportunities

As shown in Chapter 6, the Scottish student teacher participants who were sent abroad through well-structured university programmes were more able to critically reflect on intercultural encounters during their learning trips, and showed more readiness to be globally competent teachers (i.e. Callie, Richard and Gina) than the other three Scottish student teacher participants who studied abroad but not through university programmes (i.e. Ada, Ella and Kala). According to the responses of the former group, the expertise of the academics who were working on the study abroad programmes was a contributing factor to well-structured learning trips. In these programmes, student teachers were asked to complete tasks before, during, and after the learning trips. For example, Gina and Richard attributed their meaningful learning experiences in China to Daniel who had a lot of expertise in internationalisation, as well as in Chinese culture and language. In Callie's scenario, her transformative learning experience in Malawi was also facilitated by the expertise of an academic:

> … we were with xxx [a professor] in the Cultural Awareness module [before departure]. It prepared us very well about challenging awareness of culture. I think … without the module in place, we could have just gone out and actually not thought about reflecting on it. So, we were constantly thinking about every experience, and how it changed our thinking, seeing ways that shaped us. That was quite influential. We also had a written assignment to do when we came back, which was on research questions (Callie, undergraduate).

Coincidentally, the professor mentioned by Callie in the above response is the same academic mentioned previously by another student teacher. In Chapter 7, Tina attributed her impactful learning experience in the module to the rich experience and knowledge of the professor who was running it:

> I'm not aware if there is, erm, trained specialists, but xxx [the professor] had a lot of knowledge about— she does have a lot of knowledge about different cultures and she's taught in different areas. And, she's obviously from xxx [another country] (Tina, PGDE).

These responses indicate that the meaningfulness of approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education is greatly dependent on the knowledge, experience and cultural background of teacher educators. However, the fact that the same professor was mentioned by two of the Scottish student teachers across different degree courses may lead us to think that there are a limited number of lecturers, or just one professor who has the expertise to run modules that have global dimensions. Some other Scottish student teacher participants' responses demonstrate that there is a lack of expertise and diversity among the teacher educators at Southside University:

> There is a lack of staff with relevant experience, and a lack of diversity in staff. [There is] a major shortage of staff from ethnic minority backgrounds or diverse cultures. They have to rely on other sources for

> authentic viewpoints or information (Nila, PGDE).

The responses of many of the Scottish student teachers reveal that there is a lack of diversity among teacher educators in terms of their expertise and cultural backgrounds. Their exposure to different cultures or to other international elements is largely decided by the availability and expertise of the academics.

In line with their students' views, some of the Scottish academics also noted a lack of expertise among themselves and their colleagues. They had been working on this issue through different means. For example, Carol suggested that:

> … the expertise thing is tied to staffing. We have lots of people expert in certain things, but we don't have lots of people that are experts in the same thing. I think that's why it is important to develop working relationships with colleagues internationally – the development of something can be shared (Carol, academic).

According to Carol, one way for the university to address the lack of expertise is to work on proper staffing. Otherwise, the inclusion of global dimensions within the curriculum is only possible in optional modules run by a specific academic, or some academics, which cannot meet the needs of all student teachers at Southside University. Meanwhile, these optional modules may not be possible if there is staff mobility.

The lack of expertise among academics highlights the need for universities to internationalise teacher education. In Carol's opinion, international collaboration in study abroad programmes or research projects could enable partner universities to share expertise, and to contribute to teacher education in each other's university:

> … it could be that in some sense they are treating us for something and we are treating them for something. Or, things that we can actually

> collaborate on so that it is a stronger input for our students or a stronger input for our staff for trying to do some research projects (Carol, academic).

Every year, Southside University welcomes many visiting scholars from different countries for around one year or less. Daniel had been working closely with visiting scholars, particularly those from China. He appreciated their valuable international contribution to some modules at Southside University:

> We have introduced an optional module in the postgraduate programme that looks at the teaching of Chinese in schools. And, visiting scholars will offer some input as well, because they have expertise in the teaching of languages. So, I think that will be quite beneficial as well. We try to match the expertise of visitors to some of the programmes we teach, but we are in an early stage in the process (Daniel, academic).

Although some of the Scottish academics have recognised this lack of expertise and have been keen to address it, there is still much work to be done in the future. Apart from suggestions about increasing the diversity of expertise among academics through staffing and inviting international visiting scholars, an important point Carol made can serve as a guide to future efforts in training faculty members to become globally minded teacher educators:

> I suppose in some ways it's a shame that we have to think about it, because we should have a global perspective. [It] should just be part of who we are, and what we do, so the idea that we have to put in those terms I suppose is quite interesting (Carol, academic).

Carol's words imply that the internationalisation of teacher education at Southside University should become a way of thinking and doing. It appears that there is still a long way to go for them to fully achieve it.

8.4.2 A lack of expertise in internationalising teacher education among the Chinese academics

A lack of expertise among Chinese academics can be specifically seen in individual approaches to internationalisation. In study abroad programmes, for example, Nanhai University tended to send large groups out to the host countries. From one of the two large groups (16 students in one and 29 in another) sent to the US through the university programmes, one student teacher reported that they seldom felt disoriented because:

> Our group [16 student teachers] normally spoke Mandarin. … We had classes together. We didn't feel we were foreigners (Manlu, postgraduate).

The lack of proper expertise in developing study abroad programmes at Nanhai University runs the risk of establishing overseas learning experiences as “selfcontained island programmes” (Ochoa, 2010, p. 108) in the host country where a large group of student teachers stick together, and are isolated from local people. My findings in Chapter 6 confirm that these isolated international learning experiences are quite disconnected from student teachers’ future practices of teaching (Hovland, 2005), and thus not useful in shaping their development as globally competent teachers.

Without relevant expertise, the academics may not be able to provide their student teachers with appropriate support or guided reflection before, during, and after study abroad experiences. At Nanhai University, there was little focus on how to ensure student teachers a meaningful learning experience through intercultural immersion. As one Chinese academic stressed, it was not necessary to provide pre-departure briefings to student teachers,

> because students can find information about a country easily through

> the highly developed Internet. I do suggest on providing them with pre-departure training for dealing with the procedural steps [concerning logistics] (Jing, academic).

During experiences abroad, the Chinese student teachers were asked to do group discussions on a weekly basis, but these were more in the form of sharing what they had learned from others, rather than guiding them to critically reflect on new cultures or situations:

> Every Thursdays, each group [smaller groups formed out of the large group] had a written summary of what we had learned during the week and we shared it across groups by reading (Manlu, postgraduate).

The accompanying coursework or post-trip tasks were mostly in the form of content reflection rather than critical reflection:

> A lecturer asked me to gather information and pictures from peers in the [Taiwan] programme to make a brochure and a video. We used these reports to promote the learning opportunity to student teachers in junior years. … It's a recollection of our happy memories (Rui, Undergraduate).

These responses indicate that the educative value of the study abroad programmes was not given due attention. Instead, the coursework or tasks were often used to promote the programmes to potential participants. Reflection emphasised by these tasks is quite common in study abroad programmes in other countries and runs the risk of generating "a superficial social reminiscing of the experience" (Buchanan, Major, Harbon, & Kearney, 2017, p. 180). Meanwhile, such tasks focus too much on factual information about education and places of interest in the host countries, which results in another risk: student teachers may see these learning experiences simply as enjoyable trips abroad. As one Chinese student teacher mentioned,

> On Fridays, we went out for fun. We went to Universal Studio Hollywood, Santa Monica, Las Vegas, the Grand Canyon, and the Long Beach. The places we visited the most are the shops (Manlu, postgraduate).

These findings point to the need for the expertise of teacher educators who can set up well-structured study abroad programmes for their students and ensure that they have meaningful learning experiences. However, the lack of expertise in internationalisation has become clear as a result of my data analysis, rather than from any information noted by the Chinese participants. This result indicates that there is a need to bring this issue to the attention of faculty members, particularly academics who are working on study abroad programmes.

8.4.3 The importance of the international experiences and perspectives of the Chinese academics

However, what distinguishes the responses of the Chinese student teacher participants from those of the Scottish participants is that the former mostly referred expertise to the international perspectives and experiences of the academics, rather than intercultural experience or cultural diversity among academics. Many of the Chinese student teacher participants highlighted that the international experiences and perspectives of academics could directly influence how they taught and what they taught:

> I think those lecturers who have been abroad differ from those who haven't in their views towards things, in the content they are teaching and in the teaching methods they are using. … The latter would be more focused on teaching according to the textbooks and have narrow mind-sets (Yinqi, postgraduate).

In particular, the international experiences and perspectives of academics in some modules could help encourage student teachers' interest in engaging in the wider

world. This is evident in the most frequently mentioned module that had an international focus:

> The learning experience in the module of International Comparative Educational Studies motivated me to go there [the US] to have a look and get to know more things. What xxx, our lecturer, shared with us in the classes was something she had directly experienced and deeply understood, which enabled me to go to visit the outside world as well (Yueqing, undergraduate).

Apart from the need for the international perspectives and experiences of the academics, many Chinese student teacher participants mentioned that there was a lack of cultural diversity among academics at Nanhai University. They said that they only had foreign lecturers in the Oral English module, while all other modules, including College English, were run by Chinese lecturers. There were some exceptions in regard to one-off lectures or seminars in which international scholars or teachers were invited to present on educational issues or systems in different countries. The Chinese student teacher participants mentioned that these presentations did not sufficiently expose them to educational issues or systems in other countries; therefore, they expected that "the university can invite more foreign scholars or teachers to teach a module for a longer period of time, maybe a semester or a year, rather than give us just one lecture" (Meng, postgraduate).

The Chinese student teachers' responses raise two issues for the university: one concerns staffing or staff training; the other concerns the need to welcome international visiting scholars on a long-term basis. Most of the Chinese academics acknowledged the importance of the international experiences and perspectives of academics in teacher education. They thought that it was crucial for the university to provide international training and professional development to academics by sending them abroad. Jing used his personal experience as a justification:

> Before I went to the UK [as the lead for a group of Chinese school teachers in a teacher training programme], I was teaching a module of Educational Policies. … I dominated in the 20 classes throughout the semester. After my experience in this programme, I arranged more workshops for the module and focused on students' deep learning of knowledge and skills through small steps of practice. … However, I think there are still very limited opportunities for academics to have overseas training experiences. As a result, only a small number of students can benefit from us (Jing, academic).

Jing's response indicates that in order to enable a wide range of student teachers to benefit from the internationalisation of teacher education, more international training opportunities have to be put in place for academics. However, Cai, another Chinese academic, recognised that limitations might exist in stand-alone training opportunities for academics. In his view, "although around 70% or 80% of our academics have some international experiences, they may not be able to translate these experiences to their work". He suggested that a helpful way of ensuring the systematic internationalisation of teacher education at Nanhai University was to "recruit more lecturers and researchers who have studied abroad on degree courses at a master or doctoral level". This is because prior overseas learning experiences on degree courses can enable the academics "to deeply understand what we need at Nanhai University for internationalisation as well as what our students have to know and what experiences are important for them during their participation in international exchange programmes" (Cai, academic). Cai's view points to the importance of proper staffing in internationalising teacher education.

Results from both research sites underscore the vital role of academics' expertise in the implementation of the internationalisation of teacher education. The Scottish student teacher participants' concerns about the lack of the expertise among the academics were well noted by the Scottish academic participants. Some of the Scottish academics suggested solutions including proper staffing, sharing expertise

through international collaboration, and increasing international input in teacher education courses by inviting international visiting scholars. However, one Scottish academic suggested that more efforts should be made to establish the internationalisation of teacher education as a way of thinking and action for all teacher educators.

In contrast, the lack of expertise of the academics at Nanhai University is more implicitly shown in Chinese student teacher participants' learning experiences which are found to be disconnected from student teachers' future practices of teaching. What the student teachers explicitly stated as being the important expertise of the academics include their international perspectives and experiences. The Chinese student teacher participants' demands for more academics who have international perspectives and experiences and for more international visiting scholars can be partly addressed by the suggestions of the Chinese academic participants about proper staffing and staff training. The findings indicate that there is still room for improvement at Nanhai University in regard to the internationalisation of teacher education.

8.5 Summary

This chapter investigated the factors which influence internationalisation in teacher education at the two universities, based on the views of both academics and student teachers. Although finance and language are two common barriers which prevent many Chinese and Scottish student teachers from participating in study abroad programmes, the different nature of these issues sheds new light on the promotion and organisation of these programmes at the two universities. Further to this, the narrow mind-sets of student teachers, and the overcrowded curriculum, can lead to student teachers' unwillingness to participate in the internationalisation of teacher education, either at home or abroad. My findings also reveal that there is still a lack of expertise among academics in regard to internationalisation. At Southside

University, the academic participants were aware of the lack of academic expertise and the need for proper staffing, for sharing expertise through international collaboration, for increasing international input in teacher education courses, and most importantly, for making internationalisation a way of thinking and action among teacher educators. At Nanhai University, the Chinese student teacher participants' need for more academics with wider international experiences and perspectives, and for more international visiting scholars, were partly acknowledged by the Chinese academics. These findings indicate that there is still room for improvement at the two universities in regard to the internationalisation of teacher education, and at Nanhai University especially.

Chapter 9 Discussion

9.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a discussion about academic participants' understandings of internationalisation in teacher education, student teacher participants' views about their learning experiences, and the role of academics in internationalisation. The first three sections of the chapter discuss academics' understandings of the rationale for the internationalisation of teacher education at their universities. Different understandings of the rationale for internationalisation can result in different discourses of internationalisation. These sections are followed by a discussion about what contributes to student teachers' transformative learning experiences. In particular, the roles of emotions and critical reflection (or premise reflection) are explored, and the relationship between the two is closely examined. The discussion points to a need for academics' expertise, which is further discussed in relation to the influential factors for internationalisation in the next section that follows. The chapter ends with a summary.

9.2 A neocolonial discourse: Westernisation under the guise of internationalisation

In this study, internationalisation is understood as a one-way process from a Chinese perspective. Much attention is paid to the academic rationale for internationalisation at the school level, which seeks educational ideas, practices and research from some Western countries in order to enhance the quality of teacher education in China. At the university level, the rationale is about improving the status of the university by learning ways of doing internationalisation from other countries. What is frequently seen in the Chinese academic participants' views is an emphasis on outward learning from so-called advanced countries in the West. Their

views suggest that Western models of knowledge are seen as an assurance of quality in teacher education, and that Western ways of internationalisation can contribute to the improvement of internationalisation practices for the Chinese university. The Chinese academics' understanding of the internationalisation of teacher education appears to be framed within Stier's (2006) idealism ideology which considers Western academic standards as the norm from which they have to learn. The predominant emphasis on learning from the West for quality assurance in education among the Chinese academic participants indicates the presence of a new form of colonial discourse of internationalisation (Ramírez, 2014).

Within a neocolonial discourse, the relationship between knowledge and power works in the way that "those who have power have control of what is known and the way it is known, and those who have such knowledge have power over those who do not" (Ashcroft et al., 2007, p. 63). Within the neocolonial discourse of internationalisation, power and control are exercised within the centre/periphery dynamic – the models or norms about quality developed by the West (or the centre) dominate over internationalisation in higher education for quality assurance in the rest of the world (or the peripheries) (Altbach, Reisberg, & Rumbley, 2009). The Chinese academics' understanding of internationalisation in teacher education at Nanhai University reinforces this asymmetrical power relationship between the centre and the periphery.

9.2.1 Conceptualising internationalisation as Westernisation

The one-way flow of knowledge from the West to China (the East) rather than vice versa, indicates Westernisation presented under the guise of internationalisation. This prevails in many other universities in Asian countries and Chinese universities in particular. As Mok (2007) argues, the concept of internationalisation in many Chinese universities is taken for granted: Westernisation is often labelled as internationalisation. The process of Westernisation manifests "a relationship of

power, of domination, of varying degrees of a complex hegemony” (Said, 1978, p. 5). The Chinese academic participants’ emphasis on learning educational research and practices, as well as practices of internationalisation from Western developed countries, is reflective of an imbalanced power relationship between the East and the West, which positions Chinese models of education or teacher education as inferior, and Western models as superior. Western dominance in education and knowledge generation typifies a neocolonial discourse of internationalisation in higher education in general in China (R. Yang, 2014). To further understand Chinese academics’ understanding of internationalisation within the neocolonial discourse, it is important to understand the realities within which they are socialised.

The Chinese academics’ belief in, or assumption about, the superiority of Western education is closely associated with the historical past and current educational reforms in China. Historically, China has been greatly influenced by Western cultures by means of territorial concessions and trade routes observed by major world powers, particularly those from the West (Lu, 2009). This outward learning process has accelerated since the opening-up policy of 1978 (L. Wang, 2014). Meanwhile, China’s educational reforms, focusing on catching up with the West since the promotion of modernisation in the late 1970s (J. Li, 2006), suggests that Chinese academics accept “the subaltern perception of self and reality” (Andreotti, 2007b, p. 70), which naturalises Western constructs of the Orient as inferior (Said, 1978).

Within the trend of educational reforms in China, the diffusion of Western education policies is gaining ground, such as the shift from the Chinese teacher-centred approach to the student-centred approach within the National Curriculum Reform (Ministry of Education of China, 2001), and the borrowing of teachers’ performance pay policy from the US (Apple, 2011). The diffusion of policies from the West in China indicates an unequal relationship in regard to knowledge and power, which is a reflection of the historical relationship between the Western powers and China. This unequal relationship is further demonstrated in its mid- and long-term

plan for promoting and enhancing internationalisation in higher education by referring to the advanced educational ideas and practices of the global community (Ministry of Education of China, 2010). This means that the conception of Western education as the norm among the Chinese academic participants is constructed by the authorities, and through national policies, in China. According to Foucault (1980), all discourses demonstrate disciplinary power and reflect socially constructed ideologies and norms, which require that social actors have to act within them. This is especially the case when the discourse of internationalisation in higher education is constructed from the top level: namely, the Chinese government. This may help explain why neocolonial influences permeate the discourse of internationalisation in higher education in general in China (R. Yang, 2014), and in the Chinese academics' understanding of internationalisation in teacher education in particular.

The Chinese academics' conceptualisation of internationalisation as Westernisation is also tied to the neoliberal focus on educational reforms in China. In this study, the Chinese academic participants emphasise the academic rationale for internationalisation, which specifically seeks educational ideas and practices from the West through the internationalisation of teacher education for quality assurance. The aspiration for good quality of teacher education is particularly stressed by the Chinese academic participants in relation to Chinese students' performance in PISA tests, which signify a global trend of standardisation and competitiveness within school education. This emphasis on quality in education is associated with a neoliberal orientation which aims for social efficiency and national competitiveness (Portnoi, 2016). Although neoliberalism is commonplace in educational practices and policies in some Western countries, and although China may not fully embrace all neoliberal values (e.g. decentralisation), the neoliberal logic and policies are used, along with authoritarianism, by the Chinese government to develop graduates for the knowledge economy (Ong, 2007; Tan, 2012). China's unique way of promoting a market economy, along with government vision of a more equitable and harmonious society, has contributed to its significant economic growth in recent

years (McEwan, 2009). From a postcolonial perspective, this is an indication of China's capacity to adapt Western economic models for its own economic development purposes. In the neoliberal logic, the Chinese government highlights the importance of quality-oriented education in developing human capital, and ensuring national competitiveness within the global community (Ministry of Education of China, 2010). According to the neoliberal logic behind quality discourses in school education, the reason for internationalising teacher education at Nanhai University is to educate quality teachers who can prepare human capital for both Shanghai, and for the country as a whole. In this sense, the academic rationale for internationalisation stressed by the Chinese academic participants overlaps with the economic rationale, which looks at the direct or indirect financial return (de Wit, 2002).

As global rankings of universities (e.g. Times Higher Education) have become increasingly popular, countries now aspire to develop the competitiveness and status of their universities (Castro, Woodin, Lundgren, & Byram, 2016; Hazelkorn, 2015; L. Wang, 2014). Hence, quality has become a key element in higher education policies in China and many other countries in the world. Although the quantifiable indicators of quality are contested, outcomes can enable universities to secure a position within international league tables, and ultimately contribute to their international branding and marketing (Knight, 2013), rather than providing guidance regarding the improvement of the quality of teaching and learning (Marginson & Van der Wende, 2007). In this sense, higher education can be seen as an extension of the market, which considers the neoliberal agenda of institutional internationalisation (S. Robertson, Bonal, & Dale, 2012). In China, expressions such as enhancing academic quality, building world-class universities, and developing world-class disciplines through the internationalisation of higher education have gained greater prominence in education policies issued in the past three decades (L. Wang, 2014). These expressions within policies are echoed in the Chinese academics' view that at the institutional level, an important reason for

internationalising teacher education is to improve the status of the university by learning practices of internationalisation from those Western countries which are more experienced in this area.

A neoliberal vision of the Chinese government is reflected in the Chinese academics' understanding and practices of internationalisation in teacher education at Nanhai University. The neoliberal focus on quality assurance and competitiveness reinforces the neocolonial discourse of internationalisation, because the market-oriented reforms and models of best practices in education in the East are still influenced by norms of quality developed by the West (Altbach et al., 2009). Even according to global rankings and in the commercialisation of higher education, countries from the West rule the game (Le Ha, 2013). The discussion above suggests that the Chinese academics' conceptualisation of internationalisation as Westernisation is deeply rooted in Chinese historical, social and economic contexts. This discussion has also brought to the surface the vagueness of the Chinese academic participants in this area, because they have no suggestions about what quality specifically refers to, or what indicators determine the quality of teacher education. Their emphasis on internationalisation for quality assurance in teacher education sounds more like rhetoric than reality.

Although the three Chinese academics predominantly focus on Westward learning attitudes as a reflection of their understanding of internationalisation in teacher education, one of them has acknowledged the potential danger of promoting Westernisation in the name of internationalisation. He cautions against construing internationalisation simply as Westernisation. This Chinese academic's warning demonstrates his awareness of the potential danger of depending on Western dominant views and perspectives. From a postcolonial perspective, this means that Chinese academics can take on agency to resist Western domination in terms of educational ideas and practices. This reflects Bhabha's (1994) idea about the ambivalence of the colonial discourse. The ambivalent nature of the colonial

discourse acknowledges that people from the global South can reverse appropriation when they attempt to adopt the dominant Western system, while also trying to empower themselves by making the system fit into their own culture. One method which the Chinese academic has suggested could be used to reshape the Western dominant discourse is to develop global mind-sets in Chinese student teachers, and encourage them to localise within the Chinese context those educational ideas and practices that they have learned from abroad. A transformation of mind-sets among people from the global South can decolonise Western dominant systems of knowledge (Andreotti, 2007b). The recognition of Westernisation in the process of internationalisation within the Chinese research site suggests an awareness of the danger of the neocolonial discourse of internationalisation in teacher education and the desire to change it through a two-way gaze.

However, the Chinese academic has made no further mention of what a global mind-set is, how it can be developed in student teachers through the internationalisation of teacher education, or how academics can help student teachers interpret, negotiate, and adapt Western models of education in the Chinese or local context. There seems to be a lack of capacity for the Chinese academic to interpolate the dominant Western models of knowledge through transformative agency (Ashcroft, 2001). Overall, this academic's views, along with those of the other two Chinese academics, still focus too much on learning educational ideas and practices from Western developed countries, without thorough consideration of the local context. The apparent resignation towards Western educational ideas and practices suggests a process of inferiorisation, in which the dominated embrace the norms and values of imperial powers or the coloniser while neglecting or doubting those of their own (Fanon, 1965).

9.2.2 Promoting Westernisation in practices

The Chinese academics' understanding of internationalisation within the neocolonial discourse is mirrored in the practices of internationalisation adopted in teacher education at Nanhai University. They tend to establish partnerships with universities from Western developed countries such as the US, the UK, Australia and New Zealand. Every year, the university sends large groups of student teachers to these countries through study abroad programmes, in the hope of them learning educational ideas and practices from these countries. Although exchange programmes are promoted on the Nanhai University website, particular emphasis is placed on the outbound mobility of their student teachers. Other internationalisation practices, such as the introduction of a curriculum from the West, the invitation of international scholars to speak about British and American education systems, and the borrowing of education policies from the US or other Western countries, manifest a neocolonial influence in the internationalisation of teacher education. The reification of educational trends from the West as the global norm, and the diffusion of education policies from the West, are tied to the conceptualisation of Western educational ideas and practices as superior, which inadvertently promotes a new form of colonialism (Crossley & Tikly, 2004; Spring, 2014). However, the rush to import or adopt educational ideas and practices from the West through internationalisation agendas is based on a naïve belief among many Asian scholars that Western ideas and practices can be equally effective within the Asian context (Nguyen, Elliott, Terlouw, & Pilot, 2009). A Westward learning attitude may also cloud the Chinese academics' views about the connection between Western educational ideas and practices and those of their own. This naivety demonstrates a failure to consider the unique cultural and local contexts of Western ideas and practices, and their potential compatibility with Asian cultures and values.

Aside from a focus on learning educational ideas and practices from the West, a new

form of colonialism is also reflected in the promotion of English learning under the name of foreign language learning at Nanhai University. As some Chinese academic participants have proudly mentioned, the popularity of English in Chinese schools and universities is at an unprecedented level. Akin to the views of their students, the Chinese academic participants perceive English learning as a key way of exposing student teachers to a global dimension. The predominant emphasis on learning English in China, and a growing trend of using English as the language of instruction in some disciplines at Chinese universities, may highlight another form of neocolonialism (R. Yang, 2014). For example, English is socially constructed as being important to Chinese people if they hope to gain access to education, employment, promotion and high social and economic status. This runs the risk of "empowering the already powerful and leaving the disadvantaged and powerless further behind" (Y. Guo & Beckett, 2007, p. 118). Meanwhile, many English textbooks for Chinese students, from kindergartens to universities, focus on the cultures and values of English speaking countries. The dominance of Western cultures and values through English as a Foreign Language learning and learning materials can marginalise traditional Chinese cultures and values (Xu & Connelly, 2009).

However, the spread of English in China may not always cause tensions and marginalisation. From a postcolonial perspective, learning a dominant language can empower the dominated or the colonised to use it as a medium of communication, which makes their voices heard, and allows them to bring changes to dominant models of knowledge (Ashcroft 2001). This postcolonial view disagrees with the impossibility for the subaltern to speak for themselves (Spivak, 1993), but stresses that the subaltern, or the dominated, can articulate their voices by using the dominant language to translate or share their own experiences (Ashcroft, 2001). This also suggests that English can empower English learners if it is taught correctly and carefully (Loomba, 2005), particularly for communicative purposes. However, many of the Chinese student teachers at Nanhai University have complained that the College English module and the Oral English module are more examination-

oriented and teacher-led than communication-oriented. As well as this, the Chinese academic participants emphasise learning educational ideas and practices from the West, rather than engaging with them through dialogic and transformative agency by using English as the medium for communication. My findings suggest that the dominated or peripheral regions find it almost impossible to transform “the very terrain of the disciplines” and to develop original and creative models of knowledge (Said, 1993, p. 293) through this one-way process of internationalisation.

9.2.3 Problems in learning through Westernisation

The way the Chinese academic participants understand and promote internationalisation is also mirrored in Chinese student teacher participants’ learning. My findings reveal that most of the Chinese student teachers tended to pay more attention to educational ideas and practices in Western developed countries when talking about what they had learned from experiences that had an intercultural, international and global dimension. Increased knowledge about education in other countries can add to student teachers’ existing frames of reference, and build their repertoire of skills (Kegan, 2009). However, three problems emerge from learning about education in other countries if the Chinese student teachers are not properly guided to re-examine their assumptions and critically reflect on educational differences between different countries, particularly those between the East and the West.

The first problem concerns the Chinese student teachers’ idealisation of educational ideas and practices from other countries. Many of the Chinese student teachers who studied abroad appear to think highly of education in their host countries. They show a great interest in directly incorporating newly learned educational ideas and practices into their future classrooms, without a thorough critical analysis of the contexts from which these ideas and practices have originated, or of the Eastern context within which these new ideas and practices will be implemented. This is

especially prominent in many Chinese student teachers' responses. They tend to favour the more relaxed learning environments and student-centred learning approach of their host countries, and disapprove of the strict structure of education in China. This attitude leads the Chinese student teachers to idealise or generalise what they have learned from their few school visits in the host countries, without appropriate critical reflection. Some other Chinese student teachers who participated in on-campus modules that had a global dimension make more general claims about what they have learned. They think they can make Chinese education more competitive by developing broader views about education in different countries, and by learning from the strengths or merits of education systems within Western developed countries. The idealisation of education in other countries "provides the opportunity for mental colonialism to continue and neocolonialism to triumph" (Nguyen et al., 2009, p. 112) among the Chinese student teacher participants. This result suggests that Chinese academics' understanding and practices of internationalisation within a neocolonial discourse have ultimately impacted on student teachers' learning.

The second problem lies in student teachers' comparisons between education systems in different countries at a superficial level, without a deep understanding of the value of these learning experiences as regards shaping their future roles as teachers. Many of the Chinese student teachers, both those who studied abroad and those who participated in on-campus modules that had a global dimension, tend to report on the dichotomy between the student-centred approach in the West and the teacher-led (or more strictly structured) approach in China. They are generally unable to relate these different approaches to the complexities of social realities in different countries. Even when some of the Chinese student teachers' pre-assumptions about superior education in Western developed countries and inferior education in developing countries were challenged by their direct contact with international visiting scholars from different parts of the world in the seminars or lectures at Nanhai University, they were still unable to critically question their

own pre-assumptions and arrive at new understandings. The main issue present in the Chinese student teacher participants' learning is that they mainly report on some educational ideas and practices within some Western countries, rather than inquiring about the social and cultural contexts of these countries, as shown in Section 7.2.1.

The third problem relates to the lack of multicultural education. Little emphasis is placed on addressing the needs of a multi-ethnic and multicultural society in China through the internationalisation of teacher education. The Chinese student teacher participants have less to say about the cultural and social aspects of learning through the internationalisation of teacher education at home and abroad than their Scottish peers. This may be explained by the predominant focus on learning about education systems, policies and curricula in other countries, as reflected in the Chinese academics' emphasis on the academic rationale for internationalisation. Many of the Scottish academics who were interviewed at Southside University, as well as teacher educators from other Western countries (Inglis, 2009; Joshee, 2009), have advocated multicultural education or diversity education as a response to cultural diversity in their local contexts. However, multicultural education is still largely invisible within Chinese education, and teacher education in particular (Howe & Xu, 2013), although cultural diversity has been complicated by globalisation in the already multi-ethnic society of China, as shown in Section 2.2.2. Instead, China specifically promotes comparative educational studies as a means of developing student teachers' international awareness and understanding in response to the growing need for the encouragement of international understanding in schools (Larsen, 2016; Tye, 2003). The Chinese universities' approach reduces international understanding within teacher education to a simplistic degree: looking at education systems and curricula in different countries through a comparative lens (Manzon, 2013; C. Wang, Dong, & Shibata, 2009), rather than bringing cultural aspects of learning to the fore. Although the Chinese academic participants at Nanhai University have recognised the need to

internationalise teacher education in response to the increasingly international and multicultural features of China – in particular major cities such as Shanghai – they still pay little attention to multicultural education in teacher education.

Further to this, and as mentioned in the above section, the English modules promoted by Nanhai University for student teachers have not been effective in developing their cross-cultural communication skills. Reflecting on the ineffective English-learning experiences of the Chinese student teachers, as well as my own English-learning experiences, I realise that the very limited number of topics within such English modules were also deeply rooted in the West. For example, issues concerning cultural diversity were often situated within an American context, as exemplified by the focus on Martin Luther King Jr's efforts to fight against racial discrimination and segregation, a feature of many English textbooks in China. The promotion of Western or American culture as a global norm to deal with cultural diversity runs the risk of forming neocolonialism, which can also be understood in the newly coined phrase *cultura franca* (Buchanan & Maher, 2018; Buchanan et al., 2017; Buchanan & Widodo, 2016). According to Buchanan and his colleagues, a *cultura franca* is like a *lingua franca*, and has the potential to marginalise other cultures. The promotion of learning English and, as a result, its related cultures, in the name of foreign language education, privileges certain languages, cultures or forms of knowledge over others. The unequal relationship between *a cultura franca* and other cultures reflects a relation of coloniality which describes the former as the subject and the latter as the object (Quijano, 2007). The relation between the subject and the object is "a relation of externality", which blocks "every relation of communication, of interchange of knowledge and of modes of producing knowledge between the cultures" (Quijano, 2007, p. 174). This suggests that Westernisation under the guise of internationalisation cannot allow for equal intercultural communication in the process.

The lack of multicultural education in Chinese teacher education can be a key reason

for Chinese student teacher participants' lack of relevant skills or ability to engage with cultural differences in a critical and appropriate manner. It is reasonable to assume that the academics' lack of emphasis on intercultural learning results in little attention being paid to student teachers' engagement with cultural differences, though the pedagogical skills of some Chinese academics may also be an important reason for student teachers' uncritical way of learning. As a result of these problems, some of the Chinese student teachers regard study abroad experiences as reasons for sightseeing and shopping (as shown in the responses of Rui and Manlu in Section 8.4.2), rather than meaningful experiences that can bring about intercultural learning. This result resonates with the findings of some previous studies in Western contexts, in which student teachers' judgemental or stereotypical views towards others can be reinforced if they mainly see themselves as foreign travellers or tourists in their host countries (Addleman et al., 2014; Santoro, 2014).

The encouragement of, and overemphasis on, learning Western educational ideas and practices in China discourages alternative models of knowledge being put forward by the Chinese academic participants in the internationalisation of teacher education at Nanhai University. They fail to "understand the complexities that diverse ways of knowing create for teaching and learning environments" (Bang & Medin, 2010, p.7). The Westward learning attitude influenced by neocolonial perspectives has blocked the alternative views that different cultures, beyond the West, can offer.

9.3 A new form of imperialism: promoting Scottish teacher education to the rest of the world

At Southside University, Henry, one Scottish academic, also portrays internationalisation as a one-way process, but it is in the opposite direction to the outward-learning process practised at Nanhai University. He sees the high standards for provisional registration in Scotland as barriers to internationalisation (or

globalisation which is used interchangeably in his responses). When considering the high professional requirements of student teachers in Scotland, he is unsure if study abroad experiences can help his students meet the required standards in Scotland. His concern implies a sense of superiority in regard to the quality of teacher education in Scotland. However, these high standards for provisional registration in Scotland are regarded by him as catalysts for internationalising teacher education for international students at Southside University, and for preparing them to become quality teachers suited to working in any part of the world. In this sense, internationalisation is conceptualised by him with a degree of academic arrogance. This view depicts internationalisation as a means of educating the inferior or uncivilised, which is a manifestation of global hegemony, or a new form of imperialism by the West (Stier, 2006).

This new form of imperialism leads to a hierarchical power relationship. The portrayal of Scotland, or Scottish teacher education, as the dominant centre is reflected in Henry's assertion that "we want people [international students] to come out of our course being able to be great teachers anywhere". From a postcolonial perspectives, the spread of a Western (Scottish) model of teacher education to other countries indicates an imposition of imperialist models of knowledge and power on the part of the global North (Rizvi, 2007; Tikly, 2004). This runs the risk of homogenising teacher education in the global community, rather than allowing space for alternative perspectives or ways of doing. Henry's imperialistic views are important to our understanding of why he uses globalisation and internationalisation interchangeably during the interview.

Henry's imperialistic views are embedded in the historical and social contexts of the UK. His belief in the good quality of education in Scotland, and at Southside University, may be associated with the legacy of the British imperial past. One purpose of British education in the 19th and early 20th centuries was to indoctrinate elites within colonised countries and train them to fit into high-ranking positions in

their own countries (Perraton, 2014; Walker, 2014). The residual effect of past imperialism is seen in the ever increasing number of international students studying in the UK, which makes it the second most popular destination in the world (Lomer, 2017) for international students. Britain's imperial past adds to the good reputation of education within the country, which is evident in the "British is best" myth (E. Lazarus & Trahar, 2015, p. 109). Henry's imperialistic views are embedded within this myth, or, more specifically, within the "Scottish is best" myth.

Henry's promotion of Scottish teacher education aims to attract more international students to Southside University. He is mainly concerned about how many international students his university can recruit, and how well the university is selling its teacher education course within the global market. His perceptions about internationalisation in teacher education are framed within an economic rationale, which is in line with the instrumental purpose of internationalisation at the institutional level, a point made by other Scottish academics at Southside University. The economic rationale for the internationalisation of higher education is highly stressed in the UK and other Anglo-Saxon countries (Engel & Siczek, 2017). In the past two decades, international education has often been promoted in market-oriented terms through higher education policies in the UK, as shown in the Prime Minister's Initiative, launched in 1999 and 2006 (The National Archives, 2009). Particularly, the most recent policy encourages the UK government, individual universities, and other suppliers of higher education, to recruit more international students and build "the UK brand globally" by disseminating the good quality of its higher education (BIS, 2013, p. 57). These policies emerge against a background in which universities in many European countries such as the UK, Ireland, and many others, are operating under tight budgets and are being encouraged by their governments to pursue incomes from the global market (Katsarova, 2015). Henry's understanding of internationalisation aligns with what the higher education policies in the UK expect from individual universities.

However, imperialistic views about internationalisation in teacher education appear to neglect the values and commitment which Scottish student teachers are expected to demonstrate in order to teach for social justice and diversity (General Teaching Council for Scotland, 2012b). These views demonstrate that the extent to which Southside University can incorporate global issues into the PGDE course for the home students is quite limited. According to Henry and some PGDE students, global dimensions are only shown in some optional modules or stand-alone lectures. Some PGDE students believe that such dimensions, presented in a limited number of optional modules (e.g. Religions and Moral Education), can develop their pedagogical skills and ability to teach children from culturally diverse backgrounds. They have expressed their readiness to teach culturally diverse children by integrating the children's cultures and religions into their future practices of teaching. The integration of cultural, religious, or ethnic content, into teaching is one of the five dimensions of multicultural education, which include content integration, knowledge construction, prejudice reduction, equity pedagogy, and empowerment of school culture (Banks & Banks, 2010). The integration of children's cultural backgrounds into classroom teaching intersects with one tenet of culturally relevant pedagogy: conception of knowledge (Ladson-Billings, 2009). However, content integration is only one aspect of the complex and multifaceted skillsets of culturally responsive teaching (Bennett, 2012; Santoro, 2009). The limitation of simply incorporating cultures and religions of culturally diverse children into teaching cannot be addressed if the university, and responsible teacher educators like Henry, continue to prioritise the market-oriented discourse of internationalisation.

Both the Chinese academic participants and Henry see internationalisation as a one-way flow of educational ideas and practices to China, or from Scotland to many other places in the world. This one-way process suggests that economic imperatives have become more important than moral ones. Such economic imperatives can further result in Western dominance within the discourse of the internationalisation of teacher education.

9.4 Decolonising internationalisation: internationalisation as a two-way process

The three Scottish academics, Stella, Carol and Daniel, have had relatively more international experiences than Henry, and have run, or have been running modules or programmes with an intercultural, international or global dimension. They avoid imperialistic views or practices when promoting internationalisation within the School of Education at Southside University. In their opinion, internationalisation is a two-way process which brings mutual benefits to both themselves and their partners (partner countries, universities or students). They focus on both what they can learn from, and what they can share with, their partners. This reciprocal learning through internationalisation allows for the equal access to power of all partners, and creates the potential to decolonise internationalisation (Gorski, 2008). From a postcolonial perspective, the two-way process of internationalisation is more linked to justice globalism which rallies against neoliberal globalisation, and advocates equity and social justice among people from both the global North and the global South (Steger, 2013). These justice-oriented views towards internationalisation are reflected in the actions for internationalisation among the three Scottish academics.

In practice, they are keen to build mutually beneficial relationships with all partners involved in internationalisation. They are concerned about the possible reciprocal learning for student teachers during their participation in internationalisation initiatives. The emphasis on intercultural dialogues between Scottish student teachers and international students suggests that international students are not solely treated as readily available resources which Southside University can use to internationalise teacher education. As well as this, most of the Scottish academics carefully consider the needs of their own university, and their partner universities, in the process of internationalisation. Careful consideration about the mutual benefits of internationalisation practices can “lead to important benefits for the public good”,

which “can compound existing economic inequalities favouring the global North” (Trede, Bowles, & Bridges, 2013, p. 445).

Central to the two-way process of internationalisation portrayed by the three Scottish academics is the social and cultural rationale for internationalising teacher education at the school level or individual level. They seek to enrich student teachers’ learning experiences, and to prepare them to become effective teachers for all children, regardless of their cultural and linguistic backgrounds. This means that they focus on developing student teachers’ intercultural capital, or “a personal reservoir of intercultural experiences and skills” (Pöllmann, 2009, pp. 539-540). In this sense, what has driven them and their school to internationalise teacher education is the development of intercultural capital for the public good, rather than increasing the competitiveness of individuals, institutions and nations in the neoliberal sense. This emphasis on the preparation of intercultural capital enables these three Scottish academics to see the potential of different cultural practices for teacher education in an increasingly global and multicultural context. An acknowledgement of the educative value of different cultural practices can allow for alternative ways of knowing, rather than merely promoting certain privileged perspectives or ways of knowing (particularly from the global North) over others (Bang & Medin, 2010).

In addition to this, these three Scottish academics avoid positioning their university or Scotland in general as the privileged producer of knowledge or disseminator of models of teacher education, as Henry does. Instead, they are keen on building intercultural dialogues between their student teachers and those student teachers from, or in different countries, through a diverse range of internationalisation initiatives. They recognise that different cultural norms, or ways of doing things, can be significant to their student teachers’ personal and professional development. For example, they think intercultural dialogues are important, as these dialogues encourage student teachers to understand the cultural capital a child has, and how

they can relate it to children's literacy. They also passionately promote study abroad programmes, because they see the educative potential in providing student teachers with a sense of otherness in host countries, and a better understanding of self and others in an increasingly connected world. What is common in these Scottish academics' understanding and practices of internationalisation is their appreciation for different ways of knowing, and doing, in different countries, and for the essentiality of intercultural dialogues. The acknowledgement of alternative ways of knowing and doing is a major insight of postcolonial theory, which refuses to universalise education at the centre of neoliberal globalisation (Rizvi, 2007). In this sense, the way these Scottish academics understand and engage in internationalisation helps level the playing field and narrow the power divide between the knowledge core and peripheries (Louisy, 2004).

These Scottish academics' understanding and practices of internationalisation are not driven by the market-oriented purpose which is prioritised by many higher education policies in the UK. The knowledge and skills they see as important to the development of student teachers through internationalisation are in line with professional expectations in Scotland. Student teachers in Scotland are expected to be able to respect and value social and cultural diversity, and educate all children for local and global citizenship (General Teaching Council for Scotland, 2012b). This study suggests that these Scottish academics' practices of internationalisation reflect the key interests emphasised by the local professional authority. This means that academics are socialised into their disciplinary community, and therefore, they demonstrate shared values and views towards internationalisation within the discipline (Becher & Trowler, 2001; Leask & Bridge, 2013). However, exceptions still exist, as is the case with Henry, who is more influenced by the neoliberal paradigm predominantly emphasised by Higher Education policies in the UK and at many universities in the world.

The way the three Scottish academics understand and promote internationalisation

can also influence their student teachers' learning experiences. In interview data, the Scottish student teacher participants placed a greater emphasis on cultural learning than their Chinese peers did. In well-structured study abroad programmes, in particular, the Scottish student teacher participants experienced more impactful learning from their interaction with different education systems, cultures and people in the host countries. Like many other international professional experiences promoted by some Western countries (e.g. Major & Santoro, 2016; Parr & Chan, 2015; Santoro, 2014; Scoffham & Barnes, 2009), the study abroad programmes promoted by teacher educators at Southside University also tended to send their student teachers to developing countries, such as China and Malawi. However, their experiences did not reinforce the Scottish student teacher participants' positioning of self as superior and others as inferior or deficient, as has been shown in some previous studies (Major & Santoro, 2016; Santoro, 2014). Instead, their imperialistic views were challenged in their host countries, and they were guided to critically reflect on their challenged assumptions. Consequently, they stopped presenting their own cultures and education systems as the norm, and started to understand how different cultures and social factors inform different ways of doing things. This will be further discussed in Section 9.5, in regard to transformative learning experiences.

The focus on the social and cultural implications of internationalisation redefines what quality means in teacher education. Since cultural diversity has reshaped the landscape of today's education in many parts of the world, internationalisation at home and abroad is increasingly oriented towards the development of quality teachers who demonstrate intercultural competence (Buchanan et al., 2017; Santoro, 2014; Stevick & Brown, 2016). This suggests that more attention needs to be paid to preparing intercultural capital in an educational sense, rather than mainly focusing on developing human capital in a neoliberal sense. What is reassuring is that these three Scottish academics have started to acknowledge the value of alternative ways of knowing, and the importance of intercultural dialogues in the

internationalisation of teacher education. This can contribute significantly to decolonising the neoliberal discourse of internationalisation, which is often dominated by Western models. As well as this, these three Scottish academics' conceptualisation of internationalisation as a two-way learning process holds potential for avoiding "colonial opportunism", which focuses on "utilising the resources of the world" for the educational interests of their own university (Parr & Chan, 2015, p. 50).

9.5 Understanding the process of transformative learning

Findings of this study also suggest that some student teachers, who have struggled with disorienting dilemmas, transformed their problematic frames of reference, and developed empathy for people from different cultural and linguistic backgrounds, show more readiness to become globally competent teachers. These aspects of learning are reflective of transformative learning. According to Mezirow (2009), transformative learning is "the process by which we transform problematic frames of reference (mind-sets, habits of mind, meaning perspectives) – sets of assumption and expectation – to make them more inclusive, discriminating, open, reflective and emotionally able to change" (Mezirow, 2009, p. 92).

These findings provide some valuable information about how student teachers construct and arrive at a new understanding in the process of transformative learning, rather than mainly focusing on learning outcomes. In particular, emotions play an important role in transformative learning, but "little is known about how to effectively engage emotions in practice, particularly in relationship to its counterpart critical reflection, and the role of particular feelings (e.g. anger, shame, happiness)" (Taylor, 2007, p. 188). Through my research findings, some insights can be gained into these relationships.

9.5.1 The role of discomforting emotions and emotional maturity in transformative learning

Emotional maturity is characterised by awareness, control, and empathy (Mezirow, 2012). Generally, the Scottish student teacher participants have experienced many emotional struggles in their host countries. Experiences as cultural outsiders can often place student teachers in unfamiliar environments, and enable them to come into contact with very different cultures, people and practices, which can lead to disorienting dilemmas or cultural disequilibrium (Parr & Chan, 2015). Feelings such as surprise, anxiety, fear, frustration and awkwardness resulting from language barriers, cultural differences and differences in physical appearance are more prominent in many of the Scottish student teachers' day-to-day lives in their host countries than in the Chinese student teacher participants' lived experiences abroad, as shown in Section 6.3. These feelings force them to become consciously aware of their own views, and the views of others (Burkitt, 2014).

The precondition for the awareness of one's own taken-for-granted views, identity and those of others is the recognition of what Malkki (2010) has termed the edge-emotions, or the strong emotions at the edge of someone's comfort zone. Some of the Scottish student teachers experienced a strong level of discomfort and unease when they became the focus of attention of local people, or the cause of local people's discomfort, as demonstrated by the incident of the Malawian baby crying at the sight of the Scottish student teachers in the Malawian village. Some felt out of place when they did not understand certain cultural practices which were carried out in their host countries. In addition, language differences or barriers also resulted in some Scottish student teachers' frustration, awkwardness, or even fear, in their host countries. Similar feelings occurred in some Scottish student teachers when they had experiences as foreign language learners in on-campus modules that had international focuses (e.g. foreign language modules, and the PS module on supporting bilingual learners), and field experiences with children who spoke English

as a second language. The experience and recognition of edge-emotions are essential to pushing many Scottish student teacher participants towards emotional maturity by managing their emotions and adjusting themselves to these new environments. For example, their frustrating experiences as foreigners, or foreign language learners, enabled them to become more aware of the way they spoke English to foreigners or children who had little or no English, and to more effectively control the speed of their speech. This result suggests that discomforting emotions at the edge of student teachers' comfort zones play an important role in "unpack[ing] their cherished views and 'comfort zones' in order to deconstruct the ways in which they have learned to see, feel and act" (Zembylas, 2015, p. 166). In this sense, the discomforting emotions are catalysts for the act of change.

The edge-emotions which many of the Scottish student teachers experienced cannot only activate their awareness of different views and ways of doing things and push them to adjust their views and behaviours, but may also develop their empathy for future students who come from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds. Having been cultural others, or foreign language learners, some Scottish student teachers demonstrate the ability to look at their own identity, and their future role as teachers, from different perspectives. A better understanding of self is the foundational phase from which student teachers can learn to better understand the experiences of their future students, and effectively engage them in classroom teaching and learning (Sleeter & Owuor, 2011). Some of the Scottish student teachers mentioned that they were more able to imagine themselves in culturally and linguistically diverse students' positions, and more capable of understanding their students in regard to the difficulties they might face during their placements in schools. In this sense, the discomforting experiences of being cultural outsiders, or foreign language learners, can enable student teachers to "engage in new affective relations with others" or to develop a growing sense of empathy for others (Zembylas & McGlynn, 2012, p. 45). The developmental process of emotional maturity, from awareness and control to empathy, reveals that some of the Scottish

student teachers have become more inclusive, more open to different cultures and views, and more capable of change, all traits which are characteristic of transformative learning (Mezirow, 2012).

However, not all emotions can contribute to transformative learning. A small number of Chinese student teachers spoke about their feelings in regard to their study abroad experiences in their host countries. Some of them felt happy as foreigners in their host countries, because the local people were very helpful, friendly and welcoming to them. Some others experienced their time there as tourists, because they enjoyed shopping and sightseeing abroad. These happy experiences kept the Chinese student teachers within their comfort zones in their host countries. These positive emotions are more likely to go unnoticed (Mälkki, 2010). This may help explain why the Chinese student teacher participants did not talk much about their feelings in the learning experiences, and why they seldom experienced transformative learning in their host countries.

9.5.2 The role of premise reflection in transformative learning

According to transformative learning theories, the discomforting emotions or disorienting dilemmas discussed above can move learners to the transitional points (Taylor, 2007) or edges of a new understanding of the world (Berger, 2004). Guided reflection is regarded as important to further move learners from transitional points to an arrival at a new understanding. However, not all types of reflection play an equally significant role in transformative learning (Kreber, 2012). In his review of research on transformative learning, Taylor (2007) further points out that there is a lack of discrimination between the three categories of reflection (content, process and premise) developed by Mezirow in empirical research, and their relationships to transformative learning. The following discussion sheds light on how they are linked to transformative learning, and what contributes to premise reflection.

Most on-campus modules or lectures at Nanhai University, and some modules and lectures at Southside University, focus more on introducing educational ideas and practices, as well as religions and cultures in other countries, than on fostering critical thoughts over these issues among student teachers. As a result, student teachers who participated in these modules tend to experience content reflection on what they have learned, rather than premise reflection on why things appear in the way they do. This leads to a high risk of developing superficial views about educational and cultural issues in other countries, as shown in many Chinese and Scottish student teacher participants' claims about integrating these newly learned ideas or cultures into their future classrooms. Further to this, responses from the Chinese student teachers who studied abroad, and the three Scottish student teachers who studied abroad but not through university programmes, still predominantly focus on learning about educational ideas and practices in their host countries. Even though their assumptions were sometimes challenged during their encounters with cultural differences, they made few conscious efforts to critically engage with their views. As a result, some of the Scottish student teachers showed an inability to develop anything more than simplistic views about self and others. Some of the Chinese student teachers formed parochial views towards their Chinese identity, as shown in their sense of pride in being Chinese. Accounts of what the Chinese student teacher participants and the three Scottish student teacher participants have experienced without further questioning largely remain at the level of content reflection which is not central to empowering adult learners to critically reflect on the content for transformation (Kreber, 2012). This result directs us to the importance of providing a discourse for student teachers to disrupt their assumptions and justify new perspectives. Otherwise, it is difficult for them to critically reflect on their own views and the views of others, or to gain transformative insights (Mezirow, 2012).

By contrast, the three Scottish student teachers who were sent to China and Malawi through university programmes experienced more transformative learning than

their other Scottish peers, or any of the Chinese student teachers. This is partly due to the stronger emotions which were triggered by their encounters with very different cultures. The discomforting emotions set "a stage of readiness for change" (Laros, 2017, p. 85). To make change happen, findings about these three Scottish student teachers' learning experiences suggest that process reflection (how they react to their disorienting dilemmas in host countries), and in particular premise reflection (why things appear in the way they do), play a more important role than content reflection (Mezirow, 1990, 2012). As discussed in the above section, some Scottish student teacher participants' progression towards emotional maturity through management of their emotions, and through adjustment to new environments, affirms the importance of process reflection in solving problems. However, process reflection leaves student teachers' assumptions, particularly their challenged views, unquestioned, which cannot allow for transformation (Kreber, 2004).

It is premise reflection that leads student teachers from disorienting dilemmas to an arrival at a new understanding. The three Scottish student teachers who studied abroad through university programmes demonstrated a stronger ability to examine their own feelings, and to question themselves about why things worked differently in Malawi and China. The critical appraisal of their assumptions enabled these Scottish student teachers to transform meaning perspectives, and to develop more informed and justifiable judgements about different cultures and ways of doing things. They did not perceive themselves as superior to others, though they were sent to developing countries and might initially feel privileged to teach others things based on their own perspectives. The "potentially colonist nature" of study abroad programmes (Parr, 2012, p.106) is common in many previous studies in which some Western developed countries sent their student teachers to some developing countries (e.g. Johnson, 2009; Parr, 2012; Santoro & Major, 2012), but it is not present in the study abroad programmes promoted at Southside University. Having participated in study abroad experiences in China and Malawi, these Scottish

student teachers felt that they were more confident and skilful when teaching children from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds during their school placements (see Chapter 6). These student teachers' learning experiences suggest that content reflection and process reflection may extend their existing frames of reference and contribute to their readiness for change, but that "the most personally significant and emotionally exacting transformations involve a critique of previously unexamined premises regarding [themselves]" (Mezirow, 2012, p. 86).

An important contributor to the success of student teachers who have more premise reflection, and who ultimately engage in transformative learning, is the academically accompanying support found in well-structured study abroad programmes. At Southside University, learning tasks were put in place before, during, and after, student teachers' learning experiences through well-structured study abroad programmes. These tasks guided them to critically reflect on their lived experiences abroad. Systematic support alongside the experiences can help adult learners build a firm ground for a new understanding (Berger, 2004). For example, the Scottish student teachers were prepared to be critically aware of cultural differences in the Cultural Awareness module before departure to Malawi. They were further supported to cope with disorienting dilemmas by accompanying assignments and tasks, which were presented to them during, and after, their study abroad experiences. This preparation and accompanying support encouraged student teachers to constantly question themselves in regard to their sense of self as Scottish people, their own ways of thinking, as well as the learning which had shaped their practices. Such support from the university helped sensitise student teachers' inner perspectives, and facilitated their critical reflection upon the disorienting dilemmas they had during their experiences in their host countries. These Scottish student teachers' learning experiences suggest that it is the interplay between the readiness of inner perspectives and the external experiences (particularly in discomforting or stressful situations) that promotes the possibility for transformation (Armold 2017).

Findings from the Chinese site affirm that accompanying tasks can increase student teachers' knowledge about educational ideas and practices in their host countries, but they are arguably limited if they only focus on factual information (McGaha & Linder, 2014). A lack of proper support can be a barrier to transformative learning. Even when some Chinese student teacher participants' expectations or assumptions were challenged in host countries, they were still unable to reflect on why things were different. This is because the student teachers lacked the relevant information and required skills to deal with disorienting dilemmas.

Another key factor that contributes to premise reflection among the Scottish student teachers who studied in China and Malawi is the dialogic relationship with others. As discussed above, premise reflection involves individuals' questioning about assumptions which have been challenged or become problematic. Findings of this study reveal that this questioning process can be effectively facilitated through dialogue with others: these Scottish student teachers engaged in either formal or informal discussions with peers or teachers about their disorienting dilemmas. By collegially making sense of why things which worked in Scotland did not work in Malawi and China, and why people did things so differently in those countries, these Scottish student teachers were able to validate the meaning of their experiences through consensus, or arrive at a new understanding of their learning experiences (Baumgartner, 2012; Mezirow, 2012). However, not all group discussions can lead to transformation. The Chinese student teacher participants who studied in the US had regular discussions with peers, but the sharing of experiences and knowledge through reading group summaries did not prompt them to critically reflect on their own assumptions or old premises. The lack of critique within group discussion fails to challenge peers' assumptions, and thus limits the group's ability to maturely process their learning experiences (Ziegler, Paulus, & Woodside, 2006). This premature process of learning is particularly demonstrated by the formation of some Chinese student teacher participants' simplistic views, or even

misunderstandings, about the host culture.

What has emerged from the above discussion is that premise reflection plays a key role in transformative learning, and that it can be promoted through dialogues in well-structured study abroad programmes. However, people may question if premise reflection and transformative learning can occur among student teachers in learning settings which have global dimensions within the home country. Some insightful ideas can be gained from the ways in which an on-campus module at Southside University fostered premise reflection among student teachers, and initiated changes in their points of view. The professor who was running the PS module deliberately pushed the PGDE student teachers to the edges of their comfort zones by posing difficult questions, as shown in Section 7.3. Oftentimes, the PGDE students felt bewildered and unable to answer these questions, which is characteristic of the growing edge of a new understanding (Berger, 2004). These bewildering or discomforting moments were utilised as important pedagogical entry points through classroom dialogues within the module. Guided reflection on old premises through dialogues between the teacher educator and PGDE students led the latter to a new understanding of self and others, and to a change in their habits of mind, which were originally underpinned by old premises. This critical orientation within teacher education, particularly in learning experiences that have intercultural, international and global dimensions, provide student teachers with "opportunities to see beyond what is obvious and taken for granted" (Santoro, 2017, p. 70).

The successful example of the PS module confirms that when classroom dialogues involve student teachers emotionally, relationally and critically, such dialogues can allow for premise reflection, and ultimately change student teachers' old premises. The PS module, as well as the study abroad experiences at Southside University, suggest that transformative learning is often "socially influenced, shaped, and accountable to others" (Taylor, 2017, p. 25). The important role of dialogues and academically accompanying support in premise reflection provides valuable

information for the design of learning tasks for student teachers within on-campus modules, study abroad programmes, and other learning activities, in order to ensure student teachers' transformative learning experiences and facilitate their development into globally competent teachers.

9.6 Influential factors and academics' expertise in relation to internationalisation

The internationalisation of teacher education is a complex process that involves different stakeholders, such as administrators, academics and student teachers. However, the knowledge, skills and dispositions of teacher educators can play a vital role in the success of the internationalisation of teacher education. Many barriers and challenges emerge from the practices of internationalisation at the two research sites.

On the student teachers' part, financial issues, language barriers, a narrow mind-set, and an overcrowded curriculum, can prevent them from participating in approaches to internationalisation at their universities. As with some other studies (Doyle et al., 2010; Qiao, 2017; Santoro et al., 2016; Souto-Otero et al., 2013), my study has discovered that financial issues are a barrier to many university students and particularly to student teachers' participation in study abroad programmes. However, there is a lack of in-depth inquiry into the nature of financial issues experienced by student teachers from different cultural contexts, and its relationship to the promotion of study abroad programmes in the current literature. While the Chinese academic participants at Nanhai University continue to promote internationalisation as a way of learning about educational ideas and practices from some Western developed countries, they may not be able to convince student teachers and their parents to invest money in study abroad experiences. This is because student teachers can learn these issues through other means, such as the Internet or other on-campus modules. At Southside University, some academics are actively seeking

funding from external means for their student teachers to study abroad. However, they fail to notice that many Scottish student teachers are more willing to participate in study abroad programmes if the opportunities are promoted to them at an early stage, in order that they can make an early plan to save money to help pay for such programmes.

Language as another influential factor for internationalisation is perceived differently by the Chinese and Scottish student teacher participants. For the Chinese student teachers who had the opportunity to study in host countries, mainly in the US, English is still seen as a barrier to their understanding of both the learning content in classrooms at their host universities and to their ability to communicate with local people. As a result, concerns and worries arise about the Chinese student teachers' experiences in the host country. To address these concerns and worries, researchers (Liu & Wei, 2013) suggest that it is important to provide Chinese students with pre-departure training to develop their proficiency in English. However, my research suggests that many years' experience of learning English among Chinese students or student teachers can still fail to prepare proficient English learners. This indicates the importance of promoting English learning for communicative purposes, rather than solely for examinations, and not only through pre-departure preparation sessions, but also at Chinese schools and universities. Language barriers have not been well recognised by the Chinese academics, and they have made little effort to prepare student teachers for communication within a different language and culture. The Chinese academic participants may assume that the high language requirements they set for recruiting participants in study abroad programmes mean that their students can communicate effectively in a different language. In addition, the high language requirements in themselves exclude many student teachers from the opportunity to study abroad, as shown in Section 8.2.2.

However, the lack of knowledge of, or skills in, the target languages of host countries is not perceived to be a barrier to participation in study abroad programmes among

many Scottish student teachers. This is different from a previous study (Santoro et al., 2016), in which Scottish student teachers showed little interest in study abroad programmes, partly due to their concerns about the different languages and cultures of host countries. This could be explained by the fact that the Scottish student teachers in my study possess a taken-for-granted privilege: English is a global language that “others” have to learn in order to communicate with “us”. However, another more explicit reason for this is that many Scottish student teacher participants have experienced life as foreigners, or foreign language learners, in internationalisation abroad or at home, and therefore view the discomforting feelings resulting from language barriers as beneficial to developing their empathy for those who speak little or no English. Especially in the university study abroad programmes and the PS module, transformative learning happens to some Scottish student teachers because they have been equipped with knowledge and skills needed to engage with different cultures and people, and to critically reflect on their taken-for-granted assumptions. The well-structured study abroad programmes and the PS module run by some Scottish academics reflect their expertise in ensuring student teachers’ meaningful learning experiences. The result from Southside University concerning language barriers may highlight some important information for Chinese academics to reconsider in their appraisal of two issues: whether they have to set very high language requirements as major criteria for recruiting potential participants in study abroad programmes, and what they have to include in any pre-departure preparation sessions.

The nature of the curriculum can also prevent many student teachers from participating in internationalisation, if it is not acknowledged by teacher educators. Student teachers from both research sites have already felt the pressure of professional requirements, and the crowded curriculum which is composed of coursework, placements and thesis writing. The constraining time and space in the overcrowded curriculum make it more difficult to include the intercultural, international and global dimensions of teacher education (Longview Foundation,

2008; Mahon, 2010; Schneider, 2003). However, my findings, derived from the views of academics, particularly some Scottish academics, suggest that tensions between an already overcrowded curriculum and student teachers' full commitment to learning experiences that have intercultural, international and global dimensions can be overcome if certain efforts are made by them. For example, some Scottish academic participants are trying to justify the significance of internationalisation in preparing teachers for a global and multicultural context, and make different dimensions an integral part of the curriculum. Some initial efforts by these Scottish academics are shown in their commitment to making these dimensions part of a module or an individual optional module to replace some old learning content, as well as in their commitment to trying to credit student teachers' learning experiences that have these dimensions.

Further to this, the findings of this study also suggest that all these barriers can be reduced if student teachers are globally minded. However, limited understanding of the benefits of internationalisation, and fears resulting from a lack of knowledge about others and others' cultures, remain a major reason for many student teachers' resistance to participation in internationalisation initiatives. The narrow mind-sets of many student teachers indicate an urgent need for universities to internationalise teacher education. This is because learning experiences such as studying abroad can act as facilitators towards the attainment of a global mind-set in student teachers (Colón-Muñiz et al., 2010; Mahon, 2007). To encourage student teachers to constructively participate in the global world, the first step requires teacher educators to recognise their students' worries and accordingly open up their mind-sets at an early stage of their degree courses. Some Scottish academic participants have become aware of this problem, and of their responsibility to expose their students to different cultures, whilst the Chinese academic participants pay little attention to this need to open up student teachers' mind-sets.

Researchers suggest that to broaden student teachers' mind-sets, teacher educators

first need global perspectives and relevant expertise in internationalisation (Olmedo & Harbon, 2010). At Southside University, different understandings among academics in regard to the rationale for internationalisation result in the uneven development of internationalisation within different degree courses. The economic rationale may marginalise many PGDE students from some learning experiences, such as study abroad programmes. In addition to this, it is often the case that optional modules that have global dimensions are mainly dependent on the interest and expertise of individual academics (Smyth, 2013). This means that the sustainability of internationalisation is questioned if there is staff mobility. Some Scottish student teachers who have experienced transformative learning attribute their positive learning outcomes to the knowledge, experience and cultural background of one professor who ran some optional modules, called Cultural Awareness classes for undergraduate student teachers, and the PS module for PGDE students. However, merely running some optional modules conducted by only one or two lecturers is not a sustainable way of promoting the institutional internationalisation of teacher education.

At Nanhai University, the Chinese academics' conceptualisation of internationalisation as Westernisation leads to the replication of educational ideas and practices from the West in the Chinese context. There is a lack of critical perspective and of carefully designed tasks within internationalisation initiatives to focus on the social and cultural aspects of learning. For example, study abroad programmes are often organised in large groups and without rigorous structure, and therefore run the risk of becoming merely tourist trips for some student teachers. Consequently, it is not surprising to see that the Chinese student teachers have not experienced transformative learning within different approaches to internationalisation, and they instead uncritically adopt educational ideas and practices from some Western countries. Compared with the result from Southside University, that from Nanhai University reminds teacher educators of the importance of critical pedagogy and multicultural education, which are largely

neglected within teacher education in China (Howe & Xu, 2013). In order to ensure the quality of teacher education in China, teacher educators need to explore the global community and develop a deeper understanding of what they can learn from others, and what they can share with others through internationalisation (Olmedo & Harbon, 2010), rather than mainly promoting internationalisation as a one-way process of learning educational ideas and practices from others.

9.7 Summary

The discussion reveals that a one-way process of internationalisation in teacher education is market-oriented, and runs the risks of generating a new form of colonialism or Western imperialism. However, a two-way process of internationalisation, which values alternative views and different ways of doing things in different countries or cultures, can deconstruct contemporary constructions of neoliberal globalisation and decolonise the neoliberal discourse of internationalisation. Different understandings of internationalisation among academics shape their different practices of internationalisation, and student teachers' learning experiences. The discussions also reveal that student teachers' experience with discomforting emotions and their progression towards emotional maturity hold the potential for transformative learning. Student teachers' effective engagement with strong emotions relies on critical reflection on their old premises, beyond content and process reflection, and with the support of academically accompanying tasks and dialogic relationships with others. Although some student teachers have developed more readiness to become globally competent teachers by participating in internationalisation abroad or at home, barriers and challenges still exist at the two research sites. My findings have also suggested that academics' expertise is vital if these issues are to be addressed.

Chapter 10 Conclusion

10.1 Introduction

This chapter will first offer a summary of my key findings, according to the two research questions. It is followed by implications and recommendations, then a discussion about the limitations of the study, as well as suggestions for future research. The chapter ends with a summary.

10.2 Key findings

The exploration of the views of both academics and student teachers in the findings chapters (Chapters 5-8) reveals some previously under-researched and unknown aspects. These aspects include the relationship between academics' understanding of internationalisation and student teachers' learning experiences through internationalisation, the nature of the barriers to student teachers' participation in internationalisation, and the nature of the processes which shape student teachers' transformative learning and, ultimately, their readiness to become globally competent teachers. These key findings will be further outlined according to the two research questions.

10.2.1 The first question: how is teacher education internationalised in China and Scotland?

As presented in Chapter 5, internationalisation was understood by academics from both research sites as a broad concept which included internationalisation at home and abroad. The academics' understanding of internationalisation as a cluster of approaches indicates that their views are different from the predominant misconception put forward in many previous studies which characterised

internationalisation as a synonym for a specific strategy or a study abroad programme (de Wit, 2016).

However, academics from both universities held very different views about the rationale for internationalisation, which could form very different discourses of internationalisation (see findings in Chapter 5 and discussions in Chapter 9). The internationalisation of teacher education at Nanhai University was mainly driven by the academic rationale which focused on learning educational perspectives and practices from "internationally advanced countries" in order to ensure the quality of education in China. This one-way process of learning from Western developed countries reflects a neocolonial discourse of internationalisation in higher education in China (R. Yang, 2014). The overemphasis on the academic rationale for internationalisation within the neocolonial discourse did not sufficiently acknowledge multicultural education within teacher education at Nanhai University, and consequently failed to address the need for globally competent teachers in the increasingly multicultural classrooms of China and the connected world.

At Southside University, internationalisation in teacher education was mainly market-driven at the institutional level, though the social and cultural rationale was more valued at the school level or individual level. However, views also varied among individual academics. One academic (Henry) portrayed internationalisation as a one-way process, which focused on recruiting more international students to learn from Scotland. His idealistic views about the good quality of teacher education in Scotland helped to justify his goal of promoting PGDE courses to the rest of the world. This aligns with the economic rationale for internationalisation at the institutional level, and reflects Western cultural imperialism. Three other Scottish academics, who were more concerned about the social and cultural rationale, embraced alternative ways of knowing in different cultures or countries and acknowledged the importance of intercultural dialogues in the internationalisation of teacher education. Consistent with their understanding, these academics

promoted internationalisation as a two-way process, in which all partners involved could learn from each other and benefit from the process. This two-way process of internationalisation allows for the equal access to power of all partners, which holds potential for decolonising internationalisation within the Western dominant discourse.

In practice, barriers to student teachers' participation in internationalisation, and the lack of expertise of academics, were inhibiting factors for internationalisation, as described in Chapter 8 and discussed in Chapter 9. Finance and language are two common barriers that prevent many Chinese and Scottish student teachers from participating in study abroad programmes (Qiao, 2017; Santoro et al., 2016), but these issues highlight different characteristics among student teachers from the two national contexts discussed in this study. Moreover, internationalisation, both at home and abroad, cannot be successfully carried out if student teachers are unwilling to participate in it because of the overcrowded curriculum or their own narrow mind-sets. Some Scottish academic participants acknowledged that they were responsible for opening up student teachers' mind-sets, and made initial efforts to include global dimensions as an integral part of the curriculum. However, more work needs to be done at both universities, and particularly at Nanhai University, to systematically develop internationalisation within teacher education courses.

What is lacking at the two universities, however, is expertise among academics in regard to internationalisation. At Southside University, academics' differing views in regard to the rationale for internationalisation resulted in the uneven development of internationalisation within different degree courses. Moreover, on-campus modules that had global dimensions depended heavily on the interest and expertise of only one or two academics. There is still a need for more cultural diversity and richer expertise in internationalisation among the Scottish academics. At Nanhai University, the less impactful learning experiences which many Chinese student

teachers encountered also highlight the need for academics who have more international experiences and perspectives, and for more international visiting scholars. Overall, there is still room for improvement at both of universities as regards their efforts to internationalise teacher education.

10.2.2 The second question: how can internationalisation shape student teachers' development as globally competent teachers in China and Scotland?

The key findings in Chapters 6 and 7, as well as discussions made in Chapter 9, reveal that student teachers' learning experiences are closely associated with academics' understandings of internationalisation. Specifically, the Chinese student teacher participants' focus on learning educational ideas and practices in other countries reflects the neocolonial discourse, as demonstrated in the Chinese academics' conceptualisation and practices of internationalisation. Many Scottish student teacher participants' social and cultural aspects of learning align with the emphasis which many of the Scottish academics placed on the social and cultural rationale for internationalisation. Learning experiences within different discourses have led to a varying degree of student teachers' readiness to become globally competent teachers.

Learning opportunities that trigger strong emotions among student teachers contribute to the development of their emotional maturity and their empathy for others in cross-cultural communication. Many of the Scottish student teachers' encounters with remarkable differences in cultures, physical appearances and languages as cultural outsiders, or foreign language learners, led to strong emotions, such as frustration, anxiety, shame, or fear. Their developmental process of emotional maturity, from awareness and control of strong emotions to empathy, was an indication of transformative learning, which contributed to their readiness to become cross-cultural communicators or educators. However, many Chinese student teacher participants' experiences as "happy foreigners" in study abroad

programmes or as English language learners within unchallenging English modules allowed them to remain within their comfort zones and ultimately failed to trigger their self-awareness and develop their empathy for others in cross-cultural communication.

Premise reflection, or critical reflection, on disorienting experiences, is key to transforming student teachers' old premises, and arriving at a new understanding of self and others. Academically accompanying support, and dialogic relationships in some well-structured learning activities that have global dimensions, can lead to more premise reflection than content and process reflection among student teachers. Some Scottish student teacher participants who participated in university study abroad programmes, or the PS module, experienced more premise reflection, and therefore engaged more deeply and critically with their feelings and beliefs than the other Scottish student teacher participants or any of the Chinese student teacher participants. The former therefore demonstrated more readiness to become globally competent teachers, as shown in their positive attitudes towards children from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds, and their self-efficacy in providing supportive and responsive teaching to these children. Although a student teacher's ethnic minority background is also a valuable asset that can contribute to their readiness for working in a global and multicultural context, further investigation in relation to the ethnicity of student teachers is still required.

Student teachers whose learning remained at content reflection and process reflection were less prepared for working in a global and multicultural context. Study abroad programmes provided by external means, and some modules that had global dimensions, increased many Scottish student teacher participants' content knowledge of education and cultures in other countries, and provoked their conscious efforts to cope with their disruptive moments. Similarly, the Chinese student teacher participants predominantly focused on content reflection about educational ideas and practices that they had learned from Western developed

countries, and tended to idealise Western education systems by uncritically assimilating these newly learned educational ideas and methods into their future teaching practices. Both content reflection and process reflection, without further critical efforts, could leave assumptions unchallenged, and therefore could not develop these Scottish student teachers and Chinese student teachers' confidence and self-efficacy when teaching global issues or sensitive topics to children.

10.3 Implications and Recommendations

The in-depth study of the two cases suggests the complexity and particularity of the internationalisation of teacher education within each institutional context. To deepen institutional internationalisation in teacher education, more communication is needed between academics from different national contexts, as well as between different stakeholders within the same national and institutional contexts. More coordinated efforts are also required to develop responsive strategies for future actions relating to internationalisation in teacher education.

10.3.1 Recommendations for international collaboration and communication

A comparison of the different understandings and practices of internationalisation at the two universities suggests the importance of international collaboration and communication. My findings have clearly shown that neo-colonialism, or neoimperialism, prevails within the discourse of internationalisation in teacher education as long as emphasis continues to be placed upon the direct or indirect economic income of the university or of the country. To disrupt the neocolonial or neoimperial discourse driven by various neoliberal ideas, it is important to promote internationalisation through international collaboration, rather than through the assistance or provision of educational models from the global North to the global South (Ramírez, 2014). The social and cultural rationale for internationalisation can provide some insightful ideas. Key to the cultural and social rationale is the

acknowledgement of alternative educational models, cultural norms and social values within different national contexts. This necessitates international collaboration in the preparation of globally competent teachers, as is emphasised in the reciprocal learning approach to internationalisation adopted by some of the Scottish academics. This two-way process of internationalisation acknowledges the public good, and particularly, the mutual benefits to partner universities or to student teachers studying at partner universities. International collaboration in internationalisation practices can help redress the unequal power relationship between the East and the West.

However, to make international collaboration occur in the internationalisation of teacher education, academics who are working in this field need to change their views. For the Chinese setting, the presence of an English language only pedagogy and mentality in China, and in many other Asian countries (Singh, 2011), has to be shifted towards an attitude of knowledge exchange: applying English as a medium of communication, and resisting the possibility of being assimilated by the colonial discourse of education (Ashcroft, 2001). The Chinese academics have to take an active role within the global academic community and share their own rich cultures and stories with others. In particular, the peace-loving tradition emphasised by Confucian perspectives can help address issues concerning cultural conflicts and sustainable development in many countries in the world. For example, the Confucian belief in "unity without uniformity" (he'erbutong; 和而不同), or harmony without sameness, delivers an inclusive humanism (Niu & Liu, 2016, p. 276). It embraces cultural diversity, and acknowledges plural forms of life in the world, rather than eliminating difference.

For both Chinese and Scottish settings, it is important for academics to change how they define the quality of education, or teacher education, and how they define world-class universities. Some researchers have expressed the idea that a university which focuses on developing students' intercultural competence in a long-term

educational sense can ultimately become a world-leading university (Castro et al., 2016). For this change to happen, communication about related internationalisation research and practices is needed among academics across national contexts, in order that they can reflect, explore, and develop different ways of interpreting teacher education, in accordance with global and local needs, and can promote internationalisation as a reciprocal process. By doing so, West-to-East and East-to-West flows of knowledge models and cultures can be incorporated in an equal and sustainable manner.

10.3.2 Intelligent internationalisation

The success and sustainability of internationalisation in teacher education require the commitment of academics, as well as institutional leaders (and administrators), researchers and policy-makers. According to Rumbley (2015), the thoughtful alliance between all stakeholders, including practitioners, researchers and policymakers, is intelligent internationalisation. Coordination between different stakeholders depends on effective communication between them.

In the Chinese setting, global education has shaped changes in the national curriculum for school education, with emphases on education for international awareness and understanding (Larsen, 2016), and on developing the core competence of students in terms of their openness to global issues, and their appreciation for cultural differences and effectiveness in cross-cultural communication in an increasingly globalised world (The Core Competence Research Team, 2016). However, teacher education still focuses on promoting comparative educational studies (C. Wang et al., 2009), and on projecting teacher education towards an international awareness and understanding in some initial practical efforts (Tye, 2004). In China, intercultural, international and global dimensions have not been systematically integrated into the national Curriculum Standards for Teacher Education. This suggests that more communication is needed between basic

education policymakers and teacher education policymakers, in order that responsive policies concerning teacher education can be put in place. This greater investment in communication could be further enhanced by fostering dialogue between policymakers and practitioners across international boundaries, for example, between colleagues in Scotland and colleagues in China, about their understandings of internationalisation and globalisation.

Through explicit instructions about internationalisation in policies, well-informed and responsive strategies for internationalisation in the Chinese context can be ensured. This is because higher education in China is highly centralised, despite the fact that more autonomy has been granted to universities in recent years. Further to this, effective communication between practitioners and policymakers is required from a bottom-up approach. Research centres concerned with international and comparative educational studies are flourishing at many Chinese universities, especially in those specialising in teacher education. They can serve as important venues for producing and disseminating research results and knowledge about internationalisation in teacher education at home and abroad. This can not only move practitioners beyond rhetoric, but can also help institutional leaders and policymakers to work out more responsive policies and strategies.

In the Scottish setting, there is an explicit professional expectation of teachers concerning teaching for cultural diversity and global citizenship (General Teaching Council for Scotland, 2012a), but these plans cannot be fully actualised in practice if opposing values or tensions arise in situations where academics are working between two professional areas (i.e. higher education and schools). To address tensions between different values in internationalisation, more conversations between stakeholders from different departmental levels and between academics at the school level have to take place if they are to clarify priorities and practices. In particular, it is important to make clear what knowledge, dispositions and skills are required of their student teachers according to professional requirements.

Moreover, intelligent internationalisation cannot be possible if some practical issues are not addressed. Some on-campus modules or learning activities exist in a stand-alone manner and cannot be further continued at the two universities because of the lack of expertise as a result of academic mobility, or because of the unavailability of, or heavy workload of, the academics. Institutional support for academics in the form of more training opportunities, financial rewards, and time, is required. However, my findings have also suggested that it is more important to systematically promote internationalisation as an integral part of teacher education, and as a way of thinking and doing among academics. Some researchers have suggested that to make internationalisation an integral part of the curriculum, approaches to internationalisation should move from market-driven activities to educational ones (Castro et al., 2016). However, intelligent internationalisation also requires proper staffing. Proper staffing can be achieved through the recruitment of teacher educators who reflect cultural diversity, who are globally minded, and who have rich expertise in internationalisation practices and research.

Intelligent internationalisation should also involve better communication between practitioners and student teachers. This kind of communication can enable the former to be well informed about practical issues and the nature of learning experiences within the internationalisation of teacher education. However, communication should not be restricted to end-of-programme or end-of-experience evaluation. Communication between practitioners and student teachers should be an ongoing process which is organised before, during, and after, student teachers' participation in learning experiences that have an intercultural, international or global dimension. If practitioners are well aware of student teachers' concerns and worries (e.g. financial issues, language barriers, overcrowded curricula or fear of cultural differences), more responsive strategies can be put in place in order to organise and promote these learning opportunities successfully. As well as this, insights can also be gained into the nature of transformative learning through

communication, which can be further applied within other modules or learning activities in order to benefit more student teachers.

10.3.3 Curriculum and pedagogy

Internationalisation influenced by a neoliberal logic reduces the quality of education to some quantifiable indicators or targets which ignore how curriculum and pedagogy that are found to be useful in some learning activities can be further applied to benefit more student teachers (Tikly, 2004). The success of some student teachers' transformative learning experiences, as shown in examples described in this study, suggests that internationalisation can pedagogically fit within teacher education.

Multicultural education, as an important part of internationalisation, should be integrated into teacher education when preparing culturally responsive teachers. Multicultural education can help student teachers take into account children's characteristics, such as race, ethnicity, culture and language in teaching and allow them to function effectively and properly across different cultures (Banks & Banks, 2010). Since multicultural education is ever more important for an increasingly global and multicultural context, and is observed to be valuable in this study, it is clear that it should not be limited to a small number of student teachers as part of pre-departure briefing sessions in study abroad programmes, or as an optional module. It should be widely promoted to all student teachers. This is especially true in the Chinese context where the social and cultural aspects of learning are largely neglected. What makes the situation worse is the total absence of these aspects of learning within policies of teacher education in China (Howe & Xu, 2013). This suggests that it is time to incorporate multicultural education into teacher education policies and curricula, particularly in China, in order that student teachers have the ability to discuss cultural differences and to effectively engage with them.

Further to this, the pedagogy of discomfort has to be considered in teacher education if it aims to prepare globally competent teachers for multicultural classrooms. As an educational approach, the pedagogy of discomfort is often used to address issues concerning cultural diversity in schools (Zembylas, 2010), and is based on the assumption that discomforting feelings are crucial to "challenging dominant beliefs, social habits and normative practices" (Zembylas, 2015, p. 163). Findings in this study affirm the important role of the pedagogy of discomfort in the internationalisation of teacher education. This suggests that teacher education ought to help student teachers understand the rich points of learning afforded by discomforting emotions, and provide them with opportunities to effectively engage with these emotions in practice. However, it should be noted that the experience of discomforting emotions is not always capable of transforming students' problematic frames of reference, which may also raise ethical concerns. Students may experience moments of enormous vulnerability and suffering when their emotional stances are destabilised or denaturalised (Zembylas & Boler, 2003). For example, if student teachers are pushed too far away from their comfort zone, they may experience an extremely high level of discomfort, such as feelings of anger, disappointment or grief, and therefore may become unable to cope with these strong emotions or become inclined to resist participating in learning experiences (Macdonald, 2013).

The ethical and strategic response to potential ethical violence (e.g. suffering and pain) in relation to the pedagogy of discomfort is to help student teachers and teacher educators to understand "the ethical dimensions of social existence" which suggests that we are all inescapably dependent on others in society and that it is important to embrace the vulnerable and ambiguous nature of self (Zembylas, 2015, p. 170). This requires the two universities studied, and perhaps others, to carefully consider the pedagogy of discomfort within the design and organisation of different approaches to internationalisation. For example, pedagogically and ethically appropriate tasks or learning activities need to be put in place before, during, and

after, student teachers' study abroad experiences. These learning activities should not only focus on challenging student teachers' pre-assumptions which are shaped by their lived experiences and cultural values, but should also have the aim of encouraging them to be more culturally aware of their relationship with others and willing to "inhabit a more ambiguous and flexible sense of self" (Boler, 1999, p. 170). These learning activities are arguably useful for increasing student teachers' readiness for engagement with difference and discomfort, because they have already been moved to their "comforting trajectory" (Zembylas & Boler, 2003, p. 129).

This also requires the knowledge and skills of teacher educators. They need to understand the importance of moving student teachers out of their comfort zones within host countries, rather than sending large groups of student teachers abroad and keeping them together in a self-contained island. As this study has suggested, it is important to strategically place student teachers in discomforting situations, for example as cultural outsiders or foreign language learners, so that they can engage with a sense of otherness, and de-centre themselves by learning from and with others. Since not all student teachers can gain access to study abroad opportunities, it is essential for teacher educators to utilise the pedagogy of discomfort when designing learning materials and tasks in alternative approaches to internationalisation. When incorporating the pedagogy of discomfort into practice, teacher educators should carefully consider their ethical responsibilities. They need to always consider how far they can push student teachers out of their comfort zones. They must also be aware of how to establish a supportive or safe learning space that guides student teachers towards critically engaging with their problematic frames of reference and discomforting emotions, in order to realise the transformative potential of the pedagogy of discomfort (Zembylas, 2015). This also means that teacher educators should be able to transform student teachers' resistance (when it is present) into a potential precursor for new learning. However, they should also understand that a safe learning space does not mean a comfortable

space without challenges. A safe space means that teacher educators are able to implement an ethic of caring and empathy (Zembylas & McGlynn, 2012) and "build a constructive point of departure to navigate through and transform these [troubled] knowledges and [discomforting] emotions" (Zembylas, 2015, p. 172). This, however, highlights the importance of institutional support and professional training for teacher educators if they are to properly apply the pedagogy of discomfort to the internationalisation of teacher education or teacher education in general.

Another recommendation is that critical pedagogy should be incorporated into internationalisation initiatives to address the simplistic way of preparing teachers for a global and multicultural context. If we are to ensure a critical orientation in teacher preparation, teacher educators need to help their student teachers to delve deeper into the content of learning, and examine their own assumptions or stereotypical views about people from, or in, different countries. In particular, teacher educators should have the skills to guide student teachers to critically reflect on "how race, culture, and social class shape students' thinking, learning, and various understandings of the world" (Howard, 2003, p. 197).

This means that teacher educators themselves must be willing to change their pedagogical skills, and be aware of student teachers' readiness for change in the learning process. Some successful examples of critical pedagogy in this study have provided valuable insight into student teachers' transformative learning experiences in, but it is still not beneficial to rely on one or even a couple of teacher educators. In order to foster transformation among student teachers, all teacher educators should be critically aware of their own frames of reference, and how they influence their own practice (Taylor, 2017), rather than reducing their teaching to merely imparting the characteristics of certain education systems, cultures, or religions to student teachers. Given that multicultural education, the discomfort pedagogy, and critical pedagogy afforded by some approaches to internationalisation have the potential for student teachers' development into globally competent teachers, the

extension of their benefits to all student teachers in other learning contexts is a worthwhile aspiration.

10.4 Limitations of the study and recommendations for future research

It may be argued that this study is limited as a result of its small sample of academic and student teacher participants at the two case-study universities. Findings from the small sample size cannot be generalised to larger groups of student teachers, or to faculty members from the two institutional and national contexts. The academic participants in my research are the direct implementers of institutional internationalisation, and their understandings of internationalisation may differ from their colleagues, who have different work responsibilities and priorities. The exclusion of other academics, and of those at administrative level, can hardly provide a comprehensive view of the understandings, tensions and possibilities in the internationalisation of teacher education within each institutional context. Without a comprehensive view, it can be difficult for us to discover why academics understand and practice internationalisation in certain ways within certain universities, though my findings have referred to some past historical and social realities within the two national settings. This suggests the importance of including other faculty members in future research, which would offer a broader view of the opportunities and challenges facing institutional internationalisation in teacher education.

Further to these concerns, there is still a lack of diversity among the sample of student teachers in terms of their ethnicity, and of the range of learning activities in which they have participated. All the Chinese student teachers are from the Han majority, the most dominant of the 56 ethnic groups in China, while the majority of the Scottish student teachers are white Scottish, with only two having different cultural and ethnic roots. Although the two Scottish student teachers who are from

culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds have shown some readiness in terms of dealing with cultural diversity, the lack of a greater degree of ethnic diversity within the sample prevents the researcher from gaining a deeper understanding of the different views among student teachers from different ethnic backgrounds. The lack of ethnic diversity also negatively affects the ability of the researcher to understand the relationship between characteristics of their ethnic backgrounds, and their degrees of readiness for teaching in a global and multicultural context. These limitations highlight the potential for future research, and the formation of a more well thought out plan in regard to the recruitment of student teacher participants.

The exploration of the impact on student teachers of different approaches to internationalisation relies on student teachers' reflective views about their learning experiences. Due to the scope of the research, there is no way to ascertain if the self-reported changes in student teachers are generated by their participation in the approaches. There is little information about how student teachers progress over time. Although my research has captured, from student teachers' voices, some valuable information about how student teachers progress towards emotional maturity and arrive at a new understanding of self, and others, by interacting with different education systems, cultures and people, there is no further evidence to support their claims as to the extent of their development. A better understanding could be provided if future research includes the views of student teachers before, and during, their participation in learning experiences that have an intercultural, international or global dimension. Further to this, a follow-up investigation about the ways in which student teachers' learning experiences shape their practices is also needed, although some insights have been gained from my study concerning their readiness for teaching culturally and linguistically diverse children in placement schools.

Internationalisation in teacher education can be understood and practiced

differently in different universities and regions, as shown in my research. This may render this study limited in generalisation. However, generalisation is not the intention of this study. In particular, the in-depth nature of the case-study approach makes it impossible for me to have a wide coverage of universities either from China and Scotland or from many other countries, because the width may compromise the depth of the investigation in a single PhD project. Nevertheless, my holistic exploration of the different approaches to internationalisation within the same institutional context, and across the two different institutional contexts, can serve as the basis for comparative analysis, and therefore provide some important insights into the different types of impact afforded by different approaches. Future research teams can develop similar research in both depth and width by including more universities across many different countries.

10.5 Summary

The case-study approach has made connections between the conceptual understanding of internationalisation in teacher education, and practices and student teachers' learning. This study has revealed that different discourses of internationalisation in teacher education perpetuate in both China and Scotland. This exploration makes the voices of a non-Western context heard in this field. However, the different voices from both countries suggest that more international collaboration and communication is needed for the success and sustainability of internationalisation in teacher education. The academics' understandings of internationalisation are reflected in their practices and student teachers' learning experiences. This fills a gap where there has been little research into the internationalisation of teacher education based on academics' views, as reflected in the current body of literature. Moreover, the exploration of the impact on student teachers of different approaches to internationalisation provides a complete view of what appears to work well, and what does not, within each institutional context. In addition to this, nuanced understandings of the developmental process of student

teachers shed light on the key factors which contribute to transformative learning, and to student teachers' readiness to become globally competent teachers. These contributing factors have pedagogical implications for teacher education. They can be further incorporated into the curriculum in order to benefit all student teachers, rather than being restricted solely to those who can gain access to certain approaches to internationalisation, such as study abroad programmes.

References

Addleman, R. A., Nava, R. C., Cevallos, T., Brazo, C. J., & Dixon, K. (2014). Preparing teacher candidates to serve students from diverse backgrounds: Triggering transformative learning through short-term cultural immersion. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 43*, 189-200.

Almarza, D. J. (2005). Connecting multicultural education theories with practice: A case study of an intervention course using the realistic approach in teacher education. *Bilingual Research Journal, 29*(3), 527-539.

Altbach, P. G., & Knight, J. (2007). The internationalization of higher education: Motivations and realities. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 11*(3-4), 290-305.

Altbach, P. G., Reisberg, L., & Rumbley, L. E. (2009). Trends in global higher education: Tracking an academic revolution. In: Boston College Center for International Higher Education Chestnut Hill, MA.

Andreotti, V. (2007a). *The contributions of postcolonial theory to development education*: DEA.

Andreotti, V. (2007b). An ethical engagement with the other: Spivak's ideas on education. *Critical literacy: Theories and practices, 1*(1), 69-79.

Andreotti, V. (2010). Postcolonial and post-critical 'global citizenship education'. *Education and social change: Connecting local and global perspectives*, 238-250.

Angen, M. J. (2000). Evaluating interpretive inquiry: Reviewing the validity debate and opening the dialogue. *Qualitative health research, 10*(3), 378-395.

Appadurai, A. (1990). Disjuncture and difference in the global cultural economy. *Theory, culture & society, 7*(2), 295-310.

Appadurai, A. (2000). Grassroots globalization and the research imagination. *Public culture, 12*(1), 1-19.

Apple, M. W. (2011). Global crises, social justice, and teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education, 62*(2), 222-234.

Apple, M. W., Kenway, J., & Singh, M. (2005). *Globalizing education: Policies, pedagogies, & politics* (Vol. 280): Peter Lang.

Arum, S., & Van de Water, J. (1992). The need for a definition of international education in US universities. *Bridges to the futures: Strategies for internationalizing higher education*, 191-203.

Ashcroft, B. (2001). *Post-colonial transformation*. London Routledge.

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (2007). *Post-colonial studies: The key concepts*: Routledge.

Aydarova, E., & Marquardt, S. K. (2016). *The Global Imperative for Teacher Education: Opportunities for Comparative and International Education.* Paper presented at the FIRE: Forum for International Research in Education.

Ayres, L. (2008). Semi-structured interview. In *The SAGE encyclopedia of qualitative research methods* (pp. 811-812).

Bang, M., & Medin, D. (2010). Cultural processes in science education: Supporting the navigation of multiple epistemologies. *Science Education, 94*(6), 1008-1026.

Banks, J. A. (2015). *Cultural diversity and education*: Routledge.

Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. M. (2010). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*: John Wiley & Sons.

Barnes, C. J. (2006). Preparing preservice teachers to teach in a culturally responsive way. *Negro Educational Review, 57*(1/2), 85.

Barrie, S. C. (2004). A research‐based approach to generic graduate attributes policy. *Higher Education Research & Development, 23*(3), 261-275.

Bartell, M. (2003). Internationalization of universities: A university culture-based framework. *Higher Education, 45*(1), 43-70.

Baumgartner, L. M. (2012). Mezirow's theory of transformative learning from 1975 to present. *The handbook of transformative learning: Theory, research, and practice*, 37-55.

Baxter, J., & Eyles, J. (1997). Evaluating qualitative research in social geography: establishing 'rigour'in interview analysis. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, 22*(4), 505-525.

Becher, T., & Trowler, P. (2001). *Academic tribes and territories: Intellectual enquiry and the culture of disciplines*: McGraw-Hill Education (UK).

Beck, U. (2015). *What is globalization?* : John Wiley & Sons.

Bennett, S. V. (2012). Effective facets of a field experience that contributed to eight preservice teachers' developing understandings about culturally responsive teaching. *Urban Education*, 0042085912452155.

Benson, P., Barkhuizen, G., Bodycott, P., & Brown, J. (2012). Study abroad and the development of second language identities. *Applied Linguistics Review, 3*(1), 173-193.

Berger, J. G. (2004). Dancing on the threshold of meaning: Recognizing and understanding the growing edge. *Journal of Transformative Education, 2*(4), 336-351.

Bhabha, H. (1994). *The location of culture*. London: Routledge.

BIS. (2013). *International education: Global growth and prosperity*. Retrieved from https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/340600/bis-13-1081-international-education-global-growth-and-prosperity-revised.pdf.

Boler, M. (1999). *Feeling power: Emotions and education*. New York: Routledge.

Bourn, D. (2011). From internationalisation to global perspectives. *Higher Education Research & Development, 30*(5), 559-571.

Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). *Transforming qualitative information: Thematic analysis and code development*:

Sage.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology, 3*(2), 77-101.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2013). *Successful qualitative research: A practical guide for beginners*: Sage.

Brinkmann, S. (2013). *Qualitative interviewing*: Oxford University Press.

Brislin, R. W. (1970). Back-translation for cross-cultural research. *Journal of cross-cultural psychology, 1*(3), 185-216.

Brown, E. J. (2010). The role of questioning and dialogue in teaching complex global issues: perceptions of student-teachers in England. *International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning, 3*(2), 21-37.

Brown, M. (2008). Comfort zone: Model or metaphor?

Bryman, A. (2012). *Social research methods*: Oxford university press.

Buchanan, J., & Maher, D. (2018). The 'foreign' language teacher: negotiating the culture of a school when unfamiliar with the language of instruction. *Teacher Development*, 1-18.

Buchanan, J., Major, J., Harbon, L., & Kearney, S. (2017). Preparing teachers through international experience: A collaborative critical analysis of four Australian programs. In *Global Teaching* (pp. 167-188): Springer.

Buchanan, J., & Widodo, A. (2016). Your place or mine? global imbalances in internationalisation and mobilisation in educational professional experience. *Asia Pacific Education Review, 17*(2), 355-364.

Buczynski, S., Lattimer, H., Inoue, N., & Alexandrowicz, V. (2010). Developing a policy for an international experience requirement in a graduate teacher education program: A cautionary tale. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 33-46.

Burkitt, I. (2014). *Emotions and social relations*: Sage.

Castro, P., Woodin, J., Lundgren, U., & Byram, M. (2016). Student mobility and internationalisation in higher education: perspectives from practitioners. *Language and Intercultural Communication, 16*(3), 418-436.

Caulfield, C., Hill, M., & Shelton, A. (2006). *The transition to secondary school: the experiences of black and minority ethnic young people*: Glasgow Centre for the Child & Society in partnership with Glasgow Anti Racist Alliance.

Charmaz, K. (2014). *Constructing grounded theory*: Sage.

Chen, Y.-L. E., & Kraklow, D. (2015). Taiwanese college students' motivation and engagement for English learning in the context of internationalization at home: A comparison of students in EMI and Non-EMI programs. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 19*(1), 46-64.

Chenail, R. J. (2011). Interviewing the investigator: Strategies for addressing instrumentation and researcher bias concerns in qualitative research. *The qualitative report, 16*(1), 255.

Childress, L. K. (2010). *The twenty-first century university: Developing faculty engagement in*

internationalization (Vol. 32): Peter Lang.

Collins, P. H. (2000). *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment*. New York Routledge.

Colón-Muñiz, A., SooHoo, S., & Brignoni, E. G. (2010). Language, culture and dissonance: A study course for globally minded teachers with possibilities for catalytic transformation. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 61-74.

Connell, R. (2007). *Southern theory: The global dynamics of knowledge in social science*: Allen & Unwin.

Cranton, P., & King, K. P. (2003). Transformative learning as a professional development goal. *New directions for adult and continuing education, 2003*(98), 31-38.

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*: Sage.

Crossley, M., & Tikly, L. (2004). Postcolonial perspectives and comparative and international research in education: A critical introduction. *Comparative education, 40*(2), 147-156.

Crotty, M. (1998). *The foundations of social research: Meaning and perspective in the research process*: Sage.

Cuddy-Keane, M. (2003). Modernism, geopolitics, globalization. *Modernism/modernity, 10*(3), 539-558.

Cushner, K. (2007). The role of experience in the making of internationally-minded teachers. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 27-39.

Dados, N., & Connell, R. (2012). The global south. *Contexts, 11*(1), 12-13.

Dantas, M. L. (2007). Building teacher competency to work with diverse learners in the context of international education. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 75-94.

Davies, L., Harber, C., & Yamashita, H. (2005). Global citizenship: The needs of teachers and learners. *London: Department for International Development (DfID)*.

de Wit, H. (2002). *Internationalization of higher education in the United States of America and Europe*: Greenwood Press.

de Wit, H. (2010). Internationalisation of Higher Education in Europe and its assessment, trends and issues. In: NVAO The Hague, Netherland.

de Wit, H. (2016). Misconceptions about (the end of) internationalisation. In *Global and Local Internationalization* (pp. 15-20): Springer.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2011). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research*: Sage.

Devlin-Foltz, B. (2010). Teachers for the global age: A call to action for funders. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 113-117.

Devos, A. (2003). Academic Standards, Internationalisation, and the Discursive Construction of" The International Student". *Higher Education Research & Development, 22*(2), 155-166.

Dewey, P., & Duff, S. (2009). Reason before passion: Faculty views on internationalization in higher

education. *Higher Education, 58*(4), 491-504.

Dirlik, A. (1994). *The postcolonial aura: Third World criticism in the age of global capitalism*: Routledge.

Donaldson, G. (2011). *Teaching Scotland's Future: Report of a review of teacher education in Scotland*: Scottish Government (Scotland).

Dong, Y., & Anwaer, M. (2014). Spatial Distribution and Living Situation of Urumqi Ethnic Minority Migrant Workers in the Process of Urbanisation in Xinjiang. *Scientia Geographica Sinica, 34*(8), 963-970.

Dover, A. G. (2013). Teaching for social justice: From conceptual frameworks to classroom practices. *Multicultural Perspectives, 15*(1), 3-11.

Doyle, S., Gendall, P., Meyer, L. H., Hoek, J., Tait, C., McKenzie, L., & Loorparg, A. (2010). An investigation of factors associated with student participation in study abroad. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 14*(5), 471-490.

Dunn, A. H., Dotson, E. K., Cross, S. B., Kesner, J., & Lundahl, B. (2014). Reconsidering the local after a transformative global experience: A comparison of two study abroad programs for preservice teachers. *Action in Teacher Education, 36*(4), 283-304.

Education Scotland. (2015). Promoting Diversity and Equality: Developing Responsible Citizens for 21st Century Scotland. In.

Engel, L. C., & Siczek, M. M. (2017). A cross-national comparison of international strategies: global citizenship and the advancement of national competitiveness. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 1-19.

Escobar, A. (2011). *Encountering development: The making and unmaking of the Third World*: Princeton University Press.

Ethnologue. (2017). China. doi:https://www.ethnologue.com/country/CN

Fang, W., Clarke, A., & Wei, Y. (2016). Empty Success or Brilliant Failure: An Analysis of Chinese Students' Study Abroad Experience in a Collaborative Master of Education Program. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 20*(2), 140-163.

Fanon, F. (1965). The wretched of the earth. Translated [from the French] by Constance Farrington. In.

Ferguson-Patrick, K., Macqueen, S., & Reynolds, R. (2012). Global Education in Teacher Education Programs: Views from Pre-Service Teachers. *Australian Association for Research in Education (NJ1)*.

Ferguson-Patrick, K., Macqueen, S., & Reynolds, R. (2014). Pre-service teacher perspectives on the importance of global education: World and classroom views. *Teachers and Teaching, 20*(4), 470-482.

Floersch, J., Longhofer, J. L., Kranke, D., & Townsend, L. (2010). Integrating thematic, grounded theory and narrative analysis: A case study of adolescent psychotropic treatment. *Qualitative Social Work*.

Foucault, M. (1972). The archaeology of knowledge, trans. AM Sheridan Smith. *London: Tavistock, 182*.

Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings, 1972-1977*: Pantheon.

Foucault, M. (1991). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison*. London Penguin

Friedman, T. L. (2000). *The Lexus and the olive tree: Understanding globalization*: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Friedman, T. L. (2005). *The world is flat: A brief history of the twenty-first century*: Macmillan.

Friesen, R. (2013). Faculty member engagement in Canadian university internationalization: A consideration of understanding, motivations and rationales. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 17*(3), 209-227.

Gallagher, M. (2009). Ethics In *Researching with children and young people: Research design, methods and analysis* (pp. 11-64).

Gallavan, N. P. (2008). Examining teacher candidates' views on teaching world citizenship. *The social studies, 99*(6), 249-254.

García, E., Arias, M. B., Murri, N. J. H., & Serna, C. (2010). Developing responsive teachers: A challenge for a demographic reality. *Journal of Teacher Education, 61*(1-2), 132-142.

Gay, G. (2002). Preparing for culturally responsive teaching. *JOURNAL OF TEACHER EDUCATION-WASHINGTON DC-, 53*(2), 106-116.

Gay, G. (2010). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*: Teachers College Press.

Gay, G. (2013). Teaching to and through cultural diversity. *Curriculum Inquiry, 43*(1), 48-70.

General Teaching Council for Scotland. (2012a). The Standard for Career-long Professional Learning. doi:http://www.gtcs.org.uk/web/FILES/about-gtcs/standard-for-career-long-professional-learning-draft-august-2012.pdf

General Teaching Council for Scotland. (2012b). The Standards for Registration: mandatory requirements for Registration with the General Teaching Council for Scotland. doi:http://www.gtcs.org.uk/web/FILES/the-standards/standards-for-registration-1212.pdf

Giddens, A. (1990). *The Consequences of Modernity* Cambridge: Polity press.

Given, L. M. (2008). *The Sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods*: Sage Publications.

Goldin, I., & Reinert, K. (2012). *Globalization for development: Meeting new challenges*: OUP Oxford.

Goodwin, A. L. (2010). Globalization and the preparation of quality teachers: Rethinking knowledge domains for teaching. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 19-32.

Gorski, P. C. (2008). Good intentions are not enough: A decolonizing intercultural education. *Intercultural Education, 19*(6), 515-525.

Griner, A. C., & Stewart, M. L. (2012). Addressing the achievement gap and disproportionality through the use of culturally responsive teaching practices. *Urban Education, 48*(4), 585–621.

Guba, E. G. (1990). *The paradigm dialog*: Sage Publications.

Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). Competing paradigms in qualitative research. *Handbook of qualitative research, 2*(163-194), 105.

Guest, G., MacQueen, K. M., & Namey, E. E. (2011). *Applied thematic analysis*: Sage.

Guo, L. (2014). Preparing Teachers to Educate for 21st Century Global Citizenship: Envisioning and Enacting. *Journal of Global Citizenship & Equity Education, 4*(1).

Guo, Y., & Beckett, G. H. (2007). The hegemony of English as a global language: Reclaiming local knowledge and culture in China. *Convergence, 40*(1/2), 117.

Hall, E. T. (2013). The power of hidden differences. In M. Bennett (Ed.), *Basic concepts of intercultural communication: Paradigms, principles, and practices* (pp. 165-184): Hachette UK.

Harvey, D. (1990). Between Space and Time: Reflections on the Geographical Imagination1. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers, 80*(3), 418-434.

Hawthorne, L. (2010). Demography, migration and demand for international students. *Globalisation and tertiary education in the Asia-Pacific: The changing nature of a dynamic market*, 93-120.

Hazelkorn, E. (2015). *Rankings and the reshaping of higher education: The battle for world-class excellence*: Springer.

Held, D., & McGrew, A. (2003). *The global transformations reader*: Cambridge: Polity Press.

Held, D., McGrew, A., Goldblatt, D., & Perraton, J. (1999). *Global Transformations: Politics, Economics and Culture* Polity.

Herb, G. H., & Kaplan, D. H. (2017). *Scaling Identities: Nationalism and Territoriality*: Rowman & Littlefield.

Heron, J., & Reason, P. (1997). A participatory inquiry paradigm. *Qualitative inquiry, 3*(3), 274-294.

Hick, P., Arshad, R., Mitchell, L., Watt, D., & Roberts, L. (2010). ESCalate Themed funding: Teacher Educators for the 21st Century Grant Project Final Report.

Hiddleston, J. (2009). *Understanding postcolonialism*: Routledge.

Holden, C., & Hicks, D. (2007). Making global connections: The knowledge, understanding and motivation of trainee teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 23*(1), 13-23.

Hovland, K. (2005). Shared futures: Global learning and social responsibility. *Diversity Digest, 8*(3), 1.

Howard, T. C. (2003). Culturally relevant pedagogy: Ingredients for critical teacher reflection. *Theory into Practice, 42*(3), 195-202.

Howe, E. R., & Xu, S. (2013). Transcultural teacher development within the dialectic of the global and local: Bridging gaps between East and West. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 36*, 33-43.

Hudzik, J. K. (2015). Strategic Institutional Partnerships and Comprehensive Internationalisation. *Higher Education: Partnerships for the Future. Porto Elizabeth: Unit for Higher Education Internationalisation in the Developing World*, 23-39.

Huff, A. S. (2009). *Designing research for publication*: Sage.

Huggan, G. (2002). *The postcolonial exotic: Marketing the margins*: Routledge.

Inglis, C. (2009). Multicultural education in Australia. *The Routledge international companion to multicultural education*, 109.

Jett, C. C., McNeal Curry, K., & Vernon-Jackson, S. (2016). Let our students be our guides: McNair scholars "guide" three urban teacher educators on meeting the needs of culturally diverse learners. *Urban Education, 51*(5), 514-533.

Jiao, K. (2014). Minority Population's Urbanisation Level and Its Trends in China. *Ethno-national Studies, 4*, 36-48. doi:http://www.hprc.org.cn/gsyj/shs/ssmzf/201503/P020150331517658023313.pdf

Johnson, R. (2009). Developing Intercultural Teachers: The Mumbai Global Experience Project. *Australian Teacher Education Association*.

Joshee, R. (2008). Neoliberalism versus social justice: A view from Canada. In *Power, voice and the public good: Schooling and education in global societies* (pp. 31-53): Emerald Group Publishing Limited.

Joshee, R. (2009). Multicultural education policy in Canada. *The Routledge international companion to multicultural education*, 96.

Kaiser, K. (2009). Protecting respondent confidentiality in qualitative research. *Qualitative health research, 19*(11), 1632-1641.

Kapoor, I. (2004). Hyper‐self‐reflexive development? Spivak on representing the Third World 'Other'. *Third world quarterly, 25*(4), 627-647.

Katsarova, I. (2015). Higher education in the EU: Approaches, issues and trends. *European Parliamentary Research Service, European Union*.

Kearsley, G. P. (1976). Questions and question asking in verbal discourse: A cross-disciplinary review. *Journal of Psycholinguistic Research, 5*(4), 355-375.

Kegan, R. (2009). What" form" transforms. *A constructive-developmental approach to transformative learning. Teoksessa K. Illeris (toim.) Contemporary theories of learning: learning theorists in their own words. Abingdon: Routledge*, 35-54.

Kenway, J., & Bullen, E. (2008). The global corporate curriculum and the young cyberflaneur as global citizen. *Youth moves: Identities and education in global perspective*, 17-32.

Killick, D. (2011). Seeing ourselves-in-the-world: Developing global citizenship through international mobility and campus community. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 1028315311431893.

Kissock, C., & Richardson, P. (2010). Calling for action within the teaching profession: It is time to internationalize teacher education. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 89-101.

Kitchenham, A. (2008). The evolution of John Mezirow's transformative learning theory. *Journal of Transformative Education, 6*(2), 104-123.

Knight, J. (1994). *Internationalization: Elements and Checkpoints. CBIE Research No. 7*: ERIC.

Knight, J. (1997). Internationalisationof higher education; a conceptual framework. Internationalisation of Higher Education in Asia Pacific Countries, Amsterdam: EAIE. In J. Knight & H. d. Wit (Eds.), *Internationalisation of higher education in Asia Pacific countries* (pp. 5-19). Amsterdam: EAIE

Knight, J. (2004). Internationalization remodeled: Definition, approaches, and rationales. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 8*(1), 5-31.

Knight, J. (2006). *Internationalization of higher education: new directions, new challenges: 2005 IAU global survey report*: International Association of Universities.

Knight, J. (2008). Higher education in turmoil. *The Changing World of Internationalisation. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense Publishers*.

Knight, J. (2013). The changing landscape of higher education internationalisation–for better or worse? *Perspectives: Policy and Practice in Higher Education, 17*(3), 84-90.

Knight, J. (2015a). Five myths about internationalization. *International Higher Education*(62).

Knight, J. (2015b). New rationales driving internationalization. *International Higher Education*(34).

Knight, J. (2015c). Updated definition of internationalization. *International Higher Education*(33).

Koziol, S., Greenberg, J., Williams, L., Niehaus, E., & Jacobson, C. (2011). Internationalizing teacher education: A systemic initiative international conference on education for teaching. Glasgow, Scotland July, 2011. In.

Kreber, C. (2004). An analysis of two models of reflection and their implications for educational development. *International Journal for Academic Development, 9*(1), 29-49.

Kreber, C. (2012). Critical reflection and transformative learning. *The handbook of transformative learning: Theory, research, and practice*, 323-341.

Kvale, S., & Brinkmann, S. (2009). *Interview: Learning the craft of qualitative research interviewing*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications

Ladson-Billings, G. (1995). Toward a theory of culturally relevant pedagogy. *American educational research journal, 32*(3), 465-491.

Ladson-Billings, G. (2008). Yes, but how do we do it?": Practicing culturally relevant pedagogy. *City kids, city schools: More reports from the front row*, 162-177.

Ladson-Billings, G. (2009). *The dreamkeepers: Successful teachers of African American children*: John Wiley & Sons.

Ladson-Billings, G. (2014). Culturally relevant pedagogy 2.0: aka the remix. *Harvard Educational Review, 84*(1), 74-84.

Laqueur, T. (1989). Bodies, details, and the humanitarian narrative. In L. Hunt & A. Biersack (Eds.), *The new cultural history* (pp. 176–204). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Laros, A. (2017). Disorienting Dilemmas as a Catalyst for Transformative Learning. In *Transformative Learning Meets Bildung* (pp. 85-95): Springer.

Larsen, M. A. (2016). Globalisation and internationalisation of teacher education: a comparative case

study of Canada and Greater China. *Teaching Education, 27*(4), 396-409.

Lazarus, E., & Trahar, S. (2015). Internationalising a Transnational Higher Education Programme. In *Critical perspectives on internationalising the curriculum in disciplines* (pp. 107-120): Springer.

Lazarus, N. (2004). Introducing postcolonial studies. *The Cambridge companion to postcolonial literary studies*, 1-16.

Le Ha, P. (2013). Issues surrounding English, the internationalisation of higher education and national cultural identity in Asia: A focus on Japan. *Critical Studies in Education, 54*(2), 160-175.

Leask, B. (2004). Internationalisation outcomes for all students using information and communication technologies (ICTs). *Journal of Studies in International Education, 8*(4), 336-351.

Leask, B., & Bridge, C. (2013). Comparing internationalisation of the curriculum in action across disciplines: theoretical and practical perspectives. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, 43*(1), 79-101.

Lewis, J. (2003). Design issues. *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers*, 47-76.

Li, J. (2006). *Analysis of the implementation of teacher education policy in China since the 1990s: A case study.*

Li, L., Dunford, M., & Yeung, G. (2012). International trade and industrial dynamics: Geographical and structural dimensions of Chinese and Sino-EU merchandise trade. *Applied Geography, 32*(1), 130-142.

Liamputtong, P. (2008). *Doing cross-cultural research: Ethical and methodological perspectives* (Vol. 34): Springer Science & Business Media.

Lincoln, Y. S. (2009). Ethical practices in qualitative research. *The handbook of social research ethics*, 150-169.

Lincoln, Y. S., Lynham, S. A., & Guba, E. G. (2011). Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions, and emerging confluences, revisited. *The Sage handbook of qualitative research, 4*, 97-128.

Liu, M., & Wei, C. (2013). Expectations of and Concerns about Semester-long Study Abroad: A Case Study. *International Journal of Education & Literacy Studies, 1*(1), 72.

Lomer, S. (2017). Soft power as a policy rationale for international education in the UK: a critical analysis. *Higher Education, 74*(4), 581-598.

Longview Foundation. (2008). *Teacher preparation for the global age: The imperative for change*.

Loomba, A. (2005). *Colonialism/postcolonialism*. London: Routledge.

Louisy, D. P. (2004). Whose context for what quality? Informing education strategies for the Caribbean. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, 34*(3), 285-292.

Lu, Q. (2009). Abnormal prosperity: Shanghai ruled by foreign powers between the Mid-1800s and Early 1990s. In (pp. 229). Shanghai: Orient Publishing Centre.

Ma, W., & Liang, Y. (2015). The development of school-based curriculum for international

understanding and its implementation in practice *Beijing Education (General Education), 9*(055).

Macdonald, H. M. (2013). Inviting discomfort: Foregrounding emotional labour in teaching anthropology in post-apartheid South Africa. *Teaching in Higher Education, 18*(6), 670-682.

Mahon, J. (2006). Under the invisibility cloak? Teacher understanding of cultural difference. *Intercultural Education, 17*(4), 391-405.

Mahon, J. (2007). A field of dreams? Overseas student teaching as a catalyst towards internationalizing teacher education. *Teacher Education Quarterly, 34*(1), 133-149.

Mahon, J. (2010). Fact or fiction? Analyzing institutional barriers and individual responsibility to advance the internationalization of teacher education. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 7-18.

Mahon, J., & Cushner, K. (2007). *The impact of overseas student teaching on personal and professional development*: Rowman & Littlefield Education.

Mair, V. H. (1991). *What is a Chinese" dialect/topolect"?: Reflections on Some Key Sino-English Linguistic Terms*: Department of Oriental Studies, University of Pennsylvania Philadelphia.

Major, J., & Santoro, N. (2016). Supervising an international teaching practicum: building partnerships in postcolonial contexts. *Oxford Review of Education, 42*(4), 460-474.

Mälkki, K. (2010). Building on Mezirow's theory of transformative learning: Theorizing the challenges to reflection. *Journal of Transformative Education, 8*(1), 42-62.

Manzon, M. (2013). Teaching comparative education in Greater China: Contexts, characteristics and challenges. *Comparative Education at Universities Worldwide*, 237-255.

Marginson, S., & Van der Wende, M. (2007). To rank or to be ranked: The impact of global rankings in higher education. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 11*(3-4), 306-329.

Maringe, F., & Woodfield, S. (2013). Contemporary issues on the internationalisation of higher education: Critical and comparative perspectives. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, 43*(1), 1-8.

Martell, L. (2008). Britain and globalization. *Globalizations, 5*(3), 449-466.

Marx, H., & Moss, D. M. (2011). Please mind the culture gap: Intercultural development during a teacher education study abroad program. *Journal of Teacher Education, 62*(1), 35-47.

McEwan, C. (2009). *Postcolonialism and development*: Routledge.

McGaha, J. M., & Linder, S. M. (2014). Determining teacher candidates' attitudes toward global-mindedness. *Action in Teacher Education, 36*(4), 305-321.

Meng, Y. (2014). The development of school-based curriculum themed on Walking in Shanghia, Enjoying the World for international understanding and its implementation in practice - a case study of Pingyang Primary School *Shanghai Education and Research*(10), 80-81.

Merryfield, M. M., Lo, J. T.-Y., Po, S. C., & Kasai, M. (2008). Worldmindedness: Taking off the blinders. *Journal of Curriculum and Instruction, 2*(1), 6-20.

Mertens, D. M. (2010). *Research and evaluation in education and psychology: Integrating diversity*

with quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methods: Sage publications.

Mezirow, J. (1990). How critical reflection triggers transformative learning. *Fostering critical reflection in adulthood, 1*, 20.

Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning*: ERIC.

Mezirow, J. (2009). An overview on transformative learning. In *In Contemporary Theories of learning* (pp. 90-105): Routledge.

Mezirow, J. (2012). Learning to Think like an Adult: Core Concepts of Transformation Theory In E. W. Taylor & P. Cranton (Eds.), *The handbook of transformative learning: Theory, research, and practice* (pp. 73-95): Jossey-Bass.

Mikulec, E. (2014). INTERNATIONALIZATION AND TEACHER EDUCATION: WHAT DISPOSITIONS DO TEACHERS NEED FOR GLOBAL ENGAGEMENT? *Education in a Changing Society, 1*, 5-13.

Miller-Dyce, C., & Owusu-Ansah, A. (2016). Yes, We Are Still Talking About Diversity: Diversity Education as a Catalyst for Transformative, Culturally Relevant, and Reflective Preservice Teacher Practices. *Journal of Transformative Education, 14*(4), 327-354.

Miller, J., & Glassner, B. (1997). The 'inside'and the 'outside': Finding realities in interviews. *Qualitative Research*, 99-112.

Ministry of Education of China. (2001). *The Guidelines for Curriculum Reform of Basic Education (the trial version)*. Retrieved from http://old.moe.gov.cn//publicfiles/business/htmlfiles/moe/moe_309/200412/4672.html.

Ministry of Education of China. (2010). *The National Guidelines for Medium- and Long-Term Educational Reform and Development (2010–2020)*. Retrieved from http://www.gov.cn/jrzg/2010-07/29/content_1667143.htm.

Ministry of Education of China. (2011). *Curriculum Standards for Teacher Education*. Retrieved from http://old.moe.gov.cn//publicfiles/business/htmlfiles/moe/s3702/201110/xxgk_125722.html.

Mok, K. H. (2007). Questing for internationalization of universities in Asia: Critical reflections. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 11*(3-4), 433-454.

Morais, D. B., & Ogden, A. C. (2011). Initial development and validation of the global citizenship scale. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 15*(5), 445-466.

Morse, J. M., & Coulehan, J. (2015). Maintaining confidentiality in qualitative publications. In: Sage Publications Sage CA: Los Angeles, CA.

Mysore, A. R., Lincoln, F., & Wavering, M. J. (2006). Attitudes of preservice teachers toward issues in multicultural education. *Working Papers in Educational Linguistics (WPEL), 21*(2), 4.

National Bureau of Statistics of PRC. (2011). *Tabulation on the 2010 Population Census of the People's Republic of China* Beijing Retrieved from http://www.stats.gov.cn/tjsj/pcsj/rkpc/6rp/indexch.htm.

Nguyen, P. M., Elliott, J. G., Terlouw, C., & Pilot, A. (2009). Neocolonialism in education: Cooperative learning in an Asian context. *Comparative education, 45*(1), 109-130.

Niu, C., & Liu, J. (2016). Positioning China's Aid to Educational Development in Africa: Past, Present,

and Post-2015. In *Post-Education-Forall and Sustainable Development Paradigm: Structural Changes with Diversifying Actors and Norms* (pp. 269-299): Emerald Group Publishing Limited.

Oberg, K. (1960). Cultural shock: Adjustment to new cultural environments. *Practical anthropology, 7*(4), 177-182.

Oberg, K. (2006). Cultural shock: Adjustment to new cultural environments. *curare, 29*(2), 3.

Ochoa, A. M. (2010). International education in higher education: A developing process of engagement in teacher preparation programs. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 103-112.

OECD. (2018). *Preparing Our Youth for an Inclusive and Sustainable World: The OECD PISA Global Competence Framework*. Retrieved from http://www.oecd.org/pisa/Handbook-PISA-2018-Global-Competence.pdf

Office for National Statistics. (2015). *International migration*. Retrieved from http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/rel/migration1/migration-statistics-quarterly-report/may-2015/sty-net-migration.html

Ohmae, K. (1990). *The borderless world: power and strategy in the global world*. London: HarperCollinsPublishers.

Oliver, P. (2010). *The student's guide to research ethics*: McGraw-Hill Education (UK).

Olmedo, I., & Harbon, L. (2010). Broadening our sights: Internationalizing teacher education for a global arena. *Teaching Education, 21*(1), 75-88.

Ong, A. (2007). Neoliberalism as a mobile technology. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, 32*(1), 3-8.

Pachler, N., & Redondo, A. (2015). Internationalisation in (teacher) education. *Internationalisierung der LehrerInnenbildung: Perspektiven aus Theorie und Praxis*.

Pan, H. (2016). An Overview of Chinese Language Law and Regulation. In: Taylor & Francis.

Parr, G. (2012). Leading an international teaching practicum: Negotiating tensions in a site of border pedagogy. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education, 40*(2), 97-109.

Parr, G., & Chan, J. (2015). Identity work in a dialogic international teaching practicum. *Teaching Education, 26*(1), 38-54.

Patton, M. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods*. California EU: Sage Publications Inc.

Perraton, H. (2014). *A history of foreign students in Britain*: Springer.

Peterson, R. A. (2000). *Constructing effective questionnaires* (Vol. 1): Sage Publications Thousand Oaks, CA.

Phillion, J., & Malewski, E. (2011). Study abroad in teacher education: Delving into cultural diversity and developing cultural competence. *Action in Teacher Education, 33*(5-6), 643-657.

Poggenpoel, M., & Myburgh, C. (2003). THE RESEARCHER AS RESEARCH INSTRUMENT IN EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH: A POSSIBLE THREAT TO TRUSTWORTHINESS?(A: RESEARCH_INSTRUMENT). *Education, 124*(2).

Pöllmann, A. (2009). Formal education and intercultural capital: towards attachment beyond narrow ethno - national boundaries? *Educational Studies, 35*(5), 537-545.

Pope, C., Ziebland, S., & Mays, N. (2000). Analysing qualitative data. *Bmj, 320*(7227), 114-116.

Portnoi, L. M. (2016). *Policy Borrowing and Reform in Education: Globalized Processes and Local Contexts*: Springer.

Qiao, X. F. (2017). *Exploring factors influencing pre-service teachers' decisions to apply for placements in international settings*. Paper presented at the Strathclyde-Nanhjing Normal University Symposium, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow.

Qin, L. (2013). Issues and solutions of international understanding education in China. *International Education Studies, 6*(11), 100.

Quezada, R. L. (2010). *Internationalization of teacher education: Creating globally competent teachers and teacher educators for the 21st century*: Routledge.

Quijano, A. (2007). Coloniality and modernity/rationality. *Cultural Studies, 21*(2-3), 168-178.

Ramírez, G. B. (2014). Trading quality across borders: Colonial discourse and international quality assurance policies in higher education. *Tertiary Education and Management, 20*(2), 121-134.

Ray, L. (2007). *Globalization and everyday life*: Routledge.

Reimers, F. (2009). Educating for Global Competency. In J. E. Cohen & M. B. Malin (Eds.), *International perspectives on the goals of universal basic and secondary education* (pp. 183-202).

Reinharz, S. (1997). Who am I? The need for a variety of selves in the field. In R. Hertz (Ed.), *Reflexivity and voice* (pp. 3-20). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Richards, H., & Emslie, C. (2000). The ‘doctor’or the ‘girl from the University’? Considering the influence of professional roles on qualitative interviewing. *Family practice, 17*(1), 71-75.

Riessman, C. K. (1993). *Narrative analysis* (Vol. 30): Sage.

Ritchie, J., Lewis, J., & Elam, G. (2003). Designing and selecting samples. *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers, 2*, 111-145.

Rivoli, P. (2014). *The travels of a t-shirt in the global economy: An economist examines the markets, power, and politics of world trade. New preface and epilogue with updates on economic issues and main characters*: John Wiley & Sons.

Rizvi, F. (2007). Postcolonialism and globalization in education. *Cultural Studies? Critical Methodologies, 7*(3), 256-263.

Rizvi, F., & Lingard, B. (2010). *Globalizing education policy*: Routledge.

Rizvi, F., Lingard, B., & Lavia, J. (2006). Postcolonialism and education: Negotiating a contested terrain. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society, 14*(3), 249-262.

Robbins, M., Francis, L. J., & Elliott, E. (2003). Attitudes toward education for global citizenship among trainee teachers. *Research in education, 69*(1), 93-98.

Robertson, R. (1992). *Globalization: Social theory and global culture* (Vol. 16): Sage.

Robertson, S., Bonal, X., & Dale, R. (2012). *WTO/GATS and the Education Service Industry: Global Strategy--Local Responses. Routledge Research in Education*: ERIC.

Rogers, M., & Tough, A. (1996). Facing the future is not for wimps. *Futures, 28*(5), 491-496.

Romano, R. (2007). The power of curiosity and the terror of it all: The life of an individual student. *Intercultural student teaching: A bridge to global competence*, 197-214.

Rudzki, R. E. (1995). The application of a strategic management model to the internationalization of higher education institutions. *Higher Education, 29*(4), 421-441.

Rumbley, L. E. (2015). “Intelligent Internationalization”: A 21st Century Imperative. *International Higher Education*(80), 16-17.

Ryan, A. M., Heineke, A. J., & Steindam, C. (2014). Preparing globally minded teachers through the incorporation of the International Baccalaureate. *Journal of Education, 194*(3).

Ryan, G. W., & Bernard, H. R. (2003). Techniques to identify themes. *Field methods, 15*(1), 85-109.

Said, E. (1978). Orientalism: Western Conceptions ofthe Orient. *London: Kegan Paul*.

Said, E. (1993). *Culture and Imperialism*. London: Chatto & Windus Ltd.

Samoff, J. (2003). Institutionalizing international influence. *Safundi: The Journal of South African and American Comparative Studies, 4*(1), 1-35.

Sanderson, G. (2011). Internationalisation and teaching in higher education. *Higher Education Research & Development, 30*(5), 661-676.

Santoro, N. (2009). Teaching in culturally diverse contexts: what knowledge about ‘self’and ‘others’ do teachers need? *Journal of Education for Teaching, 35*(1), 33-45.

Santoro, N. (2013). The Making of Teachers for the Twenty-First Century: Australian Professional Standards and the Preparation of Culturally Responsive Teachers. In *Preparing Teachers for the 21st Century* (pp. 309-321): Springer.

Santoro, N. (2014). ‘If I’m going to teach about the world, I need to know the world’: developing Australian pre-service teachers’ intercultural competence through international trips. *Race Ethnicity and Education, 17*(3), 429-444.

Santoro, N. (2016). The Cultural Diversification of the Scottish Teaching Profession. In *Diversifying the Teaching Force in Transnational Contexts* (pp. 1-13): Springer.

Santoro, N. (2017). Learning to Be a Culturally Responsive Teacher in the Global North: A Call for Critical Teacher Education. In *Global Teaching* (pp. 59-77): Springer.

Santoro, N., & Forghani-Arani, N. (2015). Interrogating practice in culturally diverse classrooms: what can an analysis of student resistance and teacher response reveal? *European Journal of Teacher Education, 38*(1), 58-70.

Santoro, N., & Major, J. (2012). Learning to be a culturally responsive teacher through international study trips: transformation or tourism? *Teaching Education, 23*(3), 309-322.

Santoro, N., Sosu, E., & Fassetta, G. (2016). ‘You have to be a bit brave’: barriers to Scottish student-teachers’ participation in study-abroad programmes. *Journal of Education for Teaching, 42*(1), 17-27.

Schattle, H. (2009). Global citizenship in theory and practice. *The handbook of practice and research in study abroad: Higher education and the quest for global citizenship*, 3-20.

Schneider, A. I. (2003). Internationalizing teacher education: What can be done. *ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED, 480869*.

Schwandt, T. A. (2000). Three epistemological stances for qualitative inquiry: Interpretivism, hermeneutics, and social constructionism. *Handbook of qualitative research, 2*, 189-213.

Scoffham, S., & Barnes, J. (2009). Transformational experiences and deep learning: The impact of an intercultural study visit to India on UK initial teacher education students. *Journal of Education for Teaching, 35*(3), 257-270.

Seidman, I. (2012). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*: Teachers college press.

Shanghai Academy of Educational Sciences. (2016). *Bluebook of Schools for Children of Foreign Personnel in Shanghai*.

Shanghai Municipal Education Commission. (2012). *Action Plan for China's Twelfth Five-year Plan - Internationalising Education in Shanghai.* Shanghai. .

Shanghai Municipal Education Commission. (2016). *The 13th Five-year (2016-2020) Plan for Economic and Social Development of PRC: New Plans for Opening up Shanghai Education*. Retrieved from http://www.shmec.gov.cn/html/xxgk/201611/301132016009.php.

Singh, M. (2011). Learning from China to internationalise Australian research education: Pedagogies of intellectual equality and ‘optimal ignorance’of ERA journal rankings. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International, 48*(4), 355-365.

Singh, M., Kenway, J., & Apple, M. (2005). Globalizing education: Perspectives from above and below.

Siwatu, K. O., Polydore, C. L., & Starker, T. V. (2009). Prospective Elementary School Teachers' Culturally Responsive Teaching Self? Efficacy Beliefs. *Multicultural Learning and Teaching, 4*(1).

Slater, D. (2008). *Geopolitics and the post-colonial: rethinking North-South relations*: John Wiley & Sons.

Sleeter, C. E. (2008). Preparing White teachers for diverse students. In M. Cochran-Smith, S. Feiman-Nemser, D. J. McIntyre, & K. E. Demers (Eds.), *Handbook of research on teacher education: Enduring questions in changing contexts*: Routledge.

Sleeter, C. E., & Owuor, J. (2011). Research on the impact of teacher preparation to teach diverse students: The research we have and the research we need. *Action in Teacher Education, 33*(5-6), 524-536.

Smyth, G. (2013). Who Are the Teachers and Who Are the Learners? Teacher Education for Culturally Responsive Pedagogy. In *Preparing Teachers for the 21st Century* (pp. 297-308): Springer.

Souto-Otero, M., Huisman, J., Beerkens, M., De Wit, H., & Vujić, S. (2013). Barriers to international

student mobility: Evidence from the Erasmus program. *Educational researcher, 42*(2), 70-77.

Sparke, M. (2012). *Introducing globalization: Ties, tensions, and uneven integration*: John Wiley & Sons.

Spiro, J. (2011). Guided interaction as intercultural learning: designing internationalisation into a mixed delivery teacher education programme. *Higher Education Research & Development, 30*(5), 635-646.

Spivak, G. C. (1993). Can the subaltern speak? In L. Chrisman & P. Williams (Eds.), *Colonial discourse and post-colonial theory: a reader*. London: Harvester Wheatsheaf.

Spivak, G. C. (1996). *The Spivak Reader: Selected Works of Gayati Chakravorty Spivak*: Routledge.

Spivak, G. C. (2002). Righting wrongs. *The South Atlantic Quarterly, 103*(2/3), 523-581.

Spring, J. (2014). *Globalization of education: An introduction*: Routledge.

Squires, A. (2009). Methodological challenges in cross-language qualitative research: a research review. *International journal of nursing studies, 46*(2), 277-287.

Stachowski, L. L., & Sparks, T. (2007). Thirty years and 2,000 student teachers later: An overseas student teaching project that is popular, successful, and replicable. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 115-132.

Stake, R. E. (2006). Multiple Case Study Analysis. In. New York: Guilford Press.

Steger, M. B. (2013). *Globalization: A very short introduction*: Oxford University Press.

Stevick, E. D., & Brown, K. D. (2016). Internationalising colleges of education through the dialectic of the global and the local? A perspective and possible pathways from the American South. *Intercultural Education, 27*(6), 493-504.

Stier, J. (2006). Internationalisation, intercultural communication and intercultural competence. *Journal of intercultural communication*(11).

Stohl, M. (2007). We have met the enemy and he is us: The role of the faculty in the internationalization of higher education in the coming decade. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 11*(3-4), 359-372.

Stromquist, N. P., & Monkman, K. (2014). Defining Globalization and Assessing its Implications for Knowledge and Education, Revisited. In N. P. Stromquist & K. Monkman (Eds.), *Globalization and Education: Integration and Contestation across Cultures* (2nd ed., pp. 1-19): Rowman & Littlefield Education.

Tamtik, M., & Kirss, L. (2016). Building a Norm of Internationalization: The Case of Estonia's Higher Education System. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 20*(2), 164-183.

Tan, C. (2012). The culture of education policy making: Curriculum reform in Shanghai. *Critical Studies in Education, 53*(2), 153-167.

Tarrant, M. A. (2010). A conceptual framework for exploring the role of studies abroad in nurturing global citizenship. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 14*(5), 433-451.

Taylor, E. W. (2007). An update of transformative learning theory: A critical review of the empirical

research (1999–2005). *International Journal of Lifelong Education, 26*(2), 173-191.

Taylor, E. W. (2017). Transformative learning theory. In *Transformative Learning Meets Bildung* (pp. 17-29): Springer.

The Core Competence Research Team. (2016). The Core Competence of Chinese Students (Zhongguo Xuesheng Hexin Suyang). *Journal of the Chinese Society of Education., 0*(10), 1-3.

The National Archives. (2009). *Prime Minister's Initiative (PMI)*. Retrieved from http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/+/http://www.dius.gov.uk/international/pmi/index.html.

The Scottish Government. (2013). *Key results on Population, Ethnicity, Identity, Language, Religion, Health, Housing and Accommodation in Scotland*. Retrieved from http://www.nrscotland.gov.uk/files/statistics/high-level-summary/j11198/j1119801.htm.

The Scottish Government. (2014). *Summary Statistics for Schools in Scotland*. Retrieved from http://spoxy5.insipio.com/generator/sc/www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2014/12/7590/9.

The Scottish Government. (2016). *Pupil in Scotland*. Retrieved from http://www.gov.scot/Topics/Statistics/Browse/School-Education/dspupcensus/dspupcensus16.

The State Council of PRC. (2000). *A Circular Concerning Several Policies on Carrying out the Development of China's Vast Western Regions*. Retrieved from http://www.gov.cn/gongbao/content/2001/content_60854.htm.

Thiong'o, N. W. (1992). *Decolonising the mind: The politics of language in African literature*: East African Publishers.

Tikly, L. (2004). Education and the new imperialism. *Comparative education, 40*(2), 173-198.

Training and Development Agency. (2011). *Results of the Newly Qualified Teacher Survey*. Retrieved from https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/182543/nqt_survey_results_2011.pdf.

Trede, F., Bowles, W., & Bridges, D. (2013). Developing intercultural competence and global citizenship through international experiences: academics' perceptions. *Intercultural Education, 24*(5), 442-455.

Trilokekar, R. D., & Kukar, P. (2011). Disorienting experiences during study abroad: Reflections of pre-service teacher candidates. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 27*(7), 1141-1150.

Turner, B. S., & Khondker, H. H. (2010). *Globalization east and west*: Sage.

Tye, K. A. (2003). Global education as a worldwide movement. *Phi Delta Kappan, 85*(2), 165-168.

UNESCO. (2014). *Global Citizenship Education: Preparing learners for the challenges of the 21st century*. Retrieved from http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002277/227729E.pdf.

Van Mol, C., & Timmerman, C. (2014). Should I stay or should I go? An analysis of the determinants of intra‐European student mobility. *Population, Space and Place, 20*(5), 465-479.

Villegas, A. M., & Lucas, T. (2002). *Educating culturally responsive teachers: A coherent approach*: Suny Press.

Wahyuni, D. (2012). The research design maze: Understanding paradigms, cases, methods and methodologies. *Journal of applied management accounting research, 10*(1), 69-80.

Walker-Dalhouse, D., & Dalhouse, A. D. (2006). Investigating White preservice teachers' beliefs about teaching in culturally diverse classrooms. *Negro Educational Review, 57*(1/2), 69.

Walker, P. (2014). International student policies in UK higher education from colonialism to the coalition: Developments and consequences. *Journal of Studies in International Education, 18*(4), 325-344.

Walters, L. M., Garii, B., & Walters, T. (2009). Learning globally, teaching locally: incorporating international exchange and intercultural learning into pre‐service teacher training. *Intercultural Education, 20*(sup1), S151-S158.

Wang, C., Dong, J., & Shibata, M. (2009). Comparative education in two Asian contexts: A juxtaposition and some questions. In *International handbook of comparative education* (pp. 1209-1223): Springer.

Wang, H. (2005). Aporias, responsibility, and the im/possibility of teaching multicultural education. *Educational Theory, 55*(1), 45-60.

Wang, L. (2014). Internationalization with Chinese characteristics: The changing discourse of internationalization in China. *Chinese Education & Society, 47*(1), 7-26.

Wang, Z., & Xiong, M. (2011). The experience and limitations of and strategies for school-based curriculum development in international understanding - a case study of a primary school F *Educational Science Research, 9*, 65-68.

Warren, C. A. (2002). Qualitative interviewing. *Handbook of interview research: Context and method, 839101*.

West, C. (2012). Toward globally competent pedagogy. *NAFSA: Association of International Educators*.

Westbrook, L. (1994). Qualitative research methods: A review of major stages, data analysis techniques, and quality controls. *Library & Information Science Research, 16*(3), 241-254.

Wilson, A. H. (1993). Conversation partners: Helping students gain a global perspective through cross‐cultural experiences. *Theory into Practice, 32*(1), 21-26.

Xu, S., & Connelly, F. M. (2009). Narrative inquiry for teacher education and development: Focus on English as a foreign language in China. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 25*(2), 219-227.

Yamashita, H. (2006). Global citizenship education and war: The needs of teachers and learners. *Educational Review, 58*(1), 27-39.

Yan, Y., & Li, X. (2018). The Research of Ethnic Population's Distribution and Population Gravity *Pupulation and Development, 24*(03), 96-104.

Yang, J. (2015). The analysis of the new situation and charateristics of foreign residents in mainland China (zhongguo dalu jingwarenkou de zui xin zhuangkuang he tezheng fenxi) *Statistics and decision*(18), 90-94.

Yang, R. (2014). Going global: Contemporary international networking in Chinese mainland universities. *Chinese Education & Society, 47*(1), 27-43.

Ye, H., Jacob, W. J., & Xiong, W. (2017). Bilingual Education for Chinese Ethnic Minorities: Challenges and Obstacles *Research on Higher Education, 5*(1).

Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case study research: Design and methods*: Sage publications.

Young, R. (2016). *Postcolonialism: An historical introduction*: John Wiley & Sons.

Zajda, J. (2015). Globalisation and its impact on education and policy. In *Second International Handbook on Globalisation, Education and Policy Research* (pp. 105-125): Springer.

Zembylas, M. (2010). Teachers' emotional experiences of growing diversity and multiculturalism in schools and the prospects of an ethic of discomfort. *Teachers and Teaching: theory and practice, 16*(6), 703-716.

Zembylas, M. (2015). 'Pedagogy of discomfort'and its ethical implications: the tensions of ethical violence in social justice education. *Ethics and Education, 10*(2), 163-174.

Zembylas, M., & Boler, M. (2003). Discomforting truths: The emotional terrain of understanding difference. In *Pedagogies of difference* (pp. 115-138): Routledge.

Zembylas, M., & McGlynn, C. (2012). Discomforting pedagogies: Emotional tensions, ethical dilemmas and transformative possibilities. *British Educational Research Journal, 38*(1), 41-59.

Zhao, Y. (2010). Preparing globally competent teachers: A new imperative for teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education, 61*(5), 422-431.

Zheng, X. (2014). The Adaptation and Integration of Migrant workers from Ethnic Minority Backgrounds to City Life *Journal of South-Central University for Nationalities (Humanities and Social Sciences), 34*(1).

Zhuo, X. (2017). *Religious Faith of the Chinese*: Springer.

Ziegler, M. F., Paulus, T. M., & Woodside, M. (2006). This course is helping us all arrive at new viewpoints, isn't it? Making meaning through dialogue in a blended environment. *Journal of Transformative Education, 4*(4), 302-319.

Appendices

Appendix 1: Participant information sheet (questionnaire)

Name of department: School of Education, Humanities and Social Sciences

Title of the study: Internationalising Teacher Education in China and Scotland

Introduction

Hello, my name is Huaping Li. I am a PhD student in teacher education in the University of Strathclyde, Scotland. Currently, I am doing research for my PhD thesis on Internationalising Teacher Education: A Case Study of the Approaches to Preparing Scottish and Chinese Student Teachers to Be Globally Competent Teachers. You are welcome to contact me through the following means.

My email address: huaping.li@strath.ac.uk

My address: Room 602, Level 6, Lord Hope Building, 141 St James Road, Glasgow, G4 0LT

What is the purpose of this investigation?

The research seeks to explore how teacher education is internationalised in both Scotland and China in terms of the two pillars (internationalisation at home and abroad), how the two pillars of internationalisation shape student teachers' development as globally competent teachers and what the Internet could offer to contribute to internationalising teacher education in increasingly globalised world.

Do you have to take part?

You are invited to take part in an open-ended questionnaire. In the questionnaire you will answer questions concerning the role of a teacher in the increasingly globalised world, approaches to preparing globally competent teachers, your own learning experiences with global dimensions either at home or abroad and the

challenges and possibilities for student teachers' exposure to global dimensions according to your own learning experiences. Your participation in the investigation is voluntary and there will be no detriment if you choose not to participate or withdraw at any point of the investigation.

What will you do in the project?

You will be invited to participate in the questionnaire for around 30 minutes. The questionnaire will be emailed to you and completed by you at your convenience. When it is finished, please send it back to the same email address.

Why have you been invited to take part?

You are invited as the participant for the questionnaire because you are one of the student teachers who are based at a university in either Scotland or China and have had learning experiences with international components. You may be interested in the research topic concerning internationalising teacher education and the questions in the questionnaire may inspire you to reflect on your own learning experiences with international components. The questions in the questionnaire may help you develop a deep understanding of the value of the experiences in shaping your development as a competent teacher in the globalised world. You could contribute to the research from your own learning experiences and perspectives.

What are the potential risks to you in taking part?

This topic is not sensitive in nature and it will not pose potential risks to you. Thank you for your time and engagement.

What happens to the information in the project?

Your responses in the questionnaire will be saved electronically in the researcher's account on the network server of the University of Strathclyde. Meanwhile, a back-up copy of the responses will be stored in the researcher's own hard drive which is protected by a password. The responses will be retained for 5 years after which time

they will be destroyed. Any data about you will be anonymised and you will not be recognised in my PhD dissertation, conference papers, academic journals or other publications.

The University of Strathclyde is registered with the Information Commissioner's Office who implements the Data Protection Act 1998. All personal data on participants will be processed in accordance with the provisions of the Data Protection Act 1998.

Thank you for reading this information – please ask any questions if you are unsure about what is written here.

What happens next?

If you are happy to be involved in the project, please sign the consent form to confirm this.

If you do not want to be involved in the project, I am still grateful to you for your attention.

I am happy to provide you feedback after the investigation is completed and I will ask you to confirm the accuracy of the information. The results will not be published without your permission and confirmation.

Researcher contact details:

If you have any questions at any stage of the investigation, please do not hesitate to contact me or my supervisor, the chief investigator.

My name: Huaping Li

My email address: huaping.li@strath.ac.uk

My address: Room 602, Level 6, Lord Hope Building, 141 St James Road, Glasgow, G4 0LT

Chief Investigator details:

The chief investigator's name: Professor Ninetta Santoro

Email address: n.santoro@strath.ac.uk

Address: Room 523, Level 5, Lord Hope Building, 141 St James Road, Glasgow, G4 0LT

Phone number: +44 (0)141 444 8101

This investigation was granted ethical approval by the School of Education Ethics Committee. If you have any questions/concerns, during or after the investigation, or wish to contact an independent person to whom any questions may be directed or further information may be sought from, please contact:

Dr Eleni Karagiannidou

Chair School of Education Ethics Committee

University of Strathclyde

Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences

School of Education

Lord Hope Building

141 St James Road

Glasgow G4 0LT

Appendix 2: Consent form (questionnaire)

Name of department: School of Education, Humanities and Social Sciences

Title of the study: Internationalising Teacher Education in China and Scotland

- I confirm that I have read and understood the information sheet for the above project and the researcher has answered any queries to my satisfaction.
- I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw from the project at any time, up to the point of completion, without having to give a reason and without any consequences. If I exercise my right to withdraw and I don't want my data to be used, any data which have been collected from me will be destroyed.
- I understand that I can withdraw from the study any personal data (i.e. data which identify me personally) at any time.
- I understand that anonymised data (i.e., data which do not identify me personally) cannot be withdrawn once they have been included in the study.
- I understand that any information recorded in the investigation will remain confidential and no information that identifies me will be made publicly available.
- I consent to being a participant in the project.
- I consent to giving responses to the questionnaire as part of the project

Do you agree to the above statements? (Please circle)

Yes/No

(PRINT NAME)	
Signature of Participant:	Date:

Appendix 3: The questionnaire for student teachers

Date: ____________________________

Dear student,

Along with the development of technology and the process of globalisation, the world is increasingly interconnected and interdependent. To cooperate and compete with people from all over the world, we need global workers who can effectively and successfully work in any place and with people from any part of the world. This shows the urgency of preparing competent teachers for an increasingly multicultural and global context.

The questionnaire invites you to talk about the practices, possibilities and challenges of the internationalisation of teacher education in our university from your own learning experiences and understanding.

Instructions:

1. Please answer ALL the following questions.
2. Please tick your choices in the box ☐ as ☑.
3. If you have any difficulty in filling in the questionnaire, please do not hesitate to contact the researcher.

Thank you very much for your time and participation.

Huaping Li

A. Demographic information

1. What's your gender?

☐ Male ☐ Female

2. Which age group are you in?

☐ 18-19 ☐ 20-29 ☐ 30-39 ☐ 40 and older

3. Your degree programme (and course name): ____________________________

____

4. Your potential students:

☐ Pre-school children

☐ Primary school students

☐ Secondary school students

Other: ______________________________

5. Which year are you enrolled in?

☐ First ☐ Second ☐ Third ☐ Fourth

Other (e.g. one-year master): ______________________________

B. The role of a teacher in the increasingly globalised world

6. What kind of teacher do you think is competent to teach in an increasingly multicultural and global context? (You are welcome to explain from different aspects such as knowledge, skills, dispositions, attitudes, etc. from your own understanding.)

C. Ways for getting prepared to teach in the globalised world

7. What kind of learning experiences with global dimensions do you think can develop you as a competent teacher in an increasingly multicultural and global context? (You can have more than one choice.)

☐ Study abroad (learning experience and/or practicing teaching)

☐ Practice teaching in the local schools with international components

☐ Inclusion of global or international knowledge and perspectives in the courses or workshops

☐ Inclusion of comparisons of educational themes between home country and some other countries in the courses or workshops

☐ Learning a foreign language

☐ Learning with international peers

☐ Extracurricular activities or events with international or intercultural components

Others: ______________________________

____

8. Which of these opportunities do you know are available to student teachers in your university?

9. Which experience do you think is the most effective way to develop you as a competent teacher in an increasingly multicultural and global context? Why?

10. Which experience do you think is the most possible way to develop you as a competent teacher in an increasingly multicultural and global context? Why?

D. Learning experience(s) with global dimensions

11. What kind of learning experience(s) with international components did you have in the teacher education programme? When did you participate in it/them? How long did it/they last?

12. What did you do in the learning activity or activities?

13. Why did you participate in the learning activity or activities?

14. What did you learn from the experience(s)?

15. How can the learning experience(s) shape your personal and professional development as a competent teacher in an increasingly multicultural and global context?

E. Challenges and possibilities for student teachers' exposure to global dimensions

16. What do you think are the influential factors for student teachers to get exposed to global dimensions in your university? (You can have more than one choice.)

☐ The lack of resources

Please explain: ______________________________

☐ The lack of knowledge

Please explain: ______________________________

☐ The lack of skills

Please explain: ______________________________

☐ The lack of time

Please explain: ______________________________

☐ Others

Please explain: ______________________________

17. What are the most challenging issues do you think can influence student teachers' exposure to global dimensions in your university? Please explain it according to your own knowledge about them and your own experience.

18. How do you think can the challenging issues be addressed in your university and in your own experience?

19. How can the Internet be used to facilitate student teachers' exposure to global dimensions in your university?

Appendix 4: Interview guide for academics

1. Who are you?

- What are your principal responsibilities at work?
- What kind of learning or working experiences with international components did you have?

2. How much do you know about the internationalisation of teacher education and the practices in your university?

- How do you understand the internationalisation of teacher education?
- What are the approaches to the internationalisation of teacher education at your university?

3. What is the value of the internationalisation of teacher education?

- Or what can the internationalisation of teacher education bring to your university and student teachers?

4. What are the challenges and possibilities for the internationalisation of teacher education at your university?

- What are the influential factors for internationalising teacher education at your university?
- How can your university address the issues you mentioned above to meet the needs of all future teachers at your university?

Thank you very much!

Appendix 5: Interview guide for student teachers in internationalisation at Home

1. Talking more about the experiences that have international components at home

- Can you please tell me more about your experience(s) (in the module/ placement/workshop…with international components at home) you mentioned in the questionnaire? (What specific things did you do or what specific activities did you participate in? When, where, how?)
- What other learning experiences or practice teaching experience(s) that have international components did you have?

2. Leaning from the experience(s)

- What did you learn from the experience(s) (e.g. knowledge about different countries in the aspects of people, culture, language, education system, current issues, etc.)?
- What specific aspects have impressed you most?
- How did you feel when you were learning about others or working with others?
- What did you learn about yourself (e.g. your own identity, culture, language, history, education, etc.) from the learning experience(s) with global dimensions?

3. Perceived impact on personal and professional learning from the experience

- To what extent do you think you are more open minded or globally minded to people who are different from you and to issues concerning other countries?
- What kind of changes have you perceived in yourself in the daily life? (Possible prompts: Do you pay more attention to global issues? Are you more

interested in knowing people from other countries? For example, do you have or like to have more foreign friends? How do you view them or communicate with them?)

- In what ways do you think you are more competent to build a global dimension to what you are going to teach after your own learning experience(s) that have international components?
- How are you going to shape your interaction with students who may be from different linguistic and cultural backgrounds or bring different perspectives to your future class?

4. Challenges for internationalising teacher education

- In what aspects do you think the learning experiences with international components can be improved to shape your learning to become a globally competent teacher?
- What might be the barriers and factors that influence your participation in the learning experiences?

Thank you very much!

Appendix 6: Interview guide for student teachers in study abroad programmes

1. Talking more about the experiences in internationalised learning activities

- Can you please tell me more about your experience(s) in the study abroad programme you mentioned in the questionnaire? (What specific things did you do or what specific activities did you participate in? When, where, how?)
- What other learning experiences or practice teaching experience(s) that have international components did you have?

2. Leaning from the experience(s)

- What did you learn from the learning experience (s) in the host country (or the countries) (e.g., knowledge about different countries in the aspects of people, culture, language, education system, current issues, etc.)?
- What specific aspects have impressed you most in your study abroad experience (s)?
- How did you feel when you were learning about others or working with others in another country?
- What did you learn about yourself (e.g., your own identity, culture, language, history, education, etc.) from the learning experience (s) in another country?

3. Perceived impact on personal and professional learning from the experience

- To what extent do you think you are more open minded or globally minded to people who are different from you and to issues concerning other countries?
- What kind of changes have you perceived in yourself in the daily life? (Possible prompts: Do you pay more attention to global issues? Are you more interested in knowing people from other countries? For example, do you have or like to have more foreign friends? How do you view them or communicate with them?)

- In what ways do you think you are more competent to build a global dimension to what you are going to teach after having learning experience(s) abroad?
- How are you going to shape your interaction with students who may be from different linguistic and cultural backgrounds or bring different perspectives to your future class?

4. Challenges for internationalising teacher education

- In what aspects do you think the learning experiences abroad can be improved to shape your learning to become a globally competent teacher?
- What might be the barriers or factors that influence your participation in study abroad programmes

Thank you very much!

Appendix 7: Key characteristics of 7 academic participants

Name	Title	Gender	Age range	Site	Profile
Cai	Academic and head of International Affairs Office	M	50-59	Nanhai University	Cai was very keen to build international links for the university. His principal responsibilities at work involved frequent interactions with universities and people from other countries on home campus or through international trips. He had learning and training experiences in the UK and the US.
Carol	Academic and deputy head of the School of Education	F	40-49	Southside University	Carol had responsibility for strategic initiatives in the School of Education and worked as the coordinator for the internationalisation. Aside from that, she led an international research project on philosophy with children. Before she came to the university, she was teaching asylum seeking children English in schools. She did a visiting lectureship at the University of Malta.
Daniel	Academic active in collaborating with China	M	40-49	Southside University	Daniel's work involved two distinctive parts. The first part was about teaching undergraduate and postgraduate student teachers. The second part focused on promoting partnerships with Chinese universities, student exchanges, and student enrolment into programmes for Humanities and also for the Business School. He visited China frequently to talk to partners and present to students who would like to come to Southside University for short-term study or long-term study.
Henry	Academic and course leader of PGDE	M	60-69	Southside University	As a course leader of PGDE, Henry had little learning and working experience abroad. He came to the university when he had taught in schools for 25 years. He was registered with the General Teaching Council and he thought that part of the initial teacher education course could be done best by those who had got substantial classroom

					experience in schools.
Jing	Academic	M	30-39	Nanhai University	Jing was keen to teach Comparative Educational Studies. He was interested in educational policies of different countries. He had an experience of leading a group of Chinese school teachers in a teacher training programme in the UK.
Stella	Academic	F	50-59	Southside University	As a professor, Stella spent one third of her time in doing citizenship which had a focus on developing international links with departments in other countries for her department. In teaching, she was very keen to build buddy projects for Scottish student teachers and their peers in other countries through Skype options. Additionally, she encouraged student teachers to take placements in communities where there were children who did not have English as their first language.
Yang	Academic and deputy head of the School of Education	M	50-59	Nanhai University	As a professor, Yang was actively promoting international and comparative education at the School of Education. He was especially interested in introducing new ways of doing things or new educational policies from Western countries to China in the journal run by the university. He studied in Japan for his PhD.

Appendix 8: Key characteristics of 27 student teacher participants in interviews

Name	Gender	Age range	Degree course	Site	Profile
Ada	F	18-19	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Ada found herself a 3-week placement opportunity in a Montessori School in the US in 2015 after she had failed to get an opportunity to study abroad through university programmes. While studying abroad, she observed classes and helped out with some of the testing or group teaching. She taught one lesson about Scotland and how it was different to the US.
Callie	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Callie, along with the other 4 Scottish student teachers and a school teacher, travelled to Malawi through a university study abroad programme for 3 weeks in September 2015. Before she studied abroad, she had Cultural Awareness classes as the pre-departure sessions. During the trip to Malawi, the group spent 5 days in a teacher training college, attending classes with the Malawian student teachers and taking part in a CPD with Malawi teachers about teaching styles in the college. For the rest of the time, her group visited local schools, surrounding villages and local markets.
Charles	M	30-39	PGDE	Southside University	Throughout the PEDE course, Charles had lectures on Diversity, Human Rights and Social Justice. In addition, he undertook a lecture on Learning for Sustainability followed by a subject specific project. A topic about global citizenship was included in the discussions of a lecture for an afternoon.
Dilan	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Dilan attended the module of Comparative Educational Studies. She undertook her placement in an international school where she had to use English as the instructional language to teach children from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds for a semester. She was not confident in

					interacting with these children in the international school.
Ella	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Ella completed her first semester of third year at a university in Sweden through an Erasmus programme. Apart from attending classes at the University, she took part in a 4-week placement in a Swedish pre-school, which consisted of teaching and assisting on a day-to-day basis.
Emma	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Emma undertook a Spanish module run by a Spanish teacher who had very little English at Southside University. Meanwhile, she was placed in a school that demonstrated a high level of cultural diversity and had a focus on the inclusion of all children and their cultures in classroom teaching and learning. She also participated in the Jewish camp and interacted with people who spoke Hebrew.
Gina	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Gina had a one-month learning trip with 9 other Scottish student teachers to China through a university programme at the end of her third year from May to June in 2016. Before her departure, she had briefing sessions. During her stay in China, she attended lectures focused on Chinese educational aspects at the partner university, had group discussions with Chinese peers, and visited local primary schools and kindergartens. She also had some cultural visits and an opportunity to teach an English lesson to a class of primary pupils in China. After the study abroad experience, there were debriefing sessions for her group.
Kala	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Kala attended a one-week intensive course in the Netherlands through Summer School. She was studying with university students from different countries at a Dutch university. The course she undertook focused on Europe's 21st Century Challenges and looked at EU migration law.
Kathy	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Kathy undertook the classes in the Introduction to French class which was run for two semesters after her failure to gain a place on one of overseas learning trips promoted by the university. The class covered basic French

					grammar and vocabulary that ended with three exams – writing, listening and speaking.
Nicole	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Nicole was the only first-year student teacher participant at the undergraduate level at Southside University, when she was interviewed. She was educated in a culturally homogenous school (i.e. all Irish girls) in Ireland, but she has an Irish and Romania background. She undertook a placement in a multicultural classroom in a community Homework Club.
Nila	F	30-39	PGDE	Southside University	As a PGDE student teacher participant, Nila has an ethic minority background: she has an Indian root but was born and raised in the UK and is married to a Canadian. She attended RME which taught her how to make religious learning content relevant to children. She also chose the PS module which was focused on supporting bilingual learners.
Ling	F	20-29	2-year Masters	Nanhai University	Ling attended a few one-off lectures given by some international scholars. Additionally, she undertook two English modules: one was College English and the other was Oral English. She did not think these English modules were helpful as the former had little focus on speaking and the latter was not challenging.
Lishi	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Lishi undertook the College English classes which were dominated by the lecturer, and Oral English module which was delivered by an English native speaker for 3 years at Nanhai University. She also had Comparative Educational Studies and some one-off lectures that had international focuses for a semester.
Manlu	F	20-29	3-year Masters	Nanhai University	Manlu, along with other 15 Nanhai student teachers, travelled to the US through the university study abroad programme in 2015 for two months. She attended 8 classes at the partner university in the US and was placed in 2 local schools: one public and the other private. A black lecturer was taking a facilitative role for her group in the programme. She attended classes and

					hung out with the large group without feeling herself as a foreigner in the host country. She saw the overseas learning experience as a good opportunity for fun, for sightseeing, and for shopping.
Meng	F	20-29	3-year Masters	Nanhai University	Meng participated in a university study abroad programme in the US for 2 months. Part of the experience was attending teacher training classes at the partner university in the US. She also visited 2 local schools and observed mathematics classes there.
Menyan	F	20-29	2-year Masters	Nanhai University	Menyan participated in a university study abroad programme in the US for one month in 2015. She had a home stay while she was placed in a local primary school. She was very well welcomed by the local people as a foreigner and felt more willing to help foreigners in China.
Peng	M	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Peng undertook Comparative Educational studies which had international focuses. He had College English classes which were dominated by the lecturer, and Oral English module which was delivered by an English native speaker for three years at Nanhai University. He also attended a one-off lecture given by a British school teacher.
Richard	M	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Richard had a one-month learning trip with 9 other Scottish student teachers to China through a university programme at the end of his third year from May to June in 2016. Before departure, there were briefing sessions for his group. During his stay in China, he attended lectures focused on Chinese educational aspects at the partner university, had group discussions with Chinese peers, and visited local primary schools and kindergartens. He also had some cultural visits and an opportunity to teach an English lesson to a class of primary pupils in China. After the study abroad experience, there were debriefing sessions for the group.
Ronald	M	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Southside University	Ronald had a lecture on the history of Chinese education which had a focus on the philosophy of it. He also attended a lecture on why go to China to

					study for a few weeks. He was placed in a school which features cultural diversity in Scotland.
Rui	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Rui studied in Taiwan with 26 peers from Nanhai University for 2 weeks in May 2015. She attended classes at the partner university in Taiwan and observed classes in a local kindergarten. After the study abroad experience, she made a brochure and a video as learning reports which were further used by the home university to promote the learning opportunity to other student teachers.
Siya	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Siya studied abroad in four different countries (i.e. the US, New Zealand, Sri Lanka and Thailand). These learning experiences ranged from 1 week to 3 weeks. She had more disorienting dilemmas than the other Chinese student teacher participants, particularly during her experiences in Thailand and Sri Lanka where she had more language barriers to communication with local people.
Tina	F	20-29	PGDE	Southside University	Tina undertook the optional PS module for PGDE students. In this module, she had learning tasks which moved her out of her comfort zone. She felt bewildered when her taken-for-granted views about children from culturally and linguistically diverse were challenged by the lecturer.
Yanyan	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Yanyan attended a module called History of Preschool Education which was concerned with educational theories and practices of Western countries. She also had the English modules which were seen by her as opportunities to claim credits rather than ways of improving her cross-cultural communication skills.
Yinqi	F	20-29	3-year Masters	Nanhai University	Yinqi, along with other 15 Nanhai student teachers, travelled to the US through the university study abroad programme in 2015 for 2 months. She attended 8 classes at the partner university in the US and was placed in 2 local schools: one public and the other private. She attended classes and

					hung out with the large group. She did not quite understand the class content at the beginning because of her lack of ability to communicate ideas in English.
Yiwen	F	20-29	3-year Masters	Nanhai University	Yiwen attended a few one-off lectures given by international scholars apart from the English modules she had. These learning experiences were not helpful to her, because she found that there was a mismatch between teacher education and student teachers' readiness for incorporating global dimensions into their future teaching practices.
Yueqing	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Yueqing travelled to the US through a university programme with another 29 peers for 3 weeks in September 2015, with 1 week learning at the partner university and 2 weeks being placed at a local primary school. She found the US and the people there were different from she had expected. However, she felt very comfortable to be a foreigner in the host country and the local people were very nice to her.
Zhimin	F	20-29	4-year Bachelors	Nanhai University	Zhimin studied in the US through the same programme with Yueqing, but she was placed in a middle school. She was shocked by the narrow mind-sets of the local students. She became more proud of her own culture when she was abroad. She was not confident to communicate with the local people in English at the beginning though she had many years' experience in learning English.